

# Open Budget Survey 2023

Questionnaire

**Gambia**

May 2024

# Country Questionnaire: Gambia

## PBS-1. What is the fiscal year of the PBS evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

**Answer:**

FY 2023

**Source:**

-<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

-<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The PBS evaluated under this 2023 OBS refers to the Medium Term Economic Fiscal Framework (MTEFF) for FY 2023-26 with focus or emphasis on FY 2023, which describes, for The Gambia, the medium term macro-economic overview and projections, revenue and expenditure projections, policies and strategies as well as medium term debt management.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

## PBS-2. When is the PBS made available to the public?

*Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.*

*The OBS methodology requires that for a PBS to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is submitted to the legislature for consideration. If the PBS is not released to the public at least one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is submitted to the legislature for consideration, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the PBS.*

**Answer:**

d. The PBS is not released to the public, or is released less than one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is introduced to the legislature

**Source:**

-<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

-<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

-Interview with Communications Officer, Mr. Ebrima Jallow, at MoFEA

**Comment:**

The MTEFF 2023-26 has been published but lately.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**PBS-3a. If the PBS is published, what is the date of publication of the PBS?**

*Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.*

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.*

*Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.*

**Answer:**

**Source:**

Interview with the Communications officer, Mr. Ebrima Jallow, at MoFEA

**Comment:**

The PBS or MTEFF 2023-26 was published on May 17, 2023, months after the 2023 Executive's Budget Proposal was introduced to the legislature.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Comments:** Based on the information, your answer seems correct. However, I could not find the MTEF in the link provided, please update it and confirm this has not been deleted. The only MTEFF I can find is MTEFF 2020-2024. I found it using GOOGLE.

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**IBP Comment**

The document was published on 17/05/2023, after the research cutoff date of 31/12/2022.

**PBS-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the PBS.**

*If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

**Answer:**

Interview with the Communications officer, Mr. Ebrima Jallow, at MoFEA

**Source:**

-<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

-<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The PBS (MTEFF 2023-26) was published online on May 17, 2023.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question

**Comments:** I could not find the MTEF in the link provided, please update it and confirm this has not been deleted. The only MTEFF I can find is MTEFF

2020-2024. I found it using GOOGLE.

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**PBS-4. If the PBS is published, what is the URL or weblink of the PBS?**

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.*

**Answer:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The PBS (MTEFF 2023-26) is available on MoFEA's official website under the Directorate of Economic Policy and Research.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Disagree

**Suggested Answer:** I could not find the MTEF in the link provided, please update it. I could only find MTEFF 2020-2024.

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Researcher Response**

It is true that the PBS (MTEFF 2023-26) is currently unavailable on MoFEA's official website; however, it was available during the time of assessing MoFEA on PBS-4. MoFEA at some point in 2023 had some payment problems with their developer (of MoFEA'S website ) and that led to the developer restricting the ministry from making certain uploads and to other glitches. This could explain why the MTEFF 2023-26 is currently unavailable online.

**IBP Comment**

IBP appreciates the additional information provided by the researcher.

**PBS-5. If the PBS is published, are the numerical data contained in the PBS available in a machine readable format?**

*Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) or HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>*

*Option "d" applies if the PBS is not publicly available, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.*

**Answer:**

c. No

**Source:**

-<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

-<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The PBS (MTEFF 2023-26) does contain numerical data, in a PDF format, but not in a machine readable format.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**PBS-6a. If the PBS is not publicly available, is it still produced?**

*If the PBS is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question PBS-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.*

*Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question PBS-2)*

*Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.*

*Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.*

*Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.*

*Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.*

*If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.*

**Answer:**

c. Produced for internal purposes/use only

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MTEFF 2023-26 is available on MoFEA's official website under the Directorate of Economic Policy and Research.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**IBP Comment**

The document was published after the research cutoff date of 31/12/2022, so is considered to be produced for internal purposes/use only within the research period.

**PBS-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question PBS-6a, please specify how you determined whether the PBS was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.**

*If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question PBS-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

**Answer:**

The document was published after the research cutoff date of 31/12/2022, so is considered to be produced for internal purposes/use only within the research period.

**Source:**

https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research

**Comment:**

The MTEFF 2023-26 is available on MoFEA's official website under the Directorate of Economic Policy and Research.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**PBS-7. If the PBS is produced, please write the full title of the PBS.**

*For example, a title for the Pre-Budget Statement could be "Proposed 2023 State Budget" or "Guidelines for the Preparation of Annual Plan and Budget for 2022/23."*

*If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

**Answer:**

MEDIUM TERM ECONOMIC FISCAL FRAMEWORK 2023 – 2026

**Source:**

https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research

**Comment:**

The FY 2023 PBS is titled "MEDIUM TERM ECONOMIC FISCAL FRAMEWORK 2023 – 2026"

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**PBS-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the PBS?**

*While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see:*

<https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>.

**Answer:**

b. No

**Source:**

-https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research

-<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

There is no Citizens' Version of the PBS, The Gambia's 2023-26 MTEFF.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**EBP-1a. What is the fiscal year of the EBP evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?**

*Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."*

**Answer:**

FY 2023

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The Executive's Budget Proposal under evaluation in this 2023 OBS is for FY 2023 and it is the latest EBP published by the MoFEA.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**EBP-1b. When is the EBP submitted to the legislature for consideration?**

*Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.*

**Answer:**

14/11/2022

**Source:**

<https://gainako.com/finance-minister-tables-2023-draft-budget-deficit-exceeding-d3-9-billion/>

**Comment:**

The FY 2023 EBP was tabled by the Minister of Finance and Economic Affairs before the National Assembly on November 14, 2022.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**EBP-2. When is the EBP made available to the public?**

*Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.*

*The OBS methodology requires that for an EBP to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public while the legislature is still considering it and before the legislature approves (enacts) it. If the EBP is not released to the public before the legislature approves it, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the EBP.*

*The OBS definition of an Executive's Budget Proposal is a document(s) that (i) the executive submits to the legislature as a formal part of the budget approval process and (ii) the legislature either approves or on which it approves proposed amendments.*

*The OBS will treat the Executive's Budget Proposal as "Not Produced," in the following cases:*

- *The executive does not submit the draft budget to the legislature; or*
- *The legislature receives the draft budget but does not approve it or does not approve recommendations on the draft budget;*
- *The legislature rejects the draft budget submitted by the executive, but the executive implements it without legislative approval; or*
- *There is no legislature, or the legislature has been dissolved.*

**Answer:**

c. Less than two months in advance of the budget year, but at least in advance of the budget being approved by the legislature

**Source:**

An official interview with the Communications Officer under the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs (MoFEA), Mr. Ebrima Jallow.

**Comment:**

According to Mr. Jallow, The FY 2023 EBP was published on the MoFEA's official website on November 16, 2022, which is less than two months in advance of the 2023 budget year. Mr. Jallow backed his claim by providing an official document showing the date of publication for the said document as November 16, 2022.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**EBP-3a. If the EBP is published, what is the date of publication of the EBP?**

*Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.*

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.*

*Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.*

*In the comment boxes below, researchers should also list any supporting documents to the EBP and their date of publication.*



**Answer:**

16/11/2022

**Source:**

An official interview with the Communications Officer under the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs (MoFEA), Mr. Ebrima Jallow.

**Comment:**

According to Mr. Jallow, the FY 2023 EBP was published on the MoFEA's official website on November 16, 2022. He presented the 2023 OBS researcher with an official document stating the publication date of the FY 2023 EBP.

The date of publication can also be found using the tool "Wayback Machine" that records previous versions of a given website. It is possible to see the document published on November 17, 2022.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**EBP-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the EBP.**

*If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

**Answer:**

An official document stating the publication date of the FY 2023 EBP was sent to the 2023 OBS researcher by Mr. Ebrima Jallow, communications officer at MoFEA.

**Source:**

Interview with the Communications Officer under the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs (MoFEA), Mr. Ebrima Jallow.

**Comment:**

An official document stating the publication date of the FY 2023 EBP was sent to the 2023 OBS researcher by Mr. Ebrima Jallow, communications officer at MoFEA.

The date of publication can also be found using the tool "Wayback Machine" that records previous versions of a given website. It is possible to see the document published on November 17, 2022.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**EBP-4. If the EBP is published, what is the URL or weblink of the EBP?**

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.*

*In the comment boxes below, researchers should also list any supporting documents to the EBP and their URL or weblink.*

**Answer:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The Executive's Budget Proposal (EBP) for the fiscal year 2023 can be found among the files uploaded by the Directorate of Budget on the MoFEA's (The Gambia) official website.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**EBP-5. If the EBP is published, are the numerical data contained in the EBP or its supporting documents available in a machine readable format?**

*Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) and HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>.*

*Option "d" applies if the EBP is not publicly available, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.*

**Answer:**

c. No

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The FY 2023 EBP is not published in a machine readable format. The document is published as a pdf document.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**EBP-6a. If the EBP is not publicly available, is it still produced?**

*If the EBP is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question EBP-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.*

*Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question EBP-2).*

*Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.*

Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.

Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.

Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.

If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.

**Answer:**

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The document is already available on the MoFEA's official website at no cost.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**EBP-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question EBP-6a, please specify how you determined whether the EBP was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.**

*If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question EBP-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

**Answer:**

n/a

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The FY2023 EBP is available on the MoFEA's official website under the Directorate of Budget.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**EBP-7. If the EBP is produced, please write the full title of the EBP.**

*For example, a title for the Executive's Budget Proposal could be "Draft Estimates of Revenue and Expenditure for BY 2022-23, produced by the Ministry of Finance, Planning and Economic Development."*

If there are any supporting documents to the EBP, please enter their full titles in the comment box below.

If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

**Answer:**

Executive Budget Proposal 2023

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The full title stated above is the name of the soft copy version of the FY2023 EBP as well as the name stated at the top left corner of the first page of the document. Furthermore, there is another title on the first page which reads " ESTIMATES OF REVENUE AND EXPENDITURE 2023".

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**EBP-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the EBP?**

*While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see: <https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

There is a "citizens version" of the FY2023 EBP.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**EB-1a. What is the fiscal year of the EB evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?**

Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

**Answer:**

FY 2022

**Source:**<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>**Comment:**

The fiscal year for the Enacted Budget (EB) under evaluation in this 2023 OBS is FY 2022. Although, the FY 2023 EB was published in less than two months after its enactment (January 25, 2023), the publication took place after December 31, 2022 which is the cut-off date for this 2023 OBS. Consequently, we are unable to evaluate it even though it is the latest EB by the government.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**EB-1b. When was the EB approved (enacted) by the legislature?**

*Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.*

**Answer:**

29/10/2021

**Source:**

An official document provided by a Principal Fiscal Officer (PFO) at the Budget Directorate of the MoFEA, The Gambia.

**Comment:**

An official document stating the enacted date was provided to the 2023 OBS researcher by a Principal Fiscal Officer (PFO) at the Budget Directorate of the MoFEA, The Gambia.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**EB-2. When is the EB made available to the public?**

*Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.*

*The OBS methodology requires that for an EB to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public three months after the budget is approved by the legislature. If the EB is not released to the public at least three months after the budget is approved by the legislature, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the EB.*

**Answer:**

b. Between two weeks and six weeks after the budget has been enacted

**Source:**

Internet Archive: Wayback Machine  
<https://web.archive.org/web/20211209042629/https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The publication date for FY 2022 Approved Budget was obtained via Internet Archive: Wayback Machine.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**EB-3a. If the EB is published, what is the date of publication of the EB?**

*Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.*

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.*

*Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.*

**Answer:**

9/12/2021

**Source:**

Internet Archive: Wayback Machine  
<https://web.archive.org/web/20211209042629/https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

Based on the findings from the Internet Archive: Wayback Machine, the FY 2022 EB was published on the MoFEA's official website on December 9, 2021.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**EB-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the EB.**

*If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

**Answer:**

The 2023 OBS researcher ascertained the publication date of the FY 2022 EB by making use of the Internet Archive: Wayback Machine, which is a platform used to derive the publication dates of documents published on the internet.

**Source:**

Internet Archive: Wayback Machine  
<https://web.archive.org/web/20211209042629/https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The 2023 OBS researcher ascertained the publication date of the FY 2022 EB by making use of the Internet Archive: Wayback Machine, which is a platform used to derive the publication dates of documents published on the internet.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**EB-4. If the EB is published, what is the URL or weblink of the EB?**

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.*

**Answer:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The FY 2022 Enacted Budget (EB) is available on the MoFEA's official website, under the Directorate of Budget.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**EB-5. If the EB is published, are the numerical data contained in the EB available in a machine readable format?**

*Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) and HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>*

*Option "d" applies if the EB is not publicly available, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.*

**Answer:**

c. No

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The version of the FY 2022 EB that is publicly available is in a PDF format which does not qualify as a machine readable document.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

**EB-6a. If the EB is not publicly available, is it still produced?**

*If the EB is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question EB-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.*

*Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question EB-2)*

*Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.*

*Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.*

*Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.*

*Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.*

*If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.*

**Answer:**

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The EB for the fiscal year 2022 is available on the MoFEA's official website, under the Directorate of Budget, and it was made available to the public in less than three months after its enactment.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

**EB-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question EB-6a, please specify how you determined whether the EB was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.**

*If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question EB-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

**Answer:**

n/a

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>



**Comment:**

The EB for the fiscal year 2022 is already available online or publicly.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**EB-7. If the EB is produced, please write the full title of the EB.**

*For example, a title for the Enacted Budget could be "Appropriation Act n. 10 of 2023."*

*If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

**Answer:**

2022 Approved Budget

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The Gambia Government's Integrated Financial Management Information Systems (IFMIS) portal, which is the portal used to generate both the EBP and EB, also gives the 2022 EB another system generated title - "Budget Version: Approved Estimates (adopted Budget Law)(5)" - that comes as a footnote beneath almost all pages.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**EB-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the EB?**

*While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see:*

<https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>

**Answer:**

a. Yes

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The citizens' version of the EB for FY 2022 exists and it is publicly available.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**CB-1. What is the fiscal year of the CB evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?**

*Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."*

*If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, for each CB please indicate the document the CB simplifies/refers to, and the fiscal year.*

**Answer:**

FY 2023

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The citizens budget under evaluation in this 2023 OBS is that of the FY 2023 Executive Budget Proposal (EBP).

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**CB-2a. For the fiscal year indicated in CB-1, what is the public availability status of the CB?**

*If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document (Executive's Budget Proposal or Enacted Budget) you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budget is produced and its public availability status.*

*Remember that publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.*

*Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology  
Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.*

*Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.*

*Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.*

*Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.*

**Answer:**

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
Wayback Machine

**Comment:**

The FY 2023 citizen version of the EBP was produced and made available to the public on December 02, 2022

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**CB-2b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question CB-2a, please specify how you determined whether the CB was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.**

*If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question CB-2a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

**Answer:**

n/a

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The CB for FY 2023 EBP is published and available online.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**CB-3a. If the CB is published, what is the date of publication of the CB?**

*Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.*

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.*

*Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.*

*If more than one Citizens Budget is published, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budget is produced and its dates of publication.*

**Answer:**

02/12/2022

**Source:**

Through Wayback Machine

**Comment:**

The publication date of the 2023 EBP CB was determined through the use of Wayback Machine website.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**CB-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the CB.**

*If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

**Answer:**

The publication date of the 2023 EBP CB was determined through the use of Wayback Machine website.

**Source:**

Wayback Machine

<https://web.archive.org/web/20221202211406/https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The publication date of the 2023 EBP CB was determined through the use of Wayback Machine website.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**CB-4. If the CB is published, what is the URL or weblink of the CB?**

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.*

*If more than one Citizens Budget is published, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budget is produced and its URL or weblink.*

**Answer:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The citizen version of the 2023 Executive Budget Proposal is available on MOFEA's website

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**CB-5. If the CB is produced, please write the full title of the CB.**

*For example, a title for the Citizens Budget could be "Budget 2022 People's Guide" or "2023 Proposed Budget in Brief: A People's Budget Publication."*

*If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

*If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, for the other CB, indicate the document the CB refers to and, next to it, its full title.*

**Answer:**

Citizens' Version of the 2023 Executive Budget Proposal

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The document title of the 2023 EBP CB is "Citizens' Version of the 2023 Executive Budget Proposal"

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**CB-6. If the CB is produced, please indicate which budget document it corresponds to.**

*If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budget is produced and which budget document it simplifies.*

**Answer:**

2023 EBP

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The CB is corresponding to the 2023 Executive Budget Proposal

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**IYRs-1. What is the fiscal year of the IYRs evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?**

*Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."*

**Answer:**

FY 2022-21

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

Given that The Gambia's fiscal year starts on January 1st and ends on December 31st and FY 2023 has just begun, the In-Year Reports that will be evaluated under this 2023 OBS are between October 2021 and September 2022, inclusive. The reason for including the last three months of 2021 and excluding the last three months of 2022 is because the government has at most three months to publish an IYR after the reporting period ends but the cut-off date is December 31, 2022. Also, the researcher aims to capture at least twelve months.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**IYRs-2. When are the IYRs made available to the public?**

*Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.*

*The OBS methodology requires that for IYRs to be considered publicly available, IYRs must be made available to the public no later than three months after the reporting period ends. If at least seven of the last 12 monthly IYRs, or at least three of the last four quarterly IYRs are not released to the public at least three months after the reporting period ends, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the IYRs.*

**Answer:**

c. At least every quarter, and within three months of the period covered

**Source:**

Interview with Mr. Ebrima Jallow, communications officer for the MoFEA.

**Comment:**

The In-Year Reports produced by The Gambia government are called "monthly expenditure briefs/reports" but they are prepared in such a way that they capture the cumulative expenditures for the months covered in a fiscal year. For instance, whereas a monthly expenditure report for January captures only the expenses for January, that of February captures both the combined expenditures for January and February and the report for March captures the cumulative expenditures of January, February and March.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Comments:** These reports are produced at the end of each month. On the 15th of each month, data from the previous month is download from the FMIS system and analyzed to produce these reports. The only reason why these reports are not posted or made available to the public on time is because it goes through channels such such via the director, PS, and sometimes even the minister before it is approved and posted on the website.

**IYRs-3a. If the IYRs are published, what are the dates of publication of the IYRs?**

*Specifically: if quarterly In-Year Reports are published, indicate the dates of publication of at least three of the last four IYRs that were publicly available. If monthly IYRs are published, indicate the dates of publication of at least seven of the last 12 IYRs that were publicly available.*

*Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.*

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.*

*Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05 September 2022. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question "n/a."*

**Answer:**

January 2022 Expenditure Report  
January to February 2022 Expenditure Report  
January to March 2022 Expenditure Report - 29 April 2022  
January-April 2022 Expenditure Report - 01 June 2022  
JANUARY TO MAY 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT - 24 August 2022  
JANUARY TO JUNE 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT - 13 September 2022  
JULY 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT FINAL - 13 September 2022  
JANUARY TO AUGUST 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT - 04 October 2022  
SEPTEMBER 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT - 01 November 2022

**Source:**

Interview with Mr. Ebrima Jallow, communications officer for the MoFEA.

**Comment:**

The publication dates (provided by Mr. Ebrima Jallow) for 7 In-Year Reports have been provided above. Even though all the In-Year Reports from October 2021 to September 2022 have been published on the MoFEA's official websites, the publication dates for some of them, especially the January to February expenditure reports couldn't ascertain.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**IYRs-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the IYRs.**

*If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

**Answer:**

The publication dates for 7 In-Year Reports were provided by Mr. Ebrima Jallow, communications officer for the MoFEA, during an interview with him.

**Source:**

Interview with the communications officer for MoFEA, Mr. Jallow.

**Comment:**

The publication dates for 7 In-Year Reports were provided by Mr. Ebrima Jallow, communications officer for the MoFEA, during an interview with him.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**IYRs-4. If the IYRs are published, what is the URL or weblink of the IYRs?**

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.*

*Researchers should provide the weblink to the most recent In-Year Report in the space below, and – in the comment box underneath – the weblinks to older IYRs.*

*If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.*

**Answer:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The IYRs from October 2021 to September 2022 are all available on MoFEA's official website at no cost.

Note: All IYRs for both 2021 and 2022 fiscal years (from January to December) are available on MoFEA's official website at no cost

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**IYRs-5. If the IYRs are published, are the numerical data contained in the IYRs available in a machine readable format?**

*Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) and HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>*

*Option "d" applies if the IYRs are not publicly available, therefore their machine readability cannot be assessed.*

**Answer:**

c. No

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The numerical data contained in the IYRs (October 2021 - September 2022) are not in a machine readable format. As a matter of fact, there's is no



machine readable version in both fiscal years, they are all published in either a word or PDF format.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**IYRs-6a. If the IYRs are not publicly available, are they still produced?**

*If the IYRs are not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question IYRs-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.*

*Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question IYRs-2).*

*Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.*

*Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.*

*Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.*

*Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.*

*If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.*

**Answer:**

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The IYRs (October 2021 to September 2022) are already available on the MoFEA's official website.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**IYRs-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question IYRs-6a, please specify how you determined whether the IYRs were produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.**

*If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question IYRs-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

**Answer:**

n/a

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The IYRs (October 2021 - September 2022) are all publicly available

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**IYRs-7. If the IYRs are produced, please write the full title of the IYRs.**

*For example, a title for the In-Year Report could be "Budget Monitoring Report, Quarter 1" or "Budget Execution Report January-March 2022."*

*If In-Year Reports are not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

*Researchers should provide the full title of the most recent In-Year Report in the space below, and – in the comment box underneath – the full titles of older IYRs.*

**Answer:**

END 2022 EXPENDITUE REPORT (JAN-DEC)

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

Month Expenditure Reports for 2022:

FINAL NOVEMBER 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT  
January-October 2022 Expenditure Report  
SEPTEMBER 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT  
JANUARY TO AUGUST 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT  
JULY 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT FINAL  
JANUARY TO JUNE 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT  
JANUARY TO MAY 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT  
January-April 2022 Expenditure Report  
January to March 2022 Expenditure Report  
January to February 2022 Expenditure Report  
January 2022 Expenditure Report

Monthly Expenditure Reports for the Last Three Months of 2021:

January – December 2021 Expenditure Brief  
January-November 2021 Expenditure Brief  
January - October 2021 Expenditure Brief

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**IYRs-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the IYRs?**

*While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see: <https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>.*

**Answer:**

b. No

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

There is no citizens version of the IYRs.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**MYR-1. What is the fiscal year of the MYR evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?**

*Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."*

**Answer:**

FY 2022

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The fiscal year for the Mid-Year Review (MYR) evaluated under this OBS is FY 2022.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**MYR-2. When is the MYR made available to the public?**

*Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on*

the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.

The OBS methodology requires that for an MYR to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public no later than three months after the reporting period ends (i.e., three months after the midpoint of the fiscal year). If the MYR is not released to the public at least three months after the reporting period ends, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the MYR.

**Answer:**

d. The MYR is not released to the public, or is released more than three months after the midpoint

**Source:**

-<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
-Principal Fiscal Officer at the Directorate of Budget, MoFEA

**Comment:**

According to a Principal Fiscal Officer at Directorate of Budget, MoFEA, the "JANUARY TO JUNE 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT" which aims "to inform all relevant stakeholders on the composition of Government Local Fund (GLF) expenditure from January to June, highlighting in particular, the absorptive capacity of different Budget Entities (BEs)" is considered the directorate's Mid-Year Review. However, this document does not meet the standard of an MYR based on the IBP guidelines since it does not "assess the state of the economy relative to the initial macroeconomic forecast and update the economic projections for the remainder of the year....provide updated estimates of expenditure, revenue, and debt, reflecting the impact of actual experience to date and revised projections for the full fiscal year"; hence, there is no MYR for the fiscal year 2022.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Comments:** However, with the introduction of the Monitoring and Reporting unit within the budget directorate these MYRs will now be produced going forward.

**MYR-3a. If the MYR is published, what is the date of publication of the MYR?**

*Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.*

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.*

*Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.*

**Answer:**

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The FY 2022 MYR is not published online.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**MYR-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the MYR.**

*If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

**Answer:**

n/a

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The FY 2022 MYR is not available online so there is simply no date of publication.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**MYR-4. If the MYR is published, what is the URL or weblink of the MYR?**

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.*

**Answer:**

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The FY 2022 MYR is not available online so there is no URL or weblink of it.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**MYR-5. If the MYR is published, are the numerical data contained in the MYR available in a machine readable format?**

*Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) and HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>.*

*Option "d" applies if the MYR is not publicly available, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.*

**Answer:**

d. Not applicable

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The machine readability of numerical data in FY 2022 MYR could not be determined because the MYR is not available online.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**MYR-6a. If the MYR is not publicly available, is it still produced?**

*If the MYR is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question MYR-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.*

*Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question MYR-2).*

*Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.*

*Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.*

*Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.*

*Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.*

*If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.*

**Answer:**

d. Not produced at all

**Source:**

-<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

-Interview with a Principal Fiscal Officer at the Budget Directorate of the MoFEA

**Comment:**

The FY 2022 MYR has not been produced at all.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**MYR-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question MYR-6a, please specify how you determined whether the MYR was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.**

If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question MYR-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

**Answer:**

See comment below.

**Source:**

-<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
-Interview with a Principal Fiscal Officer at the Directorate of Budget, MoFEA

**Comment:**

According to a Principal Fiscal Officer at Directorate of Budget, MoFEA, the "JANUARY TO JUNE 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT" which aims "to inform all relevant stakeholders on the composition of Government Local Fund (GLF) expenditure from January to June, highlighting in particular, the absorptive capacity of different Budget Entities (BEs)" is considered the directorate's Mid-Year Review. However, this document does not meet the standard of an MYR based on the IBP guidelines since it does not "assess the state of the economy relative to the initial macroeconomic forecast and update the economic projections for the remainder of the year....provide updated estimates of expenditure, revenue, and debt, reflecting the impact of actual experience to date and revised projections for the full fiscal year"; hence, there is no MYR for the fiscal year 2022.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**MYR-7. If the MYR is produced, please write the full title of the MYR.**

*For example, a title for the Mid-Year Review could be "Semi-annual Budget Performance Report, FY 2021/22" or "Mid-Year Report on the 2022 National Budget."*

*If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

**Answer:**

n/a

**Source:**

-<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
-Interview with a Principal Fiscal Officer at the Directorate of Budget, MoFEA

**Comment:**

The FY 2022 MYR has not been produced at all.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**MYR-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the MYR?**

*While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to*

expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see: <https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>.

**Answer:**

b. No

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

There is no citizens version of the FY 2022 MYR.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**YER-1. What is the fiscal year of the YER evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?**

*Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."*

**Answer:**

FY 2021

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The YER under evaluation in this 2023 OBS is that of the 2021 fiscal year.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**YER-2. When is the YER made available to the public?**

*Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.*

*The OBS methodology requires that for an YER to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public no later than one year after the fiscal year to which it corresponds. If the YER is not released to the public within one year after the end of the fiscal year to which it corresponds, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances,*



researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the YER.

**Answer:**

d. The YER is not released to the public, or is released more than 12 months after the end of the budget year

**Source:**

-<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
-Principal Fiscal Officer at the Directorate of Budget, MoFEA.

**Comment:**

According to a Principal Fiscal Officer at Directorate of Budget, MoFEA, the "January to December 2021 Expenditure Report" which aims "to inform all relevant stakeholders on the composition of Government Local Fund (GLF) expenditure from January to December, highlighting in particular, the absorptive capacity of different Budget Entities (BEs)" is considered the directorate's Year-End Report. However, this document does not meet the standard of an YER based on the IBP or OBS guidelines since it does not "cover all of the major items included in the budget, explaining differences between the original estimates (as amended by the legislature during the year) and the actual outcomes for expenditure, revenue, debt, and the macroeconomic assumptions..... review nonfinancial performance information and other important policy areas."; hence, there is no YER for the fiscal year 2021 or 2022.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Comments:** End Year Expenditure Report was produced but not end year fiscal report. The Report produced only contained expenditure and not revenue

**YER-3a. If the YER is published, what is the date of publication of the YER?**

*Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.*

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.*

*Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.*

**Answer:**

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The FY 2021 YER is not available online so there is simply no date of publication.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**YER-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the YER.**

If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

**Answer:**

n/a

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The FY 2021 YER is not published online and the document is not produced at all.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**YER-4. If the YER is published, what is the URL or weblink of the YER?**

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.*

**Answer:**

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The FY 2021 YER is not available online so there is no URL or weblink of it.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**YER-5. If the YER is published, are the numerical data contained in the YER available in a machine readable format?**

*Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) and HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>*

*Option "d" applies if the YER is not publicly available, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.*

**Answer:**

d. Not applicable

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The FY 2021 YER has not been produced; so, the machine readability of the numerical data that it would have contained cannot be assessed.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**YER-6a. If the YER is not publicly available, is it still produced?**

*If the YER is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question YER-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.*

*Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question YER-2)*

*Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.*

*Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.*

*Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.*

*Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.*

*If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.*

**Answer:**

d. Not produced at all

**Source:**

-<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
-Principal Fiscal Officer at the Directorate of Budget, MoFEA

**Comment:**

The FY 2021 YER has not been produced at all

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**YER-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question YER-6a, please specify how you determined whether the YER was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.**

*If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question YER-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

**Answer:**

See comment below.

**Source:**

-<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
-Principal Fiscal Officer at the Directorate of Budget, MoFEA.

**Comment:**

According to a Principal Fiscal Officer at Directorate of Budget, MoFEA, the "January to December 2021 Expenditure Report" which aims "to inform all relevant stakeholders on the composition of Government Local Fund (GLF) expenditure from January to December, highlighting in particular, the absorptive capacity of different Budget Entities (BEs)" is considered the directorate's Year-End Report. However, this document does not meet the standard of an YER based on the IBP or OBS guidelines since it does not "cover all of the major items included in the budget, explaining differences between the original estimates (as amended by the legislature during the year) and the actual outcomes for expenditure, revenue, debt, and the macroeconomic assumptions..... review nonfinancial performance information and other important policy areas."; hence, there is no YER for the fiscal year 2021.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**YER-7. If the YER is produced, please write the full title of the YER.**

*For example, a title for the Year-End Report could be "Consolidated Financial Statement for the Year Ended 31 March 2022" or "Annual Report 2021 Published by the Ministry of Finance and Planning." If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

**Answer:**

n/a

**Source:**

-<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
-Interview with a Principal Fiscal Officer at Directorate of Budget, MoFEA

**Comment:**

The FY 2021 YER has not been produced at all.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**YER-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the YER?**

*While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see: <https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>.*

**Answer:**

b. No

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

There is no citizens' version of the FY 2021 YER.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**AR-1. What is the fiscal year of the AR evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?**

*Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."*

**Answer:**

FY 2020

**Source:**

<https://nao.gm/financial-audit-reports/gotg-reports/>

**Comment:**

The Audit Report (AR) under evaluation in this 2023 OBS is for FY 2020. However, the latest AR published by the National Audit Office (NAO) of The Gambia corresponds to FY 2019, published on November 23, 2022. FY 2020 AR is produced but made available for internal use only, at the moment.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response.  
Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: none

**AR-2. When is the AR made available to the public?**

*Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.*

*The OBS methodology requires that for an AR to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public no later than 18 months after the end of the fiscal year to which it corresponds. If the AR is not released to the public at least 18 months after the end of the fiscal year to which it corresponds, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the AR.*

**Answer:**

d. Does not release to the public, or is released more than 18 months after the end of the budget year

**Source:**

<https://nao.gm/financial-audit-reports/gotg-reports/>

**Comment:**

The FY 2020 AR is not made available to the public.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: This is because the audit of the Gambia Government Annual Accounts is currently conducted in backlog (arrears). However, the office is consulting with the National Assembly to determine at what point to publish once the report is submitted to them.

**AR-3a. If the AR is published, what is the date of publication of the AR?**

*Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.*

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.*

*Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.*

**Answer:**

**Source:**

<https://nao.gm/financial-audit-reports/gotg-reports/>

**Comment:**

The FY 2020 AR is not made available to the public yet; so, there is no publication date.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit

Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: The GoTG 2020 was submitted to the Minister of Finance on September 13, 2023 for tabling at the National Assembly after which the report can be discussed by the appropriate committee who will then report to the plenary of the National Assembly.

**AR-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the AR.**

*If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

**Answer:**

n/a

**Source:**

<https://nao.gm/financial-audit-reports/gotg-reports/>

**Comment:**

The FY 2020 has not been published yet.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: The GoTG AR 2020 is not published yet because as per the constitution of the Gambia, the AG may only publish the report after its discussion at the National Assembly unless where there is an 'undue' delay.

**AR-4. If the AR is published, what is the URL or weblink of the AR?**

*Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.*

**Answer:**

**Source:**

<https://nao.gm/financial-audit-reports/gotg-reports/>

**Comment:**

The FY 2020 AR is not available online. On that note, there is no URL or weblink for it.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: When it is eventually published, it will be on NAO's website under the 'Publications tab'.

**AR-5. If the AR is published, are the numerical data contained in the AR available in a machine readable format?**

*Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) and HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>*

*Option "d" applies if the AR is not publicly available, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.*

**Answer:**

d. Not applicable

**Source:**<https://nao.gm/financial-audit-reports/gotg-reports/>**Comment:**

Given that the FY 2020 AR is not publicly available, machine readability of the numerical data it would have contained cannot be determined.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: none

**AR-6a. If the AR is not publicly available, is it still produced?**

*If the AR is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question AR-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.*

*Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question AR-2).*

*Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.*

*Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.*

*Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.*

*Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.*



If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.

**Answer:**

c. Produced for internal purposes/use only

**Source:**

Interview with a Communications Specialist at the National Audit Office (NAO), Ms. Binta Touray, on April 4, 2023.

**Comment:**

According to Ms. Touray at NAO, the FY 2020 AR is produced only for internal use presently.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: none

**AR-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question AR-6a, please specify how you determined whether the AR was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.**

*If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question AR-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

**Answer:**

through an interview with a Communications Specialist, Ms. Binta Touray, at NAO, The Gambia

**Source:**

-Official website of National Audit Office (NAO) of The Gambia  
<https://nao.gm/financial-audit-reports/gotg-reports/>  
-Interview with a Communications Specialist, Ms. Binta Touray, at NAO

**Comment:**

According to Ms. Touray at NAO, the FY 2020 AR is produced only for internal use presently.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: The GoTG AR 2020 was submitted to the executive (Ministry of Finance) on September 13th, 2023 for onward tabling at the National Assembly for discussion.

**AR-7. If the AR is produced, please write the full title of the AR.**

*For example, a title for the Audit Report could be "Annual General Reports of the Controller and Auditor General." If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."*

**Answer:**

Audit of the 2020 Financial Statements of the Government of the Gambia

**Source:**

Interview with a Communications Specialist at the National Audit Office of The Gambia

**Comment:**

According to Ms. Touray, the full title of the FY 2020 AR is "Audit of the 2020 Financial Statements of the Government of the Gambia".

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: none

**AR-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the AR?**

*While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see: <https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>.*

**Answer:**

b. No

**Source:**

<https://nao.gm/financial-audit-reports/gotg-reports/>

**Comment:**

There is no citizens' version of the FY 2020 AR at the moment.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: But this will be produced eventually as part of NAO's Communications activities

**GQ-1a. Are there one or more websites or web portals for disseminating government fiscal information? If yes, please provide the necessary links in the comment/citation.**

*GQ-1a asks the researcher to list any government websites or portals where fiscal information can be found. For example, in New Zealand the Treasury website (<http://www.treasury.govt.nz/>) hosts important budget-related information, including the Pre-Budget Statement, the Executive's Budget Proposal, the Citizens Budget, In-Year Reports, the Mid-Year Review, and the Year-End Report. In addition, New Zealand's Parliamentary Counsel Office (<http://www.legislation.govt.nz/>) posts the Enacted Budget while the Controller and Auditor-General website (<http://www.oag.govt.nz/>) publishes the annual Audit Report. The New Zealand researcher would provide the links to each of these sites. Other countries have developed portals that include fiscal information, though not in the "documents" format. For example, these portals have been created by Mexico (<https://www.transparenciapresupuestaria.gob.mx/>) and Brazil (<http://www.portaltransparencia.gov.br/>). Some countries have both a website and a portal. The Brazilian government, for example, apart from the Transparency Portal, has a dedicated website for the federal budget, where all key documents and other information can be found (<https://www.gov.br/economia/pt-br/assuntos/planejamento-e-orcamento/orcamento>). Researchers should include details about all of the relevant websites and/or portals that can be used to access budget information.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes

**Source:**

- 1) <https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>
- 2) <https://nao.gm/financial-audit-reports/gotg-reports/>
- 3) <https://gambia.datawarehousepro.com/>
- 4) <https://www.gbosdata.org/downloads/macroeconomic-and-financial-data-43>
- 5) <https://mofea.gm/directorates/public-finance-management>
- 6) <https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>
- 7) <https://mofea.gm/soe>
- 8) <https://mofea.gm/directorates/aid-coordination>
- 9) <https://mofea.gm/directorates/loans-and-debt-management>

**Comment:**

Explanation for which institutions or directorates the web links above belong to:

- 1) Directorate of Budget, MoFEA - Prepares and disseminates The Gambia government's PBSs (BCCs), EBPs, CBs, IYRs, MYRs, and YERs.
- 2) National Audit Office (NAO) - Prepares and publishes The Gambia government's ARs.
- 3) Central Bank of The Gambia (CBG) - Provides data on central government's fiscal history.
- 4) Gambia Bureau of Statistics (GBoS) - Also provides data on central government's fiscal history.
- 5) Directorate of Public Finance Management, MoFEA - Prepares and publishes the PFM annual progress reports on government revenue and expenditure.
- 6) Directorate of Macro-economic Policy and Research Unit (MPAU), MoFEA - Prepares and publishes the annual Budget Speech as well as the Medium Term Economic Fiscal Framework (MTEFF).
- 7) Directorate of State Owned Enterprises, MoFEA - Provides data on SOEs' financial statements.
- 8) Directorate of Aid coordination, MoFEA - Provides data on Project Grants and Budget Support.
- 9) Directorate of Loans and Debt Management, MoFEA - Provides data on government's loans and debt management.

**Peer Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree**Government Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree

**GQ-1b. On these websites/portals, can revenue and/or expenditure data for the current fiscal year be downloaded as a consolidated, machine readable file (or set of files)? If yes, please provide the necessary links in the comment/citation. For more information on machine readability, see:**  
<http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>.

*GQ-1b, GQ-1c, and GQ-1d ask about whether governments publish specific types of content on their websites/portals: (a) consolidated files that contain disaggregated revenue and/or expenditure information for the current fiscal year; (b) consolidated files that contain disaggregated revenue and/or expenditure information for multiple years in consistent formats; and (c) infographics/visualizations or other similar tools used to simplify data access and analysis. Researchers should provide the links to relevant webpages and some explanations of what they contain.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, both revenue and expenditure data can be downloaded as a consolidated file

**Source:**

- 1) <https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>
- 2) <https://nao.gm/financial-audit-reports/gotg-reports/>
- 3) <https://gambia.datawarehousepro.com/>
- 4) <https://www.gbosdata.org/downloads/macroeconomic-and-financial-data-43>
- 5) <https://mofea.gm/directorates/public-finance-management>
- 6) <https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>
- 7) <https://mofea.gm/soe>
- 8) <https://mofea.gm/directorates/aid-coordination>
- 9) <https://mofea.gm/directorates/loans-and-debt-management>

**Comment:**

On each of these websites above, both revenue and expenditure data can be downloaded as a consolidated file; most, if not all of them, have data for multiple years in consistent formats and some of them have consolidated, machine readable files such as CBG - <https://gambia.datawarehousepro.com/> and GBoS - <https://www.gbosdata.org/downloads/macroeconomic-and-financial-data-43>

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**GQ-1c. On these websites/portals, can disaggregated revenue and/or expenditure data in consolidated, machine readable files be downloaded for multiple years in consistent formats? If yes, please provide the necessary links and details in the comment/citation. For more information on machine readability, see:**  
<http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>.

**Answer:**

a. Yes, both revenue and expenditure data can be downloaded for multiple years in consistent formats

**Source:**

<https://gambia.datawarehousepro.com/>  
<https://www.gbosdata.org/downloads/macroeconomic-and-financial-data-43>

**Comment:**

"The Central Bank of The Gambia has a data warehouse where government financing covering: revenue grants, debts, expenditure and net lending, overall balance on cash basis are downloadable in machine readable format. The data could be filtered based on choice and exported in excel format showing multiple years by quarter." - 2021 OBS researcher. This explanation is true for the current state  
The website for the Gambia Bureau of Statistics (GBoS) contains such consolidated machine readable government fiscal data files as well, under the "macroeconomic-and-financial-data" section.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**GQ-1d. On these websites/portals, are infographics/visualizations or other similar tools used to simplify data access and analysis? If yes, please provide the necessary links and details in the comment/citation.**

*GQ-1d asks the researcher to list any government websites or portals where infographics/visualizations or other similar tools used to simplify data access and analysis are present. For example, in South Africa the Vulekamali portal (<https://vulekamali.gov.za>) is a project by the National Treasury which contains visualizations of the Consolidated Budget Summary, by departments budget, by division of revenue and by infrastructure budget distribution. (See for example <https://vulekamali.gov.za/2022-23/national/departments/basic-education/>). Other countries that have developed portals that include fiscal visualization and graphics include: Brazil's Transparency Portal (<https://portaldatransparencia.gov.br/>), which presents line graphs, bar graphs, pie charts, and visual maps of electronic invoices, public expenditure, public revenue, annual budget, transferred resources, resources transferred by location of beneficiary, among other information. (<https://portaldatransparencia.gov.br/orcamento> and <https://portaldatransparencia.gov.br/transferencias>). Additionally, United States Department of the Treasury, Fiscal Data portal (<https://fiscaldata.treasury.gov/>) is a one-stop shop for federal financial data that uses charts, exhibits, and figures.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes

**Source:**

<https://gambia.datawarehousepro.com/>

<https://gambia.opendataforafrica.org/bmgyepe/national-summary-data-page-nsdp>

**Comment:**

Infographics/visualizations or interactive charts are used by the Central Bank of The Gambia (CBG) and The Gambia Bureau of Statistics (GBoS) to simplify fiscal or economic data access and analysis on their websites.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**GQ-2. Are there laws in place guiding public financial management and/or auditing? If yes, please provide the necessary details and links in the comment/citation, and specify whether and where the law(s) contains specific provisions for budget transparency and/or participation.**

*GQ-2 asks about the existence of any national laws governing public financial management and auditing. These may include a public finance act, a section of the constitution, or an organic budget law. In some countries, fiscal responsibility legislation may also be relevant. For example, the Kenya researcher may include the link to its Public Finance Management Act, 2012 (<http://kenyalaw.org/8181/exist/kenyalex/actview.xql?actid=No.%2018%20of%202012>), and the Macedonian researcher may include a link to its State Audit Law (<https://finance.gov.mk/wp-content/uploads/2009/05/Audit-law.pdf>). Researchers should provide links to websites where such laws are published, if possible, or an electronic copy of the law itself. They should also indicate if and where (e.g. which article) these laws include specific provisions for budget transparency and citizen participation in budget processes.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes

**Source:**

1997 Constitution of The Gambia - <https://mofea.gm/constitution>  
Public Finance ACT, 2014 - <https://mofea.gm/pension-law>  
FINANCIAL REGULATIONS, 2016 - <https://mofea.gm/financial-regulations-2016>  
National Audit Office Act 2015 - <https://nao.gm/laws-standards/>  
Gambia Public Procurement Authority ACT, 2014 (GPPA BILL, 2014) - <https://nao.gm/laws-standards/>

**Comment:**

"There are legal frameworks in the constitution of the Gambia and other acts like the Public Finance Act, Financial Regulations and other laws on fiscal transparency and accountability. The foundation for a strong public finance management must have legal mechanisms that will govern revenue collection and withdrawal to support government activities.

Section 151(2) of the 1997 constitution codified that "No money shall be withdrawn from any other public fund of The Gambia unless the issue of that money has been authorised by law" thus limiting the executive autonomy and empowering oversight institutions on state funds which is supported by section 8 of the Public Finance Act.

Section 13 of the Public Finance Act also restricts government officials in opening an official account, in a local or international bank, without the Authority being given by the Accountant General. On Debt Management, section 36 of the Act provides legislative oversight before expending loan taking by the Parliament.

Section 159 of the 1997 constitution establishes the National Audit Office and act of Parliament in detail gives the national audit office the necessary mandate to audit government accounts and table its report to the National Assembly for discussion and consideration. Section 160 of the Constitution also empowers the Auditor General to ensure withdrawal from the Consolidated Revenue Fund follows the due process. The National Audit Office Act of 2015 also empowers the office to conduct special audits on government activities. The Office under Section 160(5) can present reports of maladministration and fraud to the Inspector General of Police for further investigation and prosecution.

The Gambia Public Procurement law of 2014 also governs the procurement system of the Gambia in order to ensure fair, competitive, transparent and accountable procurement system" -As written by the 2021 OBS researcher.

These laws and their abovementioned provisions are still the governing laws applied in ensuring fiscal transparency and accountability in The Gambia.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**GQ-3. Is there at least one additional law regulating: (1) access to information; (2) government transparency; or (3) citizens participation? If yes, please provide the necessary details and links in the comment/citation, and specify whether and where these laws contain specific provisions for budget transparency and/or participation.**

*The third and last question asks researchers to list any additional laws regulating access to information, transparency, or citizens' participation that are relevant for the promotion of budget transparency and citizen participation in budget processes. These might include legislation related to access to information, to planning processes, or to public administration more generally. India's Right to Information Act of 2005 (<https://www.ncess.gov.in/facilities/central-public-information-officer/rti-act-details.html>) is an example of this type of law. For more information on access to information legislation (constitutional provisions, laws, and regulations), including examples of model laws, see: <https://www.rti-rating.org/country-data/> and <https://www.constituteproject.org/>.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes

**Source:**

Access to Information Act, 2021 - for regulating access to information- passed by the National Assembly on July 1, 2021. Media link - <https://www.ifj.org/media-centre/news/detail/category/press-releases/article/the-gambia-new-law-on-access-to-information.html>

1997 Constitution of The Gambia - Section 160(e) - for ensuring government transparency and citizen participation  
Public Finance At, 2014 - Section 3(1)(e)(g) - for ensuring government transparency and citizen participation.

**Comment:**

Section 6 of the Access to Information Act, 2021 states that "Every public body shall create, keep, organize and maintain its information in a manner which facilitates access to information..." Section 11 of the same Bill also states that "Subject to this Act, every person has a right to access information from a public body".

"The Public Finance Act of 2014 provides for the Ministry of Finance to ensure budget transparency. Section 3(1)(e) of the act mandates the Ministry of Finance to exercise transparency and effective management of government funds. In addition, Section 3(1)(g) of the same act requires the Minister of Finance to publish budget execution and progress report to the public which create room for citizens to access budget documents. Section 160(e) of the 1997 Constitution also provides for the Auditor General to cause his/her report publicly available." -As stated by the 2021 OBS researcher, which is still true.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**1. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?***GUIDELINES:*

*Question 1 addresses the presentation of expenditure by administrative unit. This information indicates which government entity (ministry, department, or agency, or MDAs) will be responsible for spending the funds and, ultimately, held accountable for their use.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for all administrative units, accounting for all expenditures, in the budget year. To answer "b," the administrative units shown individually, in the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation, must account for at least two-thirds of all expenditures in the budget year. In other words, the sum of the expenditures assigned to the individual MDAs (education, health, infrastructure, interior, defense, etc.) must account for at least two-thirds of the total expenditure budgeted for that particular year. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents administrative units that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by administrative unit.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, administrative units accounting for all expenditures are presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

"Departmental Recurrent & Development Budget" - PP. 18 - 23

"Recurrent Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure PBB" - pp. 46 - 135

"Development Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" - pp. 159 - 208

**Comment:**

The EBP presents both the entire Recurrent Budget and Development Budget expenditures based on ministry, department or agency. Page 18 - 23, 46 - 135 & 159 - 208 on "The Executive Budget Proposal 2023" show the classification of expenditures under Recurrent and Development Budgets into ministries, departments or agencies. Each ministry is accorded a "Budget Entity" or "BE Code". For instance, BE 12 refers to the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs and all recurrent and development expenditures for this ministry and all its directorates, for the FY 2023, have been clearly indicated - see pages 81 - 86 and 166 - 169 on FY 2023 EBP. All budget line items have been stated as well. Recurrent spending, for example, under BE 12, was estimated at D 1,065,711,596 (see page 81) whereas Development spending was estimated at D 894,484,845 (see page 166).

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**2. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year by functional classification?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 2 addresses the presentation of expenditure by functional classification. This classification indicates the programmatic purpose, sector, or objective for which the funds will be used, such as health, education, or defense. Administrative units are not necessarily aligned with functional classifications. For instance, in one country all functions connected with water supply (which fall into the "Housing" function) may be undertaken by a single government agency, while in another country they may be distributed across the Ministries of Environment, Housing, and Industrial Development. In the latter case, three ministries have programs addressing water supply, so three ministries contribute to one function. Similarly, some administrative units may conduct activities that cut across more than one function. For instance, in the example above, some programs of the Ministry of Environment would also be classified in the "environmental protection" function.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for the budget year organized by functional classification.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, expenditures are presented by functional classification.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023 - Pages 24-26

**Comment:**

The EBP does present expenditures for the budget year by functional classification. "The Executive Budget Proposal 2023", on pages 24-26, shows expenditures based on functional classification. For example, between pages 24 and 26 on FY 2023 EBP, the central government's total spending on defence was estimated D 837. 49 million while its total spending on health was estimated at D 2.30 billion.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**3. If the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation presents expenditures for the budget year by functional classification, is the functional classification compatible with international standards?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 3 asks whether a country's functional classification meets international standards. To answer "a," a country's functional classification must be aligned with the OECD and the UN's Classification of the Functions of Government (COFOG), or provide a cross-walk between the national functional presentation and COFOG.*

*The OECD Best Practices for Budget Transparency can be viewed at <http://www.oecd.org/gov/budgeting/Best%20Practices%20Budget%20Transparency%20-%20complete%20with%20cover%20page.pdf>*

*COFOG can be viewed at [https://unstats.un.org/unsd/publication/SeriesM/SeriesM\\_84E.pdf](https://unstats.un.org/unsd/publication/SeriesM/SeriesM_84E.pdf) or at <http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/ch6ann.pdf>.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, the functional classification is compatible with international standards.



**Source:**

-<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023 - Pages 24-26  
-OECD's functional classification ((COFOG)  
<https://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/ch6ann.pdf>

**Comment:**

The functional classification in "The Executive Budget Proposal 2023", on pages 24-26, is compatible with the international standards, specifically OECD's "Classification of the Functions of Government (COFOG)" which has the same coding with the functional classification in the FY 2023 EBP.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**4. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year by economic classification?***GUIDELINES:*

*Question 4 asks whether the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents expenditures for the budget year organized by economic classification. Economic classification provides information on the nature of the expenditure, such as whether funds are being used to pay for wages and salaries, capital projects, or social assistance benefits. Please note that a presentation of expenditures by current and capital expenditures without additional disaggregation or detail will not qualify as an economic classification.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for the budget year organized by economic classification.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, expenditures are presented by economic classification.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023-Pages 7-17

**Comment:**

Proof of expenditures being economically classified (into Current, Capital, Lending, Financing) with additional disaggregation can be found on the following pages:

"The Executive Budget Proposal 2023" - pages 7-17

For Instance, all codes that begin with 21, 22, 24, 25, 26, 27 and 28 refer to expenditures pertaining to current expenditures whereas codes that begin with 31 refer to capital spending.

Note: The table titled "Recurrent and Development Budgets Economic Analysis 2023" on page 17 of FY 2023 EBP shows the summary of all expenditures by economic classification.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**5. If the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation presents expenditures for the budget year by economic classification, is the economic classification compatible with international standards?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 5 asks whether a country's economic classification meets international standards. To answer "a," a country's economic classification must be consistent with the International Monetary Fund's (IMF) 2001 Government Finance Statistics (GFS). The GFS economic classification is presented here: <http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/app4.pdf>. To learn more about Government Finance Statistics also refer to the entire IMF 2001 GFS manual (<http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/all.pdf>).

**Answer:**

a. Yes, the economic classification is compatible with international standards.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023-Pages 7 - 17  
IMF's "Economic Classification of Expense"  
<https://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/all.pdf> - Appendix 4, page 179

**Comment:**

Appendix 4, page 179, of IMF's "Economic Classification of Expense" (the link is - <https://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/all.pdf>) comprises an economic classification that is compatible with the one in the FY 2023 EBP for the government - pages 7-17.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**6. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 6 asks whether expenditures are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should treat the term "program" as meaning any level of detail below an administrative unit – that is, any programmatic grouping that is below the ministry, department, or agency level. For example, the Ministry of Health's budget could be broken down into several subgroups, such as "primary health care," "hospitals," or "administration." These subgroups should be considered programs even if they could be, but are not, broken down into smaller, more detailed units.

A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as *le plan comptable* or *le plan comptable detaillé*. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures, in the budget year. To answer "b," the programs shown individually in the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must account for at least two-thirds of all expenditures in the budget year. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents programs that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by program.

Budget decisions for the upcoming year can also affect the parameters of future budgets. It is therefore useful to estimate revenues and expenditures for multi-year periods, understanding that these estimates might be revised as circumstances change. Sometimes referred to as a Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF), a three-year period – that is, the budget year plus two more years – is generally considered an appropriate horizon for budgeting and planning.

**Answer:**

a. Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023  
"Recurrent Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure PBB" - Pages 46 - 135

"Development Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" - Pages 159 – 208

**Comment:**

The EBP shows expenditures for all individual programs and accounting for all expenditures under each "Budget Entity".

See for instance in the "The Executive Budget Proposal 2023":

"Recurrent Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure PBB" - Pages 46 - 135

"Development Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" - Pages 159 – 208

For instance, FY 2023 EBP shows that the "2114 Disease Control Program", page 112, under the Ministry of Health's Recurrent budget has an estimated spending of D 143.08 million out of which "Epidemiology and Disease Control" expenditure is D 2.15 million and "Eye Health Services" expenditure is D 717.80 thousand etc.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**7. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditure estimates for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?**

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 7 asks if multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by any one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications – which were addressed in Questions 1-5 above. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditure estimates by all three of the expenditure classifications for at least two years beyond the budget year. To answer "b," multi-year expenditure estimates must be presented by two of these three classifications. A "c" answer applies if multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented by any of the three classifications.*

**Answer:**

d. No, multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented by any expenditure classification.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

The expenditure classifications do not present multi-year expenditure estimates beyond the budget year.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Comments:** However stating next year (2024), these multi year period projections will now be incorporated in the budget.

**7b. Based on the response to Question 7, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications have estimates for a multi-year period in the**

## Executive's Budget Proposal?

**Answer:**

None of the above

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

None of the expenditure classifications presents multi-year expenditure estimates beyond the budget year.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

### 8. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditure estimates for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year) by program?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 8 asks if multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department. For example, the Ministry of Health's budget could be broken down into several subgroups, such as "primary health care," "hospitals," or "administration." These subgroups should be considered programs even if they could be, but are not, broken down into smaller, more detailed units.

**A note for francophone countries:** "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as *le plan comptable* or *le plan comptable detaillé*. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures, for at least two years beyond the budget year. To answer "b," the programs shown individually in the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must account for at least two-thirds of all expenditures over the multi-year period. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents multi-year estimates for programs that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if multi-year estimates are not presented by program.

Revenues generally are separated into two major categories: "tax" and "non-tax" revenues. Taxes are compulsory transfers that result from government exercising its sovereign power. The largest sources of tax revenue in some countries are taxes on personal and business income and taxes on goods and services, such as sales or value-added taxes. The category of non-tax revenues is more diverse, ranging from grants from international institutions and foreign governments to funds raised through the sale of government-provided goods and services. Note that some forms of revenue, such as contributions to social security funds, can be considered either a tax or non-tax revenue depending on the nature of the approach to these contributions. Particularly because different revenues have different characteristics, including who bears the burden of paying the tax and how collections are affected by economic conditions, it is helpful when estimates for revenues are disaggregated and displayed based on their sources.

For more information, please refer to the 2001 GFS manual, in particular Appendix 4 (<http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/app4.pdf>).

**Answer:**

d. No, multi-year estimates for programs are not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023  
HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation  
2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

Multi-year estimates for programs, beyond the budget year, are not available in the EBP or the supporting budget documentations.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**9. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present the individual sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?**

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 9 assesses the degree to which the individual sources of "tax" revenue are disaggregated in the budget. The largest sources of tax revenue in some countries are taxes on personal and business income and taxes on goods and services, such as sales or value-added taxes.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present all individual sources of tax revenue for the budget year, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all tax revenue. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present individual sources of tax revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all tax revenue, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents individual sources of tax revenue that account for less than two-thirds of tax revenues. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of tax revenue are not presented.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, individual sources of tax revenue accounting for all tax revenue are presented.

**Source:**

- <https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

Eg. "GRA- Income Tax" - Page. 37

"GRA- Income Tax/VAT" - Page. 37

**Comment:**

Individual sources of tax revenue are shown in the EBP and disaggregated as well.

See for instance in the ' The Executive Budget Proposal 2023':

On page 37, an estimated "GRA- Income Tax" of D 5.10 billion

On page 37 again, an estimated "GRA- Income Tax/VAT" of D 1.98 billion

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**10. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present the individual sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of government-produced goods and services) for the budget year?**

*GUIDELINES:*

Question 10 assesses the degree to which the individual sources of “non-tax” revenue are disaggregated in the budget. The category of non-tax revenues is diverse, and can include revenue ranging from grants from international institutions and foreign governments to funds raised through the sale of government-provided goods and services.

To answer “a,” the Executive’s Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present all individual sources of non-tax revenue for the budget year, and “other” or “miscellaneous” revenue must account for three percent or less of all non-tax revenue. To answer “b,” the Executive’s Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present individual sources of non-tax revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all non-tax revenue, but not all revenue. A “c” answer applies if the Executive’s Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents individual sources of non-tax revenue that account for less than two-thirds of non-tax revenues. Answer “d” applies if individual sources of non-tax revenue are not presented.

**Answer:**

a. Yes, individual sources of non-tax revenue accounting for all non-tax revenue are presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023  
"Overview of Revenue, Grants and Financing" - Page 3

**Comment:**

All individual sources of non-tax revenue are shown in the EBP and disaggregated as well. For example, on page 3 of the "The Executive Budget Proposal 2023" which is titled "Overview of Revenue, Grants and Financing";  
-Non-tax revenue is estimated at D 2.96 billion which is 17.21 % of the total budget. Out of that "Sales of goods and services" is estimated at D 2.90 billion whereas "Fines, penalties and forfeits" is estimated at D 4.10 million.  
-Project grants (from foreign governments and international organizations -Capital) are estimated at D 9.82 billion while budget support (from international organizations- Current) is estimated at D 2.76 billion.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**11. Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax) for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 11 evaluates whether revenue estimates are presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year) by “category,” that is, whether tax and non-tax sources of revenue are shown separately.

To answer “a,” the Executive’s Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present multi-year estimates of revenues classified by category for at least two years following the budget year in question.

**Answer:**

b. No, multi-year estimates of revenue are not presented by category.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023  
HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation  
2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

The FY 2023 EBP, or any supporting budget documentation, does not comprise tax or non-tax revenue estimates for multiple years beyond the budget year.

**Peer Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Agree

**12. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates for individual sources of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 12 evaluates whether revenue estimates for individual sources of revenue are presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year). The question applies to both tax and non-tax revenue.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present multi-year estimates of all sources of revenue individually, accounting for all revenue, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all revenue. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present multi-year estimates of individual sources of revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all revenue, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents multi-year estimates of individual revenue sources that account for less than two-thirds of revenue. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of revenue are not presented for a multi-year period.*

**Answer:**

d. No, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue are not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

The FY 2023 EBP, or any supporting budget documentation, does not show estimates of individual revenue sources for multiple years beyond the budget year.

**Peer Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Agree

**13. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 13 asks about three key estimates related to borrowing and debt that the budget should include:*

- *the amount of net new borrowing required during the entire budget year;*
- *the central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year; and*
- *the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the entire budget year.*

*Debt is the accumulated amount of money that the government borrows. The government can borrow from its citizens and banks and businesses within the*

country (domestic debt) or from creditors outside the country (external debt). External debt is typically owed to private commercial banks, other governments, or international financial institutions such as the World Bank and the IMF.

Net new borrowing is the additional amount of new borrowing that is required for the budget year to finance expenditures in the budget that exceed available revenues. Net new borrowing adds to the accumulated debt. It is distinct from gross borrowing, which also includes borrowing needed to repay existing debt that matured during the budget year; debt that is replaced (or rolled over) does not add to the total of accumulated debt. For the purposes of this question, the deficit may be accepted as a proxy for net new borrowing.

Interest payments on the debt (or debt service costs) are typically made at regular intervals, and these payments must be made on a timely basis in order to avoid defaulting on the debt obligation. Interest payments are separate from the repayment of principal, which occurs only when the loan has matured and must be paid back in full.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present all three estimates of borrowing and debt. For a "b" answer, the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present two of those three estimates. For a "c" answer, the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present one of the three estimates. Answer "d" applies if no information on borrowing and debt is presented for the entire budget year.

**Answer:**

a. Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

"Budget overview" - page 1 of the FY 2023 EBP

"Debt Service Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" Pages 209 - 214 of the FY 2023 EBP

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation - Article 38, page 16

**Comment:**

The "Budget overview" section of the EBP (eg. on page 1 of the FY 2023 EBP) has a Financing component which shows "the amount of net new borrowing required during the entire budget year" which is D -3.933 billion (-3% of Nominal GDP). Furthermore, the "Debt Service Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" section of the EBP (eg. on pages 209 - 214 of the FY 2023 EBP) shows "the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the entire budget year" estimated at D 2.91 billion.

Although information on the government's total debt burden is not available in the EBP, just the total debt service for a single budget year is presented on pages 209 - 214.

The information of total debt outstanding (D90.7 billion - for september 2022) is available in the FY 2023 Budget Speech - Article 38, page 16. On page 66 of the same document, there is a projection of the total debt outstanding at the end of the fiscal year 2023 (as percentage of GDP).

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

13b. Based on the response to Question 13, check the box(es) below to identify which estimates of government borrowing and debt are presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal:

**Answer:**

The amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year

The interest payments on outstanding debt for the budget year

The central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

"Budget overview" - page 1 of the FY 2023 EBP



"Debt Service Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" pages 209 - 214 of the FY 2023 EBP  
2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation - Article 38, page 16

**Comment:**

The "Budget overview" section of the EBP (eg. on page 1 of the FY 2023 EBP) has a Financing component which shows "the amount of net new borrowing required during the entire budget year" which is D -3.933 billion (-3% of Nominal GDP). Furthermore, the "Debt Service Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" section of the EBP (eg. on pages 209 - 214 of the FY 2023 EBP) shows "the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the entire budget year" estimated at D 2.91 billion.

Although information on the government's total debt burden is not available in the EBP, just the total debt service for a single budget year is presented on pages 209 - 214,

Information on total debt - D90.7 billion is available in the FY 2023 Budget Speech - Article 38, page 16. Also, on page 66.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**14. "Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year?"**

**(The core information must include interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)"**

*GUIDELINES:*

Question 14 focuses on the composition of government debt at the end of the budget year, asking whether "core" information related to its composition is presented. These core components include:

- interest rates on the debt;
- maturity profile of the debt; and
- whether the debt is domestic or external.

*The interest rates affect the amount of interest that must be paid to creditors. The maturity profile indicates the final payment date of the loan, at which point the principal (and all remaining interest) is due to be paid; government borrowing typically includes a mix of short-term and long-term debt. As discussed in Question 13, domestic debt is held by a country's citizens, banks, and businesses, while external debt is held by foreigners. These factors related to the composition of the debt give an indication of the potential vulnerability of the country's debt position, and ultimately whether the cost of servicing the accumulated debt is affordable.*

*Beyond these core elements, a government may also provide additional information related to the composition of its debt, including for instance: whether interest rates are fixed or variable; whether debt is callable; the currency of the debt; a profile of the creditors (bilateral institutions, multilateral institutions, commercial banks, Central Bank, etc.); an analysis of the risk associated with the debt; and where appropriate, what the debt is being used to finance.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to the composition of government debt at the end of the budget year as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to the composition of government debt is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on the composition of the debt outstanding at the end of the budget year.*

**Answer:**

b. Yes, the core information is presented for the composition of the total debt outstanding.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

"Debt Service Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" - pages 209 - 214 of the FY 2023 EBP

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

The "Debt Service Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" section of the EBP (eg. on pages 209 - 214 of the FY 2023 EBP) shows "whether the debt is domestic or external" as well as the total interest payments on past debts that are to be made in the current fiscal year, including a profile of the creditors. However, it does not present the "maturity profile of the debt" - i.e. "the final payment date of the loan, at which point the principal (and all remaining interest) is due to be paid." ; the supporting budget documentation - Budget Speech, Section 38, page 16- also presents the total domestic and external debts accrued by the central government.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:**

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**14b. Based on the response to Question 14, check the box(es) to identify which elements of the composition of the total debt outstanding are are presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal:**

**Answer:**

Interest rates on the debt  
Whether the debt is domestic or external  
Information beyond the core elements (please specify)

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023  
"Debt Service Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" - pages 209 - 214 of the FY 2023 EBP  
HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation  
2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

The "Debt Service Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" section of the EBP (eg. on pages 209 - 214 of the FY 2023 EBP) shows "whether the debt is domestic or external" as well as the total interest payments on past debts that are to be made in the current fiscal year, including the profile of the creditors (information beyond the core elements). However, it does not present the "maturity profile of the debt" - i.e. "the final payment date of the loan, at which point the principal (and all remaining interest) is due to be paid." The supporting budget documentation - Budget Speech, Section 38, page 16- also presents the total domestic and external debts accrued by the central government.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**15. "Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?"**

**(The core information must include a discussion of the economic outlook with estimates of nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)"**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 15 focuses on the macroeconomic forecast that underlies the budget's revenue and expenditure estimates, asking whether "core" information related*

to the economic assumptions is presented. These core components include a discussion of the economic outlook as well as estimates of the following:

- nominal GDP level;
- inflation rate;
- real GDP growth; and
- interest rates.

While the core macroeconomic information should be a standard feature of the Executive's Budget Proposal, the importance of some types of macroeconomic assumptions may vary from country to country. For example, the budget estimates of some countries are particularly affected by changes in the price of oil and other commodities.

Beyond these core elements, some governments also provide additional information related to the economic outlook, including for instance: short and long-term interest rates; rate of employment and unemployment; GDP deflator; price of oil and other commodities; current account; exchange rate; and composition of GDP growth.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to the macroeconomic forecast as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to the macroeconomic forecast is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information on the macroeconomic forecast is presented.

**Answer:**

b. Yes, the core information is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget#>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

"Budget overview" - Page 2

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - as supporting budget documentation

Article 10, page 3; Article 12, page 4; Article 13, page 4

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

The "Budget overview" section of the EBP (eg. on page 2 of the FY 2023 EBP) consists of the nominal GDP projections for both the previous and current fiscal years (D 115.18 billion for BY-1, 2022, and D 130.93 billion for the current BY, 2023)

Moreover, during the laying of 2023 draft budget estimates, the Minister of Finance stated the macroeconomic projections based on which the draft budget estimates were produced. For instance, Article 10, page 3, of the minister's statement shows that real GDP growth, for end December 2022, was projected at 4.8 percent; Article 12, page 4 -shows the actual, of headline inflation rate as 13.3 percent as at end September 2022, while Article 13, page 4, also shows the actual policy interest rate, again not a forecast or estimate, as 12% in September, 2022.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

15b. Based on the response to Question 15, check the box(es) to identify which elements of the macroeconomic forecast are included in the Executive's Budget Proposal:

**Answer:**

Nominal GDP level

Real GDP growth

Inflation rate

Interest rates

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget#>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

"Budget overview" - Page 2

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - as supporting budget documentation

Article 10, page 3; Article 12, page 4; Article 13, page 4

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

The "Budget overview" section of the EBP (eg. on page 2 of the FY 2023 EBP) consists of the nominal GDP projections for both the previous and current fiscal years (D 115.18 billion for BY-1, 2022, and D 130.93 billion for the current BY, 2023)

Moreover, during the laying of 2023 draft budget estimates, the Minister of Finance stated the macroeconomic projections based on which the draft budget estimates were produced. For instance, Article 10, page 3, of the minister's statement shows that real GDP growth, for end December 2022, was projected at 4.8 percent; Article 12, page 4 -shows the actual, of headline inflation rate as 13.3 percent as at end September 2022, while Article 13, page 4, also shows the actual policy interest rate, again not a forecast or estimate, as 12% in September, 2022.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**16. "Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget?"**

(The core information must include estimates of the impact on expenditures, revenue, and debt of different assumptions for the inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)"

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 16 focuses on the issue of whether the Executive's Budget Proposal shows how different macroeconomic assumptions affect the budget estimates (known as a "sensitivity analysis"). It asks whether "core" information related to a sensitivity analysis is presented, estimating the impact on expenditures, revenue, and debt of different assumptions for:

- inflation rate;
- real GDP growth; and
- interest rates.

A sensitivity analysis shows the effect on the budget of possible changes in some macroeconomic assumptions, and is important for understanding the impact of the economy on the budget; for instance, what would happen to revenue collections if GDP growth were slower than what is assumed in the budget proposal? Or what would happen to expenditure if inflation were higher than estimated? Or how will revenue be affected by a decrease in the price of oil?

As noted for Question 15, changes in certain macroeconomic assumptions, such as the price of oil and other commodities, can have a significant impact on the budget estimates. As a result, some sensitivity analyses may also examine the impact on the budget estimates of changes in assumptions such as the price of oil that are beyond the core elements of the inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.

For an example of how a sensitivity analysis may be presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal, see the following:

- The United States in its 2021 Budget Analytical Perspectives includes a section titled Sensitivity of the Budget to Economic Assumptions along with a table that shows the impact of each economic scenario on revenues, spending, and the deficit. (see pages 16 – 17, <https://www.govinfo.gov/content/pkg/BUDGET-2021-PER/pdf/BUDGET-2021-PER.pdf>).
- The Philippines in its 2021 Budget of Expenditures and Sources of Financing (BESF) presents the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on expenditures, revenue, and debt (see page 131, Table A.6 titled "Budget Sensitivity to Macroeconomic Parameters, 2021," <https://www.dbm.gov.ph/wp-content/uploads/BESF/BESF2021/A6.pdf>); pages 12-13, Technical Notes on the 2021 Proposed National Budget <https://www.dbm.gov.ph/images/pdf/Technical-Notes-on-the-2021-Proposed-National-Budget.pdf>).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to a "sensitivity analysis" as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to a "sensitivity analysis" is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information on "sensitivity analysis" is presented.

**Answer:**

d. No, information related to different macroeconomic assumptions is not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget#>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - as supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

The "HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES" from page 4-6, Section 14-20 highlights the impact of the different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget. The sections highlighted, for example, the low outturn of revenue in the first 9 months of 2022, where only 56% was realised. The macroeconomic impact on the low revenue outturn was justified as "drop in international trade taxes for both Oil and non-oil imports."

The document further highlights the impact of the different macroeconomic issues on expenditure and debt interest on page 5, section 18-19. However, the minister's statement does not specify how this will affect the subsequent budget year 2023 budget.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**17. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how new policy proposals, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Questions 17 and 18 ask about new policy proposals in the budget. In any given year, most of the expenditures and revenues in the budget reflect the continuation of existing policies. However, much of the attention during the budget debate is focused on new proposals – whether they call for eliminating an existing program, introducing a new one, or changing an existing program at the margins. Typically, these new proposals are accompanied by an increase, a decrease, or a shift in expenditures or revenues. Because these changes may have different impacts on people's lives, the budget proposal should present sufficient detail about new policies and their budgetary impact.

Question 17 asks about new expenditure policies, and Question 18 asks about new revenue policies. To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present both estimates of how all new policy proposals affect expenditures (for Question 17) or revenues (for Question 18) and a narrative discussion of the impact of these new policies. To answer "b" for either question, the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present estimates that show the impact of all new policy proposals, but no narrative discussion is included. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes only a narrative discussion of the impact of the new policies, or if it includes estimates that show the impact of only some, but not all, policy proposals (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on the impact of new policy proposals.

**Answer:**

d. No, information that shows how new policy proposals affect expenditure is not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget#>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - as supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

Neither the EBP nor any supporting budget documentation presents information for the budget year, or beyond, that shows the difference between new policy proposals and existing policies and how the new policy proposals affect expenditures. The FY 2023 EBP, for instance, does not present such information.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**18. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how new policy proposals, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Questions 17 and 18 ask about new policy proposals in the budget. In any given year, most of the expenditures and revenues in the budget reflect the continuation of existing policies. However, much of the attention during the budget debate is focused on new proposals – whether they call for eliminating an existing program, introducing a new one, or changing an existing program at the margins. Typically, these new proposals are accompanied by an increase, a decrease, or a shift in expenditures or revenues. Because these changes may have different impacts on people's lives, the budget proposal should present sufficient detail about new policies and their budgetary impact.*

*Question 17 asks about new expenditure policies, and Question 18 asks about new revenue policies. To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present both estimates of how all new policy proposals affect expenditures (for Question 17) or revenues (for Question 18) and a narrative discussion of the impact of these new policies. To answer "b" for either question, the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present estimates that show the impact of all new policy proposals, but no narrative discussion is included. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes only a narrative discussion of the impact of the new policies, or if it includes estimates that show the impact of only some, but not all, policy proposals (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on the impact of new policy proposals.*

*Prior-year information constitutes an important benchmark for assessing the proposals for the upcoming budget year. Estimates of prior years should be presented in the same formats (in terms of classification) as the budget year to ensure that year-to-year comparisons are meaningful. For example, if the budget proposes shifting responsibility for a particular program from one administrative unit to another – such as shifting responsibility for the training of nurses from the health department to the education department – the prior-year figures must be adjusted before year-to-year comparisons of administrative budgets can be made.*

*Typically, when the budget proposal is submitted, the year prior to the budget year (BY-1), also known as the current year, has not ended, so the executive will provide estimates of the anticipated outcome for BY-1. The soundness of these estimates is directly related to the degree to which they have been updated to reflect actual expenditures to date, legislative changes that have occurred, and anticipated changes in macroeconomic, caseload, and other relevant factors for the remainder of the year.*

*The first year that can reflect actual outcomes, therefore, is generally two years before the budget year (BY-2). Thus the OECD recommends that data covering at least two years before the budget year (along with two years of projections beyond the budget year) are provided in order to assess fully the trends in the budget.*

**Answer:**

c. Yes, information that shows how some but not all new policy proposals affect revenues are presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget#>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - as supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

Neither the EBP nor any supporting budget documentation presents information for the budget year, or beyond, that shows the difference between new policy proposals and existing policies and how the new policy proposals affect revenues. The FY 2023 EBP, for instance, does not present such

information.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Disagree

**Suggested Answer:** e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Comments:** The Budget Speech is a supporting document here, and it does narrate on new revenue measure/ policies that will be implemented in that fiscal year.

**Researcher Response**

It is indeed true that the Budget Speech presents information on how new policy proposals (eg. tax reforms etc.) affect revenues; therefore, the research team agrees with the government reviewer.

**IBP Comment**

Considering the comment and evidence provided by the government reviewer and the additional comment of the researcher, the most appropriate answer should be "c" instead of "d". Analyzing the budget speech it is not possible to identify if all the new policy proposals affecting revenues are presented.

**19. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?**

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 19 asks if expenditure estimates for the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) are presented by one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. (See Questions 1-5 above.)*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditure estimates for BY-1 by all three of the expenditure classifications. To answer "b," expenditure estimates for BY-1 must be presented by two of these three classifications. A "c" answer applies if expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if expenditure estimates for BY-1 are not presented by any of the three classifications.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023  
Pages 46 -135 & 159-208; Pages 7-16; Pages 24-26

**Comment:**

The EBP presents expenditures for the year preceding the budget year by all three expenditure classifications - administrative, economic and functional. For instance;  
-Pages 46 -135 & 159-208 on "The Executive Budget Proposal 2023" show the classification of expenditures under Recurrent and Development Budgets into ministries, departments or agencies with expenditure estimates for the previous budget year shown next to the estimates for the current budget year - Administrative classification.  
-Pages 7-16 on "The Executive Budget Proposal 2023" present the Economic classification of expenditure estimates for the previous budget year next to the estimates for the current budget year.  
-Pages 24-26 on "The Executive Budget Proposal 2023" present the Functional classification of expenditure estimates for the previous budget year next to the estimates for the current budget year

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**20. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 20 asks if expenditure estimates for the year before the budget year (BY-1) are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department. For example, the Ministry of Health's budget could be broken down into several subgroups, such as "primary health care," "hospitals," or "administration." These subgroups should be considered programs even if they could be, but are not, broken down into smaller, more detailed units.*

**A note for francophone countries:** "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as *le plan comptable* or *le plan comptable detaillé*. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures, for BY-1. To answer "b," the programs shown individually in the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must account for at least two-thirds of all expenditures for BY-1. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents programs that account for only less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by program.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented for BY-1.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

"Recurrent Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure PBB" - Pages 46 - 135

"Development Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" - Pages 159 – 208

**Comment:**

The FY 2023 EBP shows expenditures for all individual programs and accounting for all expenditures, under each budget entity, for the year that precedes the current budget year.

See for instance in the 'The Executive Budget Proposal 2023':

"Recurrent Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure PBB" - pages 46 - 135

"Development Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" - pages. 159 – 208

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**21. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, have expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditures?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 21 asks whether the expenditure estimates for the year before the budget year (BY-1) have been updated from the original enacted levels. Updates can reflect actual experience to date; revised estimates due to shifting of funds by the executive, as permitted under the law; enactment of supplemental budgets; and revised assumptions regarding macroeconomic conditions, caseload, and other relevant factors for the remainder of the year.*

*Answer "a" applies if the estimates have been updated; answer "b" applies if the original estimates are still being used.*



**Answer:**

b. No, expenditure estimates for BY-1 have not been updated from the original enacted levels.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

"Recurrent Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure PBB" - pages 46 - 135

"Development Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" - pages 159 – 208

**Comment:**

The actual expenditures for BY-1 are not available in the EBP.

See for instance in the ' The Executive Budget Proposal 2023':

"Recurrent Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure PBB" - pages 46 - 135

"Development Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" - pages 159 – 208

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Comments:** For FY 2021 budget , 2019 actuals and 2020 approved figures are presented.

**22. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of expenditure for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 22 asks if expenditure estimates for more than one year prior to the budget year (BY-2 and prior years) are presented by any of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. (See Questions 1-5 above.)*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years by all three of the expenditure classifications. To answer "b," expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years must be presented by two of these three classifications. A "c" answer applies if expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are not presented by any of the three classifications*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

BY-2 presents expenditures by the three budget classifications - administrative, economic and functional. The supporting documentations do not contain such information.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

22b. Based on the response to Question 22, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications have estimates for more than one year prior to the budget year in the Executive Budget Proposal:

**Answer:**

Administrative classification  
Economic classification  
Functional classification

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023  
HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation  
2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

BY-2 presents expenditures by the three budget classifications - administrative, economic and functional. The supporting documentations do not contain such information.

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

23. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for more than one year preceding the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 23 asks if expenditure estimates for more than one year before the budget year (BY-2 and prior years) are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department. For example, the Ministry of Health's budget could be broken down into several subgroups, such as "primary health care," "hospitals," or "administration." These subgroups should be considered programs even if they could be, but are not, broken down into smaller, more detailed units.*

*A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as le plan comptable or le plan comptable detaille. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures, for BY-2 and prior years. To answer "b," the programs shown individually in the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must account for at least two-thirds of all expenditures for BY-2 and prior years. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents programs that account for only less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by program.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented for BY-2 and prior years.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

The EBP presents expenditures accounting for all individual programs. For example, under the Independent Electoral Commission (IEC) (budget entity code 04) the total expenditures for the 2021 Presidential election management is recorded at D362,545,457, this could be found on the EBP page 54, budget code 0411.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Comments:** Note that B-2 information is under the concept "Actual" and B-1 information is under the concept "Approved".

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**24. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?**

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 24 asks for which year the actual outcomes for expenditures are shown. In most cases, the most recent year for which budget data on actual outcomes are available will be BY-2, as BY-1 is generally not yet finished when the budget proposal is drafted. So a government that has updated all its expenditure data for BY-2 to reflect what actually occurred, as opposed to estimating the outcome for that year, shows good public financial management practice.*

*For an "a" answer, a country must meet the good practice of having the figures for BY-2 reflect actual outcomes.*

**Answer:**

a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

**Comment:**

The most recent and the only year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes is BY-2 (2021).

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**25. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue by category (such as tax and non-tax) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?**

*GUIDELINES:*

*Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, revenue estimates for BY-1 are presented by category.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023  
"Overview of Revenue, Grants and Financing" - Pages 3 - 4

**Comment:**

The EBP presents estimates of tax and non-tax revenue, by category and with disaggregation, for BY-1. See pages 3 - 4, titled "Overview of Revenue, Grants and Financing", on the FY 2023 EBP.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**26. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present individual sources of revenue for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?**

*GUIDELINES:*

*Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented for BY-1.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023  
"Overview of Revenue, Grants and Financing" - Pages 3 - 4  
"Receipts of Revenues, Grants and Loans" - Pages 33-36  
"Detailed Revenue Estimates by Collecting Agency" Pages 37 - 41

**Comment:**

Individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue for BY-1 are shown in the EBP and disaggregated as well.  
See for instance pages 3-4, 33-36 & 37-41 on the "The Executive Budget Proposal 2023"

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**27. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, have the original estimates of revenue for the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) been updated to reflect actual revenue collections?**

*GUIDELINES:*

Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.

**Answer:**

b. No, revenue estimates for BY-1 have not been updated from the original enacted levels.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

Actual revenue for BY-1 is not presented in the EBP or in any supporting budget documentation.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**28. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax) for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?**

*GUIDELINES:*

*Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, revenue estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by category.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

Pages 3-4, titled "Overview of Revenue, Grants and Financing"

Pages 33-36, titled "Receipts of Revenues, Grants and Loans"

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

For BY-2, revenue categories such as tax and non-tax are shown in the EBP.

See pages 3-4, titled "Overview of Revenue, Grants and Financing" and Pages 33-36, titled "Receipts of Revenues, Grants and Loans" on the FY 2023 EBP. The supporting budget documentations, however, do not present revenue estimates by category.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

29. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present individual sources of revenue for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

**GUIDELINES:**

Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.

**Answer:**

a. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented for BY-2 and prior years.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

"Overview of Revenue, Grants and Financing" - Pages 3 - 4

"Receipts of Revenues, Grants and Loans" - Pages 33-36

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

Individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue for BY-2 are shown in the EBP and disaggregated as well.

See for instance pages 3-4 & 33-37 on the "The Executive Budget Proposal 2023".

The supporting budget documentations present no individual sources of revenue for BY-2 or prior years.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Comments:** Note that they are presented for BY-2, not previous years.

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

30. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?

**GUIDELINES:**

Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.

**Answer:**

a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

Pages 3-4, titled "Overview of Revenue, Grants and Financing"

"Receipts of Revenues, Grants and Loans" - Pages 33-36

**Comment:**

The most recent and the only year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes is BY-2.

See pages 3-4, titled "Overview of Revenue, Grants and Financing", on the FY 2023 EBP.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

31. "Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?"

(The core information must include the total debt outstanding at the end of BY-1; the amount of net new borrowing required during BY-1; interest payments on the debt; interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)"

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 31 focuses on prior-year debt information, rather than on prior-year expenditures or revenues, asking whether "core" information is provided on government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1).

The "core" information includes:

- total debt outstanding at the end of BY-1;
- amount of net new borrowing required during BY-1;
- interest payments on the debt;
- interest rates on the debt instruments;
- maturity profile of the debt; and
- whether it is domestic or external debt.

This core information for BY-1 is consistent with the budget year information for borrowing and debt, which is examined in Questions 13 and 14. Please note that for the purposes of this question, the deficit may be accepted as a proxy for net new borrowing.

In addition, some governments provide information beyond the core elements, such as gross new borrowing required during BY-1; currency of the debt; whether the debt carries a fixed or variable interest rate; whether it is callable; a profile of the creditors (bilateral institutions, multilateral institutions, commercial banks, Central Bank, etc.); where appropriate, what the debt is being used to finance.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for BY-1 as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to government borrowing and debt, including its composition, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on government borrowing and debt for BY-1.

**Answer:**

b. Yes, the core information is presented for government debt.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

Page 1 - "Budget overview" - Financing component

"Debt Service Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" - Pages 209 - 214

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

Article 38, page 16

**Comment:**

The "Budget overview" section of the EBP (eg. on page 1 of the FY 2023 EBP) has a Financing component which shows "the amount of net new borrowing required during BY-1", D -4.58 billion. Also, the "Debt Service Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" section of the EBP (eg. on pages 209 - 214 of the FY 2023 EBP) shows "the interest payments on the debt" for BY-1, an amount of D 3.04 billion, and whether the outstanding debt for BY-1 is domestic or external, including a profile of the creditors.

Although information on the government's total debt burden is not available in the EBP, just the total debt service for a single budget year is presented, it (information on total debt - D90.7 billion) is available in the FY 2023 Budget Speech - Article 38, page 16. However, it is not for the whole BY-1 as it shows the actual total debt accrued by the government as at end September 2022. On page 66 of the same document, there is a projection of the total debt outstanding for BY-1 (as percentage of GDP).

Moreover, on debt interest, the HM Statement on the Laying of the 2023 Estimates, highlights the projection of the total debt interest to be paid by

end December 2023 (D3.48B) on page 5, Article 19. However "maturity profile of the debt" - is not presented in the EBP or its supporting budget documents

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**32. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 32 asks for which year the actual outcome for total debt outstanding is shown. In most cases, the most recent year for which budget data on actual outcomes are available will be BY-2, as BY-1 is generally not yet finished when the budget proposal is drafted. So a government that has updated its debt data for BY-2 to reflect what actually occurred, as opposed to estimating the outcome for that year, shows good public financial management practice.*

*For an "a" answer, a country must meet the good practice of having the figures for BY-2 reflect actual outcomes.*

*It is essential that all government activities that may have an impact on the budget – in the current budget year or in future budget years – be fully disclosed to the legislature and the public in budget documents. In some countries, for instance, entities outside central government (such as public corporations) undertake fiscal activities that could affect current and future budgets. Similarly, activities that can have a significant impact on the budget, such as payment arrears and contingent liabilities, sometimes are not properly captured by the regular presentations of expenditure, revenue, and debt.*

**Answer:**

a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023  
Pages 209 - 214

Budget Speech 2023, page 16 (Section 38), <https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The most recent year for which the debt figures reflected actual figures is FY 2022 in the budget speech. On page 16, section 38, the Minister for Finance states that the total debt stock as of September 2022 is D90.7 Billion.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**33. "Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on extra-budgetary funds for at least the budget year?**

**(The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the extra-budgetary fund; and complete income, expenditure, and financing data on a gross basis.)"**

**GUIDELINES:**



Question 33 focuses on extra-budgetary funds, asking whether “core” information related to these funds, which exist outside the budget, are presented. These core components include:

- a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the extra-budgetary fund (i.e., why was a particular fund set up? what is it used for?); and
- estimates of its income, expenditure, and financing. (These estimates should be presented on a gross basis so that it is possible to tell how much money flows through each extra-budgetary fund.)

In most countries, governments engage in certain budgetary activities that are not included in the central government’s budget. Known as extra-budgetary funds, they can range in size and scope. For example, countries frequently set up pension and social security programs as extra-budgetary funds, where the revenues collected and the benefits paid are recorded in a separate fund outside the budget. Another example of an extra-budgetary fund can be found in countries dependent on hydrocarbon/mineral resources, where revenues from producing and selling those resources are channeled through systems outside the annual budget.

In some cases, the separation engendered by an extra-budgetary fund serves a legitimate political purpose, and the finances and activities of these funds are well documented. In other cases, however, this structure is used for obfuscation, and little or nothing is known about a fund’s finances and activities.

The availability of information related to extra-budgetary funds is essential for a comprehensive understanding of the government’s true fiscal position. In addition to the core information, other information about extra-budgetary funds is also desirable. Such information includes a discussion of the risks associated with the extra-budgetary fund; expenditures classified by economic, functional, or administrative unit; and the rules and procedures that govern the operations and management of the extra-budgetary fund.

For more information about extra-budgetary funds, see the Guide to Transparency in Public Finances: Looking Beyond the Core Budget (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/Looking-Beyond-the-Budget.pdf>) and Principle 2.1.1 of the IMF’s Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>).

To answer “a,” the Executive’s Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to extra-budgetary funds as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. A “b” answer applies if the Executive’s Budget Proposal or supporting documentation presents all of the core information. Answer “b” is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A “c” answer applies if some information related to extra-budgetary funds is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer “d” applies if no information is presented on extra-budgetary funds.

Please provide in the comments a list of all known extra-budgetary funds.

**Answer:**

d. No, information related to extra-budgetary funds is not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

Neither the FY 2023 EBP nor any supporting budget documentation presents information related to extra-budgetary funds.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**34. Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present central government finances (both budgetary and extra-budgetary) on a consolidated basis for at least the budget year?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 34 asks whether the Executive’s Budget Proposal or supporting documents present the finances of the central government on a consolidated basis, showing both its budgetary and extra-budgetary activities. Virtually all of the questions in the OBS questionnaire focus on budgetary central government – the

activities of the ministries, departments, or agencies of central government. In addition, Question 33 asks about extra-budgetary funds, such as social security funds that are not included in the budget.

Coverage is an important aspect of fiscal reporting. Budget documents should cover the full scope of government's financial activity. In many countries, extra-budgetary activities are substantial, and can represent a sizable share of the central government's activities. To get a full picture of the central government's finances, therefore, it is necessary to examine both activities that are included in the budget and those that are extra-budgetary. This question asks whether such a consolidated presentation of central government finances, including both revenues and expenditures, is provided.

The central government is only one component of the overall public sector. The public sector also includes other levels of government, such as state and local government, and public corporations. (See Box 2.1 under Principle 1.1.1 of the IMF's Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018): <https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>). For the purpose of answering this question, please consider only the central government level.

In order to answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present central government finances (both budgetary and extra-budgetary) on a consolidated basis for at least the budget year.

**Answer:**

b. No, central government finances are not presented on a consolidated basis.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

Neither the FY 2023 EBP nor any supporting budget documentation presents both budgetary and extra-budgetary funds on a consolidated basis.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**35. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of intergovernmental transfers for at least the budget year?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 35 asks about intergovernmental transfers. In many cases, the central government supports the provision of a good or service by a lower level of government through an intergovernmental transfer of funds. This is necessary because, independent from the level of administrative decentralization that exists in a given country, the capacity for revenue collection of a local government is unlikely to be sufficient to pay for all its expenses. However, because the activity is not being undertaken by an administrative unit of the central government, it is unlikely to receive the same level of review in the budget. Thus it is important to include in the budget proposal a statement that explicitly indicates the amount and purposes of these transfers.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year both estimates covering all intergovernmental transfers and a narrative discussing these transfers. If a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all intergovernmental transfers are presented, then a "b" answer is appropriate. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, intergovernmental transfers (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no estimates of intergovernmental transfers are presented.

**Answer:**

b. Yes, estimates of all intergovernmental transfers are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

GFS codes 25 (Subvention) and 26 (Grant) on page 14

**Comment:**

Any forms of transfers to be made by the central government (either to the regional or local government or to another foreign government) in FY 2023 are presented in the FY 2023 EBP. However, narrative discussion about the transfers is not incorporated in the FY 2023 EBP. See GFS codes 25 (Subvention) and 26 (Grant) on page 14 of "The Executive Budget Proposal 2023"

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**36. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present alternative displays of expenditures (such as by gender, by age, by income, or by region) to illustrate the financial impact of budget policies on different groups of citizens, for at least the budget year?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 36 asks about "alternative displays" of expenditures that highlight the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens. As discussed above, expenditures are typically presented by at least one of three classifications – administrative, functional, and economic classifications (see Questions 1-5) – and by individual program (Question 6). In addition, governments can provide alternative displays to emphasize different aspects of expenditure policies and to show who benefits from these expenditures.

For the purpose of answering this question, the alternative presentation must differ from the presentations (such as administrative, functional, or economic classifications or presentation by program) used to answer other questions. The alternative display can cover all expenditures or only a portion of expenditures. For instance, it can show how all expenditures are distributed according to geographic region or it can show how selected expenditures (such as the health budget or the agriculture budget) are distributed to different regions. But such a geographic display must be something different than the presentation of intergovernmental transfers used to answer question 35. One exception is when a country includes a special presentation of all policies intended to benefit the most impoverished populations (and is used to answer Question 52) then that can be considered an alternative display for purposes of answering this question as well. Finally, brief fact sheets showing how proposals in the budget benefit particular groups would be insufficient; only more detailed presentations would be considered.

The IBP Budget Brief, "How Transparent are Governments When it Comes to Their Budget's Impact on Poverty and Inequality?"

(<https://www.internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/government-transparency-of-budgets-impact-on-poverty-inequality-ibp-2019.pdf>) includes a discussion of the importance of alternative displays of budget information and provides a number of examples. For instance,

- Bangladesh in its 2017-18 Budget included a detailed supplementary Gender Budgeting Report, which presents the spending dedicated to advancing women across various departments. (<https://mof.portal.gov.bd/site/page/3bb14732-b5b1-44df-9921-efedf1496295>).
- The UK's 2017 budget included a supplementary analysis that provided a distributional analysis of the budget by households in different income groups (see [https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\\_data/file/661465/distributional\\_analysis\\_autumn\\_budget\\_2017.pdf](https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/661465/distributional_analysis_autumn_budget_2017.pdf))
- South Africa's 2017 Budget Review goes beyond the standard presentation of intergovernmental transfers, discussing the redistribution that results from national revenue flowing to the provinces and municipalities and presenting the allocations on a per capita basis (see chapter 6, <http://www.treasury.gov.za/documents/national%20budget/2017/review/FullBR.pdf>).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must include at least three different presentations that illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens for at least the budget year. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must include at least two different alternative displays of expenditures. A "c" applies if only one type of alternative display of expenditure is presented. Answer "d" applies if no alternative display of expenditure is presented.

**Answer:**

d. No, alternative displays of expenditures are not presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

FY 2023 EBP, or any supporting budget documentation, does not disaggregate government expenditures by age, gender, region or economic class to illustrate the impact of the budget or new policy on citizens or foreigners.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

36b. Based on the response to Question 36, select the box(es) below to identify which types of alternative displays are included in the Executive's Budget Proposal:

**Answer:**

None of the above

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

FY 2023 EBP, or any supporting budget documentation, does not disaggregate government expenditures by age, gender, region or economic class to illustrate the impact of the budget or new policy on citizens or foreigners.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

37. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of transfers to public corporations for at least the budget year?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 37 asks about transfers to public corporations. It is often the case that governments have a stake in enterprises that manage resources that are particularly relevant for the public good (such as electricity, water, and oil). While these public corporations can operate independently, in some cases the government will provide direct support by making transfers to these corporations, including to subsidize capital investment and operating expenses.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year both estimates covering all transfers to public corporations and a narrative discussing the purposes of these transfers. If a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all transfers to public corporations are presented, then a "b" answer is appropriate. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, transfers to public corporations (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "c" also applies if estimates of transfers to public corporations are presented as a single line item. Answer "d" applies if no estimates of transfers to public corporations are presented.*

Please provide in the comments a list of all known public corporations.

**Answer:**

b. Yes, estimates of all transfers to public corporations are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

GFS codes beginning with 25 on page 14, under "Recurrent Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure PBB" - pages 46 - 135

**Comment:**

Transfers to be made by the central government to public corporations in FY 2023 are presented in the FY 2023 EBP. However, narrative discussion about these transfers is not incorporated in the EBP. Note: See GFS codes beginning with 25 on page 14, under "Recurrent Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure PBB" - pages 46 - 135 of "The Executive Budget Proposal 2023".

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**38. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on quasi-fiscal activities for at least the budget year?**

**(The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the quasi-fiscal activity and the intended beneficiaries.)**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 38 focuses on quasi-fiscal activities, asking whether "core" information related to such activities is presented. These core components include:

- A statement of purpose or policy rationale for the quasi-fiscal activity (i.e., what is the reason for engaging in this activity?);
- The identification of intended beneficiaries of the quasi-fiscal activity.

The term "quasi-fiscal activities" refers to a broad range of activities that are fiscal in character and could be carried out through the regular budget process but are not. For example, a quasi-fiscal activity could take place if, instead of providing a direct subsidy through the budget for a particular activity, a public financial institution provides an indirect subsidy by offering loans at below-market rates for that activity. Similarly, it is a quasi-fiscal activity when an enterprise provides goods or services at prices below commercial rates to certain individuals or groups to support the government's policy goals.

The above examples are policy choices that may be approved by the government and legislature. However, quasi-fiscal activities can also involve activities that violate or circumvent a country's budget process laws or are not subject to the regular legislative approval process for expenditures. For example, the executive may issue an informal order to a government entity, such as a public commercial enterprise, to provide the executive with goods and services that normally would have to be purchased with funding authorized by the legislature. All quasi-fiscal activities should be disclosed to the public and subject to public scrutiny.

Beyond the core information, some governments may also provide other information about quasi-fiscal activities, including for example: the anticipated duration of the quasi-fiscal activity; a quantification of the activity and the assumptions that support these estimates; and a discussion of the fiscal significance and potential risks associated with the activity, including the impact on the entity carrying out the activity. Principle 3.3.2 of the IMF's Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>) provides examples of quasi-fiscal activities that can be consulted as needed. And more details on quasi-fiscal activities can be found in the Guide to Transparency in Public Finances: Looking Beyond the Core Budget (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/Looking-Beyond-the-Budget.pdf>).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to all quasi-fiscal activities for at least the budget year as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to quasi-fiscal activities is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on quasi-fiscal activities.

If quasi-fiscal activities do not represent a significant problem in your country, please mark "e." However, please exercise caution in answering this question.

**Answer:**

d. No, information related to quasi-fiscal activities is not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

Information on quasi-fiscal activities is not available in the FY 2023 EBP or in any supporting budget documentation for FY 2023.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**39. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government for at least the budget year?**

**(The core information must include a listing of the assets, and an estimate of their value.)**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 39 focuses on financial assets held by the government, asking whether "core" information related to these assets is presented. These core components include:*

- *A listing of the financial assets; and*
- *An estimate of their value.*

*Governments own financial assets such as cash, bonds, or equities. Unlike private sector businesses, however, few governments maintain balance sheets that show the value of their assets and liabilities.*

*Beyond the core information, some governments may also provide other information about financial assets, including for example: a discussion of their purpose; historical information on defaults; differences between reported values and market values; and a summary of financial assets as part of the government's balance sheet.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year all of the core information related to all financial assets held by the government as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to financial assets is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on financial assets held by the government.*

**Answer:**

d. No, information related to financial assets is not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

Information on financial assets held by the government is not available in the FY 2023 EBP or in any supporting budget documentation for FY 2023.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

**40. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on nonfinancial assets held by the government for at least the budget year?**

(The core information must include a listing of the assets by category.)

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 40 focuses on nonfinancial assets held by the government, asking whether "core" information related to these assets is presented. The core information is a listing of nonfinancial assets, grouped by the type (or category) of asset.

Nonfinancial assets are things of value that the government owns or controls (excluding financial assets) such as land, buildings, and machinery. The valuation of public nonfinancial assets can be problematic, particularly in cases where the asset is not typically available on the open market (such as a government monument). In these cases, it is considered acceptable to provide summary information in budget documents from a country's register of assets. But, in some cases, governments are able to value their nonfinancial assets; some present a summary of nonfinancial assets as part of their balance sheets. For an example of how nonfinancial assets are presented in one of the many supporting documents to the New Zealand Executive's Budget Proposal, see the Forecast Financial Statement 2011, Notes to the Financial Statements (Continued), Note 14, accessible here: <https://treasury.govt.nz/sites/default/files/2011-05/befu11-pt6of8.pdf>.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year a listing by category of all nonfinancial assets held by the government as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to nonfinancial assets is presented, but some nonfinancial assets are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on nonfinancial assets held by the government.

**Answer:**

d. No, information related to nonfinancial assets is not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

Information on non-financial assets held by the government is not available in the FY 2023 EBP or in any supporting budget documentation for FY 2023.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

**41. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of expenditure arrears for at least the budget year?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 41 asks about estimates of expenditure arrears, which arise when government has entered into a commitment to spend funds but has not made the payment when it is due. (For more information see sections 3.49-3.50 of the IMF's GFS Manual 2001, <http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/all.pdf> (page 29)). Though equivalent to borrowing, this liability is often not recorded in the budget, making it difficult to assess fully a government's financial position. Moreover, the obligation to repay this debt affects the government's ability to pay for other

activities.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year both estimates covering all expenditure arrears and a narrative discussing the arrears. If a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all expenditure arrears are presented, then a "b" answer is appropriate. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, expenditure arrears (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no estimates of expenditure arrears are presented. Answer "d" also applies if information is only available for the changes in arrears, and not the stock or balance of arrears.

If expenditure arrears do not represent a significant problem in your country, please mark "e." However, please exercise caution in answering this question. Public expenditure management laws and regulations often will allow for reasonable delays, perhaps 30 or 60 days, in the routine payment of invoices due. Expenditure arrears impacting a small percentage of expenditure that are due to contractual disputes should not be considered a significant problem for the purpose of answering this question.

**Answer:**

b. Yes, estimates of all expenditure arrears are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023  
"Financing" part of the "Budget Overview" on page 1

**Comment:**

Under the "Financing" part of the "Budget Overview" on page 1 of the FY 2023 EBP, estimates of expenditure arrears referred to as "Arrears & Guarantees" are shown. However, narrative discussion is not incorporated. Arrears and Guarantees for the BY 2023 are estimated at D 303 million.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**42. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities, such as government loan guarantees or insurance programs, for at least the budget year?**

**(The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each contingent liability; the new guarantees or insurance commitments proposed for the budget year; and the total amount of outstanding guarantees or insurance commitments (the gross exposure) at the end of the budget year.)**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 42 focuses on contingent liabilities, asking whether "core" information related to these liabilities is presented. These core components include:

- a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each contingent liability;
- the new contingent liabilities for the budget year, such as new guarantees or insurance commitments proposed for the budget year; and
- the total amount of outstanding guarantees or insurance commitments at the end of the budget year. This reflects the gross exposure of the government in the case that all guarantees or commitments come due (even though that may be unlikely to occur).

Contingent liabilities are recognized under a cash accounting method only when the contingent event occurs and the payment is made. An example of such liabilities is the case of loans guaranteed by the central government, which can include loans to state-owned banks and other state-owned commercial enterprises, subnational governments, or private enterprises. Under such guarantees, government will only make a payment if the borrower defaults. Thus a key issue for making quantitative estimates of these liabilities is assessing the likelihood of the contingency occurring.

In the budget, according to the OECD, "[w]here feasible, the total amount of contingent liabilities should be disclosed and classified by major category reflecting their nature; historical information on defaults for each category should be disclosed where available. In cases where contingent liabilities cannot be quantified, they should be listed and described."

Beyond the core information, some governments may also provide other information about contingent liabilities, including for example: historical default rates for each program, and likely default rates in the future; the maximum guarantee that is authorized by law; any special financing associated with the guarantee (e.g., whether fees are charged, whether a reserve fund exists for the purpose of paying off guarantees, etc.); the duration of each guarantee; and an estimate



of the fiscal significance and potential risks associated with the guarantees.

For more details on contingent liabilities, see Guide to Transparency in Public Finances: Looking Beyond the Core Budget (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/Looking-Beyond-the-Budget.pdf>) and page 59 (Box 11) and Principle 3.2.3 of the IMF's Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year all of the core information related to contingent liabilities as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to contingent liabilities is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on contingent liabilities.

**Answer:**

c. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some contingent liabilities.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023  
Page 1 of the FY 2023 EBP, under "Budget Overview"  
Pages 87 - 88, under BE 15 -Centralized Services

**Comment:**

Page 1 of the FY 2023 EBP, under Budget Overview, presents BY-1 and FY 2023 outstanding guarantees whereas pages 87 - 88, under BE 15 - Centralized Services, present all the contingency payments actually made in BY-2 as well as estimated in BY-1 and in FY 2023. Only these information are presented in the FY 2023 EBP.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**43. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present projections that assess the government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term?**

(The core information must cover a period of at least 10 years and include the macroeconomic and demographic assumptions used and a discussion of the fiscal implications and risks highlighted by the projections.)

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 43 focuses on government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer-term, asking whether "core" information related to these issues is presented. These core components must include:

- Projections that cover a period of at least 10 years.
- The macroeconomic and demographic assumptions used in making the projections.
- A discussion of the fiscal implications and risks highlighted by the projections. Good public financial management calls for budgets to include fiscal sustainability analyses.

The IMF's Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>) recommends that governments regularly publish the projected evolution of the public finances over the longer term (see Principle 3.1.3.). Future liabilities are a particularly important element when assessing the sustainability of public finances over the long term. Future liabilities are the result of government commitments that, unlike contingent liabilities, are virtually certain to occur at some future point and result in an expenditure. A typical example consists of government obligations to pay pension benefits or cover health care costs of future retirees. Under a cash accounting system, only current payments associated with such obligations are recognized in the budget. To capture the future impact on the budget of these liabilities, a separate statement is required.

Beyond the core information, some governments may also provide other information about the sustainability of their finances, including for example:

projections that cover 20 or 30 years; multiple scenarios with different sets of assumptions; assumptions about other factors (such as the depletion of natural resources) that go beyond just the core macroeconomic and demographic data; and a detailed presentation of particular programs that have long time horizons, such as civil service pensions.

For more details on future liabilities, see *Guide to Transparency in Public Finances: Looking Beyond the Core Budget* (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/Looking-Beyond-the-Budget.pdf>).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to future liabilities and the sustainability of government finances over the longer term as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to future liabilities is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on future liabilities and the sustainability of government's finances

**Answer:**

d. No, information related to future liabilities and the sustainability of finances over the longer term is not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

HM STATEMENT ON THE LAYING OF 2023 ESTIMATES - on November 14, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - on December 2, 2022 - As supporting budget documentation

**Comment:**

Government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term (at least 10 years) are not captured in the FY 2023 EBP or any supporting budget documentation.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**44. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind, for at least the budget year?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 44 asks about estimates of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind assistance. Such assistance is considered non-tax revenue, and the sources of this assistance should be explicitly identified. In terms of in-kind assistance, the concern is primarily with the provision of goods (particularly those for which there is a market that would allow goods received as in-kind aid to be sold, thereby converting them into cash) rather than with in-kind aid like advisors from a donor country providing technical assistance.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year both estimates covering all donor assistance and a narrative discussing the assistance. If a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all donor assistance are presented, then a "b" answer is appropriate. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, donor assistance (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "c" also applies if the sources of donor assistance are not presented, but the total amount of donor assistance is presented as a single line item. Answer "d" applies if no estimates of donor assistance are presented. Select answer "e" if your country does not receive donor assistance.

**Answer:**

b. Yes, estimates of all sources of donor assistance are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

Page 1 of the FY 2023 EBP, under "Budget Overview"- Project/Programme

Pages 146-158 of the FY 2023 EBP, under "Donor Funding Of Projects"

**Comment:**

Page 1 of the FY 2023 EBP, under "Budget Overview" - specifically "Project/Programme", and pages 146-158 of the FY 2023 EBP, under "Donor Funding Of Projects" show estimates of all sources of donor assistance to the government.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**45. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on tax expenditures for at least the budget year?**

**(The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each tax expenditure, the intended beneficiaries, and an estimate of the revenue foregone.)**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 45 focuses on tax expenditures, asking whether "core" information related to these tax preferences is presented. These core components must include for both new and existing tax expenditures:*

- a statement of purpose or policy rationale;
- a listing of the intended beneficiaries; and
- an estimate of the revenue foregone.

*Tax expenditures arise as a result of exceptions or other preferences in the tax code provided for specified entities, individuals, or activities. Tax expenditures often have the same impact on public policy and budgets as providing direct subsidies, benefits, or goods and services. For example, encouraging a company to engage in more research through a special tax break can have the same effect as subsidizing it directly through the expenditure side of the budget, as it still constitutes a cost in terms of foregone revenues. However, expenditure items that require annual authorization are likely to receive more scrutiny than tax breaks that are a permanent feature of the tax code.*

*Beyond the core information, some governments may also provide other information about tax expenditures, including for example: the intended beneficiaries by sector and income class (distributional impact); a statement of the estimating assumptions, including the definition of the benchmark against which the foregone revenue is measured; and a discussion of tax expenditures as part of a general discussion of expenditures for those program areas that receive both types of government support (in order to better inform policy choices). For more details on tax expenditures, see Guide to Transparency in Public Finances: Looking Beyond the Core Budget (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/Looking-Beyond-the-Budget.pdf>) and Principle 1.1.4 of the IMF's Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>).*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present, for at least the budget year, all of the core information related to tax expenditures as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to tax expenditures is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on tax expenditures.*

**Answer:**

d. No, information related to tax expenditures is not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023  
2023 BUDGET SPEECH - As supporting budget documentation  
Article 37, page 16

**Comment:**

Out of the core components of the information related to tax expenditures none is included in the FY 2023 EBP. However, the revenue foregone due to tax exemptions is mentioned in the FY 2023 Budget Speech under Article 37, page 16, but this piece of information relates to FY 2022, not to FY 2023.

**Peer Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Agree

**46. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of earmarked revenues for at least the budget year?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 46 asks about estimates of earmarked revenues, which are revenues that may only be used for a specific purpose (for example, revenues from a tax on fuel that can only be used for building roads). This information is important in determining which revenues are available to fund the government's general expenses, and which revenues are reserved for particular purposes.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year both estimates covering all individual earmarked revenues and a narrative discussing the earmarks. If a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all individual earmarked revenues are presented, then a "b" answer is appropriate. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, earmarked revenues (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no estimates of earmarked revenues are presented. An "e" response applies if revenue is not earmarked or the practice is disallowed by law or regulation.*

**Answer:**

d. No, estimates of earmarked revenues are not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

**Comment:**

The 2023 EBP does not present earmarked revenue that details how does revenue would be spent on specific programs

**Peer Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Agree

**47. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on how the proposed budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to government's policy goals for the budget year?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Questions 47 and 48 ask about information that shows how the budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to the government's policy goals. The budget is the executive's main policy document, the culmination of the executive's planning and budgeting processes. Therefore, it should include a clear description of the link between policy goals and the budget – that is, an explicit explanation of how the government's policy goals are reflected in its budget choices. For an example of a discussion of a government's policy goals in the budget, see pages 13-18 of New Zealand's 2011 Statement of Intent (<http://www.treasury.govt.nz/publications/abouttreasury/soi/2011-16>), one of the many documents supporting its budget.*

*In some countries the government prepares strategic/development plans. These plans include all the policies the government is planning to implement for the budget year and very often cover a multi-year perspective. In some cases, these plans do not match the budget documentation, and it is possible that they are completely disconnected from the Executive's Budget Proposal. So the question is examining whether government policy plans are "translated" into revenue and expenditure figures in the actual budget documents.*

*Question 47 asks about the information covering the budget year, and Question 48 asks about the period at least two years beyond the budget year. To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present both estimates of how the budget is linked to government's policy goals for the budget year (for Question 47) or for a multi-year period beyond the budget year (for Question 48) and a narrative discussion of how these policy goals are*

reflected in the budget. To answer "b" for either question, the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present estimates that show how the budget is linked to government's policy goals, but no narrative discussion is included. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes only a narrative discussion, or if it includes estimates that show how the budget is linked to some, but not all, of the government's policy goals (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on how the budget is linked to government's policy goals.

**Answer:**

b. Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for the budget year are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.govt.nz/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023  
Pages 27-28, under "Overview of NDP Initiatives"  
National Development Plan (NDP) 2023 - 2027 - currently available for internal use only

**Comment:**

Pages 27-28, under "Overview of NDP Initiatives" of the FY 2023 EBP show how the proposed budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to government's policy goals or NDP initiatives for the budget year.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**48. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on how the proposed budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to government's policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Questions 47 and 48 ask about information that shows how the budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to the government's policy goals. The budget is the executive's main policy document, the culmination of the executive's planning and budgeting processes. Therefore, it should include a clear description of the link between policy goals and the budget – that is, an explicit explanation of how the government's policy goals are reflected in its budget choices. For an example of a discussion of a government's policy goals in the budget, see pages 13-18 of New Zealand's 2011 Statement of Intent (<http://www.treasury.govt.nz/publications/abouttreasury/soi/2011-16>), one of the many documents supporting its budget.

In some countries the government prepares strategic/development plans. These plans include all the policies the government is planning to implement for the budget year and very often cover a multi-year perspective. In some cases, these plans do not match the budget documentation, and it is possible that they are completely disconnected from the Executive's Budget Proposal. So the question is examining whether government policy plans are "translated" into revenue and expenditure figures in the actual budget documents.

Question 47 asks about the information covering the budget year, and Question 48 asks about the period at least two years beyond the budget year. To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present both estimates of how the budget is linked to government's policy goals for the budget year (for Question 47) or for a multi-year period beyond the budget year (for Question 48) and a narrative discussion of how these policy goals are reflected in the budget. To answer "b" for either question, the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present estimates that show how the budget is linked to government's policy goals, but no narrative discussion is included. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes only a narrative discussion, or if it includes estimates that show how the budget is linked to some, but not all, of the government's policy goals (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on how the budget is linked to government's policy goals.

**Answer:**

d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government's stated policy goals for a multi-year period is not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.govt.nz/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023  
Pages 27-28, under "Overview of NDP Initiatives"

**Comment:**

Pages 27-28, under "Overview of NDP Initiatives" of the FY 2023 EBP, show how the proposed budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to government's policy goals or NDP initiatives for the budget year, for BY-1 and for BY-2, but NOT FOR SUBSEQUENT BUDGET YEAR.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**49. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired for at least the budget year?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 49 asks about the availability of nonfinancial data on inputs for the budget year. (Nonfinancial data on outputs and outcomes are addressed in Question 50.)*

*The budget should disclose not only the amount of money that is being allocated on a program but also any information needed to analyze that expenditure. Nonfinancial data and performance targets associated with budget proposals are used to assess the success of a given policy. For example, even when allocated funds are spent according to plan, there remains the question of whether the policy delivered the results that it aimed to achieve.*

*Nonfinancial data can include information on:*

*Inputs - These are the resources assigned to achieve results. For example, in regards to education, nonfinancial data on inputs could include the number of books to be provided to each school or the materials to be used to build or refurbish a school.*

*Outputs - These are products and services delivered as a result of inputs. For example, the number of pupils taught every year; the number of children that received vaccines; or the number of beneficiaries of a social security program.*

*Outcomes - These are the intended impact or policy goals achieved. For example, an increase in literacy rates among children under 10, or a reduction in rates of maternal mortality.*

*In addition, governments that set performance targets must use nonfinancial data for outputs and outcomes to determine if these targets have been met.*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present, for at least the budget year, nonfinancial data on inputs for each individual program within all administrative units (ministries, departments, and agencies). It is also acceptable if nonfinancial data on inputs for each individual program is organized by functions. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present nonfinancial data on inputs for all administrative units or all functions, but not for each individual program (or even for any programs) within those administrative units or functions. A "c" response applies if nonfinancial data on inputs are presented only for some programs and/or some administrative units or some functions. Answer "d" applies if no nonfinancial data on inputs is presented.*

**Answer:**

d. No, nonfinancial data on inputs are not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023

**Comment:**

The EBP or its supporting document, does not provide non financial data.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Comments:** It is important to note here that PBB statements are provided by every Ministry.

**50. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present nonfinancial data on results (in terms of outputs or outcomes) for at least the budget year?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 50 asks about the availability of nonfinancial data on results for the budget year. Nonfinancial data on results can include data on both outputs and outcomes, but not on inputs (which are addressed in Question 49).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present, for at least the budget year, nonfinancial data on results for each individual program within all administrative units (ministries, departments, and agencies). It is also acceptable if nonfinancial data on results for each individual program is organized by functional classification. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present nonfinancial data on results for all administrative units or all functional classifications, but not for each individual program (or even for any programs) within those administrative units or functions. A "c" response applies if nonfinancial data on results are presented only for some programs and/or some administrative units or some functions. Answer "d" applies if no nonfinancial data on results is presented.

**Answer:**

c. Yes, nonfinancial data on results are presented for some programs and/or some administrative units (or functions).

**Source:**

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - As supporting budget documentation  
Under "Key Sectors" - pages 18 - 53 of the 2023 Budget Speech  
Eg. Article 157, page 40

**Comment:**

In the FY 2023 Budget Speech, performance targets are assigned to some nonfinancial data on results. For instance Article 157, page 40 under "GENDER, CHILDREN & SOCIAL WELFARE" states as quoted:

"The Ministry of Gender Children and Welfare launched the Women Enterprise Fund in October 2019 as part of the NDP flagship projects with the objective of strengthening capacities of 35,000 women and girls in micro, small and medium enterprises which is entirely funded by government of the Gambia. From December to date, the Women Enterprise Fund has trained 24,000 women and disbursed D21 million to 257 women's groups across the country."

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question

**Comments:** Program Based Statements are produced by Ministries.

**51. Are performance targets assigned to nonfinancial data on results in the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 51 asks about performance targets assigned to nonfinancial data on results for the budget year. The question applies to those nonfinancial results shown in the budget, and that were identified for purposes of Question 50.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must assign performance targets to all nonfinancial data on results shown in the budget for at least the budget year. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must assign performance targets to a majority (but not all) of the nonfinancial data on results shown in the budget. A "c" response applies performance targets are assigned only to less than half of the nonfinancial data on results. Answer "d" applies if no performance targets are assigned to nonfinancial data on results shown in the budget, or the budget does not present nonfinancial results.

**Answer:**

c. Yes, performance targets are assigned to some nonfinancial data on results.

**Source:**

2023 BUDGET SPEECH - As supporting budget documentation  
Under "Key Sectors" - pages 18 - 53 of the 2023 Budget Speech  
Eg. Article 157, page 40

**Comment:**

In the FY 2023 Budget Speech, performance targets are assigned to some nonfinancial data on results. For instance Article 157, page 40 under "GENDER, CHILDREN & SOCIAL WELFARE" states as quoted:

"The Ministry of Gender Children and Welfare launched the Women Enterprise Fund in October 2019 as part of the NDP flagship projects with the objective of strengthening capacities of 35,000 women and girls in micro, small and medium enterprises which is entirely funded by government of the Gambia. From December to date, the Women Enterprise Fund has trained 24,000 women and disbursed D21 million to 257 women's groups across the country."

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**52. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of policies (both new proposals and existing policies) that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations in at least the budget year?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 52 asks whether the budget highlight policies, both new and existing, that benefit the poorest segments of society. This question is intended to assess only those programs that directly address the immediate needs of the poor, such as through cash assistance programs or the provision of housing, rather than indirectly, such as through a stronger national defense. This information is of particular interest to those seeking to bolster government's commitment to anti-poverty efforts. For purposes of answering this question, a departmental budget (such as for the Department of Social Welfare) would not be considered acceptable. In general, this question is asking whether the EBP includes a special presentation that pulls together estimates of all the relevant policies in one place. However, if the country uses "program budgeting," where programs are presented as expenditure categories with specific and identified objectives, and it identifies anti-poverty programs within each administrative unit, then that is also acceptable for this question.*

*The IBP Budget Brief, "How Transparent are Governments When it Comes to Their Budget's Impact on Poverty and Inequality?"*

*(<https://www.internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/government-transparency-of-budgets-impact-on-poverty-inequality-ibp-2019.pdf>) includes a discussion of countries that have provided information on how its policies affect the poor.*

*For instance, Pakistan provides a detailed breakdown of pro-poor expenditure as part of its 2017-18 budget proposal. In one document, the government sets out policy priorities, expected outputs, and estimates of past and future spending for several programs aimed at poverty alleviation. Another supporting document provides a comprehensive overview of ongoing policies, including a chapter on social safety nets, covering both financial and performance information of poverty alleviation schemes over a period of eight years. ([http://www.finance.gov.pk/budget/mtbf\\_2018\\_21.pdf](http://www.finance.gov.pk/budget/mtbf_2018_21.pdf) and [http://www.finance.gov.pk/survey\\_1718.html](http://www.finance.gov.pk/survey_1718.html)).*

*To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must for at least the budget year both present estimates covering all policies that are intended to benefit the most impoverished populations and include a narrative discussion that specifically addresses these policies. (For countries using program budgeting that breaks out individual anti-poverty programs, there should be a separate narrative associated with each such program.) Answer "b" if a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all policies that are intended to benefit the most impoverished populations are presented. Answer "c" if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, policies that are intended to benefit the most impoverished populations (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" if no estimates of policies that are intended to benefit the most impoverished populations are presented.*

**Answer:**

d. No, estimates of policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are not presented.

**Source:**



<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023  
"Development Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" - pages 159 – 208-Remarkd "Poverty Program"

**Comment:**

The "Development Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure", pages 159 – 208 - Parts remarked "Poverty Program" - shows estimates of policies that are remarked "Poverty Program" but no narrative discussion or explanation as to whether it will directly benefit the most impoverished parts of the country is included.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**53. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the Ministry of Finance or whatever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 53 asks about the budget timetable. An internal timetable is particularly important for the executive's management of the budget preparation process, in order to ensure that the executive accounts for the views of the different departments and agencies in the proposed budget. The timetable would, for instance, set deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the Ministry of Finance or whatever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation. So that civil society is aware of the various steps in the budget formulation process, and when opportunities may exist to engage the executive, it is essential that this timetable be made available to the public.*

*To answer "a," the executive must prepare a detailed budget timetable and release it to the public. A "b" answer applies if the timetable is made public, but some details are not included. A "c" response applies if the timetable is made public, but many important details are excluded, reducing its value for those outside government. Answer "d" applies if no timetable is made available to the public. As long as a timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal is released, answer "a," "b," or "c" may be selected, even if the Executive's Budget Proposal is not made publicly available.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget#>  
Budget Calendar 2022

**Comment:**

The Ministry of Finance through the Budget Directorate did publish it.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question

**Comments:** I have found the document called Budget call circular Fiscal Year 2023, but not the document called Budget Calendar 2022.

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Comments:** A Budget Calendar is released each year

**54. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?**

(The core information must include a discussion of the economic outlook with estimates of nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest

rates.)

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 54 focuses on the macroeconomic forecast that underlies the Pre-Budget Statement, asking whether “core” information related to the economic assumptions is presented. These core components include a discussion of the economic outlook as well as estimates of the following:

- nominal GDP level;
- inflation rate;
- real GDP growth; and
- interest rates.

Beyond these core elements, some governments also provide additional information related to the economic outlook, including for instance: short- and long-term interest rates; the rate of employment and unemployment; GDP deflator; price of oil and other commodities; current account; exchange rate; and composition of GDP growth.

To answer “a,” the Pre-Budget Statement must present all of the core information related to the macroeconomic forecast as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer “b,” the Pre-Budget Statement must present all of the core components noted above. Answer “b” is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A “c” answer applies if some information related to the macroeconomic forecast is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer “d” applies if no information on the macroeconomic forecast is presented.

**Answer:**

d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

MTEFF 2023 - 2026: See the table on Page 7, under the "EXECUTIVE SUMMARY"

**Comment:**

The OBS methodology requires that for a Pre-Budget Statement (PBS) to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public one month before the Executive’s Budget Proposal is submitted to the legislature for consideration. The MTEFF 2023-2026 was released to the public too late. Thus, all questions of this section (questions 54-58) will score “d”.

Having said that:

The FY 2023 PBS (MTEFF 2023-2026) presents macroeconomic forecasts of nominal GDP level, real GDP growth rate and inflation rate.

Furthermore, it presents forecasts of interest payments (% GDP), interest payments (% Government Revenue).

For instance, for the year 2023, real GDP growth is projected to grow by 4.1%, inflation by 12.5%, interest payments (% GDP) by 2.1% and interest payments (% Government Revenue) by 17.2%.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**55. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the government’s expenditure policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?**

**(The core information must include a discussion of expenditure policies and priorities and an estimate of total expenditures.)**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 55 focuses on the government’s expenditure policies and priorities in the Pre-Budget Statement, asking whether “core” information related to these policies is presented. These core components include:

- a discussion of expenditure policies and priorities; and

- an estimate of total expenditures.

Although a Pre-Budget Statement is unlikely to include detailed programmatic proposals (such detailed information is typically only presented in the budget itself), it should include a discussion of broad policy priorities and a projection of at least total expenditures associated with these policies for the budget year. The Pre-Budget Statement can include some detail, for instance, estimates provided by any of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications.

To answer “a,” the Pre-Budget Statement must present for the upcoming budget year all of the core information related to the government’s expenditure policies and priorities as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer “b,” the Pre-Budget Statement must present all of the core components noted above for the upcoming budget year. Answer “b” is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A “c” answer applies if some information related to the government’s expenditure policies and priorities is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer “d” applies if no information on the government’s expenditure policies and priorities is presented.

**Answer:**

d. No, information related to the government’s expenditure policies and priorities is not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>  
 MTEFF 2023 - 2026  
 "Table 7: Medium Term Forecast" - Page 24  
 "ANNEX I:MEDIUM-TERM POLICY REFORMS" - Page 26

**Comment:**

The OBS methodology requires that for a Pre-Budget Statement (PBS) to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public one month before the Executive’s Budget Proposal is submitted to the legislature for consideration. The MTEFF 2023-2026 was released to the public too late.

However, the MTEFF 2023-2026 contains some core elements in it, for example:

The FY 2023 PBS (MTEFF 2023-2026) presents information on some government expenditure policies and priorities, not all. For example, government, for FYs 2023 - 2026, plans to carry out "the following key activities.....: popularization of the two development plans; establishment of a monitoring and evaluation framework; launch of the institutional framework for plan implementation; annual progress report and midterm evaluation of the medium-term plan; SDG surveys; and VNRs." (See "Planned Activities from 2023 to 2026", MTEFF 2023-2026)  
 It also planned to direct some of its resources towards modernizing "the social protection system" in FY 2023 (See "SOCIAL PROTECTION REFORM", MTEFF 2023-2026).  
 Moreover, an estimate of total expenditure shows D35.4 billion for FY 2023 in "Table 7: Medium Term Forecast" of MTEFF 2023 - 2026.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**56. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the government’s revenue policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?**

**(The core information must include a discussion of revenue policies and priorities and an estimate of total revenues.)**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 56 focuses on the government’s revenue policies and priorities in the Pre-Budget Statement, asking whether “core” information related to these policies is presented. These core components include:

- a discussion of revenue policies and priorities; and
- an estimate of total revenue.

Although a Pre-Budget Statement is unlikely to include detailed revenue proposals, it should include a discussion of broad policy priorities and a projection of at least the total revenue associated with these policies for the budget year. The Pre-Budget Statement can also include more detail, for instance, with estimates provided by revenue category – tax and non-tax – or some of the major individual sources of revenue, such as the Value Added Tax or the income tax.

To answer "a," the Pre-Budget Statement must present for the upcoming budget year all of the core information related to the government's revenue policies and priorities as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Pre-Budget Statement must present all of the core components noted above for the upcoming budget year. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to the government's revenue policies and priorities is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information on the government's revenue policies and priorities is presented.

**Answer:**

d. No, information related to the government's revenue policies and priorities is not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

MTEFF 2023 - 2026

"Table 7: Medium Term Forecast" - Page 24

"ANNEX I:MEDIUM-TERM POLICY REFORMS" - Page 26

"IMPROVING TAX ADMINISTRATION" - Page 26

**Comment:**

The OBS methodology requires that for a Pre-Budget Statement (PBS) to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is submitted to the legislature for consideration. The MTEFF 2023-2026 was released to the public too late.

However, the FY 2023 PBS (MTEFF 2023-2026) presents information on some government revenue policies and priorities, not all. For example, government, for FYs 2020 - 2024, intends to focus "attention towards tax base expansion; improvement of its corporate image; consolidating gains in human resource development and modernisation of HR tools; continue the digitalisation of business processes by leveraging on available modern ICT infrastructure; and further strengthening oversight mechanisms for effective delivery of the reform initiatives." (See "IMPROVING TAX ADMINISTRATION", MTEFF 2023-2026)

Also, an estimate of total revenue shows D31.4 billion for FY 2023 in "Table 7: Medium Term Forecast" of MTEFF 2023 - 2026.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

57. Does Pre-Budget Statement present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 57 asks whether the Pre-Budget Statement includes three key estimates related to borrowing and debt:

- the amount of net new borrowing needed in the upcoming budget year;
- the central government's total debt burden at the end of the upcoming budget year; and
- the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the upcoming budget year.

Debt is the accumulated amount of money that the government borrows. The government can borrow from its citizens, banks, and businesses within the country (domestic debt) or from creditors outside the country (external debt). External debt is typically owed to private commercial banks, other governments, or international financial institutions such as the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund.

*Net new borrowing is the additional amount of new borrowing that is required for the budget year to finance expenditures in the budget that exceed available revenues. Net new borrowing adds to the accumulated debt. It is distinct from gross borrowing, which also includes borrowing needed to repay existing debt that matured during the budget year; debt that is replaced (or rolled over) does not add to the total of accumulated debt. For the purposes of this question, the deficit may be accepted as a proxy for net new borrowing.*

*Interest payments on the debt (or debt service costs) are typically made at regular intervals, and these payments must be made on a timely basis in order to avoid defaulting on the debt obligation. Interest payments are separate from the repayment of principal, which occurs only when the loan has matured and must be paid back in full.*

*To answer "a," the Pre-Budget Statement must present all three estimates of borrowing and debt for at least the upcoming budget year. For a "b" answer, the Pre-Budget Statement must present two of those three estimates. For a "c" answer, the PBS must present one of the three estimates. Answer "d" applies if no information on borrowing and debt is presented in the PBS.*

**Answer:**

d. No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>  
MTEFF 2023 - 2026  
"Table 7: Medium Term Forecast" - Page 24

**Comment:**

The OBS methodology requires that for a Pre-Budget Statement (PBS) to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is submitted to the legislature for consideration. The MTEFF 2023-2026 was released to the public too late.

However, the FY 2023 PBS (MTEFF 2023-2026) presents projections on "the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the upcoming budget year" at D2.1 billion for domestic interest payments and D784 million for external interest payments during the 2023 fiscal year. Information on the other two estimates is not available (See "Table 7: Medium Term Forecast" - Page 24).

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question  
**Comments:** I have only found MTEF for 2022, not 2023-26

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**58. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present estimates of total expenditures for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 58 asks about multi-year expenditure estimates in the Pre-Budget Statement.*

*To answer "a," expenditure estimates for at least two years beyond the upcoming budget year must be presented. The estimates must be for at least total expenditures, but could include more detail than just the aggregate total.*

**Answer:**

b. No, multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>  
MTEFF 2023 - 2026  
"Table 7: Medium Term Forecast" - Page 24

**Comment:**

The OBS methodology requires that for a Pre-Budget Statement (PBS) to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public one

month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is submitted to the legislature for consideration. The MTEFF 2023-2026 was released to the public too late.

However, the FY 2023 PBS (MTEFF 2023-2026) shows multiple years of expenditure estimates. For instance, total expenditure is estimated at D35.4 billion in 2023, D39.7 billion in 2024, D42.3 billion in 2025 and D42.7 billion in 2026, respectively (See "Table 7: Medium Term Forecast" - Page 24).

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**59. Does the Enacted Budget present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 59 asks if expenditure estimates in the Enacted Budget are presented by any one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications – which were addressed in Questions 1-5 above. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. Unlike classification by administrative unit, which tends to be unique to each country, functional and economic classifications for government budgeting have been developed and standardized by international institutions. Cross-country comparisons are facilitated by adherence to these international classification standards.*

*To answer "a," the Enacted Budget must present expenditure estimates by all three of the expenditure classifications. To answer "b," expenditure estimates must be presented by two of the three classifications. A "c" answer applies if expenditure estimates are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if expenditure estimates are not presented by any of the three classifications.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
"2022 Approved Budget"  
Administrative Classification  
"Departmental Overviews" - Pages 18 - 21  
"Recurrent Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure PBB" - Pages 41 - 123  
"Development Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" - Pages 146 – 197  
Economic Classification  
"Expenditure Budget Overview by Item" -Pages 7-16  
"Recurrent and Development Budgets Economic Analysis 2022" - page 17  
Functional Classification  
"Function of the Government-Expenditure Overview- Loans, Grants and GLF" pages 22-24

**Comment:**

FY 2022 EB presents expenditures by all three expenditure classifications - administrative, economic and functional. For instance;  
- Pages 18 - 21, 41 -123 & 146-197 on the "2022 Approved Budget" show the classification of expenditures under Recurrent and Development Budgets into ministries, departments or agencies with expenditure estimates for the previous budget year shown next to the estimates for the current budget year and actuals for BY-2 - Administrative classification.  
-Pages 7-17 on "2022 Approved Budget" present the Economic classification of expenditure estimates for the previous budget year next to the estimates for the current budget year and the actuals for BY-2.  
-Pages 22-24 on "2022 Approved Budget" present the Functional classification of expenditure estimates for the previous budget year next to the estimates for the current budget year as well as the actuals for BY-2.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Agree

59b. Based on the response to Question 59, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications are included in the Enacted Budget:

**Answer:**

Administrative classification  
Economic classification  
Functional classification

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
"2022 Approved Budget"  
Administrative Classification  
"Departmental Overviews" - Pages 18 - 21  
"Recurrent Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure PBB" - Pages 41 - 123  
"Development Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" - Pages 146 - 197  
Economic Classification  
"Expenditure Budget Overview by Item" -Pages 7-16  
"Recurrent and Development Budgets Economic Analysis 2022" - page 17  
Functional Classification  
"Function of the Government-Expenditure Overview- Loans, Grants and GLF" pages 22-24

**Comment:**

FY 2022 EB presents expenditures by all three expenditure classifications - administrative, economic and functional. For instance;  
- Pages 18 - 21, 41 - 123 & 146-197 on the "2022 Approved Budget" show the classification of expenditures under Recurrent and Development Budgets into ministries, departments or agencies with expenditure estimates for the previous budget year shown next to the estimates for the current budget year and actuals for BY-2 - Administrative classification.  
-Pages 7-17 on "2022 Approved Budget" present the Economic classification of expenditure estimates for the previous budget year next to the estimates for the current budget year and the actuals for BY-2.  
-Pages 22-24 on "2022 Approved Budget" present the Functional classification of expenditure estimates for the previous budget year next to the estimates for the current budget year as well as the actuals for BY-2.

**Peer Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Agree

60. Does the Enacted Budget present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 60 asks if expenditure estimates in the Enacted Budget are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department.*

*A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as le plan comptable or le plan comptable detaille. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)*

*To answer "a," the Enacted Budget must present all programs, which account for all expenditures, in the budget year. To answer "b," the Enacted Budget must present expenditures for individual programs that when combined account for at least two-thirds of expenditures, but not all expenditures. A "c" answer*

applies if the Enacted Budget presents programs that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by program in the Enacted Budget.

**Answer:**

a. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

"2022 Approved Budget"

"Recurrent Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure PBB" - Pages 41 - 123

"Development Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" - Pages 146 - 197

**Comment:**

The FY 2022 EB shows expenditure estimates for all individual programs and accounting for all expenditures.

See for instance in the "2022 Approved Budget":

"Recurrent Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure PBB" - Pages 41 - 123

"Development Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" - Pages 146 - 197

For instance, FY 2022 EB shows that the "2114 Disease Control Program", page 105, under the Ministry of Health's Recurrent budget has an approved spending of D 57.5 million out of which "Epidemiology and Disease Control" expenditure is D 2.5 million and "Eye Health Services" expenditure is D 1.5 million etc.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

61. Does the Enacted Budget present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 61 asks whether revenue estimates in the Enacted Budget are presented by "category" – that is, whether tax and non-tax sources of revenue are shown separately.

To answer "a," the Enacted Budget must present revenue estimates classified by category.

**Answer:**

a. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents revenue estimates by category.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

"2022 Approved Budget"

"Overview of Revenue, Grants and Financing" - Pages 3 - 4

**Comment:**

Revenue estimates by category, tax and non-tax, are presented on pages 3 - 4 of the FY 2022 Enacted Budget.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree



**62. Does the Enacted Budget present individual sources of revenue?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 62 asks whether revenue estimates for individual sources of revenue are presented in the Enacted Budget. The question applies to both tax and non-tax revenue.

To answer "a," the Enacted Budget must present all individual sources of revenue, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all revenue. To answer "b," the Enacted Budget must present individual sources of revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all revenue, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue that account for less than two-thirds of revenues. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of revenue are not presented.

**Answer:**

a. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

"2022 Approved Budget"

"Overview of Revenue, Grants and Financing" - Pages 3 – 4

"Receipts of Revenues, Grants and Loans" - Pages 29 - 32

"Detailed Revenue Estimates by Collecting Agency" - Pages 33 - 36

**Comment:**

The EB presents the following individual sources of revenue for The Gambia government on pages 3 - 4, 29 - 32 and 33 - 36 of the FY 2022 EB:

-Tax Revenue (codes beginning with 11)

-Non-tax revenue (codes beginning with 14)

-Grants (codes beginning with 13)

-Loans (codes beginning with 33)

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**63. Does the Enacted Budget present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 63 asks about three key estimates related to borrowing and debt:

- the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year;
- the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year;
- the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year.

Debt is the accumulated amount of money that the government borrows. The government can borrow from its citizens, banks, and businesses within the country (domestic debt) or from creditors outside the country (external debt). External debt is typically owed to private commercial banks, other governments, or international financial institutions such as the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund.

Net new borrowing is the additional amount of new borrowing that is required for the budget year to finance expenditures in the budget that exceed available revenues. Net new borrowing adds to the accumulated debt. It is distinct from gross borrowing, which also includes borrowing needed to repay existing debt that matured during the budget year; debt that is replaced (or rolled over) does not add to the total of accumulated debt. For the purposes of this question, the deficit may be accepted as a proxy for net new borrowing.

*Interest payments on the debt (or debt service costs) are typically made at regular intervals, and these payments must be made on a timely basis in order to avoid defaulting on the debt obligation. Interest payments are separate from the repayment of principal, which occurs only when the loan has matured and must be paid back in full.*

*To answer "a," the Enacted Budget must present all three estimates of borrowing and debt. For a "b" answer, the Enacted Budget must present two of those three estimates. For a "c" answer, the Enacted Budget must present one of the three estimates. Answer "d" applies if no information on borrowing and debt is presented in the Enacted Budget.*

**Answer:**

b. Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

"2022 Approved Budget"

"Budget overview" - page 1

"Debt Service Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" pages 198 - 203

**Comment:**

The "Budget overview" section of the EB (eg. on page 1 of the FY 2022 EB) has a Financing component which shows "the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year", which is D -2.28 billion. Also, the "Debt Service Budget Detailed Estimates of Expenditure" section of the EB (eg. on pages 198 - 203 of the FY 2022 EB) shows "the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year", which is D 3.45 billion. Although information on the government's total debt burden is not available in the EB, just the total debt service for a single budget year is presented on pages 198 - 203, it (information on total debt - D 81.8 billion as at end June 2021) is available in the FY 2022 Budget Speech - Article 37, page 14.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**64. What information is provided in the Citizens Budget?**

**(The core information must include expenditure and revenue totals, the main policy initiatives in the budget, the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget is based, and contact information for follow-up by citizens.)**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 64 focuses on the content of the Citizens Budget, asking whether "core" information is presented. These core components include:*

- *expenditure and revenue totals;*
- *the main policy initiatives in the budget;*
- *the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget is based; and*
- *contact information for follow-up by citizens.*

*To answer "a," the Citizens Budget or supporting documentation must present all of the above core information as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Citizens Budget must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if the Citizens Budget includes some of the core components above, but other core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if a Citizens Budget is not published.*

**Answer:**

c. The Citizens Budget provides information, but it excludes some core elements.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

Citizens' Version of the 2023 Executive Budget Proposal

**Comment:**

Some information is provided - expenditure and revenue totals and some policy initiatives in the budget - in the 2023 Citizens Budget related to the EBP for 2023.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Disagree

**Suggested Answer:**

b. The Citizens Budget provides the core information.

**Researcher Response**

The FY 2023 CB corresponding to the FY 2023 EBP does not provide all the core information. It provides information on the central government's proposed totals of revenue and expenditure as well as its policy initiatives. But it does not provide information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget is based, or contact information for follow-up by citizens

**IBP Comment**

IBP appreciates the government reviewer's comment. However, no evidence was presented to support the suggested new answer. Considering the additional information provided by the researcher, the answer "c" is appropriate.

**65. How is the Citizens Budget disseminated to the public?**

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 65 asks how the Citizens Budget is disseminated to the public. Citizens Budgets should be made available to a variety of audiences. Therefore paper versions and an Internet posting of a document might not be sufficient.*

*To answer "a," the executive must use three or more different types of creative media tools to reach the largest possible share of the population, including those who otherwise would not normally have access to budget documents or information. Dissemination would also be pursued at the very local level, so that the coverage is targeted both by geographic area and population group (e.g., women, elderly, low income, urban, rural, etc.). Option "b" applies if significant dissemination efforts are made through a combination of two means of communications, for instance, both posting the Citizens Budget on the executive's official website and distributing printed copies of it. Option "c" applies if the Citizens Budget is disseminated through only posting on the executive's official website. Option "d" applies when the executive does not publish a Citizens Budget.*

**Answer:**

b. A Citizens Budget is published by using at least two, but less than three, means of dissemination, but no other dissemination efforts are undertaken by the executive.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

"Citizens' Version of the 2023 Executive Budget Proposal"

Twitter

<https://twitter.com/MofeaGambia/status/1597937196547584000>

Facebook

<https://www.facebook.com/photo/?fbid=454520430195219&set=pcb.454520473528548>

**Comment:**

The CB was disseminated in three official platforms of the Ministry; Twitter, Facebook and MOFEA's website.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Disagree

**Suggested Answer:**

a. A Citizens Budget is disseminated widely through a combination of at least three different appropriate tools and media (such as the Internet, billboards, radio programs, newspapers, etc.).

**Comments:** The CB was disseminated in through official platforms of the Ministry; Twitter, Facebook, MOFEA's website. Billboards were made too (these were posted on the banjul and around the kotou highway). There were also one-page posters which were circulated to all MDAs, radio programs were also conducted, and the public was given the chance to call in and raise their issues and concerns which were addressed on air by the Ministry representatives.

**Researcher Response**

During the assessment, the research team could not obtain enough proof, from MoFEA, to show that the ministry used more than three means of dissemination tools to disseminate the FY 2023 CB corresponding to the EBP nor was the research team able to ascertain such proof online.

**IBP Comment**

IBP appreciates the government reviewer's comment. The OBS questionnaire seeks to determine whether a country's government provides certain types of information to the public, and whether certain activities occur during the budget process. Answers to the questions must be based on empirical research, and researchers are required to provide evidence as to why they have selected a particular answer. The researcher double checked the new information provided by the government reviewer but couldn't find enough evidence to confirm that the ministry used at least three different appropriate tools and media to disseminate the Citizens Budget 2023. Therefore, the answer "b" is appropriate.

**66. Has the executive established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information prior to publishing the Citizens Budget?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 66 asks whether the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information before publishing a Citizens Budget. What the public wants to know about the budget might differ from the information the executive includes in technical documents that comprise the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget; similarly, different perspectives might exist on how the budget should be presented, and this may vary depending on the context. For this reason the executive should consult with the public on the content and presentation of the Citizens Budget.*

*To answer "a," the executive must have established mechanisms to consult with the public, and these mechanisms for consultation are both accessible and widely used by the public. Such mechanisms can include focus groups, social networks, surveys, hotlines, and meetings/events in universities or other locations where people gather to discuss public issues. In countries where Citizens Budgets are consistently produced and released, it may be sufficient for the government to provide the public with contact information and feedback opportunities, and subsequently use the feedback to improve its management of public resources.*

*Option "b" applies if the executive has established mechanisms for consultation that are accessible to the public, but that the public nonetheless does not use frequently. That is, the public does not typically engage with the executive on the content of the Citizens Budget, even though the executive has created opportunities for such consultation. Option "c" applies if the executive has established mechanism for consultation with the public, but they are poorly designed and thus not accessible to the public. Option "d" applies if the executive has not created any mechanisms to seek feedback from the public on the content of the Citizens Budget.*

**Answer:**

c. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget, but these mechanisms are not accessible.

**Source:**

<https://twitter.com/MofeaGambia/status/1597937196547584000>

**Comment:**

The Ministry of Finance collaborated with local civil society to decide on the content of the CB, however, this consultation was not accessible to the general public. On its Twitter the Ministry wrote "Citizens' Version of the 2023 Executive Budget Proposal. Designed in collaboration with #GambiaParticipates to enhance #Fiscaltransparency"

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Disagree

**Suggested Answer:**

b. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget; while these mechanisms are accessible they are not widely used by the public.

**Researcher Response**

The research team stands behind its initial comments but would be content if the government can explain explicitly the available mechanisms that are accessible to the public, and how, but are not widely used by the public.

**IBP Comment**

IBP appreciates the government reviewer's comment. However, no evidence was presented to support the suggested new answer. Considering the additional information provided by the researcher, the answer "c" is appropriate.

**67. Are "citizens" versions of budget documents published throughout the budget process?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 67 asks if "citizens" versions of budget documents are published throughout the budget process. While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle.*

*To answer "a," a citizens version of at least one budget document is published for each of the four stages of the budget process (budget formulation, enactment, execution, and audit) – for a total of at least four citizens budget documents throughout the process. Option "b" applies if a citizens version of a budget document is published for at least two of the four stages of the budget process. Option "c" applies if a citizens version of a budget document is published for at least one of the four stages of the budget process. Select option "d" if no "citizens" version of budget documents is published.*

**Answer:**

b. A citizens version of budget documents is published for at least two of the four stages of the budget process.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
2022 Citizens' Budget  
2022 Revised Citizens Budget  
2023 Citizens' Version of the 2023 Executive Budget Proposal

**Comment:**

In FY 2022, the Ministry of Finance published 3 citizen version of the 2023 budget; one for the 2022 EB, which was published lately, the second for the Revised 2022 Budget and lastly the CB for the 2023 EBP. All published on Mofea's website.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question

**Comments:** I cannot find the 2023 citizens' version of the 2023 executive budget proposal nor the 2022 revised citizens budget.

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**68. Do the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 68 asks if expenditure estimates in In-Year Reports are presented by any one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications – which were addressed in Questions 1-5 above.*

*Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. Unlike classification by administrative unit, which tends to be unique to each country, functional and economic classifications for government budgeting have been developed and standardized by international institutions. Cross-*

country comparisons are facilitated by adherence to these international classification standards.

To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present actual expenditures by all three of the expenditure classifications. To answer "b," actual expenditures must be presented by two of these three classifications. A "c" answer applies if actual expenditures are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if actual expenditures are not presented by any of the three classifications in In-Year Reports.

**Answer:**

b. Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by two of the three expenditure classifications.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

"SEPTEMBER 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT" - January - September (cumulative)

"Table 2: Absorption Rates by Economic Class for January-September, 2022"

"Statistical Annexes - Annex 1: Budget Absorption by BEs for January-September, 2022"

**Comment:**

FY 2022 In-Year Reports present actual expenditures from GLF by administrative (Budget Entities called BEs) and economic classifications but not by functional classification. While Table 2 in the "SEPTEMBER 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT" is an example of economic classification, Annex 1 is an example of administrative classification.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:**

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

68b. Based on the response to Question 68, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications are included in the In-Year Reports:

**Answer:**

Administrative classification

Economic classification

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

"SEPTEMBER 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT" - January - September (cumulative)

"Table 2: Absorption Rates by Economic Class for January-September, 2022"-page 4

"Statistical Annexes - Annex 1: Budget Absorption by BEs for January-September, 2022" -page 8

**Comment:**

FY 2022 In-Year Reports present actual expenditures from GLF by administrative (Budget Entities called BEs) and economic classifications but not by functional classification. While Table 2 in the "SEPTEMBER 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT" is an example of economic classification, Annex 1 is an example of administrative classification.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**69. Do the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for individual programs?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 69 asks if expenditure estimates in In-Year Reports are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department.

**A note for francophone countries:** "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as *le plan comptable* or *le plan comptable detaillé*. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present actual expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures. To answer "b," In-Year Reports must present actual expenditures for individual programs that when combined account for at least two-thirds of expenditures, but not all expenditures. A "c" answer applies if In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for programs that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if actual expenditures are not presented by program in In-Year Reports.

**Answer:**

d. No, the In-Year Reports do not present actual expenditures by program.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
Eg. "SEPTEMBER 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT" - January - September (cumulative)

**Comment:**

The IYRs produced by the government do not present actual expenditures by program.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**70. Do the In-Year Reports compare actual year-to-date expenditures with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 70 asks whether In-Year Reports compare actual expenditures to-date with either the enacted levels or actual expenditures for the same period in the previous year.

The OECD recommends that the reports contain the total year-to-date expenditures in a format that allows for a comparison with the budget's forecast expenditures (based on enacted levels) for the same period.

To answer "a," comparisons must be made for expenditures presented in the In-Year Reports

**Answer:**

a. Yes, comparisons are made for expenditures presented in the In-Year Reports.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
"SEPTEMBER 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT" - January - September (cumulative)

**Comment:**

In-Year Reports compare actual year-to-date expenditures from GLF with both the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) - eg. Table 2, Table 3a, Table 4, Annex 1, etc. - as well as with the same period in the previous year - eg. Table 1, Table 3 Annex 2, etc.

For instance, from January to September 2022, a total amount of D 4.11 billion was spent on Personnel Emoluments. (execution rate: 79% of the FY

2022 Approved Budget and 71% of FY 2022 Revised Budget).

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**71. Do In-Year Reports present actual revenue by category (such as tax and non-tax)?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Questions 71 asks whether In-Year Reports present actual revenues by "category"— that is, whether tax and non-tax sources of revenue are shown separately.*

*To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present revenue estimates classified by category.*

**Answer:**

b. No, In-Year Reports do not present actual revenue by category.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

"SEPTEMBER 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT" - January - September (cumulative)

**Comment:**

The In-Year Reports produced and published by the MoFEA do not present actual revenue by category. In fact, they do not contain information regarding revenue collected in the period being reported.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**72. Do In-Year Reports present the individual sources of revenue for actual revenues collected?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 72 asks whether In-Year Reports present actual collections of individual sources of revenue (such as income taxes, VAT, etc.). The question applies to both tax and non-tax revenue.*

*To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present actual collections for all individual sources of revenue, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all revenue. To answer "b," In-Year Reports must present actual collections for individual sources of revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all revenue collected, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue that account for less than two-thirds of all revenue collected. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of actual revenue are not presented.*

**Answer:**

d. No, In-Year Reports do not present individual sources of actual revenue.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

"SEPTEMBER 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT" - January - September (cumulative)



**Comment:**

The In-Year Reports produced and published by the MoFEA do not present individual sources of actual revenue. In fact, they do not contain information regarding revenue collected in the period being reported.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**73. Do the In-Year Reports compare actual year-to-date revenues with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 73 asks whether In-Year Reports compare actual revenues to-date with either the enacted levels or actual revenues for the same period in the previous year.*

*The OECD recommends that the reports contain the total year-to-date revenues in a format that allows for a comparison with the budget's forecast revenues (based on enacted levels) for the same period.*

*To answer "a," comparisons must be made for revenues presented in the In-Year Reports.*

**Answer:**

b. No, comparisons are not made for revenues presented in the In-Year Reports.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
"SEPTEMBER 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT" - January - September (cumulative)

**Comment:**

The In-Year Reports do not contain information regarding revenue collected in the period being reported.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**74. Do In-Year Reports present three estimates related to actual government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing; the total debt outstanding; and interest payments?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 74 asks about three key estimates related to borrowing and debt:*

- *the amount of net new borrowing so far during the year;*
- *the central government's total debt burden at that point in the year; and*
- *the interest payments to-date on the outstanding debt.*

*Debt is the accumulated amount of money that the government borrows. The government can borrow from its citizens and banks and businesses within the country (domestic debt) or from creditors outside the country (external debt). External debt is typically owed to private commercial banks, other governments, or international financial institutions such as the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund.*

*Net new borrowing is the additional amount of new borrowing that is required for the budget year to finance expenditures in the budget that exceed available revenues. Net new borrowing adds to the accumulated debt. It is distinct from gross borrowing, which also includes borrowing needed to repay existing debt that matured during the budget year; debt that is replaced (or rolled over) does not add to the total of accumulated debt. For the purposes of this question, the deficit may be accepted as a proxy for net new borrowing.*

*Interest payments on the debt (or debt service costs) are typically made at regular intervals, and these payments must be made on a timely basis in order to avoid defaulting on the debt obligation. Interest payments are separate from the repayment of principal, which occurs only when the loan has matured and must be paid back in full.*

*To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present all three estimates of borrowing and debt. For a "b" answer, In-Year Reports must present two of those three estimates. For a "c" answer, IYRs must present one of the three estimates. Answer "d" applies if no information on borrowing and debt is presented in In-Year Reports.*

**Answer:**

c. Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
"SEPTEMBER 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT" - January - September (cumulative)  
"BE50 - National Debt Service" - Table 1 on page 3, Table 2 on page 4, Annex 1 on page 8

**Comment:**

The FY 2022 IYRs do not present information related to "the amount of net new borrowing" or "the total debt outstanding"; such information is provided by the Directorate of Loans and Debt Management, at the MoFEA, in its quarterly debt bulletin. IYRs, however, present information on interest payments and amortization for the budget year and the period being reported (as National Debt Service).

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**75. Do In-Year Reports present information related to the composition of the total actual debt outstanding?**

**(The core information must include interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 75 focuses on the composition of government debt, asking whether "core" information related to its composition is presented. These core components include:*

- *interest rates on the debt;*
- *maturity profile of the debt; and*
- *whether the debt is domestic or external.*

*The interest rates affect the amount of interest that must be paid to creditors. The maturity profile indicates the final payment date of the loan, at which point the principal (and all remaining interest) is due to be paid; government borrowing typically includes a mix of short-term and long-term debt. As discussed in Question 74, domestic debt is held by a country's citizens and banks and businesses, while external debt is held by foreigners. These factors related to the composition of the debt give an indication of the potential vulnerability of the country's debt position, and ultimately whether the cost of servicing the accumulated debt is affordable.*

*Beyond these core elements, a government may also provide additional information related to the composition of its debt, including for instance: whether interest rates are fixed or variable; whether debt is callable; the currency of the debt; a profile of the creditors (bilateral institutions, multilateral institutions, commercial banks, Central Bank, etc.); an analysis of the risk associated with the debt; and where appropriate, what the debt is being used to finance.*

*To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present all of the core information related to the composition of government debt to-date as well as some additional*

information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," In-Year Reports must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to the composition of government debt is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on the composition of the debt outstanding in In-Year Reports.

**Answer:**

d. No, information related to composition of total actual debt outstanding is not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
"SEPTEMBER 2022 EXPENDITURE REPORT" - January - September (cumulative)

**Comment:**

The FY 2022 IYRs do not present "information related to composition of total actual debt outstanding".

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**76. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include an updated macroeconomic forecast for the budget year underway?**

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 76 asks whether the Mid-Year Review includes an updated macroeconomic forecast for the budget year underway, and provides an explanation of the update.*

*Refer to Question 15 for the components of the macroeconomic forecast presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal.*

*To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must include an updated macroeconomic forecast and explain all of the differences between the initial forecast presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal and the updated forecast. The explanation must include at least estimates of all differences; a narrative discussion is desirable but not required if estimates of all the differences are provided. To answer "b," the macroeconomic forecast must be updated, but only some of the differences between the initial and updated forecasts are explained. The explanation would be more limited, such as only a narrative discussion of the differences or estimates covering only some of the differences. A "c" response applies if the Mid-Year Review includes an updated macroeconomic forecast, but does not provide an explanation for the revisions. A "d" response applies if the macroeconomic forecast has not been updated.*

**Answer:**

d. No, the estimates for macroeconomic forecast have not been updated.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>  
<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs (MoFEA) does not produce or publish Mid-Year Reviews.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**77. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 77 asks whether the Mid-Year Review includes updated estimates of expenditure for the budget year underway, and provides an explanation of the update. Please note that year-to-date expenditures as assessed in Question 70 do not qualify as updated estimates of expenditure for the purposes of this indicator.*

*To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must include updated expenditure estimates and explain all of the differences between the initial levels presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal (or the Enacted Budget) and the updated estimates. The explanation must include at least estimates of all differences; a narrative discussion is desirable but not required if estimates of all the differences are provided. The expenditure estimates must be updated, but only some of the differences between the initial and updated estimates are explained. The explanation would be more limited, such as only a narrative discussion of the differences or estimates covering only some of the differences. A "c" response applies if the Mid-Year Review includes updated expenditure estimates, but does not provide an explanation for the revisions. A "d" response applies if the expenditure estimates have not been updated.*

**Answer:**

d. No, expenditure estimates have not been updated.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Mid-Year Reviews.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**78. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 78 asks if expenditure estimates for the budget year underway in the Mid-Year Review are presented by any one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications – which were addressed in Questions 1-5 above. Please note that year-to-date expenditures as assessed in Question 70 do not qualify as updated estimates of expenditure for the purposes of this indicator.*

*Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. Unlike classification by administrative unit, which tends to be unique to each country, functional and economic classifications for government budgeting have been developed and standardized by international institutions. Cross-country comparisons are facilitated by adherence to these international classification standards.*

*To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must present expenditure estimates by all three of the expenditure classifications. To answer "b," expenditure estimates must be presented by two of these three classifications. A "c" answer applies if expenditure estimates are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if expenditure estimates are not presented by any of the three classifications in the Mid-Year Review.*

**Answer:**

d. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>  
<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Mid-Year Reviews.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**78b. Based on the response to Question 78, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications are included in the Mid-Year Review:**

**Answer:**

None of the above

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>  
<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Mid-Year Reviews.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**79. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway for individual programs?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 79 asks if expenditure estimates in the Mid-Year Review are presented by program for the budget year underway. Please note that year-to-date expenditures as assessed in Question 70 do not qualify as updated estimates of expenditure for the purposes of this indicator.*

**A note for francophone countries:** "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as *le plan comptable* or *le plan comptable detaillé*. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

*To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must present expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures. To answer "b," the Mid-Year Review must present expenditures for individual programs that when combined account for at least two-thirds of expenditures, but not all expenditures. A "c" answer applies if the Mid-Year Review presents programs that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by program in the Mid-Year Review.*

**Answer:**

d. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present expenditure estimates by program.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Mid-Year Reviews.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**80. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?**

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 80 asks whether the Mid-Year Review includes updated estimates of revenue for the budget year underway, and provides an explanation of the update. Please note that year-to-date revenues as assessed in Question 73 do not qualify as updated estimates of revenue for the purposes of this indicator.*

*To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must include updated revenue estimates and explain all of the differences between the initial levels presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal (or the Enacted Budget) and the updated estimates. The explanation must include at least estimates of all differences; a narrative discussion is desirable but not required if estimates of all the differences are provided. To answer "b," the revenue estimates must be updated, but only some of the differences between the initial and updated estimates are explained. The explanation would be more limited, such as only a narrative discussion of the differences or estimates covering only some of the differences. A "c" response applies if the Mid-Year Review includes updated revenue estimates, but no explanation for the revisions is provided. A "d" response applies if the revenue estimates have not been updated.*

**Answer:**

d. No, revenue estimates have not been updated.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Mid-Year Reviews.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**81. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway by category (such as tax and non-tax)?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 81 asks whether revenue estimates for the budget year underway in the Mid-Year Review are presented by “category”— that is, whether tax and non-tax sources of revenue are shown separately. Please note that year-to-date revenues as assessed in Question 73 do not qualify as updated estimates of revenue for the purposes of this indicator.

To answer “a,” the Mid-Year Review must present revenue estimates classified by category.

**Answer:**

b. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present revenue estimates by category.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Mid-Year Reviews.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**82. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present updated individual sources of revenue for the budget year underway?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 82 asks whether revenue estimates for individual sources of revenue for the budget year underway are presented in the Mid-Year Review. Please note that year-to-date revenues as assessed in Question 73 do not qualify as updated estimates of revenue for the purposes of this indicator.

To answer “a,” the Mid-Year Review must present all sources of revenue individually, accounting for all revenues, and “other” or “miscellaneous” revenue must account for three percent or less of all revenue. To answer “b,” the Mid-Year Review must present individual sources of revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all revenue, but not all revenue. A “c” answer applies if the Mid-Year Review presents estimates of individual revenue sources that account for less than two-thirds of revenue. Answer “d” applies if individual sources of revenue are not presented in the Mid-Year Review.

**Answer:**

d. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present individual sources of revenue.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Mid-Year Reviews.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**83. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the budget year underway?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 83 asks whether the Mid-Year Review includes updated estimates of borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the budget year underway, and provides an explanation of the update.*

*Refer to Question 13 for details on estimates in the Executive's Budget Proposal of borrowing and debt. Key estimates related to borrowing and debt include:*

- *The amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year;*
- *The central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year; and*
- *The interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year.*

*Refer to Question 14 for details on estimates in the Executive's Budget Proposal related to the composition of the debt. Core information related to the composition of government debt include:*

- *interest rates on the debt;*
- *maturity profile of the debt; and*
- *whether the debt is domestic or external.*

*To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must include an updated estimates of borrowing and debt, including its composition, and explain all of the differences between the initial estimates presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal (or Enacted Budget) and the updated estimates. The explanation must include at least estimates of all differences; a narrative discussion is desirable but not required if estimates of all the differences are provided. To answer "b," the estimates of borrowing and debt must be updated, but only some of the differences between the initial and updated estimates are explained. The explanation would be more limited, such as only a narrative discussion of the differences or estimates covering only some of the differences. A "c" response applies if the Mid-Year Review includes updated estimates, but no explanation for the revisions is provided. A "d" response applies if the estimates of borrowing and debt have not been updated.*

**Answer:**

d. No, estimates of government borrowing and debt have not been updated.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Mid-Year Reviews.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**84. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 84 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and actual expenditures for the year, and*



whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all expenditures, along with a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if estimates of the differences for all expenditures are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences are presented for some, but not all expenditures, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. Answer "d" if no estimates of the differences are presented in the Year-End Report

**Answer:**

d. No, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures are not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Year-End Reports.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**85. Does the Year-End Report present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 85 asks if expenditure estimates in the Year-End Report are presented by any one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications – which were addressed in Questions 1-5 above. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. Unlike classification by administrative unit, which tends to be unique to each country, functional and economic classifications for government budgeting have been developed and standardized by international institutions. Cross-country comparisons are facilitated by adherence to these international classification standards.*

*To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present expenditure estimates by all three of the expenditure classifications. Answer "b" if expenditure estimates are presented by two of these three classifications. Answer "c" if expenditure estimates are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" if expenditure estimates are not presented by any of the three classifications in the Year-End Report.*

**Answer:**

d. No, the Year-End Report does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Year-End Reports.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

85b. Based on the response to Question 85, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications are included in the Year-End Report:

**Answer:**

None of the above

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Year-End Reports.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

86. Does the Year-End Report present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 86 asks if expenditure estimates in the Year-End Report are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department.

**A note for francophone countries:** "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as *le plan comptable* or *le plan comptable detaillé*. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present expenditure estimates for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents expenditures for individual programs that when combined account for at least two-thirds of expenditures, but not all expenditures. Answer "c" if the Year-End Report presents programs that account for only less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" if expenditures are not presented by program in the Year-End Report.

**Answer:**

d. No, the Year-End Report does not present expenditure estimates by program.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Year-End Reports.

Peer Reviewer

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**87. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 87 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and actual revenues for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.*

*To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all revenues, along with a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if estimates of the differences for all revenues are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences are presented for some, but not all revenues, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. Answer "d" if no estimates of the differences are presented in the Year-End Report.*

**Answer:**

d. No, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for revenues are not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Year-End Reports.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**88. Does the Year-End Report present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 88 asks whether revenue estimates in the Year-End Report are presented by "category"—that is, whether tax and non-tax sources of revenue are shown separately.*

*To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present revenue estimates classified by category.*

**Answer:**

b. No, the Year-End Report does not present revenue estimates by category.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Year-End Reports.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**89. Does the Year-End Report present individual sources of revenue?**

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 89 asks whether revenue estimates for individual sources of revenue are presented in the Year-End Report. The question applies to both tax and non-tax revenue.*

*To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present all sources of revenue individually, accounting for all revenue, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all revenue. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all revenue, but not all revenue. Answer "c" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of individual revenue sources that account for less than two-thirds of revenue. Answer "d" if individual sources of revenue are not presented in the Year-End Report.*

**Answer:**

d. No, the Year-End Report does not present individual sources of revenue.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Year-End Reports.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**90. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?**

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 90 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the original estimates and the actual outcome for the fiscal year for borrowing and debt, including its composition, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.*

*Refer to Question 13 for details on estimates in the Executive's Budget Proposal of borrowing and debt. Key estimates related to borrowing and debt include:*

- *the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year;*
- *the central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year; and*
- *the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year.*

*Refer to Question 14 for details on estimates in the Executive's Budget Proposal related to the composition of the debt. Core information related to the composition of government debt include:*

- *interest rates on the debt;*
- *maturity profile of the debt; and*
- *whether the debt is domestic or external.*

*To answer "a," the Year-End Report must include estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented.*

**Answer:**

d. No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year is not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Year-End Reports.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

90b. Based on the response to Question 90, check the box(es) to identify which estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, have the differences between the original forecast and the actual outcome for the year presented in the Year-End Report:

**Answer:**

None of the above

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Year-End Reports.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**91. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 91 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.*

*Refer to Question 15 for the components of the macroeconomic forecast in the Executive's Budget Proposal. Core components include estimates of the nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates, although the importance of other macroeconomic assumptions, such as the price of oil, can vary from country to country.*

*To answer "a," the Year-End Report must include estimates of the differences between all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented.*

**Answer:**

d. No, estimates of the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year is not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>  
<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Year-End Reports.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**91b. Based on the response to Question 91, check the box(es) to identify which elements of the macroeconomic forecast have the differences between the original forecast and the outcome for the year presented in the Year-End Report:**

**Answer:**

None of the above

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>  
<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Year-End Reports.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**92. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 92 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.

Refer to Question 49 for the nonfinancial data on inputs included in the Executive's Budget Proposal.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must include estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented.

**Answer:**

d. No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Year-End Reports.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**93. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 93 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion. Nonfinancial data on results can include data on both outputs and outcomes, but not on inputs (which are addressed in Question 92).

Refer to Question 50 for the nonfinancial data on results included in the Executive's Budget Proposal.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must include estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented.

**Answer:**

d. No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>  
<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Year-End Reports.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**94. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted level of funds for policies (both new proposals and existing policies) that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?**

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 94 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the enacted level of funds for policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.*

*Refer to Question 52 for assistance to the most impoverished populations in the Executive's Budget Proposal.*

*To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present estimates of the differences between the enacted level for all policies that are intended to benefit the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between the enacted level for all policies that are intended to benefit the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between the enacted level for some but not all of the policies that are intended to benefit the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented.*

**Answer:**

d. No, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>  
<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Year-End Reports.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**95. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome?**

*GUIDELINES:*



Question 95 asks whether the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.

Refer to Question 33 for estimates of extra-budgetary funds in the Executive's Budget Proposal.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must include estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented

**Answer:**

d. No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome is not presented.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/economic-policy-and-research>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA does not produce or publish Year-End Reports.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**96. Is a financial statement included as part of the Year-End Report or released as a separate report?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 96 asks whether a financial statement is included as part of the Year-End Report, or whether it is released as a separate report. The financial statement can include some or all of the following elements: a cash flow statement, an operating statement, a balance sheet, and notes on accounting. For purposes of responding to this question, the financial statement in question does not need to be audited. For an example of a financial statement, see the document "Financial Statements of the Government of New Zealand 2013" (<https://treasury.govt.nz/sites/default/files/2013-10/fsgnz-year-jun13.pdf>)

To answer "a," a financial statement must either be included in the Year-End Report or must be released as a separate report. Answer "a" applies if a financial statement is released as a separate report, even if the Year-End Report is not publicly available. Answer "b" applies if no financial statement is released either as part of the Year-End Report or as a separate report.

**Answer:**

a. Yes, a financial statement is part of the Year-End Report or is released as a separate report.

**Source:**

Financial Statement 2022

<https://www.cbg.gm/financial-statements>

**Comment:**

The Central Bank of The Gambia publishes the central government's financial statements and they are published as separate reports. YERs are not produced or published.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**97. What type of audits (compliance, financial, or performance) has the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) conducted and made available to the public?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 97 asks about the types of audits conducted by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI). There are three basic types of audits:

- Financial audits are intended to determine if an entity's financial information is accurate (free from errors or fraud) and presented in accordance with the applicable financial reporting and regulatory framework. See ISSAI 200 (<https://www.issai.org/pronouncements/issai-100-fundamental-principles-of-public-sector-auditing/>) for more detail.
- Compliance audits look at the extent to which the relevant regulations and procedures have been followed. See ISSAI 400 (<https://www.issai.org/pronouncements/issai-400-compliance-audit-principles/>) for more details.
- Performance audits assess whether activities are adhering to the principles of economy, efficiency, and effectiveness. See ISSAI 300 (<https://www.issai.org/pronouncements/issai-300-performance-audit-principles/>) for more details.

Financial and compliance audits are more common than performance audits, which usually occur only once a performance framework has been agreed upon. In some countries, the SAI's mandate limits the type of audit it can conduct.

To answer "a," the SAI must have conducted all three types of audit – financial, compliance, and performance – and made all of them available to the public. A "b" response applies if the SAI has conducted two of the three audit types, and a "c" applies if it has conducted only one type of audit. Answers "b" and "c" may be selected even if the Audit Report is not publicly available, as long as the SAI has conducted compliance or performance audits and made them available to the public. A "d" response applies if the SAI has not conducted any of the three types of audits, or has not made them available to the public.

**Answer:**

a. The SAI has conducted all three types of audits (compliance, financial, or performance) and made them available to the public.

**Source:**

Audit Reports

<https://nao.gm/audit-reports/>

<https://nao.gm/financial-audit-reports/gotg-reports/>

<https://nao.gm/performance-audit-reports/>

<https://nao.gm/compliance-and-other-audit-reports/>

**Comment:**

The National Audit Office (NAO) has conducted all three types of audit – financial, compliance, and performance – and made them available to the public. Proof of such can be ascertained from the following web addresses:

Financial Audits: <https://nao.gm/financial-audit-reports/gotg-reports/>

Performance Audits: <https://nao.gm/performance-audit-reports/>

Compliance Audits: <https://nao.gm/compliance-and-other-audit-reports/>

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response.

Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: none

**98. What percentage of expenditures within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 98 focuses on the coverage of audits by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI), asking what percentage of expenditures within the SAI's mandate has been audited.

The SAI's mandate is typically defined in statute. Only expenditures related to budgetary central government (ministries, departments, and agencies) that are within the SAI's mandate should be considered for this question. (Question 99 addresses audits of extra-budgetary funds.) Further, the question does not apply to "secret programs" (for example, security-related expenditures that are confidential). Further, if the mandate gives the SAI the authority to outsource some audits, then those audits count for purposes of this question.

Only the Audit Report identified in Section 1 should be used to answer this question. Financial audits and compliance audits, or a hybrid of the two, can be taken into account to answer this question. Performance audits should not be considered for this question.

To answer "a," all expenditures within the SAI's mandate must be audited. A "b" response applies if at least two-thirds, but not all, expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited. A "c" response is appropriate when less than two-thirds of expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited. A "d" response applies when no expenditures have been audited.

**Answer:**

d. No expenditures have been audited.

**Source:**

Audit Reports  
<https://nao.gm/audit-reports/>

**Comment:**

The Audit Reports (AR) under evaluation in this 2023 OBS are for FY 2020 and they have not been made available to the public yet.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Disagree

**Suggested Answer:** e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Comments:** expenditures are audited. There is a covid funds audit report etc

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response, and the final IBP decision after the additional input. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: disagree (suggested answer "b") Comment: From our audit exercise for GoTG AR 2020, more than two-third of total expenditure was audited. This is linked to the information shared on the Institutional Capacity Building Framework (ICBF) self-assessment results submitted to AFROSAI-E. We can say that we have audited at least two-thirds of the expenditure because by auditing GoTG FS 2020 and providing opinion, you are auditing the entire budget of GoTG. IBP decision: The Open Budget Questionnaire is intended to evaluate information on the central government's budget that is available to the public. Moreover, if a document is not available to the public (not produced or published late), then all the questions regarding that document should be marked "d." For example, if the Audit Report is not made available to the public within 18 months after the end of the fiscal year to which it corresponds, then all of questions 98-102 should be marked "d." This is the case here.

**99. What percentage of extra-budgetary funds within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 99 focuses on audits of extra-budgetary funds, asking what percentage of extra-budgetary funds within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution

(SAI) has been audited. These funds, although technically outside the budget, are governmental in nature and thus should be subject to the same audit requirement as other government programs.

The SAI's mandate is typically defined in statute. Only expenditures related to extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate should be considered for this question. (Question 98 addresses audits of budgetary central government.) Further, if the mandate gives the SAI the authority to outsource some audits, then those audits count for purposes of this question.

To answer "a," all extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate must be audited. A "b" response applies if extra-budgetary funds accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited. A "c" response applies if extra-budgetary funds accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited. A "d" response applies if extra-budgetary funds have not been audited.

**Answer:**

d. No extra-budgetary funds have been audited.

**Source:**

Audit Reports  
<https://nao.gm/audit-reports/>

**Comment:**

The Audit Reports (AR) under evaluation in this 2023 OBS are for FY 2020 and they have not been made available to the public yet.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Disagree

**Suggested Answer:**

**Comments:** Most extra budgetary funds are audited such as covid funds etc

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: none IBP decision: The Open Budget Questionnaire is intended to evaluate information on the central government's budget that is available to the public. Moreover, if a document is not available to the public (not produced or published late), then all the questions regarding that document should be marked "d." For example, if the Audit Report is not made available to the public within 18 months after the end of the fiscal year to which it corresponds, then all of questions 98-102 should be marked "d." This is the case here.

**100. Does the annual Audit Report(s) prepared by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) include an executive summary?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 100 asks whether the annual Audit Report includes an executive summary. Only the Audit Report identified in Section 1 should be used to answer this question. The Audit Report can be a fairly technical document, and an executive summary of the report's findings can help make it more accessible to the media and the public.

To answer "a," the Audit Report must include at least one executive summary summarizing the report's content. Answer "b" applies if the Audit Report does not include an executive summary, or the Audit Report is not made publicly available.

**Answer:**

b. No, the annual Audit Report(s) does not include an executive summary.

**Source:**

Audit Reports  
<https://nao.gm/audit-reports/>

**Comment:**

The Audit Reports (AR) under evaluation in this 2023 OBS are for FY 2020 and they have not been made available to the public yet.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response, and the final IBP decision after the additional input. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: disagree (suggested answer "a") Comment: The AR 2020 has an Executive Summary and public will access it once it is published IBP decision: The Open Budget Questionnaire is intended to evaluate information on the central government's budget that is available to the public. Moreover, if a document is not available to the public (not produced or published late), then all the questions regarding that document should be marked "d." For example, if the Audit Report is not made available to the public within 18 months after the end of the fiscal year to which it corresponds, then all of questions 98-102 should be marked "d or b" This is the case here.

**101. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 101 asks whether the executive reports to the public on the steps it has taken to address audit recommendations made by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI). The ultimate purpose of audits is to verify that the budget was executed in a manner consistent with existing law, and to hold the government accountable for this execution and its future improvement. The extent to which audits achieve the latter depends on whether there is adequate and timely follow-up on the recommendations provided in the SAI's audit reports.*

*To answer "a," the executive must report publicly on the steps it has taken to address all audit findings. A "b" response applies if the executive reports publicly on the steps it has taken to address most, but not all, audit findings. A "c" response applies if the executive reports publicly on the steps it has taken to address only some audit findings. As long as the executive reports publicly on the steps it has taken to address audit finding, answer "a," "b," or "c" may be selected, even if the Audit Report is not made publicly available. A "d" response applies if the executive does not report at all on its steps to address audit findings.*

**Answer:**

d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.

**Source:**

Audit Reports  
<https://nao.gm/audit-reports/>

**Comment:**

The Audit Reports (AR) under evaluation in this 2023 OBS are for FY 2020 and they have not been made available to the public yet; hence, the executive has not reported on steps it has taken to address audit findings.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought

input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: none

**102. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) or legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 102 asks whether the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) or the legislature track actions by the executive to address audit recommendations. After audit results and recommendations are discussed and validated by the legislature, the executive is normally asked to take certain actions to address the audit findings. For accountability purposes, the public needs to be informed about the status of those actions, and steps the executive has taken to address audit recommendations. In addition to the executive reporting on its actions (see Question 101), the SAI and legislature – as the key oversight institutions – have a responsibility to keep the public informed by tracking the executive's progress in addressing audit recommendations.*

*To answer "a," the SAI or legislature must report publicly on what steps the executive has taken to address all audit findings. A "b" response applies if the SAI or legislature reports publicly on what steps the executive has taken to address most, but not all, audit findings. A "c" response applies if the SAI or legislature reports publicly on what steps the executive has taken to address only some audit findings. As long as the SAI or legislature reports publicly on the steps the executive has taken, answer "a," "b," or "c" may be selected, even if the Audit Report is not made publicly available. A "d" response applies if neither the SAI nor the legislature reports on the executive's steps to address audit findings.*

**Answer:**

d. No, neither the SAI nor legislature reports on steps the executive has taken to address audit recommendations.

**Source:**

Audit Reports  
<https://nao.gm/audit-reports/>

**Comment:**

The Audit Reports (AR) under evaluation in this 2023 OBS are for FY 2020 and they have not been made available to the public yet. So neither the SAI nor legislature has reported on steps the executive has taken to address audit recommendations.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: none

**103. Is there an Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) that conducts budget analyses for the budget formulation and/or approval process?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 103 examines whether an Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) exists that contributes budget analyses to the budget formulation and/or approval process. According to the Principles for Independent Fiscal Institutions, adopted by the OECD Council in 2014, "independent fiscal institutions are publicly funded, independent bodies under the statutory authority of the executive or the legislature which provide non-partisan oversight and analysis of, and in some cases advice on, fiscal policy and performance"; and with "a forward-looking ex ante diagnostic task". In practice, they come in two main forms:*

- *Parliamentary budget offices (also known as PBOs) such as the Congressional Budget Office in the United States (<https://www.cbo.gov/>), the*

Parliamentary Budget Office in South Africa (<https://www.parliament.gov.za/parliamentary-budget-office>), and the Center for Public Finance Studies in Mexico (Centro de Estudios de las Finanzas Públicas, <http://www.cefp.gob.mx/>); or

- Fiscal councils such as the Office for Budget Responsibility in the United Kingdom (<https://obr.uk/>) and the High Council for Public Finances in France (Haut Conseil des finances publiques, <https://www.hcfp.fr/>).

For more information, see von Trapp et al. 'Principles for Independent Fiscal Institutions and Case Studies', *OECD Journal on Budgeting* 15:2 (special issue, 2016), <https://doi.org/10.1787/budget-15-5jm2795tv625>.

To answer "a," there must be an IFI, and its independence must be set in law. In addition, it must have sufficient staffing and resources, including funding, to carry out its tasks. Answer "b" applies if an IFI exists, but either its independence is not set in law or its staffing and resources are insufficient to carry out its tasks. Answer "c" applies if an IFI exists, but its independence is not set in law and it lacks sufficient staffing and resources. Answer "d" applies if no IFI exists.

If the answer is "a," "b," or "c," please specify in the comments the name and type of IFI that exists (e.g., parliamentary budget office or fiscal council). If the answer is "a" or "b," identify the law that guarantees its independence, and provide evidence in support of the assessment of the adequacy of its staffing and resources. This can include the IFI's total budget allocation over recent years, any press reports that discuss perceived funding shortfalls, assessments by international organizations, and/or information from interviews with staff of the IFI.

**Answer:**

c. Yes, there is an IFI, but its independence is not set in law and its staffing and resources, including funding, are insufficient to carry out its tasks.

**Source:**

Interview with the Principal Budget Officer, National Assembly (NA) Budget Office - on March 26, 2023

**Comment:**

The Principal Budget Officer at NA has said regarding the IFI's independence as quoted, "It is not set in law yet because it is a new establishment. We are working on inscribing that in constitution like other PBOs. However we work like an independent office." As for the staffing and funding aspects, the NA Budget Office "does not have sufficient staff. However resources are provided when we request for them."

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question

**Comments:** No evidence found.

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**IBP Comment**

After conducting a consistency check with other countries with similar institutions the original answer was changed from "b" to "c".

#### 104. Does the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) publish macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts?

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 104 assesses whether an Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) has a role in producing the macroeconomic forecast (e.g., GDP growth, inflation, interest rates, etc.) and/or the fiscal forecast (revenues, expenditure, deficits, and debt), and if so, what kind of role it has. Macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasting is a typical core function across IFIs, but their role in forecasting takes several forms (von Trapp et al. 2016, p. 17 and Table 2). Some IFIs produce just a macroeconomic forecast, while others produce a complete fiscal forecast (which also typically requires an underlying macroeconomic forecast). In some cases, the fiscal forecast reflects continuation of current budget policies; such forecasts can be used by the legislature, the media, or the public to assess the projections in the executive's budget reflecting the government's policy proposals.

Some IFIs produce the official macroeconomic and fiscal forecasts used in the executive's budget. In other cases, IFIs do not prepare their own independent forecasts, but rather produce an assessment of the official estimates, or provide an opinion on, or endorsement of, the government's forecasts. Some others have no role at all in forecasting.

To answer "a," there must be an IFI that publishes both its own macroeconomic AND fiscal forecasts. Answer "b" applies if an IFI publishes its own macroeconomic OR fiscal forecast (but not both). Answer "c" applies if the IFI does not publish a macroeconomic or fiscal forecast, but rather publishes an assessment of the official forecasts produced by the executive and used in the budget. Choose option "d" if there is no IFI; or if there is an IFI that neither publishes its own macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts, nor a commentary on the official forecasts for the budget.

Macroeconomic forecasts may include indicators relating to economic output and economic growth, inflation, and the labor market, amongst others. Fiscal forecasts may include estimates of revenues, expenditures, the budget balance, and debt. If the answer is "a" or "b," please specify which indicators and estimates are included in the forecasts and whether the forecast is used by government as the official forecast. If the answer is "c," please describe the nature and depth of the assessment (e.g., the length of the commentary, or whether it covers both economic and fiscal issues).

**Answer:**

d. No, there is no IFI; or the IFI neither publishes its own macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts, nor a commentary on the official forecasts produced by the executive.

**Source:**

-<https://www.assembly.gm/>

-Interview with the Principal Budget Officer, National Assembly (NA) Budget Office - on March 26, 2023

**Comment:**

The Parliamentary Budget Office at the National Assembly (NA) has neither started publishing its own macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts, nor a commentary on the official forecasts produced by the executive. This has also been confirmed by the only Principal Budget Officer of the National Assembly (NA) Budget Office. However, she added that "The office is under a year old and is working on the necessary tools and resources to execute its mandate."

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question

**Comments:** Evidence was not found

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**105. Does the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) publish its own costings of new policy proposals, to assess their impact on the budget?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 105 assesses whether an Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) has a costing function that involves assessing the budgetary implications of new policy proposals for both revenues and expenditures, and if so, what kind of role it has. Many IFIs have a costing role, but with substantial diversity in the nature and extent of this work (von Trapp et al 2016, pp. 17-18 and Table 2). Some assess virtually all new policy proposals, while others cost only a selection of new policy proposals. Others only publish opinions on, or scrutinize the costings of, budget measures produced by the executive.

To answer "a," the IFI must publish its own costings of all (or virtually all) new policy proposals. Answer "b" applies if the IFI publishes its own costings, but only for major new policy proposals – for instance, only those proposals that cost or save above a certain amount. Answer "c" applies if the IFI publishes its own costings, but only on a limited number of proposals. This could occur, for instance, if the IFI lacked the capacity to assess proposals dealing with certain sectors. Instead of producing a cost estimate, it can also publish an assessment of the estimates produced by the executive. Answer "d" applies if there is no IFI; or if the IFI does not publish its own costings of new policy proposals or provide an assessment of the official costings of new policy proposals.

**Answer:**

d. No, there is no IFI; or the IFI does not publish its own costings of new policy proposals.

**Source:**

-<https://www.assembly.gm/>

-Interview with the Principal Budget Officer, National Assembly (NA) Budget Office - on March 26, 2023

**Comment:**

The Parliamentary Budget Office at the NA has made no publications of its own costings of new policy proposals nor has it published an assessment of the official costings of new policy proposals. This has also been confirmed by the only Principal Budget Officer of the National Assembly (NA) Budget Office. However, she added that "The office is under a year old and is working on the necessary tools and resources to execute its mandate. Once the framework is established, the office will publish its costing of new policies."



**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question

**Comments:** Evidence was not found

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**106. In the past 12 months, how frequently did the head or a senior staff member of the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) take part and testify in hearings of a committee of the legislature?**

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 106 concerns the interaction between two important oversight actors and assesses how frequently the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) made high-level inputs to the work of legislative committees. Almost all IFIs interact with the legislature in some form (von Trapp et al 2016, p. 18), but the intensity of the interaction varies. This question assesses this aspect by asking, with reference to the past 12 months, how frequently the head or a senior staff member of the IFI took part and testified in hearings of a committee of the legislature. The intent is to assess the extent to which the IFI staff member in question was not only present at a meeting of a legislative committee, but was an active participant (as opposed to a passive observer, serving only as a resource when called upon). As evidence to support your answer, you can refer to official records of legislative committees, websites and annual reports of the IFI, press releases and media coverage, for example. Choose answer "a" if this occurred five times or more; "b" for three times or more, but less than five times; and "c" for once or twice. Answer "d" should be selected if the head or a senior staff member of the IFI never took part and testified in hearings of a committee of the legislature, or if there is no IFI.*

**Answer:**

d. Never, or there is no IFI.

**Source:**

Interview with the Principal Budget Officer, National Assembly (NA) Budget Office - on March 26, 2023

**Comment:**

According to the Principal Budget Officer at the National Assembly (NA) Budget Office and as quoted, "NA staff do not testify during committee sessions, except for clerks and the National Assembly Members (NAMs)."

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**107. Does the full legislature and/or a legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal?**

*GUIDELINES:*

*Question 107 asks whether the legislature debated budget policies prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal for the most recent budget year before the research cut-off date. In general, prior to discussing the Executive's Budget Proposal for the coming year, the legislature should have an opportunity to review the government's broad budget priorities and fiscal parameters. Often times this information is laid out in a Pre-Budget Statement, which the executive presents to the legislature for debate. (See Questions 54-58.)*

*A number of countries conduct a pre-budget debate in the legislature around six months before the start of the budget year. In some cases, they adopt laws that guide the upcoming budget, for example the Budget Guidelines Law in Brazil and the Spring Fiscal Policy Bill in Sweden. A pre-budget debate can serve two main purposes: 1) to allow the executive to inform the legislature of its fiscal policy intentions by presenting updated reports on its annual and medium-term budget strategy and policy priorities; and 2) to establish "hard" multi-year fiscal targets or spending ceilings, which the government must adhere to when preparing its detailed spending estimates for the upcoming budget year.*

*To answer "a," the full legislature must debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal and approve recommendations for the*

upcoming budget.

Answer "b" applies if a legislative committee (but not the full legislature) debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal, and approves recommendations for the budget. Option "b" also applies if, in addition to the action by the committee, the full legislature also debates budget policy in advance of the budget, but does not approve recommendations.

Answer "c" applies if the full legislature and/or a legislative committee debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal, but does not approve recommendations for the budget. Answer "d" applies if neither the full legislature nor any legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal.

In your comment, please indicate the dates of the budget debate, and if both the full legislature and a legislative committee held a debate. Note that a debate does not need to be open to the public, but a public record of the meeting or a public notice that the meeting occurred is required. In addition, please indicate whether the budget debate was focused on a Pre-Budget Statement published by the Executive. If the Executive did not publish a Pre-Budget Statement, then please indicate what served as the focus of the legislature's debate (for instance, a report released by an IFI or some other institution).

**Answer:**

d. No, neither the full legislature nor any legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal.

**Source:**

-Interview with the Principal Budget Officer, National Assembly (NA) Budget Office -on March 26, 2023

-<https://www.facebook.com/GambiaAssembly/>

-<https://www.assembly.gm/>

**Comment:**

In an interview with the Principal Budget Officer at the National Assembly (NA) Budget Office, both the full legislative and legislative committees debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the EBP and approve recommendations for the upcoming budget. However, the researcher could not access prove of the full legislature or a legislative committee debating budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal. The legislature debates budget policy after the tabling of the EBP.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**108. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the Executive's Budget Proposal?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 108 examines how far in advance of the start of the most recent budget year the legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal. International good practice recommends that the Executive's Budget Proposal should be submitted to the legislature far enough in advance to allow the legislature time to review it properly, or at least three months prior to the start of the fiscal year. (See, for instance, Principle 2.2.2 of the IMF's Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>)).

For the purposes of responding to this question, if – and only if – the most recent budget submission occurred later than usual as a result of a particular event, such as an election, please use a more normal year as the basis for the response. If, however, delays have been observed for more than one budget year, and the legislature has not received the Executive's Budget Proposal in a timely manner on more than one occasion in the last three years, then "d" will be the appropriate answer.

To answer "a," the legislature must receive the Executive's Budget Proposal at least three months in advance of the start of the budget year. Answer "b" applies if the legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal at least two months, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year. Answer "c" applies if the legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal at least one month, but less than two months, before the start of the budget year. Answer "d" applies if the legislature does not receive the Executive's Budget Proposal at least one month prior to the start of the budget year, or does not receive it at all.

**Answer:**

c. The legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal at least one month, but less than two months, before the start of the budget year.

**Source:**

-Section 152 (1) of the 1997 Constitution of The Republic of The Gambia  
-Section 21 (1) of the Public Finance Act (2014)  
-<https://gainako.com/finance-minister-tables-2023-draft-budget-deficit-exceeding-d3-9-billion/>

**Comment:**

Both Section 152 (1) of the 1997 Constitution of The Republic of The Gambia and Section 21 (1) of the Public Finance Act (2014) clearly state that the Minister of Finance is "to lay before the National Assembly, the Appropriation Bill, at least 30 days before the end of the financial year, and according to Gainako news media, "Minister of Finance and Economic Affairs, Hon Seedy Keita laid the 2023 Draft Budget at the National Assembly featuring a Budget Deficit of D3.93 billion Dalasis on 14th November 2022.". This goes to show that the National Assembly received the most recent Executive's Budget Proposal at least one month, but less than two, before the start of the budget year.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**109. When does the legislature approve the Executive's Budget Proposal?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 109 examines when the legislature approves the Executive's Budget Proposal. International good practice recommends that the Executive's Budget Proposal should be approved by the legislature before the start of the fiscal year the budget proposal refers to. This gives the executive time to implement the budget in its entirety, particularly new programs and policies.*

*In some countries, the expenditure and revenue estimates of the Executive's Budget Proposal are approved separately; for purposes of this question, at least the expenditure estimates must be approved. Further, approval of the budget implies approval of the full-year budget, not just a short-term continuation of spending and revenue authority.*

*To answer "a," the legislature must approve the Executive's Budget Proposal at least one month before the start of the budget year. Answer "b" applies if the legislature approves the Executive's Budget Proposal less than one month in advance of the start of the budget year, but at least by the start of the budget year. Answer "c" applies if the legislature approves the Executive's Budget Proposal less than one month after the start of the budget year. Answer "d" applies if the legislature approves the Executive's Budget Proposal more than one month after the start of the budget year, or does not approve the budget.*

**Answer:**

b. The legislature approves the budget less than one month in advance of the start of the budget year, but at least by the start of the budget year.

**Source:**

-Interview with Principal Fiscal Officer, Mr. Abdou Salam Jatta, Directorate of Budget, MoFEA, on February 22, 2023.  
-<https://foreignbrief.com/daily-news/gambian-mps-face-deadline-to-approve-2023-draft-budget/>

**Comment:**

The FY 2023 EBP was approved on December 6, 2022 (less than 1 month in advance of the budget year). Moreover, the EBP always gets approved by the National Assembly before the start of the budget year it corresponds to.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**110. Does the legislature have the authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 110 examines the legislature's power to amend—as opposed to simply accept or reject—the budget proposal presented by the executive. This question is about legal authority rather than actions the legislature takes in practice. The legislature's powers to amend the budget can vary substantially across countries.*

*The "a" response is appropriate only if there are no restrictions on the right of the legislature to modify the Executive's Budget Proposal, including its right to change the size of the proposed deficit or surplus. The "b" response would be appropriate if, for instance, the legislature is restricted from changing the deficit or surplus, but it still has the power to increase or decrease funding and revenue levels. The more limited "c" response would apply if, for instance, the legislature can only re-allocate spending within the totals set in the Executive's Budget Proposal or can only decrease funding levels or increase revenues. Finally, response "d" would apply if the legislature may not make any changes (or only small technical changes), or if amendments must first be approved by the executive. In these cases, the legislature is essentially only able to approve or reject the budget as a whole. If the answer is "b" or "c", please indicate the nature of the amendment powers available to the Parliament and how they are limited.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal.

**Source:**

-Section 152 (1,1A) of the 1997 Constitution of The Gambia  
-Principal Fiscal Officer, Directorate of Budget, MoFEA  
-Principal Budget Officer, National Assembly (NA) Budget Office

**Comment:**

Section 152 (1,1A) of the 1997 Constitution of The Gambia states that "The National Assembly (NA) shall, within fourteen days of the estimates being laid before it, give consideration to and approve the estimates." During the 14-day period, the NA can amend the EBP by collectively making recommendations or impositions on the Executive (precisely MoFEA) to move funds between or among budget lines of a single budget entity or between or among budget lines of different budget entities before it can approve the EBP.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**111. During the most recent budget approval process, did the legislature use its authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 111 assesses whether any formal authority of the legislature to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal is used in practice. The responses to this question should be determined based on action by the legislature related to the Enacted Budget used in the OBS. Choose answer "a" if the legislature used its authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal during the most recent budget approval process, and amendments were adopted (all, or at least some of them). Answer "a" also applies if the legislature used its authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal, but the amendments were rejected by executive veto. Answer "b" applies if the legislature used its authority in law to propose amendments to the Executive's Budget Proposal, but none of these amendments were adopted. Answer "c" applies if the legislature has the authority in law to amend the budget, but no amendments were proposed during its consideration. Answer "d" applies when the legislature does not have any authority to amend the budget (that is, Question 110 is answered "d").*

*If the answer is "a" or "b", please specify in the comments the number of amendments introduced by the legislature (and in the case of an "a" response, the number adopted, or if applicable, information about an executive veto) and describe their nature. For example, did the amendments result in an increase or decrease of the deficit? What were the most significant amendments to revenues and to expenditures in terms of the sums involved? How did amendments affect the composition of expenditures? If the answer is "a," please specify which amendments were adopted, and provide evidence for it.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, the legislature used its authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal, and (at least some of) its amendments were adopted.

**Source:**

-<https://www.mofea.gm/directorates/budget>  
ESTIMATES OF REVENUE AND EXPENDITURE - 2023 (approved)  
The Executive Budget Proposal 2023 (draft)  
-<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=9DrsPFS51h0>  
-<https://gainako.com/parliament-approved-additional-d3-7-billion-in-2023-budget/>

**Comment:**

The Parliament, during the "FOURTH ORDINARY SESSION (BUDGET SESSION) OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY IN THE 2022 LEGISLATIVE YEAR - 2" and after the tabling of the FY 2023 Draft Budget by the Minister of Finance and Economic Affairs, held an 8-hour deliberation on the FY 2023 Draft Budget in order to amend or make adjustments where necessary before approving it. Such amendments included, but not limited to;

- Increasing the budget appropriated to the Ministry of Agriculture by D 440 million
- Increasing the budgets for the basic, secondary and higher education by D 23 million
- Increasing spending on the health sector by D 7.7 million
- Reducing Overall Travel Expenses by D 13.8 million

All amendments were made within the resource envelope.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**112. During the last budget approval process, did a specialized budget or finance committee in the legislature examine the Executive's Budget Proposal?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 112 assesses the role of a specialized budget or finance committee during the budget approval stage. Effective committee involvement is an essential condition for legislative influence in the budget process. Specialized committees provide opportunities for individual legislators to gain relevant expertise, and to examine budgets and policy in depth. Yet, the involvement of committees differs across legislatures. Some legislatures have separate committees to examine spending and tax proposals, while others have a single finance committee. Not all legislatures have a specialized budget or finance committee to examine the budget. In addition, there can be differences in the time available for the committee's analysis of the budget.*

*A report with the committee's findings and recommendations is intended to inform the debate in the full legislature, therefore it must be published before the legislature has adopted the budget.*

*Response "a" requires that, in the last budget approval process, a specialized budget or finance committee had one month or more to examine the Executive's Budget Proposal, and it published a report with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted. Response "b" applies where such a committee examined the draft budget and published a report, but within a shorter timeframe of less than one month. Response "c" applies if a committee examined the budget (without regard to the time period), but did not publish a report prior to the adoption of the budget. Response "d" applies where a specialized budget or finance committee did not examine the Executive's Budget Proposal.*

*Please specify in your comment the name of the committee and the number of days it had available to examine the budget. For bicameral legislatures where one house or chamber has greater constitutional authority in budgetary matters, the question applies to the house or chamber (usually the upper or second one) that is decisive. For bicameral legislatures with co-equal houses or chambers, the question should be answered with reference to the one that achieves the higher score for this question. In the case of bicameral legislatures, please note the relevant arrangements in each house or chamber. If applicable, provide a copy of the report. Please note also if a report is published, but only after the budget has been adopted.*

**Answer:**

b. Yes, a specialized budget or finance committee had less than one month to examine the Executive's Budget Proposal, and it published a report with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.

**Source:**

-FPAC Report With Findings and Recommendations  
<https://www.assembly.gm/wp-content/uploads/2022/12/ADOPTED-CONSOLIDATED-REPORT-2023-Budget.pdf>  
-Section 152(1A) of the 1997 Constitution  
-Interview with a Communications Officer, Mr. Gibairou Nayconf, at National Assembly on April 6, 2023.

**Comment:**

During the 2023 budget approval process, the Finance and Public Accounts Committee (FPAC) of the National Assembly (NA) prepared a

consolidated report comprising its findings and recommendations as well as those of the other committees at the National Assembly (NA). Seeing as the NA, under Section 152(1A) of the 1997 Constitution, has only 14 days to approve the budget, the FPAC automatically had less than one month to examine the FY 2023 EBP and come up with a report before approval. This report was published by NA on its official website on November 24, 2022 before the 2023 budget was approved.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**113. During the last approval process, did legislative committees, responsible for particular sectors (e.g., health, education, defense, etc.), examine spending in the Executive's Budget Proposal related to the sector for which they are responsible?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 113 assesses the role of committees of the legislature that are responsible for particular sectors (e.g., health, education, defense, etc.) during the budget approval stage. The role of sectoral committees differs across legislatures. Some legislatures do not involve them in the budget approval process, while others do. In addition, the time available for committee analysis differs.*

*A report with the committee's findings and recommendations is intended to inform the debate in the full legislature, so therefore must be published before the legislature has adopted the budget. Response "a" requires that sector committees had one month or more to examine the Executive's Budget Proposal, and published a report with findings and recommendations prior the budget being adopted. Response "b" applies where such committees examined the draft budget and published a report, but within a shorter timeframe of less than one month. Response "c" applies if sectoral committees examined the budget (without regard to the time period), but did not publish a report prior to the adoption of the budget. Response "d" applies where sectoral committees did not examine the Executive's Budget Proposal.*

*Please note that the examination of sectoral budgets by a specialized budget or finance committee is assessed in Question 112 and should not be considered for this question.*

*Please provide in the comments a brief overview of the committee structure and specify the number of days that sectoral committees had available to examine the budget and to publish their reports. For bicameral legislatures where one house or chamber has greater constitutional authority in budgetary matters, the question applies to the house or chamber (usually the upper or second one) that is decisive. For bicameral legislatures with co-equal houses or chambers, the question should be answered with reference to the one that achieves the higher score for this question. In the case of bicameral legislatures, please note the relevant arrangements in each house or chamber. If applicable, provide a sample copy of at least one of the reports. Please note if a report is published, but only after the budget has been adopted.*

*For purposes of responding to this question, use those sectoral committees that are best performing – that is, the ones that examine the budget the longest and that publish reports.*

**Answer:**

b. Yes, sector committees had less than one month to examine the Executive's Budget Proposal, and they published reports with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.

**Source:**

-FPAC Report With Findings and Recommendations

<https://www.assembly.gm/wp-content/uploads/2022/12/ADOPTED-CONSOLIDATED-REPORT-2023-Budget.pdf>

-Interview with a Communications Officer, Mr. Gibairou Nayconf, National Assembly- on April 6, 2023.

**Comment:**

Sector committees at the National Assembly (NA) such as the "STANDING COMMITTEE ON DEFENCE AND SECURITY", "SELECT COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION, TRAINING & ICT", "SELECT COMMITTEE ON HEALTH, DISASTER, REFUGEES, & HUMANITARIAN RELIEF" each examined the FY 2023 EBP and submitted their findings and recommendations to the FPAC for inclusion in the "ADOPTED-CONSOLIDATED-REPORT-2023-Budget" which is available on the NA's official website. Furthermore, their reports were published on November 24, 2022, before the 2023 budget was approved.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Agree

**114. In the past 12 months, did a committee of the legislature examine in-year implementation of the Enacted Budget during the relevant budget execution period?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 114 is about legislative oversight of budget execution. It assesses whether and how often a committee examined the implementation of the budget during the budget execution period (i.e., financial year) for which it was approved, and whether this resulted in an official report with findings and recommendations. This question does not apply to the ex post review of implementation following the end of the budget year as part of the audit stage, which is assessed separately. Nor does it apply to the legislature's review of the budget that it may undertake as part of the process of considering a supplemental budget during the year. In-year monitoring by the legislature will be affected by the frequency that the executive publishes In-Year Reports.*

*To answer "a," a committee must have examined in-year implementation of the Enacted Budget at least three times during the course of the relevant budget year and published reports with findings and recommendations. Answer "b" applies where this occurred only once or twice during the year.*

*Exception: If a legislature is in session only twice during the year, and it examines the implementation of the budget during both sessions, then it would be eligible for an "a" response.*

*Choose "c" if a committee examined in-year implementation (without regard to frequency), but did not publish any report with findings and recommendations. Answer "d" applies where no committee examined in-year implementation.*

*If the answer is "a" or "b," please specify the name of the committee and when it reviewed budget implementation, and provide a copy of its report(s). If the answer is "c," please specify the name of the committee and when it reviewed budget implementation.*

*For purposes of responding to this question, if more than one committee holds in-year reviews of the budget, use the committee that is best performing – that is, the one that examines in-year implementation the most times and that publishes a report.*

**Answer:**

c. Yes, a committee examined in-year implementation, but it did not publish any report with findings and recommendations.

**Source:**

Interview with the Principal Budget Officer, National Assembly (NA) Budget Office - on March 26, 2023

**Comment:**

According to the Principal Budget Officer at the National Assembly (NA) Budget Office, a committee of the NA examines in-year implementation of the Enacted Budget during the execution phase and they do so on both monthly and quarterly bases.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question

**Comments:** Evidence not found.

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**115. Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units that receive explicit funding in the Enacted Budget, and is it legally required to do so?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 115 examines whether the executive seeks approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, and whether it is legally required to do so.*

*In some countries, the executive has the power in law to adjust funding levels for specific appropriations during the execution of the budget. This question*

examines rules around shifting funds between administrative units (ministries, departments, or agencies) or whatever funding unit (or "vote") is specified in the Enacted Budget.

The conditions under which the executive may exercise its discretion to shift funds should be clearly defined in publicly available regulations or law. In addition, the amount of funds that the executive is allowed to transfer between administrative units should not be so excessive as to undermine the accountability of the executive to the legislature.

To answer "a," the executive is required by law or regulation to obtain prior legislative approval before shifting funds between administrative units, and it does so in practice. Answer "b" applies if the executive obtains legislative approval before shifting funds between administrative units, but is not legally required to do so. Answer "c" applies if the executive is legally required to receive legislative approval before shifting funds, but does not do so in practice. Answer "d" applies if legislative approval is not legally required for the executive to shift funds between administrative units and the executive does not obtain legislative approval in practice. Answer "d" also applies if the executive is authorized to shift an amount considered so excessive as to undermine accountability (roughly equal to 3 percent of total budgeted expenditures). A "d" response applies if the legislature only approves the shifting of funds after it has already occurred.

In the comments, please indicate any law or regulation that provides the executive with standing authority to shift funds between administrative units and, if so, describe that authority. Similarly, legislative approval for shifting funds between administrative units typically occurs with the adoption of legislation such as a supplemental budget. But if other formal procedures for gaining approval from the legislature exist, then please provide information about that approval process.

**Answer:**

d. There is no law or regulation requiring the executive to obtain approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, and in practice the executive shifts funds between administrative units before obtaining approval from the legislature.

**Source:**

<https://www.mofea.gm/pension-law>  
Public Finance ACT, 2014

**Comment:**

Section 29(4a, 4b, 4c) of the Public Finance ACT, 2014 states as quoted:

"Virement is allowed among expenditure items of a budget agency up to a maximum of seventy five per cent of the appropriation of giving or receiving expenditure items, at the request of the budget agency and the approval of the minister; among budget agencies under the same supervising department, at the request of the supervising department and the approval of the minister provided that the amount being vired does not exceed fifty per cent of the total appropriations of the giving or receiving expenditure items of each budget agency; and among budget agencies by the approval of the minister in consultation with vote controllers of Budget agencies."

From this section, it is clear that the executive does not need any approval from the NA to vire funds nor is it legally required to do so.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**116. Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenue (that is, amounts higher than originally anticipated) that may become available during the budget execution period, and is it legally required to do so?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 116 examines whether the executive receives approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenue, and whether it is legally required to do so. Good practice requires the legislature to approve changes in revenue or expenditure relative to the Enacted Budget. For example, if additional revenue is collected unexpectedly during the year, which often happens in oil/mineral-dependent countries, and it was not accounted for in the Enacted Budget, there should be a procedure in place to ensure that the legislature approves any proposed use of these "new" funds. If such requirements are not in place, the executive might deliberately underestimate revenue in the budget proposal it submits to the legislature, in order to have additional resources to spend at the executive's discretion, with no legislative control.

To answer "a," the executive is required by law or regulation to obtain prior legislative approval before spending any funds resulting from higher-than-expected revenues, and it does so in practice. Answer "b" applies if the executive obtains legislative approval before spending excess revenue, but is not legally required to do so. Answer "c" applies if the executive is legally required to receive legislative approval before spending excess revenue, but does not do so in practice. Answer "d" applies if prior legislative approval is not legally required for the executive to spend excess revenue and the executive does not obtain legislative approval in practice. A "d" response applies if the legislature only approves the additional spending after it has already occurred.



Typically, legislative approval of additional spending beyond what was reflected in the Enacted Budget would occur with the adoption of a supplemental budget. But other formal procedures for getting approval from the legislature in advance of it adopting the supplemental budget may exist. If that is the case, then please provide information about that approval process.

**Answer:**

a The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenues, and it does so in practice.

**Source:**

-Section 153(1), 1997 Constitution of The Gambia  
-<https://www.mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

Section 153(1), 1997 Constitution of The Gambia states as quoted:

"subject to section 154, if in respect of any financial year it is found that the amount appropriated under the Appropriation Act is insufficient or that a need has arisen for a purpose for which no amount has been appropriated by that Act a supplementary estimate showing the sums required shall be laid before the National Assembly before the expenditure has been incurred."

This statement shows that the law requires that a supplementary budget be approved by the NA before it is expended and a proof of this practice is available on the MoFEA's official website, under the Directorate of Budget. It is labelled as "Press Release"

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**117. Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below the levels in the Enacted Budget in response to revenue shortfalls (that is, revenues lower than originally anticipated) or other reasons during the budget execution period, and is it legally required to do so?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 117 examines whether the executive receives approval from the legislature prior to cutting spending below the levels in the Enacted Budget in response to revenue shortfalls or for any other reason, and whether it is legally required to do so. Good practice requires the legislature to approve changes in revenue or expenditure relative to the Enacted Budget. For example, if less revenue is collected unexpectedly during the year, the legislature should approve or reject any proposed reductions in expenditures that are implemented as a result. If such requirements are not in place, the executive might substantially change the composition of the budget at the executive's discretion, with no legislative control.

Typically, legislative approval of proposals to reduce spending below the levels reflected in the Enacted Budget would occur as part of the supplemental budget. But other formal procedures for getting approval from the legislature in advance of it adopting the supplemental budget may exist. If that is the case, then please provide information about that approval process.

To answer "a," the executive is required by law or regulation to obtain prior legislative approval before implementing spending cuts in response to revenue shortfalls or for other reasons, and it does so in practice. Answer "b" applies if the executive received legislative approval before implementing such cuts, but is not legally required to do so. Answer "c" applies if the executive is legally required to obtain legislative approval before implementing such cuts, but does not do so in practice. Answer "d" applies if legislative approval is not legally required for the executive to implement such cuts and the executive does not obtain such approval in practice. A "d" response applies if the legislature only approves the spending cuts after they have already occurred.

**Answer:**

d. There is no law or regulation requiring the executive to obtain approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below enacted levels, and in practice the executive implements these spending cuts before seeking prior approval from the legislature.

**Source:**

Section 33 (1), Public Finance Act, 2014

**Comment:**

The ministry does not seek approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below the levels in the Enacted Budget in response to revenue shortfalls and in fact, Section 33 (1), Public Finance Act, 2014 states that the MoFEA "is responsible for the execution of the Government budget and

the accounting and execution of Government receipts and payments".

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Disagree

**Suggested Answer:**

a. The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below the enacted levels in response to revenue shortfalls or other reasons, and it does so in practice.

**Comments:** A Revised Budget is produced in instances like this. A revised budget was produced for FY 2022. Check Mofea website for evidence of this.

**Researcher Response**

The research team stands behind its initial comments that MoFEA or the executive does not seek approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below the levels in the Enacted Budget in response to revenue shortfalls. The FY 2022 budget was revised mainly due to the overall salary increment for civil servants in 2022 and the inclusion of two new ministries in the FY 2022 budget (The ministry of Communication and Digital Economy and The ministry of Public Service, Administrative Reforms and Policy Coordination).

**IBP Comment**

IBP appreciates the government reviewer's comment. Considering the arguments and additional information provided by the researcher, the answer "d" is appropriate.

**118. Did a committee of the legislature examine the Audit Report on the annual budget produced by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI)?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 118 is about ex post oversight following the implementation of the budget. It probes whether a committee examined the Audit Report on the annual budget produced by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI), and whether this resulted in an official report with findings and recommendations. A key issue is how soon after the SAI releases the report does it legislature review it. This question does not apply to the legislative scrutiny of in-year implementation of the Enacted Budget during the relevant budget execution period, which is assessed separately. Also, the question is asking specifically about the SAI's annual report on the execution of the budget, not about other audit reports that the SAI may produce. (This is the Audit Report used for responding to Question 98.)*

*To answer "a," a legislative committee must have examined the annual Audit Report within three months of it being released by the SAI, and then published a report (or reports) with findings and recommendations. (Note that the three-month period should only take into account time when the legislature is in session.)*

*Answer "b" applies when the committee examines it within six months of it being released (but more than three months), and then published a report with its findings and recommendations. Choose "c" if a committee examined the annual Audit Report more than six months after it became available or it did not publish any report with findings and recommendations. Answer "d" applies where no committee examined the annual Audit Report.*

*If the answer is "a" or "b," please specify the name of the committee and when it reviewed the Audit Report, and provide a copy of its report(s). If the answer is "c," please specify the name of the committee and when it reviewed budget implementation. Answers "a," "b," or "c" may be selected if the Audit Report is produced by the SAI but not made publicly available.*

**Answer:**

c. Yes, a committee examined the Audit Report on the annual budget, but it did so after the report had been available for more than six months or it did not publish any report with findings and recommendations.

**Source:**

-Interview with Deputy Clerk, Mr. Kalifa M.M. Mbye, National Assembly - on March 29, 2023

-Consideration of the 2019 Accounts of The Government of The Gambia - on February 15, 2023

[https://www.facebook.com/GambiaAssembly/videos/523779706561119/?extid=NS-UNK-UNK-UNK-AN\\_GK0T-GK1C&mibextid=1Yhcl9R](https://www.facebook.com/GambiaAssembly/videos/523779706561119/?extid=NS-UNK-UNK-UNK-AN_GK0T-GK1C&mibextid=1Yhcl9R)

**Comment:**

Based on the data obtained from Mr. Mbye, an NA clerk, the Finance and Public Accounts Committee (FPAC) of the NA "examines the Audit Reports on the annual budget whenever submitted by the Auditor General and the committee publishes reports with findings and recommendations and even sometimes with resolutions". Proof of FPAC's examining of the Audit Reports can be found in the link provided in the Source Box.

The latest Audit Report (2019) was published by the National Audit Office (NAO) on November 23, 2022, and within three months of its publication,

FPAC examined it -on February 15, 2023.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question

**Comments:** Evidence not found.

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**119. Was the process of appointing (or re-appointing) the current head of the SAI carried out in a way that ensures his or her independence?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 119 concerns the appointment process of the current head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI). Appointment procedures vary greatly across countries, as well as across different types of SAIs. Moreover, conventions and informal practices can greatly affect the de facto independence of the head of the SAI. While these factors make it difficult to devise a single metric against which all SAIs can be assessed with regard to this particular aspect, this question focuses on whether the legislature or judiciary must appoint or approve the appointment of the head of the SAI as a way to ensure the SAI's independence from the executive. However, if the appointment is carried out in another way that nonetheless ensures the independence of the SAI head, then that approach could be also considered.*

*To answer "a," the legislature or judiciary must appoint (or re-appoint) the head of the SAI, or approve the recommendation of the executive, as a way that ensure his or her independence from the executive. (As noted above, alternative approaches may also be acceptable.) Choose "b" if the appointment process does not ensure the independence of the head of the SAI, e.g. the executive may appoint the head of the SAI without the final consent of the legislature or judiciary.*

*Irrespective of which answer you selected, provide a description of how the head of the SAI is appointed.*

**Answer:**

b. No, the executive may appoint the head of the SAI without the final consent of the legislature or judiciary.

**Source:**

-Section158(2), the 1997 Constitution of The Gambia

-Section 11(1), National Audit Office Act, 2015

"DIRECTOR GENERAL INTERNAL AUDIT APPOINTED AUDITOR GENERAL"

<https://mofea.gm/news/director-general-internal-audit-appointed-auditor->

**Comment:**

Both Section158(2) of the 1997 Constitution of The Gambia and Section 11(1) of the National Audit Office Act, 2015 clearly states that the appointment of the head of the SAI is done by the president "after consultation with the Public Service Commission".

The recent appointment of the new Auditor General, Modou Ceesay, was appointed on this legal basis without subjecting his appointment to Parliamentary approval.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Researcher Response**

The research team would need further elaboration on why the SAI disagrees with option "b" and opts for an option "c". Option "b" still applies for the research team.

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought

input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response, and the final IBP decision after the additional input. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: disagree (suggested answer "c") Comment: We disagree with option b chosen above by the Researcher (we opt for option c); but agree with the researcher's comment on the appointment of the head of SAI as stated by the 1997 Constitution of the Gambia. IBP final comment: IBP appreciates the National Audit Office of The Gambia's comment. There is no disagreement related to the legal framework which regulates the process of appointing (or re-appointing) the current head of the Office. Therefore, the answer "b" is appropriate.

**120. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 120 covers the manner in which the head or senior members of the SAI may be removed from office. This question draws on best practices identified in the Lima Declaration of Guidelines on Auditing Precepts (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/LimaDeclaration.pdf>), including measures intended to guarantee the office's independence from the executive.*

*To answer "a," the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before the head of the SAI is removed. For example, the legislature or judiciary may give final consent following a certain external process, such as a criminal proceeding. So while the executive may initiate a criminal proceeding, the final consent of a member of the judiciary – or a judge – is necessary to render a verdict of wrongdoing that may lead to the removal from office of the head of the SAI. Answer "b" applies if the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before he or she is removed.

**Source:**

Section 16(5, 6, 7), National Audit Office Act, 2015

**Comment:**

The head of the SAI (Auditor General) may be removed by the president under a condition that the Auditor General has health issues that render him or her invalid, he or she is incompetent or he or she has misbehaved. However, proof of health related issues must be provided by a "properly constituted medical board" whereas as proof of incompetence or misbehavior must be provided by an independent tribunal which consists of "a judge of the High Court; the Ombudsman; a member of the Public Service Commission; a chartered accountant".

Thus, the judiciary is involved in investigating the removal of the process before it is effected by the President, which guarantees security of tenure for the Auditor General

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: none

**121. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI)?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 121 asks who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI). To ensure objective audits of government budgets, another important component of the SAI's independence from the executive is the extent to which the SAI's budget is determined by a body other than the executive, and whether the SAI has adequate resources to fulfill its mandate.

Answer "a" applies if the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate, AND either the SAI determines its own budget and then submits it to the executive (which accepts it with little or no change) or directly to the legislature, or the budget of the SAI is determined directly by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body). Answer "b" applies if the SAI's budget is determined by the executive (absent a recommendation from the SAI), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. Answer "c" applies if the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body) determines the SAI's budget, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. Answer "d" applies if the executive determines the SAI's budget, and the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. Please provide evidence in support of the assessment that the funding level is or is not broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.

**Answer:**

c. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.

**Source:**

-Section 159(4), 1997 Constitution of The Gambia  
-Section 24(2), the National Audit Office Act 2015, The Gambia  
-<https://www.mofea.gm/directorates/budget> - 2023 Draft Budget vs. 2023 Approved Budget

**Comment:**

Section 159(4) of the 1997 Constitution and Section 24(2) of the NAO Act of 2015, both mentioned that the NAO is to submit its budget to the President for onward submission to the parliament for amendment and approval. The president however is to submit the budget without amending it but may submit with observations and recommendations. Moreover, the NAO's FY 2023 budget after approval, was reduced by about D49.9 million by the Legislature. Which is a budget cut below the need of the NAO.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: none

**122. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have the discretion in law to undertake those audits it may wish to?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 122 explores the scope of the investigative powers of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) as prescribed in law.

Question 97 asks which of the three types of audits – financial, compliance, and performance – the SAI conducts. This question asks if the SAI is constrained by law (rather than by a lack of capacity or an inadequate budget) from undertaking any form of audit or investigating irregularities in any program or activity.

There are numerous examples of limitations. For instance, some SAIs are not permitted by their legal mandate to audit joint ventures or other public-private arrangements. Others are only allowed to undertake financial audits, precluded from conducting performance or value-for-money audits. The SAIs in some countries do not have the legal mandate to review arrangements involving oil or stabilization funds, or other types of special or extra-budgetary funds. The SAI may also not have the ability to audit commercial projects involving the public and private sector.

To answer "a," the SAI must have full discretion in law to decide which audits to undertake. Answer "b" applies if some limitations exist, but the SAI enjoys

significant discretion to undertake those audits it wishes to. Answer "c" applies if the SAI has some discretion, but significant legal limitations exist. Answer "d" applies if the SAI has no power at all to choose which audits to undertake

Consulting the Lima Declaration of Guidelines on Auditing Precepts (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/LimaDeclaration.pdf>) may be useful in answering this question as its provisions serve to define the appropriate scope of a SAI's legal mandate and jurisdiction.

**Answer:**

a. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.

**Source:**

-Section 160(4), 1997 Constitution of The Gambia  
-Section 14(a, b), National Audit Office Act 2015, The Gambia

**Comment:**

Sections 160(4) of the 1997 Constitution and 14(a, b) of the National Audit Office Act of The Gambia both give full discretion to the National Audit Office (NAO) to conduct any audits of public institutions it wishes to without the interference of the Executive.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response.  
Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: none

**123. Are the audit processes of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) reviewed by an independent agency?**

**GUIDELINES:**

Question 123 assesses whether and to what extent the audit processes of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) are subject to review by an independent agency. The latter could be a peer SAI, an international organization, an academic institution with relevant expertise, or an independent domestic agency with quality assurance functions in the area of financial reporting.

To answer "a," an independent agency must conduct and publish a review of the audit processes of the SAI on an annual basis. Answer "b" applies if a review was carried out within the past five years, and published, but it is not conducted annually, but. Choose answer "c" if the SAI has an internal unit that reviews the audit processes of the SAI on a regular basis, but an independent agency does not conduct such a review. Answer "d" applies if the audit processes of the SAI are reviewed neither by an independent agency nor by a unit within the SAI.

If the answer is either "a" or "b," please specify the name of the independent agency and when last it conducted such a review, and provide a copy of the published report. If the answer is "c," please specify the name of the unit within the SAI that is tasked with conducting such reviews.

**Answer:**

a. Yes, an independent agency conducts and publishes a review of the audit processes of the SAI on an annual basis.

**Source:**

-Interview with Ms. Binta Touray, Communications Specialist, National Audit Office (NAO)-on March 29, 2023  
-Independent Agencies  
<https://afrosai-e.org.za/category/publications/icbf-self-assessment-report/>  
<https://afrosai-e.org.za/category/publications/integrated-annual-report/>

**Comment:**

Based on the information provided by Ms. Touray and quoted by the 2023 OBS researcher, "Yes, the NAO is a member of the African Organization of English-speaking Supreme Audit Institutions (AFROSAI-E) which is a member-based organization (headquartered in South Africa). AFROSAI-E

conducts an annual assessment called 'Institutional Capacity Building Framework (ICBF) to assess NAOs on 5 domains:

1. Independence & Legal Framework
2. Organization & Management
3. Human Resources
4. Audit Standards and Methodology
5. Communications and Stakeholder Management

In addition to this annual self-assessment questionnaire, the AFROSAI-E Quality Assurance team also visits the NAO every 3 years to review its audit quality assurance management and to corroborate the results of the annual ICBF self-assessment. These are on the AFROSAI-E website). "

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: none

**124. In the past 12 months, how frequently did the head or a senior staff member of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) take part and testify in hearings of a committee of the legislature?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*Question 124 concerns the interaction between two important oversight actors and assesses how frequently the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) made high-level inputs to the work of legislative committees. Many SAIs interact with the legislature in some form, but the nature and intensity of the interaction varies. This question probes this aspect by asking, with reference to the past 12 months, how frequently the head or a senior staff member of the SAI took part and testified in hearings of a committee of the legislature. The intent is to assess the extent to which the SAI representative in question was not only present at a meeting of a legislative committee, but was an active participant (as opposed to a passive observer, serving only as a resource when called upon). You can refer to official records of legislative committees, websites and annual reports of the SAI, press releases and media coverage, for example. Choose answer "a" if this occurred five times or more; "b" for three times or more, but less than five times; "c" for once or twice, and "d" for never.*

**Answer:**

a. Frequently (i.e., five times or more).

**Source:**

-Interview with Ms. Binta Touray, Communications Specialist, National Audit Office (NAO)-on March 29, 2023

"The Auditor General Presenting the Audit Report on the Government's COVID 19 funds of the Finance and Public Accounts Committee" January 14, 2022

<https://www.facebook.com/GambiaAssembly/videos/auditor-general-presentation-audit-report-on-the-government-covid-19-response-pr/555189115832815/>

"AUDITOR GENERAL'S REPORT ON THE 2019 FINANCIAL STATEMENT OF THE GAMBIA"

[https://www.youtube.com/live/PQP\\_5jxw8gl?feature=share](https://www.youtube.com/live/PQP_5jxw8gl?feature=share) September 27, 2022

"National Assembly Meets to Discuss the Auditor General's Reports for the Financial Years 2016-2018"

<https://nao.gm/national-assembly-meets-to-discuss-the-auditor-generals-reports-for-the-financial-years-2016-2018/>

FPAC: Presentation of annual Activity Reports and audited Financial Statement By: Gambia National Library Service Authority (GNLSA)

<https://www.facebook.com/GambiaAssembly/videos/fpac-presentation-of-annual-activity-reports-and-audited-financial-statement-by-/2948515512117077/>

**Comment:**

The Auditor General frequently answers to the call of the National Assembly where necessary to testify on the his audit findings on government accounts, local government accounts, SOEs, and other special audits conducted by the Auditor General.

These testimonies includes both in plenary and committee sittings which are broadcasted online.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: none

**125. Does the executive use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during the formulation of the annual budget (prior to the budget being tabled in parliament)?**

*GUIDELINES:*

*This question reflects the GIFT principles on "Inclusiveness" and "Timeliness" and assesses the extent to which the participation mechanism(s) used by the executive are truly interactive and involve a two-way conversation between citizens and the executive.*

*The drafting of this question and its answers are partially drawn from the IAP2 Spectrum of Public Participation, in particular with regards to the concepts of "involvement" (option "a" in the responses) and "consultation" (option "b"). See:*

[https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/foundations\\_course/IAP2\\_P2\\_Spectrum\\_FINAL.pdf](https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/foundations_course/IAP2_P2_Spectrum_FINAL.pdf).

*Please consider only participation mechanisms that the Ministry of Finance, lead budget agency, or central coordinating agency designated by the government to implement participation mechanisms ("the executive") is currently using to allow the public to participate in the formulation of the annual budget, including annual pre-budget discussions. Participation mechanisms used only by line ministries should not be used to answer this question. If there is more than one mechanism used by the executive, please select the deepest or most interactive mechanism that reflects the government's efforts to incorporate citizens' input into the formulation of the annual budget. The participation mechanisms can involve a range of different issues, such as spending and tax policy, funding and revenue levels, and macro-fiscal planning .*

*To answer "a," the executive must use open participation mechanisms that involve the public in the formulation of the annual budget. This means that a public process is in place whereby CSOs and/or individual members of the public and government officials interact, and have the opportunity to express their opinions to each other in what can be considered a public dialogue between them (i.e., in-person and online discussion forums). Additionally, the mechanism should be open to any CSO and/or individual members of the public who wish to participate. By selecting this answer, the researcher must present evidence to support the presence of a public dialogue among citizens and government officials. Examples include public meetings and online deliberative exchanges.*

*Answer "b" applies if an open consultation mechanism is in place whereby members of the public (i.e., individuals and/or CSOs as well as academics, independent experts, policy think tanks, and business organizations) can provide their input in the formulation of the annual budget. This answer applies if the government is using a mechanism that is structured and well established, and not ad-hoc. The researcher must present evidence to support the presence of consultative processes through which the executive seeks out inputs from citizens. Examples include surveys, focus groups, report cards, published policy consultation exercises, and online platforms that government officials actively manage to solicit inputs.*

*Answer "c" applies if the executive has established a mechanism or mechanisms to allow citizens to participate in the budget formulation phase, but:*

*1) The mechanisms are not structured and happen only on ad-hoc basis, or not regularly.*

*and/or*

*2) The executive consults with and/or interacts with, citizens, but there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, and the executive determines fully or partially such selection process by inviting specific groups (for example by making an open call but just to experts from a particular sector, or naming specific organizations). While it is not possible for all citizens and/or CSOs to participate in this or other phases of the budget process, options "a" and "b" apply if the government does not exercise any discretion in determining who is allowed to participate. While there is likely going to be self-selection, it is important that the selection is not made by the executive.*

*In cases where there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, to select answer choice "c", there should be some sort of public record (held in public, minutes of meetings released to public) so that all CSOs and individual members of the public can have knowledge of the meeting, who participated, and what*



was discussed.

Examples of mechanisms that might qualify as a "c" response include hotlines, Facebook announcements, and one-off meetings with NGOs in which there is a public record.

The researcher must present evidence to support selection of a "c" response.

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget formulation stage.

**Answer:**

c. Yes, the executive uses participation mechanisms during the budget formulation phase, but either these mechanisms capture only some ad-hoc views, or the executive invites specific individuals or groups for budget discussions (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).

**Source:**

-<https://mofea.gm/downloads-file/budget-call-circular-fiscal-year-2023#:~:text=NATIONAL%20BUDGET%20CONSULTATIVE%20WORKSHOP%20MOFEA,underpinning%20the%20FY2023%2D2025%20budget>.  
-<https://www.mofea.gm/news/updates-from-the-ministry-of-finance-economic-affa-2023> OBS Researcher (as an intern at the MoFEA Budget Directorate)  
-Diretorate of Budget (DoB), MoFEA  
<https://twitter.com/MofeaGambia/status/1557704708030173186>

**Comment:**

The MoFEA, through its Budget Directorate organizes budget consultative workshops- it took place in 2021, 2022 and it is expected to take place on June 29, 2023 based on DoB's (MoFEA) budget calendar - before tabling the annual budget at the National Assembly, to which selected CSOs and members of the press or media are invited to participate in the budget discussions. Furthermore, the Director of Budget accompanied by the 2023 OBS researcher held a meeting with the Gambia Chamber of Commerce and Industry (GCCl), during the pre-budget stage, to discuss ways of addressing the needs of the private sector in the 2023 budget. Also, through regional consultations, MoFEA goes with Key MDAs(Agriculture, health, education, infrastructure) to LGAs to discuss the needs of respective constituents for inclusion in the upcoming budget. However, MoFEA has not done these regional consultations regularly and they are one-off meetings conducted in different local government areas where members of the public are engaged.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Disagree

**Suggested Answer:**

a. Yes, the executive uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public and government officials exchange views on the budget.

**Researcher Response**

The research team stands behind its initial comments and therefore still opts for option "c"

**IBP Comment**

IBP appreciates the government reviewer's comment. However, no evidence was presented to support the suggested new answer. Considering the initial information provided by the researcher, the answer "c" is appropriate

**126. With regard to the mechanism identified in question 125, does the executive take concrete steps to include vulnerable and under-represented parts of the population in the formulation of the annual budget?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*This question reflects the GIFT principle of "Inclusiveness", and examines the executive's effort to actively reach out to citizens who are from socially vulnerable groups and/or underrepresented in national processes. The emphasis here is on the executive's efforts to seek out the views of members of the public from socially vulnerable groups and/or who are underrepresented in the process.*

*To answer "a," the executive must actively seek out individuals from at least one vulnerable and underrepresented community and/or civil society organization representing vulnerable and underrepresented individuals and communities. The researcher must provide evidence to show the government's efforts and*

actions. The researcher must speak with the relevant government official(s), and subsequently double check with an alternative source, such as representatives of vulnerable/underrepresented groups.

Answer "b" applies if the executive does not take concrete steps to incorporate vulnerable/underrepresented individuals, or organizations representing them, into participation mechanisms or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget formulation stage.

**Answer:**

b. The requirements for an "a" response are not met.

**Source:**

-<https://www.mofea.gm/news>

-Interview with the Directorate of Budget (DoB) team, MoFEA-on March 27, 2023

-Interview with Mr. Ebrima Jallow, Communications Officer, MoFEA-on March 28, 2023

**Comment:**

The MoFEA (which is also the body of the Executive responsible for the preparation of the annual budget) does engaged CSOs, Women and Community Based Organisations (CBOs), however, there still a persistent challenge in PWD representation and consultation on budget formulation.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Disagree

**Suggested Answer:**

a. Yes, the executive takes concrete steps to include individuals and/or CSOs representing vulnerable and underrepresented parts of the population in the formulation of the annual budget.

**Researcher Response**

The research team stands behind its comment that the MoFEA does engage CSOs, Women and Community Based Organisations (CBOs), however, there still a persistent challenge in PWD representation and consultation on budget formulation. Hence option "b" is still the viable option for the research team.

**IBP Comment**

IBP appreciates the government reviewer's comment. However, no evidence was presented to support the suggested new answer. Considering the additional information provided by the researcher, the answer "b" is appropriate

127. During the budget formulation stage, which of the following key topics does the executive's engagement with citizens cover?

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:

1. Macroeconomic issues
2. Revenue forecasts, policies, and administration
3. Social spending policies
4. Deficit and debt levels
5. Public investment projects
6. Public services

**GUIDELINES:**

This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Timeliness". Please consider all of the mechanisms currently used by the executive to promote public participation during the formulation of the annual budget.

Please note that while the public engagement can/may cover other topics -- and for this reason the other questions assessing the executive's engagement with the public during budget formulation can be answered on the basis of engagement on topics other than the six listed above -- for the purpose of answering this question, "key topics" are considered to be only the ones listed above. If the executive's engagement with the public covers topics other than the six listed above, please specify these topics in the comments.

Note also that this question assesses only the coverage of public engagement (i.e., "what issues is the public invited to engage on?") and issues related to the depth of engagement or selectivity of engaged are not dealt with by this question.

*If written materials about the public engagement, such as an invitation, do not specify the coverage of the public engagement, but the researcher has personally participated in the engagement, s/he may respond to this question based on firsthand experience of the coverage of the public engagement.*

*Answer "d" applies if requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget formulation stage.*

**Answer:**

b. The executive's engagement with citizens covers at least three (but less than six) of the above-mentioned topics.

**Source:**

Interview with Officials at the Directorate of Budget (DoB), MoFEA - on March 27, 2023

**Comment:**

According to the officials at the Directorate of Budget, including the Deputy Director at DoB, Mr. Alaye Barra, the executive's engagement with citizens covers four main topics namely:

Macroeconomic issues, Social Spending Policies, Public Investment Projects and Public Services

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**128. Does the executive use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input in monitoring the implementation of the annual budget?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*This question reflects the GIFT principles on "Inclusiveness" and "Timeliness" and assesses the extent to which the participation mechanism(s) used by the executive are truly interactive and involve a two-way conversation between citizens and the executive.*

*The drafting of this question and its answers are partially drawn from the IAP2 Spectrum of Public Participation, in particular with regards to the concepts of "involvement" (option "a" in the responses) and "consultation" (option "b"). See:*

[https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/foundations\\_course/IAP2\\_P2\\_Spectrum\\_FINAL.pdf](https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/foundations_course/IAP2_P2_Spectrum_FINAL.pdf)

*Please consider only participation mechanisms that the Ministry of Finance, lead budget agency, or central coordinating agency designated by the government to implement participation mechanisms ("the executive") is currently using to allow the public to participate in monitoring the implementation of the annual budget. If the executive has designated a central coordinating agency to implement participation mechanisms throughout the national budget process, researchers may consider these mechanisms. Participation mechanisms used only by line ministries should not be used to answer this question. If there is more than one mechanism used by the executive, please select the deepest or most interactive mechanism that reflects the government's efforts to incorporate citizens' input into the implementation of the annual budget. The participation mechanisms can involve a range of different issues, such as revenue administration, public service delivery, public investment project implementation, including procurement, and the administration of social transfer schemes.*

*To answer "a," the executive must use open participation mechanisms that involve the public in the implementation of the annual budget. This means that a public process is in place whereby CSOs and/or individual members of the public and government officials interact, and have the opportunity to express their opinions to each other in what can be considered a public dialogue between them (i.e., in-person and online discussion forums). Additionally, the mechanism should be open to any CSO and/or individual members of the public who wish to participate. By selecting this answer, the researcher must present evidence to support the presence of a public dialogue among citizens and government official. Examples include public meetings, online, deliberative exchanges, procurement complaint mechanisms, and social monitoring and dialogue.*

*Answer "b" applies if an open consultation mechanism is in place whereby members of the public (i.e., individuals and/or CSOs as well as academics, independent experts, policy think tanks, and business organizations) can provide their input on the implementation of the annual budget. This answer applies if the government is using a mechanism that is structured and well established, and not ad-hoc. The researcher must present evidence to support the presence of consultative processes through which the executive seeks out inputs from citizens. Examples include public hearings, surveys, focus groups, report cards, and online platforms that government officials actively manage to solicit inputs.*

*Answer "c" applies if the executive has established a mechanism or mechanisms to allow citizens to provide input on budget implementation, but:*

1) *The mechanisms are not structured, happen only on ad-hoc basis, or not regularly.*

*and/or*

2) *The executive consults with and/or interacts with, citizens, but there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, and the executive determines fully or partially such selection process by inviting specific groups (for example by making an open call but just to experts from a particular sector, or naming specific organizations). While it is not possible for all citizens and/or CSOs to participate in this or other phases of the budget process, options "a" and "b" apply if the government does not exercise any discretion in determining who is allowed to participate. While there is likely going to be self-selection, it is important that the selection is not made by the executive.*

*In cases where there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, to select answer choice "c", the researcher must have evidence that the government is holding participation mechanisms that have some sort of public record (held in public, minutes of meetings released to public) so that all CSOs and members of the public can have knowledge of the meeting, who participated, and what was discussed.*

*Examples include hotlines, Facebook announcements, one-off meetings with NGOs in which there is a public record.*

*The researcher must present evidence to support selection of a "c" response.*

*Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget implementation stage.*

**Answer:**

c. Yes, the executive uses participation mechanisms during the budget implementation phase, but either these mechanisms capture only some ad-hoc views, or the executive invites specific individuals or groups for budget discussions (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).

**Source:**

-<https://www.mofea.gm/directorates/aid-coordination>  
-Interview with the Directorate of Budget (DoB) team, MoFEA-on March 27, 2023

**Comment:**

The Directorate of Budget (DoB) team, MoFEA, stated that "the MoFEA goes out with sectors (other ministries) to their intervention sites and discuss with beneficiaries (public) for feedbacks which are incorporated in the reports", there is however no solid proof provided to back up this claim.

The ones who are participated are the local government authorities, village and ward development committees, Technical Assistant Committee (TAC) of the different ministries, and selected community members.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Researcher Response**

These consultations do happened with civil society and the private sector over the past years and current, especially during the launching of the Citizens Budget, there are discussions centred on this. We have been engaged before. I couldn't find news report or reports from MOFEA's website to back this. Here is a link on MOFEA's Twitter: <https://twitter.com/MofeaGambia/status/1514553495969574912>

**129. With regard to the mechanism identified in question 128, does the executive take concrete steps to receive input from vulnerable and underrepresented parts of the population on the implementation of the annual budget?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*This question reflects the GIFT principle of "Inclusiveness", and examines the executive's effort to actively reach out to citizens who are from socially vulnerable groups and/or underrepresented in national processes. The emphasis here is on national government's efforts to obtain input from members of the public who are from socially vulnerable groups and/or underrepresented in national processes during the implementation of the annual budget.*

*To answer "a," the executive must actively seek out individuals from at least one vulnerable and underrepresented community and/or civil society organization representing vulnerable and underrepresented individuals and communities. The researcher must provide evidence to show the government's efforts and actions. The researcher must speak with the relevant government official(s), and subsequently double check with an alternative source, such as*

representatives from vulnerable/underrepresented groups.

Answer "b" applies if the national executive does not take concrete steps to incorporate vulnerable/underrepresented individuals, or organizations representing them, into participation mechanisms or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget implementation stage.

**Answer:**

b. The requirements for an "a" response are not met.

**Source:**

-Interview with the Directorate of Budget (DoB) team, MoFEA-on March 27, 2023  
-<https://www.mofea.gm/news>

**Comment:**

Based on the response from the DoB, MoFEA "uses MDAs as implementing institutions", which would mean that MDAs (but the MoFEA) are to take concrete steps to receive input from individuals and/or organizations representing vulnerable and underrepresented parts of the population on the implementation of the annual budget. However, there has been no proof provided by the MoFEA that shows beyond reasonable doubt that the executive takes "concrete steps to receive input" from the said groups or individuals at the implementation stage of the annual budget.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**130. During the implementation of the annual budget, which of the following topics does the executive's engagement with citizens cover?**

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:

1. Changes in macroeconomic circumstances
2. Delivery of public services
3. Collection of revenue
4. Implementation of social spending
5. Changes in deficit and debt levels
6. Implementation of public investment projects

**GUIDELINES:**

*This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Timeliness". Please consider all of the mechanisms currently used by the executive to promote public participation during the implementation of the annual budget.*

*Please note that while the public engagement can/may cover other topics -- and for this reason the other questions assessing the executive's engagement with the public during budget implementation can be answered on the basis of engagement on topics other than the six listed above -- for the purpose of answering this question, "key topics" are considered to be ONLY the ones listed above. If the executive's engagement with the public covers topics other than the six listed above, please specify these topics in the comments.*

*Note also that this question assesses only the coverage of public engagement (i.e., "what issues is the public invited to engage on?") and issues related to the depth of engagement or selectivity of engaged are not dealt with by this question.*

*If written materials about the public engagement, such as an invitation, do not specify the coverage of the public engagement, but the researcher has personally participated in the engagement, s/he may respond to this question based on firsthand experience of the coverage of the public engagement.*

*Answer "d" applies if requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget implementation stage.*

**Answer:**

c. The executive's engagement with citizens covers at least one (but less than three) of the above-mentioned topics.

**Source:**

-Interview with the Directorate of Budget (DoB) team, MoFEA-on March 27, 2023  
-https://www.mofea.gm

**Comment:**

According to the officials at the Directorate of Budget (DoB), including the Deputy Director at DoB, Mr. Alaye Barra, the executive's engagement with citizens covers four main topics namely:  
Changes in macroeconomic circumstances, Delivery of public services, Implementation of social spending and Implementation of public investment projects. There is however no solid proof provided to back up this claim.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question

**Comments:** I think that it is clearer before the approval of the annual budget. During execution I do not think that the engagement is as strong, but I have no evidence to disagree.

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**131. When the executive engages with the public, does it provide comprehensive prior information on the process of the engagement, so that the public can participate in an informed manner?**

**Comprehensive information must include at least three of the following elements:**

1. Purpose
2. Scope
3. Constraints
4. Intended outcomes
5. Process and timeline

**GUIDELINES:**

*This question relates to the GIFT principle of "Openness," and addresses whether the executive provides relevant information on the process of the engagement before public participation takes place, in order to help citizens engage effectively. The question addresses whether the "rules of the public engagement" are clearly spelled out, in advance and in detail, so that those members of the public who want to engage know how to do so, in terms of when they can do so, what they are expected to provide input on, by when, to whom, etc. This question does not cover the substance of the engagement, which is covered by questions 127 and 130.*

*Non-comprehensive information means that the government provides information that includes at least one but less than three of the elements listed above.*

*Purpose refers to a brief explanation of why the public engagement is being undertaken, including the executive's objectives for its engagement with the public.*

*Scope refers to what is within the subject matter of the engagement as well as what is outside the subject matter of the engagement. For example, the scope may include how a current policy is administered but exclude the specifics of the policies themselves.*

*Constraints refers to whether there are any explicit limitations on the engagement. An example of a constraint could be that any policy changes must not cost (or forgo revenue) more than a specific amount or have no net fiscal cost.*

*Intended outcomes refers to what the executive hopes to achieve as a result of the engagement. Examples of intended outcomes could be revising a policy to better reflect citizen or service-user views or to improve the way in which a particular program is administered.*

*Process refers to the methods by which the public engagement will take place and the discrete steps in the process. For example, the process may simply be a one-off Internet-based consultation, with a summary published of public inputs and the official response. The process may involve simultaneous or overlapping steps, and may be conducted in one round or in two or more rounds of engagement.*

*Timeline refers to the specific dates on which the discrete steps in the process will take place, or during which they will be completed, and clear start and end dates for the overall engagement.*

*Answer "d" applies if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget implementation or formulation stage.*

**Answer:**

c. Information is provided in a timely manner in both or one of the two phases, but it is not comprehensive.

**Source:**

-Interview with the Directorate of Budget (DoB) team, MoFEA-on March 27, 2023  
-<https://www.mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The Executive through its Budget Consultative workshop (see the comment on question 125) at the pre-budget stage (formulation) sends prior information to selected CSOs and media groups (representatives of the public) in a timely manner through invitation letters sent to invited participants.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Researcher Response**

I have a copy of the invitation letter, but for the CB Dialogue, to discuss the content of the 2022 budget and the second paragraph of the letter reads as follows: "Considering that citizens are the main beneficiaries of the Government budget, it is important that they have a thorough understanding of the National Budget to encourage active participation in the processes of budget formulation, execution and monitoring. Such participation allows citizens to highlight their aspirations and concerns towards our shared national development." So the purpose is broadly captured on the last sentence. The discussions are also beyond the content of the CB alone. The letter was dated April 11, 2022 and the event was to take place on April 14, 2022 (3 days notice) which in this case is short.

**IBP Comment**

After analyzing the invitation to CSOs and conducting a consistency check across countries, the original answer was changed from "b" to "c".

**132. With regard to the mechanism identified in question 125, does the executive provide the public with feedback on how citizens' inputs have been used in the formulation of the annual budget?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Sustainability", and examines the extent to which the executive provides information to citizens on which public inputs were received, which ones are used in the formulation of the annual budget, and how/why.*

*By "written record", we mean a document that is produced and released by the lead budget agency (Ministry of Finance, Treasury) that has set up and holds the participation activity.*

*Answer "a" applies when the executive provides a written document with:*

- *The inputs (e.g., a written transcript) received from the public and*
- *A detailed report on how the inputs were used or not used (such report should include information on which inputs were used or not used, why, and how)*

*Answer "b" applies when the executive provides a written document that includes:*

- *The inputs (e.g., a written transcript) received from the public and*
- *A not-so-detailed report, such as a document with a few paragraphs, on how public inputs were used or not used. This document only gives a general idea on how those inputs were used or not used.*

*Answer "c" applies when the executive provides a written document that includes:*

- *The inputs (e.g., a written transcript) received from the public or*
- *A report (being it detailed or not-so-detailed) on how public inputs have been used or not used.*

*Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the*

*budget formulation stage.*

**Answer:**

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

**Source:**

<https://www.mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

There is no such written record or report available on the MoFEA's official website.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Comments:** Even though public participation is involved in the process, there is no such written record or list of the inputs received or a report or summary on how the citizen inputs were used

**133. With regard to the mechanism identified in question 128, does the executive provide the public with information on how citizens' inputs have been used to assist in monitoring the implementation of the annual budget?**

*GUIDELINES:*

*This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Sustainability", and examines the extent to which the executive provides information to citizens on which public inputs were received during the implementation of the annual budget, which ones are taken into account to improve budget monitoring, and how/why.*

*By "written record", we mean a document that is produced and released by the lead budget agency (Ministry of Finance, Treasury) that has set up and holds the participation activity.*

*Answer "a" applies when the executive provides a written document with:*

- *The inputs (e.g., a written transcript) received from the public and*
- *A detailed report on how the inputs were used or not used (such report should include information on which inputs were used or not used, why, and how)*

*Answer "b" applies when the executive provides a written document that includes:*

- *The inputs received (e.g., a written transcript) from the public and*
- *A not-so-detailed report, such as a document with a few paragraphs, on how public inputs were used or not used. This document only gives a general idea on how those inputs were or were not taken into account by the executive during budget monitoring.*

*Answer "c" applies when the executive provides a written document that includes:*

- *The inputs (e.g., a written transcript) received from the public or*
- *A report (being it detailed or not-so-detailed) on how public inputs have been used or not used.*

*Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget implementation stage.*

**Answer:**

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

**Source:**



<https://www.mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

There is no such written record or report available on the MoFEA's official website.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**134. Are participation mechanisms incorporated into the timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*This question reflects the GIFT principles on "Sustainability," "Timeliness" and "Complementarity" and addresses whether the executive is able to link participation mechanisms to the administrative processes that are used to create the annual budget.*

*Please note that "timetable" refers to a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the Ministry of Finance or whatever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation. This document is sometimes referred to as the budget calendar and is the same document referenced in Question 53.*

*Answer "a" applies if the national executive establishes a clear set of guidelines that enable citizens and civil servants to understand when participation mechanisms should be used to enable citizen inputs to be incorporated into the annual budget. For answer choice "a", the timetable must be available to the public prior to the budget preparation process beginning.*

*Answer "b" applies if the executive does not establish a clear set of guidelines that enable citizens and civil servants to understand when participation mechanisms should be used to enable citizen inputs to be incorporated into the annual budget or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget formulation or implementation stage.*

**Answer:**

b. The requirements for an "a" response are not met.

**Source:**

<https://mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

The executive incorporates participation such as "Consultation with Civil Society Organizations (CSOs), Pre Budget-Consultation with Private sector, etc." into its timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal (Budget Calendar) and the timetable is available on the MoFEA's official website under the Budget Directorate.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question

**Comments:** I found the budget circular not the calendar. In the budget circular there is no explicit reference to the citizen's participation.

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Researcher Response**

I have checked again to verify but the budget calendar is missing on the website. Agree with the Peer Reviewer, the Call Circular does not include calendar engagement with the public

**IBP Comment**

Based on the comment provided by the peer reviewer and the second review conducted by the researcher, the original answer was changed from "a" to "b".

**135. Do one or more line ministries use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during the formulation or implementation of the annual budget?**

**GUIDELINES**

While questions 125 – 134 focus only on participation mechanisms that the Ministry of Finance, lead budget agency, or central coordinating agency currently use to allow the public to participate in the national budget process, this question asks about participation mechanisms used by line ministries to allow the public to participate in national budget processes. Thus, participation mechanisms used by the Ministry of Finance, lead budget agency, or central coordinating agency should not be used to answer this question. If there is more than one mechanism used by a line ministry or if multiple line ministries use participation mechanisms, please select the deepest or most interactive mechanism that reflects the government's efforts to incorporate citizens' input into the formulation and/or implementation of the annual budget.

This question reflects the GIFT principles on "Inclusiveness" and "Timeliness" and assesses the extent to which the participation mechanism(s) used by the executive are truly interactive and involve a two-way conversation between citizens and the executive.

The drafting of this question and its answers are partially drawn from the IAP2 Spectrum of Public Participation, in particular with regards to the concepts of "involvement" (option "a" in the responses) and "consultation" (option "b"). See:

[https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/foundations\\_course/IAP2\\_P2\\_Spectrum\\_FINAL.pdf](https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/foundations_course/IAP2_P2_Spectrum_FINAL.pdf)

To answer "a," a line ministry must use open participation mechanisms that involve the public in the formulation or implementation of the annual budget. This means that a public process is in place whereby CSOs and/or individual members of the public and government officials interact, and have the opportunity to express their opinions to each other in what can be considered a public dialogue between them (i.e., in-person and online discussion forums). Additionally, the mechanism should be open to any CSO and/or individual members of the public who wish to participate. By selecting this answer, the researcher must present evidence to support the presence of a public dialogue among citizens and government official. Examples include public meetings and online deliberative exchanges.

Answer "b" applies if an open consultation mechanism is in place whereby members of the public (i.e., individuals and/or CSOs as well as academics, independent experts, policy think tanks, and business organizations) can provide their input in the formulation or implementation of the annual budget. This answer applies if the government is using a mechanism that is structured and well established, and not ad-hoc. The researcher must present evidence to support the presence of consultative processes through which a line ministry seeks out inputs from citizens. Examples include surveys, focus groups, report cards, published policy consultation exercises, and online platforms that government officials actively manage to solicit inputs.

Answer "c" applies if a line ministry has established a mechanism or mechanisms to allow citizens to participate in the budget formulation phase, but:

1) The mechanisms are not structured and happen only on ad-hoc basis, or not regularly.

and/or

2) A line ministry consults with and/or interacts with, citizens, but there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, and the line ministry determines fully or partially such selection process by inviting specific groups (for example by making an open call but just to experts from a particular sector, or naming specific organizations). While it is not possible for all citizens and/or CSOs to participate in this or other phases of the budget process, options "a" and "b" apply if the government does not exercise any discretion in determining who is allowed to participate. While there is likely going to be self-selection, it is important that the selection is not made by the executive.

In cases where there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, to select answer choice "c", there should be some sort of public record (held in public, minutes of meetings released to public) so that all CSOs and individual members of the public can have knowledge of the meeting, who participated, and what was discussed.

The researcher must present evidence to support selection of a "c" response.

Examples of mechanisms that might qualify as a "c" response include hotlines, Facebook announcements, and one-off meetings with NGOs in which there is a public record.

**Answer:**

c. Yes, at least one line ministry uses participation mechanisms during the budget formulation or implementation phase, but either these mechanisms capture only some ad-hoc views, or the executive invites specific individuals or groups for budget discussions (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).

**Source:**

-Interview with the Directorate of Budget (DoB) team, MoFEA-on March 27, 2023  
-<https://www.mofea.gm/directorates/budget>

**Comment:**

Through regional consultations, MoFEA together with Key MDAs(Agriculture, health, education, infrastructure) hold consultations with LGAs to discuss the needs of respective constituents for inclusion in the upcoming budget. However, these regional consultations have not been done regularly and they are one-off meetings conducted in different local government areas where members of the public are engaged.

#### Peer Reviewer

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question

**Comments:** No evidence found.

#### Government Reviewer

**Opinion:** Disagree

**Suggested Answer:**

a. Yes, at least one line ministry uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public and government officials exchange views on the budget.

#### Researcher Response

The research team still goes with the comment that through regional consultations, MoFEA together with Key MDAs(Agriculture, health, education, infrastructure) hold consultations with LGAs to discuss the needs of respective constituents for inclusion in the upcoming budget. However, these regional consultations have not been done regularly and they are one-off meetings conducted in different local government areas where members of the public are engaged. Thus, the research team still goes for option "c".

#### IBP Comment

IBP appreciates the government reviewer's comment. However, no evidence was presented to support the suggested new answer. Considering the additional information provided by the researcher, the answer "c" is appropriate

**136. Does the legislature or the relevant legislative committee(s) hold public hearings and/or use other participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during its public deliberations on the formulation of the annual budget (pre-budget and/or approval stages)?**

#### GUIDELINES:

*This question reflects the GIFT principle on "Sustainability," "Transparency," and "Complementarity" and assesses the extent to which the participation mechanism(s) used by the legislature are interactive and involve a two-way conversation between citizens and the legislature, rather than being limited to allowing the public to attend or hear public budget deliberations.*

*Please consider participation mechanisms that the legislature (both in its whole institution or its relevant budget/public accounts/finance committees) has put in place and is using to allow the public to participate in their deliberations on the annual budget. This includes deliberations during the pre-budget phase (i.e., when the executive is still in the process of formulating the draft budget) and the budget discussions after the budget has been tabled to parliament and before it is approved. In the comment box, please specify during which stage of the budget cycle the legislature has put in place a public participation mechanism.*

*Mechanisms through which members of the public reach out to individual Members of Parliament as opposed to the legislature (both in its whole institution or its relevant budget/public accounts/finance committees) or unofficial hearings organized by a subset of committee members should not be considered in answering this question.*

*If there is more than one mechanism, please select a mechanism that best shows/reflects the legislature's efforts to incorporate citizens into the formulation of the annual budget. The participation mechanisms can involve a range of different issues, such as revenues, policy selection, and macro-fiscal planning (please note that the issue of coverage is covered in a subsequent question).*

*To answer "a," the legislature must hold public hearings where citizens are allowed to testify. This answer applies only if the legislature does not exercise discretion in determining which citizens and/or CSOs can testify (for example, participation takes place on a first-come-first-served basis).*

*Answer "b" should be selected if the following applies:*

- The legislature holds public hearings on the budget;*
- Testimony is not allowed from members of the public or CSOs; but*
- There are other means used by the legislature to receive and collect views from citizens and CSOs on the budget, and the legislature does not exercise discretion in determining which citizens and/or CSOs can provide input. The researcher must provide evidence to support the presence of those alternative processes through which the legislature seeks inputs from citizens. For example, there should be a public record indicating that views from citizens and the public were sought.*

*Answer "c" should be selected if the following applies:*

- The legislature holds public hearings on the budget;
- Testimony is not allowed from members of the public or CSOs;
- No other means are used by the legislature to receive and collect views/input from citizens and CSOs on the budget, but
- The legislature invites a few individuals/groups to provide input (through public hearings or elsewhere)
- The legislature has a provision (via standing orders or in law) through which the public can submit their inputs, and members of the public or CSOs actively use it to submit opinions on the budget.

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the legislature does not use public participation mechanisms during its deliberations on the annual budget

**Answer:**

c. Yes, public hearings on the budget are held. No testimony from the public is provided during the public hearings, and there are no other mechanisms through which public contributions are received, but the legislature invites specific individuals or groups to testify or provide input (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).

**Source:**

-<https://standard.gm/us-ambassador-tells-nams-they-bear-responsibility-for-govt-accountability/>  
 -<https://gainako.com/gambia-participates-trains-parliamentarians-on-budget-analysis/>  
 -Interview with Deputy Clerk, Mr. Kalifa M.M. Mbye, National Assembly - on Marh 29, 2023  
 -NA Standing Orders (National-Assembly-of-The-Gambia-2019-Edition-Amended-25th-June-2020.pdf [Standing Orders 103(6)(a, b) and 103(9)]  
<https://www.assembly.gm/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Revised-Standing-Orders-of-the->

**Comment:**

From November 14-16, 2022, the Legislature held a budget retreat to review the Executive Budget Proposal 2023 right after it was tabled at the National Assembly by the Minister of Finance.

During the budget retreat, civil society (like Gambia Participates) and external invited experts, participated in the review process, provided inputs and guidance, which were received by parliamentarians.

This is however not a public hearing as only invited participants could participate in this exercise.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

137. During the legislative deliberations on the annual budget (pre-budget or approval stages), which of the following key topics does the legislature's (or relevant legislative budget committee) engagement with citizens cover?

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:

1. Macroeconomic issues
2. Revenue forecasts, policies, and administration
3. Social spending policies
4. Deficit and debt levels
5. Public investment projects
6. Public services

**GUIDELINES:**

This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Timeliness". Please consider the range of mechanisms currently used by the legislature to promote public participation during legislative deliberations on the annual budget.

Please note that while the public engagement can/may cover other topics, for the purpose of answering this question, "key topics" are considered to be only the ones listed above. If the legislature's engagement with the public covers topics other than the six listed above, please specify these topics in the comments.

Note also that this question assesses only the coverage of public engagement (i.e., "what issues is the public invited to engage on?") and issues related to the depth of engagement or selectivity of engaged are not dealt with by this question.

If written materials about the public engagement, such as an invitation, do not specify the coverage of the public engagement, but the researcher has personally participated in the engagement, s/he may respond to this question based on firsthand experience of the coverage of the public engagement.

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the legislature does not use public participation mechanisms during its deliberations on the annual budget.

**Answer:**

a. The legislature seeks input on all six topics.

**Source:**

-<https://standard.gm/us-ambassador-tells-nams-they-bear-responsibility-for-govt-accountability/>

-<https://gainako.com/gambia-participates-trains-parliamentarians-on-budget-analysis/>

-Interview with Deputy Clerk, Mr. Kalifa M.M. Mbye, National Assembly - on Marh 29, 2023

-NA Budget Deliberation

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=9DrsPFS51h0>

**Comment:**

On November 14, 2022, right after the tabling of the 2023 Executive Budget Proposal, Parliamentarians engaged in a retreat to review the Executive Budget Proposal which covers all the above topics. External experts and civil society (like Gambia Participates) participated in the retreat providing technical guidance on certain proposed government expenditures, question to raise on revenue collections, debt, macroeconomic impact on the budget etc.

The researcher also have access to the budget retreat agenda which covers all the six topics.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**138. Does the legislature provide feedback to the public on how citizens' inputs have been used during legislative deliberations on the annual budget?**

**GUIDELINES:**

This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Sustainability", and examines the extent to which the legislature provides information to citizens on which public inputs were received and how inputs were used during legislative deliberations (please note that these deliberations can refer to the pre-budget and approval phases). By "written record" in this question, we mean a document that is produced and released by the legislature.

Answer "a" applies when the legislature provides a written document with:

- The inputs received from the public (e.g., a written transcript) and
- A detailed report on how the inputs were used or not used (such report should include information on which inputs were used or not used, why, and how).

Answer "b" applies when the legislature provides a written document that includes:

- The inputs received from the public (e.g., a written transcript) and
- A not-so-detailed report on how public inputs were used or not used. This document only gives a general idea on how those inputs were used or not used in legislative deliberations on the annual budget (please note that these deliberations refer to the pre-budget and approval phases).

Answer "c" applies when the legislature makes available a video recording of the relevant legislative session or provides a written document that includes:

- The inputs received from the public (e.g., a written transcript) or
- A report (being it detailed or not-so-detailed) on how public inputs have been used or not used.

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the legislature does not use public participation mechanisms during its deliberations on the annual budget.

**Answer:**

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

**Source:**

-<https://www.assembly.gm/>

-Interview with Deputy Clerk, Mr. Kalifa M.M. Mbye, National Assembly - on March 29, 2023

**Comment:**

The legislature does not provide updates to citizens specifically how their inputs are used on the budget. The parliament only publishes the budget deliberation records and the FPAC report on the Executive Budget Proposal.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**139. Does the legislature hold public hearings and/or use other participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during its public deliberations on the Audit Report?**

*GUIDELINES:*

*This question reflects the GIFT principle on "Sustainability," "Transparency," and "Complementarity" and assesses the extent to which the participation mechanism(s) used by the legislature are interactive and involve a two-way conversation between citizens and the legislature, rather than being limited to allowing the public to attend or hear public budget deliberations.*

*A key constitutional role of the legislature in almost all countries is to oversee the government's management of public resources. While the Supreme Audit Institution is responsible for checking the government's accounts and publishing the outcome of their audits, for accountability purposes it is essential that the legislature reviews and scrutinizes those reports, and checks on whether the executive is taking the appropriate corrective actions based on the Supreme Audit Institution's recommendations.*

*Holding public hearings to review audit findings allows the public to learn more about how the government has managed its resources for the budget years that have ended, and demand accountability in case of mismanagement and irregularities. Reviewing and discussing those reports in public is therefore a key responsibility of a legislature.*

*Please note that by "Audit Report" we refer to the same audit report assessed in the transparency section of this Survey, i.e., one of the eight key budget documents that all governments (in this case, the Supreme Audit Institution) must produce, according to best practice.*

*Please consider participation mechanisms that the legislature (both in its whole institution or its relevant budget/public accounts/finance committees) have put in place and using to allow the public to participate in their deliberations on the Audit Report.*

*Mechanisms through which members of the public reach out to individual members of parliament as opposed to the legislature (both in its whole institution or its relevant budget/public accounts/finance committees) or unofficial hearings organized by a subset of committee members should not be considered in answering this question.*

*To answer "a," the national legislature must hold public hearings where citizens are allowed to testify. This answer applies only if the legislature does not exercise discretion in determining which citizens and/or CSOs can testify (for example, participation takes place on a first-come-first-served basis).*

*Answer "b" should be selected if the following applies:*

- *The legislature holds public hearings on the budget;*
- *No testimony is allowed from the public; BUT*
- *There are other means used by the legislature to receive and collect views from citizens and CSOs on the budget, and the legislature does not exercise discretion in determining which citizens and/or CSOs can provide input. The researcher must provide evidence to support the presence of those alternative processes through which the legislature seeks inputs from citizens. For example, there should be a public record indicating that views from*

*citizens and the public were sought.*

Answer "c" should be selected if the following applies:

- The legislature holds public hearings on the budget;
- No testimony is allowed from the public;
- No other means are used by the legislature to receive and collect views/input from citizens and CSOs on the budget, BUT
- The legislature invites a few individuals/groups to provide input (through public hearings or elsewhere)

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the legislature does not use public participation mechanisms during its deliberations on the Audit Report.

**Answer:**

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

**Source:**

-Interview with Deputy Clerk, Mr. Kalifa M.M. Mbye, National Assembly - on March 29, 2023  
-<https://www.assembly.gm/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Revised-Standing-Orders-of-the-National-Assembly-of-The-Gambia-2019-Edition-Amended-25th-June-2020.pdf>  
Standing Orders 103(6)(a, b) and 103(9)

**Comment:**

Though the legislative session on the deliberation of the audit report is public and the public can attend the sessions and the National Assembly, however, there are little or no opportunities for the public to provide input during the hearing on the Audit Report.

The Finance and Public Accounts Committee do invite specific expert and expert witness to testify where necessary.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**140. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can suggest issues/topics to include in the SAI's audit program (for example, by bringing ideas on agencies, programs, or projects that could be audited)?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*This question assesses whether the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has established mechanisms through which the public can provide suggestions on issues/topics to be included in its audit program. When deciding its audit agenda, the SAI may undertake audits for a sample of agencies, projects, and programs in the country; and such a selection could be based on complaints and suggestions made by members of the public. To receive such suggestions, the SAI may create formal mechanisms, like setting up a website, hotline, or office (or assigning staff to liaise with the public).*

*Please note that formal mechanisms that do not explicitly seek the public's input in the audit program (such as general comment submission boxes on the SAI's website) should not be considered for this question.*

**Answer:**

a. Yes, the SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can suggest issues/topics to include in its audit program.

**Source:**

-Interview with Ms. Binta Touray, Communications Specialist, National Audit Office (NAO) - on March 29, 2023  
-<https://nao.gm/contact/>

**Comment:**

"Yes, the NAO in 2022 enhanced its feedback form on its website to include suggestions from the public on potential audit areas (relating to the use and management of public resources). The platform is named the 'citizens feedback portal' (Ms. Binta Touray, 2023).

Through the "Contact" page on NAOs website, any citizen can suggest audit topics that could be incorporated by NAO in its audit program.

**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: none

**141. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) provide the public with feedback on how citizens' inputs have been used to determine its audit program?**

*GUIDELINES:*

*This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Sustainability", and examines the extent to which the Supreme Audit Institution provides information to citizens on which public inputs were received, which ones are used to determine the Supreme Audit Institution's audit program. By "written record" in this question, we mean a document that is produced and released by the Supreme Audit Institution.*

*Answer "a" applies when the Supreme Audit Institution provides a written document with:*

- *The inputs received from the public and*
- *A detailed report on how the inputs were used or not used (such report should include information on which inputs were used or not used, why, and how).*

*Answer "b" applies when the SAI provides a written document that includes:*

- *The inputs received from the public and*
- *A not-so-detailed report on how public inputs were used or not used. This document only gives a general idea on how those inputs were used or not used to determine the SAI's annual audit program.*

*Answer "c" applies when the SAI provides a written document that includes:*

- *The received from the public or*
- *A report (being it detailed or not-so-detailed) on how public inputs have been used or not used.*

*Answer "d" applies if requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can suggests issues/topics to include in the SAI's audit program.*

**Answer:**

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

**Source:**

-Interview with Ms. Binta Touray, Communications Specialist, National Audit Office (NAO) - on March 29, 2023  
-<https://nao.gm/other-publications/>

**Comment:**

"No, the office does not currently provide feedback on how citizens' input has been used to determine an audit program. What we do especially for performance audit exercises and other 'special audits', is to state on the reports the factors that contributed to the office choosing a particular performance audit topic – thus, for most of the PA reports where this applies, we would mention that the public outcry or interest was a motivational factor for choosing to conduct that particular audit topic, amongst other factors. The public input is mostly sourced from monitoring of



media spaces and general public discourse on public service delivery. "(Ms. Binta Touray, 2023).  
However, a written report stating the exact inputs provided by the public and how those inputs were used is not provided.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: agree Comment: none

**142. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can contribute to audit investigations (as respondents, witnesses, etc.)?**

**GUIDELINES:**

*This question mirrors question 140, but instead of covering public assistance in formulating the SAI's audit program, it focuses on whether the Supreme Audit Institution has established mechanisms through which the public can participate in audit investigations. In addition to seeking public input to determine its audit agenda, the SAI may wish to provide formal opportunities for the public and civil society organizations to participate in the actual audit investigations, as witnesses or respondents.*

**Answer:**

b. The requirements for an "a" response are not met.

**Source:**

Interview with Ms. Binta Touray, Communications Specialist, National Audit Office (NAO) - on March 29, 2023

<https://nao.gm/contact/>

**Comment:**

Although, NAO does not maintain any formal mechanisms through which the public can contribute to its audit investigations as respondents or witnesses. However, there have been special instances where the public through CSOs provided reports as leads to the NAO to contribute to its audit investigations.

The NAO website also have a feature in which citizens can contribute on to its audit program. For example, on its "Contact Us" page, there is an option to select the subject "Use and management of public resource (Potential Audit Area/Topic).

Through this formal mechanism, the NAO collects citizens input to inform its audit topic.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** I choose not to review this question

**Comments:** It is not clear if this qualifies as a "formal" mechanism.

**Government Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**Researcher Response**

Seeing as the source came from the SAI itself, then the research team agrees to their statement that "There is no formal mechanism."

**IBP Comment**

Within the framework of the Open Budget Survey 2023, a new pilot review has been developed to incorporate the inputs of a subset of Supreme Audit Institutions. In addition to the feedback provided by the government reviewer from the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, IBP has sought

input on a subset of indicators of the survey questionnaire from the Supreme Audit Institution (National Audit Office of The Gambia), during the research process. We are including the comment below, along with the SAI's agreement or disagreement with the researcher's suggested response, and the final IBP decision after the additional input. Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) review: disagree Comment: There is no formal mechanism. IBP comment: Considering the peer reviewer and the National Audit Office of The Gambia's comments, the correct answer should be "b" instead of "a".