

Open Budget Survey 2023

Questionnaire

China

May 2024

Country Questionnaire: China

PBS-1. What is the fiscal year of the PBS evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer:

FY 2023

Source:

Comment:

Accroding to the guideline, I will review the PBS for FY2022.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

Researcher Response

https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-12/16/content_5732408.htm

PBS-2. When is the PBS made available to the public?

Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.

The OBS methodology requires that for a PBS to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is submitted to the legislature for consideration. If the PBS is not released to the public at least one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is submitted to the legislature for consideration, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the PBS.

Answer:

d. The PBS is not released to the public, or is released less than one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is introduced to the legislature

Source:

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202112/t20211227_3778258.htm

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202201/t20220121_3784025.htm

Comment:

These two sources (links above) provide general information about the fiscal policies and directions for the coming fiscal year, which are crucial for the preparation of the new executive budget proposal. However, they do not contain any fiscal figures/parameters for the budget proposal. Thus, I would consider it not meeting the requirement of PBS according to the IBP's definition, although the information is useful for steering the expectation of the public.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

Researcher Response

https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-12/16/content_5732408.htm Again, it does not contain any fiscal figures/parameters for the budget proposal.

PBS-3a. If the PBS is published, what is the date of publication of the PBS?

Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.

Answer:

Source:

Comment:

These two sources are most relevant to PBS. However, as I explained before, they do not be considered as the PBS. So the answer is N.A.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

PBS-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the PBS.

If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

n/a

Source:

Comment:

See the comment in PBS-2, and PBS-3a.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

PBS-4. If the PBS is published, what is the URL or weblink of the PBS?

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.

Answer:

Source:

n.a.

Comment:

See the comments in PBS-2, and 3a.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

PBS-5. If the PBS is published, are the numerical data contained in the PBS available in a machine readable format?

Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) or HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>

Option "d" applies if the PBS is not publicly available, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.

Answer:

d. Not applicable

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

PBS-6a. If the PBS is not publicly available, is it still produced?

If the PBS is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question PBS-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.

Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question PBS-2)

Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.

Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.

Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.

Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.

If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.

Answer:

c. Produced for internal purposes/use only

Source:

Comment:

Again, we don't know exactly if the Chinese central government (or Finance Ministry) produces the PBS or not. Nevertheless, for similar reasons like the reasons provided in the 2021 survey, the best guess would be C.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

Researcher Response

There are a few important institutions engaged in PBS: the National Development and Reform Commission, and Financial Ministry, and the Financial Committee of the National People's Congress. They work together to ensure that they can report to the Politburo of the Chinese Communist Party Meeting to prepare the budget proposal to be submitted to the two Meetings in 2023. therefore, the best guess would be C.

PBS-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question PBS-6a, please specify how you determined whether the PBS was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question PBS-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

n.a.

Source:

Comment:

Again, we don't know exactly if the Chinese central government (or Finance Ministry) produces the PBS. Nevertheless, for similar reasons like the reasons provided in the 2021 survey, the best guess would be C.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

PBS-7. If the PBS is produced, please write the full title of the PBS.

For example, a title for the Pre-Budget Statement could be "Proposed 2023 State Budget" or "Guidelines for the Preparation of Annual Plan and Budget for 2022/23."

If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

Source:

n.a.

Comment:

As the PBS is not available for the public, we don't know the title.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

PBS-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the PBS?

While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see:

<https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>

Answer:

b. No

Source:

https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2021-12/29/content_5665081.htm

<https://m.yicai.com/news/101637303.html>

Comment:

Although the above news sources provide simple and easy-to-understand information for the public, the news sources identified in PBS-2 are not recognized as PBS. Thus, B would be the best answer.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The two news sources do not provide details on the budget.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EBP-1a. What is the fiscal year of the EBP evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer:

FY 2022

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

Ministry of Finance submitted the Budget Proposal to the National People's Congress on 5 March 2022. Although it is not a comprehensive document according to the IBP definition, it is part of the EBP (or can consider it as its supporting documents). Besides, it did provide some critical fiscal information to the public before the legislative approval. In this sense, I recognize it and evaluate it in this section.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EBP-1b. When is the EBP submitted to the legislature for consideration?

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.

Answer:

5/3/2022

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

Ministry of Finance submitted the Budget Proposal to the National People's Congress on 5 March 2023.

Although it is not a comprehensive document for EPS according to the IBP definition, it is part of the EBP (or can consider it as its supporting documents). Besides, it did provide some critical fiscal information to the public before the legislative approval. In this sense, I recognize it and evaluate it in this section.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EBP-2. When is the EBP made available to the public?

Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.

The OBS methodology requires that for an EBP to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public while the legislature is still considering it and before the legislature approves (enacts) it. If the EBP is not released to the public before the legislature approves it, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the EBP.

The OBS definition of an Executive's Budget Proposal is a document(s) that (i) the executive submits to the legislature as a formal part of the budget approval process and (ii) the legislature either approves or on which it approves proposed amendments.

The OBS will treat the Executive's Budget Proposal as "Not Produced," in the following cases:

- The executive does not submit the draft budget to the legislature; or
- The legislature receives the draft budget but does not approve it or does not approve recommendations on the draft budget;
- The legislature rejects the draft budget submitted by the executive, but the executive implements it without legislative approval; or
- There is no legislature, or the legislature has been dissolved.

Answer:

d. The EBP is not released to the public, or is released after the budget has been approved by the legislature

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Ministry of Finance, Report on the Execution of the Central and Local Budgets for 2021 and on the Draft Central and Local Budgets for 2022, 14 March 2022. http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220314_3794760.htm

Ministry of Finance, 2022 Central Budget documents, 24 March 2022, <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2022zycys/index.htm>

Comment:

Ministry of Finance published the abstract on 5 March after it submitted the Budget Proposal to the Congress on the same day. The abstract was published before the Congress' approval. Although the answer is the same as the last review, I would like to highlight that the publication of this brief summary of budget proposal seeks to enhance fiscal transparency at the central level. The options in this question may not be able to accurately reflect such practice.

The Report was published on 14 March after the Congress' approval. It provides detailed financial information and fiscal policies. More detailed tables were provided in the Central Budget documents on 24 March 2022.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EBP-3a. If the EBP is published, what is the date of publication of the EBP?

Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.

In the comment boxes below, researchers should also list any supporting documents to the EBP and their date of publication.

Answer:

Source:

n.a.

Comment:

According to the IBP's methodology, the EBP is not published to the public.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EBP-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the EBP.

If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

n.a.

Source:

Comment:

According to the IBP's methodology, the EBP is not published to the public.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EBP-4. If the EBP is published, what is the URL or weblink of the EBP?

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.

In the comment boxes below, researchers should also list any supporting documents to the EBP and their URL or weblink.

Answer:

Source:

n.a.

Comment:

According to the IBP's methodology, the EBP is not published to the public.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion:

EBP-5. If the EBP is published, are the numerical data contained in the EBP or its supporting documents available in a machine readable format?

Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) and HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>.

Option "d" applies if the EBP is not publicly available, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.

Answer:

d. Not applicable

Source:

Comment:

According to the IBP's methodology, the EBP is not published to the public.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion:

EBP-6a. If the EBP is not publicly available, is it still produced?

If the EBP is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question EBP-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.

Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question EBP-2).

Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.

Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.

Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.

Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.

If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.

Answer:

c. Produced for internal purposes/use only

Source:

Comment:

The EBP is not disclosed to the public. Only part of it is released. The best guess is "for internal use only".

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EBP-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question EBP-6a, please specify how you determined whether the EBP was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question EBP-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

I was informed before, national lawmakers received the full version of the EBP during the two meetings in Beijing. Therefore, the best guess is "for internal use only".

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EBP-7. If the EBP is produced, please write the full title of the EBP.

For example, a title for the Executive's Budget Proposal could be "Draft Estimates of Revenue and Expenditure for BY 2022-23, produced by the Ministry of Finance, Planning and Economic Development."

If there are any supporting documents to the EBP, please enter their full titles in the comment box below.

If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

Report on the Execution of the Central and Local Budgets for 2021 and on the Draft Central and Local Budgets for 2022

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the Execution of the Central and Local Budgets for 2021 and on the Draft Central and Local Budgets for 2022, 14 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220314_3794760.htm

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EBP-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the EBP?

While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see: <https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>.

Answer:

a. Yes

Source:

https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2023-03/09/content_5745529.htm

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhuantihuigu/ysbgjd/mtbd2022/202203/t20220307_3792906.htm

http://jsz.mof.gov.cn/zhengcefagui/202203/t20220308_3793499.htm

Comment:

These links provide media reports to citizens. They were shared by the Chinese government before the legislative approval.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EB-1a. What is the fiscal year of the EB evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer:

FY 2022

Source:

State Council, National People's Congress approved the 2022 budget proposal. 11 March 2022. https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-03/11/content_5678444.htm

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EB-1b. When was the EB approved (enacted) by the legislature?

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.

Answer:

11/3/2022

Source:

State Council, National People's Congress approved the 2022 budget proposal. 11 March 2022. https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-03/11/content_5678444.htm

Comment:

The budget proposal was approved on 11 March 2022.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EB-2. When is the EB made available to the public?

Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.

The OBS methodology requires that for an EB to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public three months after the budget is approved by the legislature. If the EB is not released to the public at least three months after the budget is approved by the legislature, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the EB.

Answer:

a. Two weeks or less after the budget has been enacted

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the Execution of the Central and Local Budgets for 2021 and on the Draft Central and Local Budgets for 2022. 14 March 2022. http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220314_3794760.htm
Ministry of Finance, 2022 Central Budget documents. 24 March 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2022zyczys/index.htm>

Comment:

Although the first source shows the approved budget proposal, it is the budget documents of the second source (24 March 2022) that disclose the

detailed tables of central and local budgets in specific sectors. And the EBP was approved by 11 March. Therefore, the second source can be seen as the EB and the answer of this indicator is a.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The researcher is correct to note that details of the EB are published within two weeks of the budget being enacted, however, the details in the second link provide only details of the central government EB, which account for only one-third of consolidated national revenues and a little more than 10% of consolidated expenditures. Local government EBs are separately published by the localities within 60 days of their EBs being enacted, and provide similar but varying levels of detail. Two examples are from Zhejiang province:

https://czt.zj.gov.cn/art/2022/1/30/art_1416803_58923989.html and Guangdong province:

<http://czt.gd.gov.cn/attachment/0/481/481042/3803533.pdf>

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EB-3a. If the EB is published, what is the date of publication of the EB?

Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.

Answer:

24/3/2022

Source:

Source

Ministry of Finance, Report on the Execution of the Central and Local Budgets for 2021 and on the Draft Central and Local Budgets for 2022, 14 March 2022. http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220314_3794760.htm

Ministry of Finance, 2022 Central Budget documents, 24 March 2022, <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2022zyczys/index.htm>

Comment:

Although the first source shows the approved budget proposal, it is the budget documents of the second source (24 March 2022) that disclose the detailed tables of central and local budgets in specific sectors. Therefore, the second source can be seen as the EB.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The researcher is correct to note that details of the EB are published within two weeks of the budget being enacted, however, the details in the second link provide only details of the central government EB, which account for only one-third of consolidated national revenues and a little more than 10% of consolidated expenditures. Local government EBs are separately published by the localities within 60 days of their EBs being enacted, and provide similar but varying levels of detail. Two examples are from Zhejiang province:

https://czt.zj.gov.cn/art/2022/1/30/art_1416803_58923989.html and Guangdong province:

<http://czt.gd.gov.cn/attachment/0/481/481042/3803533.pdf>

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EB-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the EB.

If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

Although the first source shows the approved budget proposal, it is the budget documents of the second source (24 March 2022) that disclose the detailed tables of central and local budgets in specific sectors. Therefore, the second source can be seen as the EB.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the Execution of the Central and Local Budgets for 2021 and on the Draft Central and Local Budgets for 2022. 14 March 2022. http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220314_3794760.htm
Ministry of Finance, 2022 Central Budget documents. 24 March 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2022zyczys/index.htm>

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: but note again the separate reporting of the central government and local government EBs.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EB-4. If the EB is published, what is the URL or weblink of the EB?

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.

Answer:

<http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2022zyczys/index.htm>

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2022 Central Budget documents. 24 March 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2022zyczys/index.htm>

Comment:

2022 central general public budget revenue budget table
Explanation on the 2022 Central General Public Budget Revenue Budget
2022 Central General Public Budget Expenditure Budget Table
2022 Central Government Expenditure Budget Table
Explanation on the 2022 Central Government Expenditure Budget

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: note the separate reporting of central and local government EBs

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EB-5. If the EB is published, are the numerical data contained in the EB available in a machine readable format?

Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) and HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>

Option "d" applies if the EB is not publicly available, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.

Answer:

c. No

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2022 Central Budget documents. 24 March 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2022zyczys/index.htm>

Comment:

Information is only available in the form of HTML file.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EB-6a. If the EB is not publicly available, is it still produced?

If the EB is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question EB-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.

Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question EB-2)

Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.

Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.

Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.

Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.

If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.

Answer:

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2022 Central Budget documents. 24 March 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2022zyczys/index.htm>

Comment:

EB is available to the public.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EB-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question EB-6a, please specify how you determined whether the EB was produced for internal use only, versus not

produced at all.

If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question EB-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

n/a.

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EB-7. If the EB is produced, please write the full title of the EB.

For example, a title for the Enacted Budget could be "Appropriation Act n. 10 of 2023."

If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

2022 Central Budget Documents

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2022 Central Budget documents. 24 March 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2022zyczys/index.htm>

Comment:

The documents disclose detailed tables of central and local budgets in specific sectors.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: note the separate reporting of central and local government EBs.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

EB-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the EB?

While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see:

<https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>.

Answer:

a. Yes

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Graphic representation of the national accounts. 17 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caijingshidian/cjzylm/202203/t20220317_3795924.htm

People's Daily, Central departments reveal clear accounts. 26 March 2022. <http://politics.people.com.cn/n1/2022/0326/c1001-32384654.html>

Ministry of Finance, National accounts show warmth and commitment. 22 July 2022.
http://tj.mof.gov.cn/zt4/jianguanshixiang/202203/t20220330_3799604.htm

Ministry of Finance, National accounts: Relieving people's worries and enterprises' troubles. 22 July 2022.
http://jsz.mof.gov.cn/zt2019/ysjg/zcfg/202204/t20220428_3806992.htm

Comment:

The government website has released various forms of interpretive news to help the public better understand the budget proposal. For instance, the first source publishes news that combines text and images, conveying key information in a more concise manner.

The second source analyzes and summarizes detailed tables of the budget proposal. The third and the fourth are similar reports.

These documents could be considered as a citizen version of EB.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

CB-1. What is the fiscal year of the CB evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, for each CB please indicate the document the CB simplifies/refers to, and the fiscal year.

Answer:

FY 2022

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

CB-2a. For the fiscal year indicated in CB-1, what is the public availability status of the CB?

If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document

(Executive's Budget Proposal or Enacted Budget) you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budget is produced and its public availability status.

Remember that publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.

Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology
Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.

Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.

Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.

Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.

Answer:

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Interpretations of 2022 Budget Proposal. In March 2022. <http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhuantihuigu/ysbgjd/>
Ministry of Finance, Delegates, members, experts, and others discuss the national livelihood reflected in national accounts. 6 March 2022. http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhuantihuigu/ysbgjd/mtbd2022/202203/t20220307_3792906.htm
Ministry of Finance, Breaking down national accounts with "three increases and three decreases". 6 March 2022. http://jsz.mof.gov.cn/zhengcefagui/202203/t20220308_3793499.htm
Ministry of Finance, Graphic representation of the national accounts. 17 March 2022. http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caijingshidian/cjzylm/202203/t20220317_3795924.htm
People's Daily, Central departments reveal clear accounts. 26 March 2022. <http://politics.people.com.cn/n1/2022/0326/c1001-32384654.html>

Comment:

First, the official website of the Ministry of Finance has set up a column to consolidate media reports related to the 2022 budget proposal (the first source). For instance, the second source elaborates on the policies of livelihood protection and enterprise burden reduction, and the third source focuses on interpreting the sections of tax cuts and the expansion of fiscal expenditures.
Second, the official website has released news that combines text and images, conveying key information in a more concise manner (the fourth source). Additionally, some official media outlets also analyze and summarize detailed tables of the budget proposal, for example, the fifth source. These documents are available to the public and meet the timeframe of OBS.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Again noting the separate reporting of central and local government CBs, an example from Guangdong province: http://czt.gd.gov.cn/zwgk/sjjd/content/post_3803706.html

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

CB-2b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question CB-2a, please specify how you determined whether the CB was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question CB-2a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

n/a.

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

CB-3a. If the CB is published, what is the date of publication of the CB?

Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.

If more than one Citizens Budget is published, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budget is produced and its dates of publication.

Answer:

17/3/2022

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Graphic representation of the national accounts. 17 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caijingshidian/cjzylm/202203/t20220317_3795924.htm

Comment:

This document distills the policy points and data from the budget proposal in a graphic format that could be considered a CB.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Again note the separate reporting of central and local government CBs, with differing dates for local CBs.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

CB-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the CB.

If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

The website shows the publication date: 17 March 2022.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Graphic representation of the national accounts. 17 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caijingshidian/cjzylm/202203/t20220317_3795924.htm

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Again noting the separate reporting of central and local government CBs.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

CB-4. If the CB is published, what is the URL or weblink of the CB?

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.

If more than one Citizens Budget is published, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budget is produced and its URL or weblink.

Answer:

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caijingshidian/cjzylm/202203/t20220317_3795924.htm

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Graphic representation of the national accounts. 17 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caijingshidian/cjzylm/202203/t20220317_3795924.htm

Ministry of Finance, Interpretations of 2022 Budget Proposal. In March 2022. <http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhuantihuigu/ysbgjd/>

Comment:

The two links can be considered as a CB. The first one is a very simple version of budget proposal by a mouthpiece of authority. The second is a official website of Ministry of Finance, including the budget proposal documents and media interpretations of the budget proposals.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Again noting the separate reporting of central and local government CBs

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

CB-5. If the CB is produced, please write the full title of the CB.

For example, a title for the Citizens Budget could be "Budget 2022 People's Guide" or "2023 Proposed Budget in Brief: A People's Budget Publication."

If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, for the other CB, indicate the document the CB refers to and, next to it, its full title.

Answer:

Graphic representation of the national accounts: Implementing proactive fiscal policies to promote sustainable and healthy economic development and social stability

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Graphic representation of the national accounts. 17 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caijingshidian/cjzylm/202203/t20220317_3795924.htm

Ministry of Finance, Interpretations of 2022 Budget Proposal. In March 2022. <http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhuantihuigu/ysbgjd/>

Comment:

The two links can be considered as a CB. The first one is a very simple version of budget proposal by a mouthpiece of authority. The second is a

official website of Ministry of Finance, including the budget proposal documents and media interpretations of the budget proposals.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Again noting the separate reporting of central and local government CBs, with varying sources and level of detail for local CBs.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

CB-6. If the CB is produced, please indicate which budget document it corresponds to.

If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budget is produced and which budget document it simplifies.

Answer:

It corresponds to EB.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Graphic representation of the national accounts. 17 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caijingshidian/cjzylm/202203/t20220317_3795924.htm

Ministry of Finance, Interpretations of 2022 Budget Proposal. In March 2022. <http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhuantihuigu/ysbjgd/>

Comment:

The first source was released on 17 March 2022 which is later than when EB published (14 March 2022). The second source corresponds to EBP because the documents included were earlier than EB and their contents were related to budget proposal.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: same for local government CBs.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

IYRs-1. What is the fiscal year of the IYRs evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer:

FY 2022

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Summary of national revenue and expenditure.

<http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/redianzhuanti/quanguocaizhengshouzhiquang/>

Comment:

Ministry of Finance reported the monthly report every month. All reports are available in a timely manner.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

IYRs-2. When are the IYRs made available to the public?

Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.

The OBS methodology requires that for IYRs to be considered publicly available, IYRs must be made available to the public no later than three months after the reporting period ends. If at least seven of the last 12 monthly IYRs, or at least three of the last four quarterly IYRs are not released to the public at least three months after the reporting period ends, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the IYRs.

Answer:

a. At least every month, and within one month of the period covered

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Summary of national revenue and expenditure.

<http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/redianzhuanti/quanguocaizhengshouzhiquingkuang/>

Comment:

The IYRs are provided every month except January and February. The report for Jan and Feb is combined and reported in March 2022.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

IYRs-3a. If the IYRs are published, what are the dates of publication of the IYRs?

Specifically: if quarterly In-Year Reports are published, indicate the dates of publication of at least three of the last four IYRs that were publicly available. If monthly IYRs are published, indicate the dates of publication of at least seven of the last 12 IYRs that were publicly available.

Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05 September 2022. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

The monthly report for November 2022 was publicly available online on 20 December 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202212/t20221220_3858837.htm

The monthly report for October 2022 was publicly available online on 17 November 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202211/t20221116_3851724.htm

The report for the first three quarters of 2022 was publicly available online on 25 October 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202210/t20221025_3847842.htm

The monthly report for August 2022 was publicly available online on 16 September 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202209/t20220916_3840932.htm

The monthly report for July 2022 was publicly available online on 17 August 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202208/t20220817_3834300.htm

The report for the first half year of 2022 was publicly available online on 14 July 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202207/t20220714_3827010.htm

The monthly report for May 2022 was publicly available online on 16 June 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202206/t20220616_3818568.htm

The monthly report for April 2022 was publicly available online on 17 May 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202205/t20220517_3810958.htm

The report for the first quarter of 2022 was publicly available online on 20 April 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202204/t20220420_3804357.htm

The monthly report for January- February 2022 (combined) was publicly available online on 18 March 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202203/t20220318_3796233.htm

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Summary of national revenue and expenditure.

<http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/redianzhuanti/quanguocaizhengshouzhiquang/>

Comment:

The IYRs are provided every month except January and February. The report for Jan and Feb is combined and reported in March 2022.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

IYRs-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the IYRs.

If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

The dates are stated in the websites.

Source:

See the sources in IYRs-3a.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

IYRs-4. If the IYRs are published, what is the URL or weblink of the IYRs?

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.

Researchers should provide the weblink to the most recent In-Year Report in the space below, and – in the comment box underneath – the weblinks to older IYRs.

If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.

Answer:

<http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/redianzhuanti/quanguocaizhengshouzhiquang/>

Source:

See the website links provided in IYRs-3a.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

IYRs-5. If the IYRs are published, are the numerical data contained in the IYRs available in a machine readable format?

Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) and HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>

Option “d” applies if the IYRs are not publicly available, therefore their machine readability cannot be assessed.

Answer:

c. No

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Summary of national revenue and expenditure.

<http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/redianzhuanti/quanguocaizhengshouzhiquang/>

Comment:

All information is presented in the form of HTML files. Thus, it does not meet the requirements of the machine-readable format.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

IYRs-6a. If the IYRs are not publicly available, are they still produced?

If the IYRs are not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question IYRs-2 was “d”), a government may nonetheless produce the document.

Option “a” applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question IYRs-2).

Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.

Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.

Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.

Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.

If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.

Answer:

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Summary of national revenue and expenditure.

<http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/redianzhuanti/quanguocaizhengshouzhiquang/>

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: the document is publicly available.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

IYRs-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question IYRs-6a, please specify how you determined whether the IYRs were produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question IYRs-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion:

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

IYRs-7. If the IYRs are produced, please write the full title of the IYRs.

For example, a title for the In-Year Report could be "Budget Monitoring Report, Quarter 1" or "Budget Execution Report January-March 2022."

If In-Year Reports are not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Researchers should provide the full title of the most recent In-Year Report in the space below, and – in the comment box underneath – the full titles of older

IYRs.

Answer:

Fiscal revenue and expenditure in Jan & Feb 2022
Fiscal revenue and expenditure in first quarter of 2022
Fiscal revenue and expenditure in April 2022
Fiscal revenue and expenditure in May 2022
Fiscal revenue and expenditure in upper half 2022
Fiscal revenue and expenditure in July 2022
Fiscal revenue and expenditure in Aug 2022
Fiscal revenue and expenditure in third quarter 2022
Fiscal revenue and expenditure in Oct 2022
Fiscal revenue and expenditure in Nov 2022
Fiscal revenue and expenditure in 2022

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Summary of national revenue and expenditure.
<http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/redianzhuanti/quanguocaizhengshouzhiquingkuang/>
Also see the answers of IYRs-3a for more detailed website links.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

IYRs-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the IYRs?

While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see: <https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>.

Answer:

b. No

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Summary of national revenue and expenditure.
<http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/redianzhuanti/quanguocaizhengshouzhiquingkuang/>

Comment:

There are no simple versions of the reports for the general public.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

MYR-1. What is the fiscal year of the MYR evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer:

FY 2022

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the implementation of China's financial policies in the first half year. 30 August 2022.
https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-08/30/content_5707425.htm

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

MYR-2. When is the MYR made available to the public?

Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.

The OBS methodology requires that for an MYR to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public no later than three months after the reporting period ends (i.e., three months after the midpoint of the fiscal year). If the MYR is not released to the public at least three months after the reporting period ends, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the MYR.

Answer:

d. The MYR is not released to the public, or is released more than three months after the midpoint

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the implementation of China's financial policies in the first half year. 30 August 2022.
https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-08/30/content_5707425.htm

Comment:

Ministry of Finance released the above on 30 August 2022. The report provides some figures about the budget execution for the first half year. However, it does not provide any projections for the second half. Thus, it may not meet the IBP definition of MYR.

However, it should be noted that this document is vital to the public as it releases some critical figures about fiscal implementation, thereby contributing to fiscal transparency.

Therefore, I would suggest counting the scores in the questions covering the Mid-Year Review later in the Open Budget Survey (Questions 76-83) based on this document.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion:

MYR-3a. If the MYR is published, what is the date of publication of the MYR?

Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.

Answer:

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the implementation of China's financial policies in the first half year. 30 August 2022.
https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-08/30/content_5707425.htm

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: this report was published on 30/8/2022.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

IBP Comment

Many thanks to the peer reviewer. As the Mid-Year Review is not considered publicly available, the dates entered are not applicable.

MYR-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the MYR.

If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

The publication date was shown in the website.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the implementation of China's financial policies in the first half year. 30 August 2022.
https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-08/30/content_5707425.htm

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

MYR-4. If the MYR is published, what is the URL or weblink of the MYR?

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.

Answer:

https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-08/30/content_5707425.htm

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the implementation of China's financial policies in the first half year. 30 August 2022.
https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-08/30/content_5707425.htm

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

MYR-5. If the MYR is published, are the numerical data contained in the MYR available in a machine readable format?

Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) and HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>.

Option "d" applies if the MYR is not publicly available, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.

Answer:

d. Not applicable

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the implementation of China's financial policies in the first half year. 30 August 2022.
https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-08/30/content_5707425.htm

Comment:

All information is presented in the form of HTML files. Thus, it does not meet the requirements of the machine-readable format.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

MYR-6a. If the MYR is not publicly available, is it still produced?

If the MYR is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question MYR-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.

Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question MYR-2).

Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.

Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.

Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.

Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.

If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.

Answer:

d. Not produced at all

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

MYR-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question MYR-6a, please specify how you determined whether the MYR was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question MYR-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

n/a.

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

MYR-7. If the MYR is produced, please write the full title of the MYR.

For example, a title for the Mid-Year Review could be "Semi-annual Budget Performance Report, FY 2021/22" or "Mid-Year Report on the 2022 National Budget."

If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

N/A

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the implementation of China's financial policies in the first half year. 30 August 2022.
https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-08/30/content_5707425.htm

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

MYR-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the MYR?

While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see: <https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>.

Answer:

a. Yes

Source:

People's Daily, The fiscal policy implementation report in the first half of 2022 released, budget implementation is generally better. 31 August 2022. https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-08/31/content_5707537.htm
CBN Daily, Fiscal revenue exceeds 10 trillion yuan, significant increase in technology expenditure! A review of the fiscal policy implementation report in the first half year. 30 August 2022. <https://m.mp.oeeee.com/a/BAAFRD000020220830717614.html>
Southern Metropolis Daily, Trillions of fiscal direct funds accelerate implementation and expenditure, tighter supervision | A review of China's financial data. 30 August 2022. <https://m.yicai.com/news/101524995.html>

Comment:

First, the government's official website publishes reports on MYR from official media sources, such as a brief summary of MYR from People's Daily (the first source).
Second, some mainstream media also provide coverage on MYR with a combination of text and visuals (the second and third sources).
The three sources can be considered as a citizen report.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

YER-1. What is the fiscal year of the YER evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer:

FY 2021

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 final report at the central level. 22 June 2022. <http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/bc2d630c1af0481b93b6bf88684ea55a.shtml>
Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report. July 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/>

Comment:

The first link provides a summary of the final report at the central level.
The second link provides all detailed tables for the final report.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: However, the first link no longer works, and it only referred to the central government budget. It should be deleted from the answer.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

IBP Comment

Many thanks to the reviewer. The correct link is <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/>

YER-2. When is the YER made available to the public?

Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.

The OBS methodology requires that for an YER to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public no later than one year after the fiscal year to which it corresponds. If the YER is not released to the public within one year after the end of the fiscal year to which it corresponds, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the YER.

Answer:

b. Nine months or less, but more than six months, after the end of the budget year

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 final report at the central level. 22 June 2022. <http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/bc2d630c1af0481b93b6bf88684ea55a.shtml>
Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report. July 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/>

Comment:

The first link provides a summary of the final report at the central level, with tax revenues, final accounts of expenditures, fiscal allocations and debts. The second link provides all detailed tables for the final report. Thus, both can be considered as YER.
Based on the OBS methodology, the answer is A.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: b. Nine months or less, but more than six months, after the end of the budget year

Comments: The YER for the national budget (not just the central budget) is typically provided in July or August. The 2021 YER has a publication date of 12/7/2022, but was actually put on the web some weeks later. This can be seen in some of the individual tables in the YER. For example, the budget expenditure table (http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220728_3830482.htm) lists a publication date of 28/7/2022. This is the same date for the Local Government-managed Funds Revenue table (http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220728_3830602.htm), and also for the Local Government Social Insurance Funds Revenue (http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220728_3830644.htm).

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

Researcher Response

Yes. Thanks for the correction. B should be the right answer.

YER-3a. If the YER is published, what is the date of publication of the YER?

Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.

Answer:

28/7/2022

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 final report at the central level. 22 June 2022.

<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/bc2d630c1af0481b93b6bf88684ea55a.shtml>

Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report. July 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/>

Comment:

The first link provides a summary of the final report at the central level, with tax revenues, final accounts of expenditures, fiscal allocations and debts. The second link provides all detailed tables for the final report. Thus, both can be considered as YER.

The first source stated that the publication date is 22 June 2022.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: The first source should be rejected since it refers only to the central government YER. The second source misleadingly lists its publication date as 12/7/2022 but many of the tables list their availability as 28/7/2022. I would use 28/7/2022 as the publication date.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

Researcher Response

Thanks for the correction. Agree. 28 July 2022 should be the correct answer.

YER-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the YER.

If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

The second source stated that the publication date is 28 July 2022.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 final report at the central level. 22 June 2022.
<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/bc2d630c1af0481b93b6bf88684ea55a.shtml>
Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report. July 2022. <http://ysss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/>

Comment:**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: The first source should be rejected since it refers only to the central government YER. The second source misleadingly lists its publication date as 12/7/2022 but many of the tables list their availability as 28/7/2022. I would use 28/7/2022 as the publication date.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

Researcher Response

Thanks for the correction. Agree.

YER-4. If the YER is published, what is the URL or weblink of the YER?

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.

Answer:

<http://ysss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/>

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 final report at the central level. 22 June 2022.
<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/bc2d630c1af0481b93b6bf88684ea55a.shtml>
Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report. July 2022. <http://ysss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/>

Comment:**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: See answer to previous questions in YER-3. the correct url is <http://ysss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/>

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

Researcher Response

Agree. thanks a lot.

YER-5. If the YER is published, are the numerical data contained in the YER available in a machine readable format?

Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) and HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>

Option "d" applies if the YER is not publicly available, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.

Answer:

c. No

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 final report at the central level. 22 June 2022.
<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/bc2d630c1af0481b93b6bf88684ea55a.shtml>
Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report. July 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/>

Comment:

All information is presented in the form of HTML files. Thus, it does not meet the requirements of the machine-readable format.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: delete first source.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

YER-6a. If the YER is not publicly available, is it still produced?

If the YER is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question YER-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.

Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question YER-2)

Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.

Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.

Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.

Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.

If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.

Answer:

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Source:**Comment:****Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

YER-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question YER-6a, please specify how you determined whether the YER was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question YER-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

n/a.

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

YER-7. If the YER is produced, please write the full title of the YER.

For example, a title for the Year-End Report could be "Consolidated Financial Statement for the Year Ended 31 March 2022" or "Annual Report 2021 Published by the Ministry of Finance and Planning." If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

2021 final report at the central level

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 final report at the central level. 22 June 2022.
<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/bc2d630c1af0481b93b6bf88684ea55a.shtml>
Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report. July 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/>

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: National Government Final Accounts (2021)

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

YER-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the YER?

While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see: <https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>.

Answer:

b. No

Source:

Xinhua Agency, Central government revenue to exceed 9 trillion yuan in 2021. 21 June 2022. https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-06/21/content_5696994.htm

Xinhua Agency, 102 central departments make public 2021 departmental accounts. 22 July 2022. https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-07/22/content_5702149.htm

People's Daily, Central departments disclose clear revenue and expenditure accounts (policy interpretation). <http://politics.people.com.cn/n1/2022/0727/c1001-32486375.html>

Comment:

First, the government's official websites published summarized reports related to relevant contents, including important data on public budget revenues and expenditures, as well as an introduction to the public budget transparency system (the first and second sources).

Second, following the release of detailed tables in the MYR, official media outlets like People's Daily also provided analytical reports to help the public grasp the key content of the MYR (the third source).

However, these reports contain very limited fiscal information of the YER. Thus, I don't consider them as a citizen budget.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

AR-1. What is the fiscal year of the AR evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer:

FY 2021

Source:

National People's Congress, Audit report on 2021 central budget implementation and other fiscal revenue and expenditure. 22 June 2022.

<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/17a7dc825750458ba00b85e5d7b6b18e.shtml>

National Audit Office, Auditing report on 2021 central budget implementation and relevant work. 21 June 2022.

<https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n25/c10252123/content.html>

Comment:

The audit report in the first source disclosed the overall audit findings and various illegal and disciplinary issues. The second source published detailed audit issues concerning various departments of the central government.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: however, it should again be noted that the links above refer only to audits of the central government budget, which is a small fraction of the national budget. Local government budget audits are available from this url: <https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n1482/index.html>

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

AR-2. When is the AR made available to the public?

Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the

time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.

The OBS methodology requires that for an AR to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public no later than 18 months after the end of the fiscal year to which it corresponds. If the AR is not released to the public at least 18 months after the end of the fiscal year to which it corresponds, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the AR.

Answer:

a. Six months or less after the end of the budget year

Source:

National People's Congress, Audit report on 2021 central budget implementation and other fiscal revenue and expenditure. 22 June 2022.

<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/17a7dc825750458ba00b85e5d7b6b18e.shtml>

National Audit Office, Auditing report on 2021 central budget implementation and relevant work. 21 June 2022.

<https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n25/c10252123/content.html>

Comment:

The audit report in the first source disclosed the overall audit findings and various illegal and disciplinary issues. The second source published detailed audit issues concerning various departments of the central government.

Both reports can be considered as AR and were released to the public before the six months after the end of the budget year.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: b. 12 months or less, but more than six months, after the end of the budget year

Comments: The first url no longer works. The second link above refers to audit of selected central government departments. the correct link for audit of the central budget is <https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n26/c10252052/part/10252146.pdf>. The publication date is 21/6/2022. Audit of local government budgets is <https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n1482/index.html> . Their publication dates are later - in August and September.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

Researcher Response

Agree with the reviewer's comment. The second link and the link provided by him/her indicated the same day: 21 June 2022. Given that the fiscal year ends at 31 December 2021, 21 June 2022 is within 6 months (?).

AR-3a. If the AR is published, what is the date of publication of the AR?

Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.

Answer:

21/6/2022

Source:

National People's Congress, Audit report on 2021 central budget implementation and other fiscal revenue and expenditure. 22 June 2022.

<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/17a7dc825750458ba00b85e5d7b6b18e.shtml>

Comment:

The publication date is shown in the website.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: the url no longer works. As explained in previous question: the correct link for audit of the central budget is <https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n26/c10252052/part/10252146.pdf>. The publication date is 21/6/2022 - shown on the website. Audit of local government budgets is <https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n1482/index.html> . Their publication dates are later - in August and September.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

Researcher Response

here is the updated link: <https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n25/c10252123/content.html>

AR-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the AR.

If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

It is stated in the website that the document was published on 21 June 2022.

Source:

National People's Congress, Audit report on 2021 central budget implementation and other fiscal revenue and expenditure. 22 June 2022.
<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/17a7dc825750458ba00b85e5d7b6b18e.shtml>

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: see answer in AR-3a.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

AR-4. If the AR is published, what is the URL or weblink of the AR?

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.

Answer:

<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/17a7dc825750458ba00b85e5d7b6b18e.shtml>

Source:

National People's Congress, Audit report on 2021 central budget implementation and other fiscal revenue and expenditure. 22 June 2022.
<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/17a7dc825750458ba00b85e5d7b6b18e.shtml>
National Audit Office, Auditing report on 2021 central budget implementation and relevant work. 21 June 2022.
<https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n25/c10252123/content.html>

Comment:

The audit report in the first source disclosed the overall audit findings and various illegal and disciplinary issues. The second source published detailed audit issues concerning various ministries of the central government.
Both reports can be considered as AR.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: <https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n26/c10252052/content.html> see also answer in previous questions

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

AR-5. If the AR is published, are the numerical data contained in the AR available in a machine readable format?

Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) and HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>

Option "d" applies if the AR is not publicly available, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.

Answer:

c. No

Source:

National People's Congress, Audit report on 2021 central budget implementation and other fiscal revenue and expenditure. 22 June 2022.

<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/17a7dc825750458ba00b85e5d7b6b18e.shtml>

National Audit Office, Auditing report on 2021 central budget implementation and relevant work. 21 June 2022.

<https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n25/c10252123/content.html>

Comment:

All information is presented in the form of HTML files. Thus, it does not meet the requirements of the machine-readable format.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: but see answer in previous questions for correct url. <https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n26/c10252052/content.html>

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

AR-6a. If the AR is not publicly available, is it still produced?

If the AR is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question AR-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.

Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question AR-2).

Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.

Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.

Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.

Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.

If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.

Answer:

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Source:

National People's Congress, Audit report on 2021 central budget implementation and other fiscal revenue and expenditure. 22 June 2022.

<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/17a7dc825750458ba00b85e5d7b6b18e.shtml>

National Audit Office, Auditing report on 2021 central budget implementation and relevant work. 21 June 2022.

<https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n25/c10252123/content.html>

Comment:

AR is publicly available.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

AR-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question AR-6a, please specify how you determined whether the AR was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question AR-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

n/a.

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

AR-7. If the AR is produced, please write the full title of the AR.

For example, a title for the Audit Report could be "Annual General Reports of the Controller and Auditor General." If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

Audit report on 2021 central budget implementation and other fiscal revenue and expenditure

Source:

National People's Congress, Audit report on 2021 central budget implementation and other fiscal revenue and expenditure. 22 June 2022.

<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/17a7dc825750458ba00b85e5d7b6b18e.shtml>

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: But url should be <https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n26/c10252052/content.html>

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

AR-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the AR?

While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see: <https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>.

Answer:

b. No

Source:

National Audit Office, [Interpretation] Adhering to the centralized and unified leadership of the Party Central Committee, and based on the role of economic supervision, we actively prepare for the successful convening of the 20th National Congress of the Party through practical actions. 24 June 2022. <https://www.audit.gov.cn/n11/n536/n980/c10249418/content.html>
Xinhua Agency, Understanding the 2021 Annual Audit Report from the perspectives of "specialization, depth, and stability". 22 June 2022. https://www.gov.cn/zhengce/2022-06/22/content_5697037.htm

Comment:

After the release of the AR, both the website of the National Audit Office and the State Council published related articles. The first source comprehensively summarized the various aspects and data of financial audits and provided a link to the full text of AR, aiming to reach out to the general public.
On the other hand, the second source presented a more concise version. It featured interviews with the head of the National Audit Office and relevant experts, offering the public different perspectives and interpretations of the report.
These two sources, however, may not meet the requirement of the citizen budget as it does not contain comprehensive and straightforward information.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

GQ-1a. Are there one or more websites or web portals for disseminating government fiscal information? If yes, please provide the necessary links in the comment/citation.

GQ-1a asks the researcher to list any government websites or portals where fiscal information can be found. For example, in New Zealand the Treasury website (<http://www.treasury.govt.nz/>) hosts important budget-related information, including the Pre-Budget Statement, the Executive's Budget Proposal, the Citizens Budget, In-Year Reports, the Mid-Year Review, and the Year-End Report. In addition, New Zealand's Parliamentary Counsel Office (<http://www.legislation.govt.nz/>) posts the Enacted Budget while the Controller and Auditor-General website (<http://www.oag.govt.nz/>) publishes the annual

Audit Report. The New Zealand researcher would provide the links to each of these sites. Other countries have developed portals that include fiscal information, though not in the "documents" format. For example, these portals have been created by Mexico (<https://www.transparenciapresupuestaria.gob.mx/>) and Brazil (<http://www.portaltransparencia.gov.br/>). Some countries have both a website and a portal. The Brazilian government, for example, apart from the Transparency Portal, has a dedicated website for the federal budget, where all key documents and other information can be found (<https://www.gov.br/economia/pt-br/assuntos/planejamento-e-orcamento/orcamento>). Researchers should include details about all of the relevant websites and/or portals that can be used to access budget information.

Answer:

a. Yes

Source:

Ministry of Finance, <http://www.mof.gov.cn/index.htm>
National Audit Office, <http://www.audit.gov.cn/>
State Council, <http://www.gov.cn/>
National People's Congress, <http://www.npc.gov.cn/>
Chinese Communist Party website, <http://www.12371.cn/>
Xinhua Agency, <http://www.xinhuanet.com/>
People's Daily, https://paper.people.com.cn/rmrb/html/2021-04/16/nbs.D110000renmrb_01.htm
Central Budget and Final Accounts Public Platform, <http://www.mof.gov.cn/zyjsgkpt/>

Comment:

Generally speaking, the MOF, State Council, National People's Congress, and Chinese Communist Party website provide important documents related to the budget, including the Pre-Budget Statement, the Executive's Budget Proposal, the Citizens Budget, In-Year Reports, the Mid-Year Review, and the Year-End Report.

In addition, official media outlets such as Xinhua Agency and People's Daily will disseminate government fiscal information and provide policy interpretations.

Apart from the official websites, the MOF has also established a dedicated platform website called the Central Budget and Final Accounts Public Platform. This platform integrates budgetary and final accounts information from the central government and central departments and provides details of specific projects related to non-tax revenues.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

GQ-1b. On these websites/portals, can revenue and/or expenditure data for the current fiscal year be downloaded as a consolidated, machine readable file (or set of files)? If yes, please provide the necessary links in the comment/citation. For more information on machine readability, see:

<http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>.

GQ-1b, GQ-1c, and GQ-1d ask about whether governments publish specific types of content on their websites/portals: (a) consolidated files that contain disaggregated revenue and/or expenditure information for the current fiscal year; (b) consolidated files that contain disaggregated revenue and/or expenditure information for multiple years in consistent formats; and (c) infographics/visualizations or other similar tools used to simplify data access and analysis. Researchers should provide the links to relevant webpages and some explanations of what they contain.

Answer:

d. No, neither expenditure or revenue data can be downloaded as a consolidated file

Source:

Ministry of Finance, <http://www.mof.gov.cn/index.htm>
National Audit Office, <http://www.audit.gov.cn/>
State Council, <http://www.gov.cn/>
National People's Congress, <http://www.npc.gov.cn/>
Chinese Communist Party website, <http://www.12371.cn/>
Xinhua Agency, <http://www.xinhuanet.com/>
People's Daily, https://paper.people.com.cn/rmrb/html/2021-04/16/nbs.D110000renmrb_01.htm
Central Budget and Final Accounts Public Platform, <http://www.mof.gov.cn/zyjsgkpt/>

Comment:

All information is presented in the form of HTML files. And there is no available way to download a consolidated, machine-readable file.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

GQ-1c. On these websites/portals, can disaggregated revenue and/or expenditure data in consolidated, machine readable files be downloaded for multiple years in consistent formats? If yes, please provide the necessary links and details in the comment/citation. For more information on machine readability, see: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>.

Answer:

d. No, neither expenditure or revenue data can be downloaded for multiple years in consistent formats

Source:

Ministry of Finance, <http://www.mof.gov.cn/index.htm>

National Audit Office, <http://www.audit.gov.cn/>

State Council, <http://www.gov.cn/>

National People's Congress, <http://www.npc.gov.cn/>

Chinese Communist Party website, <http://www.12371.cn/>

Xinhua Agency, <http://www.xinhuanet.com/>

People's Daily, https://paper.people.com.cn/rmrb/html/2021-04/16/nbs.D110000renmrb_01.htm

Central Budget and Final Accounts Public Platform, <http://www.mof.gov.cn/zyjsgkpt/>

Comment:

In most cases, the relevant file only provides the information for the fiscal year under consideration. Correspondent figures of previous years are not provided.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

GQ-1d. On these websites/portals, are infographics/visualizations or other similar tools used to simplify data access and analysis? If yes, please provide the necessary links and details in the comment/citation.

GQ-1d asks the researcher to list any government websites or portals where infographics/visualizations or other similar tools used to simplify data access and analysis are present. For example, in South Africa the Vulekamali portal (<https://vulekamali.gov.za>) is a project by the National Treasury which contains visualizations of the Consolidated Budget Summary, by departments budget, by division of revenue and by infrastructure budget distribution. (See for example <https://vulekamali.gov.za/2022-23/national/departments/basic-education/>). Other countries that have developed portals that include fiscal visualization and graphics include: Brazil's Transparency Portal (<https://portaldatransparencia.gov.br/>), which presents line graphs, bar graphs, pie charts, and visual maps of electronic invoices, public expenditure, public revenue, annual budget, transferred resources, resources transferred by location of beneficiary, among other information. (<https://portaldatransparencia.gov.br/orcamento> and <https://portaldatransparencia.gov.br/transferencias>). Additionally, United States Department of the Treasury, Fiscal Data portal (<https://fiscaldata.treasury.gov/>) is a one-stop shop for federal financial data that uses charts, exhibits, and figures.

Answer:

b. No

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Graphic representation of the national accounts. 17 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caijingshidian/cjzylm/202203/t20220317_3795924.htm

Comment:

In most cases, the above-mentioned links only provide the full text of the reports. Some policy interpretation news might include simple chart data. However, these websites do not include visualized tools for data representation or analysis.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

GQ-2. Are there laws in place guiding public financial management and/or auditing? If yes, please provide the necessary details and links in the comment/citation, and specify whether and where the law(s) contains specific provisions for budget transparency and/or participation.

GQ-2 asks about the existence of any national laws governing public financial management and auditing. These may include a public finance act, a section of the constitution, or an organic budget law. In some countries, fiscal responsibility legislation may also be relevant. For example, the Kenya researcher may include the link to its Public Finance Management Act, 2012 (<http://kenyalaw.org/8181/exist/kenyalex/actview.xql?actid=No.%2018%20of%202012>), and the Macedonian researcher may include a link to its State Audit Law (<https://finance.gov.mk/wp-content/uploads/2009/05/Audit-law.pdf>). Researchers should provide links to websites where such laws are published, if possible, or an electronic copy of the law itself. They should also indicate if and where (e.g. which article) these laws include specific provisions for budget transparency and citizen participation in budget processes.

Answer:

a. Yes

Source:

National People's Congress, Budget Law, effective since 1 January 2015. https://www.gov.cn/zhengce/content/2020-08/20/content_5536179.htm
State Council, Regulations on the Implementation of the Budget Law. effective since 1 October 2020, published on 3 August 2020.
http://www.gov.cn/zhengce/content/2020-08/20/content_5536179.htm
National Audit Office, Audit Law, <https://www.audit.gov.cn/n6/n36/n10083637/c10191187/content.html>

Comment:

The Budget Law specifies in its first article that one goal is to establish a transparent financial management system. Moreover, Article 14 specifies that budget proposals, final reports and government procurement information should be disclosed to the public within a given period. Article 6 in the regulations promulgated by State Council further provides detailed requirements on financial information disclosure. Article 4 of the Audit Law stipulates that administrative organs shall submit audit work reports to the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress (NPC), and it defines the scope of the audits. The key areas of focus include the audit of budget execution and its performance, as well as the audit of state-owned resources and state-owned assets.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

GQ-3. Is there at least one additional law regulating: (1) access to information; (2) government transparency; or (3) citizens participation? If yes, please provide

the necessary details and links in the comment/citation, and specify whether and where these laws contain specific provisions for budget transparency and/or participation.

The third and last question asks researchers to list any additional laws regulating access to information, transparency, or citizens' participation that are relevant for the promotion of budget transparency and citizen participation in budget processes. These might include legislation related to access to information, to planning processes, or to public administration more generally. India's Right to Information Act of 2005 (<https://www.ncess.gov.in/facilities/central-public-information-officer/rti-act-details.html>) is an example of this type of law. For more information on access to information legislation (constitutional provisions, laws, and regulations), including examples of model laws, see: <https://www.rti-rating.org/country-data/> and <https://www.constituteproject.org/>.

Answer:

a. Yes

Source:

State Council, Regulation on Open Government Information, effective since 15 May 2019. http://www.gov.cn/zhengce/content/2019-04/15/content_5382991.htm

Comment:

The regulation provides detailed requirements on government information disclosure, including the general guidelines, disclosure contents and responsible institutions, proactive disclosure, disclosure according to application, and monitoring and supporting arrangements. In particular, Article 20 specifies that budget proposal and final reports should be disclosed to the public.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

1. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 1 addresses the presentation of expenditure by administrative unit. This information indicates which government entity (ministry, department, or agency, or MDAs) will be responsible for spending the funds and, ultimately, held accountable for their use.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for all administrative units, accounting for all expenditures, in the budget year. To answer "b," the administrative units shown individually, in the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation, must account for at least two-thirds of all expenditures in the budget year. In other words, the sum of the expenditures assigned to the individual MDAs (education, health, infrastructure, interior, defense, etc.) must account for at least two-thirds of the total expenditure budgeted for that particular year. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents administrative units that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by administrative unit.

Answer:

d. No, expenditures are not presented by administrative unit.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

State Council, National People's Congress approved the 2022 budget proposal. 1 March 2022. https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-03/11/content_5678444.htm

Ministry of Finance, Report on the Execution of the Central and Local Budgets for 2021 and on the Draft Central and Local Budgets for 2022. 14 March 2022. http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220314_3794760.htm

Ministry of Finance, 2022 Central Budget documents. 24 March 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2022zyczys/index.htm>

Ministry of Finance, Central Budget and Final Accounts Public Platform. http://www.mof.gov.cn/zyjsgkpt/zybmyjs/bmys/index_5.html

Comment:

The MOF submitted the budget proposal to the Congress on March 5th and released the abstract of the budget proposal on the same day. This abstract publishes important data and policies aimed at improving fiscal transparency at the central level. After approval by the Congress on March 11th, the complete budget proposal will be made available to the public on March 14th, followed by the publication of detailed tables on March 24th.

The EBP is not available to the public. Thus, D is the answer.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

2. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year by functional classification?

GUIDELINES:

Question 2 addresses the presentation of expenditure by functional classification. This classification indicates the programmatic purpose, sector, or objective for which the funds will be used, such as health, education, or defense. Administrative units are not necessarily aligned with functional classifications. For instance, in one country all functions connected with water supply (which fall into the "Housing" function) may be undertaken by a single government agency, while in another country they may be distributed across the Ministries of Environment, Housing, and Industrial Development. In the latter case, three ministries have programs addressing water supply, so three ministries contribute to one function. Similarly, some administrative units may conduct activities that cut across more than one function. For instance, in the example above, some programs of the Ministry of Environment would also be classified in the "environmental protection" function.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for the budget year organized by functional classification.

Answer:

b. No, expenditures are not presented by functional classification.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the Execution of the Central and Local Budgets for 2021 and on the Draft Central and Local Budgets for 2022. 14 March 2022. http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220314_3794760.htm
Ministry of Finance, 2022 Central Budget documents. 24 March 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2022zyczys/index.htm>

Comment:

The first and second links disclosed the functional expenditure. However, the publication date is later than when EBP was approved (11 March 2022).

Thus, B is the answer of this indicator based on the OBS methodology.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

3. If the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation presents expenditures for the budget year by functional classification, is the functional classification compatible with international standards?

GUIDELINES:

Question 3 asks whether a country's functional classification meets international standards. To answer "a," a country's functional classification must be aligned with the OECD and the UN's Classification of the Functions of Government (COFOG), or provide a cross-walk between the national functional presentation and COFOG.

The OECD Best Practices for Budget Transparency can be viewed at <http://www.oecd.org/gov/budgeting/Best%20Practices%20Budget%20Transparency%20-%20complete%20with%20cover%20page.pdf>

COFOG can be viewed at https://unstats.un.org/unsd/publication/SeriesM/SeriesM_84E.pdf or at <http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/ch6ann.pdf>.

Answer:

b. No, the functional classification is not compatible with international standards, or expenditures are not presented by functional classification.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the Execution of the Central and Local Budgets for 2021 and on the Draft Central and Local Budgets for 2022. 14 March 2022. http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220314_3794760.htm
Ministry of Finance, 2022 Central Budget documents. 24 March 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2022zyczys/index.htm>

Comment:

According to the question 2, the documents were not within the acceptable time frame of OBS methodology, so the answer here should be b.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

4. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year by economic classification?

GUIDELINES:

Question 4 asks whether the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents expenditures for the budget year organized by economic classification. Economic classification provides information on the nature of the expenditure, such as whether funds are being used to pay for wages and salaries, capital projects, or social assistance benefits. Please note that a presentation of expenditures by current and capital expenditures without additional disaggregation or detail will not qualify as an economic classification.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for the budget year organized by economic classification.

Answer:

b. No, expenditures are not presented by economic classification.

Source:

Comment:

The EBP does not provide the economic classification information.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion:

5. If the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation presents expenditures for the budget year by economic classification, is the economic classification compatible with international standards?

GUIDELINES:

Question 5 asks whether a country's economic classification meets international standards. To answer "a," a country's economic classification must be consistent with the International Monetary Fund's (IMF) 2001 Government Finance Statistics (GFS). The GFS economic classification is presented here: <http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/app4.pdf>. To learn more about Government Finance Statistics also refer to the entire IMF 2001 GFS manual (<http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/all.pdf>).

Answer:

b. No, the economic classification is not compatible with international standards, or expenditures are not presented by economic classification.

Source:

Comment:

According to the answer of question 4, the answer here should be b.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

6. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 6 asks whether expenditures are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should treat the term "program" as meaning any level of detail below an administrative unit – that is, any programmatic grouping that is below the ministry, department, or agency level. For example, the Ministry of Health's budget could be broken down into several subgroups, such as "primary health care," "hospitals," or "administration." These subgroups should be considered programs even if they could be, but are not, broken down into smaller, more detailed units.

A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as le plan comptable or le plan comptable detaillé. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures, in the budget year. To answer "b," the programs shown individually in the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must account for at least two-thirds of all expenditures in the budget year. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents programs that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by program.

Budget decisions for the upcoming year can also affect the parameters of future budgets. It is therefore useful to estimate revenues and expenditures for multi-year periods, understanding that these estimates might be revised as circumstances change. Sometimes referred to as a Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF), a three-year period – that is, the budget year plus two more years – is generally considered an appropriate horizon for budgeting and planning.

Answer:

d. No, expenditures are not presented by program.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not include any program spending information.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

7. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditure estimates for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 7 asks if multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by any one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications – which were addressed in Questions 1-5 above. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditure estimates by all three of the expenditure classifications for at least two years beyond the budget year. To answer "b," multi-year expenditure estimates must be presented by two of these three classifications. A "c" answer applies if multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented by any of the three classifications.

Answer:

d. No, multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented by any expenditure classification.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not include any expenditure classification.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

7b. Based on the response to Question 7, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications have estimates for a multi-year period in the Executive's Budget Proposal?

Answer:

None of the above

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not include any expenditure classification.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

8. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditure estimates for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year) by program?**GUIDELINES:**

Question 8 asks if multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department. For example, the Ministry of Health's budget could be broken down into several subgroups, such as "primary health care," "hospitals," or "administration." These subgroups should be considered programs even if they could be, but are not, broken down into smaller, more detailed units.

A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as *le plan comptable* or *le plan comptable detaillé*. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures, for at least two years beyond the budget year. To answer "b," the programs shown individually in the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must account for at least two-thirds of all expenditures over the multi-year period. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents multi-year estimates for programs that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if multi-year estimates are not presented by program.

Revenues generally are separated into two major categories: "tax" and "non-tax" revenues. Taxes are compulsory transfers that result from government exercising its sovereign power. The largest sources of tax revenue in some countries are taxes on personal and business income and taxes on goods and services, such as sales or value-added taxes. The category of non-tax revenues is more diverse, ranging from grants from international institutions and foreign governments to funds raised through the sale of government-provided goods and services. Note that some forms of revenue, such as contributions to social security funds, can be considered either a tax or non-tax revenue depending on the nature of the approach to these contributions. Particularly because different revenues have different characteristics, including who bears the burden of paying the tax and how collections are affected by economic conditions, it is helpful when estimates for revenues are disaggregated and displayed based on their sources.

For more information, please refer to the 2001 GFS manual, in particular Appendix 4 (<http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/app4.pdf>).

Answer:

d. No, multi-year estimates for programs are not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present multi-year

expenditure estimates.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

9. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present the individual sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 9 assesses the degree to which the individual sources of "tax" revenue are disaggregated in the budget. The largest sources of tax revenue in some countries are taxes on personal and business income and taxes on goods and services, such as sales or value-added taxes.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present all individual sources of tax revenue for the budget year, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all tax revenue. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present individual sources of tax revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all tax revenue, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents individual sources of tax revenue that account for less than two-thirds of tax revenues. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of tax revenue are not presented.

Answer:

d. No, individual sources of tax revenue are not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present individual sources of tax revenue.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

10. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present the individual sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of government-produced goods and services) for the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 10 assesses the degree to which the individual sources of "non-tax" revenue are disaggregated in the budget. The category of non-tax revenues is diverse, and can include revenue ranging from grants from international institutions and foreign governments to funds raised through the sale of government-provided goods and services.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present all individual sources of non-tax revenue for the budget year, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all non-tax revenue. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present individual sources of non-tax revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all non-tax revenue, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents individual sources of non-tax revenue that account for less than two-thirds of non-tax revenues. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of non-tax revenue are not presented.

Answer:

d. No, individual sources of non-tax revenue are not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. This abstract presents some sources of non-tax revenues and corresponding figures, i.e., a total of 276.5 billion yuan was transferred from the central stabilization fund, and 990 billion yuan was transferred from the central governmental fund and central state-owned capital fund. But it does not disclose details.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

11. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax) for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 11 evaluates whether revenue estimates are presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year) by "category," that is, whether tax and non-tax sources of revenue are shown separately.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present multi-year estimates of revenues classified by category for at least two years following the budget year in question.

Answer:

b. No, multi-year estimates of revenue are not presented by category.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present revenue estimates by category.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

12. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates for individual sources of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 12 evaluates whether revenue estimates for individual sources of revenue are presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year). The question applies to both tax and non-tax revenue.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present multi-year estimates of all sources of revenue individually, accounting for all revenue, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all revenue. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present multi-year estimates of individual sources of revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all revenue, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents multi-year estimates of individual revenue sources that account for less than two-thirds of revenue. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of revenue are not presented for a multi-year period.

Answer:

d. No, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue are not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present any multiple-year information for individual sources.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

13. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 13 asks about three key estimates related to borrowing and debt that the budget should include:

- the amount of net new borrowing required during the entire budget year;
- the central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year; and
- the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the entire budget year.

Debt is the accumulated amount of money that the government borrows. The government can borrow from its citizens and banks and businesses within the country (domestic debt) or from creditors outside the country (external debt). External debt is typically owed to private commercial banks, other governments, or international financial institutions such as the World Bank and the IMF.

Net new borrowing is the additional amount of new borrowing that is required for the budget year to finance expenditures in the budget that exceed available revenues. Net new borrowing adds to the accumulated debt. It is distinct from gross borrowing, which also includes borrowing needed to repay existing debt that matured during the budget year; debt that is replaced (or rolled over) does not add to the total of accumulated debt. For the purposes of this question, the deficit may be accepted as a proxy for net new borrowing.

Interest payments on the debt (or debt service costs) are typically made at regular intervals, and these payments must be made on a timely basis in order to avoid defaulting on the debt obligation. Interest payments are separate from the repayment of principal, which occurs only when the loan has matured and must be paid back in full.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present all three estimates of borrowing and debt. For a "b" answer, the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present two of those three estimates. For a "c" answer, the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present one of the three estimates. Answer "d" applies if no information on borrowing and debt is presented for the entire budget year.

Answer:

d. No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. The abstract provides important information, such as the figures for local government special debt revenue, the limit on local government general debt balance, and the limit on special debt balance.

However, it does not release estimates related to government borrowing and debt required here.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

13b. Based on the response to Question 13, check the box(es) below to identify which estimates of government borrowing and debt are presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal:

Answer:

None of the above

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. The abstract provides important information, such as the figures for local government special debt revenue, the limit on local government general debt balance, and the limit on special debt balance.

However, it does not release estimates related to government borrowing and debt required by the indicator.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

14. "Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year?

(The core information must include interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)"

GUIDELINES:

Question 14 focuses on the composition of government debt at the end of the budget year, asking whether “core” information related to its composition is presented. These core components include:

- interest rates on the debt;
- maturity profile of the debt; and
- whether the debt is domestic or external.

The interest rates affect the amount of interest that must be paid to creditors. The maturity profile indicates the final payment date of the loan, at which point the principal (and all remaining interest) is due to be paid; government borrowing typically includes a mix of short-term and long-term debt. As discussed in Question 13, domestic debt is held by a country’s citizens, banks, and businesses, while external debt is held by foreigners. These factors related to the composition of the debt give an indication of the potential vulnerability of the country’s debt position, and ultimately whether the cost of servicing the accumulated debt is affordable.

Beyond these core elements, a government may also provide additional information related to the composition of its debt, including for instance: whether interest rates are fixed or variable; whether debt is callable; the currency of the debt; a profile of the creditors (bilateral institutions, multilateral institutions, commercial banks, Central Bank, etc.); an analysis of the risk associated with the debt; and where appropriate, what the debt is being used to finance.

To answer “a,” the Executive’s Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to the composition of government debt at the end of the budget year as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer “b,” the Executive’s Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer “b” is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A “c” answer applies if some information related to the composition of government debt is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer “d” applies if no information is presented on the composition of the debt outstanding at the end of the budget year.

Answer:

d. No, information related to composition of total debt outstanding is not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And none of the core information about total debt outstanding was presented in the abstract.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

14b. Based on the response to Question 14, check the box(es) to identify which elements of the composition of the total debt outstanding are are presented in the Executive’s Budget Proposal:

Answer:

None of the above

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And none of the core information about total debt outstanding was presented in the abstract.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion:

15. "Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?"

(The core information must include a discussion of the economic outlook with estimates of nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)"

GUIDELINES:

Question 15 focuses on the macroeconomic forecast that underlies the budget's revenue and expenditure estimates, asking whether "core" information related to the economic assumptions is presented. These core components include a discussion of the economic outlook as well as estimates of the following:

- *nominal GDP level;*
- *inflation rate;*
- *real GDP growth; and*
- *interest rates.*

While the core macroeconomic information should be a standard feature of the Executive's Budget Proposal, the importance of some types of macroeconomic assumptions may vary from country to country. For example, the budget estimates of some countries are particularly affected by changes in the price of oil and other commodities.

Beyond these core elements, some governments also provide additional information related to the economic outlook, including for instance: short and long-term interest rates; rate of employment and unemployment; GDP deflator; price of oil and other commodities; current account; exchange rate; and composition of GDP growth.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to the macroeconomic forecast as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to the macroeconomic forecast is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information on the macroeconomic forecast is presented.

Answer:

d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present any information on the macroeconomic forecast.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion:

15b. Based on the response to Question 15, check the box(es) to identify which elements of the macroeconomic forecast are included in the Executive's Budget Proposal:

Answer:

None of the above

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present any information on the macroeconomic forecast.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

16. "Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget?"

(The core information must include estimates of the impact on expenditures, revenue, and debt of different assumptions for the inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)"

GUIDELINES:

Question 16 focuses on the issue of whether the Executive's Budget Proposal shows how different macroeconomic assumptions affect the budget estimates (known as a "sensitivity analysis"). It asks whether "core" information related to a sensitivity analysis is presented, estimating the impact on expenditures, revenue, and debt of different assumptions for:

- *inflation rate;*
- *real GDP growth; and*
- *interest rates.*

A sensitivity analysis shows the effect on the budget of possible changes in some macroeconomic assumptions, and is important for understanding the impact of the economy on the budget; for instance, what would happen to revenue collections if GDP growth were slower than what is assumed in the budget proposal? Or what would happen to expenditure if inflation were higher than estimated? Or how will revenue be affected by a decrease in the price of oil?

As noted for Question 15, changes in certain macroeconomic assumptions, such as the price of oil and other commodities, can have a significant impact on the budget estimates. As a result, some sensitivity analyses may also examine the impact on the budget estimates of changes in assumptions such as the price of oil that are beyond the core elements of the inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.

For an example of how a sensitivity analysis may be presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal, see the following:

- *The United States in its 2021 Budget Analytical Perspectives includes a section titled Sensitivity of the Budget to Economic Assumptions along with a table that shows the impact of each economic scenario on revenues, spending, and the deficit. (see pages 16 – 17, <https://www.govinfo.gov/content/pkg/BUDGET-2021-PER/pdf/BUDGET-2021-PER.pdf>).*
- *The Philippines in its 2021 Budget of Expenditures and Sources of Financing (BESF) presents the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on expenditures, revenue, and debt (see page 131, Table A.6 titled "Budget Sensitivity to Macroeconomic Parameters, 2021," <https://www.dbm.gov.ph/wp-content/uploads/BESF/BESF2021/A6.pdf>); pages 12-13, Technical Notes on the 2021 Proposed National Budget*

<https://www.dbm.gov.ph/images/pdffiles/Technical-Notes-on-the-2021-Proposed-National-Budget.pdf>.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to a "sensitivity analysis" as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to a "sensitivity analysis" is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information on "sensitivity analysis" is presented.

Answer:

d. No, information related to different macroeconomic assumptions is not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present any information related to different macroeconomic assumptions.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

17. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how new policy proposals, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 17 and 18 ask about new policy proposals in the budget. In any given year, most of the expenditures and revenues in the budget reflect the continuation of existing policies. However, much of the attention during the budget debate is focused on new proposals – whether they call for eliminating an existing program, introducing a new one, or changing an existing program at the margins. Typically, these new proposals are accompanied by an increase, a decrease, or a shift in expenditures or revenues. Because these changes may have different impacts on people's lives, the budget proposal should present sufficient detail about new policies and their budgetary impact.

Question 17 asks about new expenditure policies, and Question 18 asks about new revenue policies. To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present both estimates of how all new policy proposals affect expenditures (for Question 17) or revenues (for Question 18) and a narrative discussion of the impact of these new policies. To answer "b" for either question, the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present estimates that show the impact of all new policy proposals, but no narrative discussion is included. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes only a narrative discussion of the impact of the new policies, or if it includes estimates that show the impact of only some, but not all, policy proposals (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on the impact of new policy proposals.

Answer:

d. No, information that shows how new policy proposals affect expenditure is not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. The abstract provides information regarding the implementation of new policies and their expenditures, such as corporate tax refund policy, employment subsidy funds (617.58 billion yuan, increased by 51.68 billion yuan), new urbanization construction (400 billion yuan), and rural revitalization grant funds (1650 billion yuan, increased by 84.76 billion yuan).

Based on the IBP feedback last year, D should be the answer as the abstract is not a comprehensive file.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

18. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how new policy proposals, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 17 and 18 ask about new policy proposals in the budget. In any given year, most of the expenditures and revenues in the budget reflect the continuation of existing policies. However, much of the attention during the budget debate is focused on new proposals – whether they call for eliminating an existing program, introducing a new one, or changing an existing program at the margins. Typically, these new proposals are accompanied by an increase, a decrease, or a shift in expenditures or revenues. Because these changes may have different impacts on people's lives, the budget proposal should present sufficient detail about new policies and their budgetary impact.

Question 17 asks about new expenditure policies, and Question 18 asks about new revenue policies. To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present both estimates of how all new policy proposals affect expenditures (for Question 17) or revenues (for Question 18) and a narrative discussion of the impact of these new policies. To answer "b" for either question, the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present estimates that show the impact of all new policy proposals, but no narrative discussion is included. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes only a narrative discussion of the impact of the new policies, or if it includes estimates that show the impact of only some, but not all, policy proposals (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on the impact of new policy proposals.

Prior-year information constitutes an important benchmark for assessing the proposals for the upcoming budget year. Estimates of prior years should be presented in the same formats (in terms of classification) as the budget year to ensure that year-to-year comparisons are meaningful. For example, if the budget proposes shifting responsibility for a particular program from one administrative unit to another – such as shifting responsibility for the training of nurses from the health department to the education department – the prior-year figures must be adjusted before year-to-year comparisons of administrative budgets can be made.

Typically, when the budget proposal is submitted, the year prior to the budget year (BY-1), also known as the current year, has not ended, so the executive will provide estimates of the anticipated outcome for BY-1. The soundness of these estimates is directly related to the degree to which they have been updated to reflect actual expenditures to date, legislative changes that have occurred, and anticipated changes in macroeconomic, caseload, and other relevant factors for the remainder of the year.

The first year that can reflect actual outcomes, therefore, is generally two years before the budget year (BY-2). Thus the OECD recommends that data covering at least two years before the budget year (along with two years of projections beyond the budget year) are provided in order to assess fully the trends in the budget.

Answer:

d. No, information that shows how new policy proposals affect revenues is not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. The abstract provides some policy guidelines which may affect revenue arrangement. In particular, the abstract emphasizes enhancing market vitality and ensuring the well-being of the people, while appropriately reducing the deficit rate and continuing to maintain an active fiscal policy.

Again, as the abstract does not meet the comprehensiveness requirement, the answer should be D.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

19. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 19 asks if expenditure estimates for the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) are presented by one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. (See Questions 1-5 above.)

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditure estimates for BY-1 by all three of the expenditure classifications. To answer "b," expenditure estimates for BY-1 must be presented by two of these three classifications. A "c" answer applies if expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if expenditure estimates for BY-1 are not presented by any of the three classifications.

Answer:

d. No, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are not presented by any expenditure classification.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present the three expenditure classifications.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

20. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 20 asks if expenditure estimates for the year before the budget year (BY-1) are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department. For example, the Ministry of Health's budget could be broken down into several subgroups, such as "primary health care," "hospitals," or "administration." These subgroups should be considered programs even if they could be, but are not, broken down into smaller, more detailed units.

A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as *le plan comptable* or *le plan comptable detaillé*. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures, for BY-1. To answer "b," the programs shown individually in the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must account for at least two-thirds of all expenditures for BY-1. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents programs that account for only less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by program.

Answer:

d. No, expenditures are not presented by program for BY-1.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present expenditures for individual programs.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

21. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, have expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditures?

GUIDELINES:

Question 21 asks whether the expenditure estimates for the year before the budget year (BY-1) have been updated from the original enacted levels. Updates can reflect actual experience to date; revised estimates due to shifting of funds by the executive, as permitted under the law; enactment of supplemental budgets; and revised assumptions regarding macroeconomic conditions, caseload, and other relevant factors for the remainder of the year.

Answer "a" applies if the estimates have been updated; answer "b" applies if the original estimates are still being used.

Answer:

b. No, expenditure estimates for BY-1 have not been updated from the original enacted levels.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. The abstract introduces the actual expenditure for the previous fiscal year and compares it with the budgeted figure.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

22. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of expenditure for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 22 asks if expenditure estimates for more than one year prior to the budget year (BY-2 and prior years) are presented by any of the three expenditure

classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. (See Questions 1-5 above.)

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years by all three of the expenditure classifications. To answer "b," expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years must be presented by two of these three classifications. A "c" answer applies if expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are not presented by any of the three classifications

Answer:

d. No, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are not presented by any expenditure classification.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present information of expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

22b. Based on the response to Question 22, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications have estimates for more than one year prior to the budget year in the Executive Budget Proposal:

Answer:

None of the above

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present information of expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

23. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for more than one year preceding the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 23 asks if expenditure estimates for more than one year before the budget year (BY-2 and prior years) are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department. For example, the Ministry of Health's budget could be broken down into several subgroups, such as "primary health care," "hospitals," or "administration." These subgroups should be considered programs even if they could be, but are not, broken down into smaller, more detailed units.

A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as *le plan comptable* or *le plan comptable detaillé*. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures, for BY-2 and prior years. To answer "b," the programs shown individually in the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must account for at least two-thirds of all expenditures for BY-2 and prior years. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents programs that account for only less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by program.

Answer:

d. No, expenditures are not presented by program for BY-2 and prior years.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present such information.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

24. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?

GUIDELINES:

Question 24 asks for which year the actual outcomes for expenditures are shown. In most cases, the most recent year for which budget data on actual outcomes are available will be BY-2, as BY-1 is generally not yet finished when the budget proposal is drafted. So a government that has updated all its expenditure data for BY-2 to reflect what actually occurred, as opposed to estimating the outcome for that year, shows good public financial management practice.

For an "a" answer, a country must meet the good practice of having the figures for BY-2 reflect actual outcomes.

Answer:

d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. The abstract presents expenditures for the BY-1, which is not included in the options.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion:

25. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue by category (such as tax and non-tax) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.

Answer:

b. No, revenue estimates for BY-1 are not presented by category.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. The abstract reports the actual tax and non-tax revenues for the BY-1.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion:

26. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present individual sources of revenue for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.

Answer:

d. No, individual sources of revenue are not presented for BY-1.

Source:

Comment:

EBP is not available to the public.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

27. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, have the original estimates of revenue for the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) been updated to reflect actual revenue collections?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.

Answer:

b. No, revenue estimates for BY-1 have not been updated from the original enacted levels.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. The abstract introduces the actual revenue for the previous fiscal year and compares it with the budgeted figure.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

28. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax) for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.

Answer:

b. No, revenue estimates for BY-2 and prior years are not presented by category.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present any BY-2 information.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

29. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present individual sources of revenue for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.

Answer:

d. No, individual sources of revenue are not presented for BY-2 and prior years.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present any information for BY-2 and for prior years.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

30. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.

Answer:

d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. The abstract presents revenue for the BY-1, which is not included in the options.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

31. "Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?"

(The core information must include the total debt outstanding at the end of BY-1; the amount of net new borrowing required during BY-1; interest payments on the debt; interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)"

GUIDELINES:

Question 31 focuses on prior-year debt information, rather than on prior-year expenditures or revenues, asking whether "core" information is provided on government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1).

The "core" information includes:

- total debt outstanding at the end of BY-1;
- amount of net new borrowing required during BY-1;
- interest payments on the debt;
- interest rates on the debt instruments;
- maturity profile of the debt; and
- whether it is domestic or external debt.

This core information for BY-1 is consistent with the budget year information for borrowing and debt, which is examined in Questions 13 and 14. Please note that for the purposes of this question, the deficit may be accepted as a proxy for net new borrowing.

In addition, some governments provide information beyond the core elements, such as gross new borrowing required during BY-1; currency of the debt; whether the debt carries a fixed or variable interest rate; whether it is callable; a profile of the creditors (bilateral institutions, multilateral institutions, commercial banks, Central Bank, etc.); where appropriate, what the debt is being used to finance.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for BY-1 as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to government borrowing and debt, including its composition, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on government borrowing and debt for BY-1.

Answer:

d. No, information related to government debt is not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. The abstract reports some information related to borrowing and debt. It presents the amount of central deficit for BY-1 and the guideline of deficit budget for 2022.

However, EBP is not available to the public.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

32. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?

GUIDELINES:

Question 32 asks for which year the actual outcome for total debt outstanding is shown. In most cases, the most recent year for which budget data on actual outcomes are available will be BY-2, as BY-1 is generally not yet finished when the budget proposal is drafted. So a government that has updated its debt data for BY-2 to reflect what actually occurred, as opposed to estimating the outcome for that year, shows good public financial management practice.

For an "a" answer, a country must meet the good practice of having the figures for BY-2 reflect actual outcomes.

It is essential that all government activities that may have an impact on the budget – in the current budget year or in future budget years – be fully disclosed to the legislature and the public in budget documents. In some countries, for instance, entities outside central government (such as public corporations) undertake fiscal activities that could affect current and future budgets. Similarly, activities that can have a significant impact on the budget, such as payment arrears and contingent liabilities, sometimes are not properly captured by the regular presentations of expenditure, revenue, and debt.

Answer:

d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present any information for actual debt figures for BY-2.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

33. "Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on extra-budgetary funds for at least the budget year?"

(The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the extra-budgetary fund; and complete income, expenditure, and financing data on a gross basis.)"

GUIDELINES:

Question 33 focuses on extra-budgetary funds, asking whether "core" information related to these funds, which exist outside the budget, are presented. These core components include:

- a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the extra-budgetary fund (i.e., why was a particular fund set up? what is it used for?); and
- estimates of its income, expenditure, and financing. (These estimates should be presented on a gross basis so that it is possible to tell how much money flows through each extra-budgetary fund.)

In most countries, governments engage in certain budgetary activities that are not included in the central government's budget. Known as extra-budgetary funds, they can range in size and scope. For example, countries frequently set up pension and social security programs as extra-budgetary funds, where the revenues collected and the benefits paid are recorded in a separate fund outside the budget. Another example of an extra-budgetary fund can be found in countries dependent on hydrocarbon/mineral resources, where revenues from producing and selling those resources are channeled through systems outside the annual budget.

In some cases, the separation engendered by an extra-budgetary fund serves a legitimate political purpose, and the finances and activities of these funds are well documented. In other cases, however, this structure is used for obfuscation, and little or nothing is known about a fund's finances and activities.

The availability of information related to extra-budgetary funds is essential for a comprehensive understanding of the government's true fiscal position. In addition to the core information, other information about extra-budgetary funds is also desirable. Such information includes a discussion of the risks associated with the extra-budgetary fund; expenditures classified by economic, functional, or administrative unit; and the rules and procedures that govern the operations and management of the extra-budgetary fund.

For more information about extra-budgetary funds, see the *Guide to Transparency in Public Finances: Looking Beyond the Core Budget* (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/Looking-Beyond-the-Budget.pdf>) and Principle 2.1.1 of the IMF's *Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018)* (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to extra-budgetary funds as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. A "b" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation presents all of the core information. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to extra-budgetary funds is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on extra-budgetary funds.

Please provide in the comments a list of all known extra-budgetary funds.

Answer:

d. No, information related to extra-budgetary funds is not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. The abstract provides some information related to extra-budgetary funds. For example, it presents the amount of local government bonds to ensure the construction of key projects.

However, EBP is not available to the public.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

34. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present central government finances (both budgetary and extra-budgetary) on a consolidated basis for at least the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 34 asks whether the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documents present the finances of the central government on a consolidated basis, showing both its budgetary and extra-budgetary activities. Virtually all of the questions in the OBS questionnaire focus on budgetary central government – the activities of the ministries, departments, or agencies of central government. In addition, Question 33 asks about extra-budgetary funds, such as social security funds that are not included in the budget.

Coverage is an important aspect of fiscal reporting. Budget documents should cover the full scope of government's financial activity. In many countries, extra-budgetary activities are substantial, and can represent a sizable share of the central government's activities. To get a full picture of the central government's finances, therefore, it is necessary to examine both activities that are included in the budget and those that are extra-budgetary. This question asks whether such a consolidated presentation of central government finances, including both revenues and expenditures, is provided.

The central government is only one component of the overall public sector. The public sector also includes other levels of government, such as state and local government, and public corporations. (See Box 2.1 under Principle 1.1.1 of the IMF's *Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018)*: <https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>) For the purpose of answering this question, please consider only the central government level.

In order to answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present central government finances (both budgetary and extra-budgetary) on a consolidated basis for at least the budget year.

Answer:

b. No, central government finances are not presented on a consolidated basis.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the IBP standards, only the abstract of the budget proposal was released before the legislature's approval. In China, there are four accounts at the national level: general revenue account, government-managed fund (revenues mainly from land sales), state capital operation budget, and social security fund.

The abstract provides all information for these four accounts at both the central and local levels. In other words, both budget and extra-budget information is covered.

the EBP is not available.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

35. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of intergovernmental transfers for at least the budget year?**GUIDELINES:**

Question 35 asks about intergovernmental transfers. In many cases, the central government supports the provision of a good or service by a lower level of government through an intergovernmental transfer of funds. This is necessary because, independent from the level of administrative decentralization that exists in a given country, the capacity for revenue collection of a local government is unlikely to be sufficient to pay for all its expenses. However, because the activity is not being undertaken by an administrative unit of the central government, it is unlikely to receive the same level of review in the budget. Thus it is important to include in the budget proposal a statement that explicitly indicates the amount and purposes of these transfers.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year both estimates covering all intergovernmental transfers and a narrative discussing these transfers. If a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all intergovernmental transfers are presented, then a "b" answer is appropriate. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, intergovernmental transfers (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no estimates of intergovernmental transfers are presented.

Answer:

d. No, estimates of intergovernmental transfers are not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. The abstract provides intergovernmental transfer information. For example, the abstract states the amount of central to local transfers (82,215.94 billion yuan) in 2021, and this figure will grow to 89,975 billion yuan, an increase of 8.4%.

It also includes data on various components of local government transfers, such as transfers from the central governmental fund to local governments, and transfers from the budget of central state-owned capital fund to local governments.

However, the narrative discussion is not comprehensive.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

b. Yes, estimates of all intergovernmental transfers are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

Comments: since the amounts of all intergovernmental transfers are presented in the abstract, I believe the correct answer is b.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

IBP Comment

Many thanks to peer reviewer for their comments. However, they are referring to information in the Enacted Budget Law. The Budget Proposal was never published. Answer choice D is maintained.

36. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present alternative displays of expenditures (such as by gender, by age, by income, or by region) to illustrate the financial impact of budget policies on different groups of citizens, for at least the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 36 asks about "alternative displays" of expenditures that highlight the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens. As discussed above, expenditures are typically presented by at least one of three classifications – administrative, functional, and economic classifications (see Questions 1-5) – and by individual program (Question 6). In addition, governments can provide alternative displays to emphasize different aspects of expenditure policies and to show who benefits from these expenditures.

For the purpose of answering this question, the alternative presentation must differ from the presentations (such as administrative, functional, or economic classifications or presentation by program) used to answer other questions. The alternative display can cover all expenditures or only a portion of expenditures. For instance, it can show how all expenditures are distributed according to geographic region or it can show how selected expenditures (such as the health budget or the agriculture budget) are distributed to different regions. But such a geographic display must be something different than the presentation of intergovernmental transfers used to answer question 35. One exception is when a country includes a special presentation of all policies intended to benefit the most impoverished populations (and is used to answer Question 52) then that can be considered an alternative display for purposes of answering this question as well. Finally, brief fact sheets showing how proposals in the budget benefit particular groups would be insufficient; only more detailed presentations would be considered.

The IBP Budget Brief, "How Transparent are Governments When it Comes to Their Budget's Impact on Poverty and Inequality?"

(<https://www.internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/government-transparency-of-budgets-impact-on-poverty-inequality-ibp-2019.pdf>) includes a discussion of the importance of alternative displays of budget information and provides a number of examples. For instance,

- *Bangladesh in its 2017-18 Budget included a detailed supplementary Gender Budgeting Report, which presents the spending dedicated to advancing women across various departments. (<https://mof.portal.gov.bd/site/page/3bb14732-b5b1-44df-9921-efedf1496295>).*
- *The UK's 2017 budget included a supplementary analysis that provided a distributional analysis of the budget by households in different income groups (see https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/661465/distributional_analysis_autumn_budget_2017.pdf).*
- *South Africa's 2017 Budget Review goes beyond the standard presentation of intergovernmental transfers, discussing the redistribution that results from national revenue flowing to the provinces and municipalities and presenting the allocations on a per capita basis (see chapter 6, <http://www.treasury.gov.za/documents/national%20budget/2017/review/FullBR.pdf>).*

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must include at least three different presentations that illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens for at least the budget year. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must include at least two different alternative displays of expenditures. A "c" applies if only one type of alternative display of expenditure is presented. Answer "d" applies if no alternative display of expenditure is presented.

Answer:

d. No, alternative displays of expenditures are not presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present information regarding to alternative displays of expenditures.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

36b. Based on the response to Question 36, select the box(es) below to identify which types of alternative displays are included in the Executive's Budget Proposal:

Answer:

None of the above

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present information regarding to alternative displays of expenditures.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

37. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of transfers to public corporations for at least the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 37 asks about transfers to public corporations. It is often the case that governments have a stake in enterprises that manage resources that are particularly relevant for the public good (such as electricity, water, and oil). While these public corporations can operate independently, in some cases the government will provide direct support by making transfers to these corporations, including to subsidize capital investment and operating expenses.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year both estimates covering all transfers to public corporations and a narrative discussing the purposes of these transfers. If a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all transfers to public corporations are presented, then a "b" answer is appropriate. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, transfers to public corporations (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "c" also applies if estimates of transfers to public corporations are presented as a single line item. Answer "d" applies if no estimates of transfers to public corporations are presented.

Please provide in the comments a list of all known public corporations.

Answer:

d. No, estimates of transfers to public corporations are not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. Transfers from the central government to public corporations are included in the central to local transfers. However, the abstract does not separately list the estimate of transfers to public corporations.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

38. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on quasi-fiscal activities for at least the budget year?

(The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the quasi-fiscal activity and the intended beneficiaries.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 38 focuses on quasi-fiscal activities, asking whether "core" information related to such activities is presented. These core components include:

- *A statement of purpose or policy rationale for the quasi-fiscal activity (i.e., what is the reason for engaging in this activity?);*
- *The identification of intended beneficiaries of the quasi-fiscal activity.*

The term "quasi-fiscal activities" refers to a broad range of activities that are fiscal in character and could be carried out through the regular budget process but are not. For example, a quasi-fiscal activity could take place if, instead of providing a direct subsidy through the budget for a particular activity, a public financial institution provides an indirect subsidy by offering loans at below-market rates for that activity. Similarly, it is a quasi-fiscal activity when an enterprise provides goods or services at prices below commercial rates to certain individuals or groups to support the government's policy goals.

The above examples are policy choices that may be approved by the government and legislature. However, quasi-fiscal activities can also involve activities that violate or circumvent a country's budget process laws or are not subject to the regular legislative approval process for expenditures. For example, the executive may issue an informal order to a government entity, such as a public commercial enterprise, to provide the executive with goods and services that normally would have to be purchased with funding authorized by the legislature. All quasi-fiscal activities should be disclosed to the public and subject to public scrutiny.

Beyond the core information, some governments may also provide other information about quasi-fiscal activities, including for example: the anticipated duration of the quasi-fiscal activity; a quantification of the activity and the assumptions that support these estimates; and a discussion of the fiscal significance and potential risks associated with the activity, including the impact on the entity carrying out the activity. Principle 3.3.2 of the IMF's Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>) provides examples of quasi-fiscal activities that can be consulted as needed. And more details on quasi-fiscal activities can be found in the Guide to Transparency in Public Finances: Looking Beyond the Core Budget (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/Looking-Beyond-the-Budget.pdf>).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to all quasi-fiscal activities for at least the budget year as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to quasi-fiscal activities is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on quasi-fiscal activities.

If quasi-fiscal activities do not represent a significant problem in your country, please mark "e." However, please exercise caution in answering this question.

Answer:

d. No, information related to quasi-fiscal activities is not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present information regarding to quasi-fiscal activities.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion:

39. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government for at least the budget year?

(The core information must include a listing of the assets, and an estimate of their value.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 39 focuses on financial assets held by the government, asking whether "core" information related to these assets is presented. These core components include:

- A listing of the financial assets; and
- An estimate of their value.

Governments own financial assets such as cash, bonds, or equities. Unlike private sector businesses, however, few governments maintain balance sheets that show the value of their assets and liabilities.

Beyond the core information, some governments may also provide other information about financial assets, including for example: a discussion of their purpose; historical information on defaults; differences between reported values and market values; and a summary of financial assets as part of the government's balance sheet.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year all of the core information related to all financial assets held by the government as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to financial assets is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on financial assets held by the government.

Answer:

d. No, information related to financial assets is not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present information on financial assets.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion:

40. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on nonfinancial assets held by the government for at least the budget year?

(The core information must include a listing of the assets by category.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 40 focuses on nonfinancial assets held by the government, asking whether "core" information related to these assets is presented. The core information is a listing of nonfinancial assets, grouped by the type (or category) of asset.

Nonfinancial assets are things of value that the government owns or controls (excluding financial assets) such as land, buildings, and machinery. The valuation of public nonfinancial assets can be problematic, particularly in cases where the asset is not typically available on the open market (such as a government monument). In these cases, it is considered acceptable to provide summary information in budget documents from a country's register of assets. But, in some cases, governments are able to value their nonfinancial assets; some present a summary of nonfinancial assets as part of their balance sheets. For an example of how nonfinancial assets are presented in one of the many supporting documents to the New Zealand Executive's Budget Proposal, see the Forecast Financial Statement 2011, Notes to the Financial Statements (Continued), Note 14, accessible here: <https://treasury.govt.nz/sites/default/files/2011-05/befu11-pt6of8.pdf>.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year a listing by category of all nonfinancial assets held by the government as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to nonfinancial assets is presented, but some nonfinancial assets are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on nonfinancial assets held by the government.

Answer:

d. No, information related to nonfinancial assets is not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not report information on nonfinancial assets.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

41. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of expenditure arrears for at least the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 41 asks about estimates of expenditure arrears, which arise when government has entered into a commitment to spend funds but has not made the payment when it is due. (For more information see sections 3.49-3.50 of the IMF's GFS Manual 2001, <http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/all.pdf> (page 29)). Though equivalent to borrowing, this liability is often not recorded in the budget, making it difficult to assess fully a government's financial position. Moreover, the obligation to repay this debt affects the government's ability to pay for other activities.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year both estimates covering all expenditure arrears and a narrative discussing the arrears. If a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all expenditure arrears are presented, then a "b" answer is appropriate. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, expenditure arrears (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no estimates of expenditure arrears are presented. Answer "d" also applies if information is only available for the changes in arrears, and not the stock or balance of arrears.

If expenditure arrears do not represent a significant problem in your country, please mark "e." However, please exercise caution in answering this question. Public expenditure management laws and regulations often will allow for reasonable delays, perhaps 30 or 60 days, in the routine payment of invoices due. Expenditure arrears impacting a small percentage of expenditure that are due to contractual disputes should not be considered a significant problem for the purpose of answering this question.

Answer:

d. No, estimates of expenditure arrears are not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not include information on expenditure arrears.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

42. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities, such as government loan guarantees or insurance programs, for at least the budget year?

(The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each contingent liability; the new guarantees or insurance commitments proposed for the budget year; and the total amount of outstanding guarantees or insurance commitments (the gross exposure) at the end of the budget year.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 42 focuses on contingent liabilities, asking whether "core" information related to these liabilities is presented. These core components include:

- a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each contingent liability;
- the new contingent liabilities for the budget year, such as new guarantees or insurance commitments proposed for the budget year; and
- the total amount of outstanding guarantees or insurance commitments at the end of the budget year. This reflects the gross exposure of the government in the case that all guarantees or commitments come due (even though that may be unlikely to occur).

Contingent liabilities are recognized under a cash accounting method only when the contingent event occurs and the payment is made. An example of such liabilities is the case of loans guaranteed by the central government, which can include loans to state-owned banks and other state-owned commercial enterprises, subnational governments, or private enterprises. Under such guarantees, government will only make a payment if the borrower defaults. Thus a key issue for making quantitative estimates of these liabilities is assessing the likelihood of the contingency occurring.

In the budget, according to the OECD, "[w]here feasible, the total amount of contingent liabilities should be disclosed and classified by major category reflecting their nature; historical information on defaults for each category should be disclosed where available. In cases where contingent liabilities cannot be quantified, they should be listed and described."

Beyond the core information, some governments may also provide other information about contingent liabilities, including for example: historical default rates for each program, and likely default rates in the future; the maximum guarantee that is authorized by law; any special financing associated with the guarantee (e.g., whether fees are charged, whether a reserve fund exists for the purpose of paying off guarantees, etc.); the duration of each guarantee; and an estimate of the fiscal significance and potential risks associated with the guarantees.

For more details on contingent liabilities, see *Guide to Transparency in Public Finances: Looking Beyond the Core Budget* (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/Looking-Beyond-the-Budget.pdf>) and page 59 (Box 11) and Principle 3.2.3 of the IMF's *Fiscal Transparency Handbook* (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year all of the core information related to contingent liabilities as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to contingent liabilities is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on contingent liabilities.

Answer:

d. No, information related to contingent liabilities is not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not report information on contingent liabilities.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

43. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present projections that assess the government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term?

(The core information must cover a period of at least 10 years and include the macroeconomic and demographic assumptions used and a discussion of the fiscal implications and risks highlighted by the projections.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 43 focuses on government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer-term, asking whether "core" information related to these issues is presented. These core components must include:

- *Projections that cover a period of at least 10 years.*
- *The macroeconomic and demographic assumptions used in making the projections.*
- *A discussion of the fiscal implications and risks highlighted by the projections. Good public financial management calls for budgets to include fiscal sustainability analyses.*

The IMF's Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>) recommends that governments regularly publish the projected evolution of the public finances over the longer term (see Principle 3.1.3.). Future liabilities are a particularly important element when assessing the sustainability of public finances over the long term. Future liabilities are the result of government commitments that, unlike contingent liabilities, are virtually certain to occur at some future point and result in an expenditure. A typical example consists of government obligations to pay pension benefits or cover health care costs of future retirees. Under a cash accounting system, only current payments associated with such obligations are recognized in the budget. To capture the future impact on the budget of these liabilities, a separate statement is required.

Beyond the core information, some governments may also provide other information about the sustainability of their finances, including for example: projections that cover 20 or 30 years; multiple scenarios with different sets of assumptions; assumptions about other factors (such as the depletion of natural resources) that go beyond just the core macroeconomic and demographic data; and a detailed presentation of particular programs that have long time horizons, such as civil service pensions.

For more details on future liabilities, see Guide to Transparency in Public Finances: Looking Beyond the Core Budget (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/Looking-Beyond-the-Budget.pdf>).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to future liabilities and the sustainability of government finances over the longer term as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to future liabilities is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on future liabilities and the sustainability of government's finances

Answer:

d. No, information related to future liabilities and the sustainability of finances over the longer term is not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not report information on the government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

44. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind, for at least the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 44 asks about estimates of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind assistance. Such assistance is considered non-tax revenue, and the sources of this assistance should be explicitly identified. In terms of in-kind assistance, the concern is primarily with the provision of goods (particularly those for which there is a market that would allow goods received as in-kind aid to be sold, thereby converting them into cash) rather than with in-kind aid like advisors from a donor country providing technical assistance.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year both estimates covering all donor assistance and a narrative discussing the assistance. If a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all donor assistance are presented, then a "b" answer is appropriate. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, donor assistance (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "c" also applies if the sources of donor assistance are not presented, but the total amount of donor assistance is presented as a single line item. Answer "d" applies if no estimates of donor assistance are presented. Select answer "e" if your country does not receive donor assistance.

Answer:

d. No, estimates of the sources of donor assistance are not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present information on donor assistance.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

45. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on tax expenditures for at least the budget year?

(The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each tax expenditure, the intended beneficiaries, and an estimate of the revenue foregone.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 45 focuses on tax expenditures, asking whether “core” information related to these tax preferences is presented. These core components must include for both new and existing tax expenditures:

- a statement of purpose or policy rationale;
- a listing of the intended beneficiaries; and
- an estimate of the revenue foregone.

Tax expenditures arise as a result of exceptions or other preferences in the tax code provided for specified entities, individuals, or activities. Tax expenditures often have the same impact on public policy and budgets as providing direct subsidies, benefits, or goods and services. For example, encouraging a company to engage in more research through a special tax break can have the same effect as subsidizing it directly through the expenditure side of the budget, as it still constitutes a cost in terms of foregone revenues. However, expenditure items that require annual authorization are likely to receive more scrutiny than tax breaks that are a permanent feature of the tax code.

Beyond the core information, some governments may also provide other information about tax expenditures, including for example: the intended beneficiaries by sector and income class (distributional impact); a statement of the estimating assumptions, including the definition of the benchmark against which the foregone revenue is measured; and a discussion of tax expenditures as part of a general discussion of expenditures for those program areas that receive both types of government support (in order to better inform policy choices). For more details on tax expenditures, see *Guide to Transparency in Public Finances: Looking Beyond the Core Budget* (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/Looking-Beyond-the-Budget.pdf>) and Principle 1.1.4 of the IMF’s *Fiscal Transparency Handbook* (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>).

To answer “a,” the Executive’s Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present, for at least the budget year, all of the core information related to tax expenditures as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer “b,” the Executive’s Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer “b” is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A “c” answer applies if some information related to tax expenditures is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer “d” applies if no information is presented on tax expenditures.

Answer:

d. No, information related to tax expenditures is not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present any core information on tax expenditure.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

46. Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of earmarked revenues for at least the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 46 asks about estimates of earmarked revenues, which are revenues that may only be used for a specific purpose (for example, revenues from a tax on fuel that can only be used for building roads). This information is important in determining which revenues are available to fund the government’s general expenses, and which revenues are reserved for particular purposes.

To answer “a,” the Executive’s Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year both estimates covering all individual earmarked revenues and a narrative discussing the earmarks. If a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all individual earmarked revenues are presented, then a “b” answer is appropriate. A “c” response applies if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, earmarked revenues (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer “d” applies if no estimates of earmarked revenues are presented. An “e” response applies if revenue is not earmarked or the practice is disallowed by law or regulation.

Answer:

d. No, estimates of earmarked revenues are not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. While the abstract shows estimates of general revenues, such as revenues from central state-owned capital fund, it does not disclose earmarked revenues.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

b. Yes, estimates of all earmarked revenues are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

Comments: Earmarked revenues are presented in the Government Fund Budget, the State Assets Operating Budget, and the Social Security Funds Budget in the abstract of the budget proposal.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

IBP Comment

Many thanks to peer reviewer for their comments. However, they are referring to information in the Enacted Budget Law. The Budget Proposal was never published. Answer choice D is maintained.

47. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on how the proposed budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to government's policy goals for the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 47 and 48 ask about information that shows how the budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to the government's policy goals. The budget is the executive's main policy document, the culmination of the executive's planning and budgeting processes. Therefore, it should include a clear description of the link between policy goals and the budget – that is, an explicit explanation of how the government's policy goals are reflected in its budget choices. For an example of a discussion of a government's policy goals in the budget, see pages 13-18 of New Zealand's 2011 Statement of Intent (<http://www.treasury.govt.nz/publications/abouttreasury/soi/2011-16>), one of the many documents supporting its budget.

In some countries the government prepares strategic/development plans. These plans include all the policies the government is planning to implement for the budget year and very often cover a multi-year perspective. In some cases, these plans do not match the budget documentation, and it is possible that they are completely disconnected from the Executive's Budget Proposal. So the question is examining whether government policy plans are "translated" into revenue and expenditure figures in the actual budget documents.

Question 47 asks about the information covering the budget year, and Question 48 asks about the period at least two years beyond the budget year. To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present both estimates of how the budget is linked to government's policy goals for the budget year (for Question 47) or for a multi-year period beyond the budget year (for Question 48) and a narrative discussion of how these policy goals are reflected in the budget. To answer "b" for either question, the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present estimates that show how the budget is linked to government's policy goals, but no narrative discussion is included. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes only a narrative discussion, or if it includes estimates that show how the budget is linked to some, but not all, of the government's policy goals (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on how the budget is linked to government's policy goals.

Answer:

d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government's stated policy goals for the budget year is not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. The abstract presents the budgets for some key policies, such as employment subsidies (617.58 billion yuan), urbanization and public service supply (400 billion yuan), and rural revitalization grants (1650 billion yuan).

This part of narrative discussion is very brief and does not include all government policy goals.

However, the EBP is not available.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

48. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on how the proposed budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to government's policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 47 and 48 ask about information that shows how the budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to the government's policy goals. The budget is the executive's main policy document, the culmination of the executive's planning and budgeting processes. Therefore, it should include a clear description of the link between policy goals and the budget – that is, an explicit explanation of how the government's policy goals are reflected in its budget choices. For an example of a discussion of a government's policy goals in the budget, see pages 13-18 of New Zealand's 2011 Statement of Intent (<http://www.treasury.govt.nz/publications/abouttreasury/soi/2011-16>), one of the many documents supporting its budget.

In some countries the government prepares strategic/development plans. These plans include all the policies the government is planning to implement for the budget year and very often cover a multi-year perspective. In some cases, these plans do not match the budget documentation, and it is possible that they are completely disconnected from the Executive's Budget Proposal. So the question is examining whether government policy plans are "translated" into revenue and expenditure figures in the actual budget documents.

Question 47 asks about the information covering the budget year, and Question 48 asks about the period at least two years beyond the budget year. To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present both estimates of how the budget is linked to government's policy goals for the budget year (for Question 47) or for a multi-year period beyond the budget year (for Question 48) and a narrative discussion of how these policy goals are reflected in the budget. To answer "b" for either question, the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present estimates that show how the budget is linked to government's policy goals, but no narrative discussion is included. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes only a narrative discussion, or if it includes estimates that show how the budget is linked to some, but not all, of the government's policy goals (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on how the budget is linked to government's policy goals.

Answer:

d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government's stated policy goals for a multi-year period is not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not present information regarding to a multi-year period.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

49. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired for at least the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 49 asks about the availability of nonfinancial data on inputs for the budget year. (Nonfinancial data on outputs and outcomes are addressed in Question 50.)

The budget should disclose not only the amount of money that is being allocated on a program but also any information needed to analyze that expenditure. Nonfinancial data and performance targets associated with budget proposals are used to assess the success of a given policy. For example, even when allocated funds are spent according to plan, there remains the question of whether the policy delivered the results that it aimed to achieve.

Nonfinancial data can include information on:

Inputs - These are the resources assigned to achieve results. For example, in regards to education, nonfinancial data on inputs could include the number of books to be provided to each school or the materials to be used to build or refurbish a school.

Outputs - These are products and services delivered as a result of inputs. For example, the number of pupils taught every year; the number of children that received vaccines; or the number of beneficiaries of a social security program.

Outcomes - These are the intended impact or policy goals achieved. For example, an increase in literacy rates among children under 10, or a reduction in rates of maternal mortality.

In addition, governments that set performance targets must use nonfinancial data for outputs and outcomes to determine if these targets have been met.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present, for at least the budget year, nonfinancial data on inputs for each individual program within all administrative units (ministries, departments, and agencies). It is also acceptable if nonfinancial data on inputs for each individual program is organized by functions. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present nonfinancial data on inputs for all administrative units or all functions, but not for each individual program (or even for any programs) within those administrative units or functions. A "c" response applies if nonfinancial data on inputs are presented only for some programs and/or some administrative units or some functions. Answer "d" applies if no nonfinancial data on inputs is presented.

Answer:

d. No, nonfinancial data on inputs are not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not report information regarding to non-financial information on inputs.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

50. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present nonfinancial data on results (in terms of outputs or outcomes) for at least the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 50 asks about the availability of nonfinancial data on results for the budget year. Nonfinancial data on results can include data on both outputs and outcomes, but not on inputs (which are addressed in Question 49).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present, for at least the budget year, nonfinancial data on results for each individual program within all administrative units (ministries, departments, and agencies). It is also acceptable if nonfinancial data on results for each individual program is organized by functional classification. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present nonfinancial data on results for all administrative units or all functional classifications, but not for each individual program (or even for any programs) within those administrative units or functions. A "c" response applies if nonfinancial data on results are presented only for some programs and/or some administrative units or some functions. Answer "d" applies if no nonfinancial data on results is presented.

Answer:

d. No, nonfinancial data on results are not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And it does not report the non-financial information on results.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

51. Are performance targets assigned to nonfinancial data on results in the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation?**GUIDELINES:**

Question 51 asks about performance targets assigned to nonfinancial data on results for the budget year. The question applies to those nonfinancial results shown in the budget, and that were identified for purposes of Question 50.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must assign performance targets to all nonfinancial data on results shown in the budget for at least the budget year. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must assign performance targets to a majority (but not all) of the nonfinancial data on results shown in the budget. A "c" response applies performance targets are assigned only to less than half of the nonfinancial data on results. Answer "d" applies if no performance targets are assigned to nonfinancial data on results shown in the budget, or the budget does not present nonfinancial results.

Answer:

d. No, performance targets are not assigned to nonfinancial data on results, or the budget does not present nonfinancial data on results.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. And performance targets assigned to nonfinancial data on results cannot find in the abstract.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

52. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of policies (both new proposals and existing policies) that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations in at least the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 52 asks whether the budget highlight policies, both new and existing, that benefit the poorest segments of society. This question is intended to assess only those programs that directly address the immediate needs of the poor, such as through cash assistance programs or the provision of housing, rather than indirectly, such as through a stronger national defense. This information is of particular interest to those seeking to bolster government's commitment to anti-poverty efforts. For purposes of answering this question, a departmental budget (such as for the Department of Social Welfare) would not be considered acceptable. In general, this question is asking whether the EBP includes a special presentation that pulls together estimates of all the relevant policies in one place. However, if the country uses "program budgeting," where programs are presented as expenditure categories with specific and identified objectives, and it identifies anti-poverty programs within each administrative unit, then that is also acceptable for this question.

The IBP Budget Brief, "How Transparent are Governments When it Comes to Their Budget's Impact on Poverty and Inequality?"

(<https://www.internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/government-transparency-of-budgets-impact-on-poverty-inequality-ibp-2019.pdf>) includes a discussion of countries that have provided information on how its policies affect the poor.

For instance, Pakistan provides a detailed breakdown of pro-poor expenditure as part of its 2017-18 budget proposal. In one document, the government sets out policy priorities, expected outputs, and estimates of past and future spending for several programs aimed at poverty alleviation. Another supporting document provides a comprehensive overview of ongoing policies, including a chapter on social safety nets, covering both financial and performance information of poverty alleviation schemes over a period of eight years. (http://www.finance.gov.pk/budget/mtbf_2018_21.pdf and http://www.finance.gov.pk/survey_1718.html).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must for at least the budget year both present estimates covering all policies that are intended to benefit the most impoverished populations and include a narrative discussion that specifically addresses these policies. (For countries using program budgeting that breaks out individual anti-poverty programs, there should be a separate narrative associated with each such program.) Answer "b" if a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all policies that are intended to benefit the most impoverished populations are presented. Answer "c" if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, policies that are intended to benefit the most impoverished populations (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" if no estimates of policies that are intended to benefit the most impoverished populations are presented.

Answer:

d. No, estimates of policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

According to the OBS methodology, only the abstract of the budget proposal is within the acceptable time frame. The abstract reports goals related to poverty alleviation. However, this goal is included in the rural revitalization fund and the abstract just provide a brief discussion.

Therefore, we do not know for the specific funds that directly support the most impoverished population. D should be the answer.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

53. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the Ministry of Finance or whatever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 53 asks about the budget timetable. An internal timetable is particularly important for the executive's management of the budget preparation process, in order to ensure that the executive accounts for the views of the different departments and agencies in the proposed budget. The timetable would, for instance, set deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the Ministry of Finance or whatever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation. So that civil society is aware of the various steps in the budget formulation process, and when opportunities may exist to engage the executive, it is essential that this timetable be made available to the public.

To answer "a," the executive must prepare a detailed budget timetable and release it to the public. A "b" answer applies if the timetable is made public, but some details are not included. A "c" response applies if the timetable is made public, but many important details are excluded, reducing its value for those

outside government. Answer "d" applies if no timetable is made available to the public. As long as a timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal is released, answer "a," "b," or "c" may be selected, even if the Executive's Budget Proposal is not made publicly available.

Answer:

d. No, a timetable is not issued to the public.

Source:

Comment:

We do not find any open access documents releasing the timetable.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

54. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?

(The core information must include a discussion of the economic outlook with estimates of nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 54 focuses on the macroeconomic forecast that underlies the Pre-Budget Statement, asking whether "core" information related to the economic assumptions is presented. These core components include a discussion of the economic outlook as well as estimates of the following:

- nominal GDP level;
- inflation rate;
- real GDP growth; and
- interest rates.

Beyond these core elements, some governments also provide additional information related to the economic outlook, including for instance: short- and long-term interest rates; the rate of employment and unemployment; GDP deflator; price of oil and other commodities; current account; exchange rate; and composition of GDP growth.

To answer "a," the Pre-Budget Statement must present all of the core information related to the macroeconomic forecast as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Pre-Budget Statement must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to the macroeconomic forecast is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information on the macroeconomic forecast is presented.

Answer:

d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.

Source:

Comment:

See the comments in PBS-2. The PBS was not released to the public. Therefore, the answer should be D here.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

55. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the government's expenditure policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?

(The core information must include a discussion of expenditure policies and priorities and an estimate of total expenditures.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 55 focuses on the government's expenditure policies and priorities in the Pre-Budget Statement, asking whether "core" information related to these policies is presented. These core components include:

- *a discussion of expenditure policies and priorities; and*
- *an estimate of total expenditures.*

Although a Pre-Budget Statement is unlikely to include detailed programmatic proposals (such detailed information is typically only presented in the budget itself), it should include a discussion of broad policy priorities and a projection of at least total expenditures associated with these policies for the budget year. The Pre-Budget Statement can include some detail, for instance, estimates provided by any of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications.

To answer "a," the Pre-Budget Statement must present for the upcoming budget year all of the core information related to the government's expenditure policies and priorities as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Pre-Budget Statement must present all of the core components noted above for the upcoming budget year. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to the government's expenditure policies and priorities is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information on the government's expenditure policies and priorities is presented.

Answer:

d. No, information related to the government's expenditure policies and priorities is not presented.

Source:

Comment:

See the comments in PBS-2. The PBS was not released to the public. Therefore, the answer should be D here.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

56. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the government's revenue policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?

(The core information must include a discussion of revenue policies and priorities and an estimate of total revenues.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 56 focuses on the government's revenue policies and priorities in the Pre-Budget Statement, asking whether "core" information related to these policies is presented. These core components include:

- *a discussion of revenue policies and priorities; and*
- *an estimate of total revenue.*

Although a Pre-Budget Statement is unlikely to include detailed revenue proposals, it should include a discussion of broad policy priorities and a projection of

at least the total revenue associated with these policies for the budget year. The Pre-Budget Statement can also include more detail, for instance, with estimates provided by revenue category – tax and non-tax – or some of the major individual sources of revenue, such as the Value Added Tax or the income tax.

To answer “a,” the Pre-Budget Statement must present for the upcoming budget year all of the core information related to the government’s revenue policies and priorities as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer “b,” the Pre-Budget Statement must present all of the core components noted above for the upcoming budget year. Answer “b” is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A “c” answer applies if some information related to the government’s revenue policies and priorities is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer “d” applies if no information on the government’s revenue policies and priorities is presented.

Answer:

d. No, information related to the government’s revenue policies and priorities is not presented.

Source:

Comment:

See the comments in PBS-2. The PBS was not released to the public. Therefore, the answer should be D here.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

57. Does Pre-Budget Statement present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 57 asks whether the Pre-Budget Statement includes three key estimates related to borrowing and debt:

- the amount of net new borrowing needed in the upcoming budget year;
- the central government’s total debt burden at the end of the upcoming budget year; and
- the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the upcoming budget year.

Debt is the accumulated amount of money that the government borrows. The government can borrow from its citizens, banks, and businesses within the country (domestic debt) or from creditors outside the country (external debt). External debt is typically owed to private commercial banks, other governments, or international financial institutions such as the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund.

Net new borrowing is the additional amount of new borrowing that is required for the budget year to finance expenditures in the budget that exceed available revenues. Net new borrowing adds to the accumulated debt. It is distinct from gross borrowing, which also includes borrowing needed to repay existing debt that matured during the budget year; debt that is replaced (or rolled over) does not add to the total of accumulated debt. For the purposes of this question, the deficit may be accepted as a proxy for net new borrowing.

Interest payments on the debt (or debt service costs) are typically made at regular intervals, and these payments must be made on a timely basis in order to avoid defaulting on the debt obligation. Interest payments are separate from the repayment of principal, which occurs only when the loan has matured and must be paid back in full.

To answer “a,” the Pre-Budget Statement must present all three estimates of borrowing and debt for at least the upcoming budget year. For a “b” answer, the Pre-Budget Statement must present two of those three estimates. For a “c” answer, the PBS must present one of the three estimates. Answer “d” applies if no information on borrowing and debt is presented in the PBS.

Answer:

d. No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.

Source:

Comment:

See the comments in PBS-2. The PBS was not released to the public. Therefore, the answer should be D here.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

58. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present estimates of total expenditures for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 58 asks about multi-year expenditure estimates in the Pre-Budget Statement.

To answer "a," expenditure estimates for at least two years beyond the upcoming budget year must be presented. The estimates must be for at least total expenditures, but could include more detail than just the aggregate total.

Answer:

b. No, multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented.

Source:

Comment:

See the comments in PBS-2. The PBS was not released to the public. Therefore, the answer should be D here.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

59. Does the Enacted Budget present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 59 asks if expenditure estimates in the Enacted Budget are presented by any one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications – which were addressed in Questions 1-5 above. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. Unlike classification by administrative unit, which tends to be unique to each country, functional and economic classifications for government budgeting have been developed and standardized by international institutions. Cross-country comparisons are facilitated by adherence to these international classification standards.

To answer "a," the Enacted Budget must present expenditure estimates by all three of the expenditure classifications. To answer "b," expenditure estimates must be presented by two of the three classifications. A "c" answer applies if expenditure estimates are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if expenditure estimates are not presented by any of the three classifications.

Answer:

b. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by two of the three expenditure classifications.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the Execution of the Central and Local Budgets for 2021 and on the Draft Central and Local Budgets for 2022. 14 March 2022. http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220314_3794760.htm
Ministry of Finance, 2022 Central Budget documents. 24 March 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2022zyczys/index.htm>

Comment:

The sources disclose detailed tables of expenditures by functional and economic classifications, but do not indicate that the expenditure is spent by a particular department or ministry.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: But again note that the detailed tables refer to only central government expenditures.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

59b. Based on the response to Question 59, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications are included in the Enacted Budget:

Answer:

Economic classification
Functional classification

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the Execution of the Central and Local Budgets for 2021 and on the Draft Central and Local Budgets for 2022. 14 March 2022. http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220314_3794760.htm
Ministry of Finance, 2022 Central Budget documents. 24 March 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2022zyczys/index.htm>

Comment:

The sources disclose detailed tables of expenditures by functional and economic classifications, but do not indicate that the expenditure is spent by a particular department or ministry.
Expenditures by functional and economic classifications are presented in the EB files.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: again note that functional and economic classifications breakdown are available for the central government budget only. The two urls provided have different scopes of coverage. The first covers both central and local budgets, the second only the central budget.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

60. Does the Enacted Budget present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

GUIDELINES:

Question 60 asks if expenditure estimates in the Enacted Budget are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department.

A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as le plan comptable or le plan comptable detaillé. (These data are typically

coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer "a," the Enacted Budget must present all programs, which account for all expenditures, in the budget year. To answer "b," the Enacted Budget must present expenditures for individual programs that when combined account for at least two-thirds of expenditures, but not all expenditures. A "c" answer applies if the Enacted Budget presents programs that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by program in the Enacted Budget.

Answer:

d. No, the Enacted Budget does not present expenditure estimates by program.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2022 Central Budget documents. 24 March 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2022zyczys/index.htm>

Comment:

The EB documents are not presented by individual programs.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

61. Does the Enacted Budget present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 61 asks whether revenue estimates in the Enacted Budget are presented by "category"—that is, whether tax and non-tax sources of revenue are shown separately.

To answer "a," the Enacted Budget must present revenue estimates classified by category.

Answer:

a. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents revenue estimates by category.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the Execution of the Central and Local Budgets for 2021 and on the Draft Central and Local Budgets for 2022. 14 March 2022. http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220314_3794760.htm

Ministry of Finance, 2022 Central Budget documents (2022 central revenue table). 24 March 2022. http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2022zyczys/202203/t20220324_3797829.htm

Comment:

The first link presents the revenue estimates by category and their aggregate figures. And the second link discloses detailed tables of revenue category.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

62. Does the Enacted Budget present individual sources of revenue?

GUIDELINES:

Question 62 asks whether revenue estimates for individual sources of revenue are presented in the Enacted Budget. The question applies to both tax and non-tax revenue.

To answer "a," the Enacted Budget must present all individual sources of revenue, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all revenue. To answer "b," the Enacted Budget must present individual sources of revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all revenue, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue that account for less than two-thirds of revenues. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of revenue are not presented.

Answer:

a. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the Execution of the Central and Local Budgets for 2021 and on the Draft Central and Local Budgets for 2022. 14 March 2022. http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220314_3794760.htm
Ministry of Finance, 2022 Central Budget documents (2022 central revenue table). 24 March 2022.
http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2022zycyzs/202203/t20220324_3797829.htm

Comment:

While the first link does not provide the category information on revenue, the second provides very detailed revenue information by revenue category. Revenue in others (10 billion) is about 1% of all revenue (9307 billion). Therefore, A is the answer.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: But note the second link refers only to central government revenues, leaving out local government revenues.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

63. Does the Enacted Budget present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 63 asks about three key estimates related to borrowing and debt:

- the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year;
- the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year;
- the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year.

Debt is the accumulated amount of money that the government borrows. The government can borrow from its citizens, banks, and businesses within the country (domestic debt) or from creditors outside the country (external debt). External debt is typically owed to private commercial banks, other governments, or international financial institutions such as the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund.

Net new borrowing is the additional amount of new borrowing that is required for the budget year to finance expenditures in the budget that exceed available revenues. Net new borrowing adds to the accumulated debt. It is distinct from gross borrowing, which also includes borrowing needed to repay existing debt that matured during the budget year; debt that is replaced (or rolled over) does not add to the total of accumulated debt. For the purposes of this question, the deficit may be accepted as a proxy for net new borrowing.

Interest payments on the debt (or debt service costs) are typically made at regular intervals, and these payments must be made on a timely basis in order to avoid defaulting on the debt obligation. Interest payments are separate from the repayment of principal, which occurs only when the loan has matured and

must be paid back in full.

To answer "a," the Enacted Budget must present all three estimates of borrowing and debt. For a "b" answer, the Enacted Budget must present two of those three estimates. For a "c" answer, the Enacted Budget must present one of the three estimates. Answer "d" applies if no information on borrowing and debt is presented in the Enacted Budget.

Answer:

a. Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the Execution of the Central and Local Budgets for 2021 and on the Draft Central and Local Budgets for 2022. 14 March 2022. http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220314_3794760.htm
Ministry of Finance, 2022 Central Budget documents (2022 central debt and deficit). 24 March 2022. http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2022zyczys/202203/t20220324_3797696.htm

Comment:

Both sources disclose the information of net new borrowing and total debt outstanding, the first providing the aggregate figures for net new borrowing and total debt outstanding and the second providing detailed tables by category. And the first source provides the interest payment for the budget year (638.2 billion).
Thus, a is the answer.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

64. What information is provided in the Citizens Budget?

(The core information must include expenditure and revenue totals, the main policy initiatives in the budget, the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget is based, and contact information for follow-up by citizens.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 64 focuses on the content of the Citizens Budget, asking whether "core" information is presented. These core components include:

- expenditure and revenue totals;
- the main policy initiatives in the budget;
- the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget is based; and
- contact information for follow-up by citizens.

To answer "a," the Citizens Budget or supporting documentation must present all of the above core information as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Citizens Budget must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if the Citizens Budget includes some of the core components above, but other core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if a Citizens Budget is not published.

Answer:

c. The Citizens Budget provides information, but it excludes some core elements.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Interpretations of 2022 Budget Proposal. In March 2022. <http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhuantihuigu/ysbjgd/>
Ministry of Finance, Graphic representation of the national accounts. 17 March 2022. http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caijingshidian/cjzylm/202203/t20220317_3795924.htm
Ministry of Finance, Breaking down national accounts with "three increases and three decreases". 6 March 2022. http://jsz.mof.gov.cn/zhengcefaui/202203/t20220308_3793499.htm

Ministry of Finance, Delegates, members, experts, and others discuss the national livelihood reflected in national accounts. 6 March 2022. http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhuantihuigu/ysbgjd/mtbd2022/202203/t20220307_3792906.htm

Comment:

The first link displays media interpretations and reports on the budget proposal that are summarized on the MOF website, making it easier for the public to access and understand the core information of the budget proposal.

The second link combines text and graphics to convey key information from the budget report in a more concise way, such as national public budget expenditures and major expenditures on people's livelihood projects. The third and fourth links report on expenditure and revenue totals, as well as summarizing main policy initiatives such as tax reduction, education, science and technology, social security, and employment. However, the core information on macroeconomic forecasts and contact information for citizens' follow-up was not disclosed by CB.

Therefore, the answer is C.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

65. How is the Citizens Budget disseminated to the public?

GUIDELINES:

Question 65 asks how the Citizens Budget is disseminated to the public. Citizens Budgets should be made available to a variety of audiences. Therefore paper versions and an Internet posting of a document might not be sufficient.

To answer "a," the executive must use three or more different types of creative media tools to reach the largest possible share of the population, including those who otherwise would not normally have access to budget documents or information. Dissemination would also be pursued at the very local level, so that the coverage is targeted both by geographic area and population group (e.g., women, elderly, low income, urban, rural, etc.). Option "b" applies if significant dissemination efforts are made through a combination of two means of communications, for instance, both posting the Citizens Budget on the executive's official website and distributing printed copies of it. Option "c" applies if the Citizens Budget is disseminated through only posting on the executive's official website. Option "d" applies when the executive does not publish a Citizens Budget.

Answer:

b. A Citizens Budget is published by using at least two, but less than three, means of dissemination, but no other dissemination efforts are undertaken by the executive.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Interpretations of 2022 Budget Proposal. In March 2022. <http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhuantihuigu/ysbgjd/>

Ministry of Finance, Delegates enthusiastically discuss the budget proposal, the "national accounts" benefits enterprises and improves people's well-being. 7 March 2022. http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhuantihuigu/ysbgjd/mtbd2022/202203/t20220307_3792909.htm

Ministry of Finance, Breaking down national accounts with "three increases and three decreases". 6 March 2022.

http://jsz.mof.gov.cn/zhengcefagui/202203/t20220308_3793499.htm

Comment:

The CB is disseminated to the public through the MoF website and the newspapers (such as People's Daily and The Beijing News).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

66. Has the executive established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information prior to publishing the Citizens Budget?

GUIDELINES:

Question 66 asks whether the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information before publishing a Citizens Budget. What the public wants to know about the budget might differ from the information the executive includes in technical documents that comprise the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget; similarly, different perspectives might exist on how the budget should be presented, and this may vary depending on the context. For this reason the executive should consult with the public on the content and presentation of the Citizens Budget.

To answer "a," the executive must have established mechanisms to consult with the public, and these mechanisms for consultation are both accessible and widely used by the public. Such mechanisms can include focus groups, social networks, surveys, hotlines, and meetings/events in universities or other locations where people gather to discuss public issues. In countries where Citizens Budgets are consistently produced and released, it may be sufficient for the government to provide the public with contact information and feedback opportunities, and subsequently use the feedback to improve its management of public resources.

Option "b" applies if the executive has established mechanisms for consultation that are accessible to the public, but that the public nonetheless does not use frequently. That is, the public does not typically engage with the executive on the content of the Citizens Budget, even though the executive has created opportunities for such consultation. Option "c" applies if the executive has established mechanism for consultation with the public, but they are poorly designed and thus not accessible to the public. Option "d" applies if the executive has not created any mechanisms to seek feedback from the public on the content of the Citizens Budget.

Answer:

d. No, the executive has not established any mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget.

Source:

Comment:

There is no reference showing that there are any mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

67. Are "citizens" versions of budget documents published throughout the budget process?

GUIDELINES:

Question 67 asks if "citizens" versions of budget documents are published throughout the budget process. While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle.

To answer "a," a citizens version of at least one budget document is published for each of the four stages of the budget process (budget formulation, enactment, execution, and audit) – for a total of at least four citizens budget documents throughout the process. Option "b" applies if a citizens version of a budget document is published for at least two of the four stages of the budget process. Option "c" applies if a citizens version of a budget document is published for at least one of the four stages of the budget process. Select option "d" if no "citizens" version of budget documents is published.

Answer:

c. A citizens version of budget documents is published for at least one stage of the budget process.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Breaking down national accounts with "three increases and three decreases". 6 March 2022.

http://jsz.mof.gov.cn/zhengcefagui/202203/t20220308_3793499.htm

Ministry of Finance, Graphic representation of the national accounts. 17 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caijingshidian/cjzylm/202203/t20220317_3795924.htm

People's Daily, The fiscal policy implementation report in the first half of 2022 released, budget implementation is generally better. 31 August 2022.

https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-08/31/content_5707537.htm

Xinhua Agency, 102 central departments make public 2021 departmental accounts. 22 July 2022. https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-07/22/content_5702149.htm

Xinhua Agency, Understanding the 2021 Annual Audit Report from the perspectives of "specialization, depth, and stability". 22 June 2022.
https://www.gov.cn/zhengce/2022-06/22/content_5697037.htm

Comment:

The five sources are relevant news to citizens regarding EBP, EB, MYR, YER and AR.

Nevertheless, only the source of EBP meets the requirement of citizen budget.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

68. Do the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 68 asks if expenditure estimates in In-Year Reports are presented by any one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications – which were addressed in Questions 1-5 above.

Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. Unlike classification by administrative unit, which tends to be unique to each country, functional and economic classifications for government budgeting have been developed and standardized by international institutions. Cross-country comparisons are facilitated by adherence to these international classification standards.

To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present actual expenditures by all three of the expenditure classifications. To answer "b," actual expenditures must be presented by two of these three classifications. A "c" answer applies if actual expenditures are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if actual expenditures are not presented by any of the three classifications in In-Year Reports.

Answer:

c. Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by only one of the three expenditure classifications.

Source:

The monthly report for November 2022 was publicly available online on 20 December 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202212/t20221220_3858837.htm

The monthly report for October 2022 was publicly available online on 17 November 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202211/t20221116_3851724.htm

The report for the first three quarters of 2022 was publicly available online on 25 October 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202210/t20221025_3847842.htm

The monthly report for August 2022 was publicly available online on 16 September 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202209/t20220916_3840932.htm

The monthly report for July 2022 was publicly available online on 17 August 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202208/t20220817_3834300.htm

The report for the first half year of 2022 was publicly available online on 14 July 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202207/t20220714_3827010.htm

The monthly report for May 2022 was publicly available online on 16 June 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202206/t20220616_3818568.htm

The monthly report for April 2022 was publicly available online on 17 May 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202205/t20220517_3810958.htm

The report for the first quarter of 2022 was publicly available online on 20 April 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202204/t20220420_3804357.htm

The monthly report for January- February 2022 (combined) was publicly available online on 18 March 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202203/t20220318_3796233.htm

Comment:

As shown in the websites, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by only one of the three expenditure classifications: functional expenditure.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

68b. Based on the response to Question 68, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications are included in the In-Year Reports:

Answer:

Functional classification

Source:

The monthly report for November 2022 was publicly available online on 20 December 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202212/t20221220_3858837.htm

The monthly report for October 2022 was publicly available online on 17 November 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202211/t20221116_3851724.htm

The report for the first three quarters of 2022 was publicly available online on 25 October 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202210/t20221025_3847842.htm

The monthly report for August 2022 was publicly available online on 16 September 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202209/t20220916_3840932.htm

The monthly report for July 2022 was publicly available online on 17 August 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202208/t20220817_3834300.htm

The report for the first half year of 2022 was publicly available online on 14 July 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202207/t20220714_3827010.htm

The monthly report for May 2022 was publicly available online on 16 June 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202206/t20220616_3818568.htm

The monthly report for April 2022 was publicly available online on 17 May 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202205/t20220517_3810958.htm

The report for the first quarter of 2022 was publicly available online on 20 April 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202204/t20220420_3804357.htm

The monthly report for January- February 2022 (combined) was publicly available online on 18 March 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202203/t20220318_3796233.htm

Comment:

As shown in the websites, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by only one of the three expenditure classifications: functional expenditure.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

69. Do the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for individual programs?

GUIDELINES:

Question 69 asks if expenditure estimates in In-Year Reports are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department.

A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as *le plan comptable* or *le plan comptable detaillé*. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present actual expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures. To answer "b," In-Year Reports must present actual expenditures for individual programs that when combined account for at least two-thirds of expenditures, but not all expenditures. A "c" answer applies if In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for programs that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if actual expenditures are not presented by program in In-Year Reports.

Answer:

d. No, the In-Year Reports do not present actual expenditures by program.

Source:

The monthly report for November 2022 was publicly available online on 20 December 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202212/t20221220_3858837.htm
The monthly report for October 2022 was publicly available online on 17 November 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202211/t20221116_3851724.htm
The report for the first three quarters of 2022 was publicly available online on 25 October 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202210/t20221025_3847842.htm
The monthly report for August 2022 was publicly available online on 16 September 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202209/t20220916_3840932.htm
The monthly report for July 2022 was publicly available online on 17 August 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202208/t20220817_3834300.htm
The report for the first half year of 2022 was publicly available online on 14 July 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202207/t20220714_3827010.htm
The monthly report for May 2022 was publicly available online on 16 June 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202206/t20220616_3818568.htm
The monthly report for April 2022 was publicly available online on 17 May 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202205/t20220517_3810958.htm
The report for the first quarter of 2022 was publicly available online on 20 April 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202204/t20220420_3804357.htm
The monthly report for January- February 2022 (combined) was publicly available online on 18 March 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202203/t20220318_3796233.htm

Comment:

As shown in the websites, the In-Year Reports do not present any actual expenditure information for individual programs.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

70. Do the In-Year Reports compare actual year-to-date expenditures with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 70 asks whether In-Year Reports compare actual expenditures to-date with either the enacted levels or actual expenditures for the same period in the previous year.

The OECD recommends that the reports contain the total year-to-date expenditures in a format that allows for a comparison with the budget's forecast expenditures (based on enacted levels) for the same period.

To answer "a," comparisons must be made for expenditures presented in the In-Year Reports

Answer:

a. Yes, comparisons are made for expenditures presented in the In-Year Reports.

Source:

The monthly report for November 2022 was publicly available online on 20 December 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202212/t20221220_3858837.htm
The monthly report for October 2022 was publicly available online on 17 November 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202211/t20221116_3851724.htm
The report for the first three quarters of 2022 was publicly available online on 25 October 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202210/t20221025_3847842.htm
The monthly report for August 2022 was publicly available online on 16 September 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202209/t20220916_3840932.htm
The monthly report for July 2022 was publicly available online on 17 August 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202208/t20220817_3834300.htm
The report for the first half year of 2022 was publicly available online on 14 July 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202207/t20220714_3827010.htm
The monthly report for May 2022 was publicly available online on 16 June 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202206/t20220616_3818568.htm
The monthly report for April 2022 was publicly available online on 17 May 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202205/t20220517_3810958.htm
The report for the first quarter of 2022 was publicly available online on 20 April 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202204/t20220420_3804357.htm
The monthly report for January- February 2022 (combined) was publicly available online on 18 March 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202203/t20220318_3796233.htm

Comment:

As shown in the websites, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditure comparisons based on the same period in the previous year.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

71. Do In-Year Reports present actual revenue by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 71 asks whether In-Year Reports present actual revenues by "category"—that is, whether tax and non-tax sources of revenue are shown separately.

To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present revenue estimates classified by category.

Answer:

a. Yes, In-Year Reports present actual revenue by category.

Source:

The monthly report for November 2022 was publicly available online on 20 December 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202212/t20221220_3858837.htm
The monthly report for October 2022 was publicly available online on 17 November 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202211/t20221116_3851724.htm
The report for the first three quarters of 2022 was publicly available online on 25 October 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202210/t20221025_3847842.htm
The monthly report for August 2022 was publicly available online on 16 September 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202209/t20220916_3840932.htm
The monthly report for July 2022 was publicly available online on 17 August 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202208/t20220817_3834300.htm
The report for the first half year of 2022 was publicly available online on 14 July 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202207/t20220714_3827010.htm
The monthly report for May 2022 was publicly available online on 16 June 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202206/t20220616_3818568.htm

The monthly report for April 2022 was publicly available online on 17 May 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202205/t20220517_3810958.htm
The report for the first quarter of 2022 was publicly available online on 20 April 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202204/t20220420_3804357.htm
The monthly report for January- February 2022 (combined) was publicly available online on 18 March 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202203/t20220318_3796233.htm

Comment:

As shown in the websites, the In-Year Reports present actual revenue by category.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

72. Do In-Year Reports present the individual sources of revenue for actual revenues collected?

GUIDELINES:

Question 72 asks whether In-Year Reports present actual collections of individual sources of revenue (such as income taxes, VAT, etc.). The question applies to both tax and non-tax revenue.

To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present actual collections for all individual sources of revenue, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all revenue. To answer "b," In-Year Reports must present actual collections for individual sources of revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all revenue collected, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue that account for less than two-thirds of all revenue collected. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of actual revenue are not presented.

Answer:

b. Yes, In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue.

Source:

The monthly report for November 2022 was publicly available online on 20 December 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202212/t20221220_3858837.htm
The monthly report for October 2022 was publicly available online on 17 November 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202211/t20221116_3851724.htm
The report for the first three quarters of 2022 was publicly available online on 25 October 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202210/t20221025_3847842.htm
The monthly report for August 2022 was publicly available online on 16 September 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202209/t20220916_3840932.htm
The monthly report for July 2022 was publicly available online on 17 August 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202208/t20220817_3834300.htm
The report for the first half year of 2022 was publicly available online on 14 July 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202207/t20220714_3827010.htm
The monthly report for May 2022 was publicly available online on 16 June 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202206/t20220616_3818568.htm
The monthly report for April 2022 was publicly available online on 17 May 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202205/t20220517_3810958.htm
The report for the first quarter of 2022 was publicly available online on 20 April 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202204/t20220420_3804357.htm
The monthly report for January- February 2022 (combined) was publicly available online on 18 March 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202203/t20220318_3796233.htm

Comment:

There is no breakdown for non-tax revenue, which accounts for about 17.6% of the total revenue. Details of individual tax revenues are presented, which account for more than two-thirds of all revenue collected.
Thus, B is the answer.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion:

73. Do the In-Year Reports compare actual year-to-date revenues with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 73 asks whether In-Year Reports compare actual revenues to-date with either the enacted levels or actual revenues for the same period in the previous year.

The OECD recommends that the reports contain the total year-to-date revenues in a format that allows for a comparison with the budget's forecast revenues (based on enacted levels) for the same period.

To answer "a," comparisons must be made for revenues presented in the In-Year Reports.

Answer:

a. Yes, comparisons are made for revenues presented in the In-Year Reports.

Source:

The monthly report for November 2022 was publicly available online on 20 December 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202212/t20221220_3858837.htm

The monthly report for October 2022 was publicly available online on 17 November 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202211/t20221116_3851724.htm

The report for the first three quarters of 2022 was publicly available online on 25 October 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202210/t20221025_3847842.htm

The monthly report for August 2022 was publicly available online on 16 September 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202209/t20220916_3840932.htm

The monthly report for July 2022 was publicly available online on 17 August 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202208/t20220817_3834300.htm

The report for the first half year of 2022 was publicly available online on 14 July 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202207/t20220714_3827010.htm

The monthly report for May 2022 was publicly available online on 16 June 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202206/t20220616_3818568.htm

The monthly report for April 2022 was publicly available online on 17 May 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202205/t20220517_3810958.htm

The report for the first quarter of 2022 was publicly available online on 20 April 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202204/t20220420_3804357.htm

The monthly report for January- February 2022 (combined) was publicly available online on 18 March 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202203/t20220318_3796233.htm

Comment:

As shown in the websites, the In-Year Reports present actual revenue comparisons based on the same period in the previous year.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion:

74. Do In-Year Reports present three estimates related to actual government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing; the total debt outstanding;

and interest payments?

GUIDELINES:

Question 74 asks about three key estimates related to borrowing and debt:

- the amount of net new borrowing so far during the year;
- the central government's total debt burden at that point in the year; and
- the interest payments to-date on the outstanding debt.

Debt is the accumulated amount of money that the government borrows. The government can borrow from its citizens and banks and businesses within the country (domestic debt) or from creditors outside the country (external debt). External debt is typically owed to private commercial banks, other governments, or international financial institutions such as the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund.

Net new borrowing is the additional amount of new borrowing that is required for the budget year to finance expenditures in the budget that exceed available revenues. Net new borrowing adds to the accumulated debt. It is distinct from gross borrowing, which also includes borrowing needed to repay existing debt that matured during the budget year; debt that is replaced (or rolled over) does not add to the total of accumulated debt. For the purposes of this question, the deficit may be accepted as a proxy for net new borrowing.

Interest payments on the debt (or debt service costs) are typically made at regular intervals, and these payments must be made on a timely basis in order to avoid defaulting on the debt obligation. Interest payments are separate from the repayment of principal, which occurs only when the loan has matured and must be paid back in full.

To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present all three estimates of borrowing and debt. For a "b" answer, In-Year Reports must present two of those three estimates. For a "c" answer, IYRs must present one of the three estimates. Answer "d" applies if no information on borrowing and debt is presented in In-Year Reports.

Answer:

c. Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

Source:

The monthly report for November 2022 was publicly available online on 20 December 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202212/t20221220_3858837.htm

The monthly report for October 2022 was publicly available online on 17 November 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202211/t20221116_3851724.htm

The report for the first three quarters of 2022 was publicly available online on 25 October 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202210/t20221025_3847842.htm

The monthly report for August 2022 was publicly available online on 16 September 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202209/t20220916_3840932.htm

The monthly report for July 2022 was publicly available online on 17 August 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202208/t20220817_3834300.htm

The report for the first half year of 2022 was publicly available online on 14 July 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202207/t20220714_3827010.htm

The monthly report for May 2022 was publicly available online on 16 June 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202206/t20220616_3818568.htm

The monthly report for April 2022 was publicly available online on 17 May 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202205/t20220517_3810958.htm

The report for the first quarter of 2022 was publicly available online on 20 April 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202204/t20220420_3804357.htm

The monthly report for January- February 2022 (combined) was publicly available online on 18 March 2022 at:

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202203/t20220318_3796233.htm

Comment:

As shown in the websites, the In-Year Reports only present information on the interest payments on the debt.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

75. Do In-Year Reports present information related to the composition of the total actual debt outstanding?

(The core information must include interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 75 focuses on the composition of government debt, asking whether "core" information related to its composition is presented. These core components include:

- *interest rates on the debt;*
- *maturity profile of the debt; and*
- *whether the debt is domestic or external.*

The interest rates affect the amount of interest that must be paid to creditors. The maturity profile indicates the final payment date of the loan, at which point the principal (and all remaining interest) is due to be paid; government borrowing typically includes a mix of short-term and long-term debt. As discussed in Question 74, domestic debt is held by a country's citizens and banks and businesses, while external debt is held by foreigners. These factors related to the composition of the debt give an indication of the potential vulnerability of the country's debt position, and ultimately whether the cost of servicing the accumulated debt is affordable.

Beyond these core elements, a government may also provide additional information related to the composition of its debt, including for instance: whether interest rates are fixed or variable; whether debt is callable; the currency of the debt; a profile of the creditors (bilateral institutions, multilateral institutions, commercial banks, Central Bank, etc.); an analysis of the risk associated with the debt; and where appropriate, what the debt is being used to finance.

To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present all of the core information related to the composition of government debt to-date as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," In-Year Reports must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to the composition of government debt is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on the composition of the debt outstanding in In-Year Reports.

Answer:

d. No, information related to composition of total actual debt outstanding is not presented.

Source:

The monthly report for November 2022 was publicly available online on 20 December 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202212/t20221220_3858837.htm
The monthly report for October 2022 was publicly available online on 17 November 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202211/t20221116_3851724.htm
The report for the first three quarters of 2022 was publicly available online on 25 October 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202210/t20221025_3847842.htm
The monthly report for August 2022 was publicly available online on 16 September 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202209/t20220916_3840932.htm
The monthly report for July 2022 was publicly available online on 17 August 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202208/t20220817_3834300.htm
The report for the first half year of 2022 was publicly available online on 14 July 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202207/t20220714_3827010.htm
The monthly report for May 2022 was publicly available online on 16 June 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202206/t20220616_3818568.htm
The monthly report for April 2022 was publicly available online on 17 May 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202205/t20220517_3810958.htm
The report for the first quarter of 2022 was publicly available online on 20 April 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202204/t20220420_3804357.htm
The monthly report for January- February 2022 (combined) was publicly available online on 18 March 2022 at:
http://gks.mof.gov.cn/tongjishuju/202203/t20220318_3796233.htm

Comment:

As shown in the websites, the In-Year Reports do not present the information on the composition of the total actual debt outstanding.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

b. Yes, the core information is presented for the composition of the total actual debt outstanding.

Comments: The MOF website provides almost monthly reports on local government debt that includes information on the core elements of interest rates on the debt; maturity profile of the debt; and whether the debt is domestic or external. See, for example, the November 2022 report, published on 29 December 2022: http://yss.mof.gov.cn/zhuantilanmu/dfzgl/sjtj/202212/t20221229_3861047.htm , october report: http://yss.mof.gov.cn/zhuantilanmu/dfzgl/sjtj/202211/t20221130_3854835.htm (issued 30 Nov 2022). http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2022zyczys/202203/t20220324_3797696.htm provides information on total debt outstanding for 2021 and 2022, domestic and external.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

Researcher Response

Thanks for the reviewer's input. However, two links are about local debts, while the last one is not about In-Year reports. So, the answer should be kept as it is.

76. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include an updated macroeconomic forecast for the budget year underway?

GUIDELINES:

Question 76 asks whether the Mid-Year Review includes an updated macroeconomic forecast for the budget year underway, and provides an explanation of the update.

Refer to Question 15 for the components of the macroeconomic forecast presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal.

To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must include an updated macroeconomic forecast and explain all of the differences between the initial forecast presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal and the updated forecast. The explanation must include at least estimates of all differences; a narrative discussion is desirable but not required if estimates of all the differences are provided. To answer "b," the macroeconomic forecast must be updated, but only some of the differences between the initial and updated forecasts are explained. The explanation would be more limited, such as only a narrative discussion of the differences or estimates covering only some of the differences. A "c" response applies if the Mid-Year Review includes an updated macroeconomic forecast, but does not provide an explanation for the revisions. A "d" response applies if the macroeconomic forecast has not been updated.

Answer:

d. No, the estimates for macroeconomic forecast have not been updated.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the implementation of China's financial policies in the first half year, 30 August 2022.
https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-08/30/content_5707425.htm

Comment:

The MYR does not present the information on macroeconomic forecast.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

77. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?

GUIDELINES:

Question 77 asks whether the Mid-Year Review includes updated estimates of expenditure for the budget year underway, and provides an explanation of the update. Please note that year-to-date expenditures as assessed in Question 70 do not qualify as updated estimates of expenditure for the purposes of this indicator.

To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must include updated expenditure estimates and explain all of the differences between the initial levels presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal (or the Enacted Budget) and the updated estimates. The explanation must include at least estimates of all differences; a narrative discussion is desirable but not required if estimates of all the differences are provided. The expenditure estimates must be updated, but only some of the differences between the initial and updated estimates are explained. The explanation would be more limited, such as only a narrative discussion of the differences or estimates covering only some of the differences. A "c" response applies if the Mid-Year Review includes updated expenditure estimates, but does not provide an explanation for the revisions. A "d" response applies if the expenditure estimates have not been updated.

Answer:

d. No, expenditure estimates have not been updated.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the implementation of China's financial policies in the first half year. 30 August 2022.
https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-08/30/content_5707425.htm

Comment:

The MYR does not update the expenditure estimate. It only reports the actual expenditure by the end of June in the report.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

78. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 78 asks if expenditure estimates for the budget year underway in the Mid-Year Review are presented by any one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications – which were addressed in Questions 1-5 above. Please note that year-to-date expenditures as assessed in Question 70 do not qualify as updated estimates of expenditure for the purposes of this indicator.

Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. Unlike classification by administrative unit, which tends to be unique to each country, functional and economic classifications for government budgeting have been developed and standardized by international institutions. Cross-country comparisons are facilitated by adherence to these international classification standards.

To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must present expenditure estimates by all three of the expenditure classifications. To answer "b," expenditure estimates must be presented by two of these three classifications. A "c" answer applies if expenditure estimates are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if expenditure estimates are not presented by any of the three classifications in the Mid-Year Review.

Answer:

d. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the implementation of China's financial policies in the first half year. 30 August 2022.
https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-08/30/content_5707425.htm

Comment:

The MYR only reports the actual expenditure by the end of June, but does not update the expenditure estimate.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

78b. Based on the response to Question 78, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications are included in the Mid-Year Review:

Answer:

None of the above

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the implementation of China's financial policies in the first half year. 30 August 2022.

https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-08/30/content_5707425.htm

Comment:

None is reported in the MYR.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

79. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway for individual programs?

GUIDELINES:

Question 79 asks if expenditure estimates in the Mid-Year Review are presented by program for the budget year underway. Please note that year-to-date expenditures as assessed in Question 70 do not qualify as updated estimates of expenditure for the purposes of this indicator.

A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as le plan comptable or le plan comptable detaille. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must present expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures. To answer "b," the Mid-Year Review must present expenditures for individual programs that when combined account for at least two-thirds of expenditures, but not all expenditures. A "c" answer applies if the Mid-Year Review presents programs that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by program in the Mid-Year Review.

Answer:

d. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present expenditure estimates by program.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the implementation of China's financial policies in the first half year. 30 August 2022.

https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-08/30/content_5707425.htm

Comment:

The MYR does not present expenditures for individual programs.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion:

80. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?

GUIDELINES:

Question 80 asks whether the Mid-Year Review includes updated estimates of revenue for the budget year underway, and provides an explanation of the update. Please note that year-to-date revenues as assessed in Question 73 do not qualify as updated estimates of revenue for the purposes of this indicator.

To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must include updated revenue estimates and explain all of the differences between the initial levels presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal (or the Enacted Budget) and the updated estimates. The explanation must include at least estimates of all differences; a narrative discussion is desirable but not required if estimates of all the differences are provided. To answer "b," the revenue estimates must be updated, but only some of the differences between the initial and updated estimates are explained. The explanation would be more limited, such as only a narrative discussion of the differences or estimates covering only some of the differences. A "c" response applies if the Mid-Year Review includes updated revenue estimates, but no explanation for the revisions is provided. A "d" response applies if the revenue estimates have not been updated.

Answer:

d. No, revenue estimates have not been updated.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the implementation of China's financial policies in the first half year. 30 August 2022.
https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-08/30/content_5707425.htm

Comment:

The MYR does not update the revenue estimate. It only reports the actual revenue by the end of June in the report.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion:

81. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 81 asks whether revenue estimates for the budget year underway in the Mid-Year Review are presented by "category"—that is, whether tax and non-tax sources of revenue are shown separately. Please note that year-to-date revenues as assessed in Question 73 do not qualify as updated estimates of revenue for the purposes of this indicator.

To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must present revenue estimates classified by category.

Answer:

b. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present revenue estimates by category.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the implementation of China's financial policies in the first half year. 30 August 2022.
https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-08/30/content_5707425.htm

Comment:

The MYR does not update the revenue estimate. It only reports the actual revenue by the end of June in the report.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

82. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present updated individual sources of revenue for the budget year underway?*GUIDELINES:*

Question 82 asks whether revenue estimates for individual sources of revenue for the budget year underway are presented in the Mid-Year Review. Please note that year-to-date revenues as assessed in Question 73 do not qualify as updated estimates of revenue for the purposes of this indicator.

To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must present all sources of revenue individually, accounting for all revenues, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all revenue. To answer "b," the Mid-Year Review must present individual sources of revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all revenue, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if the Mid-Year Review presents estimates of individual revenue sources that account for less than two-thirds of revenue. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of revenue are not presented in the Mid-Year Review.

Answer:

d. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present individual sources of revenue.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the implementation of China's financial policies in the first half year. 30 August 2022.
https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-08/30/content_5707425.htm

Comment:

The MYR does not update the revenue estimate. It only reports the actual revenue by the end of June in the report.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

83. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the budget year underway?*GUIDELINES:*

Question 83 asks whether the Mid-Year Review includes updated estimates of borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the budget year underway, and provides an explanation of the update.

Refer to Question 13 for details on estimates in the Executive's Budget Proposal of borrowing and debt. Key estimates related to borrowing and debt include:

- The amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year;
- The central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year; and
- The interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year.

Refer to Question 14 for details on estimates in the Executive's Budget Proposal related to the composition of the debt. Core information related to the composition of government debt include:

- interest rates on the debt;
- maturity profile of the debt; and
- whether the debt is domestic or external.

To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must include an updated estimates of borrowing and debt, including its composition, and explain all of the differences between the initial estimates presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal (or Enacted Budget) and the updated estimates. The explanation must include at least estimates of all differences; a narrative discussion is desirable but not required if estimates of all the differences are provided. To answer "b," the estimates of borrowing and debt must be updated, but only some of the differences between the initial and updated estimates are explained. The explanation would be more limited, such as only a narrative discussion of the differences or estimates covering only some of the differences. A "c" response applies if the Mid-Year Review includes updated estimates, but no explanation for the revisions is provided. A "d" response applies if the estimates of borrowing and debt have not been updated.

Answer:

d. No, estimates of government borrowing and debt have not been updated.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Report on the implementation of China's financial policies in the first half year. 30 August 2022. https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-08/30/content_5707425.htm

Comment:

The MYR reports some information on government borrowing and debt, but does not update the estimates.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

84. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?

GUIDELINES:

Question 84 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and actual expenditures for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all expenditures, along with a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if estimates of the differences for all expenditures are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences are presented for some, but not all expenditures, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. Answer "d" if no estimates of the differences are presented in the Year-End Report

Answer:

b. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all expenditures are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 final report at the central level. 22 June 2022. <http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/bc2d630c1af0481b93b6bf88684ea55a.shtml>
 Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report. July 2022. <http://ysss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/>

Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report (Central Government's General Public Budget Expenditure). 12 July 2022.
http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826610.htm
Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report (Description of Central Level General Public Budget Expenditure). 12 July 2022.
http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826608.htm

Comment:

The first source presents some major expenditures and the differences compared to the enacted estimates. The third and fourth sources show expenditure by detailed category and corresponding description. Again, the explanation is brief. Therefore, b is the answer.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

85. Does the Year-End Report present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 85 asks if expenditure estimates in the Year-End Report are presented by any one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications – which were addressed in Questions 1-5 above. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. Unlike classification by administrative unit, which tends to be unique to each country, functional and economic classifications for government budgeting have been developed and standardized by international institutions. Cross-country comparisons are facilitated by adherence to these international classification standards.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present expenditure estimates by all three of the expenditure classifications. Answer "b" if expenditure estimates are presented by two of these three classifications. Answer "c" if expenditure estimates are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" if expenditure estimates are not presented by any of the three classifications in the Year-End Report.

Answer:

a. Yes, the Year-End Report presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Central Budget and Final Accounts Public Platform. 24 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zyjsgkpt/zybmys/bmys/index_5.html
Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report. July 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/>
Ministry of Finance, 2021 Central Budget documents (Central Level General Public Budget Expenditure). 12 July 2022.
http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826606.htm
Ministry of Finance, 2021 Central Budget documents (Basic Expenditure of Central Level in General Public Budget). 12 July 2022.
http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826606.htm

Comment:

The expenditure on administrative classification is released in the first link.
The second link is a summarized website for national government final accounts. Specifically, the third presents functional expenditure information, and the fourth link reports the economic expenditure information.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

85b. Based on the response to Question 85, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications are included in the Year-End Report:

Answer:

Administrative classification
Economic classification
Functional classification

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Central Budget and Final Accounts Public Platform. 24 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zyjsgkpt/zybmyjs/bmys/index_5.html
Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report. July 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/>
Ministry of Finance, 2021 Central Budget documents (Central Level General Public Budget Expenditure). 12 July 2022.
http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826606.htm
Ministry of Finance, 2021 Central Budget documents (Basic Expenditure of Central Level in General Public Budget). 12 July 2022.
http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826606.htm

Comment:

The expenditure on administrative classification is released in the first link.
The second link is a summarized website for national government final accounts. Specifically, the third presents functional expenditure information, and the fourth link reports the economic expenditure information.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Again, note these links refer only to the central government budget.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

86. Does the Year-End Report present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

GUIDELINES:

Question 86 asks if expenditure estimates in the Year-End Report are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department.

A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as *le plan comptable* or *le plan comptable detaillé*. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present expenditure estimates for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents expenditures for individual programs that when combined account for at least two-thirds of expenditures, but not all expenditures. Answer "c" if the Year-End Report presents programs that account for only less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" if expenditures are not presented by program in the Year-End Report.

Answer:

d. No, the Year-End Report does not present expenditure estimates by program.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 final report at the central level. 22 June 2022.
<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/bc2d630c1af0481b93b6bf88684ea55a.shtml>
Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report. July 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/>
Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report (Central Government's General Public Budget Expenditure). 12 July 2022.

http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826610.htm

Comment:

No information on expenditure estimates for individual programs is presented.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

87. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?

GUIDELINES:

Question 87 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and actual revenues for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all revenues, along with a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if estimates of the differences for all revenues are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences are presented for some, but not all revenues, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. Answer "d" if no estimates of the differences are presented in the Year-End Report.

Answer:

a. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all revenues are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report (Central Government's General Public Budget Expenditure). 12 July 2022.

http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826610.htm

Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report (Description of Central Level General Public Budget Expenditure). 12 July 2022.

http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826608.htm

Ministry of Finance, 2021 final report at the central level. 22 June 2022.

<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/bc2d630c1af0481b93b6bf88684ea55a.shtml>

Comment:

The above links show that both the differences compared to the enacted estimates (first link) and the narrative discussion for revenues (second link) are presented. The third link (the report to the National People's Congress) also provides some comparisons and narratives.

Therefore, A is the answer.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

88. Does the Year-End Report present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 88 asks whether revenue estimates in the Year-End Report are presented by "category" – that is, whether tax and non-tax sources of revenue are shown separately.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present revenue estimates classified by category.

Answer:

a. Yes, the Year-End Report presents revenue estimates by category.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report (Central Government's General Public Budget Expenditure). 12 July 2022.

http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826610.htm

Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report (Description of Central Level General Public Budget Expenditure). 12 July 2022.

http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826608.htm

Ministry of Finance, 2021 final report at the central level. 22 June 2022.

<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/bc2d630c1af0481b93b6bf88684ea55a.shtml>

Comment:

The above sources present tax and non-tax revenues with breakdown items.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

89. Does the Year-End Report present individual sources of revenue?

GUIDELINES:

Question 89 asks whether revenue estimates for individual sources of revenue are presented in the Year-End Report. The question applies to both tax and non-tax revenue.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present all sources of revenue individually, accounting for all revenue, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all revenue. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all revenue, but not all revenue. Answer "c" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of individual revenue sources that account for less than two-thirds of revenue. Answer "d" if individual sources of revenue are not presented in the Year-End Report.

Answer:

a. Yes, the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report (Central Government's General Public Budget Expenditure). 12 July 2022.

http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826610.htm

Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report (Description of Central Level General Public Budget Expenditure). 12 July 2022.

http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826608.htm

Ministry of Finance, 2021 final report at the central level. 22 June 2022.

<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/bc2d630c1af0481b93b6bf88684ea55a.shtml>

Comment:

The above sources present tax and non-tax revenues with breakdown items. And the "other" revenue takes up less than 3% in the breakdown table.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

90. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 90 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the original estimates and the actual outcome for the fiscal year for borrowing and debt, including its composition, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.

Refer to Question 13 for details on estimates in the Executive's Budget Proposal of borrowing and debt. Key estimates related to borrowing and debt include:

- the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year;
- the central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year; and
- the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year.

Refer to Question 14 for details on estimates in the Executive's Budget Proposal related to the composition of the debt. Core information related to the composition of government debt include:

- interest rates on the debt;
- maturity profile of the debt; and
- whether the debt is domestic or external.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must include estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented.

Answer:

c. Yes, estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 final report at the central level. 22 June 2022.
<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/bc2d630c1af0481b93b6bf88684ea55a.shtml>

Comment:

The 2021 final report presents the interest payment information and compares it with the budgeted figure (interest payment: 586.7 billion and 97.8% of the budget).
It also presents the central government's total debt at the end of the budget year: 23.2697 trillion (including a domestic debt of 22.9643 trillion and an external debt of 305,358 million).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

90b. Based on the response to Question 90, check the box(es) to identify which estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, have the differences between the original forecast and the actual outcome for the year presented in the Year-End Report:

Answer:

The central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year
The interest payments on outstanding debt for the budget year
Whether the debt is domestic or external

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 final report at the central level. 22 June 2022.
<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/bc2d630c1af0481b93b6bf88684ea55a.shtml>

Comment:

The 2021 final report presents the interest payment information and compares it with the budgeted figure (interest payment: 586.7 billion and 97.8% of the budget).
It also presents the central government's total debt at the end of the budget year: 23.2697 trillion (including a domestic debt of 22.9643 trillion and an external debt of 305,358 million).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

91. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?**GUIDELINES:**

Question 91 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.

Refer to Question 15 for the components of the macroeconomic forecast in the Executive's Budget Proposal. Core components include estimates of the nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates, although the importance of other macroeconomic assumptions, such as the price of oil, can vary from country to country.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must include estimates of the differences between all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented.

Answer:

d. No, estimates of the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year is not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 final report at the central level. 22 June 2022.
<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/bc2d630c1af0481b93b6bf88684ea55a.shtml>

Comment:

No macroeconomic forecast information is presented in the YER.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

91b. Based on the response to Question 91, check the box(es) to identify which elements of the macroeconomic forecast have the differences between the original forecast and the outcome for the year presented in the Year-End Report:

Answer:

None of the above

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 final report at the central level. 22 June 2022.
<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/bc2d630c1af0481b93b6bf88684ea55a.shtml>

Comment:

No macroeconomic forecast information is presented in the YER.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

92. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome?

GUIDELINES:

Question 92 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.

Refer to Question 49 for the nonfinancial data on inputs included in the Executive's Budget Proposal.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must include estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented.

Answer:

d. No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 final report at the central level. 22 June 2022.
<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/bc2d630c1af0481b93b6bf88684ea55a.shtml>

Comment:

No nonfinancial information is presented in the YER.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

93. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome?

GUIDELINES:

Question 93 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion. Nonfinancial data on results can include data on both outputs and outcomes, but not on inputs (which are addressed in Question 92).

Refer to Question 50 for the nonfinancial data on results included in the Executive's Budget Proposal.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must include estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented.

Answer:

d. No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 final report at the central level. 22 June 2022.
<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/bc2d630c1af0481b93b6bf88684ea55a.shtml>

Comment:

No nonfinancial information is presented in the YER.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

94. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted level of funds for policies (both new proposals and existing policies) that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?

GUIDELINES:

Question 94 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the enacted level of funds for policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.

Refer to Question 52 for assistance to the most impoverished populations in the Executive's Budget Proposal.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present estimates of the differences between the enacted level for all policies that are intended to benefit the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between the enacted level for all policies that are intended to benefit the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between the enacted level for some but not all of the policies that are intended to benefit the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented.

Answer:

d. No, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are not presented.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 final report at the central level. 22 June 2022.
<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/bc2d630c1af0481b93b6bf88684ea55a.shtml>

Comment:

The YER does not specify the actual outcome on this issue.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

95. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome?

GUIDELINES:

Question 95 asks whether the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.

Refer to Question 33 for estimates of extra-budgetary funds in the Executive's Budget Proposal.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must include estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented

Answer:

b. Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report. July 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/>
Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report (Central Government-managed Funds Revenue). 12 July 2022.
http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826570.htm
Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report (Central Government-managed Funds Expenditure). 12 July 2022.
http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826566.htm
Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report (Central Government's State Capital Operations Revenue). 12 July 2022.
http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826326.htm
Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report (Central Government's State Capital Operations Expenditure). 12 July 2022.
http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826325.htm
Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report (Central Government's Social Insurance Funds Revenue). 12 July 2022.
http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826316.htm
Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report (Central Government's Social Insurance Funds Expenditure). 12 July 2022.
http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826314.htm
Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report (Description of Central Government-managed Funds and Related Policies). 12 July 2022.
http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826393.htm
Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report (Description of Central Government's State Capital Operations). 12 July 2022.
http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826319.htm
Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report (Description of Central Government's Social Insurance Funds). 12 July 2022.
http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/202207/t20220712_3826312.htm

Comment:

According to the guidelines of Q34, social security funds, national government-managed funds, and state capital operation budget can be taken as extra-budget funds in the Chinese context.

The above sources present detailed tables on the revenues and expenditures of the three entities. Additionally, the final three links provide corresponding narrative discussions, including comparisons between estimates and actual outcomes, as well as brief explanations regarding any discrepancies in the data.

Again, these explanations are brief. Thus, B is the answer.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

96. Is a financial statement included as part of the Year-End Report or released as a separate report?

GUIDELINES:

Question 96 asks whether a financial statement is included as part of the Year-End Report, or whether it is released as a separate report. The financial statement can include some or all of the following elements: a cash flow statement, an operating statement, a balance sheet, and notes on accounting. For purposes of responding to this question, the financial statement in question does not need to be audited. For an example of a financial statement, see the document "Financial Statements of the Government of New Zealand 2013" (<https://treasury.govt.nz/sites/default/files/2013-10/fsgnz-year-jun13.pdf>)

To answer "a," a financial statement must either be included in the Year-End Report or must be released as a separate report. Answer "a" applies if a financial statement is released as a separate report, even if the Year-End Report is not publicly available. Answer "b" applies if no financial statement is released either as part of the Year-End Report or as a separate report.

Answer:

b. No, a financial statement is neither part of the Year-End Report nor released as a separate report.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, 2021 final report at the central level. 22 June 2022.

<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/bc2d630c1af0481b93b6bf88684ea55a.shtml>

Ministry of Finance, 2021 national final report. July 2022. <http://yss.mof.gov.cn/2021zyjs/>

Comment:

The first one is the YER, and the second (published within the timeframe for evaluation) can be taken as a set of financial statement.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Comments: I am not familiar with a financial statement issued by the government, and the second link does not work so I cannot see it.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

Researcher Response

The link does no longer work. After a careful review, I agree with the reviewer that these tables are not qualified as a financial statement.

97. What type of audits (compliance, financial, or performance) has the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) conducted and made available to the public?

GUIDELINES:

Question 97 asks about the types of audits conducted by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI). There are three basic types of audits:

- *Financial audits are intended to determine if an entity's financial information is accurate (free from errors or fraud) and presented in accordance with the applicable financial reporting and regulatory framework. See ISSAI 200 (<https://www.issai.org/pronouncements/issai-100-fundamental-principles->*

[of-public-sector-auditing/](#)) for more detail.

- Compliance audits look at the extent to which the relevant regulations and procedures have been followed. See ISSAI 400 (<https://www.issai.org/pronouncements/issai-400-compliance-audit-principles/>) for more details.
- Performance audits assess whether activities are adhering to the principles of economy, efficiency, and effectiveness. See ISSAI 300 (<https://www.issai.org/pronouncements/issai-300-performance-audit-principles/>) for more details.

Financial and compliance audits are more common than performance audits, which usually occur only once a performance framework has been agreed upon. In some countries, the SAI's mandate limits the type of audit it can conduct.

To answer "a," the SAI must have conducted all three types of audit – financial, compliance, and performance – and made all of them available to the public. A "b" response applies if the SAI has conducted two of the three audit types, and a "c" applies if it has conducted only one type of audit. Answers "b" and "c" may be selected even if the Audit Report is not publicly available, as long as the SAI has conducted compliance or performance audits and made them available to the public. A "d" response applies if the SAI has not conducted any of the three types of audits, or has not made them available to the public.

Answer:

a. The SAI has conducted all three types of audits (compliance, financial, or performance) and made them available to the public.

Source:

National People's Congress, Audit report on 2021 central budget implementation and other fiscal revenue and expenditure. 22 June 2022.

<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/17a7dc825750458ba00b85e5d7b6b18e.shtml>

National Audit Office, Auditing report on 2021 central budget implementation and relevant work. 21 June 2022.

<https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n25/c10252123/content.html>

Comment:

The first link evaluates the budget implementation by the three types, including non-compliance issues in departmental budget execution and the improper use of funds in some major policy areas (compliance issue). There are also issues of inaccuracy in the revenue and expenditure of certain departments (financial audit) and a low level of refinement in budget performance management (performance audit).

The second link presents a more elaborate account of budget execution issues across various departments.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

98. What percentage of expenditures within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited?

GUIDELINES:

Question 98 focuses on the coverage of audits by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI), asking what percentage of expenditures within the SAI's mandate has been audited.

The SAI's mandate is typically defined in statute. Only expenditures related to budgetary central government (ministries, departments, and agencies) that are within the SAI's mandate should be considered for this question. (Question 99 addresses audits of extra-budgetary funds.) Further, the question does not apply to "secret programs" (for example, security-related expenditures that are confidential). Further, if the mandate gives the SAI the authority to outsource some audits, then those audits count for purposes of this question.

Only the Audit Report identified in Section 1 should be used to answer this question. Financial audits and compliance audits, or a hybrid of the two, can be taken into account to answer this question. Performance audits should not be considered for this question.

To answer "a," all expenditures within the SAI's mandate must be audited. A "b" response applies if at least two-thirds, but not all, expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited. A "c" response is appropriate when less than two-thirds of expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited. A "d" response applies when no expenditures have been audited.

Answer:

c. Expenditures representing less than two-thirds of expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited.

Source:

Comment:

According to the Audit report, the Audit Office audited all 41 central departments and most of their affiliated units. Thus, the best guess is B.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

c. Expenditures representing less than two-thirds of expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited.

Comments: I believe SAI's mandate is to audit the national budget, not just the central government budget. Since the central government accounts for less than 15% of total expenditures (less if consolidated with extrabudgetary resources), my guess is the answer is c.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

Researcher Response

I agree with the reviewer that "SAI's mandate is to audit the national budget". As IBP focuses on the national budget, C should be the answer.

99. What percentage of extra-budgetary funds within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited?

GUIDELINES:

Question 99 focuses on audits of extra-budgetary funds, asking what percentage of extra-budgetary funds within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited. These funds, although technically outside the budget, are governmental in nature and thus should be subject to the same audit requirement as other government programs.

The SAI's mandate is typically defined in statute. Only expenditures related to extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate should be considered for this question. (Question 98 addresses audits of budgetary central government.) Further, if the mandate gives the SAI the authority to outsource some audits, then those audits count for purposes of this question.

To answer "a," all extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate must be audited. A "b" response applies if extra-budgetary funds accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited. A "c" response applies if extra-budgetary funds accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited. A "d" response applies if extra-budgetary funds have not been audited.

Answer:

c. Extra-budgetary funds accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited.

Source:

Comment:

The reason is similar to the previous round of review comment. The report provides some evidence that some extra-budgetary funds were audited, including the social security funds, medical security funds, and government investment funds.

However, as the audit report is summarized based on the budget units (second link), audit information on extra-budgetary funds is not available to the public.

Based on the available information, C would be an appropriate answer.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

100. Does the annual Audit Report(s) prepared by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) include an executive summary?

GUIDELINES:

Question 100 asks whether the annual Audit Report includes an executive summary. Only the Audit Report identified in Section 1 should be used to answer this question. The Audit Report can be a fairly technical document, and an executive summary of the report's findings can help make it more accessible to the media and the public.

To answer "a," the Audit Report must include at least one executive summary summarizing the report's content. Answer "b" applies if the Audit Report does not include an executive summary, or the Audit Report is not made publicly available.

Answer:

b. No, the annual Audit Report(s) does not include an executive summary.

Source:

National People's Congress, Audit report on 2021 central budget implementation and other fiscal revenue and expenditure. 22 June 2022.

<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/17a7dc825750458ba00b85e5d7b6b18e.shtml>

National Audit Office, Auditing report on 2021 central budget implementation and relevant work. 21 June 2022.

<https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n25/c10252123/content.html>

Comment:

Although the introductory sections of both reports provide some summary statements, they do not summarize the entire document. Thus, b is the proper answer.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

101. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?

GUIDELINES:

Question 101 asks whether the executive reports to the public on the steps it has taken to address audit recommendations made by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI). The ultimate purpose of audits is to verify that the budget was executed in a manner consistent with existing law, and to hold the government accountable for this execution and its future improvement. The extent to which audits achieve the latter depends on whether there is adequate and timely follow-up on the recommendations provided in the SAI's audit reports.

To answer "a," the executive must report publicly on the steps it has taken to address all audit findings. A "b" response applies if the executive reports publicly on the steps it has taken to address most, but not all, audit findings. A "c" response applies if the executive reports publicly on the steps it has taken to address only some audit findings. As long as the executive reports publicly on the steps it has taken to address audit finding, answer "a," "b," or "c" may be selected, even if the Audit Report is not made publicly available. A "d" response applies if the executive does not report at all on its steps to address audit findings.

Answer:

b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings.

Source:

Comment:

I don't find any executive report to address audit recommendations.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.

Comments: <https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n26/c10307718/part/10308252.pdf> this is a State Council report on progress and steps taken to rectify findings of the 2021 budget audit, with details on the share of problems corrected, etc.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

Researcher Response

Thanks for the reviewer's input. Yes. This can be considered a report on the steps it has taken to address audit findings. However, at the aggregate level, it summarizes all measures to address the auditing issues. The associate director of the SAO reports it. It may be appropriate to choose B.

102. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) or legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?

GUIDELINES:

Question 102 asks whether the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) or the legislature track actions by the executive to address audit recommendations. After audit results and recommendations are discussed and validated by the legislature, the executive is normally asked to take certain actions to address the audit findings. For accountability purposes, the public needs to be informed about the status of those actions, and steps the executive has taken to address audit recommendations. In addition to the executive reporting on its actions (see Question 101), the SAI and legislature – as the key oversight institutions – have a responsibility to keep the public informed by tracking the executive's progress in addressing audit recommendations.

To answer "a," the SAI or legislature must report publicly on what steps the executive has taken to address all audit findings. A "b" response applies if the SAI or legislature reports publicly on what steps the executive has taken to address most, but not all, audit findings. A "c" response applies if the SAI or legislature reports publicly on what steps the executive has taken to address only some audit findings. As long as the SAI or legislature reports publicly on the steps the executive has taken, answer "a," "b," or "c" may be selected, even if the Audit Report is not made publicly available. A "d" response applies if neither the SAI nor the legislature reports on the executive's steps to address audit findings.

Answer:

c. Yes, the SAI or legislature reports publicly on some audit recommendations.

Source:

National People's Congress, Audit report on 2021 central budget implementation and other fiscal revenue and expenditure. 22 June 2022.

<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/17a7dc825750458ba00b85e5d7b6b18e.shtml>

National Audit Office, Auditing report on 2021 central budget implementation and relevant work. 21 June 2022.

<https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n25/c10252123/content.html>

Comment:

The first link reported the information on institutional improvement and the number of people held accountable in 2020, and mentioned efforts to improve audit work based on the "Opinions on Establishing and Improving a Long-term Mechanism for Rectifying Issues Found in Audits".

The second link mentioned that the Audit Office issued audit reports and decisions in response to the identified issues and provided concise suggestions, but did not disclose detailed information.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: see link provided in the comments section of previous question. <https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n26/c10307718/part/10308252.pdf> the first link provided by researcher no longer works. The second link is a report on the audit of central government departments only.

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

103. Is there an Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) that conducts budget analyses for the budget formulation and/or approval process?

GUIDELINES:

Question 103 examines whether an Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) exists that contributes budget analyses to the budget formulation and/or approval process. According to the Principles for Independent Fiscal Institutions, adopted by the OECD Council in 2014, "independent fiscal institutions are publicly funded, independent bodies under the statutory authority of the executive or the legislature which provide non-partisan oversight and analysis of, and in some cases advice on, fiscal policy and performance", and with "a forward-looking ex ante diagnostic task". In practice, they come in two main forms:

- Parliamentary budget offices (also known as PBOs) such as the Congressional Budget Office in the United States (<https://www.cbo.gov/>), the Parliamentary Budget Office in South Africa (<https://www.parliament.gov.za/parliamentary-budget-office>), and the Center for Public Finance Studies in Mexico (Centro de Estudios de las Finanzas Públicas, <http://www.cefp.gob.mx/>); or
- Fiscal councils such as the Office for Budget Responsibility in the United Kingdom (<https://obr.uk/>) and the High Council for Public Finances in France (Haut Conseil des finances publiques, <https://www.hcfp.fr/>).

For more information, see von Trapp et al. 'Principles for Independent Fiscal Institutions and Case Studies', OECD Journal on Budgeting 15:2 (special issue, 2016), <https://doi.org/10.1787/budget-15-5jm2795tv625>.

To answer "a," there must be an IFI, and its independence must be set in law. In addition, it must have sufficient staffing and resources, including funding, to carry out its tasks. Answer "b" applies if an IFI exists, but either its independence is not set in law or its staffing and resources are insufficient to carry out its tasks. Answer "c" applies if an IFI exists, but its independence is not set in law and it lacks sufficient staffing and resources. Answer "d" applies if no IFI exists.

If the answer is "a," "b," or "c," please specify in the comments the name and type of IFI that exists (e.g., parliamentary budget office or fiscal council). If the answer is "a" or "b," identify the law that guarantees its independence, and provide evidence in support of the assessment of the adequacy of its staffing and resources. This can include the IFI's total budget allocation over recent years, any press reports that discuss perceived funding shortfalls, assessments by international organizations, and/or information from interviews with staff of the IFI.

Answer:

d. No, there is no IFI.

Source:

National People's Congress, Structure of National People's Congress, <http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c507/rdjg.shtml>
National People's Congress, Responsibilities of the Budgetary Affairs Commission, http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c5868/ysgzwyh_listcont.shtml
National People's Congress, Responsibilities of the Financial and Economic Affairs Committee, <http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/czjwyh2023002/202303/7e522d25743543dd820b1fc151e3deda.shtml>
Ministry of Finance, Structure of the Ministry of Finance, <http://www.mof.gov.cn/znjg/jgsz/>
Ministry of Finance, Responsibilities of the Ministry of Finance, <http://www.mof.gov.cn/znjg/bbzn/>

Comment:

In China, the Ministry of Finance is responsible for analyzing the central financial revenue and expenditure and reporting the budget proposal (budget formulation).
The Budgetary Affairs Commission and the Financial and Economic Affairs Committee of the National People's Congress are responsible for reviewing and monitoring fiscal policies and implementation (approval process).
However, these institutions are not independent.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

104. Does the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) publish macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts?

GUIDELINES:

Question 104 assesses whether an Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) has a role in producing the macroeconomic forecast (e.g., GDP growth, inflation, interest rates, etc.) and/or the fiscal forecast (revenues, expenditure, deficits, and debt), and if so, what kind of role it has. Macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasting is a typical core function across IFIs, but their role in forecasting takes several forms (von Trapp et al. 2016, p. 17 and Table 2). Some IFIs produce just a macroeconomic forecast, while others produce a complete fiscal forecast (which also typically requires an underlying macroeconomic forecast). In some

cases, the fiscal forecast reflects continuation of current budget policies; such forecasts can be used by the legislature, the media, or the public to assess the projections in the executive's budget reflecting the government's policy proposals.

Some IFIs produce the official macroeconomic and fiscal forecasts used in the executive's budget. In other cases, IFIs do not prepare their own independent forecasts, but rather produce an assessment of the official estimates, or provide an opinion on, or endorsement of, the government's forecasts. Some others have no role at all in forecasting.

To answer "a", there must be an IFI that publishes both its own macroeconomic AND fiscal forecasts. Answer "b" applies if an IFI publishes its own macroeconomic OR fiscal forecast (but not both). Answer "c" applies if the IFI does not publish a macroeconomic or fiscal forecast, but rather publishes an assessment of the official forecasts produced by the executive and used in the budget. Choose option "d" if there is no IFI; or if there is an IFI that neither publishes its own macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts, nor a commentary on the official forecasts for the budget.

Macroeconomic forecasts may include indicators relating to economic output and economic growth, inflation, and the labor market, amongst others. Fiscal forecasts may include estimates of revenues, expenditures, the budget balance, and debt. If the answer is "a" or "b," please specify which indicators and estimates are included in the forecasts and whether the forecast is used by government as the official forecast. If the answer is "c," please describe the nature and depth of the assessment (e.g., the length of the commentary, or whether it covers both economic and fiscal issues).

Answer:

d. No, there is no IFI; or the IFI neither publishes its own macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts, nor a commentary on the official forecasts produced by the executive.

Source:

Comment:

The answer of the question 103 is D. According to the question guideline, the answer here should be D.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

105. Does the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) publish its own costings of new policy proposals, to assess their impact on the budget?

GUIDELINES:

Question 105 assesses whether an Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) has a costing function that involves assessing the budgetary implications of new policy proposals for both revenues and expenditures, and if so, what kind of role it has. Many IFIs have a costing role, but with substantial diversity in the nature and extent of this work (von Trapp et al 2016, pp. 17-18 and Table 2). Some assess virtually all new policy proposals, while others cost only a selection of new policy proposals. Others only publish opinions on, or scrutinize the costings of, budget measures produced by the executive.

To answer "a," the IFI must publish its own costings of all (or virtually all) new policy proposals. Answer "b" applies if the IFI publishes its own costings, but only for major new policy proposals – for instance, only those proposals that cost or save above a certain amount. Answer "c" applies if the IFI publishes its own costings, but only on a limited number of proposals. This could occur, for instance, if the IFI lacked the capacity to assess proposals dealing with certain sectors. Instead of producing a cost estimate, it can also publish an assessment of the estimates produced by the executive. Answer "d" applies if there is no IFI; or if the IFI does not publish its own costings of new policy proposals or provide an assessment of the official costings of new policy proposals.

Answer:

d. No, there is no IFI; or the IFI does not publish its own costings of new policy proposals.

Source:

Comment:

The answer of the question 103 is D. According to the question guideline, the answer here should be D.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion:

106. In the past 12 months, how frequently did the head or a senior staff member of the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) take part and testify in hearings of a committee of the legislature?

GUIDELINES:

Question 106 concerns the interaction between two important oversight actors and assesses how frequently the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) made high-level inputs to the work of legislative committees. Almost all IFIs interact with the legislature in some form (von Trapp et al 2016, p. 18), but the intensity of the interaction varies. This question assesses this aspect by asking, with reference to the past 12 months, how frequently the head or a senior staff member of the IFI took part and testified in hearings of a committee of the legislature. The intent is to assess the extent to which the IFI staff member in question was not only present at a meeting of a legislative committee, but was an active participant (as opposed to a passive observer, serving only as a resource when called upon). As evidence to support your answer, you can refer to official records of legislative committees, websites and annual reports of the IFI, press releases and media coverage, for example. Choose answer "a" if this occurred five times or more; "b" for three times or more, but less than five times; and "c" for once or twice. Answer "d" should be selected if the head or a senior staff member of the IFI never took part and testified in hearings of a committee of the legislature, or if there is no IFI.

Answer:

d. Never, or there is no IFI.

Source:

Comment:

The answer of the question 103 is D. According to the question guideline, the answer here should be D.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion:

107. Does the full legislature and/or a legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal?

GUIDELINES:

Question 107 asks whether the legislature debated budget policies prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal for the most recent budget year before the research cut-off date. In general, prior to discussing the Executive's Budget Proposal for the coming year, the legislature should have an opportunity to review the government's broad budget priorities and fiscal parameters. Often times this information is laid out in a Pre-Budget Statement, which the executive presents to the legislature for debate. (See Questions 54-58.)

A number of countries conduct a pre-budget debate in the legislature around six months before the start of the budget year. In some cases, they adopt laws that guide the upcoming budget, for example the Budget Guidelines Law in Brazil and the Spring Fiscal Policy Bill in Sweden. A pre-budget debate can serve two main purposes: 1) to allow the executive to inform the legislature of its fiscal policy intentions by presenting updated reports on its annual and medium-term budget strategy and policy priorities; and 2) to establish "hard" multi-year fiscal targets or spending ceilings, which the government must adhere to when preparing its detailed spending estimates for the upcoming budget year.

To answer "a," the full legislature must debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal and approve recommendations for the upcoming budget.

Answer "b" applies if a legislative committee (but not the full legislature) debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal, and

approves recommendations for the budget. Option “b” also applies if, in addition to the action by the committee, the full legislature also debates budget policy in advance of the budget, but does not approve recommendations.

Answer “c” applies if the full legislature and/or a legislative committee debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive’s Budget Proposal, but does not approve recommendations for the budget. Answer “d” applies if neither the full legislature nor any legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive’s Budget Proposal.

In your comment, please indicate the dates of the budget debate, and if both the full legislature and a legislative committee held a debate. Note that a debate does not need to be open to the public, but a public record of the meeting or a public notice that the meeting occurred is required. In addition, please indicate whether the budget debate was focused on a Pre-Budget Statement published by the Executive. If the Executive did not publish a Pre-Budget Statement, then please indicate what served as the focus of the legislature’s debate (for instance, a report released by an IFI or some other institution).

Answer:

d. No, neither the full legislature nor any legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive’s Budget Proposal.

Source:

National People’s Congress, Budget Law, effective since 1 January 2015. https://www.gov.cn/zhengce/content/2020-08/20/content_5536179.htm
Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm
The National People’s Congress of the People’s Republic of China, Financial and Economic Affairs Committee reviews the State Council’s plan and budgeting in 2022 according to law. 7 March 2022. https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-03/07/content_5677725.htm
State Council, National People’s Congress approved the 2022 budget proposal. 11 March 2022. https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-03/11/content_5678444.htm

Comment:

In Chapter 5, Article 44 of China’s Budget Law (effective since 2015), “The financial department of the State Council shall, at least 45 days before the beginning of the annual session of the National People’s Congress, submit the preliminary proposal of the draft central budget to the Financial and Economic Affairs Committee of the National People’s Congress for preliminary review.”

Based on the law, the Financial and Economic Affairs Committee started to review the EBP and formulate review report (third link). Before that, an abstract of the budget proposal was released to the public (second link).

The Financial and Economic Affairs Committee may debate the budget policy prior to the tabling of the EBP. However, we don’t find any public evidence, showing the important role of the legislative committee.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

108. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the Executive’s Budget Proposal?

GUIDELINES:

Question 108 examines how far in advance of the start of the most recent budget year the legislature receives the Executive’s Budget Proposal. International good practice recommends that the Executive’s Budget Proposal should be submitted to the legislature far enough in advance to allow the legislature time to review it properly, or at least three months prior to the start of the fiscal year. (See, for instance, Principle 2.2.2 of the IMF’s Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>)).

For the purposes of responding to this question, if – and only if – the most recent budget submission occurred later than usual as a result of a particular event, such as an election, please use a more normal year as the basis for the response. If, however, delays have been observed for more than one budget year, and the legislature has not received the Executive’s Budget Proposal in a timely manner on more than one occasion in the last three years, then “d” will be the appropriate answer.

To answer “a,” the legislature must receive the Executive’s Budget Proposal at least three months in advance of the start of the budget year. Answer “b” applies if the legislature receives the Executive’s Budget Proposal at least two months, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year. Answer “c” applies if the legislature receives the Executive’s Budget Proposal at least one month, but less than two months, before the start of the budget year.

Answer "d" applies if the legislature does not receive the Executive's Budget Proposal at least one month prior to the start of the budget year, or does not receive it at all.

Answer:

d. The legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal less than one month before the start of the budget year, or does not receive it at all.

Source:

National People's Congress, Budget Law, effective since 1 January 2015. https://www.gov.cn/zhengce/content/2020-08/20/content_5536179.htm
Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.
http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

Comment:

In Chapter 5, Article 44 of China's Budget Law (effective since 2015), "The financial department of the State Council shall, at least 45 days before the beginning of the annual session of the National People's Congress, submit the preliminary proposal of the draft central budget to the Financial and Economic Affairs Committee of the National People's Congress for preliminary review."

Article 47 specifies that State Council should report the fiscal policy implementation and the budget proposal to the National People's Congress during the Two Sessions.

China's fiscal year begins at 1 January 2022. The second link presents the EBP was submitted to the National People's Congress on 5 March 2022.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

109. When does the legislature approve the Executive's Budget Proposal?

GUIDELINES:

Question 109 examines when the legislature approves the Executive's Budget Proposal. International good practice recommends that the Executive's Budget Proposal should be approved by the legislature before the start of the fiscal year the budget proposal refers to. This gives the executive time to implement the budget in its entirety, particularly new programs and policies.

In some countries, the expenditure and revenue estimates of the Executive's Budget Proposal are approved separately; for purposes of this question, at least the expenditure estimates must be approved. Further, approval of the budget implies approval of the full-year budget, not just a short-term continuation of spending and revenue authority.

To answer "a," the legislature must approve the Executive's Budget Proposal at least one month before the start of the budget year. Answer "b" applies if the legislature approves the Executive's Budget Proposal less than one month in advance of the start of the budget year, but at least by the start of the budget year. Answer "c" applies if the legislature approves the Executive's Budget Proposal less than one month after the start of the budget year. Answer "d" applies if the legislature approves the Executive's Budget Proposal more than one month after the start of the budget year, or does not approve the budget.

Answer:

d. The legislature approves the budget more than one month after the start of the budget year, or does not approve the budget.

Source:

State Council, National People's Congress approved the 2022 budget proposal. 11 March 2022. https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-03/11/content_5678444.htm

Comment:

China's fiscal year begins at 1 January 2022. The link presents the EBP was submitted to the National People's Congress on 5 March 2022, more than a month later than the start of the budget year.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

110. Does the legislature have the authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal?

GUIDELINES:

Question 110 examines the legislature's power to amend—as opposed to simply accept or reject—the budget proposal presented by the executive. This question is about legal authority rather than actions the legislature takes in practice. The legislature's powers to amend the budget can vary substantially across countries.

The "a" response is appropriate only if there are no restrictions on the right of the legislature to modify the Executive's Budget Proposal, including its right to change the size of the proposed deficit or surplus. The "b" response would be appropriate if, for instance, the legislature is restricted from changing the deficit or surplus, but it still has the power to increase or decrease funding and revenue levels. The more limited "c" response would apply if, for instance, the legislature can only re-allocate spending within the totals set in the Executive's Budget Proposal or can only decrease funding levels or increase revenues. Finally, response "d" would apply if the legislature may not make any changes (or only small technical changes), or if amendments must first be approved by the executive. In these cases, the legislature is essentially only able to approve or reject the budget as a whole. If the answer is "b" or "c", please indicate the nature of the amendment powers available to the Parliament and how they are limited.

Answer:

d. No, the legislature does not have any authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal.

Source:

National People's Congress, Budget Law, effective since 1 January 2015. https://www.gov.cn/zhengce/content/2020-08/20/content_5536179.htm
The National People's Congress of the People's Republic of China, Financial and Economic Affairs Committee reviews the State Council's plan and budgeting in 2022 according to law. 7 March 2022. https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-03/07/content_5677725.htm

Comment:

According to the Budget Law of China (effective since 2015), Chapter 5 Article 43, "The central budget shall be examined and approved by the National People's Congress". In other words, National People's Congress, in law, only has the authority to approve, not the authority to amend, the Executive's Budget Proposal.

Nevertheless, Article 44 states that "The financial department of the State Council shall, at least 45 days before the beginning of the annual session of the National People's Congress, submit the preliminary proposal of the draft central budget to the Financial and Economic Affairs Committee of the National People's Congress for preliminary review." This provides a mechanism by which the Legislature can provide comments and perhaps informal amendments to the budget proposal.

The second link presents the Financial and Economic Affairs Committee reviews the budget proposal and only provides some very vague suggestions.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

111. During the most recent budget approval process, did the legislature use its authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal?

GUIDELINES:

Question 111 assesses whether any formal authority of the legislature to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal is used in practice. The responses to this question should be determined based on action by the legislature related to the Enacted Budget used in the OBS. Choose answer "a" if the legislature used its authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal during the most recent budget approval process, and amendments were adopted (all, or at least some of them). Answer "a" also applies if the legislature used its authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal, but the amendments were rejected by executive veto. Answer "b" applies if the legislature used its authority in law to propose amendments to the Executive's Budget Proposal, but none of these amendments were adopted. Answer "c" applies if the legislature has the authority in law to amend the budget, but no amendments were proposed

during its consideration. Answer "d" applies when the legislature does not have any authority to amend the budget (that is, Question 110 is answered "d").

If the answer is "a" or "b", please specify in the comments the number of amendments introduced by the legislature (and in the case of an "a" response, the number adopted, or if applicable, information about an executive veto) and describe their nature. For example, did the amendments result in an increase or decrease of the deficit? What were the most significant amendments to revenues and to expenditures in terms of the sums involved? How did amendments affect the composition of expenditures? If the answer is "a," please specify which amendments were adopted, and provide evidence for it.

Answer:

d. No, the legislature does not have any such authority.

Source:

Comment:

See the answer and comments in Question 110. The answer of the question 110 is D. According to the question guideline, the answer here should be D.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

112. During the last budget approval process, did a specialized budget or finance committee in the legislature examine the Executive's Budget Proposal?

GUIDELINES:

Question 112 assesses the role of a specialized budget or finance committee during the budget approval stage. Effective committee involvement is an essential condition for legislative influence in the budget process. Specialized committees provide opportunities for individual legislators to gain relevant expertise, and to examine budgets and policy in depth. Yet, the involvement of committees differs across legislatures. Some legislatures have separate committees to examine spending and tax proposals, while others have a single finance committee. Not all legislatures have a specialized budget or finance committee to examine the budget. In addition, there can be differences in the time available for the committee's analysis of the budget.

A report with the committee's findings and recommendations is intended to inform the debate in the full legislature, therefore it must be published before the legislature has adopted the budget.

Response "a" requires that, in the last budget approval process, a specialized budget or finance committee had one month or more to examine the Executive's Budget Proposal, and it published a report with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted. Response "b" applies where such a committee examined the draft budget and published a report, but within a shorter timeframe of less than one month. Response "c" applies if a committee examined the budget (without regard to the time period), but did not publish a report prior to the adoption of the budget. Response "d" applies where a specialized budget or finance committee did not examine the Executive's Budget Proposal.

Please specify in your comment the name of the committee and the number of days it had available to examine the budget. For bicameral legislatures where one house or chamber has greater constitutional authority in budgetary matters, the question applies to the house or chamber (usually the upper or second one) that is decisive. For bicameral legislatures with co-equal houses or chambers, the question should be answered with reference to the one that achieves the higher score for this question. In the case of bicameral legislatures, please note the relevant arrangements in each house or chamber. If applicable, provide a copy of the report. Please note also if a report is published, but only after the budget has been adopted.

Answer:

b. Yes, a specialized budget or finance committee had less than one month to examine the Executive's Budget Proposal, and it published a report with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.

Source:

Ministry of Finance, Abstract of the Budget Proposal. 5 March 2022.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/202203/t20220305_3792848.htm

The National People's Congress of the People's Republic of China, Financial and Economic Affairs Committee reviews the State Council's plan and budgeting in 2022 according to law. 7 March 2022. https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-03/07/content_5677725.htm

State Council, National People's Congress approved the 2022 budget proposal. 11 March 2022. https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-03/11/content_5678444.htm

Comment:

On 5 March 2022, EBP was submitted to the NPC by the Ministry of Finance (first link). The Financial and Economic Affairs Committee, then, discussed and reviewed the budget proposal, and prepared a review report on 7 March 2022 (second link). The review report of last year's implementation and comments on the new budget proposal was submitted to and approved by the national meeting by 11 March 2022 (third link). The process is less than one month.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

113. During the last approval process, did legislative committees, responsible for particular sectors (e.g., health, education, defense, etc.), examine spending in the Executive's Budget Proposal related to the sector for which they are responsible?

GUIDELINES:

Question 113 assesses the role of committees of the legislature that are responsible for particular sectors (e.g., health, education, defense, etc.) during the budget approval stage. The role of sectoral committees differs across legislatures. Some legislatures do not involve them in the budget approval process, while others do. In addition, the time available for committee analysis differs.

A report with the committee's findings and recommendations is intended to inform the debate in the full legislature, so therefore must be published before the legislature has adopted the budget. Response "a" requires that sector committees had one month or more to examine the Executive's Budget Proposal, and published a report with findings and recommendations prior the budget being adopted. Response "b" applies where such committees examined the draft budget and published a report, but within a shorter timeframe of less than one month. Response "c" applies if sectoral committees examined the budget (without regard to the time period), but did not publish a report prior to the adoption of the budget. Response "d" applies where sectoral committees did not examine the Executive's Budget Proposal.

Please note that the examination of sectoral budgets by a specialized budget or finance committee is assessed in Question 112 and should not be considered for this question.

Please provide in the comments a brief overview of the committee structure and specify the number of days that sectoral committees had available to examine the budget and to publish their reports. For bicameral legislatures where one house or chamber has greater constitutional authority in budgetary matters, the question applies to the house or chamber (usually the upper or second one) that is decisive. For bicameral legislatures with co-equal houses or chambers, the question should be answered with reference to the one that achieves the higher score for this question. In the case of bicameral legislatures, please note the relevant arrangements in each house or chamber. If applicable, provide a sample copy of at least one of the reports. Please note if a report is published, but only after the budget has been adopted.

For purposes of responding to this question, use those sectoral committees that are best performing – that is, the ones that examine the budget the longest and that publish reports.

Answer:

d. No, sector committees did not examine the Executive's Budget Proposal.

Source:

The National People's Congress of the People's Republic of China, Financial and Economic Affairs Committee reviews the State Council's plan and budgeting in 2022 according to law. 7 March 2022. https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-03/07/content_5677725.htm

Comment:

No other sector committees examined the budget proposal during the Two Sessions, although national representatives may discuss it during the small group discussion sessions.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

114. In the past 12 months, did a committee of the legislature examine in-year implementation of the Enacted Budget during the relevant budget execution period?

GUIDELINES:

Question 114 is about legislative oversight of budget execution. It assesses whether and how often a committee examined the implementation of the budget during the budget execution period (i.e., financial year) for which it was approved, and whether this resulted in an official report with findings and recommendations. This question does not apply to the ex post review of implementation following the end of the budget year as part of the audit stage, which is assessed separately. Nor does it apply to the legislature's review of the budget that it may undertake as part of the process of considering a supplemental budget during the year. In-year monitoring by the legislature will be affected by the frequency that the executive publishes In-Year Reports.

To answer "a," a committee must have examined in-year implementation of the Enacted Budget at least three times during the course of the relevant budget year and published reports with findings and recommendations. Answer "b" applies where this occurred only once or twice during the year.

Exception: If a legislature is in session only twice during the year, and it examines the implementation of the budget during both sessions, then it would be eligible for an "a" response.

Choose "c" if a committee examined in-year implementation (without regard to frequency), but did not publish any report with findings and recommendations. Answer "d" applies where no committee examined in-year implementation.

If the answer is "a" or "b," please specify the name of the committee and when it reviewed budget implementation, and provide a copy of its report(s). If the answer is "c," please specify the name of the committee and when it reviewed budget implementation.

For purposes of responding to this question, if more than one committee holds in-year reviews of the budget, use the committee that is best performing – that is, the one that examines in-year implementation the most times and that publishes a report.

Answer:

d. No, a committee did not examine in-year implementation.

Source:

National People's Congress, The State Council has submitted the "Report on the Implementation of the Budget Since the Beginning of this Year" for review. 1 September 2022. <http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202209/d2b5cf01e9f9467cb2d7a5996193dfa7.shtml>

Comment:

The MOF reports the in-year implementation to the National People's Congress Standing Committee, not the Financial and Economic Affairs Committee. So far, there is no evidence to indicate that the Financial and Economic Affairs Committee has conducted any review of the in-year implementation or published any findings or recommendations.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

115. Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units that receive explicit funding in the Enacted Budget, and is it legally required to do so?

GUIDELINES:

Question 115 examines whether the executive seeks approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, and whether it is legally required to do so.

In some countries, the executive has the power in law to adjust funding levels for specific appropriations during the execution of the budget. This question examines rules around shifting funds between administrative units (ministries, departments, or agencies) or whatever funding unit (or "vote") is specified in the

Enacted Budget.

The conditions under which the executive may exercise its discretion to shift funds should be clearly defined in publicly available regulations or law. In addition, the amount of funds that the executive is allowed to transfer between administrative units should not be so excessive as to undermine the accountability of the executive to the legislature.

To answer "a," the executive is required by law or regulation to obtain prior legislative approval before shifting funds between administrative units, and it does so in practice. Answer "b" applies if the executive obtains legislative approval before shifting funds between administrative units, but is not legally required to do so. Answer "c" applies if the executive is legally required to receive legislative approval before shifting funds, but does not do so in practice. Answer "d" applies if legislative approval is not legally required for the executive to shift funds between administrative units and the executive does not obtain legislative approval in practice. Answer "d" also applies if the executive is authorized to shift an amount considered so excessive as to undermine accountability (roughly equal to 3 percent of total budgeted expenditures). A "d" response applies if the legislature only approves the shifting of funds after it has already occurred.

In the comments, please indicate any law or regulation that provides the executive with standing authority to shift funds between administrative units and, if so, describe that authority. Similarly, legislative approval for shifting funds between administrative units typically occurs with the adoption of legislation such as a supplemental budget. But if other formal procedures for gaining approval from the legislature exist, then please provide information about that approval process.

Answer:

c. The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, but in practice the executive shifts funds before obtaining approval from the legislature.

Source:

National People's Congress, Budget Law, effective since 1 January 2015. http://www.npc.gov.cn/wxzl/gongbao/2014-11/02/content_1892137.htm

Comment:

Article 69 of the Budget Law specifies that the Financial department should submit the adjusted budget proposal to the Financial and Economic Affairs Committee for preliminary review at least 30 days before the meeting of the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress. And the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress will decide whether it approves the revision.

Thus, legislative approval is required. Nevertheless, sometimes, the Finance Ministry may not need the legislature approval in practice. Thus, C would be the appropriate answer.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

116. Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenue (that is, amounts higher than originally anticipated) that may become available during the budget execution period, and is it legally required to do so?

GUIDELINES:

Question 116 examines whether the executive receives approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenue, and whether it is legally required to do so. Good practice requires the legislature to approve changes in revenue or expenditure relative to the Enacted Budget. For example, if additional revenue is collected unexpectedly during the year, which often happens in oil/mineral-dependent countries, and it was not accounted for in the Enacted Budget, there should be a procedure in place to ensure that the legislature approves any proposed use of these "new" funds. If such requirements are not in place, the executive might deliberately underestimate revenue in the budget proposal it submits to the legislature, in order to have additional resources to spend at the executive's discretion, with no legislative control.

To answer "a," the executive is required by law or regulation to obtain prior legislative approval before spending any funds resulting from higher-than-expected revenues, and it does so in practice. Answer "b" applies if the executive obtains legislative approval before spending excess revenue, but is not legally required to do so. Answer "c" applies if the executive is legally required to receive legislative approval before spending excess revenue, but does not do so in practice. Answer "d" applies if prior legislative approval is not legally required for the executive to spend excess revenue and the executive does not obtain legislative approval in practice. A "d" response applies if the legislature only approves the additional spending after it has already occurred.

Typically, legislative approval of additional spending beyond what was reflected in the Enacted Budget would occur with the adoption of a supplemental budget. But other formal procedures for getting approval from the legislature in advance of it adopting the supplemental budget may exist. If that is the case,

then please provide information about that approval process.

Answer:

c. The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenues, but in practice the executive spends these funds before obtaining approval from the legislature.

Source:

National People's Congress, Budget Law, effective since 1 January 2015. http://www.npc.gov.cn/wxzl/gongbao/2014-11/02/content_1892137.htm
State Council, the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress approved the adjusted central budget proposal in 2016. 7 November 2016. http://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2016-11/07/content_5129789.htm

Comment:

Chapter 6, Article 66 of the Budget Law of China: "If there is over-receipt income in the annual general public budget implementation at all levels, it can only be used to offset the deficit or supplement the budget stabilization fund."

Article 69 of the Budget Law specifies that the Financial department should submit the adjusted budget proposal submit to the Financial and Economic Affairs Committee for preliminary review at least 30 days before the meeting of the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress. Besides, it states that the adjusted budget proposal should be approved by the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress. Therefore, the adjusted proposal is required to be approved by the National People's Congress.

However, the central government and the Ministry of Finance emphasize the stringent control of excess revenue (the message can be found in the Budget Proposal, such as the budget proposals of 2016/17 and 2020/21). And the articles above have specified the use of excess revenue. There are few cases that are relevant to this question.

The adjusted budget proposal in 2016 was caused by the increased central revenue. The Ministry of Finance submitted the proposal to the National People's Congress for approval. Thus, the practice did follow the law.

The case provided in the last review was the practice at the local level.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

117. Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below the levels in the Enacted Budget in response to revenue shortfalls (that is, revenues lower than originally anticipated) or other reasons during the budget execution period, and is it legally required to do so?

GUIDELINES:

Question 117 examines whether the executive receives approval from the legislature prior to cutting spending below the levels in the Enacted Budget in response to revenue shortfalls or for any other reason, and whether it is legally required to do so. Good practice requires the legislature to approve changes in revenue or expenditure relative to the Enacted Budget. For example, if less revenue is collected unexpectedly during the year, the legislature should approve or reject any proposed reductions in expenditures that are implemented as a result. If such requirements are not in place, the executive might substantially change the composition of the budget at the executive's discretion, with no legislative control.

Typically, legislative approval of proposals to reduce spending below the levels reflected in the Enacted Budget would occur as part of the supplemental budget. But other formal procedures for getting approval from the legislature in advance of it adopting the supplemental budget may exist. If that is the case, then please provide information about that approval process.

To answer "a," the executive is required by law or regulation to obtain prior legislative approval before implementing spending cuts in response to revenue shortfalls or for other reasons, and it does so in practice. Answer "b" applies if the executive received legislative approval before implementing such cuts, but is not legally required to do so. Answer "c" applies if the executive is legally required to obtain legislative approval before implementing such cuts, but does not do so in practice. Answer "d" applies if legislative approval is not legally required for the executive to implement such cuts and the executive does not obtain such approval in practice. A "d" response applies if the legislature only approves the spending cuts after they have already occurred.

Answer:

c. The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below enacted levels, but in practice the executive implements these cuts before seeking approval from the legislature.

Source:

Comment:

The answer is similar to the previous one.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

118. Did a committee of the legislature examine the Audit Report on the annual budget produced by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 118 is about ex post oversight following the implementation of the budget. It probes whether a committee examined the Audit Report on the annual budget produced by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI), and whether this resulted in an official report with findings and recommendations. A key issue is how soon after the SAI releases the report does it legislature review it. This question does not apply to the legislative scrutiny of in-year implementation of the Enacted Budget during the relevant budget execution period, which is assessed separately. Also, the question is asking specifically about the SAI's annual report on the execution of the budget, not about other audit reports that the SAI may produce. (This is the Audit Report used for responding to Question 98.)

To answer "a," a legislative committee must have examined the annual Audit Report within three months of it being released by the SAI, and then published a report (or reports) with findings and recommendations. (Note that the three-month period should only take into account time when the legislature is in session.)

Answer "b" applies when the committee examines it within six months of it being released (but more than three months), and then published a report with its findings and recommendations. Choose "c" if a committee examined the annual Audit Report more than six months after it became available or it did not publish any report with findings and recommendations. Answer "d" applies where no committee examined the annual Audit Report.

If the answer is "a" or "b," please specify the name of the committee and when it reviewed the Audit Report, and provide a copy of its report(s). If the answer is "c," please specify the name of the committee and when it reviewed budget implementation. Answers "a," "b," or "c" may be selected if the Audit Report is produced by the SAI but not made publicly available.

Answer:

c. Yes, a committee examined the Audit Report on the annual budget, but it did so after the report had been available for more than six months or it did not publish any report with findings and recommendations.

Source:

National People's Congress, Audit report on 2021 central budget implementation and other fiscal revenue and expenditure. 22 June 2022.

<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/17a7dc825750458ba00b85e5d7b6b18e.shtml>

State Council, Report of the Financial and Economic Affairs Committee of the 13th National People's Congress on the review results of the 2021 central final accounts proposal. 25 June 2022. https://www.gov.cn/xinwen/2022-06/25/content_5697692.htm

Comment:

The first link shows that the National Audit Office reported the audit report to the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress.

The second link presents the Financial and Economic Affairs Committee reviewed the annual audit report of 2021. This link also presents the Financial and Economic Affairs Committee reports some issues in budget implementation.

The audit report was submitted within 6 months.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

119. Was the process of appointing (or re-appointing) the current head of the SAI carried out in a way that ensures his or her independence?

GUIDELINES:

Question 119 concerns the appointment process of the current head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI). Appointment procedures vary greatly across countries, as well as across different types of SAIs. Moreover, conventions and informal practices can greatly affect the de facto independence of the head of the SAI. While these factors make it difficult to devise a single metric against which all SAIs can be assessed with regard to this particular aspect, this question focuses on whether the legislature or judiciary must appoint or approve the appointment of the head of the SAI as a way to ensure the SAI's independence from the executive. However, if the appointment is carried out in another way that nonetheless ensures the independence of the SAI head, then that approach could be also considered.

To answer "a," the legislature or judiciary must appoint (or re-appoint) the head of the SAI, or approve the recommendation of the executive, as a way that ensure his or her independence from the executive. (As noted above, alternative approaches may also be acceptable.) Choose "b" if the appointment process does not ensure the independence of the head of the SAI, e.g. the executive may appoint the head of the SAI without the final consent of the legislature or judiciary.

Irrespective of which answer you selected, provide a description of how the head of the SAI is appointed.

Answer:

a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be appointed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before the appointment takes effect.

Source:

State Council, The Constitution of the People's Republic of China. https://www.gov.cn/guoqing/2018-03/22/content_5276318.htm
Xinhua Agency, Order of the President No 50. 30 June 2020. http://www.xinhuanet.com/politics/leaders/2020-06/30/c_1126178819.htm

Comment:

Article 62 of the Constitution stipulates that the Congress has the power to appoint the candidate for the head of the SAI based on the nomination by the Premier of the State Council.

The second link shows that the appointment of the SAI head was decided by the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress and promulgated by the President.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

120. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?

GUIDELINES:

Question 120 covers the manner in which the head or senior members of the SAI may be removed from office. This question draws on best practices identified in the Lima Declaration of Guidelines on Auditing Precepts (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/LimaDeclaration.pdf>), including measures intended to guarantee the office's independence from the executive.

To answer "a," the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before the head of the SAI is removed. For example, the legislature or judiciary may give final consent following a certain external process, such as a criminal proceeding. So while the executive may initiate a criminal proceeding, the final consent of a member of the judiciary – or a judge – is necessary to render a verdict of wrongdoing that may lead to the removal from office of the head of the SAI. Answer "b" applies if the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.

Answer:

a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before he or she is removed.

Source:

State Council, The Constitution of the People's Republic of China. https://www.gov.cn/guoqing/2018-03/22/content_5276318.htm
Xinhua Agency, Order of the President No 50. 30 June 2020. http://www.xinhuanet.com/politics/leaders/2020-06/30/c_1126178819.htm

Comment:

Article 62 of the Constitution stipulates that the Congress has the power to remove the head of the SAI.
The second link shows that the appointment and the removal of the SAI head were decided by the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress and promulgated by the President.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

121. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI)?*GUIDELINES:*

Question 121 asks who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI). To ensure objective audits of government budgets, another important component of the SAI's independence from the executive is the extent to which the SAI's budget is determined by a body other than the executive, and whether the SAI has adequate resources to fulfill its mandate.

Answer "a" applies if the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate, AND either the SAI determines its own budget and then submits it to the executive (which accepts it with little or no change) or directly to the legislature, or the budget of the SAI is determined directly by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body). Answer "b" applies if the SAI's budget is determined by the executive (absent a recommendation from the SAI), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. Answer "c" applies if the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body) determines the SAI's budget, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. Answer "d" applies if the executive determines the SAI's budget, and the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. Please provide evidence in support of the assessment that the funding level is or is not broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.

Answer:

b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.

Source:

National Audit Office, Audit Law, <https://www.audit.gov.cn/n6/n36/n10083637/c10191187/content.html>
Departmental budget of National Audit Office, The departmental budget of the NAO 2022, 24 March 2022.
<https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n521/n1573/c10224658/content.html>

Comment:

According to the Audit Law of China, Chapter 2, Article 11, "Funds necessary for audit institutions to perform their functions shall be included in the budgets of the governments and supported by the government at the corresponding levels".
The latest departmental budget of the National Audit Office shows that its functions are comprehensive.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

122. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have the discretion in law to undertake those audits it may wish to?

GUIDELINES:

Question 122 explores the scope of the investigative powers of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) as prescribed in law.

Question 97 asks which of the three types of audits – financial, compliance, and performance – the SAI conducts. This question asks if the SAI is constrained by law (rather than by a lack of capacity or an inadequate budget) from undertaking any form of audit or investigating irregularities in any program or activity.

There are numerous examples of limitations. For instance, some SAIs are not permitted by their legal mandate to audit joint ventures or other public-private arrangements. Others are only allowed to undertake financial audits, precluded from conducting performance or value-for-money audits. The SAIs in some countries do not have the legal mandate to review arrangements involving oil or stabilization funds, or other types of special or extra-budgetary funds. The SAI may also not have the ability to audit commercial projects involving the public and private sector.

To answer “a,” the SAI must have full discretion in law to decide which audits to undertake. Answer “b” applies if some limitations exist, but the SAI enjoys significant discretion to undertake those audits it wishes to. Answer “c” applies if the SAI has some discretion, but significant legal limitations exist. Answer “d” applies if the SAI has no power at all to choose which audits to undertake

Consulting the Lima Declaration of Guidelines on Auditing Precepts (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/LimaDeclaration.pdf>) may be useful in answering this question as its provisions serve to define the appropriate scope of a SAI’s legal mandate and jurisdiction.

Answer:

c. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations.

Source:

National Audit Office of China, Introduction of the National Audit Office. <http://www.audit.gov.cn/n10/n14/index.html>

Comment:

The Central Audit Committee chaired by the General Secretary of the Party was established to supervise the National Audit Office in 2019. This suggests that the auditing work should follow the instructions and guidelines of the Party.

The Introduction (the link) further specifies the major auditing work of the NAO. Therefore, the NAO has considerable limit in deciding its auditing agenda by its own.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

123. Are the audit processes of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) reviewed by an independent agency?

GUIDELINES:

Question 123 assesses whether and to what extent the audit processes of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) are subject to review by an independent agency. The latter could be a peer SAI, an international organization, an academic institution with relevant expertise, or an independent domestic agency with quality assurance functions in the area of financial reporting.

To answer “a,” an independent agency must conduct and publish a review of the audit processes of the SAI on an annual basis. Answer “b” applies if a review was carried out within the past five years, and published, but it is not conducted annually, but. Choose answer “c” if the SAI has an internal unit that reviews the audit processes of the SAI on a regular basis, but an independent agency does not conduct such a review. Answer “d” applies if the audit processes of the SAI are reviewed neither by an independent agency nor by a unit within the SAI.

If the answer is either “a” or “b,” please specify the name of the independent agency and when last it conducted such a review, and provide a copy of the published report. If the answer is “c,” please specify the name of the unit within the SAI that is tasked with conducting such reviews.

Answer:

d. No, the audit processes of the SAI are reviewed neither by an independent agency nor by a unit within the SAI.

Source:

National Audit Office of China, Internal organizational structure of the NAO. <http://www.audit.gov.cn/n10/n16/n49/index.html>

Comment:

According to the website's introduction, there is no formal department called "department of Quality Assurance". Although there is a unit named "department of internal audit supervision", and it is responsible for evaluation on the audit work of the Audit Office. It is not stated that the evaluation is conducted on a regular basis (requirement for answer C). More importantly, it is not an independent organization. Thus, Answer D is chosen for this question.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

124. In the past 12 months, how frequently did the head or a senior staff member of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) take part and testify in hearings of a committee of the legislature?

GUIDELINES:

Question 124 concerns the interaction between two important oversight actors and assesses how frequently the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) made high-level inputs to the work of legislative committees. Many SAIs interact with the legislature in some form, but the nature and intensity of the interaction varies. This question probes this aspect by asking, with reference to the past 12 months, how frequently the head or a senior staff member of the SAI took part and testified in hearings of a committee of the legislature. The intent is to assess the extent to which the SAI representative in question was not only present at a meeting of a legislative committee, but was an active participant (as opposed to a passive observer, serving only as a resource when called upon). You can refer to official records of legislative committees, websites and annual reports of the SAI, press releases and media coverage, for example. Choose answer "a" if this occurred five times or more; "b" for three times or more, but less than five times; "c" for once or twice, and "d" for never.

Answer:

c. Rarely (i.e., once or twice).

Source:

National Audit Office, Audit report on the implementation of the 2021 central budget. 21 June 2022.

<https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n26/c10252052/content.html>

National Audit Office, Audit report on the implementation of the 2021 central budget. 28 December 2022.

<https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n26/c10307718/content.html>

Comment:

The NAO website highlights two sessions when the director of the NAO presented the audit reports to the National People's Congress in 2022.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

125. Does the executive use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during the formulation of the annual budget (prior to the budget being tabled in parliament)?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principles on "Inclusiveness" and "Timeliness" and assesses the extent to which the participation mechanism(s) used by the executive are truly interactive and involve a two-way conversation between citizens and the executive.

The drafting of this question and its answers are partially drawn from the IAP2 Spectrum of Public Participation, in particular with regards to the concepts of "involvement" (option "a" in the responses) and "consultation" (option "b"). See:

https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/foundations_course/IAP2_P2_Spectrum_FINAL.pdf.

Please consider only participation mechanisms that the Ministry of Finance, lead budget agency, or central coordinating agency designated by the government to implement participation mechanisms ("the executive") is currently using to allow the public to participate in the formulation of the annual budget, including annual pre-budget discussions. Participation mechanisms used only by line ministries should not be used to answer this question. If there is more than one mechanism used by the executive, please select the deepest or most interactive mechanism that reflects the government's efforts to incorporate citizens' input into the formulation of the annual budget. The participation mechanisms can involve a range of different issues, such as spending and tax policy, funding and revenue levels, and macro-fiscal planning.

To answer "a," the executive must use open participation mechanisms that involve the public in the formulation of the annual budget. This means that a public process is in place whereby CSOs and/or individual members of the public and government officials interact, and have the opportunity to express their opinions to each other in what can be considered a public dialogue between them (i.e., in-person and online discussion forums). Additionally, the mechanism should be open to any CSO and/or individual members of the public who wish to participate. By selecting this answer, the researcher must present evidence to support the presence of a public dialogue among citizens and government officials. Examples include public meetings and online deliberative exchanges.

Answer "b" applies if an open consultation mechanism is in place whereby members of the public (i.e., individuals and/or CSOs as well as academics, independent experts, policy think tanks, and business organizations) can provide their input in the formulation of the annual budget. This answer applies if the government is using a mechanism that is structured and well established, and not ad-hoc. The researcher must present evidence to support the presence of consultative processes through which the executive seeks out inputs from citizens. Examples include surveys, focus groups, report cards, published policy consultation exercises, and online platforms that government officials actively manage to solicit inputs.

Answer "c" applies if the executive has established a mechanism or mechanisms to allow citizens to participate in the budget formulation phase, but:

1) The mechanisms are not structured and happen only on ad-hoc basis, or not regularly.

and/or

2) The executive consults with and/or interacts with, citizens, but there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, and the executive determines fully or partially such selection process by inviting specific groups (for example by making an open call but just to experts from a particular sector, or naming specific organizations). While it is not possible for all citizens and/or CSOs to participate in this or other phases of the budget process, options "a" and "b" apply if the government does not exercise any discretion in determining who is allowed to participate. While there is likely going to be self-selection, it is important that the selection is not made by the executive.

In cases where there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, to select answer choice "c", there should be some sort of public record (held in public, minutes of meetings released to public) so that all CSOs and individual members of the public can have knowledge of the meeting, who participated, and what was discussed.

Examples of mechanisms that might qualify as a "c" response include hotlines, Facebook announcements, and one-off meetings with NGOs in which there is a public record.

The researcher must present evidence to support selection of a "c" response.

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget formulation stage.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

National People's Congress, Budget Law, effective since 1 January 2015. https://www.gov.cn/zhengce/content/2020-08/20/content_5536179.htm

Comment:

In the Budget Law, only Article 91 mentions that citizens have the right to report any violations of the Budget Law to relevant authorities. However, the Budget Law does not specify the role of citizens in the budgetary process, or set any participation mechanism for the public.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

126. With regard to the mechanism identified in question 125, does the executive take concrete steps to include vulnerable and under-represented parts of the population in the formulation of the annual budget?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principle of "Inclusiveness", and examines the executive's effort to actively reach out to citizens who are from socially vulnerable groups and/or underrepresented in national processes. The emphasis here is on the executive's efforts to seek out the views of members of the public from socially vulnerable groups and/or who are underrepresented in the process.

To answer "a," the executive must actively seek out individuals from at least one vulnerable and underrepresented community and/or civil society organization representing vulnerable and underrepresented individuals and communities. The researcher must provide evidence to show the government's efforts and actions. The researcher must speak with the relevant government official(s), and subsequently double check with an alternative source, such as representatives of vulnerable/underrepresented groups.

Answer "b" applies if the executive does not take concrete steps to incorporate vulnerable/underrepresented individuals, or organizations representing them, into participation mechanisms or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget formulation stage.

Answer:

b. The requirements for an "a" response are not met.

Source:

Comment:

There is no mechanism for public participation. The answer of the question 125 is D. According to the question guideline, the answer here should be B.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

127. During the budget formulation stage, which of the following key topics does the executive's engagement with citizens cover?

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:

1. Macroeconomic issues
2. Revenue forecasts, policies, and administration
3. Social spending policies
4. Deficit and debt levels
5. Public investment projects
6. Public services

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Timeliness". Please consider all of the mechanisms currently used by the executive to promote public participation during the formulation of the annual budget.

Please note that while the public engagement can/may cover other topics -- and for this reason the other questions assessing the executive's engagement with the public during budget formulation can be answered on the basis of engagement on topics other than the six listed above -- for the purpose of answering this question, "key topics" are considered to be only the ones listed above. If the executive's engagement with the public covers topics other than the six listed above, please specify these topics in the comments.

Note also that this question assesses only the coverage of public engagement (i.e., "what issues is the public invited to engage on?") and issues related to the depth of engagement or selectivity of engaged are not dealt with by this question.

If written materials about the public engagement, such as an invitation, do not specify the coverage of the public engagement, but the researcher has personally participated in the engagement, s/he may respond to this question based on firsthand experience of the coverage of the public engagement.

Answer "d" applies if requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget formulation stage.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

Comment:

Citizens did not participate in the executive's budget formulation.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

128. Does the executive use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input in monitoring the implementation of the annual budget?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principles on "Inclusiveness" and "Timeliness" and assesses the extent to which the participation mechanism(s) used by the executive are truly interactive and involve a two-way conversation between citizens and the executive.

The drafting of this question and its answers are partially drawn from the IAP2 Spectrum of Public Participation, in particular with regards to the concepts of "involvement" (option "a" in the responses) and "consultation" (option "b"). See:

https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/foundations_course/IAP2_P2_Spectrum_FINAL.pdf

Please consider only participation mechanisms that the Ministry of Finance, lead budget agency, or central coordinating agency designated by the government to implement participation mechanisms ("the executive") is currently using to allow the public to participate in monitoring the implementation of the annual budget. If the executive has designated a central coordinating agency to implement participation mechanisms throughout the national budget process, researchers may consider these mechanisms. Participation mechanisms used only by line ministries should not be used to answer this question. If there is more than one mechanism used by the executive, please select the deepest or most interactive mechanism that reflects the government's efforts to incorporate citizens' input into the implementation of the annual budget. The participation mechanisms can involve a range of different issues, such as revenue administration, public service delivery, public investment project implementation, including procurement, and the administration of social transfer schemes.

To answer "a," the executive must use open participation mechanisms that involve the public in the implementation of the annual budget. This means that a public process is in place whereby CSOs and/or individual members of the public and government officials interact, and have the opportunity to express their opinions to each other in what can be considered a public dialogue between them (i.e., in-person and online discussion forums). Additionally, the mechanism should be open to any CSO and/or individual members of the public who wish to participate. By selecting this answer, the researcher must present evidence to support the presence of a public dialogue among citizens and government official. Examples include public meetings, online, deliberative exchanges, procurement complaint mechanisms, and social monitoring and dialogue.

Answer "b" applies if an open consultation mechanism is in place whereby members of the public (i.e., individuals and/or CSOs as well as academics, independent experts, policy think tanks, and business organizations) can provide their input on the implementation of the annual budget. This answer applies if the government is using a mechanism that is structured and well established, and not ad-hoc. The researcher must present evidence to support the presence of consultative processes through which the executive seeks out inputs from citizens. Examples include public hearings, surveys, focus groups, report cards, and online platforms that government officials actively manage to solicit inputs.

Answer "c" applies if the executive has established a mechanism or mechanisms to allow citizens to provide input on budget implementation, but:

1) The mechanisms are not structured, happen only on ad-hoc basis, or not regularly.

and/or

2) The executive consults with and/or interacts with, citizens, but there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, and the executive determines fully or partially such selection process by inviting specific groups (for example by making an open call but just to experts from a particular sector, or naming specific organizations). While it is not possible for all citizens and/or CSOs to participate in this or other phases of the budget process, options “a” and “b” apply if the government does not exercise any discretion in determining who is allowed to participate. While there is likely going to be self-selection, it is important that the selection is not made by the executive.

In cases where there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, to select answer choice “c”, the researcher must have evidence that the government is holding participation mechanisms that have some sort of public record (held in public, minutes of meetings released to public) so that all CSOs and members of the public can have knowledge of the meeting, who participated, and what was discussed.

Examples include hotlines, Facebook announcements, one-off meetings with NGOs in which there is a public record.

The researcher must present evidence to support selection of a “c” response.

Answer “d” applies if the requirements for a “c” response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget implementation stage.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a “c” response or above are not met.

Source:

National People’s Congress, Budget Law, effective since 1 January 2015. https://www.gov.cn/zhengce/content/2020-08/20/content_5536179.htm
Ministry of Finance, Online petition forum. <http://www.mof.gov.cn/gongzhongcanyu/liuyanxuzhi/>

Comment:

The Budget Law does not specify the role of citizens in the budgetary process.
Besides, the Ministry of Finance has an online petition forum, and thus citizens may report any fiscal misconduct during the implementation through this channel. However, it seems that this channel is strictly controlled and not tailor-made for monitoring the implementation.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

129. With regard to the mechanism identified in question 128, does the executive take concrete steps to receive input from vulnerable and underrepresented parts of the population on the implementation of the annual budget?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principle of “Inclusiveness”, and examines the executive’s effort to actively reach out to citizens who are from socially vulnerable groups and/or underrepresented in national processes. The emphasis here is on national government’s efforts to obtain input from members of the public who are from socially vulnerable groups and/or underrepresented in national processes during the implementation of the annual budget.

To answer “a,” the executive must actively seek out individuals from at least one vulnerable and underrepresented community and/or civil society organization representing vulnerable and underrepresented individuals and communities. The researcher must provide evidence to show the government’s efforts and actions. The researcher must speak with the relevant government official(s), and subsequently double check with an alternative source, such as representatives from vulnerable/underrepresented groups.

Answer “b” applies if the national executive does not take concrete steps to incorporate vulnerable/underrepresented individuals, or organizations representing them, into participation mechanisms or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget implementation stage.

Answer:

b. The requirements for an “a” response are not met.

Source:

Comment:

I don't find any effective channels for citizens to monitoring the implementation. The answer of the question 128 is D. According to the question guideline, the answer here should be B.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

130. During the implementation of the annual budget, which of the following topics does the executive's engagement with citizens cover?

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:

1. Changes in macroeconomic circumstances
2. Delivery of public services
3. Collection of revenue
4. Implementation of social spending
5. Changes in deficit and debt levels
6. Implementation of public investment projects

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Timeliness". Please consider all of the mechanisms currently used by the executive to promote public participation during the implementation of the annual budget.

Please note that while the public engagement can/may cover other topics -- and for this reason the other questions assessing the executive's engagement with the public during budget implementation can be answered on the basis of engagement on topics other than the six listed above -- for the purpose of answering this question, "key topics" are considered to be ONLY the ones listed above. If the executive's engagement with the public covers topics other than the six listed above, please specify these topics in the comments.

Note also that this question assesses only the coverage of public engagement (i.e., "what issues is the public invited to engage on?") and issues related to the depth of engagement or selectivity of engaged are not dealt with by this question.

If written materials about the public engagement, such as an invitation, do not specify the coverage of the public engagement, but the researcher has personally participated in the engagement, s/he may respond to this question based on firsthand experience of the coverage of the public engagement.

Answer "d" applies if requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget implementation stage.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

Comment:

I don't find any effective channels for citizens to monitoring the implementation.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

131. When the executive engages with the public, does it provide comprehensive prior information on the process of the engagement, so that the public can participate in an informed manner?

Comprehensive information must include at least three of the following elements:

1. Purpose
2. Scope
3. Constraints
4. Intended outcomes
5. Process and timeline

GUIDELINES:

This question relates to the GIFT principle of "Openness," and addresses whether the executive provides relevant information on the process of the engagement before public participation takes place, in order to help citizens engage effectively. The question addresses whether the "rules of the public engagement" are clearly spelled out, in advance and in detail, so that those members of the public who want to engage know how to do so, in terms of when they can do so, what they are expected to provide input on, by when, to whom, etc. This question does not cover the substance of the engagement, which is covered by questions 127 and 130.

Non-comprehensive information means that the government provides information that includes at least one but less than three of the elements listed above.

Purpose refers to a brief explanation of why the public engagement is being undertaken, including the executive's objectives for its engagement with the public.

Scope refers to what is within the subject matter of the engagement as well as what is outside the subject matter of the engagement. For example, the scope may include how a current policy is administered but exclude the specifics of the policies themselves.

Constraints refers to whether there are any explicit limitations on the engagement. An example of a constraint could be that any policy changes must not cost (or forgo revenue) more than a specific amount or have no net fiscal cost.

Intended outcomes refers to what the executive hopes to achieve as a result of the engagement. Examples of intended outcomes could be revising a policy to better reflect citizen or service-user views or to improve the way in which a particular program is administered.

Process refers to the methods by which the public engagement will take place and the discrete steps in the process. For example, the process may simply be a one-off Internet-based consultation, with a summary published of public inputs and the official response. The process may involve simultaneous or overlapping steps, and may be conducted in one round or in two or more rounds of engagement.

Timeline refers to the specific dates on which the discrete steps in the process will take place, or during which they will be completed, and clear start and end dates for the overall engagement.

Answer "d" applies if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget implementation or formulation stage.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

Comment:

I don't find any effective channels for citizens to participate in the formulation and implementation processes.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

132. With regard to the mechanism identified in question 125, does the executive provide the public with feedback on how citizens' inputs have been used in the formulation of the annual budget?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Sustainability", and examines the extent to which the executive provides information to citizens on which public inputs were received, which ones are used in the formulation of the annual budget, and how/why.

By "written record", we mean a document that is produced and released by the lead budget agency (Ministry of Finance, Treasury) that has set up and holds the participation activity.

Answer "a" applies when the executive provides a written document with:

- *The inputs (e.g., a written transcript) received from the public and*
- *A detailed report on how the inputs were used or not used (such report should include information on which inputs were used or not used, why, and how)*

Answer "b" applies when the executive provides a written document that includes:

- *The inputs (e.g., a written transcript) received from the public and*
- *A not-so-detailed report, such as a document with a few paragraphs, on how public inputs were used or not used. This document only gives a general idea on how those inputs were used or not used.*

Answer "c" applies when the executive provides a written document that includes:

- *The inputs (e.g., a written transcript) received from the public or*
- *A report (being it detailed or not-so-detailed) on how public inputs have been used or not used.*

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget formulation stage.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

Comment:

The answer of the question 125 is D. According to the question guideline, the answer here should be D.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

133. With regard to the mechanism identified in question 128, does the executive provide the public with information on how citizens' inputs have been used to assist in monitoring the implementation of the annual budget?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Sustainability", and examines the extent to which the executive provides information to citizens on which public inputs were received during the implementation of the annual budget, which ones are take into account to improve budget monitoring, and how/why.

By "written record", we mean a document that is produced and released by the lead budget agency (Ministry of Finance, Treasury) that has set up and holds the participation activity.

Answer "a" applies when the executive provides a written document with:

- *The inputs (e.g., a written transcript) received from the public and*

- A detailed report on how the inputs were used or not used (such report should include information on which inputs were used or not used, why, and how)

Answer "b" applies when the executive provides a written document that includes:

- The inputs received (e.g., a written transcript) from the public and
- A not-so-detailed report, such as a document with a few paragraphs, on how public inputs were used or not used. This document only gives a general idea on how those inputs were or were not taken into account by the executive during budget monitoring.

Answer "c" applies when the executive provides a written document that includes:

- The inputs (e.g., a written transcript) received from the public or
- A report (being it detailed or not-so-detailed) on how public inputs have been used or not used.

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget implementation stage.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

Comment:

The answer of the question 128 is D. According to the question guideline, the answer here should be D.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

134. Are participation mechanisms incorporated into the timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principles on "Sustainability," "Timeliness" and "Complementarity" and addresses whether the executive is able to link participation mechanisms to the administrative processes that are used to create the annual budget.

Please note that "timetable" refers to a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the Ministry of Finance or whatever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation. This document is sometimes referred to as the budget calendar and is the same document referenced in Question 53.

Answer "a" applies if the national executive establishes a clear set of guidelines that enable citizens and civil servants to understand when participation mechanisms should be used to enable citizen inputs to be incorporated into the annual budget. For answer choice "a", the timetable must be available to the public prior to the budget preparation process beginning.

Answer "b" applies if the executive does not establish a clear set of guidelines that enable citizens and civil servants to understand when participation mechanisms should be used to enable citizen inputs to be incorporated into the annual budget or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget formulation or implementation stage.

Answer:

b. The requirements for an "a" response are not met.

Source:

Comment:

I don't find any effective channels for citizens to participate in the formulation and implementation processes.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

135. Do one or more line ministries use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during the formulation or implementation of the annual budget?

GUIDELINES

While questions 125 – 134 focus only on participation mechanisms that the Ministry of Finance, lead budget agency, or central coordinating agency currently use to allow the public to participate in the national budget process, this question asks about participation mechanisms used by line ministries to allow the public to participate in national budget processes. Thus, participation mechanisms used by the Ministry of Finance, lead budget agency, or central coordinating agency should not be used to answer this question. If there is more than one mechanism used by a line ministry or if multiple line ministries use participation mechanisms, please select the deepest or most interactive mechanism that reflects the government's efforts to incorporate citizens' input into the formulation and/or implementation of the annual budget.

This question reflects the GIFT principles on "Inclusiveness" and "Timeliness" and assesses the extent to which the participation mechanism(s) used by the executive are truly interactive and involve a two-way conversation between citizens and the executive.

The drafting of this question and its answers are partially drawn from the IAP2 Spectrum of Public Participation, in particular with regards to the concepts of "involvement" (option "a" in the responses) and "consultation" (option "b"). See:

https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/foundations_course/IAP2_P2_Spectrum_FINAL.pdf

To answer "a," a line ministry must use open participation mechanisms that involve the public in the formulation or implementation of the annual budget. This means that a public process is in place whereby CSOs and/or individual members of the public and government officials interact, and have the opportunity to express their opinions to each other in what can be considered a public dialogue between them (i.e., in-person and online discussion forums). Additionally, the mechanism should be open to any CSO and/or individual members of the public who wish to participate. By selecting this answer, the researcher must present evidence to support the presence of a public dialogue among citizens and government official. Examples include public meetings and online deliberative exchanges.

Answer "b" applies if an open consultation mechanism is in place whereby members of the public (i.e., individuals and/or CSOs as well as academics, independent experts, policy think tanks, and business organizations) can provide their input in the formulation or implementation of the annual budget. This answer applies if the government is using a mechanism that is structured and well established, and not ad-hoc. The researcher must present evidence to support the presence of consultative processes through which a line ministry seeks out inputs from citizens. Examples include surveys, focus groups, report cards, published policy consultation exercises, and online platforms that government officials actively manage to solicit inputs.

Answer "c" applies if a line ministry has established a mechanism or mechanisms to allow citizens to participate in the budget formulation phase, but:

1) The mechanisms are not structured and happen only on ad-hoc basis, or not regularly.

and/or

2) A line ministry consults with and/or interacts with, citizens, but there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, and the line ministry determines fully or partially such selection process by inviting specific groups (for example by making an open call but just to experts from a particular sector, or naming specific organizations). While it is not possible for all citizens and/or CSOs to participate in this or other phases of the budget process, options "a" and "b" apply if the government does not exercise any discretion in determining who is allowed to participate. While there is likely going to be self-selection, it is important that the selection is not made by the executive.

In cases where there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, to select answer choice "c", there should be some sort of public record (held in public, minutes of meetings released to public) so that all CSOs and individual members of the public can have knowledge of the meeting, who participated, and what was discussed.

The researcher must present evidence to support selection of a "c" response.

Examples of mechanisms that might qualify as a "c" response include hotlines, Facebook announcements, and one-off meetings with NGOs in which there is a public record.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

Comment:

There are usually some public interaction sections on the official websites of government departments, which includes the Minister's mailbox and online petition platforms.

However, similar to the MOF's online petition forum mentioned in Q128, these channels are not specifically designed to gather citizens' views on the formulation or implementation of the annual budget. In the solicitation of opinions sections on these official websites, no public notices related to soliciting opinions on departmental budgets were found.

Therefore, D is the appropriate answer.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

136. Does the legislature or the relevant legislative committee(s) hold public hearings and/or use other participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during its public deliberations on the formulation of the annual budget (pre-budget and/or approval stages)?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principle on "Sustainability," "Transparency," and "Complementarity" and assesses the extent to which the participation mechanism(s) used by the legislative are interactive and involve a two-way conversation between citizens and the legislature, rather than being limited to allowing the public to attend or hear public budget deliberations.

Please consider participation mechanisms that the legislature (both in its whole institution or its relevant budget/public accounts/finance committees) has put in place and is using to allow the public to participate in their deliberations on the annual budget. This includes deliberations during the pre-budget phase (i.e., when the executive is still in the process of formulating the draft budget) and the budget discussions after the budget has been tabled to parliament and before it is approved. In the comment box, please specify during which stage of the budget cycle the legislature has put in place a public participation mechanism.

Mechanisms through which members of the public reach out to individual Members of Parliament as opposed to the legislature (both in its whole institution or its relevant budget/public accounts/finance committees) or unofficial hearings organized by a subset of committee members should not be considered in answering this question.

If there is more than one mechanism, please select a mechanism that best shows/reflects the legislature's efforts to incorporate citizens into the formulation of the annual budget. The participation mechanisms can involve a range of different issues, such as revenues, policy selection, and macro-fiscal planning (please note that the issue of coverage is covered in a subsequent question).

To answer "a," the legislature must hold public hearings where citizens are allowed to testify. This answer applies only if the legislature does not exercise discretion in determining which citizens and/or CSOs can testify (for example, participation takes place on a first-come-first-served basis).

Answer "b" should be selected if the following applies:

- *The legislature holds public hearings on the budget;*
- *Testimony is not allowed from members of the public or CSOs; but*
- *There are other means used by the legislature to receive and collect views from citizens and CSOs on the budget, and the legislature does not exercise discretion in determining which citizens and/or CSOs can provide input. The researcher must provide evidence to support the presence of those alternative processes through which the legislature seeks inputs from citizens. For example, there should be a public record indicating that views from citizens and the public were sought.*

Answer "c" should be selected if the following applies:

- *The legislature holds public hearings on the budget;*
- *Testimony is not allowed from members of the public or CSOs;*
- *No other means are used by the legislature to receive and collect views/input from citizens and CSOs on the budget, but*

- *The legislature invites a few individuals/groups to provide input (through public hearings or elsewhere)*
- *The legislature has a provision (via standing orders or in law) through which the public can submit their inputs, and members of the public or CSOs actively use it to submit opinions on the budget.*

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the legislature does not use public participation mechanisms during its deliberations on the annual budget

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

Comment:

I didn't find any references showing that the general public participated in the legislative budgeting process.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

137. During the legislative deliberations on the annual budget (pre-budget or approval stages), which of the following key topics does the legislature's (or relevant legislative budget committee) engagement with citizens cover?

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:

- 1. Macroeconomic issues**
- 2. Revenue forecasts, policies, and administration**
- 3. Social spending policies**
- 4. Deficit and debt levels**
- 5. Public investment projects**
- 6. Public services**

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Timeliness". Please consider the range of mechanisms currently used by the legislature to promote public participation during legislative deliberations on the annual budget.

Please note that while the public engagement can/may cover other topics, for the purpose of answering this question, "key topics" are considered to be only the ones listed above. If the legislature's engagement with the public covers topics other than the six listed above, please specify these topics in the comments.

Note also that this question assesses only the coverage of public engagement (i.e., "what issues is the public invited to engage on?") and issues related to the depth of engagement or selectivity of engaged are not dealt with by this question.

If written materials about the public engagement, such as an invitation, do not specify the coverage of the public engagement, but the researcher has personally participated in the engagement, s/he may respond to this question based on firsthand experience of the coverage of the public engagement.

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the legislature does not use public participation mechanisms during its deliberations on the annual budget.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

Comment:

I didn't find any references showing that the general public participated in the legislative budgeting process.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

138. Does the legislature provide feedback to the public on how citizens' inputs have been used during legislative deliberations on the annual budget?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Sustainability", and examines the extent to which the legislature provides information to citizens on which public inputs were received and how inputs were used during legislative deliberations (please note that these deliberations can refer to the pre-budget and approval phases). By "written record" in this question, we mean a document that is produced and released by the legislature.

Answer "a" applies when the legislature provides a written document with:

- *The inputs received from the public (e.g., a written transcript) and*
- *A detailed report on how the inputs were used or not used (such report should include information on which inputs were used or not used, why, and how).*

Answer "b" applies when the legislature provides a written document that includes:

- *The inputs received from the public (e.g., a written transcript) and*
- *A not-so-detailed report on how public inputs were used or not used. This document only gives a general idea on how those inputs were used or not used in legislative deliberations on the annual budget (please note that these deliberations refer to the pre-budget and approval phases).*

Answer "c" applies when the legislature makes available a video recording of the relevant legislative session or provides a written document that includes:

- *The inputs received from the public (e.g., a written transcript) or*
- *A report (being it detailed or not-so-detailed) on how public inputs have been used or not used.*

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the legislature does not use public participation mechanisms during its deliberations on the annual budget.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

Comment:

The answer of the question 136 is D. According to the question guideline, the answer here should be D.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

139. Does the legislature hold public hearings and/or use other participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during its public

deliberations on the Audit Report?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principle on "Sustainability," "Transparency," and "Complementarity" and assesses the extent to which the participation mechanism(s) used by the legislative are interactive and involve a two-way conversation between citizens and the legislature, rather than being limited to allowing the public to attend or hear public budget deliberations.

A key constitutional role of the legislature in almost all countries is to oversee the government's management of public resources. While the Supreme Audit Institution is responsible for checking the government's accounts and publishing the outcome of their audits, for accountability purposes it is essential that the legislature reviews and scrutinizes those reports, and checks on whether the executive is taking the appropriate corrective actions based on the Supreme Audit Institution's recommendations.

Holding public hearings to review audit findings allows the public to learn more about how the government has managed its resources for the budget years that have ended, and demand accountability in case of mismanagement and irregularities. Reviewing and discussing those reports in public is therefore a key responsibility of a legislature.

Please note that by "Audit Report" we refer to the same audit report assessed in the transparency section of this Survey, i.e., one of the eight key budget documents that all governments (in this case, the Supreme Audit Institution) must produce, according to best practice.

Please consider participation mechanisms that the legislature (both in its whole institution or its relevant budget/public accounts/finance committees) have put in place and using to allow the public to participate in their deliberations on the Audit Report.

Mechanisms through which members of the public reach out to individual members of parliament as opposed to the legislature (both in its whole institution or its relevant budget/public accounts/finance committees) or unofficial hearings organized by a subset of committee members should not be considered in answering this question.

To answer "a," the national legislature must hold public hearings where citizens are allowed to testify. This answer applies only if the legislature does not exercise discretion in determining which citizens and/or CSOs can testify (for example, participation takes place on a first-come-first-served basis).

Answer "b" should be selected if the following applies:

- *The legislature holds public hearings on the budget;*
- *No testimony is allowed from the public; BUT*
- *There are other means used by the legislature to receive and collect views from citizens and CSOs on the budget, and the legislature does not exercise discretion in determining which citizens and/or CSOs can provide input. The researcher must provide evidence to support the presence of those alternative processes through which the legislature seeks inputs from citizens. For example, there should be a public record indicating that views from citizens and the public were sought.*

Answer "c" should be selected if the following applies:

- *The legislature holds public hearings on the budget;*
- *No testimony is allowed from the public;*
- *No other means are used by the legislature to receive and collect views/input from citizens and CSOs on the budget, BUT*
- *The legislature invites a few individuals/groups to provide input (through public hearings or elsewhere)*

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the legislature does not use public participation mechanisms during its deliberations on the Audit Report.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

National People's Congress, Audit report on 2021 central budget implementation and other fiscal revenue and expenditure. 22 June 2022.

<http://www.npc.gov.cn/npc/c30834/202206/17a7dc825750458ba00b85e5d7b6b18e.shtml>

National Audit Office, Auditing report on 2021 central budget implementation and relevant work. 21 June 2022.

<https://www.audit.gov.cn/n5/n25/c10252123/content.html>

Comment:

The above two websites show the process of audit reports to the National People's Congress. They don't show any evidence that the general public is engaged in the process.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

140. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can suggest issues/topics to include in the SAI's audit program (for example, by bringing ideas on agencies, programs, or projects that could be audited)?

GUIDELINES:

This question assesses whether the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has established mechanisms through which the public can provide suggestions on issues/topics to be included in its audit program. When deciding its audit agenda, the SAI may undertake audits for a sample of agencies, projects, and programs in the country; and such a selection could be based on complaints and suggestions made by members of the public. To receive such suggestions, the SAI may create formal mechanisms, like setting up a website, hotline, or office (or assigning staff to liaise with the public).

Please note that formal mechanisms that do not explicitly seek the public's input in the audit program (such as general comment submission boxes on the SAI's website) should not be considered for this question.

Answer:

b. The requirements for an "a" response are not met.

Source:

National Audit Office, Public interaction channels. <http://www.audit.gov.cn/n7/n33/index.html>

National Audit Office of China, Introduction of the National Audit Office. <http://www.audit.gov.cn/n10/n14/index.html>

Comment:

The NAO website only provides an email address to receive public opinions, and it only handles cases related to illegal actions by audit personnel and significant matters that need to be brought to the attention of the NAO leadership.

The scope does not specify any inputs into the audit programs. In the Chinese context, it means that suggestions about audit programs are not the scope.

Besides, according to the answers to question 122, the Central Audit Committee chaired by the General Secretary of the Party was established to supervise the National Audit Office in 2019. This suggests that the auditing work should follow the instructions and guidelines of the Party. The Introduction (the second link) further specifies the major auditing work of the NAO. Therefore, the NAO has considerable limit in deciding its auditing agenda by its own.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

141. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) provide the public with feedback on how citizens' inputs have been used to determine its audit program?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Sustainability", and examines the extent to which the Supreme Audit Institution provides information to citizens on which public inputs were received, which ones are used to determine the Supreme Audit Institution's audit program. By "written record" in this question, we mean a document that is produced and released by the Supreme Audit Institution.

Answer "a" applies when the Supreme Audit Institution provides a written document with:

- *The inputs received from the public and*
- *A detailed report on how the inputs were used or not used (such report should include information on which inputs were used or not used, why, and how).*

Answer "b" applies when the SAI provides a written document that includes:

- The inputs received from the public and
- A not-so-detailed report on how public inputs were used or not used. This document only gives a general idea on how those inputs were used or not used to determine the SAI's annual audit program.

Answer "c" applies when the SAI provides a written document that includes:

- The received from the public or
- A report (being it detailed or not-so-detailed) on how public inputs have been used or not used.

Answer "d" applies if requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can suggests issues/topics to include in the SAI's audit program.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

Comment:

The answer of the question 140 is B. According to the question guideline, the answer here should be D.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

142. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can contribute to audit investigations (as respondents, witnesses, etc.)?

GUIDELINES:

This question mirrors question 140, but instead of covering public assistance in formulating the SAI's audit program, it focuses on whether the Supreme Audit Institution has established mechanisms through which the public can participate in audit investigations. In addition to seeking public input to determine its audit agenda, the SAI may wish to provide formal opportunities for the public and civil society organizations to participate in the actual audit investigations, as witnesses or respondents.

Answer:

b. The requirements for an "a" response are not met.

Source:

Comment:

I didn't find any evidence showing that the SAI has established such a formal mechanism for citizen participation in audit investigation.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion:

