

# Open Budget Survey 2019

Questionnaire

Rwanda

April 2020

# Country Questionnaire: Rwanda

PBS-1. What is the fiscal year of the PBS evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

*Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."*

Answer:  
FY2018-19

Source:  
The source is MINECOFIN website. the link of where the information is located is: <http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231>

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

PBS-2. When is the PBS made available to the public?

*Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.*

*The OBS methodology requires that for a PBS to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is submitted to the legislature for consideration. If the PBS is not released to the public at least one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is submitted to the legislature for consideration, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the PBS.*

Answer:  
d. The PBS is not released to the public, or is released less than one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is introduced to the legislature

Source:

Comment:  
The PBS in equivalent to the second budget call circular in Rwanda (PBCC), which was not published online for FY 2018-19.

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

PBS-3a. If the PBS is published, what is the date of publication of the PBS?

*Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.*

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2018 should be entered as 05/09/2018. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.

Answer:  
00/00/0000 00/00/0000

Source:

Comment:  
The PBS in equivalent to the second budget call circular in Rwanda (PBCC), which was not published online for FY 2018-19.

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

PBS-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the PBS.

If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:  
The PBS in equivalent to the second budget call circular in Rwanda (PBCC), which was not published online for FY 2018-19. The PBS in equivalent to the second budget call circular in Rwanda (PBCC), which was not published online for FY 2018-19.

Source:  
MINECOFIN

Comment:  
The PBS in equivalent to the second budget call circular in Rwanda (PBCC), which was not published online for FY 2018-19.

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

PBS-4. If the PBS is published, what is the URL or weblink of the PBS?

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.

Answer:  
[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=228&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fteste.php%3F%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-165%5Bpath%5D=2018-19\\_Budget\\_Call\\_Circular&cHash=d3714b2dc50556dab1ded3e5a79029a3](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=228&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fteste.php%3F%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-165%5Bpath%5D=2018-19_Budget_Call_Circular&cHash=d3714b2dc50556dab1ded3e5a79029a3) [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=228&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fteste.php%3F%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-165%5Bpath%5D=2018-19\\_Budget\\_Call\\_Circular&cHash=d3714b2dc50556dab1ded3e5a79029a3](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=228&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fteste.php%3F%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-165%5Bpath%5D=2018-19_Budget_Call_Circular&cHash=d3714b2dc50556dab1ded3e5a79029a3)

Source:  
MINECOFIN website

Comment:

The PBS in equivalent to the second budget call circular in Rwanda (PBCC), which was not published online for FY 2018-19.

Only the first budget call circular was published.

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

PBS-5. If the PBS is published, are the numerical data contained in the PBS available in a machine readable format?

*Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs and Word (.doc/.docx) files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>*

*Option "d" applies if the PBS is not published or not produced, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.*

Answer:

d. Not applicable

Source:

MINECOFIN Website

Comment:

The PBS in equivalent to the second budget call circular in Rwanda (PBCC), which was not published online for FY 2018-19.

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

PBS-6a. If the PBS is not publicly available, is it still produced?

*If the PBS is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question PBS-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.*

*Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question PBS-2)*

*Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.*

*Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.*

*Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.*

*Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.*

*If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.*

Answer:

c. Produced for internal purposes/use only

Source:

Comment:

The PBS in equivalent to the second budget call circular in Rwanda (PBCC), which was not published online for FY 2018-19.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: I choose not to review this question

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

PBS-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question PBS-6a, please specify how you determined whether the PBS was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

*If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question PBS-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion:

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

PBS-7. If the PBS is produced, please write the full title of the PBS.

*For example, a title for the Pre-Budget Statement could be "Proposed 2019 State Budget" or "Guidelines for the Preparation of Annual Plan and Budget for 2018/19."*

*If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:

Second Planning and Budgeting Call Circular for 2018-2019 Fiscal Year Second Planning and Budgeting Call Circular for 2018-2019 Fiscal Year

Source:

Minecofin website

Comment:

in Rwanda there are 2 Planning and Budgeting Call Circulars

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: I choose not to review this question

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: n/a

PBS-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the PBS?

While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see: <http://www.internationalbudget.org/opening-budgets/citizens-budgets/>.

Answer:

b. No

Source:

MINECOFIN website

Comment:

The Citizen

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EBP-1a. What is the fiscal year of the EBP evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

*Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."*

Answer:

FY 2018-19 FY 2018-2019

Source:

Minecofin website, Budget Management and reporting unit.

Comment:

In Rwanda EBP is known under the name: Budget Framework Paper 2018/2019-2020/2021

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: In Rwanda EBP is equivalent to Budget Framework Paper. 2018/2019-2020/2021 Budget Framework Paper is the most recent document given the cut off date of 31 December 2018 for 2019 OBS

EBP-1b. When is the EBP submitted to the legislature for consideration?

*Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2018 should be entered as 05/09/2018. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.*

Answer:

30/4/2018

Source:

<http://en.igihe.com/news/2018-2019-national-budget-increases-by-over-300.html>

Comment:

The submission of the EBP is publicized and covered by media.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Yes the EBP for 2018/19 was presented to Parliament on 30th April 2018. As per the link provided by the researcher, the local news paper wrote the information on the next day (1st May 2018). The following link can take you to tweets during the minister's presentation of the EBP at Parliament on 30th April 2018: [https://twitter.com/hashtag/BFP2018?src=hash&ref\\_src=twsrc%5Etfw%7Ctwcamp%5Eembeddedtimeline%7Ctwtterm%5Eprofile%3ARwandaFinance&ref\\_url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.minecofin.gov.rw%2Findex.php%3Fid%3D2](https://twitter.com/hashtag/BFP2018?src=hash&ref_src=twsrc%5Etfw%7Ctwcamp%5Eembeddedtimeline%7Ctwtterm%5Eprofile%3ARwandaFinance&ref_url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.minecofin.gov.rw%2Findex.php%3Fid%3D2)

EBP-2. When is the EBP made available to the public?

*Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.*

*The OBS methodology requires that for an EBP to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public while the legislature is still considering it and before the legislature approves (enacts) it. If the EBP is not released to the public before the legislature approves it, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the EBP.*

*The OBS definition of an Executive's Budget Proposal is a document(s) that (i) the executive submits to the legislature as a formal part of the budget approval process and (ii) the legislature either approves or on which it approves proposed amendments.*

*The OBS will treat the Executive's Budget Proposal as "Not Produced," in the following cases:*

- *The executive does not submit the draft budget to the legislature; or*
- *The legislature receives the draft budget but does not approve it or does not approve recommendations on the draft budget;*
- *The legislature rejects the draft budget submitted by the executive, but the executive implements it without legislative approval; or*
- *There is no legislature, or the legislature has been dissolved.*

Answer:

c. Less than two months in advance of the budget year, but at least in advance of the budget being approved by the legislature

Source:

MINECOFIN,

Comment:

The EBP for 2018/19 was published on 31 May 2018, which is less than two months in advance of the start of the budget year (1 July 2018), but at least in advance of the budget being approved by the legislature (29 June 2018).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The Executive's Budget Proposal (called Budget Framework Paper) was submitted to the parliament on April 2018, and published on the MINECOFIN website on May 31, 2018. [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: In addition to the above, the law requires the the Budget Framework Paper is submitted to Parliament not later than April 30th of each year. Reference: <http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=20>

EBP-3a. If the EBP is published, what is the date of publication of the EBP?

*Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.*

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.*

*Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2018 should be entered as 05/09/2018. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.*

*In the comment boxes below, researchers should also list any supporting documents to the EBP and their date of publication.*

Answer:  
31/05/2018

Source:  
MINECOFIN web site, the link to the source is:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

Comment:  
The list of supporting documents and their dates an time of their publication are provided below:

- 1) 2018-2021\_Budget\_Framework\_Paper.pdf 31-05-18 10:00
- 2) 2018-21\_Executive\_Budget\_Proposal.zip 31-05-18 09:51
- 3) Annex\_II-Basic\_Macro\_\_Indicators\_2011-2021.xls.xls 31-05-18 09:51
- 4) Annex\_III-Fiscal\_projections\_for\_2018\_-\_2021.xlsx 31-05-18 09:51
- 5) Annex\_IX\_-\_Summarised\_Central\_Government\_Transfers\_to\_LG.xls 31-05-18 09:51
- 6) Annex\_X\_-\_Consolidated\_Districts\_Revenues\_and\_Expenditure\_Projections\_for\_2018-2021.xls 31-05-18 09:51

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Disagree  
Suggested Answer: The EBP was published on 04/05/2018. However, EBP annexes were later published on 31/05/2018 and we kept the Original version published.  
Reference:[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf) Reference:[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

IBP Comment  
As noted by the Government Reviewer, the EBP Annexes were not published until 31 May 2018. The difference of publication between the EBP and the supporting documents do not affect the document's timeliness or its score.

EBP-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the EBP.

*If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:  
The date of publication was determined looking at the date the document was uploaded to the web site. The web site displays the date and time for each file uploaded on the MINECOFIN web site

Source:  
Minecofin.  
[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

Comment:  
No comment

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Comments: The EBP was published on 04/05/2018. However, EBP annexes were later published on 31/05/2018 and we kept the Original version published.

Reference:[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf) Reference:[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

IBP Comment

As noted by the Government Reviewer, the EBP Annexes were not published until 31 May 2018. The difference of publication between the EBP and the supporting documents do not affect the document's timeliness or its score.

EBP-4. If the EBP is published, what is the URL or weblink of the EBP?

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.*

*In the comment boxes below, researchers should also list any supporting documents to the EBP and their URL or weblink.*

Answer:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

Source:

Minecofin

Comment:

It important to note that though the publication was done on 31 may 2018, the public is informed when the Minister of Finance and Economic planning is presenting the budget framework paper to the parliament, which is followed by debates in media

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: Reference:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf) However, the EBP and its annexes were later published on 31/05/2018 but we kept the Originally published EBP of 04/05/2018.

IBP Comment

As noted by the Government Reviewer, the EBP Annexes were not published until 31 May 2018. The difference of publication between the EBP and the supporting documents do not affect the document's timeliness or its score.

EBP-5. If the EBP is published, are the numerical data contained in the EBP or its supporting documents available in a machine readable format?

*Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs and Word (.doc/.docx) files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>.*

*Option "d" applies if the EBP is not published or not produced, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.*

Answer:

a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format

Source:  
MINECOFIN

Comment:

The link below will allow access to the files.

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EBP-6a. If the EBP is not publicly available, is it still produced?

*If the EBP is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question EBP-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.*

*Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question EBP-2).*

*Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.*

*Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.*

*Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.*

*Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.*

*If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.*

Answer:

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Source:

See the MINECOFIN website:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

Comment:

The documents were made available on 31-may-2018

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EBP-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question EBP-6a, please specify how you determined whether the EBP was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

*If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question EBP-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion:

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EBP-7. If the EBP is produced, please write the full title of the EBP.

*For example, a title for the Executive's Budget Proposal could be "Draft Estimates of Revenue and Expenditure for BY 2018-19, produced by the Ministry of Finance, Planning and Economic Development."*

*If there are any supporting documents to the EBP, please enter their full titles in the comment box below.*

*If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:

Budget Framework Paper 2018/2019-2020/2021

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EBP-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the EBP?

*While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see: <http://www.internationalbudget.org/opening-budgets/citizens-budgets>.*

Answer:

b. No

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

EB-1a. What is the fiscal year of the EB evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

*Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."*

Answer:  
FY2018-19

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Comments: The FY year runs from July 1st to June 30th. For 2018/19, the Budget was approved in June 2018 and thus qualifies for the survey.  
Reference: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws%2F2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law&cHash=0dbe79aac26043e02dd1b45fc3ba04c2](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Annual_State_Finance_Laws%2F2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law&cHash=0dbe79aac26043e02dd1b45fc3ba04c2)

EB-1b. When was the EB approved (enacted) by the legislature?

*Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2018 should be entered as 05/09/2018. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.*

Answer:  
27/6/2018

Source:

Official Gazette No. Special of 30 June 2018 published:  
[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law/FY\\_2018-19\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law/FY_2018-19_Original_Finance_Law.pdf)

Comment:

It is agreed in all EAC that the budget has to be enacted by 30 June of each Fiscal Year

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: The 2018/2019 budget was approved on 27/06/2018 by the legislature. REFERENCE: <https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/mps-approve-201819-budget-today>

Researcher Response  
ok

EB-2. When is the EB made available to the public?

*Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.*

*The OBS methodology requires that for an EB to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public three months after the budget is approved by the legislature. If the EB is not released to the public at least three months after the budget is approved by the legislature, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the EB.*

Answer:

a. Two weeks or less after the budget has been enacted

Source:

MINECOFIN website

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law/FY\\_2018-19\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law/FY_2018-19_Original_Finance_Law.pdf)

Comment:

After the budget has been enacted, it was posted on the MINECOFIN website on 03-07-18.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The budget was enacted on 29/06, and made available to the public on the website of the Prime Minister Office on 30/06/2018.

[https://www.primature.gov.rw/index.php?id=42&no\\_cache=1&tx\\_drblob\\_pi1%5BdownloadUid%5D=529](https://www.primature.gov.rw/index.php?id=42&no_cache=1&tx_drblob_pi1%5BdownloadUid%5D=529) It was also made available on 03/07, so 4 days later, on the website of the ministry of Finance and Economic Planning (MINECOFIN).

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: It was published on the website (03/07/2018) a week after it was enacted.

EB-3a. If the EB is published, what is the date of publication of the EB?

*Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.*

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.*

*Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2018 should be entered as 05/09/2018. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.*

Answer:

3/7/2018

Source:

Official Gazette No. Special of 30 June 2018.

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law/FY\\_2018-19\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law/FY_2018-19_Original_Finance_Law.pdf)

Comment:

The date of publication is the date on which the enacted budget has been Gazetted

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The date of the publication on the website of the Office of the Prime Minister is 30/06/2018. [https://www.primature.gov.rw/index.php?id=42&no\\_cache=1&tx\\_drblob\\_pi1%5BdownloadUid%5D=529](https://www.primature.gov.rw/index.php?id=42&no_cache=1&tx_drblob_pi1%5BdownloadUid%5D=529) It was also published on MINECOFIN website on 03/07/2018.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree  
Comments: Date of Publication: 03/07/2018

EB-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the EB.

*If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:

The date of the publication of the EB is determined by looking at the date of the Official Gazette which is normally published as a special No. For this FY budget 2018-19, the date of publication is 30 June 2018,

Source:

Minecofin

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law/FY\\_2018-19\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law/FY_2018-19_Original_Finance_Law.pdf)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The official gazette was published on 30th June 2018 ([https://www.primature.gov.rw/index.php?id=42&no\\_cache=1&tx\\_drblob\\_pi1%5BdownloadUid%5D=529](https://www.primature.gov.rw/index.php?id=42&no_cache=1&tx_drblob_pi1%5BdownloadUid%5D=529)) on the Prime Minister's website but it was published on MINECOFIN's website on 03/07/2018 ([http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws%2F2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law&cHash=0dbe79aac26043e02dd1b45fc3ba04c2](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Annual_State_Finance_Laws%2F2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law&cHash=0dbe79aac26043e02dd1b45fc3ba04c2))

EB-4. If the EB is published, what is the URL or weblink of the EB?

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.*

Answer:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law/FY\\_2018-19\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law/FY_2018-19_Original_Finance_Law.pdf)

Source:

MINECOFIN Website

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: It is also published on the website of the Office of the Prime Minister. [https://www.primature.gov.rw/index.php?id=42&no\\_cache=1&tx\\_drblob\\_pi1%5BdownloadUid%5D=529](https://www.primature.gov.rw/index.php?id=42&no_cache=1&tx_drblob_pi1%5BdownloadUid%5D=529)

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

Comments: MINECOFIN's website: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws%2F2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law&cHash=0dbe79aac26043e02dd1b45fc3ba04c2](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Annual_State_Finance_Laws%2F2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law&cHash=0dbe79aac26043e02dd1b45fc3ba04c2) Prime Minister's office: [https://www.primature.gov.rw/index.php?id=42&no\\_cache=1&tx\\_drblob\\_pi1%5BdownloadUid%5D=529](https://www.primature.gov.rw/index.php?id=42&no_cache=1&tx_drblob_pi1%5BdownloadUid%5D=529)

EB-5. If the EB is published, are the numerical data contained in the EB available in a machine readable format?

*Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs and Word (.doc/.docx) files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>*

*Option "d" applies if the EB is not published or not produced, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.*

Answer:

c. No

Source:

MINECOFIN website

Comment:

The EB is available in the PDF format.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-6a. If the EB is not publicly available, is it still produced?

*If the EB is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question EB-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.*

*Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question EB-2)*

*Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.*

*Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.*

*Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.*

*Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.*

*If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.*

Answer:

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Reference: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws%2F2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law&cHash=0dbe79aac26043e02dd1b45fc3ba04c2](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Annual_State_Finance_Laws%2F2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law&cHash=0dbe79aac26043e02dd1b45fc3ba04c2)

EB-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question EB-6a, please specify how you determined whether the EB was produced for internal use only, versus not

produced at all.

*If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question EB-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion:

Government Reviewer  
Opinion:

EB-7. If the EB is produced, please write the full title of the EB.

*For example, a title for the Enacted Budget could be "Appropriation Act n. 10 of 2018."*

*If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:

LAW N°38/2018 OF 29/06/2018 DETERMINING THE STATE FINANCES FOR THE 2018/2019 FISCAL YEAR

Source:

Minecofin website

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law/FY\\_2018-19\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law/FY_2018-19_Original_Finance_Law.pdf)

Comment:

Enacted budget is published as a law

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

EB-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the EB?

*While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see: <http://www.internationalbudget.org/opening-budgets/citizens-budgets/>.*

Answer:

a. Yes

Source:

Minecofin

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal\\_Decentralisation\\_Unit/Budget\\_Citizen\\_Guide/2018-2019/2018\\_19\\_Final\\_Citizen\\_Guide\\_to\\_the\\_Budget\\_-\\_English.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal_Decentralisation_Unit/Budget_Citizen_Guide/2018-2019/2018_19_Final_Citizen_Guide_to_the_Budget_-_English.pdf)

Comment:

The EB is summarized in the Citizens' Guide for 2018/2019 Budget

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: In addition to the above, the Citizen's guide is produced in 3 languages (Local language, English and French) to increase Public awareness of the National budget in all categories. French version:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal\\_Decentralisation\\_Unit/Budget\\_Citizen\\_Guide/2018-2019/2018\\_19\\_Final\\_Citizen\\_Guide\\_to\\_the\\_Budget\\_-\\_French.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal_Decentralisation_Unit/Budget_Citizen_Guide/2018-2019/2018_19_Final_Citizen_Guide_to_the_Budget_-_French.pdf) Local language version:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal\\_Decentralisation\\_Unit/Budget\\_Citizen\\_Guide/2018-2019/2018\\_19\\_Final\\_Citizen\\_Guide\\_to\\_the\\_Budget\\_-\\_Kinyarwanda.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal_Decentralisation_Unit/Budget_Citizen_Guide/2018-2019/2018_19_Final_Citizen_Guide_to_the_Budget_-_Kinyarwanda.pdf)

CB-1. What is the fiscal year of the CB evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

*Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."*

*If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, for each CB please indicate the document the CB simplifies/refers to, and the fiscal year.*

Answer:

FY 2018-19

Source:

MINECOFIN website

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

CB-2a. For the fiscal year indicated in CB-1, what is the public availability status of the CB?

*If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document (Executive's Budget Proposal or Enacted Budget) you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budget is produced and its public availability status.*

*Remember that publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.*

*Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology  
Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.*

*Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.*

*Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.*

*Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.*

Answer:

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Source:

Minecofin website

Comment:

The CB was published 2 and it was produced in three languages (English, Kinyarwanda and French)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The document is Publicly available.

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal\\_Decentralisation\\_Unit/Budget\\_Citizen\\_Guide/2018-2019/2018\\_19\\_Final\\_Citizen\\_Guide\\_to\\_the\\_Budget\\_-\\_English.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal_Decentralisation_Unit/Budget_Citizen_Guide/2018-2019/2018_19_Final_Citizen_Guide_to_the_Budget_-_English.pdf)

CB-2b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question CB-2a, please specify how you determined whether the CB was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

*If option "a","b," or "e" was selected in question CB-2a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion:

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

CB-3a. If the CB is published, what is the date of publication of the CB?

*Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.*

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.*

*Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2018 should be entered as 05/09/2018. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.*

*If more than one Citizens Budget is published, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budget is produced and its dates of publication.*

Answer:

20/9/2018

Source:

Minecofin

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal\\_Decentralisation\\_Unit/Budget\\_Citizen\\_Guide/2018-2019/2018\\_19\\_Final\\_Citizen\\_Guide\\_to\\_the\\_Budget\\_-\\_English.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal_Decentralisation_Unit/Budget_Citizen_Guide/2018-2019/2018_19_Final_Citizen_Guide_to_the_Budget_-_English.pdf)

Comment:

The publication date considered here is the date when the CB was uploaded on the website

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=156&L=182&tx-filelist-pi1-406%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Citizen\\_Guide%2F2018-2019&cHash=905a074ac87d269f0254ca0eb189aa0c](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=156&L=182&tx-filelist-pi1-406%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Citizen_Guide%2F2018-2019&cHash=905a074ac87d269f0254ca0eb189aa0c)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Date for Publication: 20/09/2018

CB-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the CB.

*If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:

The date of publication was determined looking at the date when the CD was uploaded on the Web site.

Source:

Minecofin web site

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=156&L=182&tx-filelist-pi1-406%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Citizen\\_Guide%2F2018-2019&cHash=905a074ac87d269f0254ca0eb189aa0c](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=156&L=182&tx-filelist-pi1-406%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Citizen_Guide%2F2018-2019&cHash=905a074ac87d269f0254ca0eb189aa0c)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

CB-4. If the CB is published, what is the URL or weblink of the CB?

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.*

*If more than one Citizens Budget is published, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budget is produced and its URL or weblink.*

Answer:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal\\_Decentralisation\\_Unit/Budget\\_Citizen\\_Guide/2018-2019/2018\\_19\\_Final\\_Citizen\\_Guide\\_to\\_the\\_Budget\\_-\\_English.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal_Decentralisation_Unit/Budget_Citizen_Guide/2018-2019/2018_19_Final_Citizen_Guide_to_the_Budget_-_English.pdf)

Source:

Minecofin web site

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: In addition to the above, the Citizen budget guide is published in 3 official languages (Kinyarwanda, French and English) for public awareness. French version:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal\\_Decentralisation\\_Unit/Budget\\_Citizen\\_Guide/2018-2019/2018\\_19\\_Final\\_Citizen\\_Guide\\_to\\_the\\_Budget\\_-\\_French.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal_Decentralisation_Unit/Budget_Citizen_Guide/2018-2019/2018_19_Final_Citizen_Guide_to_the_Budget_-_French.pdf) Kinyarwanda version:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal\\_Decentralisation\\_Unit/Budget\\_Citizen\\_Guide/2018-2019/2018\\_19\\_Final\\_Citizen\\_Guide\\_to\\_the\\_Budget\\_-\\_Kinyarwanda.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal_Decentralisation_Unit/Budget_Citizen_Guide/2018-2019/2018_19_Final_Citizen_Guide_to_the_Budget_-_Kinyarwanda.pdf)

CB-5. If the CB is produced, please write the full title of the CB.

*For example, a title for the Citizens Budget could be "Budget 2018 People's Guide" or "2019 Proposed Budget in Brief: A People's Budget Publication."*

*If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

*If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, for the other CB, indicate the document the CB refers to and, next to it, its full title.*

Answer:

The National Budget Citizens' Guide for 2018/2019 Budget Industrialization for Job Creation and Shared Prosperity

Source:

Minecofin web site

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: In addition to the above comments, below are other full titles in different languages; French version: Industrialisation pour la création d'emplois et la Prospérité inclusive Kinyarwanda Version: Guteza imbere inganda hagamijwe kongera imirimo n'iterambere kuri bose

CB-6. If the CB is produced, please indicate which budget document it corresponds to.

*If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budget is produced and which budget document it simplifies.*

Answer:

The released CB correspond to the EB

Source:

Minecofin Web site

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The CB produced corresponds to the 2018/2019 Approved budget by Legislature. Reference:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law/FY\\_2018-19\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law/FY_2018-19_Original_Finance_Law.pdf)

IYRs-1. What is the fiscal year of the IYRs evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer:

FY 2017-18 & FY 2018-19

Source:

Minecofin web site

For the 2017-18:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fft.php%3F%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports&cHash=62c02486ddd82be39435b70a61426d3b](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fft.php%3F%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports&cHash=62c02486ddd82be39435b70a61426d3b)

For 2018-19

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fft.php%3F%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2018-2019\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2FQuarter\\_I&cHash=8c975ac46585aa3619ddd3e6164d4c8](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fft.php%3F%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2018-2019_Budget_Execution_Reports%2FQuarter_I&cHash=8c975ac46585aa3619ddd3e6164d4c8)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-2. When are the IYRs made available to the public?

*Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.*

*The OBS methodology requires that for IYRs to be considered publicly available, IYRs must be made available to the public no later than three months after the reporting period ends. If at least seven of the last 12 monthly IYRs, or at least three of the last four quarterly IYRs are not released to the public at least three months after the reporting period ends, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the IYRs.*

Answer:

c. At least every quarter, and within three months of the period covered

Source:

Minecofin Web site

For Q1 FY 2018-19

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2018-2019\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/Quarter\\_I/BUDGET\\_EXECUTION\\_REPORT\\_FOR\\_THE\\_JULY-SEPT\\_2018\\_.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2018-2019_Budget_Execution_Reports/Quarter_I/BUDGET_EXECUTION_REPORT_FOR_THE_JULY-SEPT_2018_.pdf)

For FY 2017-18

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fft.php%3F%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports&cHash=62c02486ddd82be39435b70a61426d3b](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fft.php%3F%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports&cHash=62c02486ddd82be39435b70a61426d3b)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

IYRs-3a. If the IYRs are published, what are the dates of publication of the IYRs?

*Specifically: if quarterly In-Year Reports are published, indicate the dates of publication of at least three of the last four IYRs that were publicly available. If monthly IYRs are published, indicate the dates of publication of at least seven of the last 12 IYRs that were publicly available.*

*Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document. Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.*

*Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2018 should be entered as 05 September 2018. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:

For the FY 2018-19

Q1: 14-11-2018

For the FY 2017-18

Q1: 16-11-17;

Q2: 15-02-18

Q3: 15-05-18

Q4: 14-08-18

Source:

Minecofin Web Site

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2018-2019\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/Quarter\\_I/BUDGET\\_EXECUTION\\_REPORT\\_FOR\\_THE\\_JULY-SEPT\\_2018\\_.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2018-2019_Budget_Execution_Reports/Quarter_I/BUDGET_EXECUTION_REPORT_FOR_THE_JULY-SEPT_2018_.pdf)

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Ftt.php%3F%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports&cHash=62c02486ddd82be39435b70a61426d3b](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Ftt.php%3F%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports&cHash=62c02486ddd82be39435b70a61426d3b)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: 16 November 2017 15 February 2018 15 May 2018 14 August 2018 14 November 2018

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the IYRs.

*If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:

Dates of publication are determined by looking at the date written on the cover page and also at the date when the reports have been uploaded on the minecofin web site.

Source:

Minecofin web site

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Ftt.php%3F%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2018-2019\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports&cHash=80e571604590dc5e4ddec5d255522632](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Ftt.php%3F%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2018-2019_Budget_Execution_Reports&cHash=80e571604590dc5e4ddec5d255522632)

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Ftt.php%3F%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports&cHash=62c02486ddd82be39435b70a61426d3b](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Ftt.php%3F%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports&cHash=62c02486ddd82be39435b70a61426d3b)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

IYRs-4. If the IYRs are published, what is the URL or weblink of the IYRs?

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.*

*Researchers should provide the weblink to the most recent In-Year Report in the space below, and – in the comment box underneath – the weblinks to older IYRs.*

*If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.*

Answer:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=data%3A%2F%2Ftext%2Fplain..&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports&cHash=f0761b2aea8e319bfc0ed32c5540d555](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=data%3A%2F%2Ftext%2Fplain..&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Execution_Reports&cHash=f0761b2aea8e319bfc0ed32c5540d555)

Source:

Minecofin web site

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Comments: In addition to the link provided, the links below are for the recent IYRs published; 2018/2019: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2018-2019\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2FQuarter\\_I&cHash=8c975ac46585aa3619dddd3e6164d4c8](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2018-2019_Budget_Execution_Reports%2FQuarter_I&cHash=8c975ac46585aa3619dddd3e6164d4c8) 2017-2018: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports&cHash=62c02486ddd82be39435b70a61426d3b](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports&cHash=62c02486ddd82be39435b70a61426d3b)

IYRs-5. If the IYRs are published, are the numerical data contained in the IYRs available in a machine readable format?

*Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs and Word (.doc/.docx) files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>*

*Option "d" applies if the IYRs are not published or not produced, therefore their machine readability cannot be assessed.*

Answer:

c. No

Source:

Minecofin

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Comments: The In-Year Reports are published in pdf format.

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

IYRs-6a. If the IYRs are not publicly available, are they still produced?

*If the IYRs are not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question IYRs-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.*

*Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question IYRs-2).*

*Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.*

*Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.*

*Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.*

*Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.*

*If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.*

Answer:

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

IYRs-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question IYRs-6a, please specify how you determined whether the IYRs were produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

*If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question IYRs-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion:

Government Reviewer  
Opinion:

IYRs-7. If the IYRs are produced, please write the full title of the IYRs.

*For example, a title for the In-Year Report could be "Budget Monitoring Report, Quarter 1" or "Budget Execution Report January-March 2018."*

*If In-Year Reports are not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

*Researchers should provide the full title of the most recent In-Year Report in the space below, and – in the comment box underneath – the full titles of older IYRs.*

Answer:

FY 2018-19: BUDGET EXECUTION REPORT FOR JULY-SEPTEMBER 2018

FY 2017-18

Q1: BUDGET EXECUTION REPORT FOR JULY-SEPTEMBER 2017

Q2: BUDGET EXECUTION REPORT FOR JULY-DECEMBER 2017

Q3: BUDGET EXECUTION REPORT FOR JULY 2017-MARCH 2018

Q4: BUDGET EXECUTION REPORT FOR FY JULY 2017-JUNE 2018

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2018-2019\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/Quarter\\_I/BUDGET\\_EXECUTION\\_REPORT\\_FOR\\_THE\\_JULY-SEPT\\_2018\\_.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2018-2019_Budget_Execution_Reports/Quarter_I/BUDGET_EXECUTION_REPORT_FOR_THE_JULY-SEPT_2018_.pdf)

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fft.php%3F%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports&cHash=62c02486ddd82be39435b70a61426d3b](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fft.php%3F%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports&cHash=62c02486ddd82be39435b70a61426d3b)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the IYRs?

*While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see:*

<http://www.internationalbudget.org/opening-budgets/citizens-budgets/>.

Answer:

b. No

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-1. What is the fiscal year of the MYR evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer:  
FY 2017-18

Source:  
[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fft.php%3F%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2FQuarter\\_2&cHash=7e47f14edb4034991bb1e06a2c408320](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fft.php%3F%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports%2FQuarter_2&cHash=7e47f14edb4034991bb1e06a2c408320)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree  
Comments: Reference 2017-18:  
[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2017-2018\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law/2017-18\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2017-2018_Revised_Finance_Law/2017-18_Revised_Finance_Law.pdf)

MYR-2. When is the MYR made available to the public?

*Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.*

*The OBS methodology requires that for an MYR to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public no later than three months after the reporting period ends (i.e., three months after the midpoint of the fiscal year). If the MYR is not released to the public at least three months after the reporting period ends, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the MYR.*

Answer:  
d. The MYR is not released to the public, or is released more than three months after the midpoint

Source:  
The MYR in Rwanda is produced for internal use only.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree  
Comments: An explanatory note that provides justification of the MYR report of the fiscal year 2017-18 was not provided however progress has been made going forward and the justifications were provided for the FY 2018-19 MYR. Reference 2017-18:[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws%2F2017-2018\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law&cHash=3efab0b2202ec1d44c83a96a3eb1172c](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Annual_State_Finance_Laws%2F2017-2018_Revised_Finance_Law&cHash=3efab0b2202ec1d44c83a96a3eb1172c) Reference 2018-19:[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law/Explanatory\\_note\\_for\\_2018\\_19\\_Revised\\_Budget\\_-\\_English.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law/Explanatory_note_for_2018_19_Revised_Budget_-_English.pdf)

MYR-3a. If the MYR is published, what is the date of publication of the MYR?

*Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.*

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.*

*Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2018 should be entered as 05/09/2018. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.*

Answer:  
0/00/0000

Source:  
The MYR in Rwanda is produced for internal use only.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree  
Comments: An explanatory note that provides justification of the MYR report of the fiscal year 2017-18 was not provided however progress has been made going forward and the justifications were provided for the FY 2018-19 MYR. Reference 2018-19:[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law/Explanatory\\_note\\_for\\_2018\\_19\\_Revised\\_Budget\\_-\\_English.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law/Explanatory_note_for_2018_19_Revised_Budget_-_English.pdf)

MYR-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the MYR.

*If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:  
The MYR in Rwanda is produced for internal use only.

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree  
Comments: The MYR was produced and was shared on hard and soft copy only (not available online) but was not published for the FY 2017-18. However, progress has been made and in the FY 2018/19, MYR was produced and published on MINECOFIN Website.

IBP Comment  
As the MYR for 2017-18 was produced, but not made available to the public, then it is considered produced for internal use only.

MYR-4. If the MYR is published, what is the URL or weblink of the MYR?

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.*

Answer:  
<http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/>

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree  
Comments: The MYR was produced and was used for internal use but was not published for the FY 2017-18. However, progress has been made and in the FY 2018/19, MYR was produced and published on MINECOFIN Website. What was published for 2017-18 is the EB by legislature as per the link below. Reference:  
[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2017-2018\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law/2017-18\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2017-2018_Revised_Finance_Law/2017-18_Revised_Finance_Law.pdf)

MYR-5. If the MYR is published, are the numerical data contained in the MYR available in a machine readable format?

*Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs and Word (.doc/.docx) files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>.*

*Option "d" applies if the MYR is not published or not produced, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.*

Answer:  
d. Not applicable

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

MYR-6a. If the MYR is not publicly available, is it still produced?

*If the MYR is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question MYR-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.*

*Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question MYR-2).*

*Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.*

*Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.*

*Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.*

*Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.*

*If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.*

Answer:

c. Produced for internal purposes/use only

Source:

The MYR in Rwanda is produced for internal use only.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: As published in the news in the Parliament of Rwanda website: "February 7, 2018: As provided for under article 41 of Organic Law N°12/2013/OL of 12/09/2013 on State Finances and Property, the Minister of Finance and Economic Planning Claver Gatete today tabled before Parliament the 2017-18 revised budget proposal." Source: "Minister Gatete presented 2017-18 revised budget to Chamber of Deputies", 9 February 2018, Republic of Rwanda Parliament website. Link: [http://parliament.gov.rw/index.php?id=218&L=0&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bnews%5D=657&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&cHash=e575f3da86f4e27427ad71a9a4fa1fb7](http://parliament.gov.rw/index.php?id=218&L=0&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=657&tx_news_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx_news_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&cHash=e575f3da86f4e27427ad71a9a4fa1fb7)

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)

Comments: The MYR was produced and was shared on hard and soft copy only but was not published for the FY 2017-18. However, progress has been made and in the FY 2018/19, MYR was produced and published on MINECOFIN Website. Reference for 2018-19: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law/Explanatory\\_note\\_for\\_2018\\_19\\_Revised\\_Budget\\_-\\_English.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law/Explanatory_note_for_2018_19_Revised_Budget_-_English.pdf)

IBP Comment

As the MYR for 2017-18 was produced, but not made available to the public, then it is considered produced for internal use only.

MYR-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question MYR-6a, please specify how you determined whether the MYR was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

*If option "a","b," or "e" was selected in question MYR-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion:

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

MYR-7. If the MYR is produced, please write the full title of the MYR.

*For example, a title for the Mid-Year Review could be "Semi-annual Budget Performance Report, FY 2017/18" or "Mid-Year Report on the 2018 National Budget."*

*If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:

The MYR in Rwanda is produced for internal use only.

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree  
Comments: The MYR was produced and was shared on hard and soft copy only but was not published for the FY 2017-18. However, progress has been made and in the FY 2018/19, MYR was produced and published on MINECOFIN Website.

IBP Comment  
As the MYR for 2017-18 was produced, but not made available to the public, then it is considered produced for internal use only.

MYR-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the MYR?

*While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see: <http://www.internationalbudget.org/opening-budgets/citizens-budgets/>.*

Answer:  
b. No

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

YER-1. What is the fiscal year of the YER evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

*Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."*

Answer:  
FY 2016-17

Source:  
Minecofin Web site

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: The fiscal year of the YER is FY 2017-18

IBP Comment

OBS guidelines give governments 12 months after the end of the fiscal year to publish a Year-End Report. The YER for FY 2016-17 was due 30 June 2018, which means this is the appropriate YER to examine in this OBS.

YER-2. When is the YER made available to the public?

*Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.*

*The OBS methodology requires that for an YER to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public no later than one year after the fiscal year to which it corresponds. If the YER is not released to the public within one year after the end of the fiscal year to which it corresponds, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the YER.*

Answer:

d. The YER is not released to the public, or is released more than 12 months after the end of the budget year

Source:

The YER in Rwanda is produced for internal use only.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: a. Six months or less after the end of the budget year

Comments: The YER is published 45 days after the end of the budget year. For the FY 2017-18, the report was published on 14/08/2018. Reference: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=data%25253&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report&cHash=a77569c12eda7edddfa5da7bc3d3fe50](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=data%25253&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report&cHash=a77569c12eda7edddfa5da7bc3d3fe50)

IBP Comment

For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government -- the "Annual Budget Execution Report" -- is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

YER-3a. If the YER is published, what is the date of publication of the YER?

*Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.*

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.*

*Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2018 should be entered as 05/09/2018. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.*

Answer:

0/00/0000

Source:

The YER in Rwanda is produced for internal use only.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: For the FY 2017-18, the YER was published on 14/08/2018. Reference: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=data%25253&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report&cHash=a77569c12eda7edddfa5da7bc3d3fe50](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=data%25253&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report&cHash=a77569c12eda7edddfa5da7bc3d3fe50)

IBP Comment

For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government -- the "Annual Budget Execution Report" -- is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

YER-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the YER.

*If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:

The YER in Rwanda is produced for internal use only.

Source:

Minecofin web site

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: The date is determined by looking at the MINECOFIN website. Reference: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=data%25253&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report&cHash=a77569c12eda7edddfa5da7bc3d3fe50](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=data%25253&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report&cHash=a77569c12eda7edddfa5da7bc3d3fe50)

IBP Comment

For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government -- the "Annual Budget Execution Report" -- is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

YER-4. If the YER is published, what is the URL or weblink of the YER?

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.*

Answer:

<http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/>

Source:

Minecofin web site

The YER in Rwanda is produced for internal use only.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Disagree  
Suggested Answer: Reference: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=data%25253&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report&cHash=a77569c12eda7edddfa5da7bc3d3fe50](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=data%25253&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report&cHash=a77569c12eda7edddfa5da7bc3d3fe50)

IBP Comment  
For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government – the "Annual Budget Execution Report" – is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

YER-5. If the YER is published, are the numerical data contained in the YER available in a machine readable format?

*Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs and Word (.doc/.docx) files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>*

*Option "d" applies if the YER is not published or not produced, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.*

Answer:  
d. Not applicable

Source:  
The YER in Rwanda is produced for internal use only.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Disagree  
Suggested Answer: c. No  
Comments: For the FY 2017-18, the report was published on 14/08/2018 however the numerical data contained are not in a machine readable format. Reference: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=data%25253&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report&cHash=a77569c12eda7edddfa5da7bc3d3fe50](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=data%25253&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report&cHash=a77569c12eda7edddfa5da7bc3d3fe50)

IBP Comment  
For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government – the "Annual Budget Execution Report" – is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

YER-6a. If the YER is not publicly available, is it still produced?

*If the YER is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question YER-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.*

*Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question YER-2)*

*Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.*

*Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.*

*Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.*

*Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.*

If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.

Answer:

c. Produced for internal purposes/use only

Source:

The YER in Rwanda is produced for internal use only.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: On October 2018, the Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning hosted the Development Partner Coordination Group (DPCG), a quarterly consultative meeting between Government of Rwanda officials and development Partners, where the 2017-18 budget execution report was discussed. Quoting the press release: "Speaking at the meeting, the Permanent Secretary and Secretary to Treasury (PS-ST), Caleb Rwamuganza said: "Government of Rwanda believes in the importance of accountability and transparency and this meeting provides us with the opportunities to present to you the budget execution report for the last 2017-18 fiscal year." "Policy makers and Development Partners discuss Budget Execution, Human Capital Development", 04/10/2018, published on MINECOFIN website, available on [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=119&tx\\_ttnews%5Btt\\_news%5D=693&cHash=25e4eae04c143fd568f7adeb12314fe5](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=119&tx_ttnews%5Btt_news%5D=693&cHash=25e4eae04c143fd568f7adeb12314fe5)

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Comments: For the FY 2017-18, the YER was published on 14/08/2018. Reference: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=data%25253&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report&cHash=a77569c12eda7edddfa5da7bc3d3fe50](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=data%25253&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report&cHash=a77569c12eda7edddfa5da7bc3d3fe50)

IBP Comment

For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government -- the "Annual Budget Execution Report" -- is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

YER-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question YER-6a, please specify how you determined whether the YER was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

*If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question YER-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion:

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

YER-7. If the YER is produced, please write the full title of the YER.

*For example, a title for the Year-End Report could be "Consolidated Financial Statement for the Year Ended 31 March 2018" or "Annual Report 2017 Published by the Ministry of Finance and Planning." If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:

The YER in Rwanda is produced for internal use only.

Source:

The YER in Rwanda is produced for internal use only.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: BUDGET EXECUTION REPORT FOR FY JULY 2017-JUNE 2018 is the title of the YER of the FY 2017-18.

IBP Comment

For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government -- the "Annual Budget Execution Report" -- is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

YER-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the YER?

*While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see: <http://www.internationalbudget.org/opening-budgets/citizens-budgets/>.*

Answer:

b. No

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-1. What is the fiscal year of the AR evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

*Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."*

Answer:

FY 2016-17

Source:

Office of Auditor General (OAG)

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Financial\\_Reports/ANNUAL\\_REPORT\\_JUNE\\_2017\\_EXECUTIVE\\_SUMMARY.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Financial_Reports/ANNUAL_REPORT_JUNE_2017_EXECUTIVE_SUMMARY.pdf)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

AR-2. When is the AR made available to the public?

*Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.*

*The OBS methodology requires that for an AR to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public no later than 18 months after the end of the fiscal year to which it corresponds. If the AR is not released to the public at least 18 months after the end of the fiscal year to which it corresponds, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the AR.*

Answer:

b. 12 months or less, but more than six months, after the end of the budget year

Source:

Office of Auditor General (OAG)

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Financial\\_Reports/ANNUAL\\_REPORT\\_JUNE\\_2017\\_EXECUTIVE\\_SUMMARY.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Financial_Reports/ANNUAL_REPORT_JUNE_2017_EXECUTIVE_SUMMARY.pdf)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

AR-3a. If the AR is published, what is the date of publication of the AR?

*Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document. Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.*

*Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2018 should be entered as 05/09/2018. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.*

Answer:

18/6/2018

Source:

Office of Auditor General (OAG)

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/index.php?id=14&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bnews%5D=16&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bday%5D=3&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bmonth%5D=5&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Byear%5D=2018&cHash=63a5fe647a0ec57d7fce8dba325dfa9](http://www.oag.gov.rw/index.php?id=14&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=16&tx_news_pi1%5Bday%5D=3&tx_news_pi1%5Bmonth%5D=5&tx_news_pi1%5Byear%5D=2018&cHash=63a5fe647a0ec57d7fce8dba325dfa9)

Comment:

The date of the release stated above is the date when the Auditor General presented its report to the parliament

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: 30/04/2018

Comments: Although the date is not written in the report itself, according to the news published in the Parliament website, it is mentioned that "On April 30, 2018, the Office of the Auditor General tabled before both chambers of Parliament its report for the financial year ended 30/06/2017."

[http://parliament.gov.rw/index.php?](http://parliament.gov.rw/index.php?id=218&L=0&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=677&tx_news_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx_news_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&cHash=ee27a6749a742c9a497c2a8b4244260c)

[id=218&L=0&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bnews%5D=677&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&cHash=ee27a6749a742c9a497c2a8b4244260c](http://parliament.gov.rw/index.php?id=218&L=0&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=677&tx_news_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx_news_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&cHash=ee27a6749a742c9a497c2a8b4244260c)

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IBP Comment

Answer choice "18 June 2018" has been confirmed after consultation with the researcher. This is the earliest date we were able to confirm that the AR was published online.

AR-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the AR.

*If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:

The date was determined by looking at the date when the report was publicly presented to the parliament by the Auditor General

Source:

Office of the Auditor General (OAG)

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/index.php?](http://www.oag.gov.rw/index.php?id=14&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=16&tx_news_pi1%5Bday%5D=3&tx_news_pi1%5Bmonth%5D=5&tx_news_pi1%5Byear%5D=2018&cHash=63a5fe647a0ec57d7fcef8dba325dfa9)

[id=14&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bnews%5D=16&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bday%5D=3&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bmonth%5D=5&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Byear%5D=2018&cHash=63a5fe647a0ec57d7fcef8dba325dfa9](http://www.oag.gov.rw/index.php?id=14&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=16&tx_news_pi1%5Bday%5D=3&tx_news_pi1%5Bmonth%5D=5&tx_news_pi1%5Byear%5D=2018&cHash=63a5fe647a0ec57d7fcef8dba325dfa9)

Comment:

The uploaded report does not have a cover page with publication date, so it was difficult to determine the date but we relied on the OAG news. (refer to the link above)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The date of publication is not written in the report itself; but according to the news published in the Parliament website, it is mentioned that "On April 30, 2018, the Office of the Auditor General tabled before both chambers of Parliament its report for the financial year ended 30/06/2017." [http://parliament.gov.rw/index.php?](http://parliament.gov.rw/index.php?id=218&L=0&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=677&tx_news_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx_news_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&cHash=ee27a6749a742c9a497c2a8b4244260c)

[id=218&L=0&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bnews%5D=677&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&cHash=ee27a6749a742c9a497c2a8b4244260c](http://parliament.gov.rw/index.php?id=218&L=0&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=677&tx_news_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx_news_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&cHash=ee27a6749a742c9a497c2a8b4244260c)

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IBP Comment

Answer choice "18 June 2018" has been confirmed after consultation with the researcher. This is the earliest date we were able to confirm that the AR was published online.

AR-4. If the AR is published, what is the URL or weblink of the AR?

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.*

Answer:

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Financial\\_Reports/ANNUAL\\_REPORT\\_JUNE\\_2017\\_EXECUTIVE\\_SUMMARY.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Financial_Reports/ANNUAL_REPORT_JUNE_2017_EXECUTIVE_SUMMARY.pdf)

Source:

Office of the Auditor General (OAG)

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Financial\\_Reports/ANNUAL\\_REPORT\\_JUNE\\_2017\\_EXECUTIVE\\_SUMMARY.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Financial_Reports/ANNUAL_REPORT_JUNE_2017_EXECUTIVE_SUMMARY.pdf)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-5. If the AR is published, are the numerical data contained in the AR available in a machine readable format?

*Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs and Word (.doc/.docx) files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>*

*Option "d" applies if the AR is not published or not produced, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.*

Answer:

c. No

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Reference: [http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Financial\\_Reports/ANNUAL\\_REPORT\\_JUNE\\_2017\\_EXECUTIVE\\_SUMMARY.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Financial_Reports/ANNUAL_REPORT_JUNE_2017_EXECUTIVE_SUMMARY.pdf)

AR-6a. If the AR is not publicly available, is it still produced?

*If the AR is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question AR-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.*

*Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question AR-2).*

*Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.*

*Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.*

*Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.*

*Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.*

*If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.*

Answer:

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree  
Comments: [http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Financial\\_Reports/ANNUAL\\_REPORT\\_JUNE\\_2017\\_EXECUTIVE\\_SUMMARY.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Financial_Reports/ANNUAL_REPORT_JUNE_2017_EXECUTIVE_SUMMARY.pdf)

AR-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question AR-6a, please specify how you determined whether the AR was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

*If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question AR-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion:

Government Reviewer  
Opinion:

AR-7. If the AR is produced, please write the full title of the AR.

*For example, a title for the Audit Report could be "Annual General Reports of the Controller and Auditor General." If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

Answer:

REPORT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL OF STATE FINANCES FOR THE YEAR ENDED 30 JUNE 2017

Source:

Office of the Auditor General

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Financial\\_Reports/ANNUAL\\_REPORT\\_JUNE\\_2017\\_EXECUTIVE\\_SUMMARY.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Financial_Reports/ANNUAL_REPORT_JUNE_2017_EXECUTIVE_SUMMARY.pdf)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

AR-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the AR?

*While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see: <http://www.internationalbudget.org/opening-budgets/citizens-budgets/>.*

Answer:

b. No

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

GQ-1a. Are there one or more websites or web portals for disseminating government fiscal information? If yes, please provide the necessary links in the comment/citation.

*GQ-1a asks the researcher to list any government websites or portals where fiscal information can be found. For example, in New Zealand the Treasury website (<http://www.treasury.govt.nz/>) hosts important budget-related information, including the Pre-Budget Statement, the Executive's Budget Proposal, the Citizens Budget, In-Year Reports, the Mid-Year Review, and the Year-End Report. In addition, New Zealand's Parliamentary Counsel Office (<http://www.legislation.govt.nz/>) posts the Enacted Budget while the Controller and Auditor-General website (<http://www.oag.govt.nz/>) publishes the annual Audit Report. The New Zealand researcher would provide the links to each of these sites. Other countries have developed portals that include fiscal information, though not in the "documents" format. For example, these portals have been created by Mexico (<https://www.transparenciapresupuestaria.gob.mx/>) and Brazil (<http://www.portaltransparencia.gov.br/>). Some countries have both a website and a portal. The Brazilian government, for example, apart from the Transparency Portal, has a dedicated website for the federal budget, where all key documents and other information can be found ([www.orcamentofederal.gov.br](http://www.orcamentofederal.gov.br)). Researchers should include details about all of the relevant websites and/or portals that they can be used to access budget information.*

Answer:

a. Yes

Source:

Comment:

<http://www.minecofin.gov.rw>

<http://www.oag.gov.rw/index.php?id=2>

<https://www.bnr.rw/index.php?id=125>

<http://www.rra.gov.rw/>

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning <http://www.minecofin.gov.rw> Office of the Auditor General - Rwanda

<http://www.oag.gov.rw/index.php?id=2> Office Prime Minister Rwanda Publication of the Official Gazette <https://www.primature.gov.rw/index.php?id=42> BNR - National Bank of Rwanda <https://www.bnr.rw> RRA - Rwanda Revenue Authority <https://www.rra.gov.rw/>

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: In addition to the websites shared above, we also use the following for fiscal information: <http://www.statistics.gov.rw/>

GQ-1b. On these websites/portals, can revenue and/or expenditure data for the current fiscal year be downloaded as a consolidated file (or set of files)? If yes, please provide the necessary links in the comment/citation.

*GQ-1b, GQ-1c, and GQ-1d ask about whether governments publish specific types of content on their websites/portals: (a) consolidated files that contain revenue and/or expenditure information for the current fiscal year; (b) consolidated files that contain revenue and/or expenditure information for multiple years in consistent formats; and (c) infographics/visualizations or other similar tools used to simplify data access and analysis. Researchers should provide the links to relevant webpages and some explanations of what they contain.*

Answer:

a. Yes, both revenue and expenditure data can be downloaded as a consolidated file

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

Annex III provides a consolidated file with revenue and expenditure data for 2018/19.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The document titled "Annex III. Fiscal Projections for 2018-2021" contains a summary of the projected revenue and expenditure for 2018/19.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

GQ-1c. On these websites/portals, can consolidated revenue and/or expenditure data be downloaded for multiple years in consistent formats? If yes, please provide the necessary links and details in the comment/citation.

Answer:

a. Yes, both revenue and expenditure data can be downloaded for multiple years in consistent formats

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

Annex III provides a consolidated file with revenue and expenditure data for 2019/20 and 2020/21 (BY+1 and BY+2)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The document titled "Annex III. Fiscal Projections for 2018-2021" contains a summary of the projected revenue and expenditure for 2018/19, 2019/20 and 2020/21.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: for 2019-20 [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2019-2022\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e6c0efc08666e4cfd2c084eff262f3a1](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2019-2022_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e6c0efc08666e4cfd2c084eff262f3a1) And going forward, the EBP will be presented and published on the website in a consistent format.

GQ-1d. On these websites/portals, are infographics/visualizations or other similar tools used to simplify data access and analysis? If yes, please provide the necessary links and details in the comment/citation.

Answer:

b. No

Source:

Minecofin

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal\\_Decentralisation\\_Unit/Budget\\_Citizen\\_Guide/2018-2019/2018\\_19\\_Final\\_Citizen\\_Guide\\_to\\_the\\_Budget\\_-\\_Kinyarwanda.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal_Decentralisation_Unit/Budget_Citizen_Guide/2018-2019/2018_19_Final_Citizen_Guide_to_the_Budget_-_Kinyarwanda.pdf)

Comment:

There are some infographics in the Citizen budget, but no other interactive infographics.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: a. Yes

Comments: In addition to the shared link by the researcher, below is another link on the MINECOFIN website with various info-graphics on fiscal data.  
<http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=165>

IBP Comment

The page cited by the government is a static PDF, and not interactive graphics that would qualify for this question.

GQ-2. Are there laws in place guiding public financial management and/or auditing? If yes, please provide the necessary details and links in the comment/citation, and specify whether and where the law(s) contains specific provisions for budget transparency and/or participation.

*GQ-2 asks about the existence of any national laws governing public financial management and auditing. These may include a public finance act, a section of the constitution, or an organic budget law. In some countries, fiscal responsibility legislation may also be relevant. For example, the Kenya researcher may include the link to its Public Finance Management Act, 2012 (<http://www.kenyalaw.org/lex/actview.xhtml?actid=No.%2018%20of%202012>), and the Macedonian researcher may include a link to its State Audit Law (<https://www.finance.gov.mk/files/u11/Audit%20law.pdf>). Researchers should provide links to websites where such laws are published, if possible, or an electronic copy of the law itself. They should also indicate if and where (e.g. which article) these laws include specific provisions for budget transparency and citizen participation in budget processes.*

Answer:

a. Yes

Source:

Official Gazette n° Special of 05/11/2013

The Organic Law on State finances and property in it's Article 4: Fundamental principles of public finance management

<http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=20&L=0>

See also Official Gazette n° Special of 03/02/2016,

The ministerial order N°001/16/10/TC of 26/01/2016: In it's Article 10 on General planning and budgeting principles for public entities. It states that

Planning and budgeting within public entities shall

be :

1 ° participatory, consultative, transparent

and inclusiveness of all stakeholders;

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The Chapter IX of the Constitution describes the general principles on State Finance and Taxes, in particular, articles 165 (Office of the Auditor General of State Finances) and article 166 (Report of the Auditor General of State Finances)

[http://parliament.gov.rw/fileadmin/Bills\\_CD/THE\\_CONSTITUTION\\_OF\\_THE\\_REPUBLIC\\_OF\\_RWANDA\\_OF\\_2003\\_REVISIED\\_IN\\_2015.pdf](http://parliament.gov.rw/fileadmin/Bills_CD/THE_CONSTITUTION_OF_THE_REPUBLIC_OF_RWANDA_OF_2003_REVISIED_IN_2015.pdf) At the website of the Auditor General, it can also be found "The Law no 79/2013 of 11/09/2013 determining the mission, organisation and functioning of the Office of the Auditor General of State Finances". [http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Documents/OAG\\_LAW.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Documents/OAG_LAW.pdf)

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments:

1. [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Legal/Ministerial\\_Orders/Ministerial\\_Order\\_on\\_Financial\\_Regulations.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Legal/Ministerial_Orders/Ministerial_Order_on_Financial_Regulations.pdf)  
"openness and information to the public on matters relating to public finance management"

GQ-3. Are there additional laws regulating: (1) access to information; (2) government transparency; or (3) citizens participation? If yes, please provide the necessary details and links in the comment/citation, and specify whether and where these laws contain specific provisions for budget transparency and/or participation.

*The third and last question asks researchers to list any additional laws regulating access to information, transparency, or citizens' participation that are relevant for the promotion of budget transparency and citizen participation in budget processes. These might include legislation related to access to information, to planning processes, or to public administration more generally. India's Right to Information Act of 2005 (<https://www.ncess.gov.in/facilities/central-public-information-officer/rti-act-details.html>) is an example of this type of law. More information on access to information legislation (constitutional provisions, laws, and regulations), including examples of model laws, can be found here: <http://www.right2info.org/laws/constitutional-provisions-laws-and-regulations#section-1>.*

Answer:

a. Yes

Source:

OAG: Official Gazette n° 45 of 11/11/2013

LAW N° 79/2013 OF 11/09/2013 DETERMINING THE MISSION, ORGANIZATION AND FUNCTIONING OF THE OFFICE OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL OF STATE FINANCES

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/\\_migrated/content\\_uploads/OAG\\_LAW.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/_migrated/content_uploads/OAG_LAW.pdf)

See article 7

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Additional laws regulating participation and transparency are: -Ministerial Order on Financial Regulations On page 36, article 10 titled "General planning and budgeting principles for public entities" contains a paragraph on participation: "Planning and budgeting within public entities shall be as follows: 1° participatory, consultative, transparent and inclusiveness of all stakeholders" Link:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Legal/Ministerial\\_Orders/Ministerial\\_Order\\_on\\_Financial\\_Regulations.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Legal/Ministerial_Orders/Ministerial_Order_on_Financial_Regulations.pdf) - Organic

Law on State finances and property On page 16, article 4 describes the fundamental principles of public finance management as: "In using public funds, the following fundamental public finance management principles shall be put into consideration: 1° comprehensiveness; 2° transparency; 3° accountability; 4° uniformity" On page 24, article 13 describes one of the responsibilities of the minister as: "to promote and enforce transparency and accountability in use of public funds, including the publication of reports as defined in Articles 63, 64, 65 and 66 of this Organic Law" Link:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Legal/State\\_Finance\\_Law/Law\\_on\\_State\\_Finances\\_and\\_Property.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Legal/State_Finance_Law/Law_on_State_Finances_and_Property.pdf)

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Legal/Constitution/The\\_Constitution.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Legal/Constitution/The_Constitution.pdf)

1. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?

GUIDELINES:

*Question 1 addresses the presentation of expenditure by administrative unit. This information indicates which government entity (ministry, department, or agency, or MDAs) will be responsible for spending the funds and, ultimately, held accountable for their use.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for all administrative units, accounting for all expenditures, in the budget year. To answer "b," the administrative units shown individually, in the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation, must account for at least two-thirds of all expenditures in the budget year. In other words, the sum of the expenditures assigned to the individual MDAs (education, health, infrastructure, interior, defense, etc.) must account for at least two-thirds of the total expenditure budgeted for that particular year. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents administrative units that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by administrative unit.*

Answer:

a. Yes, administrative units accounting for all expenditures are presented.

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

Comment:

Annex II-6 presents expenditure by administrative unit

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Detailed expenditure by budget agency are presented in the documents called "Annex II-1-2018-2019 DETAILED EXPENDITURE BY BUDGET AGENCY" and "ANNEX II-6: 2018/2021 BUDGET BY BUDGET AGENCY" accounting for the total expenditure for the 2018/19 budget (FRW 2,443.5 billion).

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Apart from Annex I that present state revenues, Annex II-8 and II-9 that present the budget by COFOG and National Strategy For Transformation respectively; all the other budget annexes presents administrative units. Source: The Zip Folder named 2018-21\_Executive\_Budget\_Proposal.zip; Accessible Through: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

2. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year by functional classification?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 2 addresses the presentation of expenditure by functional classification. This classification indicates the programmatic purpose, sector, or objective for which the funds will be used, such as health, education, or defense. Administrative units are not necessarily aligned with functional classifications. For instance, in one country all functions connected with water supply (which fall into the "Housing" function) may be undertaken by a single government agency, while in another country they may be distributed across the Ministries of Environment, Housing, and Industrial Development. In the latter case, three ministries have programs addressing water supply, so three ministries contribute to one function. Similarly, some administrative units may conduct activities that cut across more than one function. For instance, in the example above, some programs of the Ministry of Environment would also be classified in the "environmental protection" function.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for the budget year organized by functional classification.*

Answer:

a. Yes, expenditures are presented by functional classification.

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

Comment:

Functional classification: Annex II-8

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Detailed expenditure by budget agency is presented in the document called "ANNEX II-8: 2018/2021 STATE OF EXPENDITURE BY DIVISION AND GROUPS" accounting for the total expenditure for the 2018/19 budget (FRW 2,443.5 billion).

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Annex II-8 in the Zip Folder named 2018-21\_Executive\_Budget\_Proposal.zip accessible on the following link presents the budget by COFOG [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

3. If the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation presents expenditures for the budget year by functional classification, is the

functional classification compatible with international standards?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 3 asks whether a country's functional classification meets international standards. To answer "a," a country's functional classification must be aligned with the OECD and the UN's Classification of the Functions of Government (COFOG), or provide a cross-walk between the national functional presentation and COFOG.*

*The OECD Best Practices for Budget Transparency can be viewed at <http://www.oecd.org/gov/budgeting/Best%20Practices%20Budget%20Transparency%20-%20complete%20with%20cover%20page.pdf>*

*COFOG can be viewed at [https://unstats.un.org/unsd/publication/SeriesM/SeriesM\\_84E.pdf](https://unstats.un.org/unsd/publication/SeriesM/SeriesM_84E.pdf) or at <http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/qfs/manual/pdf/ch6ann.pdf>.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, the functional classification is compatible with international standards.

**Source:**

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

**Comment:**

Functional classification: Annex II-8

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The divisions in the budget are aligned with the COFOG, and are grouped in ten areas: - general public services - defence - public order and safety - economic affairs - environmental protection - housing and community amenities - health - recreation, culture and religion - education - social protection

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Annex II-8 in the Zip Folder named 2018-21\_Executive\_Budget\_Proposal.zip accessible on the following link presents the budget by COFOG [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

4. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year by economic classification?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 4 asks whether the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents expenditures for the budget year organized by economic classification. Economic classification provides information on the nature of the expenditure, such as whether funds are being used to pay for wages and salaries, capital projects, or social assistance benefits.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for the budget year organized by economic classification.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, expenditures are presented by economic classification.

**Source:**

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

**Comment:**

Table 9, page 22  
Annex II-4  
Annex II-7

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Detailed expenditure by economic classification of each of the budget agencies is presented in the document called "ANNEX II-7: 2018/2021 BUDGET BY AGENCY AND BY ECONOMIC CHAPTERS" accounting for the total expenditure for the 2018/19 budget (FRW 2,443.5 billion).

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Table 9 on page 22 of the Budget Framework Paper present the budget by economic classification as per GFSM 1986 [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf) Annex II-4 and II-7 in the Zip Folder named 2018-21\_Executive\_Budget\_Proposal.zip accessible on the following link presents the budget by Economic Categories as per GFS 2014 [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

5. If the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation presents expenditures for the budget year by economic classification, is the economic classification compatible with international standards?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 5 asks whether a country's economic classification meets international standards. To answer "a," a country's economic classification must be consistent with the International Monetary Fund's (IMF) 2001 Government Finance Statistics (GFS). The GFS economic classification is presented here: <http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/app4.pdf>. To learn more about Government Finance Statistics also refer to the entire IMF 2001 GFS manual (<http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/all.pdf>).*

Answer:

a. Yes, the economic classification is compatible with international standards.

Source:

Comment:

Table 9, page 22 is consistent with GFS economic classification

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The document titled "ANNEX II-7: 2018/2021 BUDGET BY AGENCY AND BY ECONOMIC CHAPTERS" presents the budget information according to the GFS classification, including the correct coding for each expense line.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Annex II-4 and II-7 in the Zip Folder named 2018-21\_Executive\_Budget\_Proposal.zip accessible on the following link presents the budget by Economic Categories as per GFS 2014 [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

6. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 6 asks whether expenditures are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should treat the term "program" as meaning any level of detail below an administrative unit – that is, any programmatic grouping that is below the ministry, department, or agency level. For example, the Ministry of Health's budget could be broken down into several subgroups, such as "primary health care," "hospitals," or "administration." These subgroups should be considered programs even if they could be, but are not, broken down into smaller, more detailed units.*

*A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as le plan comptable or le plan comptable detaillé. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures, in the budget year. To answer "b," the programs shown individually in the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must account for at least two-thirds of all expenditures in the budget year. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents programs that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by program.*

*Budget decisions for the upcoming year can also affect the parameters of future budgets. It is therefore useful to estimate revenues and expenditures for multi-year periods, understanding that these estimates might be revised as circumstances change. Sometimes referred to as a Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF), a three-year period – that is, the budget year plus two more years – is generally considered an appropriate horizon for budgeting and planning.*

Answer:

a. Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented.

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

Comment:

Annex II-5

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Expenditure by program and budget agency is presented in the document titled "ANNEX II-5:2018-2021 - BUDGET BY AGENCY, PROGRAM AND SUB-PROGRAM" accounting for the total expenditure of FRW 2,443.5 billion.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Annex II-1, II-2 and II-5 in the Zip Folder named 2018-21\_Executive\_Budget\_Proposal.zip accessible on the following link presents the budget by Programs and Subprograms [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

7. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditure estimates for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 7 asks if multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by any one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications – which were addressed in Questions 1-5 above. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditure estimates by all three of the expenditure classifications for at least two years beyond the budget year. To answer "b," multi-year expenditure estimates must be presented by two of these three classifications. A "c" answer applies if multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented by any of the three classifications.*

Answer:

a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

Comment:

Expenditure is projected out to 2019/20 and 2020/21 (BY+1 and BY +2),

Administrative classification: Annex II-7

Economic classification: Annex II-7

Functional classification: Annex II-8

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Multi-year expenditure by administrative unit is also presented in the document titled "ANNEX II-6: 2018/2021 BUDGET BY BUDGET AGENCY"

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The budget is prepared in MTEF. Annex II-6 presents the budget in MTEF by administrative classification Annex II-7 presents the budget in MTEF by both Administrative and Economic categories Annex II-8 presents the budget in MTEF by Functional Classification All can be accessible in the Zip Folder named 2018-21\_Executive\_Budget\_Proposal.zip on the following link: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

7b. Based on the response to Question 7, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications have estimates for a multi-year period in the Executive's Budget Proposal?

Answer:

Administrative classification

Economic classification

Functional classification

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

Comment:

Administrative classification: Annex II-7

Economic classification: Annex II-7

Functional classification: Annex II-8

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: All the expenditure classifications have estimates for a multi-year period in the Executive's Budget Proposal

8. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditure estimates for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year) by program?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 8 asks if multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department. For example, the Ministry of Health's budget could be broken down into several subgroups, such as "primary health care," "hospitals," or "administration." These subgroups should be considered programs even if they could be, but are not, broken down into smaller, more detailed units.*

*A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as le plan comptable or le plan comptable detaillé. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures, for at least two years beyond the budget year. To answer "b," the programs shown individually in the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must account for at least two-thirds of all expenditures over the multi-year period. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents multi-year estimates for programs that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if multi-year estimates are not presented by program.*

*Revenues generally are separated into two major categories: "tax" and "non-tax" revenues. Taxes are compulsory transfers that result from government exercising its sovereign power. The largest sources of tax revenue in some countries are taxes on personal and business income and taxes on goods and services, such as sales or value-added taxes. The category of non-tax revenues is more diverse, ranging from grants from international institutions and foreign governments to funds raised through the sale of government-provided goods and services. Note that some forms of revenue, such as contributions to social security funds, can be considered either a tax or non-tax revenue depending on the nature of the approach to these contributions. Particularly because different revenues have different characteristics, including who bears the burden of paying the tax and how collections are affected by economic conditions, it is helpful when estimates for revenues are disaggregated and displayed based on their sources.*

*For more information, please refer to the 2001 GFS manual, in particular Appendix 4 (<http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/app4.pdf>).*

Answer:

a. Yes, multi-year estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures are presented.

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

Comment:

Annex II-5 presents program level detail for two years beyond the budget year, until 2020-21.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Annex II-5 presents the budget by program and subprogram two years beyond the budget year, until 2020-21.

9. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present the individual sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 9 assesses the degree to which the individual sources of "tax" revenue are disaggregated in the budget. The largest sources of tax revenue in some countries are taxes on personal and business income and taxes on goods and services, such as sales or value-added taxes.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present all individual sources of tax revenue for the budget year, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all tax revenue. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present individual sources of tax revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all tax revenue, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents individual sources of tax revenue that account for less than two-thirds of tax revenues. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of tax revenue are not presented.*

Answer:

a. Yes, individual sources of tax revenue accounting for all tax revenue are presented.

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

Comment:

Annex I

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Individual sources of tax revenue accounting for all tax revenue are presented in the document titled "ANNEX I: STATE REVENUES 2018/2021"

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Annex I that present state revenues by individual sources of tax revenue as per GFSM 2014. Source: The Zip Folder named 2018-21\_Executive\_Budget\_Proposal.zip; Accessible Through: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

10. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present the individual sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of government-produced goods and services) for the budget year?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 10 assesses the degree to which the individual sources of "non-tax" revenue are disaggregated in the budget. The category of non-tax revenues is*

diverse, and can include revenue ranging from grants from international institutions and foreign governments to funds raised through the sale of government-provided goods and services.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present all individual sources of non-tax revenue for the budget year, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all non-tax revenue. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present individual sources of non-tax revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all non-tax revenue, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents individual sources of non-tax revenue that account for less than two-thirds of non-tax revenues. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of non-tax revenue are not presented.

Answer:

a. Yes, individual sources of non-tax revenue accounting for all non-tax revenue are presented.

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

Comment:

Annex I

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Individual sources of non-tax revenue accounting for all non-tax revenue are presented in the document titled "ANNEX I: STATE REVENUES 2018/2021"

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Annex I that present state revenues by individual sources of non tax revenue as per GFSM 2014. Source: The Zip Folder named 2018-21\_Executive\_Budget\_Proposal.zip; Accessible Through: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

11. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax) for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 11 evaluates whether revenue estimates are presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year) by "category," that is, whether tax and non-tax sources of revenue are shown separately.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present multi-year estimates of revenues classified by category for at least two years following the budget year in question.*

Answer:

a. Yes, multi-year estimates of revenue are presented by category.

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

Comment:

Annex I presents revenue categories (tax, grants, other revenues, disposal of assets, proceeds from loan borrowings) for two years beyond the budget year, until 2020/21.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Annex I presents revenue categories as per GFSM 2014 (tax, other revenues) for two years beyond the budget year, until 2020/21. Source: The Zip Folder named 2018-21\_Executive\_Budget\_Proposal.zip; Accessible Through: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

12. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates for individual sources of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 12 evaluates whether revenue estimates for individual sources of revenue are presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year). The question applies to both tax and non-tax revenue.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present multi-year estimates of all sources of revenue individually, accounting for all revenue, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all revenue. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present multi-year estimates of individual sources of revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all revenue, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents multi-year estimates of individual revenue sources that account for less than two-thirds of revenue. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of revenue are not presented for a multi-year period.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented.

**Source:**

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

**Comment:**

Annex I presents individual sources of revenue for two years beyond the budget year, until 2020/21.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Annex I presents individual sources of revenue for two years beyond the budget year, until 2020/21. Source: The Zip Folder named 2018-21\_Executive\_Budget\_Proposal.zip; Accessible Through: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

13. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 13 asks about three key estimates related to borrowing and debt that the budget should include:*

- *the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year;*
- *the central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year; and*
- *the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year.*

*Debt is the accumulated amount of money that the government borrows. The government can borrow from its citizens and banks and businesses within the country (domestic debt) or from creditors outside the country (external debt). External debt is typically owed to private commercial banks, other governments, or international financial institutions such as the World Bank and the IMF.*

*Net new borrowing is the additional amount of new borrowing that is required for the budget year to finance expenditures in the budget that exceed available revenues. Net new borrowing adds to the accumulated debt. It is distinct from gross borrowing, which also includes borrowing needed to repay existing debt that matured during the budget year; debt that is replaced (or rolled over) does not add to the total of accumulated debt.*

*Interest payments on the debt (or debt service costs) are typically made at regular intervals, and these payments must be made on a timely basis in order to avoid defaulting on the debt obligation. Interest payments are separate from the repayment of principal, which occurs only when the loan has matured and must be paid back in full.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present all three estimates of borrowing and debt. For a "b" answer, the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present two of those three estimates. For a "c" answer, the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present one of the three estimates. Answer "d" applies no information on borrowing and debt is presented for the budget year.*

Answer:

a. Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

Comment:

Net new borrowing for 2018/19: see Table 9  
Total debt outstanding at end of 2018/19: not presented  
Interest payments on debt for 2018/19: see Table 9

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

Comments: Net new borrowing for 2018/19: Annex I (page 4) presents Proceeds From Loan Borrowings (both Domestic borrowing and External Borrowing). In addition, Table 9 (Fiscal projections for the medium term covering 2017/18 to 2020/21) on page 22 of the BFP also show net financing [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf) Interest payments on debt for 2018/19: Annex II-4 presents the budget by category whereby one of them is interest payment. In addition, Table 9 (Fiscal projections for the medium term covering 2017/18 to 2020/21) on page 22 of the BFP also show interest payment. The central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year: Annex named Annex II - Basic Macro Indicators 2011 -2021 (in Excel) on its row number 36 presents Central Government Total debt (end period)% of GDP). Since the GDP is also provided, anyone who would wish to know the nominal value of government debts can easily run simple calculation and get it. Reference: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

Researcher Response

Answer adjusted to "a"

IBP Comment

Total debt as a percentage of GDP as a proxy for the total debt figure as the nominal GDP level is presented in the same annex.

13b. Based on the response to Question 13, check the box(es) below to identify which estimates of government borrowing and debt are presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal:

Answer:

The amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year  
The interest payments on outstanding debt for the budget year  
The central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

Comment:

Net new borrowing for 2018/19: see Table 9  
Total debt outstanding at end of 2018/19: not presented  
Interest payments on debt for 2018/19: see Table 9

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: The amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year The central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year The interest payments on outstanding debt for the budget year

Comments: Net new borrowing for 2018/19: Annex I (page 4) presents Proceeds From Loan Borrowings (both Domestic borrowing and External Borrowing). In addition, Table 9 (Fiscal projections for the medium term covering 2017/18 to 2020/21) on page 22 of the BFP also show net financing [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf) The interest payments on outstanding debt for the budget year: Annex II-4 presents the budget by category whereby one of them is interest payment. In addition, Table 9 (Fiscal projections for the medium term covering 2017/18 to 2020/21) on page 22 of the BFP also show interest payment. The central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year: Annex named Annex II - Basic Macro Indicators 2011 -2021 (in Excel) on its row number 36 presents Central Government Total debt (end period)% of GDP). Since the GDP is also provided, anyone who would wish to know the nominal value of government debts can easily run simple calculation and get it. Reference: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

IBP Comment

Total debt as a percentage of GDP as a proxy for the total debt figure as the nominal GDP level is presented in the same annex.

14. "Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year?"

(The core information must include interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)"

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 14 focuses on the composition of government debt at the end of the budget year, asking whether "core" information related to its composition is presented. These core components include:*

- *interest rates on the debt;*
- *maturity profile of the debt; and*
- *whether the debt is domestic or external.*

*The interest rates affect the amount of interest that must be paid to creditors. The maturity profile indicates the final payment date of the loan, at which point the principal (and all remaining interest) is due to be paid; government borrowing typically includes a mix of short-term and long-term debt. As discussed in Question 13, domestic debt is held by a country's citizens, banks, and businesses, while external debt is held by foreigners. These factors related to the composition of the debt give an indication of the potential vulnerability of the country's debt position, and ultimately whether the cost of servicing the accumulated debt is affordable.*

*Beyond these core elements, a government may also provide additional information related to the composition of its debt, including for instance: whether interest rates are fixed or variable; whether debt is callable; the currency of the debt; a profile of the creditors (bilateral institutions, multilateral institutions, commercial banks, Central Bank, etc.); an analysis of the risk associated with the debt; and where appropriate, what the debt is being used to finance.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to the composition of government debt at the end of the budget year as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to the composition of government debt is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on the composition of the debt outstanding at the end of the budget year.*

Answer:

c. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

Comment:

Information on the composition of government debt is not presented.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

c. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

Comments: Annex named Annex II - Basic Macro Indicators 2011 -2021 (in Excel) on its row number 36 presents Central Government Total debt (end period)% of GDP). Row number 37 and 38 show Central Government Domestic debt (end period)% of GDP) and Central Government External debt (end period)% of GDP) respectively. Since the GDP is also provided, anyone who would wish to know the nominal value of government debts can easily run simple calculation and get it. Reference: Annex named Annex II - Basic Macro Indicators 2011 -2021 (in Excel) available on

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

IBP Comment

Answer choice "C" selected for cross country comparability. As the Government Reviewer noted, Annex II provides the breakdown of debt into external and domestic, and presents it as a percentage of GDP. This is acceptable as the GDP level is also included in Annex II.

14b. Based on the response to Question 14, check the box(es) to identify which elements of the composition of the total debt outstanding are presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal:

Answer:

Whether the debt is domestic or external

Source:

Minecofin

Budget Framework Paper 2018/2019-2020/2021. April 2018

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: Whether the debt is domestic or external Information beyond the core elements (Central Government Service of external debt (in % exports goods+services))

Comments: Annex named Annex II - Basic Macro Indicators 2011 -2021 (in Excel) on its row number 36 presents Central Government Total debt (end period)% of GDP). Row number 37 and 38 show Central Government Domestic debt (end period)% of GDP and Central Government External debt (end period)% of GDP) respectively. Since the GDP is also provided, anyone who would wish to know the nominal value of government debts can easily run simple calculation and get it. Reference: Annex named Annex II - Basic Macro Indicators 2011 -2021 (in Excel) available on [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

IBP Comment

As the Government Reviewer noted, Annex II provides the breakdown of debt into external and domestic, and presents it as a percentage of GDP. This is acceptable as the GDP level is also included in Annex II.

15. "Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?"

(The core information must include a discussion of the economic outlook with estimates of nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)"

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 15 focuses on the macroeconomic forecast that underlies the budget's revenue and expenditure estimates, asking whether "core" information related to the economic assumptions is presented. These core components include a discussion of the economic outlook as well as estimates of the following:*

- *nominal GDP level;*
- *inflation rate;*
- *real GDP growth; and*
- *interest rates.*

*While the core macroeconomic information should be a standard feature of the Executive's Budget Proposal, the importance of some types of macroeconomic assumptions may vary from country to country. For example, the budget estimates of some countries are particularly affected by changes in the price of oil and other commodities.*

Beyond these core elements, some governments also provide additional information related to the economic outlook, including for instance: short and long-term interest rates; rate of employment and unemployment; GDP deflator; price of oil and other commodities; current account; exchange rate; and composition of GDP growth.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to the macroeconomic forecast as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to the macroeconomic forecast is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information on the macroeconomic forecast is presented.

Answer:

b. Yes, the core information is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.

Source:

MINECOFIN

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

Comment:

nominal GDP level: Annex II Basic Macro Indicators

inflation rate: Annex II Basic Macro Indicators

real GDP growth: Annex II Basic Macro Indicators

interest rates:

Information beyond the core: Balance of payments, gross investment, net savings, and private sector credit information is all available in Annex II Basic Macro Indicators.

Annex II Basic Macro Indicators does present macro information based on calendar years, rather than the government's fiscal year.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.

Comments: In addition to the core information for the macroeconomic forecast which are presented additional information beyond the core are presented including: Balance of payments, gross investment, net savings, Exchange rates and private sector credit. Reference: Annex named Annex II - Basic Macro Indicators 2011 -2021 (in Excel) available on [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

IBP Comment

Answer choice "B" is maintained. While the EBP does include information beyond the core, it also misses a core element necessary to score "A" -- information on interest rates.

15b. Based on the response to Question 15, check the box(es) to identify which elements of the macroeconomic forecast are included in the Executive's Budget Proposal:

Answer:

Nominal GDP level

Inflation rate

Real GDP growth

Information beyond the core elements (please specify)

Source:

Minecofin

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

Comment:

nominal GDP level: Annex II Basic Macro Indicators

inflation rate: Annex II Basic Macro Indicators

real GDP growth: Annex II Basic Macro Indicators  
interest rates:

Information beyond the core: Balance of payments, gross investment, net savings, and private sector credit information is all available in Annex II Basic Macro Indicators.

Annex II Basic Macro Indicators does present macro information based on calendar years, rather than the government's fiscal year.

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

16. "Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget?"

(The core information must include estimates of the impact on expenditures, revenue, and debt of different assumptions for the inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)"

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 16 focuses on the issue of whether the Executive's Budget Proposal shows how different macroeconomic assumptions affect the budget estimates (known as a "sensitivity analysis"). It asks whether "core" information related to a sensitivity analysis is presented, estimating the impact on expenditures, revenue, and debt of different assumptions for:*

- *inflation rate;*
- *real GDP growth; and*
- *interest rates.*

*A sensitivity analysis shows the effect on the budget of possible changes in some macroeconomic assumptions, and is important for understanding the impact of the economy on the budget; for instance, what would happen to revenue collections if GDP growth were slower than what is assumed in the budget proposal? Or what would happen to expenditure if inflation were higher than estimated? Or how will revenue be affected by a decrease in the price of oil?*

*As noted for Question 15, changes in certain macroeconomic assumptions, such as the price of oil and other commodities, can have a significant impact on the budget estimates. As a result, some sensitivity analyses may also examine the impact on the budget estimates of changes in assumptions such as the price of oil that are beyond the core elements of the inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to a "sensitivity analysis" as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to a "sensitivity analysis" is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information on "sensitivity analysis" is presented.*

Answer:

d. No, information related to different macroeconomic assumptions is not presented.

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

Comment:

Sensitivity analysis not included in the EBP.

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

17. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how new policy proposals, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Questions 17 and 18 ask about new policy proposals in the budget. In any given year, most of the expenditures and revenues in the budget reflect the continuation of existing policies. However, much of the attention during the budget debate is focused on new proposals – whether they call for eliminating an existing program, introducing a new one, or changing an existing program at the margins. Typically, these new proposals are accompanied by an increase, a decrease, or a shift in expenditures or revenues. Because these changes may have different impacts on people's lives, the budget proposal should present sufficient detail about new policies and their budgetary impact.*

*Question 17 asks about new expenditure policies, and Question 18 asks about new revenue policies. To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present both estimates of how all new policy proposals affect expenditures (for Question 17) or revenues (for Question 18) and a narrative discussion of the impact of these new policies. To answer "b" for either question, the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present estimates that show the impact of all new policy proposals, but no narrative discussion is included. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes only a narrative discussion, or if it includes estimates that show the impact of only some, but not all, policy proposals (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on the impact of new policy proposals.*

**Answer:**

c. Yes, information that shows how some but not all new policy proposals affect expenditure is presented.

**Source:**

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

see page 27 to 37 in the Budget Framework Papers for information on allocations to NST1 Pillars. However this information does not provide information/estimates on the impact of new policy proposals on expenditure.

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

b. Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect expenditures are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

Comments: The executive budget proposal presents impact of new policy proposals that affect expenditure. For example section III of the Budget Framework paper (on page number 16:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf#page=15&zoom=100,0,85](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf#page=15&zoom=100,0,85)) is called "OBJECTIVES AND POLICIES FOR THE MEDIUM TERM 2018/19- 2020/21". It talks about measures to promote import substitution and diversified exports as well as promoting made in Rwanda. Further, sub section III.1.7 on page 21 of the BFP says "Regarding expenditures, implementation of expenditure prioritization measures are expected to allow expenditures to decline from 27% of GDP in 2018/19 to 26.3% of GDP in 2019/20 and to 26.2% of GDP in 2020/21. The prioritization strategy will mostly affect recurrent spending which is projected at 14.8% of GDP in 2018/19 with a decline to 14.2% of GDP in 2019/20 and to 13.9% of GDP by 2020/21. Spending on investment projects will however remain robust in the medium term as capital expenditure, which is projected at 10.1% of GDP in 2018/19 will reach 10.4% of GDP by 2020/21.

**IBP Comment**

After further consultation with the researcher, answer adjusted to "C." Some information on how new policies impact expenditure can be found in the Budget Framework Paper, for example on pages 25 and 26 there is brief discussion of new spending such as the construction of a strategic petroleum reserve storage facility. Estimates of the impact of all new policies are not presented however.

18. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how new policy proposals, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Questions 17 and 18 ask about new policy proposals in the budget. In any given year, most of the expenditures and revenues in the budget reflect the continuation of existing policies. However, much of the attention during the budget debate is focused on new proposals – whether they call for eliminating an existing program, introducing a new one, or changing an existing program at the margins. Typically, these new proposals are accompanied by an increase, a decrease, or a shift in expenditures or revenues. Because these changes may have different impacts on people's lives, the budget proposal should present sufficient detail about new policies and their budgetary impact.*

Question 17 asks about new expenditure policies, and Question 18 asks about new revenue policies. To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present both estimates of how all new policy proposals affect expenditures (for Question 17) or revenues (for Question 18) and a narrative discussion of the impact of these new policies. To answer "b" for either question, the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present estimates that show the impact of all new policy proposals, but no narrative discussion is included. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes only a narrative discussion, or if it includes estimates that show the impact of only some, but not all, policy proposals (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on the impact of new policy proposals.

Prior-year information constitutes an important benchmark for assessing the proposals for the upcoming budget year. Estimates of prior years should be presented in the same formats (in terms of classification) as the budget year to ensure that year-to-year comparisons are meaningful. For example, if the budget proposes shifting responsibility for a particular program from one administrative unit to another – such as shifting responsibility for the training of nurses from the health department to the education department – the prior-year figures must be adjusted before year-to-year comparisons of administrative budgets can be made.

Typically, when the budget proposal is submitted, the year prior to the budget year (BY-1), also known as the current year, has not ended, so the executive will provide estimates of the anticipated outcome for BY-1. The soundness of these estimates is directly related to the degree to which they have been updated to reflect actual expenditures to date, legislative changes that have occurred, and anticipated changes in macroeconomic, caseload, and other relevant factors for the remainder of the year.

The first year that can reflect actual outcomes, therefore, is generally two years before the budget year (BY-2). Thus the OECD recommends that data covering at least two years before the budget year (along with two years of projections beyond the budget year) are provided in order to assess fully the trends in the budget.

Answer:

c. Yes, information that shows how some but not all new policy proposals affect revenues are presented.

Source:

Minecofin

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

Comment:

The information in the EBP does not provide information/estimates on the impact of new policy proposals on revenue.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

Comments: Subsection III.1.7 on page 21 of the BFP

([http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf#page=23&zoom=100,0,85](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf#page=23&zoom=100,0,85)) Says: "In the case of tax collections, these are projected to increase on average by 0.3% of GDP per year from 15.6% of GDP in 2018/19 to 15.9% of GDP in 2019/20 and further to 16.2% of GDP by 2020/21. Increased yields from on-going tax policy and administrative measures including those to be implemented in 2018/19 and the medium term are expected to boost revenue collections in the medium term. Sub Section IV.1.1 on page 24 says: "In 2018/19, total tax revenue collections (excluding local Government taxes) have been projected at FRW 1,353 billion showing a nominal increase of FRW115.1 billion. Tax policy changes involving the 'EBM for all' which aims at rolling out the EBMs to selected non-VAT registered tax payers, enactment of the law amending excise duties on beer, wines and liquors as well as mobile data and amendments to taxes on income involving capping of management fees to 2 percent, excluding liberal professionals from lump-sum/flat regime and the implementation of the transfer pricing guidelines which will help the Rwanda Revenue Authority conduct proper audits of multinational companies ( banks, telecoms, insurance and mining companies)."

Researcher Response

Response adjusted to "C"

19. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 19 asks if expenditure estimates for the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) are presented by one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. (See Questions 1-5 above.)

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditure estimates for BY-1 by all three of the expenditure classifications. To answer "b," expenditure estimates for BY-1 must be presented by two of these three classifications. A "c" answer applies if expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if expenditure estimates for BY-1 are not presented by any of the three

classifications.

Answer:

c. Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by only one of the three expenditure classifications.

Source:

Minecofin

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

See Annexes

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=86&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fteste.php%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-75%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit%2FBudget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=3b4888ce7854843334748b00124dbc88](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=86&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fteste.php%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-75%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit%2FBudget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=3b4888ce7854843334748b00124dbc88)

Comment:

Tables 9 and 10 present expenditure by economic classification for 2017/18. Administrative or economic classification for 2017/18 is not presented.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Administrative and functional classification for 2017/18 are not presented.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Tables 9 and 10 (respectively on page 22 and 23 of the BFP) present expenditure by broad economic classification for 2017/18

20. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 20 asks if expenditure estimates for the year before the budget year (BY-1) are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department. For example, the Ministry of Health's budget could be broken down into several subgroups, such as "primary health care," "hospitals," or "administration." These subgroups should be considered programs even if they could be, but are not, broken down into smaller, more detailed units.*

*A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as le plan comptable or le plan comptable detaillé. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures, for BY-1. To answer "b," the programs shown individually in the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must account for at least two-thirds of all expenditures for BY-1. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents programs that account for only less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by program.*

Answer:

d. No, expenditures are not presented by program for BY-1.

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

Comment:

Annex II-5 only presents programs for 2018-19 to 2020-21. Prior years, such as 2017/18 are not presented.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

21. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, have expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditures?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 21 asks whether the expenditure estimates for the year before the budget year (BY-1) have been updated from the original enacted levels. Updates can reflect actual experience to date; revised estimates due to shifting of funds by the executive, as permitted under the law; enactment of supplemental budgets; and revised assumptions regarding macroeconomic conditions, caseload, and other relevant factors for the remainder of the year.*

*Answer "a" applies if the estimates have been updated; answer "b" applies if the original estimates are still being used.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 have been updated from the original enacted levels.

**Source:**

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

**Comment:**

Table 10 presents the revised budget for 2017/18.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

22. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of expenditure for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 22 asks if expenditure estimates for more than one year prior to the budget year (BY-2 and prior years) are presented by any of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. (See Questions 1-5 above.)*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years by all three of the expenditure classifications. To answer "b," expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years must be presented by two of these three classifications. A "c" answer applies if expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are not presented by any of the three classifications*

**Answer:**

d. No, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are not presented by any expenditure classification.

**Source:**

**Comment:**

BY-2 (2016/17) is not presented by any expenditure classification.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

22b. Based on the response to Question 22, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications have estimates for more than one year prior to the budget year in the Executive Budget Proposal:

Answer:

None of the above

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

23. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for more than one year preceding the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 23 asks if expenditure estimates for more than one year before the budget year (BY-2 and prior years) are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department. For example, the Ministry of Health's budget could be broken down into several subgroups, such as "primary health care," "hospitals," or "administration." These subgroups should be considered programs even if they could be, but are not, broken down into smaller, more detailed units.*

*A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as le plan comptable or le plan comptable detaillé. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures, for BY-2 and prior years. To answer "b," the programs shown individually in the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must account for at least two-thirds of all expenditures for BY-2 and prior years. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents programs that account for only less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by program.*

Answer:

d. No, expenditures are not presented by program for BY-2 and prior years.

Source:

Comment:

BY-2 (2016/17) is not presented for programs.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

24. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect

actual outcomes?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 24 asks for which year the actual outcomes for expenditures are shown. In most cases, the most recent year for which budget data on actual outcomes are available will be BY-2, as BY-1 is generally not yet finished when the budget proposal is drafted. So a government that has updated all its expenditure data for BY-2 to reflect what actually occurred, as opposed to estimating the outcome for that year, shows good public financial management practice.

For an "a" answer, a country must meet the good practice of having the figures for BY-2 reflect actual outcomes.

Answer:

d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Table 5 on page 12 presents provisional expenditure outcomes by economic category.

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf#page=23&zoom=100,0,85](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf#page=23&zoom=100,0,85)

Researcher Response

The source is similar to the one provided by the government.

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf#page=23&zoom=100,0,85](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf#page=23&zoom=100,0,85)

IBP Comment

Answer choice "D" selected. The EBP includes revised expenditure estimates for BY-1 (table 10), and the provisional outturn for the first half of BY-1 (table 5). However the EBP does not present actual expenditures for any year.

25. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue by category (such as tax and non-tax) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

**GUIDELINES:**

Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.

Answer:

a. Yes, revenue estimates for BY-1 are presented by category.

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

Comment:

Table 10 presents revenue by tax and non tax for 2017/18 (BY-1)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: In addition to table 10 on page 23 of the BFP, Annex I in the Zip folder called "2018-21\_Executive\_Budget\_Proposal.zip" present detailed revenues by category. Reference: <http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1->

26. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present individual sources of revenue for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.*

**Answer:**

d. No, individual sources of revenue are not presented for BY-1.

**Source:**

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

**Comment:**

While revenue information for 2017/18 (BY-1) is presented in the EBP, detail of individual sources is not presented.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

27. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, have the original estimates of revenue for the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) been updated to reflect actual revenue collections?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, revenue estimates for BY-1 have been updated from the original enacted levels.

**Source:**

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

**Comment:**

Revised revenue for 2017/18 is presented in Table 10.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

28. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax) for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

**GUIDELINES:**

Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.

Answer:

b. No, revenue estimates for BY-2 and prior years are not presented by category.

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

29. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present individual sources of revenue for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

**GUIDELINES:**

Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.

Answer:

d. No, individual sources of revenue are not presented for BY-2 and prior years.

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

30. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?

**GUIDELINES:**

Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.

Answer:

d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.

Source:

Comment:

revenues are presented with 1year prior to the budget

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

31. "Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?"

(The core information must include the total debt outstanding at the end of BY-1; the amount of net new borrowing required during BY-1; interest payments on the debt; interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)"

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 31 focuses on prior-year debt information, rather than on prior-year expenditures or revenues, asking whether "core" information is provided on government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1).*

*The "core" information includes:*

- *total debt outstanding at the end of BY-1;*
- *amount of net new borrowing required during BY-1;*
- *interest payments on the debt;*
- *interest rates on the debt instruments;*
- *maturity profile of the debt; and*
- *whether it is domestic or external debt.*

*This core information for BY-1 is consistent with the budget year information for borrowing and debt, which is examined in Questions 13 and 14.*

*In addition, some governments provide information beyond the core elements, such as gross new borrowing required during BY-1; currency of the debt; whether the debt carries a fixed or variable interest rate; whether it is callable; a profile of the creditors (bilateral institutions, multilateral institutions, commercial banks, Central Bank, etc.); where appropriate, what the debt is being used to finance.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for BY-1 as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to government borrowing and debt, including its composition, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on government borrowing and debt for BY-1.*

Answer:

c. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

Source:

Minecofin  
Budget Framework Paper 2018/2019-2020/2021, page 22 to 23

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

Comment:

See

table 9: Fiscal projections for the medium term covering 2017/18 to 2020/21 page 22

Table 10: Resources and Expenditures over the medium term, page 23

Where the sources of revenues and types of expenditures are mentioned. Table 9 presents the projections from 2017-18 to 2020-21 while table 10 shows projections from 2018-19 to 2020-21

Information on total debt outstanding is not presented.

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

32. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 32 asks for which year the actual outcome for debt is shown. In most cases, the most recent year for which budget data on actual outcomes are available will be BY-2, as BY-1 is generally not yet finished when the budget proposal is drafted. So a government that has updated its debt data for BY-2 to reflect what actually occurred, as opposed to estimating the outcome for that year, shows good public financial management practice.*

*For an "a" answer, a country must meet the good practice of having the figures for BY-2 reflect actual outcomes.*

*It is essential that all government activities that may have an impact on the budget – in the current budget year or in future budget years – be fully disclosed to the legislature and the public in budget documents. In some countries, for instance, entities outside central government (such as public corporations) undertake fiscal activities that could affect current and future budgets. Similarly, activities that can have a significant impact on the budget, such as payment arrears and contingent liabilities, sometimes are not properly captured by the regular presentations of expenditure, revenue, and debt.*

Answer:

d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.

Source:

Comment:

On 1 year prior to budget is presented

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

33. "Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on extra-budgetary funds for at least the budget year?

(The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the extra-budgetary fund; and complete income, expenditure, and financing data on a gross basis.)"

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 33 focuses on extra-budgetary funds, asking whether "core" information related to these funds, which exist outside the budget, are presented. These core components include:*

- *a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the extra-budgetary fund (i.e., why was a particular fund set up? what is it used for?); and*
- *estimates of its income, expenditure, and financing. (These estimates should be presented on a gross basis so that it is possible to tell how much money flows through each extra-budgetary fund.)*

*In most countries, governments engage in certain budgetary activities that are not included in the central government's budget. Known as extra-budgetary funds, they can range in size and scope. For example, countries frequently set up pension and social security programs as extra-budgetary funds, where the revenues collected and the benefits paid are recorded in a separate fund outside the budget. Another example of an extra-budgetary fund can be found in countries dependent on hydrocarbon/mineral resources, where revenues from producing and selling those resources are channeled through systems outside the annual budget.*

*In some cases, the separation engendered by an extra-budgetary fund serves a legitimate political purpose, and the finances and activities of these funds are well documented. In other cases, however, this structure is used for obfuscation, and little or nothing is known about a fund's finances and activities.*

*The availability of information related to extra-budgetary funds is essential for a comprehensive understanding of the government's true fiscal position. In addition to the core information, other information about extra-budgetary funds is also desirable. Such information includes a discussion of the risks associated with the extra-budgetary fund; expenditures classified by economic, functional, or administrative unit; and the rules and procedures that govern the operations and management of the extra-budgetary fund.*

*For more information about extra-budgetary funds, see the Guide to Transparency in Public Finances: Looking Beyond the Core Budget (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/Looking-Beyond-the-Budget.pdf>) and Principle 2.1.1 of the IMF's Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>).*

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to extra-budgetary funds as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. A "b" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation presents all of the core information. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to extra-budgetary funds is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on extra-budgetary funds.

Answer:

d. No, information related to extra-budgetary funds is not presented.

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

34. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present central government finances (both budgetary and extra-budgetary) on a consolidated basis for at least the budget year?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 34 asks whether the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documents present the finances of the central government on a consolidated basis, showing both its budgetary and extra-budgetary activities. Virtually all of the questions in the OBS questionnaire focus on budgetary central government – the activities of the ministries, departments, or agencies of central government. In addition, Question 33 asks about extra-budgetary funds, such as social security funds that are not included in the budget.

Coverage is an important aspect of fiscal reporting. Budget documents should cover the full scope of government's financial activity. In many countries, extra-budgetary activities are substantial, and can represent a sizable share of the central government's activities. To get a full picture of the central government's finances, therefore, it is necessary to examine both activities that are included in the budget and those that are extra-budgetary. This question asks whether such a consolidated presentation of central government finances is provided.

The central government is only one component of the overall public sector. The public sector also includes other levels of government, such as state and local government, and public corporations. (See Box 2.1 under Principle 1.1.1 of the IMF's Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018): <https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>). For the purpose of answering this question, please consider only the central government level.

In order to answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present central government finances (both budgetary and extra-budgetary) on a consolidated basis for at least the budget year.

Answer:

b. No, central government finances are not presented on a consolidated basis.

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

35. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of intergovernmental transfers for at least the budget

year?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 35 asks about intergovernmental transfers. In many cases, the central government supports the provision of a good or service by a lower level of government through an intergovernmental transfer of funds. This is necessary because, independent from the level of administrative decentralization that exists in a given country, the capacity for revenue collection of a local government is unlikely to be sufficient to pay for all its expenses. However, because the activity is not being undertaken by an administrative unit of the central government, it is unlikely to receive the same level of review in the budget. Thus it is important to include in the budget proposal a statement that explicitly indicates the amount and purposes of these transfers.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year both estimates covering all intergovernmental transfers and a narrative discussing these transfers. If a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all intergovernmental transfers are presented, then a "b" answer is appropriate. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, intergovernmental transfers (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no estimates of intergovernmental transfers are presented.

Answer:

b. Yes, estimates of all intergovernmental transfers are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf)

Comment:

Transfers to districts can be found in Annex II-6

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: In addition to Annex II-6, Annex\_IX\_-\_Summarised\_Central\_Government\_Transfers\_to\_LG.xls presents intergovernmental transfers by program while Annex\_X\_-\_Consolidated\_Districts\_Revenues\_and\_Expenditure\_Projections\_for\_2018-2021.xls presents them by type of transfer (Block Grant or Earmarked Transfer). REFERENCE: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

36. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present alternative displays of expenditures (such as by gender, by age, by income, or by region) to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens, for at least the budget year?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 36 asks about "alternative displays" of expenditures that highlight the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens. As discussed above, expenditures are typically presented by at least one of three classifications – administrative, functional, and economic classifications (see Questions 1-5) – and by individual program (Question 6). In addition, governments can provide alternative displays to emphasize different aspects of expenditure policies and to show who benefits from these expenditures.

For the purpose of answering this question, the alternative presentation must differ from the presentations (such as administrative, functional, or economic classifications or presentation by program) used to answer other questions. The alternative display can cover all expenditures or only a portion of expenditures. For instance, it can show how all expenditures are distributed according to geographic region or it can show how selected expenditures (such as the health budget or the agriculture budget) are distributed to different regions. But such a geographic display must be something different than the presentation of intergovernmental transfers used to answer question 35. One exception is when a country includes a special presentation of all policies intended to benefit the most impoverished populations (and is used to answer Question 52) then that can be considered an alternative display for purposes of answering this question as well. Finally, brief fact sheets showing how proposals in the budget benefit particular groups would be insufficient; only more detailed presentations would be considered.

The IBP Budget Brief, "How Transparent are Governments When it Comes to Their Budget's Impact on Poverty and Inequality?"

(<https://www.internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/government-transparency-of-budgets-impact-on-poverty-inequality-ibp-2019.pdf>) includes a discussion of the importance of alternative displays of budget information and provides a number of examples. For instance,

- Bangladesh in its 2017-18 Budget included a detailed supplementary Gender Budgeting Report, which presents the spending dedicated to advancing women across various departments. (<https://mof.portal.gov.bd/site/page/3bb14732-b5b1-44df-9921-efedf1496295>).
- The UK's 2017 budget included a supplementary analysis that provided a distributional analysis of the budget by households in different income groups (see [https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\\_data/file/661465/distributional\\_analysis\\_autumn\\_budget\\_2017.pdf](https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/661465/distributional_analysis_autumn_budget_2017.pdf))
- South Africa's 2017 Budget Review goes beyond the standard presentation of intergovernmental transfers, discussing the redistribution that results from national revenue flowing to the provinces and municipalities and presenting the allocations on a per capita basis (see chapter 6,

<http://www.treasury.gov.za/documents/national%20budget/2017/review/FullBR.pdf>.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must include at least three different presentations that illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens for at least the budget year. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must include at least two different alternative displays of expenditures. A "c" applies if only one type of alternative display of expenditure is presented. Answer "d" applies if no alternative display of expenditure is presented.

Answer:

d. No, alternative displays of expenditures are not presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.

Source:

Minecofin

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

See the annexes of this BFP using this link and select the zipped file:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=86&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fteste.php%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-75%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit%2FBudget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=3b4888ce7854843334748b00124dbc88](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=86&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fteste.php%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-75%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit%2FBudget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=3b4888ce7854843334748b00124dbc88)

Comment:

While the EBP does provide information on expenditure by NST1 Sector's it does not provide alternative displays of expenditure to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, at least three alternative displays of expenditures are presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.

Comments: ANNEX II-8: 2018/2021 STATE OF EXPENDITURE BY DIVISION AND GROUPS in the Zip folder named 2018-

21\_Executive\_Budget\_Proposal.zip presents the budget by COFOG division and groups. Division 710 Social protection has groups for Sickness and disability (to support people with disabilities), Survivors(used to support genocide survivors), Family and children, Unemployment and finally Social protection (to support all other vulnerable groups). REFERENCE: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

IBP Comment

The presentation cited by the government is a sub-functional classification of social protection, which is distinct from the alternative display of expenditure that this question asks for.

36b. Based on the response to Question 36, select the box(es) below to identify which types of alternative displays are included in the Executive's Budget Proposal:

Answer:

None of the above

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

See the link and open the annexes: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=86&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fteste.php%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-75%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit%2FBudget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=3b4888ce7854843334748b00124dbc88](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=86&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fteste.php%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-75%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit%2FBudget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=3b4888ce7854843334748b00124dbc88)

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=86&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fteste.php%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-75%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit%2FBudget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=3b4888ce7854843334748b00124dbc88](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=86&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fteste.php%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-75%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit%2FBudget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=3b4888ce7854843334748b00124dbc88)

Comment:

While the EBP does provide information on expenditure by NST1 Sector's it does not provide alternative displays of expenditure to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: Policy impacts based on income (Social Protection support vulnerable groups based on the level of income) Policy impacts based on age (Family and children) Other displays of expenditure (Sickness and disability (to support people with disabilities), Survivors (used to support survivors of the genocide against Tutsi in 1994 ), Unemployment)

Comments: Refer to comments and reference in the previous question (Qn 36)

IBP Comment

The presentation cited by the government is a sub-functional classification of social protection, which is distinct from the alternative display of expenditure that this question asks for.

37. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of transfers to public corporations for at least the budget year?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 37 asks about transfers to public corporations. It is often the case that governments have a stake in enterprises that manage resources that are particularly relevant for the public good (such as electricity, water, and oil). While these public corporations can operate independently, in some cases the government will provide direct support by making transfers to these corporations, including to subsidize capital investment and operating expenses.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year both estimates covering all transfers to public corporations and a narrative discussing the purposes of these transfers. If a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all transfers to public corporations are presented, then a "b" answer is appropriate. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, transfers to public corporations (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "c" also applies if estimates of transfers to public corporations are presented as a single line item. Answer "d" applies if no estimates of transfers to public corporations are presented.*

Answer:

d. No, estimates of transfers to public corporations are not presented.

Source:

Minecofin

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=86&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fteste.php%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-75%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit%2FBudget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2019-2022\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=bc9565017d229029622a9d92fb02f686](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=86&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fteste.php%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-75%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit%2FBudget_Framework_Papers%2F2019-2022_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=bc9565017d229029622a9d92fb02f686)

Comment:

No estimates of transfers to public corporations are presented.

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

38. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on quasi-fiscal activities for at least the budget year?

(The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the quasi-fiscal activity and the intended beneficiaries.)

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 38 focuses on quasi-fiscal activities, asking whether "core" information related to such activities is presented. These core components include:*

- *A statement of purpose or policy rationale for the quasi-fiscal activity (i.e., what is the reason for engaging in this activity?);*
- *The identification of intended beneficiaries of the quasi-fiscal activity.*

*The term "quasi-fiscal activities" refers to a broad range of activities that are fiscal in character and could be carried out through the regular budget process but are not. For example, a quasi-fiscal activity could take place if, instead of providing a direct subsidy through the budget for a particular activity, a public*

financial institution provides an indirect subsidy by offering loans at below-market rates for that activity. Similarly, it is a quasi-fiscal activity when an enterprise provides goods or services at prices below commercial rates to certain individuals or groups to support the government's policy goals.

The above examples are policy choices that may be approved by the government and legislature. However, quasi-fiscal activities can also involve activities that violate or circumvent a country's budget process laws or are not subject to the regular legislative approval process for expenditures. For example, the executive may issue an informal order to a government entity, such as a public commercial enterprise, to provide the executive with goods and services that normally would have to be purchased with funding authorized by the legislature. All quasi-fiscal activities should be disclosed to the public and subject to public scrutiny.

Beyond the core information, some governments may also provide other information about quasi-fiscal activities, including for example: the anticipated duration of the quasi-fiscal activity; a quantification of the activity and the assumptions that support these estimates; and a discussion of the fiscal significance and potential risks associated with the activity, including the impact on the entity carrying out the activity. Principle 3.3.2 of the IMF's Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>) provides examples of quasi-fiscal activities that can be consulted as needed. And more details on quasi-fiscal activities can be found in the Guide to Transparency in Public Finances: Looking Beyond the Core Budget (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/Looking-Beyond-the-Budget.pdf>).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to all quasi-fiscal activities for at least the budget year as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to quasi-fiscal activities is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on quasi-fiscal activities.

If quasi-fiscal activities do not represent a significant problem in your country, please mark "e." However, please exercise caution in answering this question.

Answer:

d. No, information related to quasi-fiscal activities is not presented.

Source:

Minecofin:

Comment:

Information on quasi-fiscal activities are not presented.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

39. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government for at least the budget year?

(The core information must include a listing of the assets, and an estimate of their value.)

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 39 focuses on financial assets held by the government, asking whether "core" information related to these assets is presented. These core components include:

- A listing of the financial assets; and
- An estimate of their value.

Governments own financial assets such as cash, bonds, or equities. Unlike private sector businesses, however, few governments maintain balance sheets that show the value of their assets and liabilities.

Beyond the core information, some governments may also provide other information about financial assets, including for example: a discussion of their purpose; historical information on defaults; differences between reported values and market values; and a summary of financial assets as part of the government's balance sheet.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year all of the core information related to all financial assets held by the government as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to financial assets is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on financial assets held by the government.

Answer:

d. No, information related to financial assets is not presented.

Source:

Information on financial assets held by the government is not presented in the EBP.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

40. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on nonfinancial assets held by the government for at least the budget year?

(The core information must include a listing of the assets by category.)

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 40 focuses on nonfinancial assets held by the government, asking whether "core" information related to these assets is presented. The core information is a listing of nonfinancial assets, grouped by the type (or category) of asset.*

*Nonfinancial assets are things of value that the government owns or controls (excluding financial assets) such as land, buildings, and machinery. The valuation of public nonfinancial assets can be problematic, particularly in cases where the asset is not typically available on the open market (such as a government monument). In these cases, it is considered acceptable to provide summary information in budget documents from a country's register of assets. But, in some cases, governments are able to value their nonfinancial assets; some present a summary of nonfinancial assets as part of their balance sheets. For an example of how nonfinancial assets are presented in one of the many supporting documents to the New Zealand Executive's Budget Proposal, see the Forecast Financial Statement 2011, Notes to the Financial Statements (Continued), Note 14, accessible here: <https://treasury.govt.nz/sites/default/files/2011-05/befu11-pt6of8.pdf>.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year a listing by category of all nonfinancial assets held by the government as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to nonfinancial assets is presented, but some nonfinancial assets are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on nonfinancial assets held by the government.*

Answer:

d. No, information related to nonfinancial assets is not presented.

Source:

Information on non-financial assets held by the government is not presented in the EBP.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

41. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of expenditure arrears for at least the budget year?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 41 asks about estimates of expenditure arrears, which arise when government has entered into a commitment to spend funds but has not made the payment when it is due. (For more information see sections 3.49-3.50 of the IMF's GFS Manual 2001,*

<http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/qfs/manual/pdf/all.pdf> (page 29)). Though equivalent to borrowing, this liability is often not recorded in the budget, making it difficult to assess fully a government's financial position. Moreover, the obligation to repay this debt affects the government's ability to pay for other activities.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year both estimates covering all expenditure arrears and a narrative discussing the arrears. If a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all expenditure arrears are presented, then a "b" answer is appropriate. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, expenditure arrears (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no estimates of expenditure arrears are presented.

If expenditure arrears do not represent a significant problem in your country, please mark "e." However, please exercise caution in answering this question. Public expenditure management laws and regulations often will allow for reasonable delays, perhaps 30 or 60 days, in the routine payment of invoices due. Expenditure arrears impacting a small percentage of expenditure that are due to contractual disputes should not be considered a significant problem for the purpose of answering this question.

Answer:

c. Yes, estimates of some but not all expenditure arrears are presented.

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

Comment:

Table 10 provides some information on expenditure arrears for 2018/19.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

42. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities, such as government loan guarantees or insurance programs, for at least the budget year?

(The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each contingent liability; the new guarantees or insurance commitments proposed for the budget year; and the total amount of outstanding guarantees or insurance commitments (the gross exposure) at the end of the budget year.)

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 42 focuses on contingent liabilities, asking whether "core" information related to these liabilities is presented. These core components include:

- a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each contingent liability;
- the new contingent liabilities for the budget year, such as new guarantees or insurance commitments proposed for the budget year; and
- the total amount of outstanding guarantees or insurance commitments at the end of the budget year. This reflects the gross exposure of the government in the case that all guarantees or commitments come due (even though that may be unlikely to occur).

Contingent liabilities are recognized under a cash accounting method only when the contingent event occurs and the payment is made. An example of such liabilities is the case of loans guaranteed by the central government, which can include loans to state-owned banks and other state-owned commercial enterprises, subnational governments, or private enterprises. Under such guarantees, government will only make a payment if the borrower defaults. Thus a key issue for making quantitative estimates of these liabilities is assessing the likelihood of the contingency occurring.

In the budget, according to the OECD, "[w]here feasible, the total amount of contingent liabilities should be disclosed and classified by major category reflecting their nature; historical information on defaults for each category should be disclosed where available. In cases where contingent liabilities cannot be quantified, they should be listed and described."

Beyond the core information, some governments may also provide other information about contingent liabilities, including for example: historical default rates for each program, and likely default rates in the future; the maximum guarantee that is authorized by law; any special financing associated with the guarantee (e.g., whether fees are charged, whether a reserve fund exists for the purpose of paying off guarantees, etc.); the duration of each guarantee; and an estimate of the fiscal significance and potential risks associated with the guarantees.

For more details on contingent liabilities, see Guide to Transparency in Public Finances: Looking Beyond the Core Budget (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/Looking-Beyond-the-Budget.pdf>) and page 59 (Box 11) and Principle 3.2.3 of the IMF's Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year all of the core information related to

contingent liabilities as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to contingent liabilities is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on contingent liabilities.

Answer:

d. No, information related to contingent liabilities is not presented.

Source:

MINECOFIN

Comment:

Information on contingent liabilities is not presented in the EBP.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

43. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present projections that assess the government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term?

(The core information must cover a period of at least 10 years and include the macroeconomic and demographic assumptions used and a discussion of the fiscal implications and risks highlighted by the projections.)

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 43 focuses on government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer-term, asking whether "core" information related to these issues is presented. These core components must include:

- Projections that cover a period of at least 10 years.
- The macroeconomic and demographic assumptions used in making the projections.
- A discussion of the fiscal implications and risks highlighted by the projections. Good public financial management calls for budgets to include fiscal sustainability analyses.

The IMF's Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>) recommends that governments regularly publish the projected evolution of the public finances over the longer term (see Principle 3.1.3.). Future liabilities are a particularly important element when assessing the sustainability of public finances over the long term. Future liabilities are the result of government commitments that, unlike contingent liabilities, are virtually certain to occur at some future point and result in an expenditure. A typical example consists of government obligations to pay pension benefits or cover health care costs of future retirees. Under a cash accounting system, only current payments associated with such obligations are recognized in the budget. To capture the future impact on the budget of these liabilities, a separate statement is required.

Beyond the core information, some governments may also provide other information about the sustainability of their finances, including for example: projections that cover 20 or 30 years; multiple scenarios with different sets of assumptions; assumptions about other factors (such as the depletion of natural resources) that go beyond just the core macroeconomic and demographic data; and a detailed presentation of particular programs that have long time horizons, such as civil service pensions.

For more details on future liabilities, see Guide to Transparency in Public Finances: Looking Beyond the Core Budget (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/Looking-Beyond-the-Budget.pdf>).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to future liabilities and the sustainability of government finances over the longer term as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to future liabilities is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on future liabilities and the sustainability of government's finances

Answer:

d. No, information related to future liabilities and the sustainability of finances over the longer term is not presented.

Source:

MINECOFIN

Comment:

Presented information covers medium term and not long term

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

44. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind, for at least the budget year?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 44 asks about estimates of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind assistance. Such assistance is considered non-tax revenue, and the sources of this assistance should be explicitly identified. In terms of in-kind assistance, the concern is primarily with the provision of goods (particularly those for which there is a market that would allow goods received as in-kind aid to be sold, thereby converting them into cash) rather than with in-kind aid like advisors from a donor country providing technical assistance.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year both estimates covering all donor assistance and a narrative discussing the assistance. If a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all donor assistance are presented, then a "b" answer is appropriate. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, donor assistance (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "c" also applies if the sources of donor assistance are not presented, but the total amount of donor assistance is presented as a single line item. Answer "d" applies if no estimates of donor assistance are presented. Select answer "e" if your country does not receive donor assistance.*

Answer:

c. Yes, estimates of some but not all sources of donor assistance are presented.

Source:

MINECOFIN

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

See page 25.

Comment:

Some sources of donor funds are identified in the narrative (the Global Fund, Sweden, Netherlands, Germany, and DFID).

Annex 1 provides information of donor funds by sector, but not source.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

45. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on tax expenditures for at least the budget year?

(The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each tax expenditure, the intended beneficiaries, and an estimate of the revenue foregone.)

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 45 focuses on tax expenditures, asking whether "core" information related to these tax preferences is presented. These core components must include for both new and existing tax expenditures:*

- *a statement of purpose or policy rationale;*
- *a listing of the intended beneficiaries; and*

- an estimate of the revenue foregone.

*Tax expenditures arise as a result of exceptions or other preferences in the tax code provided for specified entities, individuals, or activities. Tax expenditures often have the same impact on public policy and budgets as providing direct subsidies, benefits, or goods and services. For example, encouraging a company to engage in more research through a special tax break can have the same effect as subsidizing it directly through the expenditure side of the budget, as it still constitutes a cost in terms of foregone revenues. However, expenditure items that require annual authorization are likely to receive more scrutiny than tax breaks that are a permanent feature of the tax code.*

*Beyond the core information, some governments may also provide other information about tax expenditures, including for example: the intended beneficiaries by sector and income class (distributional impact); a statement of the estimating assumptions, including the definition of the benchmark against which the foregone revenue is measured; and a discussion of tax expenditures as part of a general discussion of expenditures for those program areas that receive both types of government support (in order to better inform policy choices). For more details on tax expenditures, see *Guide to Transparency in Public Finances: Looking Beyond the Core Budget* (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/Looking-Beyond-the-Budget.pdf>) and Principle 1.1.4 of the IMF's *Fiscal Transparency Handbook* (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>).*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting budget documentation must present, for at least the budget year, all of the core information related to tax expenditures as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to tax expenditures is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on tax expenditures.*

Answer:

d. No, information related to tax expenditures is not presented.

Source:

MINECOFIN

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

Comment:

Information on tax expenditures are not presented.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

46. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of earmarked revenues for at least the budget year?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 46 asks about estimates of earmarked revenues, which are revenues that may only be used for a specific purpose (for example, revenues from a tax on fuel that can only be used for building roads). This information is important in determining which revenues are available to fund the government's general expenses, and which revenues are reserved for particular purposes.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year both estimates covering all earmarked revenues and a narrative discussing the earmarks. If a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all earmarked revenues are presented, then a "b" answer is appropriate. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, earmarked revenues (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no estimates of earmarked revenues are presented. An "e" response applies if revenue is not earmarked or the practice is disallowed by law or regulation.*

Answer:

c. Yes, estimates of some but not all earmarked revenues are presented.

Source:

Minecofin

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

Comment:

Information on earmarked revenues are not presented.

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Disagree  
Suggested Answer:

c. Yes, estimates of some but not all earmarked revenues are presented.

Comments: Section IV.1.1. Projection of Resources on page 24 of the BFP under Non-Tax Revenue Collections specify that FRW 117.9 billion will come from UN peace keeping operations which is always used for the same mission. It also specify non- tax revenue collections by the Rwanda National Police and the Rwanda Development Board of FRW 6.2 billion and FRW 9.8 billion that are earmarked to both institution respectively.

REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf#page=24&zoom=100,0,110](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf#page=24&zoom=100,0,110)

Researcher Response

"c" can be the response to this question. Answer adjusted

47. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on how the proposed budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to government's policy goals for the budget year?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Questions 47 and 48 ask about information that shows how the budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to the government's policy goals. The budget is the executive's main policy document, the culmination of the executive's planning and budgeting processes. Therefore, it should include a clear description of the link between policy goals and the budget – that is, an explicit explanation of how the government's policy goals are reflected in its budget choices. For an example of a discussion of a government's policy goals in the budget, see pages 13-18 of New Zealand's 2011 Statement of Intent (<http://www.treasury.govt.nz/publications/abouttreasury/soi/2011-16>), one of the many documents supporting its budget.*

*In some countries the government prepares strategic/development plans. These plans include all the policies the government is planning to implement for the budget year and very often cover a multi-year perspective. In some cases, these plans do not match the budget documentation, and it is possible that they are completely disconnected from the Executive's Budget Proposal. So the question is examining whether government policy plans are "translated" into revenue and expenditure figures in the actual budget documents.*

*Question 47 asks about the information covering the budget year, and Question 48 asks about the period at least two years beyond the budget year. To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present both estimates of how the budget is linked to government's policy goals for the budget year (for Question 47) or for a multi-year period beyond the budget year (for Question 48) and a narrative discussion of how these policy goals are reflected in the budget. To answer "b" for either question, the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present estimates that show how the budget is linked to government's policy goals, but no narrative discussion is included. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes only a narrative discussion, or if it includes estimates that show how the budget is linked to some, but not all, of the government's policy goals (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on how the budget is linked to government's policy goals.*

Answer:

a. Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for the budget year are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

Source:

Minecofin

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

While pages 27-37 provide some narrative about planned spending for 2018/19 by sector, it is difficult to determine which are new policies and which are continuing policies. Additionally, the policies are not costed or tied with any estimates.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Disagree  
Suggested Answer:

d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government's stated policy goals for the budget year is not presented.

Comments: The government policy goals are reflected in the National Strategy for Transformation (NST1). Section "V. 2018/19 DETAILED RESOURCE ALLOCATION TO NST1 PILLARS" from page 27 to page 37 of the BFP present government budget allocation by NST along with detailed narrative discussion. REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf#page=24&zoom=100,0,110](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf#page=24&zoom=100,0,110)

Researcher Response  
Answer changed to "A"

IBP Comment  
After further consultation with the researcher, answer choice "A" has been selected. Pages 27-37 provide a breakdown linking spending and the NST1 Pillars.

48. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on how the proposed budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to government's policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Questions 47 and 48 ask about information that shows how the budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to the government's policy goals. The budget is the executive's main policy document, the culmination of the executive's planning and budgeting processes. Therefore, it should include a clear description of the link between policy goals and the budget – that is, an explicit explanation of how the government's policy goals are reflected in its budget choices. For an example of a discussion of a government's policy goals in the budget, see pages 13-18 of New Zealand's 2011 Statement of Intent (<http://www.treasury.govt.nz/publications/abouttreasury/soi/2011-16>), one of the many documents supporting its budget.*

*In some countries the government prepares strategic/development plans. These plans include all the policies the government is planning to implement for the budget year and very often cover a multi-year perspective. In some cases, these plans do not match the budget documentation, and it is possible that they are completely disconnected from the Executive's Budget Proposal. So the question is examining whether government policy plans are "translated" into revenue and expenditure figures in the actual budget documents.*

*Question 47 asks about the information covering the budget year, and Question 48 asks about the period at least two years beyond the budget year. To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present both estimates of how the budget is linked to government's policy goals for the budget year (for Question 47) or for a multi-year period beyond the budget year (for Question 48) and a narrative discussion of how these policy goals are reflected in the budget. To answer "b" for either question, the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present estimates that show how the budget is linked to government's policy goals, but no narrative discussion is included. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes only a narrative discussion, or if it includes estimates that show how the budget is linked to some, but not all, of the government's policy goals (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on how the budget is linked to government's policy goals.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for a multi-year period are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

**Source:**

MINECOFIN

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

**Comment:**

No information on the link between the budget and the government's stated policy goals for a multi-year period is presented.

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for a multi-year period are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

Comments: The government policy goals are reflected in the National Strategy for Transformation (NST1). Section "V. 2018/19 DETAILED RESOURCE ALLOCATION TO NST1 PILLARS" from page 27 to page 37 of the BFP present government budget allocation by NST for BY and two out years along with detailed narrative discussion. REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers/2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal/2018-2021\\_Budget\\_Framework\\_Paper.pdf#page=24&zoom=100,0,110](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf#page=24&zoom=100,0,110)

Researcher Response  
I do agree. answer has changed to "a"

IBP Comment  
After further consultation with the researcher, answer choice "A" has been selected. Pages 27-37 provide a breakdown linking spending and the NST1 Pillars.

49. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired for at least the budget year?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 49 asks about the availability of nonfinancial data on inputs for the budget year. (Nonfinancial data on outputs and outcomes are addressed in Question 50.)

The budget should disclose not only the amount of money that is being allocated on a program but also any information needed to analyze that expenditure. Nonfinancial data and performance targets associated with budget proposals are used to assess the success of a given policy. For example, even when allocated funds are spent according to plan, there remains the question of whether the policy delivered the results that it aimed to achieve.

Nonfinancial data can include information on:

*Inputs* - These are the resources assigned to achieve results. For example, in regards to education, nonfinancial data on inputs could include the number of books to be provided to each school or the materials to be used to build or refurbish a school.

*Outputs* - These are products and services delivered as a result of inputs. For example, the number of pupils taught every year; the number of children that received vaccines; or the number of beneficiaries of a social security program.

*Outcomes* - These are the intended impact or policy goals achieved. For example, an increase in literacy rates among children under 10, or a reduction in rates of maternal mortality.

In addition, governments that set performance targets must use nonfinancial data for outputs and outcomes to determine if these targets have been met.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present, for at least the budget year, nonfinancial data on inputs for each individual program within all administrative units (ministries, departments, and agencies). It is also acceptable if nonfinancial data on inputs for each individual program is organized by functions. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present nonfinancial data on inputs for all administrative units or all functions, but not for each individual program (or even for any programs) within those administrative units or functions. A "c" response applies if nonfinancial data on inputs are presented only for some programs and/or some administrative units or some functions. Answer "d" applies if no nonfinancial data on inputs is presented.

**Answer:**

d. No, nonfinancial data on inputs are not presented.

**Source:**

Minecofin

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2018-2019\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=124&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Framework_Papers%2F2018-2019_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=e5096e3c5b01e15d12e0a35784d8cd52)

**Comment:**

Nonfinancial data on inputs is not presented.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

c. Yes, nonfinancial data on inputs are presented for some programs and/or some administrative units (or functions).

Comments: Section V. 2018/19 DETAILED RESOURCE ALLOCATION TO NST1 PILLARS, provides details of inputs to be acquired by priority areas

**IBP Comment**

Answer choice "D" is confirmed. The EBP does not include nonfinancial data on inputs. This is distinct from the information cited by the government, which is expenditure (financial data) assigned for acquisitions to support priority areas.

50. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present nonfinancial data on results (in terms of outputs or outcomes) for at least the budget year?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 50 asks about the availability of nonfinancial data on results for the budget year. Nonfinancial data on results can include data on both outputs and outcomes, but not on inputs (which are addressed in Question 49).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present, for at least the budget year, nonfinancial data on results for each individual program within all administrative units (ministries, departments, and agencies). It is also acceptable if nonfinancial data on results for each

*individual program is organized by functional classification. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present nonfinancial data on results for all administrative units or all functional classifications, but not for each individual program (or even for any programs) within those administrative units or functions. A "c" response applies if nonfinancial data on results are presented only for some programs and/or some administrative units or some functions. Answer "d" applies if no nonfinancial data on results is presented.*

Answer:

c. Yes, nonfinancial data on results are presented for some programs and/or some administrative units (or functions).

Source:

Minecofin

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=86&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fteste.php%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-75%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit%2FBudget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2019-2022\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=bc9565017d229029622a9d92fb02f686](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=86&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fteste.php%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-75%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit%2FBudget_Framework_Papers%2F2019-2022_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=bc9565017d229029622a9d92fb02f686)

Comment:

Nonfinancial data on results is not presented.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

Comments: Section V. 2018/19 DETAILED RESOURCE ALLOCATION TO NST1 PILLARS (from page 27), provides details of expected results by priority areas

IBP Comment

After further discussion with the researcher, answer choice "C" has been selected. Section V of the Budget Framework Paper presents some nonfinancial data on NST1 Pillars.

51. Are performance targets assigned to nonfinancial data on results in the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 51 asks about performance targets assigned to nonfinancial data on results for the budget year. The question applies to those nonfinancial results shown in the budget, and that were identified for purposes of Question 50.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must assign performance targets to all nonfinancial data on results shown in the budget for at least the budget year. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must assign performance targets to a majority (but not all) of the nonfinancial data on results shown in the budget. A "c" response applies performance targets are assigned only to less than half of the nonfinancial data on results. Answer "d" applies if no performance targets are assigned to nonfinancial data on results shown in the budget, or the budget does not present nonfinancial results.*

Answer:

c. Yes, performance targets are assigned to some nonfinancial data on results.

Source:

MINECOFIN

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=86&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fteste.php%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-75%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit%2FBudget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2019-2022\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=bc9565017d229029622a9d92fb02f686](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=86&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fteste.php%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-75%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit%2FBudget_Framework_Papers%2F2019-2022_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=bc9565017d229029622a9d92fb02f686)

Comment:

The budget does not present nonfinancial data on results.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

c. Yes, performance targets are assigned to some nonfinancial data on results.

Comments: Section V. 2018/19 DETAILED RESOURCE ALLOCATION TO NST1 PILLARS (from page 27), provides details of expected results with

performance targets assigned to some of them.

Researcher Response  
Answer adjusted to "c"

IBP Comment  
After further discussion with the researcher, answer choice "C" has been selected. Section V of the Budget Framework Paper presents some performance targets associated with non financial data on results by NST1 Pillars.

52. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of policies (both new proposals and existing policies) that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations in at least the budget year?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 52 asks whether the budget highlight policies, both new and existing, that benefit the poorest segments of society. This question is intended to assess only those programs that directly address the immediate needs of the poor, such as through cash assistance programs or the provision of housing, rather than indirectly, such as through a stronger national defense. This information is of particular interest to those seeking to bolster government's commitment to anti-poverty efforts. For purposes of answering this question, a departmental budget (such for the Department of Social Welfare) would not be considered acceptable. In general, this question is asking whether the EBP includes a special presentation that pulls together estimates of all the relevant policies in one place. However, if the country uses "program budgeting," where programs are presented as expenditure categories with specific and identified objectives, and it identifies anti-poverty programs within each administrative unit, then that is also acceptable for this question.*

*The IBP Budget Brief, "How Transparent are Governments When it Comes to Their Budget's Impact on Poverty and Inequality?" (<https://www.internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/government-transparency-of-budgets-impact-on-poverty-inequality-ibp-2019.pdf>) includes a discussion of countries that have provided information on how its policies affect the poor.*

*For instance, Pakistan provides a detailed breakdown of pro-poor expenditure as part of its 2017-18 budget proposal. In one document, the government sets out policy priorities, expected outputs, and estimates of past and future spending for several programs aimed at poverty alleviation. Another supporting document provides a comprehensive overview of ongoing policies, including a chapter on social safety nets, covering both financial and performance information of poverty alleviation schemes over a period of eight years. ([http://www.finance.gov.pk/budget/mtbf\\_2018\\_21.pdf](http://www.finance.gov.pk/budget/mtbf_2018_21.pdf) and [http://www.finance.gov.pk/survey\\_1718.html](http://www.finance.gov.pk/survey_1718.html)).*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must for at least the budget year both present estimates covering all policies that are intended to benefit the most impoverished populations and include a narrative discussion that specifically addresses these policies. (For countries using program budgeting that breaks out individual anti-poverty programs, there should be a separate narrative associated with each such program.) Answer "b" if a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all policies that are intended to benefit the most impoverished populations are presented. Answer "c" if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, policies that are intended to benefit the most impoverished populations (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" if no estimates of policies that are intended to benefit the most impoverished populations are presented.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, estimates of all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

**Source:**

Minecofin

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=86&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fteste.php%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-75%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit%2FBudget\\_Framework\\_Papers%2F2019-2022\\_Executive\\_Budget\\_Proposal&cHash=bc9565017d229029622a9d92fb02f686](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=86&L=ftp%3A%2F%2F2015julho%3Aeueu2301%40ftp.uhserver.com%2Fteste.php%3F&tx-filelist-pi1-75%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit%2FBudget_Framework_Papers%2F2019-2022_Executive_Budget_Proposal&cHash=bc9565017d229029622a9d92fb02f686)

**Comment:**

See Table 13 and pages 33-35

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

IBP Comment  
See also Annex II-5, which provides the 2018-2021 budget by agency, program, and sub-program.

53. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the Ministry of Finance or whatever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 53 asks about the budget timetable. An internal timetable is particularly important for the executive's management of the budget preparation process, in order to ensure that the executive accounts for the views of the different departments and agencies in the proposed budget. The timetable would, for instance, set deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the Ministry of Finance or whatever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation. So that civil society is aware of the various steps in the budget formulation process, and when opportunities may exist to engage the executive, it is essential that this timetable be made available to the public.*

*To answer "a," the executive must prepare a detailed budget timetable and release it to the public. A "b" answer applies if the timetable is made public, but some details are not included. A "c" response applies if the timetable is made public, but many important details are excluded, reducing its value for those outside government. Answer "d" applies if no timetable is made available to the public. As long as a timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal is released, answer "a," "b," or "c" may be selected, even if the Executive's Budget Proposal is not made publicly available.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public.

**Source:**

Minecofin

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Central\\_Gouvernement/2018-19\\_Budget\\_Call\\_Circular/2018-19\\_CG\\_PBCC.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Central_Gouvernement/2018-19_Budget_Call_Circular/2018-19_CG_PBCC.pdf)

See also the annexes in the zipped files via the link below:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=86&L=data%3A%2F%2Ftext.&tx-filelist-pi1-75%5Bpath%5D=Central\\_Gouvernement%2F2018-19\\_Budget\\_Call\\_Circular&cHash=08ecdfffd10f4936096e06e848649afb](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=86&L=data%3A%2F%2Ftext.&tx-filelist-pi1-75%5Bpath%5D=Central_Gouvernement%2F2018-19_Budget_Call_Circular&cHash=08ecdfffd10f4936096e06e848649afb)

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

Comments: A detailed calendar is provided in the document titled: "Annex 1 Planning\_and\_Budgeting\_Calendar 2018-19 (17-10-17).xls" Link:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=228&L=844&tx-filelist-pi1-165%5Bpath%5D=2018-](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=228&L=844&tx-filelist-pi1-165%5Bpath%5D=2018-19_Budget_Call_Circular&cHash=d3714b2dc50556dab1ded3e5a79029a3)

[19\\_Budget\\_Call\\_Circular&cHash=d3714b2dc50556dab1ded3e5a79029a3](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=228&L=844&tx-filelist-pi1-165%5Bpath%5D=2018-19_Budget_Call_Circular&cHash=d3714b2dc50556dab1ded3e5a79029a3)

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

54. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?

(The core information must include a discussion of the economic outlook with estimates of nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 54 focuses on the macroeconomic forecast that underlies the Pre-Budget Statement, asking whether "core" information related to the economic assumptions is presented. These core components include a discussion of the economic outlook as well as estimates of the following:*

- *nominal GDP level;*
- *inflation rate;*
- *real GDP growth; and*
- *interest rates.*

*Beyond these core elements, some governments also provide additional information related to the economic outlook, including for instance: short- and long-term interest rates; the rate of employment and unemployment; GDP deflator; price of oil and other commodities; current account; exchange rate; and composition of GDP growth.*

*To answer "a," the Pre-Budget Statement must present all of the core information related to the macroeconomic forecast as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Pre-Budget Statement must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to the macroeconomic forecast is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information on the macroeconomic forecast is presented.*

Answer:

d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.

Source:

The Second Budget Call Circular for 2018/19 was not published.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

55. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the government's expenditure policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?

(The core information must include a discussion of expenditure policies and priorities and an estimate of total expenditures.)

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 55 focuses on the government's expenditure policies and priorities in the Pre-Budget Statement, asking whether "core" information related to these policies is presented. These core components include:*

- *a discussion of expenditure policies and priorities; and*
- *an estimate of total expenditures.*

*Although a Pre-Budget Statement is unlikely to include detailed programmatic proposals (such detailed information is typically only presented in the budget itself), it should include a discussion of broad policy priorities and a projection of at least total expenditures associated with these policies for the budget year. The Pre-Budget Statement can include some detail, for instance, estimates provided by any of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications.*

*To answer "a," the Pre-Budget Statement must present for the upcoming budget year all of the core information related to the government's expenditure policies and priorities as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Pre-Budget Statement must present all of the core components noted above for the upcoming budget year. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to the government's expenditure policies and priorities is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information on the government's expenditure policies and priorities is presented.*

Answer:

d. No, information related to the government's expenditure policies and priorities is not presented.

Source:

The Second Budget Call Circular for 2018/19 was not published.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

56. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the government's revenue policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?

(The core information must include a discussion of revenue policies and priorities and an estimate of total revenues.)

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 56 focuses on the government's revenue policies and priorities in the Pre-Budget Statement, asking whether "core" information related to these policies is presented. These core components include:

- a discussion of revenue policies and priorities; and
- an estimate of total revenue.

Although a Pre-Budget Statement is unlikely to include detailed revenue proposals, it should include a discussion of broad policy priorities and a projection of at least the total revenue associated with these policies for the budget year. The Pre-Budget Statement can also include more detail, for instance, with estimates provided by revenue category – tax and non-tax – or some of the major individual sources of revenue, such as the Value Added Tax or the income tax.

To answer "a," the Pre-Budget Statement must present for the upcoming budget year all of the core information related to the government's revenue policies and priorities as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Pre-Budget Statement must present all of the core components noted above for the upcoming budget year. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to the government's revenue policies and priorities is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information on the government's revenue policies and priorities is presented.

Answer:

d. No, information related to the government's revenue policies and priorities is not presented.

Source:

The Second Budget Call Circular for 2018/19 was not published.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

57. Does Pre-Budget Statement present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 57 asks whether the Pre-Budget Statement includes three key estimates related to borrowing and debt:

- the amount of net new borrowing needed in the upcoming budget year;
- the central government's total debt burden at the end of the upcoming budget year; and
- the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the upcoming budget year.

Debt is the accumulated amount of money that the government borrows. The government can borrow from its citizens, banks, and businesses within the country (domestic debt) or from creditors outside the country (external debt). External debt is typically owed to private commercial banks, other governments, or international financial institutions such as the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund.

Net new borrowing is the additional amount of new borrowing that is required for the budget year to finance expenditures in the budget that exceed available revenues. Net new borrowing adds to the accumulated debt. It is distinct from gross borrowing, which also includes borrowing needed to repay existing debt that matured during the budget year; debt that is replaced (or rolled over) does not add to the total of accumulated debt.

Interest payments on the debt (or debt service costs) are typically made at regular intervals, and these payments must be made on a timely basis in order to avoid defaulting on the debt obligation. Interest payments are separate from the repayment of principal, which occurs only when the loan has matured and must be paid back in full.

To answer "a," the Pre-Budget Statement must present all three estimates of borrowing and debt for at least the upcoming budget year. For a "b" answer, the Pre-Budget Statement must present two of those three estimates. For a "c" answer, the PBS must present one of the three estimates. Answer "d" applies if no information on borrowing and debt is presented in the PBS.

Answer:

d. No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.

Source:

The Second Budget Call Circular for 2018/19 was not published.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

58. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present estimates of total expenditures for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 58 asks about multi-year expenditure estimates in the Pre-Budget Statement.*

*To answer "a," expenditure estimates for at least two years beyond the upcoming budget year must be presented. The estimates must be for at least total expenditures, but could include more detail than just the aggregate total.*

Answer:

b. No, multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented.

Source:

The Second Budget Call Circular for 2018/19 was not published.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

59. Does the Enacted Budget present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 59 asks if expenditure estimates in the Enacted Budget are presented by any one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications – which were addressed in Questions 1-5 above. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. Unlike classification by administrative unit, which tends to be unique to each country, functional and economic classifications for government budgeting have been developed and standardized by international institutions. Cross-country comparisons are facilitated by adherence to these international classification standards.*

*To answer "a," the Enacted Budget must present expenditure estimates by all three of the expenditure classifications. To answer "b," expenditure estimates must be presented by two of the three classifications. A "c" answer applies if expenditure estimates are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if expenditure estimates are not presented by any of the three classifications.*

Answer:

a. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law/FY\\_2018-19\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law/FY_2018-19_Original_Finance_Law.pdf)

Comment:

Economic classification: Annex II-1

Administrative classification: Annex II-1

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

Comments: The Enacted Budget presents expenditure according to administrative classification in the "Law determining the State finances for the 2018/2019 fiscal year" published in the Official Gazette No. Special of 30 June 2018, section "ANNEX II-1: 2018-2019 DETAILED EXPENDITURE BY BUDGET AGENCY", page 34, and "ANNEX II-6: 2018/2021 BUDGET BY BUDGET AGENCY", in page 560. Economic classification is presented in the same document in section "ANNEX II-4:2018/2019 -BUDGET BY AGENCY AND ECONOMIC CLASSIFICATION", in page 507. Finally, functional classification is presented in section "ANNEX II-8: 2018/2021 STATE EXPENDITURE BY DIVISION AND GROUPS", in page 575. Link:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law/FY\\_2018-19\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law/FY_2018-19_Original_Finance_Law.pdf)

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

Comments: Economic classification: Annex II-1 and Annex II-4 Administrative classification: Annex II-1and Annex II-6 Annex II-8 presents the budget by functional classification (COFOG)

Researcher Response

I think it is right. Answer changed to "a"

59b. Based on the response to Question 59, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications are included in the Enacted Budget:

Answer:

Administrative classification

Economic classification

Functional classification

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law/FY\\_2018-19\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law/FY_2018-19_Original_Finance_Law.pdf)

Comment:

Economic classification: Annex II-1

Administrative classification: Annex II-1

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: Administrative classification Economic classification Functional classification

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: Economic classification Administrative classification Functional classification

Comments: Economic classification: Annex II-1 and Annex II-4 Administrative classification: Annex II-1and Annex II-6 Annex II-8 presents the budget by functional classification (COFOG) REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law/FY\\_2018-19\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law/FY_2018-19_Original_Finance_Law.pdf)

Researcher Response

Adjustment is done

60. Does the Enacted Budget present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 60 asks if expenditure estimates in the Enacted Budget are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department.*

*A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as le plan comptable or le plan comptable detaillé. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)*

*To answer "a," the Enacted Budget must present all programs, which account for all expenditures, in the budget year. To answer "b," the Enacted Budget must present expenditures for individual programs that when combined account for at least two-thirds of expenditures, but not all expenditures. A "c" answer applies if the Enacted Budget presents programs that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by program in the Enacted Budget.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures.

**Source:**

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law/FY\\_2018-19\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law/FY_2018-19_Original_Finance_Law.pdf)

**Comment:**

Annex II-2

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The Enacted Budget presents expenditure according to programs in the "Law determining the State finances for the 2018/2019 fiscal year" published in the Official Gazette No. Special of 30 June 2018, section "ANNEX II-2:2018/2019- BUDGET BY PROGRAM AND SUB-PROGRAM", page 386.

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Annex II-2 & Annex II-5

61. Does the Enacted Budget present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 61 asks whether revenue estimates in the Enacted Budget are presented by "category"— that is, whether tax and non-tax sources of revenue are shown separately.*

*To answer "a," the Enacted Budget must present revenue estimates classified by category.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents revenue estimates by category.

**Source:**

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law/FY\\_2018-19\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law/FY_2018-19_Original_Finance_Law.pdf)

**Comment:**

Table "A" and Annex I

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The Enacted Budget presents revenue estimates by category in the "Law determining the State finances for the 2018/2019 fiscal year"

published in the Official Gazette No. Special of 30 June 2018, in Table A in page 7, and in section "ANNEX I: STATE REVENUES 2018/2021", page 28.

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

62. Does the Enacted Budget present individual sources of revenue?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 62 asks whether revenue estimates for individual sources of revenue are presented in the Enacted Budget. The question applies to both tax and non-tax revenue.*

*To answer "a," the Enacted Budget must present all individual sources of revenue, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all revenue. To answer "b," the Enacted Budget must present individual sources of revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all revenue, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue that account for less than two-thirds of revenues. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of revenue are not presented.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.

**Source:**

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law/FY\\_2018-19\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law/FY_2018-19_Original_Finance_Law.pdf)

**Comment:**

Annex I

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The Enacted Budget presents revenue estimates by category in the "Law determining the State finances for the 2018/2019 fiscal year" published in the Official Gazette No. Special of 30 June 2018 in section "ANNEX I: STATE REVENUES 2018/2021", page 28.

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

63. Does the Enacted Budget present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 63 asks about three key estimates related to borrowing and debt:*

- *the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year;*
- *the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year;*
- *the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year.*

*Debt is the accumulated amount of money that the government borrows. The government can borrow from its citizens, banks, and businesses within the country (domestic debt) or from creditors outside the country (external debt). External debt is typically owed to private commercial banks, other governments, or international financial institutions such as the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund.*

*Net new borrowing is the additional amount of new borrowing that is required for the budget year to finance expenditures in the budget that exceed available revenues. Net new borrowing adds to the accumulated debt. It is distinct from gross borrowing, which also includes borrowing needed to repay existing debt that matured during the budget year; debt that is replaced (or rolled over) does not add to the total of accumulated debt.*

*Interest payments on the debt (or debt service costs) are typically made at regular intervals, and these payments must be made on a timely basis in order to avoid defaulting on the debt obligation. Interest payments are separate from the repayment of principal, which occurs only when the loan has matured and must be paid back in full.*

*To answer "a," the Enacted Budget must present all three estimates of borrowing and debt. For a "b" answer, the Enacted Budget must present two of those*

three estimates. For a "c" answer, the Enacted Budget must present one of the three estimates. Answer "d" applies if no information on borrowing and debt is presented in the Enacted Budget.

Answer:

b. Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law/FY\\_2018-19\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law/FY_2018-19_Original_Finance_Law.pdf)

Comment:

Net new borrowing for 2018-19: Table "A"

Interest payments on debt for 2018-19: Table "B"

Total debt outstanding at end of 2018-19: not presented

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

64. What information is provided in the Citizens Budget?

(The core information must include expenditure and revenue totals, the main policy initiatives in the budget, the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget is based, and contact information for follow-up by citizens.)

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 64 focuses on the content of the Citizens Budget, asking whether "core" information is presented. These core components include:*

- *expenditure and revenue totals;*
- *the main policy initiatives in the budget;*
- *the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget is based; and*
- *contact information for follow-up by citizens.*

*To answer "a," the Citizens Budget or supporting documentation must present all of the above core information as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Citizens Budget must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if the Citizens Budget includes some of the core components above, but other core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if a Citizens Budget is not published.*

Answer:

b. The Citizens Budget provides the core information.

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law/FY\\_2018-19\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law/FY_2018-19_Original_Finance_Law.pdf)

Comment:

Expenditure and revenue totals: page 8

Main policy initiatives in the budget: pages 9-15

Macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget is based: page 7

Contact information for follow-up by citizens:

Beyond the core: Information on budget process (page 3), stakeholders (page 4-6), public participation (page 7, 17).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. The Citizens Budget provides information beyond the core elements.

Comments: Expenditure and revenue totals: page 8 Main policy initiatives in the budget: pages 9-15 Macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget is based: page 7 Contact information for follow-up by citizens: Beyond the core: Information on budget process (page 3), stakeholders (page 4-6), public participation (page 7, 17), Key priority areas and expected results page 12-15). REFERENCE: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal\\_Decentralisation\\_Unit/Budget\\_Citizen\\_Guide/2018-2019/2018\\_19\\_Final\\_Citizen\\_Guide\\_to\\_the\\_Budget\\_-\\_English.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal_Decentralisation_Unit/Budget_Citizen_Guide/2018-2019/2018_19_Final_Citizen_Guide_to_the_Budget_-_English.pdf)

IBP Comment

As the government notes, one core element is missing (contact information) but there is information that goes beyond the core. Per OBS methodology, this question is cored a "b" as opposed to a "c" (for missing core information) or an "a" (for having all core information + beyond the core).

65. How is the Citizens Budget disseminated to the public?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 65 asks how the Citizens Budget is disseminated to the public. Citizens Budgets should be made available to a variety of audiences. Therefore paper versions and an Internet posting of a document might not be sufficient.*

*To answer "a," the executive must use three or more different types of creative media tools to reach the largest possible share of the population, including those who otherwise would not normally have access to budget documents or information. Dissemination would also be pursued at the very local level, so that the coverage is targeted both by geographic area and population group (e.g., women, elderly, low income, urban, rural, etc.). Option "b" applies if significant dissemination efforts are made through a combination of two means of communications, for instance, both posting the Citizens Budget on the executive's official website and distributing printed copies of it. Option "c" applies if the Citizens Budget is disseminated through only posting on the executive's official website. Option "d" applies when the executive does not publish a Citizens Budget.*

Answer:

c. A Citizens Budget is disseminated only by using one means of dissemination.

Source:

MINECOFIN

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=86&L=data%3A%2F%2Ftext.&tx-filelist-pi1-75%5Bpath%5D=Fiscal\\_Decentralisation\\_Unit%2FBudget\\_Citizen\\_Guide%2F2018-2019&cHash=7167c0ab0c160df13a95f2801f1fb18f](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=86&L=data%3A%2F%2Ftext.&tx-filelist-pi1-75%5Bpath%5D=Fiscal_Decentralisation_Unit%2FBudget_Citizen_Guide%2F2018-2019&cHash=7167c0ab0c160df13a95f2801f1fb18f)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

66. Has the executive established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information prior to publishing the Citizens Budget?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 66 asks whether the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information before publishing a Citizens Budget. What the public wants to know about the budget might differ from the information the executive includes in technical documents that comprise the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget; similarly, different perspectives might exist on how the budget should be presented, and this may vary depending on the context. For this reason the executive should consult with the public on the content and presentation of the Citizens Budget.*

*To answer "a," the executive must have established mechanisms to consult with the public, and these mechanisms for consultation are both accessible and widely used by the public. Such mechanisms can include focus groups, social networks, surveys, hotlines, and meetings/events in universities or other locations where people gather to discuss public issues. In countries where Citizens Budgets are consistently produced and released, it may be sufficient for the government to provide the public with contact information and feedback opportunities, and subsequently use the feedback to improve its management of public resources.*

*Option "b" applies if the executive has established mechanisms for consultation that are accessible to the public, but that the public nonetheless does not use frequently. That is, the public does not typically engage with the executive on the content of the Citizens Budget, even though the executive has created opportunities for such consultation. Option "c" applies if the executive has established mechanism for consultation with the public, but they are poorly designed and thus not accessible to the public. Option "d" applies if the executive has not created any mechanisms to seek feedback from the public on the*

content of the Citizens Budget.

Answer:

d. No, the executive has not established any mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget.

Source:

Minecofin

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=156&tx-filelist-pi1-406%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Citizen\\_Guide%2F2018-2019&cHash=905a074ac87d269f0254ca0eb189aa0c](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=156&tx-filelist-pi1-406%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Citizen_Guide%2F2018-2019&cHash=905a074ac87d269f0254ca0eb189aa0c)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

67. Are "citizens" versions of budget documents published throughout the budget process?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 67 asks if "citizens" versions of budget documents are published throughout the budget process. While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle.*

*To answer "a," a citizens version of at least one budget document is published for each of the four stages of the budget process (budget formulation, enactment, execution, and audit) – for a total of at least four citizens budget documents throughout the process. Option "b" applies if a citizens version of a budget document is published for at least two of the four stages of the budget process. Option "c" applies if a citizens version of a budget document is published for at least one of the four stages of the budget process. Select option "d" if no "citizens" version of budget documents is published.*

Answer:

c. A citizens version of budget documents is published for at least one stage of the budget process.

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=156&tx-filelist-pi1-406%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Citizen\\_Guide%2F2018-2019&cHash=905a074ac87d269f0254ca0eb189aa0c](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=156&tx-filelist-pi1-406%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Citizen_Guide%2F2018-2019&cHash=905a074ac87d269f0254ca0eb189aa0c)

Comment:

The Government publishes a citizens version of the Enacted Budget.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The Citizens' Guide is provided to communicate the Enacted Budget.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal\\_Decentralisation\\_Unit/Budget\\_Citizen\\_Guide/2018-2019/2018\\_19\\_Final\\_Citizen\\_Guide\\_to\\_the\\_Budget\\_-\\_English.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Fiscal_Decentralisation_Unit/Budget_Citizen_Guide/2018-2019/2018_19_Final_Citizen_Guide_to_the_Budget_-_English.pdf)

68. Do the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 68 asks if expenditure estimates in In-Year Reports are presented by any one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications – which were addressed in Questions 1-5 above.*

Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. Unlike classification by administrative unit, which tends to be unique to each country, functional and economic classifications for government budgeting have been developed and standardized by international institutions. Cross-country comparisons are facilitated by adherence to these international classification standards.

To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present actual expenditures by all three of the expenditure classifications. To answer "b," actual expenditures must be presented by two of these three classifications. A "c" answer applies if actual expenditures are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if actual expenditures are not presented by any of the three classifications in In-Year Reports.

Answer:

b. Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by two of the three expenditure classifications.

Source:

Minecofin  
Q1 2018/19

Comment:

Administrative classification: not presented  
Economic classification: Provisional fiscal outturn July-Sept 2018  
Functional classification: 2018-2019 Budget execution by COFOG

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Files are published in the Minister of Finance and Economic Planning: FY 2018/19 [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=1%20devpartners.gov.rw%2Ffileadmin%2Ftemplates%2Fdocuments%2FDPAF\\_FY\\_2012-2013.pdf&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2018-2019\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports&cHash=80e571604590dc5e4ddec5d255522632](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=1%20devpartners.gov.rw%2Ffileadmin%2Ftemplates%2Fdocuments%2FDPAF_FY_2012-2013.pdf&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2018-2019_Budget_Execution_Reports&cHash=80e571604590dc5e4ddec5d255522632) FY 2017/18 [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=-1%2527&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports%2F2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports&cHash=62c02486ddd82be39435b70a61426d3b](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=-1%2527&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Execution_Reports%2F2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports&cHash=62c02486ddd82be39435b70a61426d3b)

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: REFERENCES:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2018-2019\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/Quarter\\_I/2018\\_2019\\_Budget\\_execution\\_by\\_Program\\_and\\_Sub-program.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2018-2019_Budget_Execution_Reports/Quarter_I/2018_2019_Budget_execution_by_Program_and_Sub-program.pdf)  
[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2018-2019\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/Quarter\\_I/2018-2019\\_Budget\\_execution\\_by\\_COFOG.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2018-2019_Budget_Execution_Reports/Quarter_I/2018-2019_Budget_execution_by_COFOG.pdf)

68b. Based on the response to Question 68, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications are included in the In-Year Reports:

Answer:

Economic classification  
Functional classification

Source:

Administrative classification: not presented  
Economic classification: Provisional fiscal outturn July-Sept 2018  
Functional classification: 2018-2019 Budget execution by COFOG

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Economic classification: Provisional fiscal outturn July-Sept 2018 Functional classification: 2018-2019 Budget execution by COFOG  
REFERENCE:  
[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2018-2019\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/Quarter\\_I/2018\\_2019\\_Budget\\_execution\\_by\\_Program\\_and\\_Sub-program.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2018-2019_Budget_Execution_Reports/Quarter_I/2018_2019_Budget_execution_by_Program_and_Sub-program.pdf)  
[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2018-2019\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/Quarter\\_I/2018-2019\\_Budget\\_execution\\_by\\_COFOG.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2018-2019_Budget_Execution_Reports/Quarter_I/2018-2019_Budget_execution_by_COFOG.pdf)

69. Do the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for individual programs?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 69 asks if expenditure estimates in In-Year Reports are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department.*

*A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as le plan comptable or le plan comptable detaillé. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)*

*To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present actual expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures. To answer "b," In-Year Reports must present actual expenditures for individual programs that when combined account for at least two-thirds of expenditures, but not all expenditures. A "c" answer applies if In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for programs that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if actual expenditures are not presented by program in In-Year Reports.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for programs accounting for all expenditures.

**Source:**

In-Year Reports include a PDF table of Budget execution by Program and Sub program. However, no administrative unit is assigned to these programs.

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The In-Year Reports for 2017/18 include a document titled "2017/2018 Budget Execution by Program and Sub Program" where expenditures are reported by program in each administrative unit. Link:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/Quarter\\_I/BUDGET\\_EXECUTION\\_REPORT\\_FOR\\_THE\\_JULY\\_SEPTMBER\\_2017\\_BY\\_PROGRAM.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports/Quarter_I/BUDGET_EXECUTION_REPORT_FOR_THE_JULY_SEPTMBER_2017_BY_PROGRAM.pdf)

However, the In-Year report for 2018/19, Q1, titled "2018-2019: Budget execution by Program and Sub program" follows a slightly different format where administrative units are not assigned to expenditures. Link:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2018-2019\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/Quarter\\_I/2018\\_2019\\_Budget\\_execution\\_by\\_Program\\_and\\_Sub-program.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2018-2019_Budget_Execution_Reports/Quarter_I/2018_2019_Budget_execution_by_Program_and_Sub-program.pdf)

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

Comments: REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2018-2019\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/Quarter\\_I/2018\\_2019\\_Budget\\_execution\\_by\\_Program\\_and\\_Sub-program.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2018-2019_Budget_Execution_Reports/Quarter_I/2018_2019_Budget_execution_by_Program_and_Sub-program.pdf)

70. Do the In-Year Reports compare actual year-to-date expenditures with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 70 asks whether In-Year Reports compare actual expenditures to-date with either the enacted levels or actual expenditures for the same period in the previous year.*

*The OECD recommends that the reports contain the total year-to-date expenditures in a format that allows for a comparison with the budget's forecast expenditures (based on enacted levels) for the same period.*

*To answer "a," comparisons must be made for expenditures presented in the In-Year Reports*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, comparisons are made for expenditures presented in the In-Year Reports.

Source:

Minecofin: MINISTRY OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC PLANNING BUDGET EXECUTION REPORT

Provisional fiscal outturn July-Sept 2018 provides a comparison between the original projected amount for July-September 2018 and the provisional amount for July-September 2018.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: All In-Year Reports (titled Budget Execution Report) have a standardised format that includes a table with the projected and provisional amounts (Table 3 - Spending). A narrative is included in Section III, titled "Performance of outlays".

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2018-2019\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/Quarter\\_I/Provisional\\_Fiscal\\_Outturn\\_July-Sept\\_2018.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2018-2019_Budget_Execution_Reports/Quarter_I/Provisional_Fiscal_Outturn_July-Sept_2018.pdf)

71. Do In-Year Reports present actual revenue by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Questions 71 asks whether In-Year Reports present actual revenues by "category" – that is, whether tax and non-tax sources of revenue are shown separately.*

*To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present revenue estimates classified by category.*

Answer:

a. Yes, In-Year Reports present actual revenue by category.

Source:

Minecofin: MINISTRY OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC PLANNING BUDGET EXECUTION REPORT

Provisional fiscal outturn July-Sept 2018 provides revenue by tax and nontax.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: All In-Year Reports (titled Budget Execution Report) have a standardised format that includes a table with the projected and provisional amounts (Table 1- Revenue). A narrative is included in Section II titled "Performance of resources and expenditures", in the sub-section "Performance of Domestic Revenue".

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2018-2019\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/Quarter\\_I/Provisional\\_Fiscal\\_Outturn\\_July-Sept\\_2018.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2018-2019_Budget_Execution_Reports/Quarter_I/Provisional_Fiscal_Outturn_July-Sept_2018.pdf)

72. Do In-Year Reports present the individual sources of revenue for actual revenues collected?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 72 asks whether In-Year Reports present actual collections of individual sources of revenue (such as income taxes, VAT, etc.). The question applies to both tax and non-tax revenue.*

*To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present actual collections for all individual sources of revenue, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all revenue. To answer "b," In-Year Reports must present actual collections for individual sources of revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all revenue collected, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue that account for less than two-thirds of all revenue collected. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of actual revenue are not presented.*

Answer:

c. Yes, In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenue.

Source:

The Budget Execution Report for July-Sept 2018 provides some information on individual sources of actual revenue (such as PAYE). However only a small percentage of sources are identified.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2018-2019\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/Quarter\\_I/Provisional\\_Fiscal\\_Outturn\\_July-Sept\\_2018.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2018-2019_Budget_Execution_Reports/Quarter_I/Provisional_Fiscal_Outturn_July-Sept_2018.pdf)

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2018-2019\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/Quarter\\_I/Provisional\\_Fiscal\\_Outturn\\_July-Sept\\_2018.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2018-2019_Budget_Execution_Reports/Quarter_I/Provisional_Fiscal_Outturn_July-Sept_2018.pdf)

73. Do the In-Year Reports compare actual year-to-date revenues with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 73 asks whether In-Year Reports compare actual revenues to-date with either the enacted levels or actual revenues for the same period in the previous year.*

*The OECD recommends that the reports contain the total year-to-date revenues in a format that allows for a comparison with the budget's forecast revenues (based on enacted levels) for the same period.*

*To answer "a," comparisons must be made for revenues presented in the In-Year Reports.*

Answer:

a. Yes, comparisons are made for revenues presented in the In-Year Reports.

Source:

Fiscal outturn document provides comparison between enacted and actual.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2018-2019\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/Quarter\\_I/BUDGET\\_EXECUTION\\_REPORT\\_FOR\\_THE\\_JULY-SEPT\\_2018\\_.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2018-2019_Budget_Execution_Reports/Quarter_I/BUDGET_EXECUTION_REPORT_FOR_THE_JULY-SEPT_2018_.pdf)

74. Do In-Year Reports present three estimates related to actual government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing; the total debt outstanding; and interest payments?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 74 asks about three key estimates related to borrowing and debt:*

*· the amount of net new borrowing so far during the year;*

- the central government's total debt burden at that point in the year; and
- the interest payments to-date on the outstanding debt.

*Debt is the accumulated amount of money that the government borrows. The government can borrow from its citizens and banks and businesses within the country (domestic debt) or from creditors outside the country (external debt). External debt is typically owed to private commercial banks, other governments, or international financial institutions such as the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund.*

*Net new borrowing is the additional amount of new borrowing that is required for the budget year to finance expenditures in the budget that exceed available revenues. Net new borrowing adds to the accumulated debt. It is distinct from gross borrowing, which also includes borrowing needed to repay existing debt that matured during the budget year; debt that is replaced (or rolled over) does not add to the total of accumulated debt.*

*Interest payments on the debt (or debt service costs) are typically made at regular intervals, and these payments must be made on a timely basis in order to avoid defaulting on the debt obligation. Interest payments are separate from the repayment of principal, which occurs only when the loan has matured and must be paid back in full.*

*To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present all three estimates of borrowing and debt. For a "b" answer, In-Year Reports must present two of those three estimates. For a "c" answer, IYRs must present one of the three estimates. Answer "d" applies if no information on borrowing and debt is presented in In-Year Reports.*

Answer:

b. Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

Source:

the amount of net new borrowing so far during the year: Budget execution report for July-Sept 2018, page 34

the central government's total debt burden at that point in the year: not presented

the interest payments to-date on the outstanding debt: provisional fiscal outturn, July-Sept 2018

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: A narrative is given in Section V, titled "Deficit and Financing" on each Budget Execution Report concerning net new borrowing, and described in Table 4 (Financing). Interest payments is also described in the section "III. Performance of outlays" under "Interest Payments".

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2018-2019\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/Quarter\\_I/BUDGET\\_EXECUTION\\_REPORT\\_FOR\\_THE\\_JULY-SEPT\\_2018\\_.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2018-2019_Budget_Execution_Reports/Quarter_I/BUDGET_EXECUTION_REPORT_FOR_THE_JULY-SEPT_2018_.pdf)

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2018-2019\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/Quarter\\_I/Provisional\\_Fiscal\\_Outturn\\_July-Sept\\_2018.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2018-2019_Budget_Execution_Reports/Quarter_I/Provisional_Fiscal_Outturn_July-Sept_2018.pdf)

75. Do In-Year Reports present information related to the composition of the total actual debt outstanding?

(The core information must include interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 75 focuses on the composition of government debt, asking whether "core" information related to its composition is presented. These core components include:*

- interest rates on the debt;
- maturity profile of the debt; and
- whether the debt is domestic or external.

*The interest rates affect the amount of interest that must be paid to creditors. The maturity profile indicates the final payment date of the loan, at which point the principal (and all remaining interest) is due to be paid; government borrowing typically includes a mix of short-term and long-term debt. As discussed in Question 74, domestic debt is held by a country's citizens and banks and businesses, while external debt is held by foreigners. These factors related to the composition of the debt give an indication of the potential vulnerability of the country's debt position, and ultimately whether the cost of servicing the accumulated debt is affordable.*

*Beyond these core elements, a government may also provide additional information related to the composition of its debt, including for instance: whether*

interest rates are fixed or variable; whether debt is callable; the currency of the debt; a profile of the creditors (bilateral institutions, multilateral institutions, commercial banks, Central Bank, etc.); an analysis of the risk associated with the debt; and where appropriate, what the debt is being used to finance.

To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present all of the core information related to the composition of government debt to-date as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," In-Year Reports must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to the composition of government debt is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on the composition of the debt outstanding in In-Year Reports.

Answer:

d. No, information related to composition of total actual debt outstanding is not presented.

Source:

This information is not presented.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

76. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include an updated macroeconomic forecast for the budget year underway?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 76 asks whether the Mid-Year Review includes an updated macroeconomic forecast for the budget year, and provides an explanation of the update.*

*Refer to Question 15 for the components of the macroeconomic forecast presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal.*

*To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must include an updated macroeconomic forecast and explain all of the differences between the initial forecast presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal and the updated forecast. The explanation must include at least estimates of all differences; a narrative discussion is desirable but not required if estimates of all the differences are provided. To answer "b," the macroeconomic forecast must be updated, but only some of the differences between the initial and updated forecasts are explained. The explanation would be more limited, such as only a narrative discussion of the differences or estimates covering only some of the differences. A "c" response applies if the Mid-Year Review includes an updated macroeconomic forecast, but does not provide an explanation for the revisions. A "d" response applies if the macroeconomic forecast has not been updated.*

Answer:

d. No, the estimates for macroeconomic forecast have not been updated.

Source:

Comment:

A Mid-Year Review is not made publicly available.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, the estimates for the macroeconomic forecast have been updated, and an explanation of all of the differences between the original and updated forecasts is presented.

Comments: Along with the supplementary budget, an explanatory note to the review was published to explain the reasons for the review. A revised macroeconomic framework is presented with a narrative discussion on the reasons for changes. REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law/Explanatory\\_note\\_for\\_2018\\_19\\_Revised\\_Budget\\_-\\_English.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law/Explanatory_note_for_2018_19_Revised_Budget_-_English.pdf)

IBP Comment

The explanatory note cited by the government was published after the research cut-off period for the OBS (31 December 2018), and thus could not be used to answer this question. Additionally, the government did not publish a similar explanatory note for FY 2017-18.

77. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 77 asks whether the Mid-Year Review includes updated estimates of expenditure for the budget year, and provides an explanation of the update.*

*To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must include updated expenditure estimates and explain all of the differences between the initial levels presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal (or the Enacted Budget) and the updated estimates. The explanation must include at least estimates of all differences; a narrative discussion is desirable but not required if estimates of all the differences are provided. The expenditure estimates must be updated, but only some of the differences between the initial and updated estimates are explained. The explanation would be more limited, such as only a narrative discussion of the differences or estimates covering only some of the differences. A "c" response applies if the Mid-Year Review includes updated expenditure estimates, but does not provide an explanation for the revisions. A "d" response applies if the expenditure estimates have not been updated.*

Answer:

d. No, expenditure estimates have not been updated.

Source:

Comment:

A Mid-Year Review is not made publicly available.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, expenditure estimates have been updated, and an explanation of all of the differences between the original and updated expenditure estimates is presented.

Comments: Along with the supplementary budget, an explanatory note to the review was published to explain the reasons for the review. A revised macroeconomic framework is presented with a narrative discussion on the reasons for changes. REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law/Explanatory\\_note\\_for\\_2018\\_19\\_Revised\\_Budget\\_-\\_English.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law/Explanatory_note_for_2018_19_Revised_Budget_-_English.pdf)

IBP Comment

The explanatory note cited by the government was published after the research cut-off period for the OBS (31 December 2018), and thus could not be used to answer this question. Additionally, the government did not publish a similar explanatory note for FY 2017-18.

78. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present expenditure estimates for the budget year underway by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 78 asks if expenditure estimates in the Mid-Year Review are presented by any one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications – which were addressed in Questions 1-5 above. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. Unlike classification by administrative unit, which tends to be unique to each country, functional and economic classifications for government budgeting have been developed and standardized by international institutions. Cross-country comparisons are facilitated by adherence to these international classification standards.*

*To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must present expenditure estimates by all three of the expenditure classifications. To answer "b," expenditure estimates must be presented by two of these three classifications. A "c" answer applies if expenditure estimates are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if expenditure estimates are not presented by any of the three classifications in the Mid-Year Review.*

Answer:

d. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=data%3A%2F%2Ftext%2Fplain.&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws%2F2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law&cHash=fff34cfe135adfc36b64a2fe42b03c52](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&L=data%3A%2F%2Ftext%2Fplain.&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Annual_State_Finance_Laws%2F2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law&cHash=fff34cfe135adfc36b64a2fe42b03c52)

Comment:

A Mid-Year Review is not made publicly available.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

Comments: Along with the supplementary budget, an explanatory note to the review was published to explain the reasons for the review. A revised macroeconomic framework is presented with a narrative discussion on the reasons for changes. REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law/Explanatory\\_note\\_for\\_2018\\_19\\_Revised\\_Budget\\_-\\_English.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law/Explanatory_note_for_2018_19_Revised_Budget_-_English.pdf) From there, a revised budget was presented in the same

format as the original budget presenting expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification). REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law/2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law.pdf)

IBP Comment

The explanatory note cited by the government was published after the research cut-off period for the OBS (31 December 2018), and thus could not be used to answer this question. Additionally, the government did not publish a similar explanatory note for FY 2017-18.

78b. Based on the response to Question 78, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications are included in the Mid-Year Review:

Answer:

None of the above

Source:

A Mid-Year Review is not made publicly available.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: Administrative classification Economic classification Functional classification

Comments: Along with the supplementary budget, an explanatory note to the review was published to explain the reasons for the review. A revised macroeconomic framework is presented with a narrative discussion on the reasons for changes. REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law/Explanatory\\_note\\_for\\_2018\\_19\\_Revised\\_Budget\\_-\\_English.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law/Explanatory_note_for_2018_19_Revised_Budget_-_English.pdf) From there, a revised budget was presented in the same

format as the original budget presenting expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification). REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law/2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law.pdf)

IBP Comment

The explanatory note cited by the government was published after the research cut-off period for the OBS (31 December 2018), and thus could not be used to answer this question. Additionally, the government did not publish a similar explanatory note for FY 2017-18.

79. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present expenditure estimates for the budget year underway for individual programs?

*GUIDELINES:*

Question 79 asks if expenditure estimates in the Mid-Year Review are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department.

A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as *le plan comptable* or *le plan comptable detaillé*. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must present expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures. To answer "b," the Mid-Year Review must present expenditures for individual programs that when combined account for at least two-thirds of expenditures, but not all expenditures. A "c" answer applies if the Mid-Year Review presents programs that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by program in the Mid-Year Review.

Answer:

d. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present expenditure estimates by program.

Source:

A Mid-Year Review is not made publicly available.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures.

Comments: Along with the revised budget, an explanatory note to the review was published to explain the reasons for the review. A revised macroeconomic framework is presented with a narrative discussion on the reasons for changes. REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law/Explanatory_note_for_2018_19_Revised_Budget_-_English.pdf)

2019\_Revised\_Finance\_Law/Explanatory\_note\_for\_2018\_19\_Revised\_Budget\_-\_English.pdf From there, a revised budget was presented in the same format as the original budget presenting expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification). See annex II-2 and II-5 for budget by programs and subprograms REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law.pdf)

IBP Comment

The explanatory note cited by the government was published after the research cut-off period for the OBS (31 December 2018), and thus could not be used to answer this question. Additionally, the government did not publish a similar explanatory note for FY 2017-18.

80. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 80 asks whether the Mid-Year Review includes updated estimates of revenue for the budget year, and provides an explanation of the update.

To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must include updated revenue estimates and explain all of the differences between the initial levels presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal (or the Enacted Budget) and the updated estimates. The explanation must include at least estimates of all differences; a narrative discussion is desirable but not required if estimates of all the differences are provided. To answer "b," the revenue estimates must be updated, but only some of the differences between the initial and updated estimates are explained. The explanation would be more limited, such as only a narrative discussion of the differences or estimates covering only some of the differences. A "c" response applies if the Mid-Year Review includes updated revenue estimates, but no explanation for the revisions is provided. A "d" response applies if the revenue estimates have not been updated.

Answer:

d. No, revenue estimates have not been updated.

Source:

A Mid-Year Review is not made publicly available.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, revenue estimates have been updated, and an explanation of all of the differences between the original and updated revenue estimates is presented.

Comments: Along with the supplementary budget, an explanatory note to the review was published to explain the reasons for the review. A revised macroeconomic framework is presented with a narrative discussion on the reasons for changes in both revenues and expenditures. REFERENCE: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law/Explanatory\\_note\\_for\\_2018\\_19\\_Revised\\_Budget\\_-\\_English.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law/Explanatory_note_for_2018_19_Revised_Budget_-_English.pdf) From there, a revised budget was presented in the same format as the original budget presenting expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification). REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law/2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law.pdf)

IBP Comment

The explanatory note cited by the government was published after the research cut-off period for the OBS (31 December 2018), and thus could not be used to answer this question. Additionally, the government did not publish a similar explanatory note for FY 2017-18.

81. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present revenue estimates for the budget year underway by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 81 asks whether revenue estimates in the Mid-Year Review are presented by "category"— that is, whether tax and non-tax sources of revenue are shown separately.*

*To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must present revenue estimates classified by category.*

Answer:

b. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present revenue estimates by category.

Source:

A Mid-Year Review is not made publicly available.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents revenue estimates by category.

Comments: Along with the supplementary budget, an explanatory note to the review was published to explain the reasons for the review. A revised macroeconomic framework is presented with a narrative discussion on the reasons for changes in both revenues and expenditures. Refer to section 4 "The Revised 2018/19 budget proposals" on page 5 of the explanatory note for revised revenue estimates by category. REFERENCE: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law/Explanatory\\_note\\_for\\_2018\\_19\\_Revised\\_Budget\\_-\\_English.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law/Explanatory_note_for_2018_19_Revised_Budget_-_English.pdf) From there, a revised budget was presented in the same format as the original budget presenting expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification). You can refer to Annex I for detailed revised revenues REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law/2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law.pdf)

IBP Comment

The explanatory note cited by the government was published after the research cut-off period for the OBS (31 December 2018), and thus could not be used to answer this question. Additionally, the government did not publish a similar explanatory note for FY 2017-18.

82. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present individual sources of revenue for the budget year underway?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 82 asks whether revenue estimates for individual sources of revenue are presented in the Mid-Year Review. The question applies to both tax and non-*

tax revenue.

To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must present all sources of revenue individually, accounting for all revenues, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all revenue. To answer "b," the Mid-Year Review must present individual sources of revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all revenue, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if the Mid-Year Review presents estimates of individual revenue sources that account for less than two-thirds of revenue. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of revenue are not presented in the Mid-Year Review.

Answer:

d. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present individual sources of revenue.

Source:

A Mid-Year Review is not made publicly available.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.

Comments: Along with the supplementary budget, an explanatory note to the review was published to explain the reasons for the review. A revised macroeconomic framework is presented with a narrative discussion on the reasons for changes in both revenues and expenditures. Refer to section 4 "The Revised 2018/19 budget proposals" on page 5 of the explanatory note for revised revenue estimates by category. REFERENCE: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law/Explanatory\\_note\\_for\\_2018\\_19\\_Revised\\_Budget\\_-\\_English.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law/Explanatory_note_for_2018_19_Revised_Budget_-_English.pdf) From there, a revised budget was presented in the same format as the original budget presenting expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification). You can refer to Annex I for detailed revised revenues REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws/2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law/2018-2019\\_Revised\\_Finance\\_Law.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Annual_State_Finance_Laws/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law/2018-2019_Revised_Finance_Law.pdf)

IBP Comment

The explanatory note cited by the government was published after the research cut-off period for the OBS (31 December 2018), and thus could not be used to answer this question. Additionally, the government did not publish a similar explanatory note for FY 2017-18.

83. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the budget year underway?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 83 asks whether the Mid-Year Review includes updated estimates of borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the budget year, and provides an explanation of the update.

Refer to Question 13 for details on estimates in the Executive's Budget Proposal of borrowing and debt. Key estimates related to borrowing and debt include:

- The amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year;
- The central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year; and
- The interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year.

Refer to Question 14 for details on estimates in the Executive's Budget Proposal related to the composition of the debt. Core information related to the composition of government debt include:

- interest rates on the debt;
- maturity profile of the debt; and
- whether the debt is domestic or external.

To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must include an updated estimates of borrowing and debt, including its composition, and explain all of the differences between the initial estimates presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal (or Enacted Budget) and the updated estimates. The explanation must include at least estimates of all differences; a narrative discussion is desirable but not required if estimates of all the differences are provided. To answer "b," the estimates of borrowing and debt must be updated, but only some of the differences between the initial and updated estimates are explained. The explanation would be more limited, such as only a narrative discussion of the differences or estimates covering only some of the differences. A "c" response applies if the Mid-Year Review includes updated estimates, but no explanation for the revisions is provided. A "d" response applies if the estimates of borrowing and debt have not been updated.

Answer:

d. No, estimates of government borrowing and debt have not been updated.

Source:

A Mid-Year Review is not made publicly available.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

b. Yes, estimates of government borrowing and debt have been updated, and information on some of the differences between the original and updated estimates is presented.

Comments: Public debt servicing section as well as Revised Deficit and financing Projections both on page 7 of the explanatory note present information on updated estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition with some explanations on variances

IBP Comment

The explanatory note cited by the government was published after the research cut-off period for the OBS (31 December 2018), and thus could not be used to answer this question. Additionally, the government did not publish a similar explanatory note for FY 2017-18.

84. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 84 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and actual expenditures for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.*

*To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all expenditures, along with a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if estimates of the differences for all expenditures are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences are presented for some, but not all expenditures, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. Answer "d" if no estimates of the differences are presented in the Year-End Report*

Answer:

d. No, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures are not presented.

Source:

A Year-End Report is not made publicly available.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

Comments: Since the FY runs from July 1st up to June 30th, the recent YER published before end December 2018 is for 2017/2018 FY. The table on Fiscal outturn presents estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all expenditure.

REFERENCE:[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report/2017\\_2018\\_Fiscal\\_Outturn.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report/2017_2018_Fiscal_Outturn.pdf) Section III "PERFORMANCE OF OUTLAYS" (from page 13 to 19) of the narrative report provides a detailed along with a narrative discussion. REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report/2017-2018\\_ANNUAL\\_BUDGET\\_EXECUTION\\_REPORT.pdf#page=13&zoom=100,0,500](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report/2017-2018_ANNUAL_BUDGET_EXECUTION_REPORT.pdf#page=13&zoom=100,0,500)

IBP Comment

For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government – the "Annual Budget Execution Report" – is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

85. Does the Year-End Report present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 85 asks if expenditure estimates in the Year-End Report are presented by any one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications – which were addressed in Questions 1-5 above. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. Unlike classification by administrative unit, which tends to be unique to each country, functional and economic classifications for government budgeting have been developed and standardized by international institutions. Cross-country comparisons are facilitated by adherence to these international classification standards.*

*To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present expenditure estimates by all three of the expenditure classifications. Answer "b" if expenditure estimates are presented by two of these three classifications. Answer "c" if expenditure estimates are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" if expenditure estimates are not presented by any of the three classifications in the Year-End Report.*

Answer:

d. No, the Year-End Report does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.

Source:

A Year-End Report is not made publicly available.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, the Year-End Report presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

Comments: Administrative and Program classification: 2017-2018 : Budget execution by Program and Sub program REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report/2017-2018\\_BudgetExecution\\_by\\_Program\\_and\\_Subprogram.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report/2017-2018_BudgetExecution_by_Program_and_Subprogram.pdf)

Economic Classification: Table 3 on page 14 of budget execution report. REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report/2017-2018\\_ANNUAL\\_BUDGET\\_EXECUTION\\_REPORT.pdf#page=13&zoom=100,0,500](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report/2017-2018_ANNUAL_BUDGET_EXECUTION_REPORT.pdf#page=13&zoom=100,0,500)

Functional Classification: 2017-2018 : Budget execution by Cofog

REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report/2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_by\\_Sectors-.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report/2017-2018_Budget_Execution_by_Sectors-.pdf)

IBP Comment

For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government -- the "Annual Budget Execution Report" -- is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

85b. Based on the response to Question 85, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications are included in the Year-End Report:

Answer:

None of the above

Source:

A Year-End Report is not made publicly available.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: Administrative classification Economic classification Functional classification

Comments: Administrative and Program classification: 2017-2018 : Budget execution by Program and Sub program REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report/2017-2018\\_BudgetExecution\\_by\\_Program\\_and\\_Subprogram.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report/2017-2018_BudgetExecution_by_Program_and_Subprogram.pdf)

Economic Classification: Table 3 on page 14 of budget execution report. REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report/2017-2018\\_ANNUAL\\_BUDGET\\_EXECUTION\\_REPORT.pdf#page=13&zoom=100,0,500](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report/2017-2018_ANNUAL_BUDGET_EXECUTION_REPORT.pdf#page=13&zoom=100,0,500) Functional Classification: 2017-2018 : Budget execution by Cofog

REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report/2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_by\\_Sectors-.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report/2017-2018_Budget_Execution_by_Sectors-.pdf)

IBP Comment

For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government – the "Annual Budget Execution Report" – is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

86. Does the Year-End Report present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 86 asks if expenditure estimates in the Year-End Report are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department.*

*A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as le plan comptable or le plan comptable detaillé. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)*

*To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present expenditure estimates for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents expenditures for individual programs that when combined account for at least two-thirds of expenditures, but not all expenditures. Answer "c" if the Year-End Report presents programs that account for only less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" if expenditures are not presented by program in the Year-End Report.*

Answer:

d. No, the Year-End Report does not present expenditure estimates by program.

Source:

A Year-End Report is not made publicly available.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, the Year-End Report presents estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures.

Comments: Administrative and Program classification: 2017-2018 : Budget execution by Program and Sub program REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report/2017-2018\\_BudgetExecution\\_by\\_Program\\_and\\_Subprogram.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report/2017-2018_BudgetExecution_by_Program_and_Subprogram.pdf)

IBP Comment

For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government – the "Annual Budget Execution Report" – is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

87. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 87 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and actual revenues for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.*

*To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all revenues, along with a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if estimates of the differences for all revenues are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences are presented for some, but not all revenues, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. Answer "d" if no estimates of the differences are presented in the Year-End Report.*

Answer:

d. No, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for revenues are not presented.

Source:

A Year-End Report is not made publicly available.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all revenues are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

Comments: The section on "Performance of Resources" from page 6 of the YER provides estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all revenues are presented, along with a narrative discussion. REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report/2017-2018\\_ANNUAL\\_BUDGET\\_EXECUTION\\_REPORT.pdf#page=13&zoom=100,0,500](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report/2017-2018_ANNUAL_BUDGET_EXECUTION_REPORT.pdf#page=13&zoom=100,0,500)

IBP Comment

For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government -- the "Annual Budget Execution Report" -- is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

88. Does the Year-End Report present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 88 asks whether revenue estimates in the Year-End Report are presented by "category" -- that is, whether tax and non-tax sources of revenue are shown separately.*

*To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present revenue estimates classified by category.*

Answer:

b. No, the Year-End Report does not present revenue estimates by category.

Source:

A Year-End Report is not made publicly available.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, the Year-End Report presents revenue estimates by category.

Comments: See table 1 on page 7 of the YER. REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report/2017-2018\\_ANNUAL\\_BUDGET\\_EXECUTION\\_REPORT.pdf#page=13&zoom=100,0,500](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report/2017-2018_ANNUAL_BUDGET_EXECUTION_REPORT.pdf#page=13&zoom=100,0,500)

IBP Comment

For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government – the "Annual Budget Execution Report" – is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

89. Does the Year-End Report present individual sources of revenue?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 89 asks whether revenue estimates for individual sources of revenue are presented in the Year-End Report. The question applies to both tax and non-tax revenue.*

*To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present all sources of revenue individually, accounting for all revenue, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all revenue. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all revenue, but not all revenue. Answer "c" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of individual revenue sources that account for less than two-thirds of revenue. Answer "d" if individual sources of revenue are not presented in the Year-End Report.*

Answer:

d. No, the Year-End Report does not present individual sources of revenue.

Source:

A Year-End Report is not made publicly available.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

90. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 90 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the original estimates and the actual outcome for the fiscal year for borrowing and debt, including its composition, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.*

*Refer to Question 13 for details on estimates in the Executive's Budget Proposal of borrowing and debt. Key estimates related to borrowing and debt include:*

- *the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year;*
- *the central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year; and*
- *the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year.*

*Refer to Question 14 for details on estimates in the Executive's Budget Proposal related to the composition of the debt. Core information related to the composition of government debt include:*

- *interest rates on the debt;*
- *maturity profile of the debt; and*
- *whether the debt is domestic or external.*

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must include estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented.

Answer:

d. No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year is not presented.

Source:

A Year-End Report is not made publicly available.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

c. Yes, estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented.

Comments: See table 2 on page 12 for borrowing and table 3 on page 14 for interest payment. REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report/2017-2018\\_ANNUAL\\_BUDGET\\_EXECUTION\\_REPORT.pdf#page=13&zoom=100,0,500](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report/2017-2018_ANNUAL_BUDGET_EXECUTION_REPORT.pdf#page=13&zoom=100,0,500)

IBP Comment

For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government -- the "Annual Budget Execution Report" -- is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

90b. Based on the response to Question 90, check the box(es) to identify which estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, have the differences between the original forecast and the actual outcome for the year presented in the Year-End Report:

Answer:

Information beyond the core elements:

Source:

A Year-End Report is not made publicly available.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: The amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year The interest payments on outstanding debt for the budget year Whether the debt is domestic or external

Comments: See table 2 on page 12 for borrowing and table 3 on page 14 for interest payment. REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report/2017-2018\\_ANNUAL\\_BUDGET\\_EXECUTION\\_REPORT.pdf#page=13&zoom=100,0,500](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report/2017-2018_ANNUAL_BUDGET_EXECUTION_REPORT.pdf#page=13&zoom=100,0,500)

IBP Comment

For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government -- the "Annual Budget Execution Report" -- is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final

outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

91. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 91 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.*

*Refer to Question 15 for the components of the macroeconomic forecast in the Executive's Budget Proposal. Core components include estimates of the nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates, although the importance of other macroeconomic assumptions, such as the price of oil, can vary from country to country.*

*To answer "a," the Year-End Report must include estimates of the differences between all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented.*

**Answer:**

d. No, estimates of the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year is not presented.

**Source:**

A Year-End Report is not made publicly available.

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Disagree

**Suggested Answer:**

c. Yes, estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented.

Comments: Section I. a. "Brief Summary of Domestic Economic Performance in the January-June 2018 period" (from page 4-6), provides estimates of the differences between some of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome. REFERENCE: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report/2017-2018\\_ANNUAL\\_BUDGET\\_EXECUTION\\_REPORT.pdf#page=4&zoom=100,0,394](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report/2017-2018_ANNUAL_BUDGET_EXECUTION_REPORT.pdf#page=4&zoom=100,0,394)

**IBP Comment**

For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government -- the "Annual Budget Execution Report" -- is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

91b. Based on the response to Question 91, check the box(es) to identify which elements of the macroeconomic forecast have the differences between the original forecast and the outcome for the year presented in the Year-End Report:

**Answer:**

None of the above

**Source:**

A Year-End Report is not made publicly available.

**Comment:**

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: Inflation rate Real GDP growth Information beyond the core elements (information on BOP, Monetary sector)

Comments: Section I. a. "Brief Summary of Domestic Economic Performance in the January-June 2018 period" (from page 4-6), provides estimates of the differences between some of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome. REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report/2017-2018\\_ANNUAL\\_BUDGET\\_EXECUTION\\_REPORT.pdf#page=4&zoom=100,0,394](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report/2017-2018_ANNUAL_BUDGET_EXECUTION_REPORT.pdf#page=4&zoom=100,0,394)

IBP Comment

For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government -- the "Annual Budget Execution Report" -- is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

92. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 92 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.*

*Refer to Question 49 for the nonfinancial data on inputs included in the Executive's Budget Proposal.*

*To answer "a," the Year-End Report must include estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented.*

Answer:

d. No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are not presented.

Source:

A Year-End Report is not made publicly available.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

c. Yes, estimate of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are presented.

Comments: See section IV "SECTORAL PERFORMANCE" from page 19. REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report/2017-2018\\_ANNUAL\\_BUDGET\\_EXECUTION\\_REPORT.pdf#page=4&zoom=100,0,394](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report/2017-2018_ANNUAL_BUDGET_EXECUTION_REPORT.pdf#page=4&zoom=100,0,394)

IBP Comment

For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government -- the "Annual Budget Execution Report" -- is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

93. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 93 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion. Nonfinancial data on results can include data on both outputs and outcomes, but not on inputs (which are addressed in Question 92).

Refer to Question 50 for the nonfinancial data on results included in the Executive's Budget Proposal.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must include estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented.

**Answer:**

d. No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are not presented.

**Source:**

A Year-End Report is not made publicly available.

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

c. Yes, estimate of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are presented.

Comments: See section IV "SECTORAL PERFORMANCE" from page 19. REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Reports/2017-2018\\_Annual\\_Budget\\_Execution\\_Report/2017-2018\\_ANNUAL\\_BUDGET\\_EXECUTION\\_REPORT.pdf#page=4&zoom=100,0,394](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Budget_Execution_Reports/2017-2018_Annual_Budget_Execution_Report/2017-2018_ANNUAL_BUDGET_EXECUTION_REPORT.pdf#page=4&zoom=100,0,394)

**IBP Comment**

For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government – the "Annual Budget Execution Report" – is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

94. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted level of funds for policies (both new proposals and existing policies) that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 94 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the enacted level of funds for policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.

Refer to Question 52 for assistance to the most impoverished populations in the Executive's Budget Proposal.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present estimates of the differences between the enacted level for all policies that are intended to benefit the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between the enacted level for all policies that are intended to benefit the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between the enacted level for some but not all of the policies that are intended to benefit the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented.

**Answer:**

d. No, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are not presented.

**Source:**

A Year-End Report is not made publicly available.

**Comment:**

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree  
Comments: The year end report is presented but doesn't have this kind of details

IBP Comment  
For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government – the "Annual Budget Execution Report" – is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

95. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 95 asks whether the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.*

*Refer to Question 33 for estimates of extra-budgetary funds in the Executive's Budget Proposal.*

*To answer "a," the Year-End Report must include estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented*

Answer:

d. No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome is not presented.

Source:

A Year-End Report is not made publicly available.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree  
Comments: The year end report is presented but doesn't have this kind of details

IBP Comment  
For the purposes of the OBS, the document cited by the Government – the "Annual Budget Execution Report" – is considered a final In-Year Report, and not a Year-End Report. It matches the formatting of the other In-Year Reports, and lacks the more comprehensive accounting of the final outcomes of the government's budget that would be expected in the YER.

96. Is a financial statement included as part of the Year-End Report or released as a separate report?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 96 asks whether a financial statement is included as part of the Year-End Report, or whether it is released as a separate report. The financial statement can include some or all of the following elements: a cash flow statement, an operating statement, a balance sheet, and notes on accounting. For purposes of responding to this question, the financial statement in question does not need to be audited. For an example of a financial statement, see the document "Financial Statements of the Government of New Zealand 2013" (<https://treasury.govt.nz/sites/default/files/2013-10/fsgnz-year-jun13.pdf>)*

*To answer "a," a financial statement must either be included in the Year-End Report or must be released as a separate report. Answer "a" applies if a financial statement is released as a separate report, even if the Year-End Report is not publicly available. Answer "b" applies if no financial statement is released either as part of the Year-End Report or as a separate report.*

Answer:

b. No, a financial statement is neither part of the Year-End Report nor released as a separate report.

Source:

A Year-End Report is not made publicly available.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, a financial statement is part of the Year-End Report or is released as a separate report.

Comments: Financial Statement is published as a separate document. REFERENCE:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/PAU\\_Files/Consolidated\\_Financial\\_Statements/Consolidated\\_Financial\\_Statements/GoR\\_Consolidated\\_Financial\\_Statements\\_FY\\_2017-2018.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/PAU_Files/Consolidated_Financial_Statements/Consolidated_Financial_Statements/GoR_Consolidated_Financial_Statements_FY_2017-2018.pdf)

Researcher Response

I agree with the government reviewer.

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Consolidated\\_Financial\\_Statements/Consolidated\\_Financial\\_Statements/GoR\\_Consolidated\\_Financial\\_Statements\\_FY\\_2016-2017.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Consolidated_Financial_Statements/Consolidated_Financial_Statements/GoR_Consolidated_Financial_Statements_FY_2016-2017.pdf)

IBP Comment

For cross country comparability, this question has been answered "B." The 2016/17 Financial Statement was published on 27 September 2018, which is more than twelve months after the end of that fiscal year. As this financial statement was published too late by international standards, this question is answered "B."

97. What type of audits (compliance, financial, or performance) has the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) conducted and made available to the public?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 97 asks about the types of audits conducted by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI). There are three basic types of audits:*

- *Financial audits are intended to determine if an entity's financial information is accurate (free from errors or fraud) and presented in accordance with the applicable financial reporting and regulatory framework. See ISSAI 200 (<http://www.issai.org/issai-framework/3-fundamental-auditing-principles.htm>) for more detail.*
- *Compliance audits look at the extent to which the relevant regulations and procedures have been followed. See ISSAI 400 (<http://www.issai.org/issai-framework/3-fundamental-auditing-principles.htm>) for more details.*
- *Performance audits assess whether activities are adhering to the principles of economy, efficiency, and effectiveness. See ISSAI 300 (<http://www.issai.org/issai-framework/3-fundamental-auditing-principles.htm>) for more details. ≈*

*Financial and compliance audits are more common than performance audits, which usually occur only once a performance framework has been agreed upon. In some countries, the SAI's mandate limits the type of audit it can conduct.*

*To answer "a," the SAI must have conducted all three types of audit – financial, compliance, and performance – and made all of them available to the public. A "b" response applies if the SAI has conducted two of the three audit types, and a "c" applies if it has conducted only one type of audit. Answers "b" and "c" may be selected even if the Audit Report is not publicly available, as long as the SAI has conducted compliance or performance audits and made them available to the public. A "d" response applies if the SAI has not conducted any of the three types of audits, or has not made them available to the public.*

Answer:

a. The SAI has conducted all three types of audits (compliance, financial, or performance) and made them available to the public.

Source:

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Financial\\_Reports/ANNUAL\\_REPORT\\_JUNE\\_2017\\_EXECUTIVE\\_SUMMARY.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Financial_Reports/ANNUAL_REPORT_JUNE_2017_EXECUTIVE_SUMMARY.pdf)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: As mentioned in the Executive summary, page 5, "The audits covered state consolidated financial statements; expenditure incurred by

Government entities for the year ended 30 June 2017 and operations of Boards and Government Business Enterprises. This report presents cross cutting and other key issues of national impact noted during regularity, performance, IT and special audits."

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

98. What percentage of expenditures within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 98 focuses on the coverage of audits by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI), asking what percentage of expenditures within the SAI's mandate has been audited.*

*The SAI's mandate is typically defined in statute. Only expenditures related to budgetary central government (ministries, departments, and agencies) that are within the SAI's mandate should be considered for this question. (Question 99 addresses audits of extra-budgetary funds.) Further, the question does not apply to "secret programs" (for example, security-related expenditures that are confidential). Further, if the mandate gives the SAI the authority to outsource some audits, then those audits count for purposes of this question.*

*Only the Audit Report identified in Section 1 should be used to answer this question. Financial audits and compliance audits, or a hybrid of the two, can be taken into account to answer this question. Performance audits should not be considered for this question.*

*To answer "a," all expenditures within the SAI's mandate must be audited. A "b" response applies if at least two-thirds, but not all, expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited. A "c" response is appropriate when less than two-thirds of expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited. A "d" response applies when no expenditures have been audited.*

**Answer:**

b. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited.

**Source:**

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Financial\\_Reports/ANNUAL\\_REPORT\\_JUNE\\_2017\\_EXECUTIVE\\_SUMMARY.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Financial_Reports/ANNUAL_REPORT_JUNE_2017_EXECUTIVE_SUMMARY.pdf)

**Comment:**

See page 6: OAG audits in 2016/17 covered 88% of national expenditures.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

Comments: On page 6, in the section Audit coverage, it is described that "the expenditure incurred by the 139 budget agencies and projects represents 86.4% of the reported Government Expenditure of FRW 2,200,199,963,530 for the year ended 30 June 2017." Source: Report of the Auditor General of State Finances for the year ended 30 June 2017

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

99. What percentage of extra-budgetary funds within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 99 focuses on audits of extra-budgetary funds, asking what percentage of extra-budgetary funds within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited. These funds, although technically outside the budget, are governmental in nature and thus should be subject to the same audit requirement as other government programs.*

*The SAI's mandate is typically defined in statute. Only expenditures related to extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate should be considered for this question. (Question 98 addresses audits of budgetary central government.) Further, if the mandate gives the SAI the authority to outsource some audits, then those audits count for purposes of this question.*

*To answer "a," all extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate must be audited. A "b" response applies if extra-budgetary funds accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited. A "c" response applies if extra-budgetary funds accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited. A "d" response applies if extra-budgetary funds have not been audited.*

Answer:

b. Extra-budgetary funds accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited.

Source:

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Financial\\_Reports/ANNUAL\\_REPORT\\_JUNE\\_2017\\_EXECUTIVE\\_SUMMARY.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Financial_Reports/ANNUAL_REPORT_JUNE_2017_EXECUTIVE_SUMMARY.pdf)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

b. Extra-budgetary funds accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited.

Comments: 26 District hospitals as well as other extra-budgetary entities including Rwanda Social security Board and Utility companies were audited  
[http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Financial\\_Reports/ANNUAL\\_REPORT\\_JUNE\\_2017\\_EXECUTIVE\\_SUMMARY.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Financial_Reports/ANNUAL_REPORT_JUNE_2017_EXECUTIVE_SUMMARY.pdf)

Researcher Response

The answer is adjusted to "b"

IBP Comment

After further consultation with the researcher, answer choice B has been accepted. The Audit Report does show that EBFs were included in the audit.

100. Does the annual Audit Report(s) prepared by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) include an executive summary?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 100 asks whether the annual Audit Report includes an executive summary. Only the Audit Report identified in Section 1 should be used to answer this question. The Audit Report can be a fairly technical document, and an executive summary of the report's findings can help make it more accessible to the media and the public.*

*To answer "a," the Audit Report must include at least one executive summary summarizing the report's content. Answer "b" applies if the Audit Report does not include an executive summary, or the Audit Report is not made publicly available.*

Answer:

a. Yes, the annual Audit Report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report's content.

Source:

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Financial\\_Reports/ANNUAL\\_REPORT\\_JUNE\\_2017\\_EXECUTIVE\\_SUMMARY.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Financial_Reports/ANNUAL_REPORT_JUNE_2017_EXECUTIVE_SUMMARY.pdf)

Comment:

See pages 12-31.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

101. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 101 asks whether the executive reports to the public on the steps it has taken to address audit recommendations made by the Supreme Audit*

*Institution (SAI). The ultimate purpose of audits is to verify that the budget was executed in a manner consistent with existing law, and to hold the government accountable for this execution and its future improvement. The extent to which audits achieve the latter depends on whether there is adequate and timely follow-up on the recommendations provided in the SAI's audit reports.*

*To answer "a," the executive must report publicly on the steps it has taken to address all audit findings. A "b" response applies if the executive reports publicly on the steps it has taken to address most, but not all, audit findings. A "c" response applies if the executive reports publicly on the steps it has taken to address only some audit findings. As long as the executive reports publicly on the steps it has taken to address audit finding, answer "a," "b," or "c" may be selected, even if the Audit Report is not made publicly available. A "d" response applies if the executive does not report at all on its steps to address audit findings.*

Answer:

d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.

Source:

Comment:

Issues raised are discussed internally with concerned institutions through the PFM platform

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

102. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) or legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 102 asks whether the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) or the legislature track actions by the executive to address audit recommendations. After audit results and recommendations are discussed and validated by the legislature, the executive is normally asked to take certain actions to address the audit findings. For accountability purposes, the public needs to be informed about the status of those actions, and steps the executive has taken to address audit recommendations. In addition to the executive reporting on its actions (see Question 101), the SAI and legislature – as the key oversight institutions – have a responsibility to keep the public informed by tracking the executive's progress in addressing audit recommendations.*

*To answer "a," the SAI or legislature must report publicly on what steps the executive has taken to address all audit findings. A "b" response applies if the SAI or legislature reports publicly on what steps the executive has taken to address most, but not all, audit findings. A "c" response applies if the SAI or legislature reports publicly on what steps the executive has taken to address only some audit findings. As long as the SAI or legislature reports publicly on the steps the executive has taken, answer "a," "b," or "c" may be selected, even if the Audit Report is not made publicly available. A "d" response applies if neither the SAI nor the legislature reports on the executive's steps to address audit findings.*

Answer:

d. No, neither the SAI nor legislature reports on steps the executive has taken to address audit recommendations.

Source:

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Financial\\_Reports/ANNUAL\\_REPORT\\_JUNE\\_2017\\_EXECUTIVE\\_SUMMARY.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Financial_Reports/ANNUAL_REPORT_JUNE_2017_EXECUTIVE_SUMMARY.pdf)

See also The new times

<https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/public-applauds-pac-efforts-against-corruption>

<https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/pac-what-next-after-public-hearings>

Comment:

Actually the parliament does not make public the report on audit recommendations. However the hearing process is open to media and media report on key findings.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The Standing Committee on Economic Development and Finance has the task to analyse and formulate recommendations related to the programme and activity report of the Auditor General's Office. However, the result of their work is not communicated to the public.

[http://www.parliament.gov.rw/index.php?id=14&L=0&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bnews%5D=1326&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&cHash=48addbbd5999c1e1c55d0b8e1e7893b9](http://www.parliament.gov.rw/index.php?id=14&L=0&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=1326&tx_news_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx_news_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&cHash=48addbbd5999c1e1c55d0b8e1e7893b9)

[http://www.parliament.gov.rw/index.php?id=14&L=0&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bnews%5D=1326&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&cHash=48addbbd5999c1e1c55d0b8e1e7893b9](http://www.parliament.gov.rw/index.php?id=14&L=0&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=1326&tx_news_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx_news_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&cHash=48addbbd5999c1e1c55d0b8e1e7893b9)

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

103. Is there an Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) that conducts budget analyses for the budget formulation and/or approval process?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 103 examines whether an Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) exists that contributes budget analyses to the budget formulation and/or approval process. According to the Principles for Independent Fiscal Institutions, adopted by the OECD Council in 2014, "independent fiscal institutions are publicly funded, independent bodies under the statutory authority of the executive or the legislature which provide non-partisan oversight and analysis of, and in some cases advice on, fiscal policy and performance", and with "a forward-looking ex ante diagnostic task". In practice, they come in two main forms:

- Parliamentary budget offices (also known as PBOs) such as the Congressional Budget Office in the United States (<https://www.cbo.gov/>), the Parliamentary Budget Office in South Africa (<https://www.parliament.gov.za/parliamentary-budget-office>), and the Center for Public Finance Studies in Mexico (Centro de Estudios de las Finanzas Públicas, <http://www.cefp.gob.mx/>); or
- Fiscal councils such as the Office for Budget Responsibility in the United Kingdom (<https://obr.uk/>), the Fiscal Policy Council in Sweden (Finanspolitiska Rådet, <http://www.finanspolitiskaradet.com/>), and the High Council for Public Finances in France (Haut Conseil des finances publiques, <https://www.hcfp.fr/>).

For more information, see von Trapp et al. 'Principles for Independent Fiscal Institutions and Case Studies', OECD Journal on Budgeting 15:2 (special issue, 2016), <https://doi.org/10.1787/budget-15-5jm2795tv625>.

To answer "a," there must be an IFI, and its independence must be set in law. In addition, it must have sufficient staffing and resources, including funding, to carry out its tasks. Answer "b" applies if an IFI exists, but either its independence is not set in law or its staffing and resources are insufficient to carry out its tasks. Answer "c" applies if an IFI exists, but its independence is not set in law and it lacks sufficient staffing and resources. Answer "d" applies if no IFI exists.

If the answer is "a," "b," or "c," please specify in the comments the name and type of IFI that exists (e.g., parliamentary budget office or fiscal council). If the answer is "a" or "b," identify the law that guarantees its independence, and provide evidence in support of the assessment of the adequacy of its staffing and resources. This can include the IFI's total budget allocation over recent years, any press reports that discuss perceived funding shortfalls, assessments by international organizations, and/or information from interviews with staff of the IFI.

Answer:

d. No, there is no IFI.

Source:

Comment:

There is not IFI in Rwanda.

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

104. Does the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) publish macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 104 assesses whether an Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) has a role in producing the macroeconomic forecast (e.g., GDP growth, inflation, interest rates, etc.) and/or the fiscal forecast (revenues, expenditure, deficits, and debt), and if so, what kind of role it has. Macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasting is a typical core function across IFIs, but their role in forecasting takes several forms (von Trapp et al. 2016, p. 17 and Table 2). Some IFIs produce just a macroeconomic forecast, while others produce a complete fiscal forecast (which also typically requires an underlying macroeconomic forecast). In some cases, the fiscal forecast reflects continuation of current budget policies; such forecasts can be used by the legislature, the media, or the public to assess the projections in the executive's budget reflecting the government's policy proposals.

Some IFIs produce the official macroeconomic and fiscal forecasts used in the executive's budget. In other cases, IFIs do not prepare their own independent forecasts, but rather produce an assessment of the official estimates, or provide an opinion on, or endorsement of, the government's forecasts. Some others have no role at all in forecasting.

To answer "a", there must be an IFI that publishes both its own macroeconomic AND fiscal forecasts. Answer "b" applies if an IFI publishes its own macroeconomic OR fiscal forecast (but not both). Answer "c" applies if the IFI does not publish a macroeconomic or fiscal forecast, but rather publishes an assessment of the official forecasts produced by the executive and used in the budget. Choose option "d" if there is no IFI; or if there is an IFI that neither publishes its own macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts, nor a commentary on the official forecasts for the budget.

Macroeconomic forecasts may include indicators relating to economic output and economic growth, inflation, and the labor market, amongst others. Fiscal forecasts may include estimates of revenues, expenditures, the budget balance, and debt. If the answer is "a" or "b," please specify which indicators and estimates are included in the forecasts and whether the forecast is used by government as the official forecast. If the answer is "c," please describe the nature and depth of the assessment (e.g., the length of the commentary, or whether it covers both economic and fiscal issues).

Answer:

d. No, there is no IFI; or the IFI neither publishes its own macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts, nor a commentary on the official forecasts produced by the executive.

Source:

There is no IFI in Rwanda.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

105. Does the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) publish its own costings of new policy proposals, to assess their impact on the budget?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 105 assesses whether an Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) has a costing function that involves assessing the budgetary implications of new policy proposals for both revenues and expenditures, and if so, what kind of role it has. Many IFIs have a costing role, but with substantial diversity in the nature and extent of this work (von Trapp et al 2016, pp. 17-18 and Table 2). Some assess virtually all new policy proposals, while others cost only a selection of new policy proposals. Others only publish opinions on, or scrutinize the costings of, budget measures produced by the executive.

To answer "a," the IFI must publish its own costings of all (or virtually all) new policy proposals. Answer "b" applies if the IFI publishes its own costings, but only for major new policy proposals – for instance, only those proposals that cost or save above a certain amount. Answer "c" applies if the IFI publishes its own costings, but only on a limited number of proposals. This could occur, for instance, if the IFI lacked the capacity to assess proposals dealing with certain sectors. Instead of producing a cost estimate, it can also publish an assessment of the estimates produced by the executive. Answer "d" applies if there is no IFI; or if the IFI does not publish its own costings of new policy proposals or provide an assessment of the official costings of new policy proposals.

Answer:

d. No, there is no IFI; or the IFI does not publish its own costings of new policy proposals.

Source:

There is no IFI in Rwanda.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

106. In the past 12 months, how frequently did the head or a senior staff member of the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) take part and testify in hearings of a committee of the legislature?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 106 concerns the interaction between two important oversight actors and assesses how frequently the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) made high-level inputs to the work of legislative committees. Almost all IFIs interact with the legislature in some form (von Trapp et al 2016, p. 18), but the intensity of the interaction varies. This question assesses this aspect by asking, with reference to the past 12 months, how frequently the head or a senior staff member of the IFI took part and testified in hearings of a committee of the legislature. The intent is to assess the extent to which the IFI staff member in question was not only present at a meeting of a legislative committee, but was an active participant (as opposed to a passive observer, serving only as a resource when called upon). As evidence to support your answer, you can refer to official records of legislative committees, websites and annual reports of the IFI, press releases and media coverage, for example. Choose answer "a" if this occurred five times or more; "b" for three times or more, but less than five times; and "c" for once or twice. Answer "d" should be selected if the head or a senior staff member of the IFI never took part and testified in hearings of a committee of the legislature, or if there is no IFI.

Answer:

d. Never, or there is no IFI.

Source:

There is no IFI in Rwanda.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

107. Does the full legislature and/or a legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 107 asks whether the legislature debates budget policies prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal. In general, prior to discussing the Executive's Budget Proposal for the coming year, the legislature should have an opportunity to review the government's broad budget priorities and fiscal parameters. Often times this information is laid out in a Pre-Budget Statement, which the executive presents to the legislature for debate. (See Questions 54-58.)

A number of countries conduct a pre-budget debate in the legislature around six months before the start of the budget year. In some cases, they adopt laws that guide the upcoming budget, for example the Budget Guidelines Law in Brazil and the Spring Fiscal Policy Bill in Sweden. A pre-budget debate can serve two main purposes: 1) to allow the executive to inform the legislature of its fiscal policy intentions by presenting updated reports on its annual and medium-term budget strategy and policy priorities; and 2) to establish "hard" multi-year fiscal targets or spending ceilings, which the government must adhere to when preparing its detailed spending estimates for the upcoming budget year.

To answer "a," the full legislature must debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal and approve recommendations for the upcoming budget.

Answer "b" applies if a legislative committee (but not the full legislature) debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal, and approves recommendations for the budget. Option "b" also applies if, in addition to the action by the committee, the full legislature also debates budget policy in advance of the budget, but does not approve recommendations.

Answer "c" applies if the full legislature and/or a legislative committee debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal, but does not approve recommendations for the budget. Answer "d" applies if neither the full legislature nor any legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal.

In your comment, please indicate the dates of the budget debate, and if both the full legislature and a legislative committee held a debate. Note that a debate does not need to be open to the public, but a public record of the meeting or a public notice that the meeting occurred is required. In addition, please indicate whether the budget debate was focused on a Pre-Budget Statement published by the Executive. If the Executive did not publish a Pre-Budget Statement, then please indicate what served as the focus of the legislature's debate (for instance, a report released by an IFI or some other institution).

Answer:

d. No, neither the full legislature nor any legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal.

Source:

Comment:

Neither the full legislature nor any legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal.

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

108. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the Executive's Budget Proposal?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 108 examines how far in advance of the start of the budget year the legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal. International good practice recommends that the Executive's Budget Proposal should be submitted to the legislature far enough in advance to allow the legislature time to review it properly, or at least three months prior to the start of the fiscal year. (See, for instance, Principle 2.2.2 of the IMF's Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>)).*

*For the purposes of responding to this question, if – and only if – the most recent budget submission occurred later than usual as a result of a particular event, such as an election, please use a more normal year as the basis for the response. If, however, delays have been observed for more than one budget year, and the legislature has not received the Executive's Budget Proposal in a timely manner on more than one occasion in the last three years, then "d" will be the appropriate answer.*

*To answer "a," the legislature must receive the Executive's Budget Proposal at least three months in advance of the start of the budget year. Answer "b" applies if the legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal at least two months, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year. Answer "c" applies if the legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal at least one month, but less than two months, before the start of the budget year. Answer "d" applies if the legislature does not receive the Executive's Budget Proposal at least one month prior to the start of the budget year, or does not receive it at all.*

**Answer:**

b. The legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal at least two months, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year.

**Source:**

See article 32 of the Organic Law on State finances and property

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/\\_migrated/content\\_uploads/Law\\_on\\_State\\_Finances\\_and\\_Property.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/_migrated/content_uploads/Law_on_State_Finances_and_Property.pdf)

**Comment:**

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Comments: Article 32 states: "The Minister shall prepare and submit to both Chambers of the Parliament, by not later than 30th April of each year, the Budget Framework Paper." In 2018, the Executive Budget Proposal (Budget Framework Paper) was presented on April 30th. "Government to focus on National Strategy for Transformation Priorities in 2018-19", Minecofin website, published on 01/05/2018.  
Link:[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=12&tx\\_ttnews%5Btt\\_news%5D=667&cHash=6ebfab82258417234a0a0f6bd8f576d7](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=12&tx_ttnews%5Btt_news%5D=667&cHash=6ebfab82258417234a0a0f6bd8f576d7) The fiscal year starts on July 1st, so the Executive Budget Proposal is received at least two months in advanced.

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Comments: For 2018/19, the Executive's Budget Proposal as presented on 30th of April 2018 (Two months before the start of the FY. REFERENCE: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=119&tx\\_ttnews%5Btt\\_news%5D=667&cHash=6ebfab82258417234a0a0f6bd8f576d7](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=119&tx_ttnews%5Btt_news%5D=667&cHash=6ebfab82258417234a0a0f6bd8f576d7))

109. When does the legislature approve the Executive's Budget Proposal?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 109 examines when the legislature approves the Executive's Budget Proposal. International good practice recommends that the Executive's Budget Proposal should be approved by the legislature before the start of the fiscal year the budget proposal refers to. This gives the executive time to implement the budget in its entirety, particularly new programs and policies.*

*In some countries, the expenditure and revenue estimates of the Executive's Budget Proposal are approved separately; for purposes of this question, at least the expenditure estimates must be approved. Further, approval of the budget implies approval of the full-year budget, not just a short-term continuation of spending and revenue authority.*

*To answer "a," the legislature must approve the Executive's Budget Proposal at least one month before the start of the budget year. Answer "b" applies if the legislature approves the Executive's Budget Proposal less than one month in advance of the start of the budget year, but at least by the start of the budget*

year. Answer "c" applies if the legislature approves the Executive's Budget Proposal less than one month after the start of the budget year. Answer "d" applies if the legislature approves the Executive's Budget Proposal more than one month after the start of the budget year, or does not approve the budget.

Answer:

b. The legislature approves the budget less than one month in advance of the start of the budget year, but at least by the start of the budget year.

Source:

See article 35 of the Organic Law on State finances and property.

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/\\_migrated/content\\_uploads/Law\\_on\\_State\\_Finances\\_and\\_Property.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/_migrated/content_uploads/Law_on_State_Finances_and_Property.pdf)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: "MPs to approve 2018/19 budget today", The New Times, published on 27/06/2018. Link: <https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/mps-approve-201819-budget-today>

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The budget for 2018/19 was approved on 27th June. REFERENCE: <https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/mps-approve-201819-budget-today>

110. Does the legislature have the authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 110 examines the legislature's power to amend—as opposed to simply accept or reject—the budget proposal presented by the executive. This question is about legal authority rather than actions the legislature takes in practice. The legislature's powers to amend the budget can vary substantially across countries.*

*The "a" response is appropriate only if there are no restrictions on the right of the legislature to modify the Executive's Budget Proposal, including its right to change the size of the proposed deficit or surplus. The "b" response would be appropriate if, for instance, the legislature is restricted from changing the deficit or surplus, but it still has the power to increase or decrease funding and revenue levels. The more limited "c" response would apply if, for instance, the legislature can only re-allocate spending within the totals set in the Executive's Budget Proposal or can only decrease funding levels or increase revenues. Finally, response "d" would apply if the legislature may not make any changes (or only small technical changes), or if amendments must first be approved by the executive. In these cases, the legislature is essentially only able to approve or reject the budget as a whole. If the answer is "b" or "c", please indicate the nature of the amendment powers available to the Parliament and how they are limited.*

Answer:

b. Yes, the legislature has authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal, with some limitations.

Source:

See Article 11 of the Organic Law on State finances and property

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/\\_migrated/content\\_uploads/Law\\_on\\_State\\_Finances\\_and\\_Property.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/_migrated/content_uploads/Law_on_State_Finances_and_Property.pdf)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Article 11 "Powers to adopt the budget" states: "The Chamber of Deputies, pursuant to the provisions of Articles 90 and 91 of the Constitution of the Republic of Rwanda of 04 June 2003 as amended to date and the Council of the decentralized entity shall have powers to revise the respective proposed budgets without altering the fiscal balance."

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

111. During the most recent budget approval process, did the legislature use its authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 111 assesses whether any formal authority of the legislature to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal is used in practice. The responses to this question should be determined based on action by the legislature related to the Enacted Budget used in the OBS. Choose answer "a" if the legislature used its authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal during the most recent budget approval process, and amendments were adopted (all, or at least some of them). Answer "a" also applies if the legislature used its authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal, but the amendments were rejected by executive veto. Answer "b" applies if the legislature used its authority in law to propose amendments to the Executive's Budget Proposal, but none of these amendments were adopted. Answer "c" applies if the legislature has the authority in law to amend the budget, but no amendments were proposed during its consideration. Answer "d" applies when the legislature does not have any authority to amend the budget (that is, Question 110 is answered "d").

If the answer is "a" or "b", please specify in the comments the number of amendments introduced by the legislature (and in the case of an "a" response, the number adopted, or if applicable, information about an executive veto) and describe their nature. For example, did the amendments result in an increase or decrease of the deficit? What were the most significant amendments to revenues and to expenditures in terms of the sums involved? How did amendments affect the composition of expenditures? If the answer is "a," please specify which amendments were adopted, and provide evidence for it.

**Answer:**

a. Yes, the legislature used its authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal, and (at least some of) its amendments were adopted.

**Source:**

See this:

[http://parliament.gov.rw/index.php?](http://parliament.gov.rw/index.php?id=14&L=1&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=557&tx_news_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx_news_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&cHash=85f95dee4809672d70902fb2eac8efff)

[id=14&L=1&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bnews%5D=557&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&cHash=85f95dee4809672d70902fb2eac8efff](http://parliament.gov.rw/index.php?id=14&L=1&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=557&tx_news_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx_news_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&cHash=85f95dee4809672d70902fb2eac8efff)

("The 2017/18 draft finance law conforms to the 2017/18 – 2019/20 Budget Framework Paper presented to Parliament on April 28, 2017 and was amended to reflect the recommended actions by the Parliament as submitted on May 30, 2017")

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

Comments: During the most recent budget approval process, 2018/19, the parliamentary committee National Budget and Patrimony made recommendations for adjustments to the Budget Framework Paper. "2018/19 Budget: Lawmakers urge govt to bridge funding gap", The New Times, published on May 30, 2018. [http://parliament.gov.rw/index.php?id=14&L=1&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bnews%5D=557&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&cHash=85f95dee4809672d70902fb2e](http://parliament.gov.rw/index.php?id=14&L=1&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=557&tx_news_pi1%5Bcontroller%5D=News&tx_news_pi1%5Baction%5D=detail&cHash=85f95dee4809672d70902fb2e)

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

Comments: In addition to the evidence from parliament website provided by the researcher, the budget speech which was published in local language has a section on parliament recommendations that were reflected. REFERENCE: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist\\_pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget\\_Speeches&cHash=b0c12cb63de13229d0fce0722fcbcb888](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist_pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Budget_Speeches&cHash=b0c12cb63de13229d0fce0722fcbcb888)

112. During the last budget approval process, did a specialized budget or finance committee in the legislature examine the Executive's Budget Proposal?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 112 assesses the role of a specialized budget or finance committee during the budget approval stage. Effective committee involvement is an essential condition for legislative influence in the budget process. Specialized committees provide opportunities for individual legislators to gain relevant expertise, and to examine budgets and policy in depth. Yet, the involvement of committees differs across legislatures. Some legislatures have separate committees to examine spending and tax proposals, while others have a single finance committee. Not all legislatures have a specialized budget or finance committee to examine the budget. In addition, there can be differences in the time available for the committee's analysis of the budget.

A report with the committee's findings and recommendations is intended to inform the debate in the full legislature, therefore it must be published before the legislature has adopted the budget.

Response "a" requires that, in the last budget approval process, a specialized budget or finance committee had one month or more to examine the Executive's Budget Proposal, and it published a report with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted. Response "b" applies where such a committee examined the draft budget and published a report, but within a shorter timeframe of less than one month. Response "c" applies if a committee examined the budget (without regard to the time period), but did not publish a report prior to the adoption of the budget. Response "d" applies where a specialized budget or finance committee did not examine the Executive's Budget Proposal.

Please specify in your comment the name of the committee and the number of days it had available to examine the budget and to publish a report. For bicameral legislatures where one house or chamber has greater constitutional authority in budgetary matters, the question applies to the house or chamber (usually the upper or second one) that is decisive. For bicameral legislatures with co-equal houses or chambers, the question should be answered with reference to the one that achieves the higher score for this question. In the case of bicameral legislatures, please note the relevant arrangements in each house or chamber. If applicable, provide a copy of the report. Please note also if a report is published, but only after the budget has been adopted.

Answer:

c. Yes, a specialized budget or finance committee examined the Executive's Budget Proposal, but it did not publish a report with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.

Source:

See article 38 point7.

[http://parliament.gov.rw/fileadmin/Images2013/ROI\\_Chamber\\_\\_of\\_Deputies.pdf](http://parliament.gov.rw/fileadmin/Images2013/ROI_Chamber__of_Deputies.pdf)

Comment:

<https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/over-700-projects-be-implemented-parliament-approves-201819-budget>

The parliamentary Committee on National Budget and Patrimony reviewed the budget but did not published a report.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Within the Senate, the Standing Committee on Economic Development and Finance also reviewed the budget. "Senators: 2018/19 budget is inclusive", The New Times, published on June 22, 2018 <https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/senators-201819-budget-inclusive>

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

113. During the last approval process, did legislative committees, responsible for particular sectors (e.g., health, education, defense, etc.), examine spending in the Executive's Budget Proposal related to the sector for which they are responsible?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 113 assesses the role of committees of the legislature that are responsible for particular sectors (e.g., health, education, defense, etc.) during the budget approval stage. The role of sectoral committees differs across legislatures. Some legislatures do not involve them in the budget approval process, while others do. In addition, the time available for committee analysis differs.*

*A report with the committee's findings and recommendations is intended to inform the debate in the full legislature, so therefore must be published before the legislature has adopted the budget. Response "a" requires that sector committees had one month or more to examine the Executive's Budget Proposal, and published a report with findings and recommendations prior the budget being adopted. Response "b" applies where such committees examined the draft budget and published a report, but within a shorter timeframe of less than one month. Response "c" applies if sectoral committees examined the budget (without regard to the time period), but did not publish a report prior to the adoption of the budget. Response "d" applies where sectoral committees did not examine the Executive's Budget Proposal.*

*Please provide in the comments a brief overview of the committee structure and specify the number of days that sectoral committees had available to examine the budget and to publish their reports. For bicameral legislatures where one house or chamber has greater constitutional authority in budgetary matters, the question applies to the house or chamber (usually the upper or second one) that is decisive. For bicameral legislatures with co-equal houses or chambers, the question should be answered with reference to the one that achieves the higher score for this question. In the case of bicameral legislatures, please note the relevant arrangements in each house or chamber. If applicable, provide a sample copy of at least one of the reports. Please note if a report is published, but only after the budget has been adopted.*

*For purposes of responding to this question, use those sectoral committees that are best performing – that is, the ones that examine the budget the longest and that publish reports.*

Answer:

c. Yes, sector committees examined the Executive's Budget Proposal, but they did not publish reports with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.

Source:

See also article 38

[http://parliament.gov.rw/fileadmin/Images2013/ROI\\_Chamber\\_\\_of\\_Deputies.pdf](http://parliament.gov.rw/fileadmin/Images2013/ROI_Chamber__of_Deputies.pdf)

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: For example, as published in the New Times: "The Ministry of Disaster Management and Refugees (MIDIMAR) wants to have its budget increased by 17 per cent from about Rwf4.5billion in the current fiscal year to about Rwf5.3 billion next year. MIDIMAR officials appeared before the parliamentary Standing Committee on National Budget and Patrimony yesterday as part of on-going hearings on the Government's proposed budget for the next fiscal year 2018/2019." "Disaster ministry seeks 17% budget increase", The New Times, published on 18/05/2018. <https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/disaster-ministry-seeks-17-budget-increase>

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

114. In the past 12 months, did a committee of the legislature examine in-year implementation of the Enacted Budget during the relevant budget execution period?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 114 is about legislative oversight of budget execution. It assesses whether and how often a committee examined the implementation of the budget during the budget execution period (i.e., financial year) for which it was approved, and whether this resulted in an official report with findings and recommendations. This question does not apply to the ex post review of implementation following the end of the budget year as part of the audit stage, which is assessed separately. Nor does it apply to the legislature's review of the budget that it may undertake as part of the process of considering a supplemental budget during the year. In-year monitoring by the legislature will be affected by the frequency that the executive publishes In-Year Reports.*

*To answer "a," a committee must have examined in-year implementation of the Enacted Budget at least three times during the course of the relevant budget year and published reports with findings and recommendations. Answer "b" applies where this occurred only once or twice during the year.*

*Exception: If a legislature is in session only twice during the year, and it examines the implementation of the budget during both sessions, then it would be eligible for an "a" response.*

*Choose "c" if a committee examined in-year implementation (without regard to frequency), but did not publish any report with findings and recommendations. Answer "d" applies where no committee examined in-year implementation.*

*If the answer is "a" or "b," please specify the name of the committee and when it reviewed budget implementation, and provide a copy of its report(s). If the answer is "c," please specify the name of the committee and when it reviewed budget implementation.*

*For purposes of responding to this question, if more than one committee holds in-year reviews of the budget, use the committee that is best performing – that is, the one that examines in-year implementation the most times and that publishes a report.*

**Answer:**

c. Yes, a committee examined in-year implementation, but it did not publish any report with findings and recommendations.

**Source:**

**Comment:**

No committee reviewed in-year budget execution.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

c. Yes, a committee examined in-year implementation, but it did not publish any report with findings and recommendations.

Comments: The parliamentary committee on National Budget and Patrimony does review the in-year implementation of the Enacted Budget.

"Members of the Lower House have urged the Government to urgently address reasons behind slow implementation of the current national budget for the financial year 2017/18 after noticing that, overall, the budget execution in districts was at 40.5 per cent in the first six months." "Budget execution in districts at 40.5 per cent", The New Times, published on February 26, 2018 <https://www.newtimes.co.rw/section/read/229452>

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Researcher Response**

I agree with the peer reviewer. Response changed to "c"

115. Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units that receive explicit funding in the Enacted Budget, and is it legally required to do so?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 115 examines whether the executive seeks approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, and whether it is legally required to do so.*

*In some countries, the executive has the power in law to adjust funding levels for specific appropriations during the execution of the budget. This question examines rules around shifting funds between administrative units (ministries, departments, or agencies) or whatever funding unit (or "vote") is specified in the*

*Enacted Budget.*

*The conditions under which the executive may exercise its discretion to shift funds should be clearly defined in publicly available regulations or law. In addition, the amount of funds that the executive is allowed to transfer between administrative units should not be so excessive as to undermine the accountability of the executive to the legislature.*

*To answer "a," the executive is required by law or regulation to obtain prior legislative approval before shifting funds between administrative units, and it does so in practice. Answer "b" applies if the executive obtains legislative approval before shifting funds between administrative units, but is not legally required to do so. Answer "c" applies if the executive is legally required to receive legislative approval before shifting funds, but does not do so in practice. Answer "d" applies if legislative approval is not legally required for the executive to shift funds between administrative units and the executive does not obtain legislative approval in practice. Answer "d" also applies if the executive is authorized to shift an amount considered so excessive as to undermine accountability (roughly equal to 3 percent of total budgeted expenditures). A "d" response applies if the legislature only approves the shifting of funds after it has already occurred.*

*In the comments, please indicate any law or regulation that provides the executive with standing authority to shift funds between administrative units and, if so, describe that authority. Similarly, legislative approval for shifting funds between administrative units typically occurs with the adoption of legislation such as a supplemental budget. But if other formal procedures for gaining approval from the legislature exist, then please provide information about that approval process.*

Answer:

a. The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, and it does so in practice.

Source:

Minecofin web site

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/\\_migrated/content\\_uploads/Law\\_on\\_State\\_Finances\\_and\\_Property.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/_migrated/content_uploads/Law_on_State_Finances_and_Property.pdf)

Comment:

Article 46 of the organic law on State\_Finances\_and\_Property stipulate that:

It is prohibited to reallocate funds from employee costs to other expenditure categories without the approval of the Chamber of Deputies.

No reallocation of funds from one public entity to another is permitted without the approval of the Chamber of Deputies.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

116. Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenue (that is, amounts higher than originally anticipated) that may become available during the budget execution period, and is it legally required to do so?

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 116 examines whether the executive receives approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenue, and whether it is legally required to do so. Good practice requires the legislature to approve changes in revenue or expenditure relative to the Enacted Budget. For example, if additional revenue is collected unexpectedly during the year, which often happens in oil/mineral-dependent countries, and it was not accounted for in the Enacted Budget, there should be a procedure in place to ensure that the legislature approves any proposed use of these "new" funds. If such requirements are not in place, the executive might deliberately underestimate revenue in the budget proposal it submits to the legislature, in order to have additional resources to spend at the executive's discretion, with no legislative control.*

*To answer "a," the executive is required by law or regulation to obtain prior legislative approval before spending any funds resulting from higher-than-expected revenues, and it does so in practice. Answer "b" applies if the executive obtains legislative approval before spending excess revenue, but is not legally required to do so. Answer "c" applies if the executive is legally required to receive legislative approval before spending excess revenue, but does not do so in practice. Answer "d" applies if prior legislative approval is not legally required for the executive to spend excess revenue and the executive does not obtain legislative approval in practice. A "d" response applies if the legislature only approves the additional spending after it has already occurred.*

*Typically, legislative approval of additional spending beyond what was reflected in the Enacted Budget would occur with the adoption of a supplemental budget. But other formal procedures for getting approval from the legislature in advance of it adopting the supplemental budget may exist. If that is the case, then please provide information about that approval process.*

Answer:

a The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenues, and it does so in practice.

Source:  
Minecofin website

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/\\_migrated/content\\_uploads/Law\\_on\\_State\\_Finances\\_and\\_Property.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/_migrated/content_uploads/Law_on_State_Finances_and_Property.pdf)

Comment:  
Article 31 and 41

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Comments: Article 10 of the Law determining the State finances for the 2018/2019 fiscal year. "All revenues, including grants and loans and all expenditures shall be included in the budget of the concerned public entity. It is prohibited to incur extra-budgetary expenditures whatever their source." REFERENCE:[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Annual\\_State\\_Finance\\_Laws%2F2018-2019\\_Original\\_Finance\\_Law&cHash=0dbe79aac26043e02dd1b45fc3ba04c2](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=231&tx-filelist-pi1-174%5Bpath%5D=Annual_State_Finance_Laws%2F2018-2019_Original_Finance_Law&cHash=0dbe79aac26043e02dd1b45fc3ba04c2)

117. Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below the levels in the Enacted Budget in response to revenue shortfalls (that is, revenues lower than originally anticipated) or other reasons during the budget execution period, and is it legally required to do so?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 117 examines whether the executive receives approval from the legislature prior to cutting spending below the levels in the Enacted Budget in response to revenue shortfalls or for any other reason, and whether it is legally required to do so. Good practice requires the legislature to approve changes in revenue or expenditure relative to the Enacted Budget. For example, if less revenue is collected unexpectedly during the year, the legislature should approve or reject any proposed reductions in expenditures that are implemented as a result. If such requirements are not in place, the executive might substantially change the composition of the budget at the executive's discretion, with no legislative control.*

*Typically, legislative approval of proposals to reduce spending below the levels reflected in the Enacted Budget would occur as part of the supplemental budget. But other formal procedures for getting approval from the legislature in advance of it adopting the supplemental budget may exist. If that is the case, then please provide information about that approval process.*

*To answer "a," the executive is required by law or regulation to obtain prior legislative approval before implementing spending cuts in response to revenue shortfalls or for other reasons, and it does so in practice. Answer "b" applies if the executive received legislative approval before implementing such cuts, but is not legally required to do so. Answer "c" applies if the executive is legally required to obtain legislative approval before implementing such cuts, but does not do so in practice. Answer "d" applies if legislative approval is not legally required for the executive to implement such cuts and the executive does not obtain such approval in practice. A "d" response applies if the legislature only approves the spending cuts after they have already occurred.*

**Answer:**

a. The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below the enacted levels in response to revenue shortfalls or other reasons, and it does so in practice.

Source:  
Minecofin website See article 41 and article 44

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/\\_migrated/content\\_uploads/Law\\_on\\_State\\_Finances\\_and\\_Property.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/_migrated/content_uploads/Law_on_State_Finances_and_Property.pdf)

Comment:  
See article 41

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Comments: For example, as published in The New Times. "Government should revise the proposed budget for the next fiscal year 2018/19 to accommodate a funding gap of over Rwf420 billion for urgent activities that need funding, especially development projects that need to be given priority. The recommendation was made by members of Lower House Tuesday after members of the standing committee on national budget and patrimony presented their analysis of the Budget Framework Paper (BFP) and the midterm budget estimates for the next three financial years (2018/19-2020/21)." "2018/19 Budget: Lawmakers urge govt to bridge funding gap", The New Times, published on May 30, 2018 <https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/201819-budget-lawmakers-urge-govt-bridge-funding-gap>

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

118. Did a committee of the legislature examine the Audit Report on the annual budget produced by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI)?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 118 is about ex post oversight following the implementation of the budget. It probes whether a committee examined the Audit Report on the annual budget produced by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI), and whether this resulted in an official report with findings and recommendations. A key issue is how soon after the SAI releases the report does it legislature review it. This question does not apply to the legislative scrutiny of in-year implementation of the Enacted Budget during the relevant budget execution period, which is assessed separately. Also, the question is asking specifically about the SAI's annual report on the execution of the budget, not about other audit reports that the SAI may produce. (This is the Audit Report used for responding to Question 98.)*

*To answer "a," a legislative committee must have examined the annual Audit Report within three months of it being released by the SAI, and then published a report (or reports) with findings and recommendations. (Note that the three-month period should only take into account time when the legislature is in session.)*

*Answer "b" applies when the committee examines it within six months of it being released (but more than three months), and then published a report with its findings and recommendations. Choose "c" if a committee examined the annual Audit Report more than six months after it became available or it did not publish any report with findings and recommendations. Answer "d" applies where no committee examined the annual Audit Report.*

*If the answer is "a" or "b," please specify the name of the committee and when it reviewed the Audit Report, and provide a copy of its report(s). If the answer is "c," please specify the name of the committee and when it reviewed budget implementation. Answers "a," "b," or "c" may be selected if the Audit Report is produced by the SAI but not made publicly available.*

**Answer:**

c. Yes, a committee examined the Audit Report on the annual budget, but it did so after the report had been available for more than six months or it did not publish any report with findings and recommendations.

**Source:**

Office of Auditor General:

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/index.php?id=14&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bnews%5D=16&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bday%5D=3&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bmonth%5D=5&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Byear%5D=2018&cHash=63a5fe647a0ec57d7fcef8dba325dfa9](http://www.oag.gov.rw/index.php?id=14&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=16&tx_news_pi1%5Bday%5D=3&tx_news_pi1%5Bmonth%5D=5&tx_news_pi1%5Byear%5D=2018&cHash=63a5fe647a0ec57d7fcef8dba325dfa9)

**Comment:**

No report was published by the legislature.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The parliamentary committee on Public Accounts (PAC) does review the Audit Report, as stated in Article 38 "Standing Committees and their functions", of the "Organic Law N°06/2006 of 15/02/2006 Establishing Internal Rules of Procedure of the Chamber of Deputies in the Parliament" "The Committee on Public Accounts shall be responsible for issues relating to: a) analysis of the report of the Auditor General of State Finances with respect to the use of national budget and patrimony and preparation of draft recommendations within six (6) months of the date of submission of such reports to the Plenary Assembly" Link: [http://parliament.gov.rw/fileadmin/Images2013/ROI\\_Chamber\\_of\\_Deputies.pdf](http://parliament.gov.rw/fileadmin/Images2013/ROI_Chamber_of_Deputies.pdf) PAC presented a report with their findings to the legislature, but it was not made publicly available. As published in The New Times: "Just last week, while presenting their report on the analysis of the Auditor General (AG)'s report for the fiscal year 2016/17, the committee called on the Prime Minister to dismiss leaders of public institutions who failed to comply with public financial management rules and caused the government to lose billions of Rwandan francs." "PAC: What next after the public hearings?", The New Times, published on 25/07/2018 <https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/pac-what-next-after-public-hearings>

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

119. Was the process of appointing (or re-appointing) the current head of the SAI carried out in a way that ensures his or her independence?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 119 concerns the appointment process of the current head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI). Appointment procedures vary greatly across countries, as well as across different types of SAIs. Moreover, conventions and informal practices can greatly affect the de facto independence of the head of the SAI. While these factors make it difficult to devise a single metric against which all SAIs can be assessed with regard to this particular aspect, this question focuses on whether the legislature or judiciary must appoint or approve the appointment of the head of the SAI as a way to ensure the SAI's independence from the executive. However, if the appointment is carried out in another way that nonetheless ensures the independence of the SAI head, then that approach could be also considered.*

*To answer "a," the legislature or judiciary must appoint (or re-appoint) the head of the SAI, or approve the recommendation of the executive, as a way that*

ensure his or her independence from the executive. (As noted above, alternative approaches may also be acceptable.) Choose "b" if the appointment process does not ensure the independence of the head of the SAI, e.g. the executive may appoint the head of the SAI without the final consent of the legislature or judiciary.

Irrespective of which answer you selected, provide a description of how the head of the SAI is appointed.

Answer:

a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be appointed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before the appointment takes effect.

Source:

See constitution of the Republic of Rwanda article 86

[http://www.parliament.gov.rw/fileadmin/Bills\\_CD/THE\\_CONSTITUTION\\_OF\\_THE\\_REPUBLIC\\_OF\\_RWANDA\\_OF\\_2003\\_REVISIED\\_IN\\_2015.pdf](http://www.parliament.gov.rw/fileadmin/Bills_CD/THE_CONSTITUTION_OF_THE_REPUBLIC_OF_RWANDA_OF_2003_REVISIED_IN_2015.pdf)

OAG website

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Documents/OAG\\_LAW.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Documents/OAG_LAW.pdf)

Comment:

Article 86 gives the Senate the power to approve the appointment of the Auditor General, while that the OAG Law is silent on this.

See article 13 of the OAG Law

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: There has been a new law approved in 2017, Law No59/2016 OF 11/01/2017 modifying and complementing Law N°79/2013 of 11/09/2013 Determining the Mission, Organization and Functioning of the Office of the Auditor General of State Finances. It states that "The Auditor General and Deputy Auditor General are appointed by a Presidential Order. After their appointment, the Auditor General and Deputy Auditor General take the oath of office before the President of the Republic." Link: [http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Law\\_No\\_59-2016\\_of\\_11-01-2017\\_modifying\\_and\\_complementing\\_Law\\_n\\_\\_79-2013\\_of\\_11\\_09\\_2013.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Law_No_59-2016_of_11-01-2017_modifying_and_complementing_Law_n__79-2013_of_11_09_2013.pdf) The Senate approves the presidential appointment according to Article 86 of the Constitution. "Cabinet appoints new Auditor General", The New Times, published on 03/06/2011

<https://www.newtimes.co.rw/section/read/31767> "Senate approves new appointments", The New Times, published on 21/06/2011

<https://www.newtimes.co.rw/section/read/32330>

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

120. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 120 covers the manner in which the head or senior members of the SAI may be removed from office. This question draws on best practices identified in the Lima Declaration of Guidelines on Auditing Precepts (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/LimaDeclaration.pdf>), including measures intended to guarantee the office's independence from the executive.

To answer "a," the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before the head of the SAI is removed. For example, the legislature or judiciary may give final consent following a certain external process, such as a criminal proceeding. So while the executive may initiate a criminal proceeding, the final consent of a member of the judiciary – or a judge – is necessary to render a verdict of wrongdoing that may lead to the removal from office of the head of the SAI. Answer "b" applies if the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.

Answer:

a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before he or she is removed.

Source:

OAG website

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Documents/OAG\\_LAW.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Documents/OAG_LAW.pdf)

Comment:

See article 16 of the Law determining the mission, organization and functioning of the Office of the Auditor General of State finances (Law no 79/2013) The article determines the circumstances in which the Auditor General can be removed from the office and the role of the parliament is

crucial under conditions specified in item 2 of paragraph one.

Article 17 however describes the process to follow for resignation

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

121. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI)?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 121 asks who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI). To ensure objective audits of government budgets, another important component of the SAI's independence from the executive is the extent to which the SAI's budget is determined by a body other than the executive, and whether the SAI has adequate resources to fulfill its mandate.*

*Answer "a" applies if the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate, AND either the SAI determines its own budget and then submits it to the executive (which accepts it with little or no change) or directly to the legislature, or the budget of the SAI is determined directly by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body). Answer "b" applies if the SAI's budget is determined by the executive (absent a recommendation from the SAI), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. Answer "c" applies if the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body) determines the SAI's budget, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. Answer "d" applies if the executive determines the SAI's budget, and the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. Please provide evidence in support of the assessment that the funding level is or is not broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.*

**Answer:**

b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.

**Source:**

See article 34 of the Law on State finance and property

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/\\_migrated/content\\_uploads/Law\\_on\\_State\\_Finances\\_and\\_Property.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/_migrated/content_uploads/Law_on_State_Finances_and_Property.pdf)

**Comment:**

Follows the same process as other government institutions

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

122. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have the discretion in law to undertake those audits it may wish to?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 122 explores the scope of the investigative powers of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) as prescribed in law.*

*Question 97 asks which of the three types of audits – financial, compliance, and performance – the SAI conducts. This question asks if the SAI is constrained by law (rather than by a lack of capacity or an inadequate budget) from undertaking any form of audit or investigating irregularities in any program or activity.*

*There are numerous examples of limitations. For instance, some SAIs are not permitted by their legal mandate to audit joint ventures or other public-private arrangements. Others are only allowed to undertake financial audits, precluded from conducting performance or value-for-money audits. The SAIs in some countries do not have the legal mandate to review arrangements involving oil or stabilization funds, or other types of special or extra-budgetary funds. The SAI may also not have the ability to audit commercial projects involving the public and private sector.*

*To answer "a," the SAI must have full discretion in law to decide which audits to undertake. Answer "b" applies if some limitations exist, but the SAI enjoys*

significant discretion to undertake those audits it wishes to. Answer "c" applies if the SAI has some discretion, but significant legal limitations exist. Answer "d" applies if the SAI has no power at all to choose which audits to undertake

Consulting the Lima Declaration of Guidelines on Auditing Precepts (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/LimaDeclaration.pdf>) may be useful in answering this question as its provisions serve to define the appropriate scope of a SAI's legal mandate and jurisdiction.

Answer:

a. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.

Source:

OAG website

See articles under Section 2 of the law

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Documents/OAG\\_LAW.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Documents/OAG_LAW.pdf)

See also article 66 and 67 of the law on state finance and property.

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/\\_migrated/content\\_uploads/Law\\_on\\_State\\_Finances\\_and\\_Property.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/_migrated/content_uploads/Law_on_State_Finances_and_Property.pdf)

Comment:

See article 24 of the law

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: In the Law determining the mission, organisation and functioning of the Office of the Auditor General of State Finances, Section two describes the Power of the Office, particularly article 7 titled "Power of free access to information", and article 11, titled "Immunity". In article 24, the law specifically describes that "The Auditor General may, if deemed necessary or at the request of Parliament, conduct any type of audit other than those provided for in this Article". Link: [http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Documents/OAG\\_LAW.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Documents/OAG_LAW.pdf)

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

123. Are the audit processes of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) reviewed by an independent agency?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 123 assesses whether and to what extent the audit processes of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) are subject to review by an independent agency. The latter could be a peer SAI, an international organization, an academic institution with relevant expertise, or an independent domestic agency with quality assurance functions in the area of financial reporting.*

*To answer "a," an independent agency must conduct and publish a review of the audit processes of the SAI on an annual basis. Answer "b" applies if a review was carried out within the past five years, and published, but it is not conducted annually, but. Choose answer "c" if the SAI has an internal unit that reviews the audit processes of the SAI on a regular basis, but an independent agency does not conduct such a review. Answer "d" applies if the audit processes of the SAI are reviewed neither by an independent agency nor by a unit within the SAI.*

*If the answer is either "a" or "b," please specify the name of the independent agency and when last it conducted such a review, and provide a copy of the published report. If the answer is "c," please specify the name of the unit within the SAI that is tasked with conducting such reviews.*

Answer:

c. No, but a unit within the SAI conducts a review of the audit processes of the SAI on a regular basis.

Source:

OAG website

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Documents/OAG\\_LAW.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Documents/OAG_LAW.pdf)

Article 27 notes that INTOSAI conducts a report every two years and submits it to parliament. However this report is not published.

Comment:

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Documents/stru.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Documents/stru.pdf)

There is a Quality Assurance division, under the supervision of Assistant Auditor General for Quality Assurance and Audit Development.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: In section 3.1.2 "External reviews (Peer reviews)" in the document "Quality Assurance Review Policy" published by the OAG it is described: "External Reviews are undertaken by AFROSAI-E, a peer SAI or a private auditing firm who are independent of the OAG and who do not have any real or apparent conflict of interest. The external reviewer may rely on the work of the internal quality assurance review if it is assessed to be functioning properly." Link: [http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/\\_migrated/content\\_uploads/QAR\\_Policy.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/_migrated/content_uploads/QAR_Policy.pdf)

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

124. In the past 12 months, how frequently did the head or a senior staff member of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) take part and testify in hearings of a committee of the legislature?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 124 concerns the interaction between two important oversight actors and assesses how frequently the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) made high-level inputs to the work of legislative committees. Many SAIs interact with the legislature in some form, but the nature and intensity of the interaction varies. This question probes this aspect by asking, with reference to the past 12 months, how frequently the head or a senior staff member of the SAI took part and testified in hearings of a committee of the legislature. The intent is to assess the extent to which the SAI representative in question was not only present at a meeting of a legislative committee, but was an active participant (as opposed to a passive observer, serving only as a resource when called upon). You can refer to official records of legislative committees, websites and annual reports of the SAI, press releases and media coverage, for example. Choose answer "a" if this occurred five times or more; "b" for three times or more, but less than five times; "c" for once or twice, and "d" for never.*

**Answer:**

c. Rarely (i.e., once or twice).

**Source:**

<https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/public-applauds-pac-efforts-against-corruption>

<https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/kigali-city-tasked-urgently-get-lasting-solution-nduba-landfill>

<http://igihe.com/amakuru/u-rwanda/article/pac-yahishuye-uburyo-abatekinisiye-baburiye-mininfra-ikinangira-ikubaka>

<https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/mps-call-efficiency-university-rwanda>

<https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/mps-demand-accountability-gishoma-project>

**Comment:**

This occurs when the report is released and when the legislature commission is hearing the audited institution, a representative of the OAG is present

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

IBP Comment  
For cross-country comparison, this score has been revised from "a" to "c".

125. Does the executive use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during the formulation of the annual budget (prior to the budget being tabled in parliament)?

**GUIDELINES:**

*This question reflects the GIFT principles on "Inclusiveness" and "Timeliness" and assesses the extent to which the participation mechanism(s) used by the executive are truly interactive and involve a two-way conversation between citizens and the executive.*

*The drafting of this question and its answers are partially drawn from the IAP2 Spectrum of Public Participation, in particular with regards to the concepts of "involvement" (option "a" in the responses) and "consultation" (option "b"). See:*

[https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/foundations\\_course/IAP2\\_P2\\_Spectrum\\_FINAL.pdf](https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/foundations_course/IAP2_P2_Spectrum_FINAL.pdf).

*Please consider only participation mechanisms that the Ministry of Finance, lead budget agency, or central coordinating agency designated by the government to implement participation mechanisms ("the executive") is currently using to allow the public to participate in the formulation of the annual budget, including annual pre-budget discussions. Participation mechanisms used only by line ministries should not be used to answer this question. If there is more than one mechanism used by the executive, please select the deepest or most interactive mechanism that reflects the government's efforts to incorporate citizens' input into the formulation of the annual budget. The participation mechanisms can involve a range of different issues, such as spending and tax policy, funding and revenue levels, and macro-fiscal planning.*

To answer "a," the executive must use open participation mechanisms that involve the public in the formulation of the annual budget. This means that a public process is in place whereby CSOs and/or individual members of the public and government officials interact, and have the opportunity to express their opinions to each other in what can be considered a public dialogue between them (i.e., in-person and online discussion forums). Additionally, the mechanism should be open to any CSO and/or individual members of the public who wish to participate. By selecting this answer, the researcher must present evidence to support the presence of a public dialogue among citizens and government officials. Examples include public meetings and online deliberative exchanges.

Answer "b" applies if an open consultation mechanism is in place whereby members of the public (i.e., individuals and/or CSOs as well as academics, independent experts, policy think tanks, and business organizations) can provide their input in the formulation of the annual budget. This answer applies if the government is using a mechanism that is structured and well established, and not ad-hoc. The researcher must present evidence to support the presence of consultative processes through which the executive seeks out inputs from citizens. Examples include surveys, focus groups, report cards, published policy consultation exercises, and online platforms that government officials actively manage to solicit inputs.

Answer "c" applies if the executive has established a mechanism or mechanisms to allow citizens to participate in the budget formulation phase, but:

1) The mechanisms are not structured and happen only on ad-hoc basis, or not regularly.

and/or

2) The executive consults with and/or interacts with, citizens, but there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, and the executive determines fully or partially such selection process by inviting specific groups (for example by making an open call but just to experts from a particular sector, or naming specific organizations). While it is not possible for all citizens and/or CSOs to participate in this or other phases of the budget process, options "a" and "b" apply if the government does not exercise any discretion in determining who is allowed to participate. While there is likely going to be self-selection, it is important that the selection is not made by the executive.

In cases where there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, to select answer choice "c", there should be some sort of public record (held in public, minutes of meetings released to public) so that the all CSOs and individual members of the public can have knowledge of the meeting, who participated, and what was discussed.

Examples of mechanisms that might qualify as a "c" response include hotlines, Facebook announcements, and one-off meetings with NGOs in which there is a public record.

The researcher must present evidence to support selection of a "c" response.

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget formulation stage.

Answer:

c. Yes, the executive uses participation mechanisms during the budget formulation phase, but either these mechanisms capture only some ad-hoc views, or the executive invites specific individuals or groups for budget discussions (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).

Source:

MINALOC

[https://www.minaloc.gov.rw/fileadmin/documents/FL\\_JSJR\\_REPORT\\_FY\\_2018-2019.pdf](https://www.minaloc.gov.rw/fileadmin/documents/FL_JSJR_REPORT_FY_2018-2019.pdf)

Minecofin

<https://twitter.com/RwamaganaDistr/status/928323702248366082>

Comment:

Both the Joint Sector Review and Sector working groups are only for invited groups.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Joint Sector Reviews (JSR) take place as the first step on citizen participation during the budget planning process (Oct-Nov). However, reports are not consistently shared with the public. Pre-budget hearings, organised by the NGO CLADHO, take place, but it is not clear how their inputs are included by the executive in the budget process. "National child focused pre-budget hearing session @SCIRwanda @PlanRwanda @SwedeninRW @NCCRwanda @MIGEPROF @Rwanda\_Justice @RwandaFinance", Twitter, CLADHO, published on 06/04/2018 [#BudgetChildFocused](https://twitter.com/cladho_rw/status/982168164438962182) We are giving our suggestions on what we need but there is no responses!!! Said: "Zamida" the Children representative in @Nyarugenge @SCIRwanda @SwedeninRW @PlanRwanda @MIGEPROF @GenderMonitorRw @Rwanda\_Justice", Twitter, CLADHO, published on 06/04/2018 [https://twitter.com/cladho\\_rw/status/982191733868920838](https://twitter.com/cladho_rw/status/982191733868920838)

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

b. Yes, the executive uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public provide their inputs on the budget.

Comments: The ministry of Finance and Economic Planning has signed an MoU with CLADHO (a civil society organization) to cooperate in Budget process including support in citizens participation.

<https://www.cladho.org.rw/fileadmin/templates/document/Amendment%20to%20the%20MoU%20with%20MINEC.PDF> CLADHO organizes open pre budget hearings and share a report with MINECOFIN <https://www.cladho.org.rw/fileadmin/templates/document/PPIMA-2018%20Pre-budget%20hearings%20report.pdf>

IBP Comment

Many thanks to the reviewers for their comments. IBP agrees with response C based on the Joint Sector Reviews process that are embedded in the planning and budgetary cycle in Rwanda. IBP understands that the lead Finance Ministry guides ministries on the JSR process. As part of the process, ministries bring together different stakeholders to engage in dialogue, review past performance and implementation as well as goals and targets for next year's budget. However, IBP is unable to verify which ministerial JSRs included inputs from civil society. As participation is dependent on invitation by ministries, we believe answer choice C best represents the practice in Rwanda. IBP acknowledges the MoU that MINECOFIN signed with CLADHO as a positive, commendable step. However, as per guidelines, we are to "select the deepest or most interactive mechanism that reflects the government's efforts to incorporate citizens' input". If MINECOFIN continues the practice of Pre-budget hearings, this will have the potential of scoring higher on OBS, as the hearings are more participatory in nature.

126. With regard to the mechanism identified in question 125, does the executive take concrete steps to include vulnerable and under-represented parts of the population in the formulation of the annual budget?

**GUIDELINES:**

*This question reflects the GIFT principle of "Inclusiveness", and examines the executive's effort to actively reach out to citizens who are from socially vulnerable groups and/or underrepresented in national processes. The emphasis here is on the executive's efforts to seek out the views of members of the public from socially vulnerable groups and/or who are underrepresented in the process.*

*To answer "a," the executive must actively seek out individuals from vulnerable and underrepresented communities and/or civil society organizations representing vulnerable and underrepresented individuals and communities. The researcher must provide evidence to show the government's efforts and actions. The researcher must speak with the relevant government official(s), and subsequently double check with an alternative source, such as representatives of vulnerable/underrepresented groups.*

*Answer "b" applies if the executive does not take concrete steps to incorporate vulnerable/underrepresented individuals, or organizations representing them, into participation mechanisms or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget formulation stage.*

Answer:

b. The requirements for an "a" response are not met.

Source:

Minaloc

[https://www.minaloc.gov.rw/fileadmin/documents/FL\\_JS\\_R\\_REPORT\\_FY\\_2018-2019.pdf](https://www.minaloc.gov.rw/fileadmin/documents/FL_JS_R_REPORT_FY_2018-2019.pdf)

Comment:

No evidence of concrete steps to involved underrepresented groups.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: In the first planning and budgeting call circular, it is mentioned in section B, point a, that to improve citizen's participation "The participatory planning approach shall also consult specific organs available at District level. These include the local representatives of the National Women Council, People with Disabilities, National Youth Council, Private Sector Development, and JADF". Source: [http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Call\\_Circulars/LG\\_The\\_First\\_Planning\\_and\\_Budgeting\\_Call\\_Circular\\_for\\_the\\_2017-18\\_FY-.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Call_Circulars/LG_The_First_Planning_and_Budgeting_Call_Circular_for_the_2017-18_FY-.pdf) However, there is little evidence this is happening in practice. As mentioned in The New Times : "Representative structures of women's voices like the national women council need urgent strengthening in terms of capacity, guidelines and resources and to ensure views from these structures are channeled in District level and national planning and budgeting. ... They are calling for increased commitment and accountability through central and local government level plans and budgets to implement structural and transformative measures to prevent and respond to gender inequalities." Source: "FEATURED: Women call for increased prioritization of GBV interventions in national planning and budgeting", The New Times, published on 06/12/2018 Link: <https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/featured-women-call-increased-prioritization-gbv-interventions-national-planning-and-budgeting>

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

127. During the budget formulation stage, which of the following key topics does the executive's engagement with citizens cover?

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:

1. Macroeconomic issues
2. Revenue forecasts, policies, and administration
3. Social spending policies
4. Deficit and debt levels

- 5. Public investment projects
- 6. Public services

**GUIDELINES:**

*This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Timeliness". Please consider all of the mechanisms currently used by the executive to promote public participation during the formulation of the annual budget.*

*Please note that while the public engagement can/may cover other topics -- and for this reason the other questions assessing the executive's engagement with the public during budget formulation can be answered on the basis of engagement on topics other than the six listed above -- for the purpose of answering this question, "key topics" are considered to be only the ones listed above. If the executive's engagement with the public covers topics other than the six listed above, please specify these topics in the comments.*

*Note also that this question assesses only the coverage of public engagement (i.e., "what issues is the public invited to engage on?") and issues related to the depth of engagement or selectivity of engaged are not dealt with by this question.*

*Answer "d" applies if requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget formulation stage.*

**Answer:**

b. The executive's engagement with citizens covers at least three (but less than six) of the above-mentioned topics.

**Source:**

[https://www.minaloc.gov.rw/fileadmin/documents/FL\\_JSR\\_REPORT\\_FY\\_2018-2019.pdf](https://www.minaloc.gov.rw/fileadmin/documents/FL_JSR_REPORT_FY_2018-2019.pdf)

**Comment:**

This is an example

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The objectives of the Joint Sector Review are, among others, to "present and discuss areas prioritised during the planning and budgeting process", section 1.1. in page 3. Out of the 6 key topics, it is discussed revenue forecast, policies and administration, social spending policies, public investments projects and public services. Joint Sector Reviews were published in a centralised manner in the MINECOFIN website for 2015/16 and 2016/17, but not for 2017/18. <http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/index.php?id=258&L=380>

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. The executive's engagement with citizens covers all six topics.

Comments: The analysis of the Executive budget proposal for 2018/19 by CLADHO (a Civil Society organization active in Budget analysis) which was presented to both the executive and the legislature, covers all the topics listed. REFERENCE:

[https://www.cladho.org.rw/fileadmin/templates/document/PPIMA-BFP%20Analysis\\_2018-2019%20-%202021.pdf](https://www.cladho.org.rw/fileadmin/templates/document/PPIMA-BFP%20Analysis_2018-2019%20-%202021.pdf)

**IBP Comment**

This indicator is scored based on the mechanism assessed in Q.125- the Joint Sector reviews.

128. Does the executive use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input in monitoring the implementation of the annual budget?

**GUIDELINES:**

*This question reflects the GIFT principles on "Inclusiveness" and "Timeliness" and assesses the extent to which the participation mechanism(s) used by the executive are truly interactive and involve a two-way conversation between citizens and the executive.*

*The drafting of this question and its answers are partially drawn from the IAP2 Spectrum of Public Participation, in particular with regards to the concepts of "involvement" (option "a" in the responses) and "consultation" (option "b"). See:*

[https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/foundations\\_course/IAP2\\_P2\\_Spectrum\\_FINAL.pdf](https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/foundations_course/IAP2_P2_Spectrum_FINAL.pdf)

*Please consider only participation mechanisms that the Ministry of Finance, lead budget agency, or central coordinating agency designated by the government to implement participation mechanisms ("the executive") is currently using to allow the public to participate in monitoring the implementation of the annual budget. If the executive has designated a central coordinating agency to implement participation mechanisms throughout the national budget process, researchers may consider these mechanisms. Participation mechanisms used only by line ministries should not be used to answer this question. If there is more than one mechanism used by the executive, please select the deepest or most interactive mechanism that reflects the government's efforts to incorporate citizens' input into the implementation of the annual budget. The participation mechanisms can involve a range of different issues, such as revenue administration, public service delivery, public investment project implementation, including procurement, and the administration of social transfer schemes.*

*To answer "a," the executive must use open participation mechanisms that involve the public in the implementation of the annual budget. This means that a public process is in place whereby CSOs and/or individual members of the public and government officials interact, and have the opportunity to express their*

opinions to each other in what can be considered a public dialogue between them (i.e., in-person and online discussion forums). Additionally, the mechanism should be open to any CSO and/or individual members of the public who wish to participate. By selecting this answer, the researcher must present evidence to support the presence of a public dialogue among citizens and government official. Examples include public meetings, online, deliberative exchanges, procurement complaint mechanisms, and social monitoring and dialogue.

Answer "b" applies if an open consultation mechanism is in place whereby members of the public (i.e., individuals and/or CSOs as well as academics, independent experts, policy think tanks, and business organizations) can provide their input on the implementation of the annual budget. This answer applies if the government is using a mechanism that is structured and well established, and not ad-hoc. The researcher must present evidence to support the presence of consultative processes through which the executive seeks out inputs from citizens. Examples include public hearings, surveys, focus groups, report cards, and online platforms that government officials actively manage to solicit inputs.

Answer "c" applies if the executive has established a mechanism or mechanisms to allow citizens to provide input on budget implementation, but:

1) The mechanisms are not structured, happen only on ad-hoc basis, or not regularly.

and/or

2) The executive consults with and/or interacts with, citizens, but there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, and the executive determines fully or partially such selection process by inviting specific groups (for example by making an open call but just to experts from a particular sector, or naming specific organizations). While it is not possible for all citizens and/or CSOs to participate in this or other phases of the budget process, options "a" and "b" apply if the government does not exercise any discretion in determining who is allowed to participate. While there is likely going to be self-selection, it is important that the selection is not made by the executive.

In cases where there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, to select answer choice "c", the researcher must have evidence that the government is holding participation mechanisms that have some sort of public record (held in public, minutes of meetings released to public) so that all CSOs and members of the public can have knowledge of the meeting, who participated, and what was discussed.

Examples include hotlines, Facebook announcements, one-off meetings with NGOs in which there is a public record.

The researcher must present evidence to support selection of a "c" response.

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget implementation stage.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

[http://www.mininfra.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/infos/WATSAN\\_2016-2017\\_Backward-Looking\\_joint\\_sector\\_Review\\_Report.pdf](http://www.mininfra.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/infos/WATSAN_2016-2017_Backward-Looking_joint_sector_Review_Report.pdf)

[http://www.mininfra.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Energy\\_Backward\\_Looking\\_JSR\\_Report\\_November\\_2016.pdf](http://www.mininfra.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Energy_Backward_Looking_JSR_Report_November_2016.pdf)

Comment:

While Backward-Looking Joint Sector Reviews were conducted, no evidence can be found that this occurred during the 2018/19 budget year.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

129. With regard to the mechanism identified in question 128, does the executive take concrete steps to receive input from vulnerable and underrepresented parts of the population on the implementation of the annual budget?

**GUIDELINES:**

This question reflects the GIFT principle of "Inclusiveness", and examines the executive's effort to actively reach out to citizens who are from socially vulnerable groups and/or underrepresented in national processes. The emphasis here is on national government's efforts to obtain input from members of the public who are from socially vulnerable groups and/or underrepresented in national processes during the implementation of the annual budget.

To answer "a," the executive must actively seek out individuals from vulnerable and underrepresented community and/or civil society organizations representing vulnerable and underrepresented individuals and communities. The researcher must provide evidence to show the government's efforts and actions. The researcher must speak with the relevant government official(s), and subsequently double check with an alternative source, such as representatives from vulnerable/underrepresented groups.

Answer "b" applies if the national executive does not take concrete steps to incorporate vulnerable/underrepresented individuals, or organizations representing them, into participation mechanisms or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget implementation stage.

Answer:

b. The requirements for an "a" response are not met.

Source:

[http://www.mininfra.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/infos/WATSAN\\_\\_2016-2017\\_Backward-Looking\\_\\_joint\\_sector\\_Review\\_Report.pdf](http://www.mininfra.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/infos/WATSAN__2016-2017_Backward-Looking__joint_sector_Review_Report.pdf)

Comment:

While Backward-Looking Joint Sector Reviews were conducted, no evidence can be found that this occurred during the 2018/19 budget year.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

130. During the implementation of the annual budget, which of the following topics does the executive's engagement with citizens cover?

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:

1. Changes in macroeconomic circumstances
2. Delivery of public services
3. Collection of revenue
4. Implementation of social spending
5. Changes in deficit and debt levels
6. Implementation of public investment projects

*GUIDELINES:*

*This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Timeliness". Please consider all of the mechanisms currently used by the executive to promote public participation during the implementation of the annual budget.*

*Please note that while the public engagement can/may cover other topics -- and for this reason the other questions assessing the executive's engagement with the public during budget implementation can be answered on the basis of engagement on topics other than the six listed above -- for the purpose of answering this question, "key topics" are considered to be ONLY the ones listed above. If the executive's engagement with the public covers topics other than the six listed above, please specify these topics in the comments.*

*Note also that this question assesses only the coverage of public engagement (i.e., "what issues is the public invited to engage on?") and issues related to the depth of engagement or selectivity of engaged are not dealt with by this question.*

*Answer "d" applies if requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget implementation stage.*

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

[http://www.mininfra.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/infos/WATSAN\\_\\_2016-2017\\_Backward-Looking\\_\\_joint\\_sector\\_Review\\_Report.pdf](http://www.mininfra.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/infos/WATSAN__2016-2017_Backward-Looking__joint_sector_Review_Report.pdf)

Comment:

While Backward-Looking Joint Sector Reviews were conducted, no evidence can be found that this occurred during the 2018/19 budget year.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

131. When the executive engages with the public, does it provide comprehensive prior information on the process of the engagement, so that the public can

participate in an informed manner?

Comprehensive information must include at least three of the following elements:

1. Purpose
2. Scope
3. Constraints
4. Intended outcomes
5. Process and timeline

**GUIDELINES:**

*This question relates to the GIFT principle of "Openness," and addresses whether the executive provides relevant information on the process of the engagement before public participation takes place, in order to help citizens engage effectively. The question addresses whether the "rules of the public engagement" are clearly spelled out, in advance and in detail, so that those members of the public who want to engage know how to do so, in terms of when they can do so, what they are expected to provide input on, by when, to whom, etc. This question does not cover the substance of the engagement, which is covered by questions 127 and 130.*

*Non-comprehensive information means that the government provides information that includes at least one but less than three of the elements listed above.*

*Purpose refers to a brief explanation of why the public engagement is being undertaken, including the executive's objectives for its engagement with the public.*

*Scope refers to what is within the subject matter of the engagement as well as what is outside the subject matter of the engagement. For example, the scope may include how a current policy is administered but exclude the specifics of the policies themselves.*

*Constraints refers to whether there are any explicit limitations on the engagement. An example of a constraint could be that any policy changes must not cost (or forgo revenue) more than a specific amount or have no net fiscal cost.*

*Intended outcomes refers to what the executive hopes to achieve as a result of the engagement. Examples of intended outcomes could be revising a policy to better reflect citizen or service-user views or to improve the way in which a particular program is administered.*

*Process refers to the methods by which the public engagement will take place and the discrete steps in the process. For example, the process may simply be a one-off Internet-based consultation, with a summary published of public inputs and the official response. The process may involve simultaneous or overlapping steps, and may be conducted in one round or in two or more rounds of engagement.*

*Timeline refers to the specific dates on which the discrete steps in the process will take place, or during which they will be completed, and clear start and end dates for the overall engagement.*

*Answer "d" applies if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget implementation or formulation stage.*

**Answer:**

c. Information is provided in a timely manner in both or one of the two phases, but it is not comprehensive.

**Source:**

Minecofin

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Call\\_Circulars/LG\\_The\\_First\\_Planning\\_and\\_Budgeting\\_Call\\_Circular\\_for\\_the\\_2017-18\\_FY-.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Call_Circulars/LG_The_First_Planning_and_Budgeting_Call_Circular_for_the_2017-18_FY-.pdf)

**Comment:**

The budget call circular identifies all steps on how to conduct consultations with the public and other stakeholders but it is not clear how the public participation will be effectively engaged and how the feedback will be done.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

132. With regard to the mechanism identified in question 125, does the executive provide the public with feedback on how citizens' inputs have been used in the formulation of the annual budget?

**GUIDELINES:**

*This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Sustainability", and examines the extent to which the executive provides information to citizens on which public inputs were received, which ones are used in the formulation of the annual budget, and how/why.*

By "written record", we mean a document that is produced and released by the lead budget agency (Ministry of Finance, Treasury) that has set up and holds the participation activity.

Answer "a" applies when the executive provides a written document with:

- The inputs (e.g., a written transcript) received from the public and
- A detailed report on how the inputs were used or not used (such report should include information on which inputs were used or not used, why, and how)

Answer "b" applies when the executive provides a written document that includes:

- The inputs (e.g., a written transcript) received from the public and
- A not-so-detailed report, such as a document with a few paragraphs, on how public inputs were used or not used. This document only gives a general idea on how those inputs were used or not used.

Answer "c" applies when the executive provides a written document that includes:

- The inputs (e.g., a written transcript) received from the public or
- A report (being it detailed or not-so-detailed) on how public inputs have been used or not used.

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget formulation stage.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

Comment:

No feedback is provided.

the circular mentions how citizens will receive a feedback but the annex referred to is not made published. Even the Citizens guide to the budget does not mention anything in relation to the feedback but only emphasizes on their participation

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

133. With regard to the mechanism identified in question 128, does the executive provide the public with information on how citizens' inputs have been used to assist in monitoring the implementation of the annual budget?

*GUIDELINES:*

*This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Sustainability", and examines the extent to which the executive provides information to citizens on which public inputs were received during the implementation of the annual budget, which ones are taken into account to improve budget monitoring, and how/why.*

By "written record", we mean a document that is produced and released by the lead budget agency (Ministry of Finance, Treasury) that has set up and holds the participation activity.

Answer "a" applies when the executive provides a written document with:

- The inputs (e.g., a written transcript) received from the public and
- A detailed report on how the inputs were used or not used (such report should include information on which inputs were used or not used, why, and how)

Answer "b" applies when the executive provides a written document that includes:

- The inputs received (e.g., a written transcript) from the public and
- A not-so-detailed report, such as a document with a few paragraphs, on how public inputs were used or not used. This document only gives a general idea on how those inputs were or were not taken into account by the executive during budget monitoring.

Answer "c" applies when the executive provides a written document that includes:

- The inputs (e.g., a written transcript) received from the public or
- A report (being it detailed or not-so-detailed) on how public inputs have been used or not used.

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget implementation stage.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

No feedback is provided.

Comment:

Again the circular mentions how citizens will receive a feedback but the annex referred to is not made published. Even the Citizens guide to the budget does not mention anything in relation to the feedback but only emphasizes on their participation

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The feedback is not packaged in a separate documentation. However, it is provided in regular forum like citizens assemblies and meetings after community public works

134. Are participation mechanisms incorporated into the timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal?

**GUIDELINES:**

*This question reflects the GIFT principles on "Sustainability," "Timeliness" and "Complementarity" and addresses whether the executive is able to link participation mechanisms to the administrative processes that are used to create the annual budget.*

*Please note that "timetable" refers to a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the Ministry of Finance or whatever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation. This document is sometimes referred to as the budget calendar and is the same document referenced in Question 53.*

*Answer "a" applies if the national executive establishes a clear set of guidelines that enable citizens and civil servants to understand when participation mechanisms should be used to enable citizen inputs to be incorporated into the annual budget. For answer choice "a", the timetable must be available to the public prior to the budget preparation process beginning.*

*Answer "b" applies if the executive does not establish a clear set of guidelines that enable citizens and civil servants to understand when participation mechanisms should be used to enable citizen inputs to be incorporated into the annual budget or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget formulation or implementation stage.*

Answer:

a. Yes, the executive incorporates participation into its timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal and the timetable is available to the public.

Source:

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Call\\_Circulars/LG\\_The\\_First\\_Planning\\_and\\_Budgeting\\_Call\\_Circular\\_for\\_the\\_2017-18\\_FY-.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Call_Circulars/LG_The_First_Planning_and_Budgeting_Call_Circular_for_the_2017-18_FY-.pdf) (see page 2)

Comment:

The only issue is the no report about the outcomes of the consultation is made public

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The document titled "The First Planning and and Budgeting Call Circular for the 2018/2019 Fiscal Year" includes an annex with the timetable of the budgeting process (Annex 1. Planning and Budgeting Calendar 2018-19)

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Central\\_Government/2018-19\\_Budget\\_Call\\_Circular/2018-19\\_CG\\_PBCC.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Central_Government/2018-19_Budget_Call_Circular/2018-19_CG_PBCC.pdf)

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

135. Do one or more line ministries use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during the formulation or implementation of the annual budget?

**GUIDELINES**

*While questions 125 – 135 focus only on participation mechanisms that the Ministry of Finance, lead budget agency, or central coordinating agency currently use to allow the public to participate in the national budget process, this question asks about participation mechanisms used by line ministries to allow the public to participate in national budget processes. Thus, participation mechanisms used by the Ministry of Finance, lead budget agency, or central coordinating agency should not be used to answer this question. If there is more than one mechanism used by a line ministry or if multiple line ministries use participation mechanisms, please select the deepest or most interactive mechanism that reflects the government's efforts to incorporate citizens' input into the formulation and/or implementation of the annual budget.*

*This question reflects the GIFT principles on "Inclusiveness" and "Timeliness" and assesses the extent to which the participation mechanism(s) used by the executive are truly interactive and involve a two-way conversation between citizens and the executive.*

*The drafting of this question and its answers are partially drawn from the IAP2 Spectrum of Public Participation, in particular with regards to the concepts of "involvement" (option "a" in the responses) and "consultation" (option "b"). See: [https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/foundations\\_course/IAP2\\_P2\\_Spectrum\\_FINAL.pdf](https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/foundations_course/IAP2_P2_Spectrum_FINAL.pdf)*

*To answer "a," a line ministry must use open participation mechanisms that involve the public in the formulation or implementation of the annual budget. This means that a public process is in place whereby CSOs and/or individual members of the public and government officials interact, and have the opportunity to express their opinions to each other in what can be considered a public dialogue between them (i.e., in-person and online discussion forums). Additionally, the mechanism should be open to any CSO and/or individual members of the public who wish to participate. By selecting this answer, the researcher must present evidence to support the presence of a public dialogue among citizens and government official. Examples include public meetings and online deliberative exchanges.*

*Answer "b" applies if an open consultation mechanism is in place whereby members of the public (i.e., individuals and/or CSOs as well as academics, independent experts, policy think tanks, and business organizations) can provide their input in the formulation or implementation of the annual budget. This answer applies if the government is using a mechanism that is structured and well established, and not ad-hoc. The researcher must present evidence to support the presence of consultative processes through which a line ministry seeks out inputs from citizens. Examples include surveys, focus groups, report cards, published policy consultation exercises, and online platforms that government officials actively manage to solicit inputs.*

*Answer "c" applies if a line ministry has established a mechanism or mechanisms to allow citizens to participate in the budget formulation phase, but:*

*1) The mechanisms are not structured and happen only on ad-hoc basis, or not regularly.*

*and/or*

*2) A line ministry consults with and/or interacts with, citizens, but there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, and the line ministry determines fully or partially such selection process by inviting specific groups (for example by making an open call but just to experts from a particular sector, or naming specific organizations). While it is not possible for all citizens and/or CSOs to participate in this or other phases of the budget process, options "a" and "b" apply if the government does not exercise any discretion in determining who is allowed to participate. While there is likely going to be self-selection, it is important that the selection is not made by the executive.*

*In cases where there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, to select answer choice "c", there should be some sort of public record (held in public, minutes of meetings released to public) so that the all CSOs and individual members of the public can have knowledge of the meeting, who participated, and what was discussed.*

*The researcher must present evidence to support selection of a "c" response.*

*Examples of mechanisms that might qualify as a "c" response include hotlines, Facebook announcements, and one-off meetings with NGOs in which there is a public record.*

**Answer:**

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

**Source:**

Minecofin

[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget\\_Management\\_and\\_Reporting\\_Unit/Budget\\_Call\\_Circulars/LG\\_The\\_First\\_Planning\\_and\\_Budgeting\\_Call\\_Circular\\_for\\_the\\_2017-18\\_FY-.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Call_Circulars/LG_The_First_Planning_and_Budgeting_Call_Circular_for_the_2017-18_FY-.pdf)

**Comment:**

If you look at the content of the call circular, MINALOC and MININFRA seems to be referred more

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: For example, this is an action done by the Ministry of Local Government (MINALOC): "The process of gathering and collecting citizens' priorities in Districts Local Governments for national planning considerations kicked off today across the country during the citizens' community assemblies. At the national level, the function was carried out at Bukure Sector/Rwesero Cell in Gicumbi District." Source: "Citizen's participation in planning for 2019-20 launched across the country", MINELOC website, published on 13/11/2018 Link: [https://www.minaloc.gov.rw/index.php?id=469&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bnews%5D=569&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bday%5D=13&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Bmonth%5D=11&tx\\_news\\_pi1%5Byear%5D=2018&cHash=1e09f8f476701daa1cac62a926704b68](https://www.minaloc.gov.rw/index.php?id=469&tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=569&tx_news_pi1%5Bday%5D=13&tx_news_pi1%5Bmonth%5D=11&tx_news_pi1%5Byear%5D=2018&cHash=1e09f8f476701daa1cac62a926704b68)

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Joint sector reviews: [http://197.243.22.137/minaloc/fileadmin/documents/FL\\_JSR\\_REPORT\\_FY\\_2018-2019.pdf](http://197.243.22.137/minaloc/fileadmin/documents/FL_JSR_REPORT_FY_2018-2019.pdf)  
[http://moh.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/2017.18\\_Forward\\_Looking\\_Joint\\_Sector\\_Review\\_14th.June.2017.pdf](http://moh.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/2017.18_Forward_Looking_Joint_Sector_Review_14th.June.2017.pdf)

IBP Comment

IBP revised the score from C to D as the Joint Sector Review mechanism is coordinated by Finance Ministry, acknowledged accordingly in indicator 125.

136. Does the legislature or the relevant legislative committee(s) hold public hearings and/or use other participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during its public deliberations on the formulation of the annual budget (pre-budget and/or approval stages)?

*GUIDELINES:*

*This question reflects the GIFT principle on "Sustainability," "Transparency," and "Complementarity" and assesses the extent to which the participation mechanism(s) used by the legislative are interactive and involve a two-way conversation between citizens and the legislature, rather than being limited to allowing the public to attend or hear public budget deliberations.*

*Please consider participation mechanisms that the legislature (both in its whole institution or its relevant budget/public accounts/finance committees) has put in place and is using to allow the public to participate in their deliberations on the annual budget. This includes deliberations during the pre-budget phase (i.e., when the executive is still in the process of formulating the draft budget) and the budget discussions after the budget has been tabled to parliament and before it is approved. In the comment box, please specify during which stage of the budget cycle the legislature has put in place a public participation mechanism.*

*Mechanisms through which members of the public reach out to individual Members of Parliament as opposed to the legislature (both in its whole institution or its relevant budget/public accounts/finance committees) or unofficial hearings organized by a subset of committee members should not be considered in answering this question.*

*If there is more than one mechanism, please select a mechanism that best shows/reflects the legislature's efforts to incorporate citizens into the formulation of the annual budget. The participation mechanisms can involve a range of different issues, such as revenues, policy selection, and macro-fiscal planning (please note that the issue of coverage is covered in a subsequent question).*

*To answer "a," the legislature must hold public hearings where citizens are allowed to testify. This answer applies only if the legislature does not exercise discretion in determining which citizens and/or CSOs can testify (for example, participation takes place on a first-come-first-served basis).*

*Answer "b" should be selected if the following applies:*

- The legislature holds public hearings on the budget;*
- Testimony is not allowed from members of the public or CSOs; but*
- There are other means used by the legislature to receive and collect views from citizens and CSOs on the budget, and the legislature does not exercise discretion in determining which citizens and/or CSOs can provide input. The researcher must provide evidence to support the presence of those alternative processes through which the legislature seeks inputs from citizens. For example, there should be a public record indicating that views from citizens and the public were sought.*

*Answer "c" should be selected if the following applies:*

- The legislature holds public hearings on the budget;*
- Testimony is not allowed from members of the public or CSOs;*
- No other means are used by the legislature to receive and collect views/input from citizens and CSOs on the budget, but*
- The legislature invites a few individuals/groups to provide input (through public hearings or elsewhere)*

*Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the legislature does not use public participation mechanisms during its deliberations on the annual budget*

Answer:

c. Yes, public hearings are held. No testimony from the public is provided during the public hearings, and there are no other mechanisms through

which public contributions are received, but the legislature invites specific individuals or groups to testify or provide input (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).

Source:

Comment:

During hearing, CSOs are represented

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: According to the Parliament website, it is possible for the general public to observe plenary sessions from the public galleries of the Chamber, and also to observe committee discussions. Authorization is required to speak before a committee. <http://parliament.gov.rw/index.php?id=73> However, in practice, the procedure to request the authorization to speak is unclear, and in the Parliament website, the link to the agenda of the plenary seatings is not working.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

137. During the legislative deliberations on the annual budget (pre-budget or approval stages), which of the following key topics does the legislature's (or relevant legislative budget committee) engagement with citizens cover?

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:

1. Macroeconomic issues
2. Revenue forecasts, policies, and administration
3. Social spending policies
4. Deficit and debt levels
5. Public investment projects
6. Public services

*GUIDELINES:*

*This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Timeliness". Please consider the range of mechanisms currently used by the legislature to promote public participation during legislative deliberations on the annual budget.*

*Please note that while the public engagement can/may cover other topics, for the purpose of answering this question, "key topics" are considered to be only the ones listed above. If the legislature's engagement with the public covers topics other than the six listed above, please specify these topics in the comments.*

*Note also that this question assesses only the coverage of public engagement (i.e., "what issues is the public invited to engage on?") and issues related to the depth of engagement or selectivity of engaged are not dealt with by this question.*

*Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the legislature does not use public participation mechanisms during its deliberations on the annual budget.*

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

Article 38 stipulates that: Each Committee shall consider petitions of the population lodged with the Chamber of Deputies falling under its responsibilities and submit its report to Plenary sitting.

[http://parliament.gov.rw/fileadmin/Images2013/ROI\\_Chamber\\_of\\_Deputies.pdf](http://parliament.gov.rw/fileadmin/Images2013/ROI_Chamber_of_Deputies.pdf)

Comment:

No evidence to support an answer above "d"

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

b. The legislature seeks input on at least three (but less than six) of the above-mentioned topics.

Comments: The report from CLADHO (a CSO) that was presented to parliament reflecting ideas of CSOs on BFP covers almost all the topics.

[https://www.cladho.org.rw/fileadmin/templates/document/PPIMA-BFP%20Analysis\\_2018-2019%20-%202021.pdf](https://www.cladho.org.rw/fileadmin/templates/document/PPIMA-BFP%20Analysis_2018-2019%20-%202021.pdf)

138. Does the legislature provide feedback to the public on how citizens' inputs have been used during legislative deliberations on the annual budget?

**GUIDELINES:**

*This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Sustainability", and examines the extent to which the legislature provides information to citizens on which public inputs were received and how inputs were used during legislative deliberations (please note that these deliberations can refer to the pre-budget and approval phases). By "written record" in this question, we mean a document that is produced and released by the legislature.*

Answer "a" applies when the legislature provides a written document with:

- The inputs received from the public (e.g., a written transcript) and
- A detailed report on how the inputs were used or not used (such report should include information on which inputs were used or not used, why, and how).

Answer "b" applies when the legislature provides a written document that includes:

- The inputs received from the public (e.g., a written transcript) and
- A not-so-detailed report on how public inputs were used or not used. This document only gives a general idea on how those inputs were used or not used in legislative deliberations on the annual budget (please note that these deliberations refer to the pre-budget and approval phases).

Answer "c" applies when the legislature provides a written document that includes:

- The inputs received from the public (e.g., a written transcript) or
- A report (being it detailed or not-so-detailed) on how public inputs have been used or not used.

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the legislature does not use public participation mechanisms during its deliberations on the annual budget.

Answer:  
d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:  
Parliament  
[http://parliament.gov.rw/fileadmin/Images2013/ROI\\_Chamber\\_of\\_Deputies.pdf](http://parliament.gov.rw/fileadmin/Images2013/ROI_Chamber_of_Deputies.pdf)  
Minecofin  
[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/\\_migrated/content\\_uploads/Law\\_on\\_State\\_Finances\\_and\\_Property.pdf](http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/_migrated/content_uploads/Law_on_State_Finances_and_Property.pdf)

Comment:  
There is no single article that shows how the legislature has to give a feedback. Only the decision taken to amend the budget and pass the budget law can be considered as feedback. Eg. <https://www.newtimes.co.rw/section/read/214309>

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

139. Does the legislature hold public hearings and/or use other participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during its public deliberations on the Audit Report?

**GUIDELINES:**

*This question reflects the GIFT principle on "Sustainability," "Transparency," and "Complementarity" and assesses the extent to which the participation mechanism(s) used by the legislative are interactive and involve a two-way conversation between citizens and the legislature, rather than being limited to allowing the public to attend or hear public budget deliberations.*

*A key constitutional role of the legislature in almost all countries is to oversee the government's management of public resources. While the Supreme Audit Institution is responsible for checking the government's accounts and publishing the outcome of their audits, for accountability purposes it is essential that the legislature reviews and scrutinizes those reports, and checks on whether the executive is taking the appropriate corrective actions based on the Supreme Audit Institution's recommendations.*

*Holding public hearings to review audit findings allows the public to learn more about how the government has managed its resources for the budget years that have ended, and demand accountability in case of mismanagement and irregularities. Reviewing and discussing those reports in public is therefore a key responsibility of a legislature.*

*Please note that by "Audit Report" we refer to the same audit report assessed in the transparency section of this Survey, i.e., one of the eight key budget documents that all governments (in this case, the Supreme Audit Institution) must produce, according to best practice.*

*Please consider participation mechanisms that the legislature (both in its whole institution or its relevant budget/public accounts/finance committees) have put in place and using to allow the public to participate in their deliberations on the Audit Report.*

*Mechanisms through which members of the public reach out to individual members of parliament as opposed to the legislature (both in its whole institution or its relevant budget/public accounts/finance committees) or unofficial hearings organized by a subset of committee members should not be considered in answering this question.*

*To answer "a," the national legislature must hold public hearings where citizens are allowed to testify. This answer applies only if the legislature does not exercise discretion in determining which citizens and/or CSOs can testify (for example, participation takes place on a first-come-first-served basis).*

*Answer "b" should be selected if the following applies:*

- *The legislature holds public hearings on the budget;*
- *No testimony is allowed from the public; BUT*
- *There are other means used by the legislature to receive and collect views from citizens and CSOs on the budget, and the legislature does not exercise discretion in determining which citizens and/or CSOs can provide input. The researcher must provide evidence to support the presence of those alternative processes through which the legislature seeks inputs from citizens. For example, there should be a public record indicating that views from citizens and the public were sought.*

*Answer "c" should be selected if the following applies:*

- *The legislature holds public hearings on the budget;*
- *No testimony is allowed from the public;*
- *No other means are used by the legislature to receive and collect views/input from citizens and CSOs on the budget, BUT*
- *The legislature invites a few individuals/groups to provide input (through public hearings or elsewhere)*

*Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the legislature does not use public participation mechanisms during its deliberations on the Audit Report.*

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

Comment:

The OAG can involve citizens during the process to support their findings and this can be reflected in the report

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

c. Yes, public hearings on the Audit Report are held. No testimony from the public is provided during the hearings and there are no other mechanisms through which public contributions are received, but the legislature invites specific individuals or groups to testify or provide input (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).

Comments: Public hearings in the Parliament by the Public Accounts Committee (PAC) have been covered in the media. Several government agencies have been summoned to declare based on the results of the Audit Report. For example, as published in The New Times: "For the sixth year in a row, the parliamentary Public Accounts Committee (PAC) has held public hearings where they put to task officials from public institutions to give details about funds mismanaged by their institutions. The hearings are usually based on the Auditor General's report detailing how much was lost and other issues ranging from delayed or cancelled contracts to mismanagement and sometimes embezzlement." "PAC: What next after the public hearings?", The New Times, published on 25/07/2018 <https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/pac-what-next-after-public-hearings> "Kagabo said the Committee's public hearings where public finance managers were grilled are important in the sense that nobody is above the law." "Public applauds PAC efforts against corruption", The New Times, published on 22/07/2019 Link: <https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/public-applauds-pac-efforts-against-corruption> On Twitter, @OAGRwanda account, published on 7 Jun 2018: "#PublicHearing2018: Today, Public Account Committee of #RwandaCDeputies will hear @InfoWda, @MuhangaDistr and @NgororeroDistr on their financial resources issues as reflected in the Report of @OAGRwanda of State Budget of year 2016/2017: #Rwanda #PACtee @Mukabalisad" Link: <https://twitter.com/RwandaParliamt/status/1004632395495235584>

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher Response

I agree with the peer reviewer.

IBP Comment

For cross country comparability, this question has been answered "D." While the PAC does hold hearings on the Audit Report, there is no evidence that they provide a mechanism, opportunity, and invitation for citizens or civil society to participate.

140. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can suggest issues/topics to include in the SAI's audit program (for example, by bringing ideas on agencies, programs, or projects that could be audited)?

**GUIDELINES:**

*This question assesses whether the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has established mechanisms through which the public can provide suggestions on issues/topics to be included in its audit program. When deciding its audit agenda, the SAI may undertake audits for a sample of agencies, projects, and programs in the country; and such a selection could be based on complaints and suggestions made by members of the public. To receive such suggestions, the SAI may create formal mechanisms, like setting up a website, hotline, or office (or assigning staff to liaise with the public).*

Answer:

b. The requirements for an "a" response are not met.

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

Comments: The SAI provides a field on its website where the public can fill in their proposal for issues, topics, projects and programs for inclusion in the audit program. The field can also be used for any other kind of inquiry. <http://www.oag.gov.rw/index.php?id=183>

IBP Comment

The generic "Contact Us" form cited by the government reviewer does not qualify as a mechanism for the OAG to collect suggestions from the public on the issues/topics to include in its audit program. To qualify, this form should explicitly invite the public to propose issues, topics, projects, and programs for the OAG to examine.

141. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) provide the public with feedback on how citizens' inputs have been used to determine its audit program?

**GUIDELINES:**

*This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Sustainability", and examines the extent to which the Supreme Audit Institution provides information to citizens on which public inputs were received, which ones are used to determine the Supreme Audit Institution's audit program. By "written record" in this question, we mean a document that is produced and released by the Supreme Audit Institution.*

*Answer "a" applies when the Supreme Audit Institution provides a written document with:*

- *The inputs received from the public and*
- *A detailed report on how the inputs were used or not used (such report should include information on which inputs were used or not used, why, and how).*

*Answer "b" applies when the SAI provides a written document that includes:*

- *The inputs received from the public and*
- *A not-so-detailed report on how public inputs were used or not used. This document only gives a general idea on how those inputs were used or not used to determine the SAI's annual audit program.*

*Answer "c" applies when the SAI provides a written document that includes:*

- *The received from the public or*
- *A report (being it detailed or not-so-detailed) on how public inputs have been used or not used.*

Answer "d" applies if requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can suggests issues/topics to include in the SAI's audit program.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

See article 7 an 10 of the

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Documents/OAG\\_LAW.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Documents/OAG_LAW.pdf)

Comment:

These articles indicate the sources of information to be used by auditors and who has the responsibility to disclose the information. However the report contains the information gathered and how it was used

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The public is not provided with feedback on how citizens' inputs have been used to determine the audit program.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

142. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can contribute to audit investigations (as respondents, witnesses, etc.)?

*GUIDELINES:*

*This question mirrors question 140, but instead of covering public assistance in formulating the SAI's audit program, it focuses on whether the Supreme Audit Institution has established mechanisms through which the public can participate in audit investigations. In addition to seeking public input to determine its audit agenda, the SAI may wish to provide formal opportunities for the public and civil society organizations to participate in the actual audit investigations, as witnesses or respondents.*

Answer:

b. The requirements for an "a" response are not met.

Source:

OAG website

See article 7 of the following law:

[http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\\_upload/Documents/OAG\\_LAW.pdf](http://www.oag.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Documents/OAG_LAW.pdf)

Comment:

The Auditor can require any person other than the staff of the entity being audited to provide information that is required for the audit exercise, however there is no mechanism through which the public can participate in an audit investigation.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree