

Open Budget Survey 2023

Questionnaire

Malaysia

May 2024

Country Questionnaire: Malaysia

PBS-1. What is the fiscal year of the PBS evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer:

FY 2023

Source:

(a) 2023 Pre-Budget Statement

<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/siaran-media/Pre-Budget-Statement-2023.pdf>

Comment:

The Treasury published a Pre-Budget Statement in June 2022 that contained some macroeconomic forecasts and a general discussion of expenditure policies and priorities. The document however did not provide estimated aggregate amounts for total expenditure, revenue, or debt for the budget year and multi-year period.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: We agreed on the FY 2023, however, we suggest to amend the comments to as follows: "The Treasury published a Pre-Budget Statement in June 2022 that contained some macroeconomic forecasts and a general discussion of expenditure policies and priorities which shares the direction and focus of the 2023 Budget. From the fiscal perspectives, actual performance of expenditure, revenue, and debt as at end-April 2022 are provided in the document."

PBS-2. When is the PBS made available to the public?

Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.

The OBS methodology requires that for a PBS to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is submitted to the legislature for consideration. If the PBS is not released to the public at least one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is submitted to the legislature for consideration, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the PBS.

Answer:

a. At least four months in advance of the budget year, and at least one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is introduced in the legislature

Source:

(a) Media Statement by the Minister of Finance on the release of the PBS: "Budget 2023: Strengthening Recovery, Facilitating Reforms Towards Sustainable Socio-Economic Resilience of Keluarga Malaysia": <https://mof.gov.my/portal/en/news/budget2023/prebudget-2023-statement>

(b) 2023 Pre-Budget Statement

<https://mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/siaran-media/Pre-Budget-Statement-2023.pdf>

Comment:

The PBS was made publicly available on 3 June 2022 and disseminated via a media statement. The Executive's Budget Proposal was introduced in the legislative assembly on 7 October 2022. The fiscal year begins on 1 January 2023, such that the PBS was published more than 1 month before the EBP, and more than 4 months before the beginning of the fiscal year.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Both sources cited have been verified and confirmed. Indeed, this represents a new trend in Malaysia showing the government's willingness to align the budgetary system with international best practices.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

PBS-3a. If the PBS is published, what is the date of publication of the PBS?

Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.

Answer:

3/6/2022

Source:

(a) Media Statement by the Minister of Finance on the release of the PBS: "Budget 2023: Strengthening Recovery, Facilitating Reforms Towards Sustainable Socio-Economic Resilience of Keluarga Malaysia" <https://mof.gov.my/portal/en/news/budget2023/prebudget-2023-statement>

(b) 2023 Pre-Budget Statement

<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/siaran-media/Pre-Budget-Statement-2023.pdf>

Comment:

The press statement confirms that the PBS 2023 was published online and also disseminated on 3 June 2022.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: As noted under Q #2

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

PBS-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the PBS.

If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

The publication date of the PBS was determined by referring to the date stated in the document itself, as well as the date of the accompanying media statement announcing its release.

Source:

(a) Media Statement by the Minister of Finance on the release of the PBS: "Budget 2023: Strengthening Recovery, Facilitating Reforms Towards Sustainable Socio-Economic Resilience of Keluarga Malaysia"
<https://mof.gov.my/portal/en/news/budget2023/prebudget-2023-statement>

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The document does contain the PBS publication date.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

PBS-4. If the PBS is published, what is the URL or weblink of the PBS?

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.

Answer:

<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/siaran-media/Pre-Budget-Statement-2023.pdf>

Source:

(a) 2023 Pre-Budget Statement

<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/siaran-media/Pre-Budget-Statement-2023.pdf>

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

PBS-5. If the PBS is published, are the numerical data contained in the PBS available in a machine readable format?

Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) or HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>

Option "d" applies if the PBS is not publicly available, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.

Answer:

c. No

Source:

(a) 2023 Pre-Budget Statement

<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/siaran-media/Pre-Budget-Statement-2023.pdf>

Comment:

The PBS is a PDF document with a written narrative on the macroeconomic outlook and policy themes adopted by the government. There is no machine readable data provided.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: As above. The PBS document is publicly available but in pdf format.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

PBS-6a. If the PBS is not publicly available, is it still produced?

If the PBS is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question PBS-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.

Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question PBS-2)

Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.

Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.

Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.

Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.

If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.

Answer:

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Source:

(a) 2023 Pre-Budget Statement

<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/siaran-media/Pre-Budget-Statement-2023.pdf>

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

PBS-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question PBS-6a, please specify how you determined whether the PBS was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question PBS-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

n/a

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

PBS-7. If the PBS is produced, please write the full title of the PBS.

For example, a title for the Pre-Budget Statement could be "Proposed 2023 State Budget" or "Guidelines for the Preparation of Annual Plan and Budget for 2022/23."

If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

"2023 Pre-Budget Statement"

Source:

(a) 2023 Pre-Budget Statement

<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/siaran-media/Pre-Budget-Statement-2023.pdf>

Comment:

No comments.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

PBS-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the PBS?

While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see:

<https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>

Answer:

b. No

Source:

(a)<https://www.facebook.com/100064624604120/posts/pfbid02M26okXyF4nXcLQG8gnTUooszWJP417d9voPyCD29BzJz5hrEUVbPyidBcEokFqUuXI/?d=w&mibextid=qC1gEa>

3 Bidang Khusus Dalam Kenyataan Pra-Bajet 2023 (3 Key Topics in the PBS 2023)

(b) <https://www.facebook.com/KemKewangan/posts/pfbid025JrsmQtsP2Nr7hzBQq5NesF9rEyVo3ePwj22yWVepQHbooXsm717YJs5k7QVgWDcl>
3 Aspek Utama Dalam Kenyataan Pra-Bajet 2023 (3 Main Aspects in the PBS 2023)

Comment:

The infographic provided by the Ministry of Finance shows the key topics of the PBS. They were published on 8th and 9th June 2023.

These infographics indicates the topics of the 2023 PBS which was released on 3 June 2022. The caption provided with the infographics also calls for the member of the public to provide comments and inputs for the upcoming budget.

The infographics publicise the PBS and call for comments, but do not convey information that can be considered a citizen's version of the PBS.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The published PBS is intended to be accessed by everyone including analysts and citizens.

EBP-1a. What is the fiscal year of the EBP evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer:

FY 2022

Source:

No sources.

Comment:

FY 2022 was selected instead of FY 2023 because there was no full budget passed in 2022 for FY 2023. Parliament was dissolved on 10 October 2022 before the budget for FY 2023 could be debated and passed, although an EBP had been tabled a few days before, on 7 October 2022.

In December 2022, the new government used a transitional procedure that enabled the approval of a portion of operating expenditures by the legislature. The government then tabled a new EBP on 24 February 2023, which falls after the research cut off date. Therefore the EBP (and EB) for FY 2023 cannot be assessed in a meaningful way.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Given that Malaysia's budget for FY 2023 departs from typical EBP process and timelines, evaluating EBP for FY 2022 is a sensible idea.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EBP-1b. When is the EBP submitted to the legislature for consideration?

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.

Answer:

29/10/2021

Source:

(a) Budget Speech 2022
<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/bs22.pdf>

(b) Finance Bill 2021 Tabled in Parliament (Media Release)
<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/ms/berita/akhbar/rang-undang-undang-kewangan-2021-dibentang-di-dewan-rakyat#:~:text=Rang>

Comment:

The Minister of Finance delivered the budget speech on Friday 29 October 2021 and tabled the Supply Bill in parliament at the same time. The Finance Bill containing taxation measures linked to the budget was tabled on 9 November 2021.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: This can also be checked via additional sources, as below: <https://budget.mof.gov.my/en/2022/>
<https://www.thestar.com.my/news/nation/2021/10/29>

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EBP-2. When is the EBP made available to the public?

Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.

The OBS methodology requires that for an EBP to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public while the legislature is still considering it and before the legislature approves (enacts) it. If the EBP is not released to the public before the legislature approves it, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the EBP.

The OBS definition of an Executive's Budget Proposal is a document(s) that (i) the executive submits to the legislature as a formal part of the budget approval process and (ii) the legislature either approves or on which it approves proposed amendments.

The OBS will treat the Executive's Budget Proposal as "Not Produced," in the following cases:

- *The executive does not submit the draft budget to the legislature; or*
- *The legislature receives the draft budget but does not approve it or does not approve recommendations on the draft budget;*
- *The legislature rejects the draft budget submitted by the executive, but the executive implements it without legislative approval; or*
- *There is no legislature, or the legislature has been dissolved.*

Answer:

b. At least two months, but less than three months, in advance of the budget year, and in advance of the budget being approved by the legislature

Source:

(a) Budget Speech 2022
<https://budget.mof.gov.my/en/2022/>

(b) Parliament Schedule (Takwim) for week of 25 - 29 October 2021
https://www.parlimen.gov.my/images/webuser/notis/Takwim%20Parlimen%20Bagi%20Penggal%20Keempat%20Parlimen%20Ke-14%20Tahun%202021_16-07-2021.pdf

Comment:

The EBP was made available to the public on the day the Minister of Finance delivered his speech and tabled the document in Parliament on 29 October 2021. The 2022 Budget underwent its final reading and vote in Parliament on 21 December 2021.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

EBP-3a. If the EBP is published, what is the date of publication of the EBP?

Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.

In the comment boxes below, researchers should also list any supporting documents to the EBP and their date of publication.

Answer:

29/10/2021

Source:

(a) Budget Speech 2022

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/en/2022/>

(b) Parliament Schedule (Takwim) for week of 25 - 29 October 2021

https://www.parlimen.gov.my/images/webuser/notis/Takwim%20Parlimen%20Bagi%20Penggal%20Keempat%20Parlimen%20Ke-14%20Tahun%202021_16-07-2021.pdf

Comment:

EBP was published when the Minister of Finance delivered his budget speech on 29 October 2021.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

EBP-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the EBP.

If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

The budget 2022 website hosted the 2022 EBP documents. Based on researcher observation, the publication of the EBP was on the same day when the Minister of Finance delivered the budget speech, which was on 29 October 2021.

Based on 5-6 sample checks of the EBP document set available on the website, every pdf document loaded showed its date of creation and last date of modification as 29 October 2021, which indicates the likelihood that the documents were created and uploaded together on that date.

Source:

(a) Budget Speech 2022

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/en/2022/>

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EBP-4. If the EBP is published, what is the URL or weblink of the EBP?

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.

In the comment boxes below, researchers should also list any supporting documents to the EBP and their URL or weblink.

Answer:

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/en/2022/> <https://budget.mof.gov.my/en/2022/>

Source:

i) <https://budget.mof.gov.my/en/2022/>

ii) <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/en/archive3>

iii) <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/ms/berita/ucapan/rang-undang-undang-perbekalan-2022>

iv) Parliament archives - <https://www.parlimen.gov.my/bills-dewan-rakyat.html?uweb=dr&arkib=yes>

Finance Bill 2021 (for 2022) - <https://www.parlimen.gov.my/files/billindex/pdf/2021/D.R%2012%20-%20BM.pdf>

Supply Bill 2022 - https://www.parlimen.gov.my/files/billindex/pdf/2021/DR%209_2021%20-%20bm-merged.pdf

Comment:

The Budget Speech, Estimates of Federal Expenditure, Fiscal Outlook & Estimates of Federal Revenue, and Economic Outlook are available on the Budget 2022 site and the archive of the Ministry of Finance website.

The 2022 Supply Bill and Finance Bill 2021 (which is the corresponding bill on taxation for the Budget Year 2022) are currently available in parliament's archive. The Bills would also have been available in Parliament's List of Bills during the year the bills were tabled and passed.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Verified and confirmed.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EBP-5. If the EBP is published, are the numerical data contained in the EBP or its supporting documents available in a machine readable format?

Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) and HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>.

Option "d" applies if the EBP is not publicly available, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.

Answer:

c. No

Source:

<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/en/economy/fiscal-economic-data>

Comment:

The available information and data shown on the website is only up to the estimates of 2021. A machine readable format which includes updated budget information is not available on the Ministry of Finance website.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The budget documents available in the Ministry of Finance website are all in pdf format.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format

Researcher Response

Based on the documents available on <https://belanjawan.mof.gov.my/ms/2022>, there is no data provided in machine readable format for the EBP. All files are provided in pdf format. Some machine readable data is available for past years, but not for the budget period.

EBP-6a. If the EBP is not publicly available, is it still produced?

If the EBP is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question EBP-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.

Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question EBP-2).

Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.

Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.

Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.

Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.

If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.

Answer:

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Source:

(a) Budget Speech 2022

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/en/2022/>

Comment:**Peer Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

EBP-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question EBP-6a, please specify how you determined whether the EBP was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question EBP-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

n/a

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

EBP-7. If the EBP is produced, please write the full title of the EBP.

For example, a title for the Executive's Budget Proposal could be "Draft Estimates of Revenue and Expenditure for BY 2022-23, produced by the Ministry of Finance, Planning and Economic Development."

If there are any supporting documents to the EBP, please enter their full titles in the comment box below.

If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

Malaysia's EBP consists of several documents. Refer to comments for the full list.

Source:

i) <https://budget.mof.gov.my/en/2022/>

ii) <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/en/archive3>

iii) https://www.parlimen.gov.my/files/billindex/pdf/2021/DR%209_2021%20-%20bm-merged.pdf

iv) <https://www.parlimen.gov.my/files/billindex/pdf/2021/D.R%2012%20-%20BM.pdf>

Comment:

(i) Expenditure: Anggaran Perbelanjaan Persekutuan 2022 (Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022)

(ii) Revenue: Tinjauan Fiskal dan Anggaran Hasil Kerajaan Persekutuan 2022 (Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022)

(iii) Supporting budget documents which provide additional information on revenue, expenditure, fiscal assumption, borrowing and debt:

a) Rang Undang-Undang Perbekalan 2022 (Supply Bill 2022)

b) Teks Ucapan Bajet 2022 (Budget Speech 2022)

c) Tinjauan Ekonomi 2022 (Economic Outlook 2022)

d) Rang Undang-undang Kewangan 2021 (Finance Bill 2021)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The researcher has provided the full list of relevant documents.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EBP-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the EBP?

While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see: <https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>.

Answer:

a. Yes

Source:

(a) Budget 2022 Touchpoints

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/touchpoints-en.pdf>

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion:

Comments: While I do agree with the researcher that the 2022 Budget Touchpoints made available in the Ministry of Finance website can rightly be regarded as a 'citizen version' of the budget, a qualification is in order. Budget documents in Malaysia are not made public at each and every stage of the budget cycle. Touchpoints are made available only after the budget is finalized and tabled in the Parliament.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-1a. What is the fiscal year of the EB evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer:

FY 2022

Source:

No sources.

Comment:

FY 2022 was selected instead of FY 2023 because there was no full budget passed in 2022 for FY 2023. Parliament was dissolved on 10 October 2022 before the budget for FY 2023 could be debated and passed, although an EBP had been tabled a few days before, on 7 October 2022.

In December 2022, the new government used a transitional procedure that enabled the approval of a portion of operating expenditures by the legislature. The government then tabled a new EBP on 24 February 2023, which falls after the research cut off date. Therefore the EBP (and EB) for FY 2023 cannot be assessed in a meaningful way.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-1b. When was the EB approved (enacted) by the legislature?

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.

Answer:

13/12/2021

Source:

(a) <https://www.parlimen.gov.my/bills-dewan-rakyat.html?uweb=dr&arkib=yes>

(b) <https://www.nst.com.my/news/nation/2021/12/753991/dewan-rakyat-passes-2022-budget>

(c) <https://www.thestar.com.my/news/nation/2021/12/21/dewan-negara-approves-budget-2022>

(d) <https://www.freemalaysiatoday.com/category/nation/2021/12/15/dewan-rakyat-passes-finance-bill-2021/>

(e) <https://www.malaymail.com/news/malaysia/2021/12/23/dewan-negara-unanimously-passes-finance-bill-2021/2030639>

Comment:

The Supply Bill 2022 was passed by Dewan Rakyat (the House of Representatives) on 13 December 2021 and by Dewan Negara (the Senate) on 21 December 2021.

The Finance Bill 2021 was passed by the Dewan Rakyat (the House of Representatives) on 15 December 2021 and by the Dewan Negara (the Senate) on 23 December 2021.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: I choose not to review this question

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-2. When is the EB made available to the public?

Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.

The OBS methodology requires that for an EB to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public three months after the budget is

approved by the legislature. If the EB is not released to the public at least three months after the budget is approved by the legislature, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the EB.

Answer:

b. Between two weeks and six weeks after the budget has been enacted

Source:

(a) <https://lom.agc.gov.my/act-view.php?type=amendment&lang=BI&act=A1638>

(b) <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/en/budget/enacted-budget>

(c) https://lom.agc.gov.my/ilims/upload/portal/akta/outputaktap/1719465_BI/ACT%20833.pdf

Comment:

The Supply Act 2022 (Act 1638) was gazetted on 30 December 2021 and has been available on the Attorney General website since then (Source a). It is also available on the MOF portal under the section "Enacted Budget 2022" (Source b).

The Finance Act 2021 (Act 833) was gazetted on 31 December 2021 and has been available on the Attorney General website since then (Source c).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-3a. If the EB is published, what is the date of publication of the EB?

Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.

Answer:

30/12/2021 30/12/2021

Source:

(a) <https://lom.agc.gov.my/act-view.php?type=amendment&lang=BI&act=A1638>

(b) https://lom.agc.gov.my/ilims/upload/portal/akta/outputaktap/1719465_BI/ACT%20833.pdf

Comment:

The Supply Act 2022 (Act 1638) was gazetted on 30 December 2021 and has been available on the Attorney General website since then (Source a).

The Finance Act 2021 (Act 833) was gazetted on 31 December 2021 and has been available on the Attorney General website since then (Source b).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the EB.

If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

I went to the website of the Attorney General's Office to check whether and when the Supply Act 2022 and the Finance Act 2021 was gazetted.

Various news outlets and tax consultancy firms also published news and information on the gazetted Finance Act 2021. I went to the website of the Attorney General's Office to check whether and when the Supply Act 2022 and the Finance Act 2021 was gazetted.

Various news outlets and tax consultancy firms also published news and information on the gazetted Finance Act 2021.

Source:

(a) <https://lom.agc.gov.my/act-view.php?type=amendment&lang=BI&act=A1638>

(b) https://lom.agc.gov.my/ilims/upload/portal/akta/outputaktap/1719465_BI/ACT%20833.pdf

(c) <https://news.bloombergtax.com/daily-tax-report-international/tax-changes-in-malaysias-2022-budget>

Comment:

The Supply Act 2022 (Act 1638) was gazetted on 30 December 2021 and has been available on the Attorney General website since then (Source a).

The Finance Act 2021 (Act 833) was gazetted on 31 December 2021 and has been available on the Attorney General website since then (Source b). This is also confirmed by other sources (Source c).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Verified and confirmed.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-4. If the EB is published, what is the URL or weblink of the EB?

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.

Answer:

<https://lom.agc.gov.my/act-view.php?type=amendment&lang=BI&act=A1638> (b)

https://lom.agc.gov.my/ilims/upload/portal/akta/outputaktap/1719465_BI/ACT%20833.pdf

Source:

(a) <https://lom.agc.gov.my/act-view.php?type=amendment&lang=BI&act=A1638>

(b) https://lom.agc.gov.my/ilims/upload/portal/akta/outputaktap/1719465_BI/ACT%20833.pdf

Comment:

The links cited above go to the Supply Act 2022 (Source a) and the Finance Act 2021 (Source b).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

EB-5. If the EB is published, are the numerical data contained in the EB available in a machine readable format?

Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) and HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>

Option "d" applies if the EB is not publicly available, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.

Answer:

c. No

Source:

(a) <https://lom.agc.gov.my/act-view.php?type=amendment&lang=BI&act=A1638>

(b) https://lom.agc.gov.my/ilims/upload/portal/akta/outputaktap/1719465_BI/ACT%20833.pdf

(c) <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/en/budget/enacted-budget>

Comment:

The EB is only available in PDF format.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

EB-6a. If the EB is not publicly available, is it still produced?

If the EB is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question EB-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.

Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question EB-2)

Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.

Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.

Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.

Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.

If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.

Answer:

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Source:

(a) <https://lom.agc.gov.my/act-view.php?type=amendment&lang=BI&act=A1638>

(b) https://lom.agc.gov.my/ilims/upload/portal/akta/outputaktap/1719465_BI/ACT%20833.pdf

(c) <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/en/budget/enacted-budget>

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question EB-6a, please specify how you determined whether the EB was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question EB-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

n/a

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-7. If the EB is produced, please write the full title of the EB.

For example, a title for the Enacted Budget could be "Appropriation Act n. 10 of 2023."

If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

Supply Act 2022

Finance Act 2021 Supply Act 2022

Finance Act 2021

Source:

(a) <https://lom.agc.gov.my/act-view.php?type=amendment&lang=BI&act=A1638>

(b) https://lom.agc.gov.my/ilims/upload/portal/akta/outputaktap/1719465_BI/ACT%20833.pdf

Comment:
No comments.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

EB-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the EB?

While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see: <https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>.

Answer:
a. Yes

Source:
(a) Budget 2022 Infographic Flipbook
<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/infografik/>

Comment:
The Ministry of Finance published the Budget 2022 Infographic flipbook as a simplified version of the budget speech and other budget documents, listing out the major programmes and initiatives included in the budget. It can be considered a citizens' version of the EB.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

CB-1. What is the fiscal year of the CB evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, for each CB please indicate the document the CB simplifies/refers to, and the fiscal year.

Answer:
FY 2022

Source:
(a) Budget 2022 official website
<https://budget.mof.gov.my/en/2022/>

(b) Budget 2022 Touchpoints

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/touchpoints-en.pdf>

(c) Budget 2022 Infographics

November 5, 2021:

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456462612669997066>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456468579826618368>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456465340548878342>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467218586234880>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464319638433794>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456465663883558918>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467870150389761>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464065618870278>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467550871515140>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464692394684416>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456468246341640197>

November 9, 2021:

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1468750504977043456>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1468749812677840900>

Comment:

FY 2022 was selected instead of FY 2023 because there was no full budget passed in 2022 for FY 2023. Parliament was dissolved on 10 October 2022 before the budget for FY 2023 could be debated and passed, although an EBP had been tabled a few days before, on 7 October 2022.

In December 2022, the new government used a transitional procedure that enabled the approval of a portion of operating expenditures by the legislature. The government then tabled a new EBP on 24 February 2023, which falls after the research cut off date. Therefore the EBP (and EB) for FY 2023 cannot be assessed in a meaningful way. This issue also applies to the CB.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

CB-2a. For the fiscal year indicated in CB-1, what is the public availability status of the CB?

If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document (Executive's Budget Proposal or Enacted Budget) you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budget is produced and its public availability status.

Remember that publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.

Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology

Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.

Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.

Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.

Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.

Answer:

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Source:

(a) Budget 2022 official website

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/en/2022/>

(b) Budget 2022 Touchpoints
<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/touchpoints-en.pdf>

(c) Budget 2022 Infographics
November 5, 2021:
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456462612669997066>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456468579826618368>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456465340548878342>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467218586234880>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464319638433794>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456465663883558918>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467870150389761>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464065618870278>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467550871515140>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464692394684416>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456468246341640197>

November 9, 2021:
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1468750504977043456>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1468749812677840900>

Comment:
The Budget 2022 Touchpoints can be found on the Budget's official website. Budget 2022 infographics can be found on the official Twitter account of the Ministry of Finance. The Touchpoints and infographics present key information contained in Budget 2022 in a simplified manner catering to the general public audience.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

CB-2b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question CB-2a, please specify how you determined whether the CB was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question CB-2a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:
n/a

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

CB-3a. If the CB is published, what is the date of publication of the CB?

Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.

If more than one Citizens Budget is published, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budget is produced and its dates of publication.

Answer:

29/10/2021

Source:

(a) Budget 2022 official website

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/en/2022/>

(b) Budget 2022 Touchpoints

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/touchpoints-en.pdf>

(c) Former budget 2022 weblink

<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/en/budget>

(d) Budget 2022 Infographics

November 5, 2021:

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456462612669997066>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456468579826618368>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456465340548878342>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467218586234880>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464319638433794>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456465663883558918>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467870150389761>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464065618870278>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467550871515140>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464692394684416>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456468246341640197>

November 9, 2021:

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1468750504977043456>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1468749812677840900>

Comment:

Budget 2022 was tabled in Parliament on 29 October 2021, which is the same date that the Touchpoints document was created and modified, according to its properties. The former budget 2022 weblink is broken, but indicates a date: 11 November 2021. Therefore it can be surmised that the Touchpoints were made publicly available between 29 October and 11 November 2021.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: This could not be confirmed, as indicated above.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

CB-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the CB.

If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

While the actual publication date of the Budget 2022 Touchpoints is not disclosed, it is determined by the date of the national budget being tabled in the parliament. In addition, the document properties indicate that it was created and last modified on 29 October 2021. The former Budget 2022 weblink is broken, but shows a date: 11 November 2021. Therefore it can be surmised that the Touchpoints were made publicly available between 29 October and 11 November 2021.

Source:

(a) Budget 2022 official website
<https://budget.mof.gov.my/en/2022/>

(b) Budget 2022 Touchpoints
<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/touchpoints-en.pdf>

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

CB-4. If the CB is published, what is the URL or weblink of the CB?

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.

If more than one Citizens Budget is published, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budget is produced and its URL or weblink.

Answer:

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/touchpoints-en.pdf>

Source:

(a) Budget 2022 official website
<https://budget.mof.gov.my/en/2022/>

(b) Budget 2022 Touchpoints
<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/touchpoints-en.pdf>

(c) Budget 2022 Infographics

November 5, 2021:

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456462612669997066>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456468579826618368>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456465340548878342>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467218586234880>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464319638433794>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456465663883558918>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467870150389761>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464065618870278>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467550871515140>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464692394684416>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456468246341640197>

November 9, 2021:

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1468750504977043456>
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1468749812677840900>

Comment:

The Budget 2022 Touchpoints can be found on the official Budget 2022 website, while the infographics for Budget 2022 can be found on the official

Twitter account of the Ministry of Finance.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

CB-5. If the CB is produced, please write the full title of the CB.

For example, a title for the Citizens Budget could be "Budget 2022 People's Guide" or "2023 Proposed Budget in Brief: A People's Budget Publication."

If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, for the other CB, indicate the document the CB refers to and, next to it, its full title.

Answer:

Touchpoints Budget 2022 Measures

Source:

(a) Budget 2022 official website

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/en/2022/>

(b) Budget 2022 Touchpoints

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/touchpoints-en.pdf>

(c) Budget 2022 Infographics

November 5, 2021:

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456462612669997066>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456468579826618368>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456465340548878342>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467218586234880>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464319638433794>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456465663883558918>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467870150389761>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464065618870278>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467550871515140>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464692394684416>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456468246341640197>

November 9, 2021:

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1468750504977043456>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1468749812677840900>

Comment:

The Budget 2022 Touchpoints is a document that provides budget information in layman terms as well as in tabular format. The infographics are visual postings on Twitter by the official account of the Ministry of Finance that provide key information from the EBP. These postings do not have titles.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

CB-6. If the CB is produced, please indicate which budget document it corresponds to.

If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budget is produced and which budget document it simplifies.

Answer:

Executive's Budget Proposal

Source:

a) Budget 2022 Touchpoints

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/touchpoints-en.pdf>

b) Budget Speech 2022

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/bs22.pdf>

Comment:

The Budget 2022 Touchpoints summarizes the key allocations and initiatives presented by the Minister of Finance in the Budget Speech 2022 .

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-1. What is the fiscal year of the IYRs evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer:

FY 2022

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion:

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-2. When are the IYRs made available to the public?

Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on

the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.

The OBS methodology requires that for IYRs to be considered publicly available, IYRs must be made available to the public no later than three months after the reporting period ends. If at least seven of the last 12 monthly IYRs, or at least three of the last four quarterly IYRs are not released to the public at least three months after the reporting period ends, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the IYRs.

Answer:

c. At least every quarter, and within three months of the period covered

Source:

(a) <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/>

(b) <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/indikator/>

(c) <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/ringkasan-fiskal/>

Comment:

Quarterly Malaysian Economy reports for Q1 to Q4 are available. All were published on the Ministry of Finance website by the second month after the end of the quarter. The report for Q3 FY2022 was published and made available on the Ministry of Finance website (Source a) on 17 November 2022. The reports provide information on various indicators, such as federal government finance (revenue, expenditure, debt), and macroeconomic indicators. The four quarterly reports for FY2022 were all published and made available on the same website that has stored all of the quarterly reports from as early as 2012.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-3a. If the IYRs are published, what are the dates of publication of the IYRs?

Specifically: if quarterly In-Year Reports are published, indicate the dates of publication of at least three of the last four IYRs that were publicly available. If monthly IYRs are published, indicate the dates of publication of at least seven of the last 12 IYRs that were publicly available.

Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05 September 2022. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

Q4 FY2022 - 17 February 2023

Q3 FY2022 - 17 November 2022

Q2 FY2022 - 17 August 2022

Q1 FY2022 - 18 May 2022

Source:

(a) <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202204/>

Comment:

Using the Javascript `javascript:alert (document.lastModified)` in the website storing the document (Source a: Malaysian Economy report), the latest IYR was last modified on 17 February 2023. This is recorded as the date of publication in the response. The same operation was performed on the other IYRs.

There is no publication date in the document, on the website, nor in the HTML code for the four IYRs.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: I choose not to review this question

Comments: Since neither the IYR documents nor the website in which they are uploaded are explicit about publication dates I am unable to confirm this.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the IYRs.

If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

I visited the portal of the Ministry of Finance that stores all the IYRs, and used the JavaScript "alert.(document.lastModified)" to look up the last modification date for each IYR (each of the IYRs is published as an e-book on the website).

Source:

(a) Q1 FY2022 - <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202201/>

(b) Q2 FY2022 - <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202202/>

(c) Q3 FY2022 - <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202203/>

(d) Q4 FY2022 - <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202204/>

(e) Portal - <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/>

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: I choose not to review this question

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Agree and please add comment as follows: The quarterly report was published once the inter-agency planning group (IAPG) has agreed and released the macroeconomic data for the respective quarter. Generally, the publication of the quarterly report is made available through the Ministry's website during the middle of the second month after the end of each reporting quarter.

IYRs-4. If the IYRs are published, what is the URL or weblink of the IYRs?

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.

Researchers should provide the weblink to the most recent In-Year Report in the space below, and – in the comment box underneath – the weblinks to older IYRs.

If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.

Answer:

<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202204/>

Source:

(a) Weblink to the portal that stores all IYRs: <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/>

Comment:

Weblinks to other IYRs for FY2022:

(a) Q1 FY2022 - <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202201/>

(b) Q2 FY2022 - <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202202/>

(c) Q3 FY2022 - <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202203/>

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-5. If the IYRs are published, are the numerical data contained in the IYRs available in a machine readable format?

Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) and HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>

Option "d" applies if the IYRs are not publicly available, therefore their machine readability cannot be assessed.

Answer:

c. No

Source:

<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/>

Comment:

The IYRs are published as online flipbooks that are only downloadable as PDFs.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format

Comments: However, the numerical data in excel format for IYR is published in the 'Monthly Highlights & Statistics' page in the BNM website. It can be accessed as the link follows: <https://www.bnm.gov.my/publications/mhs> (please refer to section 3 of the statistics page).

Researcher Response

Agree that the External Sector & Macroeconomic Indicators section of the BNM website provides machine readable data on a quarterly basis. It includes quarterly statistics on federal government revenue, expenditures, and debt.

IBP Comment

Thank-you to the Government Reviewer for the link to relevant information published by the Central Bank of Malaysia. This information does however not form part of the Ministry of Finance Malaysia's IYR.

IYRs-6a. If the IYRs are not publicly available, are they still produced?

If the IYRs are not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question IYRs-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.

Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question IYRs-2).

Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.

Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.

Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.

Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.

If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.

Answer:

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Source:

<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/>

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question IYRs-6a, please specify how you determined whether the IYRs were produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question IYRs-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

n/a

Source:

n/a

Comment:

n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-7. If the IYRs are produced, please write the full title of the IYRs.

For example, a title for the In-Year Report could be "Budget Monitoring Report, Quarter 1" or "Budget Execution Report January-March 2022."

If In-Year Reports are not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Researchers should provide the full title of the most recent In-Year Report in the space below, and – in the comment box underneath – the full titles of older IYRs.

Answer:

Malaysian Economy Fourth Quarter 2022

Source:

<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/>

Comment:

Earlier IYRs in FY2022:

- Malaysian Economy Third Quarter 2022
- Malaysian Economy Second Quarter 2022
- Malaysian Economy First Quarter 2022

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the IYRs?

While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see:

<https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>.

Answer:

b. No

Source:

<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/>

Comment:

There is no citizens version of the IYRs.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: a. Yes

Comments: The published PBS is intended to be accessed by everyone including analysts and citizens.

Researcher Response

The IYR is a flipbook with charts and tables containing key financial data. A citizens' version would be in the format of infographics or easily disseminated material with key highlights for citizens, rather than a full length document.

MYR-1. What is the fiscal year of the MYR evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer:

FY 2022

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: MOF has published a Mid-Year Review documents in FY 2023 (only available in national language) as per link as follows:

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/belanjawan2023/LAPORAN-PRESTASI-PERBELANJAAN-PERTENGAHAN-TAHUN-2023.pdf> A brief summary on the revenue collection performance for the budget year is reported in the documents.

Researcher Response

The first time publication of MYR in 2023 is noted. As the research cut off date is 31 December 2022, FY2022 is evaluated in this edition of the survey.

MYR-2. When is the MYR made available to the public?

Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.

The OBS methodology requires that for an MYR to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public no later than three months after the reporting period ends (i.e., three months after the midpoint of the fiscal year). If the MYR is not released to the public at least three months after the reporting period ends, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the MYR.

Answer:

d. The MYR is not released to the public, or is released more than three months after the midpoint

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: MOF has published a Mid-Year Review documents in FY 2023 (only available in national language) as per link as follows:
<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/belanjawan2023/LAPORAN-PRESTASI-PERBELANJAAN-PERTENGAHAN-TAHUN-2023.pdf> A brief summary on the revenue collection performance for the budget year is reported in the documents.

Researcher Response

The first time publication of MYR in 2023 is noted. As the research cut off date is 31 December 2022, FY2022 is evaluated in this edition of the survey.

MYR-3a. If the MYR is published, what is the date of publication of the MYR?

Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.

Answer:

n/a

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the MYR.

If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

n/a

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-4. If the MYR is published, what is the URL or weblink of the MYR?

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.

Answer:

n/a

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: MOF has published a Mid-Year Review documents in FY 2023 (only available in national language) as per link as follows: <https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/belanjawan2023/LAPORAN-PRESTASI-PERBELANJAAN-PERTENGAHAN-TAHUN-2023.pdf> A brief summary on the revenue collection performance for the budget year is reported in the documents.

Researcher Response

The first time publication of MYR in 2023 is noted. As the research cut off date is 31 December 2022, FY2022 is evaluated in this edition of the survey.

MYR-5. If the MYR is published, are the numerical data contained in the MYR available in a machine readable format?

Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) and HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>.

Option "d" applies if the MYR is not publicly available, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.

Answer:

d. Not applicable

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-6a. If the MYR is not publicly available, is it still produced?

If the MYR is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question MYR-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.

Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question MYR-2).

Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.

Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.

Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.

Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.

If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.

Answer:

c. Produced for internal purposes/use only

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: d. Not produced at all

Comments: The National Budget Office in Malaysia does not produce MYR regularly.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher Response

It should be considered that the question is to check if the government has produced a report internally, and not whether the level of practice is consistent. An MOF officer queried the researcher twice on the contents and deadline for a midyear review report, in August and September 2022, which indicates to the researcher there was ongoing activity to produce a report. In 2023, a report has been published online for the first time, indicating a practice beginning to develop (although the latter is not part of this assessment). Ref: <https://belanjawan.mof.gov.my/en/budget2023/?ref=businessnews.com.my> In addition, Section 36 of the new Fiscal Responsibility Act 2023 requires a mid-year expenditure report to be published, indicating that a consistent practice will be established in future years. Ref: D.R. 34/2023 <https://www.parlimen.gov.my/bills-dewan-rakyat.html?uweb=dr&#>

MYR-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question MYR-6a, please specify how you determined whether the MYR was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question MYR-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

In a phone interview with a representative from the National Budget Office of the Ministry of Finance, the researcher was informed that the MYR had been produced for internal use in 2022.

Source:

Interview with Mr Afizal bin Kasa, Head of Budget Section, the National Budget Office, Ministry of Finance.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: I choose not to review this question

Comments: No other evidence could be found to confirm that this is indeed the case.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher Response

See response to MYR-6a.

MYR-7. If the MYR is produced, please write the full title of the MYR.

For example, a title for the Mid-Year Review could be "Semi-annual Budget Performance Report, FY 2021/22" or "Mid-Year Report on the 2022 National Budget."

If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

Laporan Kemajuan Pelaksanaan Bajet 2022 (Report on the Progress of Budget 2022 Implementation)

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: I choose not to review this question

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the MYR?

While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see:

<https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>.

Answer:

b. No

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

YER-1. What is the fiscal year of the YER evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer:
FY 2021

Source:
https://www.anm.gov.my/images/JANM/Webmaster/BPOPA/Penyata-Kewangan/PENYATA_KEWANGAN_KERAJAAN_PERSEKUTUAN_2021.pdf

Comment:

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

YER-2. When is the YER made available to the public?

Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.

The OBS methodology requires that for an YER to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public no later than one year after the fiscal year to which it corresponds. If the YER is not released to the public within one year after the end of the fiscal year to which it corresponds, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the YER.

Answer:
c. More than nine months, but within 12 months, after the end of the budget year

Source:
<https://www.parlimen.gov.my/ipms/eps/2022-10-07/ST.171.2022%20-%20ST%20171.2022.pdf>

Comment:
The publication date is 7 October 2022, which is more than 9 months but within 12 months of the end of the reporting period (31 December 2021).

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

YER-3a. If the YER is published, what is the date of publication of the YER?

*Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.
Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.*

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.

Answer:

7/10/2022

Source:

<https://www.parlimen.gov.my/ipms/eps/2022-10-07/ST.171.2022%20-%20ST%20171.2022.pdf>

Comment:

The publication date is the day when the YER was laid before Parliament.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: I choose not to review this question

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

YER-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the YER.

If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

The publication date is determined by looking at the date when the YER was laid before Parliament. Additionally, by clicking on the "Document Properties" of the PDF, it shows the "last modified" and "created" date. Both of these show the date of 7 October 2022.

Source:

(a) https://www.anm.gov.my/images/JANM/Webmaster/BPOPA/Penyata-Kewangan/PENYATA_KEWANGAN_KERAJAAN_PERSEKUTUAN_2021.pdf

(b) <https://www.parlimen.gov.my/ipms/eps/2022-10-07/ST.171.2022%20-%20ST%20171.2022.pdf>

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: I choose not to review this question

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

YER-4. If the YER is published, what is the URL or weblink of the YER?

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.

Answer:

<https://www.parlimen.gov.my/ipms/eps/2022-10-07/ST.171.2022%20-%20ST%20171.2022.pdf>

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: I choose not to review this question

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

YER-5. If the YER is published, are the numerical data contained in the YER available in a machine readable format?

Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) and HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>

Option "d" applies if the YER is not publicly available, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.

Answer:

c. No

Source:

<https://www.anm.gov.my/arkib/terbitan/penyata-kewangan-kerajaan-persekutuan>

Comment:

The YER is in PDF format. A machine readable format is not available.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

YER-6a. If the YER is not publicly available, is it still produced?

If the YER is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question YER-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.

Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question YER-2)

Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.

Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.

Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.

Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.

If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.

Answer:

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

YER-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question YER-6a, please specify how you determined whether the YER was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question YER-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

n/a

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

YER-7. If the YER is produced, please write the full title of the YER.

For example, a title for the Year-End Report could be "Consolidated Financial Statement for the Year Ended 31 March 2022" or "Annual Report 2021 Published by the Ministry of Finance and Planning." If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

Federal Government Financial Statements 2021

Source:

(a) <https://www.anm.gov.my/en/archive/publication/federal-government-financial-statement>

(b) https://www.anm.gov.my/images/JANM/Webmaster/BPOPA/Penyata-Kewangan/PENYATA_KEWANGAN_KERAJAAN_PERSEKUTUAN_2021.pdf

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

YER-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the YER?

While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see:

<https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>.

Answer:

b. No

Source:

(a) <https://www.anm.gov.my/en/archive/publication/federal-government-financial-statement>

(b) https://www.anm.gov.my/images/JANM/Webmaster/BPOPA/Penyata-Kewangan/PENYATA_KEWANGAN_KERAJAAN_PERSEKUTUAN_2021.pdf

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-1. What is the fiscal year of the AR evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire?

Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer:

FY 2021

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

AR-2. When is the AR made available to the public?

Publicly available budget documents are defined as those documents that are published on the website of the public authority issuing the document within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology and that all citizens are able to obtain free of charge. (See the Open Budget Survey Guidelines on Public Availability of Budget Documents.) This is a change from previous rounds of the Open Budget Survey: now at minimum documents must be made available on the Internet and free of charge to be considered publicly available.

The OBS methodology requires that for an AR to be considered publicly available, it must be made available to the public no later than 18 months after the end of the fiscal year to which it corresponds. If the AR is not released to the public at least 18 months after the end of the fiscal year to which it corresponds, option "d" applies. Option "d" should also be chosen for documents that are produced for internal purposes only (that is, produced but never released to the public) or are not produced at all. Some governments may publish budget documents further in advance than the latest possible dates outlined above. In these instances, researchers should choose options "a" or "b," depending on the date of publication identified for the AR.

Answer:

b. 12 months or less, but more than six months, after the end of the budget year

Source:

https://www.audit.gov.my/images/media/KENYATAAN_AKHBAR/2021/Kenyataan_Akhbar_Ketua_Audit_Negara_-_LKAN_Penyata_Kewangan_Tahun_2021.pdf

Comment:

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

AR-3a. If the AR is published, what is the date of publication of the AR?

Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document. Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late.

Please enter the date in the following format: "DD/MM/YYYY." For example, 5 September 2022 should be entered as 05/09/2022. If the document is not published or not produced, leave this question blank.

Answer:

6/10/2022

Source:

https://www.audit.gov.my/images/media/KENYATAAN_AKHBAR/2021/Kenyataan_Akhbar_Ketua_Audit_Negara_-_LKAN_Penyata_Kewangan_Tahun_2021.pdf

Comment:

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

AR-3b. In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the AR.

If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

At the end of the press statement announcing the release of the AR, there is a QR code to enable the public to download the AR. The press statement was released on 6 October.

Source:

https://www.audit.gov.my/images/media/KENYATAAN_AKHBAR/2021/Kenyataan_Akhbar_Ketua_Audit_Negara_-_LKAN_Penyata_Kewangan_Tahun_2021.pdf

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Could also be verified using- <https://www.thestar.com.my/news/nation/2022/10/06/a-g039s-report-2021-tabled-in-parliament-on-oct-6>

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-4. If the AR is published, what is the URL or weblink of the AR?

Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should leave this question blank.

Answer:

<https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1222>

Source:

<https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1222>

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-5. If the AR is published, are the numerical data contained in the AR available in a machine readable format?

Material (data or content) is machine readable if it is in a format that can be easily processed by a computer, such as .csv, .xls/.xlsx, and .json. Numerical data found in PDFs, Word (.doc/.docx) and HTML files do not qualify as machine readable. See more at: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>

Option "d" applies if the AR is not publicly available, therefore its machine readability cannot be assessed.

Answer:

c. No

Source:

(a) Auditor General's Report on the Government Financial Statement 2021
(Laporan Ketua Audit Negara Penyata Kewangan Kerajaan Persekutuan Tahun 2021) <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1222>

Comment:

The audit report is in PDF format.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-6a. If the AR is not publicly available, is it still produced?

If the AR is not considered publicly available under the OBS methodology (and thus the answer to Question AR-2 was "d"), a government may nonetheless produce the document.

Option "a" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public online but not within the time frame specified in the OBS methodology (see Question AR-2).

Option "b" applies if the document is produced and made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology but only in hard copy (and is not available online). Option "b" also applies if the document is made available to the public within the time frame specified by the OBS methodology in soft electronic copy but is not available online.

Option "c" applies if the document is produced for internal purposes only and so is not made available to the public.

Option "d" applies if the document is not produced at all.

Option "e" applies if the document is publicly available.

If a document is not released to the public, researchers may need to write to or visit the relevant government office in order to determine whether answer "c" or "d" applies.

Answer:

e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-6b. If you selected option "c" or "d" in question AR-6a, please specify how you determined whether the AR was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all.

If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question AR-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

n/a

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-7. If the AR is produced, please write the full title of the AR.

For example, a title for the Audit Report could be "Annual General Reports of the Controller and Auditor General." If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer:

Laporan Ketua Audit Negara Penyata Kewangan Kerajaan Persekutuan Tahun 2021
(Auditor General's Report on the Government Financial Statements 2021)

Source:

(a) Laporan Ketua Audit Negara Penyata Kewangan Kerajaan Persekutuan Tahun 2021
<https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1222>

(b) Compliance audit - Laporan Ketua Audit Negara Pengauditan Pematuhan Kementerian dan Jabatan Persekutuan
<https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1427>

(c) Performance audit for federal government bodies - Laporan Ketua Audit Negara 2021 - Aktiviti Kementerian / Jabatan Kerajaan Persekutuan dan Badan-badan Berkanun Persekutuan
Series 1 (Siri 1) - <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1043>
Series 2 (Siri 2) - <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1474>

(d) Performance audit for federal government corporations - Laporan Ketua Audit Negara 2021 - Pengurusan Syarikat Kerajaan Persekutuan
Series 1 (Siri 1) - <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1054>
Series 2 (Siri 2) - <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1426>

Comment:

The series of reports are known as: Laporan Ketua Audit Negara 2021 (Auditor General's Report 2021). The long titles reflect whether the specific report is for a financial, compliance, or performance audit.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-8. Is there a "citizens version" of the AR?

While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle. While it is recognized that it may be unreasonable to expect that a citizens version is produced for each and every one of those key documents, it seems acceptable to expect that according to good practice, the executive releases a citizens version of key budget documents for each of the four stages of the budget process to allow citizens to be aware of what is happening, in terms of public financial management, throughout the entire budget cycle. For more information on Citizens Budget see: <https://www.internationalbudget.org/publications/citizens-budgets/>.

Answer:

a. Yes

Source:

(a) <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1222>

(b) Infographic and explanation section - <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1225>

Comment:

The AR now provides infographic summaries with explanations at the beginning of the report that can be separately downloaded (see the link to "Infografik dan Penerangan Infografik"). The infographics for the audit report contain summary information from the audit of the federal government's financial statements. The National Audit Department now publishes an infographic at the beginning of all series of audit reports (including the compliance and performance audits of selected government departments and statutory bodies). It is a substantial improvement from the infographics in the previous iteration of OBS that only presented summarised data from all reports.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

GQ-1a. Are there one or more websites or web portals for disseminating government fiscal information? If yes, please provide the necessary links in the comment/citation.

GQ-1a asks the researcher to list any government websites or portals where fiscal information can be found. For example, in New Zealand the Treasury website (<http://www.treasury.govt.nz/>) hosts important budget-related information, including the Pre-Budget Statement, the Executive's Budget Proposal, the Citizens Budget, In-Year Reports, the Mid-Year Review, and the Year-End Report. In addition, New Zealand's Parliamentary Counsel Office (<http://www.legislation.govt.nz/>) posts the Enacted Budget while the Controller and Auditor-General website (<http://www.oag.govt.nz/>) publishes the annual Audit Report. The New Zealand researcher would provide the links to each of these sites. Other countries have developed portals that include fiscal information, though not in the "documents" format. For example, these portals have been created by Mexico (<https://www.transparenciapresupuestaria.gob.mx/>) and Brazil (<http://www.portaltransparencia.gov.br/>). Some countries have both a website and a portal. The Brazilian government, for example, apart from the Transparency Portal, has a dedicated website for the federal budget, where all key documents and other information can be found (<https://www.gov.br/economia/pt-br/assuntos/planejamento-e-orcamento/orcamento>). Researchers should include details about all of the relevant websites and/or portals that can be used to access budget information.

Answer:

a. Yes

Source:

(a) Official website for the Budget

<https://budget.mof.gov.my>

(b) Web portal for PBS and EBP
<https://www.mof.gov.my>

(c) Web portal for audit reports
<https://www.audit.gov.my>

(d) Web portal for reports and bills tabled and passed in Parliament
<https://www.parlimen.gov.my/bills-dewan-rakyat.html?uweb=dr&>

(e) Web portal of the federal government financial statements / YER
<https://www.anm.gov.my>

(f) Web portal of the government operating and expenditure data
<https://data.gov.my>

(g) Official X account of Ministry of Finance to disseminate budget information
<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia>

Comment:

The Ministry of Finance maintains a portal with the latest budget data.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

GQ-1b. On these websites/portals, can revenue and/or expenditure data for the current fiscal year be downloaded as a consolidated, machine readable file (or set of files)? If yes, please provide the necessary links in the comment/citation. For more information on machine readability, see: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>.

GQ-1b, GQ-1c, and GQ-1d ask about whether governments publish specific types of content on their websites/portals: (a) consolidated files that contain disaggregated revenue and/or expenditure information for the current fiscal year; (b) consolidated files that contain disaggregated revenue and/or expenditure information for multiple years in consistent formats; and (c) infographics/visualizations or other similar tools used to simplify data access and analysis. Researchers should provide the links to relevant webpages and some explanations of what they contain.

Answer:

d. No, neither expenditure or revenue data can be downloaded as a consolidated file

Source:

(a) <https://www.mof.gov.my/en/economy/fiscal-economic-data>

(i) Revenue

https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/data-ekonomi/2020/1.3_Hasil_Kerajaan_Persekutuan_Nov.xlsx

(ii) Operating expenditure

https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/data-ekonomi/2019/1.4_Perbelanjaan_Mengurus_Kerajaan_Persekutuan_Dis19.xlsx

(iii) Development expenditure

https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/data-ekonomi/2020/1.5_Perbelanjaan_Pembangunan_Kerajaan_Persekutuan_Nov.xlsx

Comment:

The government revenue, operating and development expenditure are only updated until FY 2021 in a machine readable format.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: a. Yes, both revenue and expenditure data can be downloaded as a consolidated file

Comments: a. Yes, both revenue and expenditure data can be downloaded as a consolidated file

Researcher Response

GQ-1b asks if the data is available for the current fiscal year. The file provides multi-year data up to the previous fiscal year only.

GQ-1c. On these websites/portals, can disaggregated revenue and/or expenditure data in consolidated, machine readable files be downloaded for multiple years in consistent formats? If yes, please provide the necessary links and details in the comment/citation. For more information on machine readability, see: <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>.

Answer:

a. Yes, both revenue and expenditure data can be downloaded for multiple years in consistent formats

Source:

(a) <https://www.mof.gov.my/en/economy/fiscal-economic-data>

(i) Revenue

https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/data-ekonomi/2020/1.3_Hasil_Kerajaan_Persekutuan_Nov.xlsx

(ii) Operating expenditure

https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/data-ekonomi/2019/1.4_Perbelanjaan_Mengurus_Kerajaan_Persekutuan_Dis19.xlsx

(iii) Development expenditure

https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/data-ekonomi/2020/1.5_Perbelanjaan_Pembangunan_Kerajaan_Persekutuan_Nov.xlsx

Comment:

The data can be found on the Fiscal & Economic Data page on the new Ministry of Finance website. The data is structured in Excel files. It is however only updated until FY 2021.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

GQ-1d. On these websites/portals, are infographics/visualizations or other similar tools used to simplify data access and analysis? If yes, please provide the necessary links and details in the comment/citation.

GQ-1d asks the researcher to list any government websites or portals where infographics/visualizations or other similar tools used to simplify data access and analysis are present. For example, in South Africa the Vulekamali portal (<https://vulekamali.gov.za>) is a project by the National Treasury which contains visualizations of the Consolidated Budget Summary, by departments budget, by division of revenue and by infrastructure budget distribution. (See for example <https://vulekamali.gov.za/2022-23/national/departments/basic-education/>). Other countries that have developed portals that include fiscal visualization and graphics include: Brazil's Transparency Portal (<https://portaldatransparencia.gov.br/>), which presents line graphs, bar graphs, pie charts, and visual maps of electronic invoices, public expenditure, public revenue, annual budget, transferred resources, resources transferred by location of beneficiary, among other information. (<https://portaldatransparencia.gov.br/orcamento> and <https://portaldatransparencia.gov.br/transferencias>). Additionally, United States Department of the Treasury, Fiscal Data portal (<https://fiscaldata.treasury.gov/>) is a one-stop shop for federal financial data that uses charts, exhibits, and figures.

Answer:

a. Yes

Source:

(a) Budget 2022 Touchpoints

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/touchpoints-en.pdf>

(b) Budget 2022 Infographics

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456462612669997066>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456468579826618368>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456465340548878342>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467218586234880>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464319638433794>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456465663883558918>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467870150389761>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464065618870278>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467550871515140>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464692394684416>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456468246341640197>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1468750504977043456>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1468749812677840900>

(c) <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/ms/laporan-laksana>

Comment:

The Budget 2022 Touchpoints can be found on the official website of the Budget 2022. It provides key budget information for the general public using a tabular format. It is based on the Budget Speech 2021 presented by the Minister of Finance.

Infographics for Budget 2022 can be found on the official X account of the Ministry of Finance. The infographics contain visualizations for key budget initiatives.

Regarding implementation, the Laksana reports (Laporan Laksana) provide detailed charts tracking implementation of specific programs, particularly programs for the Covid-19 stimulus packages.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

GQ-2. Are there laws in place guiding public financial management and/or auditing? If yes, please provide the necessary details and links in the comment/citation, and specify whether and where the law(s) contains specific provisions for budget transparency and/or participation.

GQ-2 asks about the existence of any national laws governing public financial management and auditing. These may include a public finance act, a section of the constitution, or an organic budget law. In some countries, fiscal responsibility legislation may also be relevant. For example, the Kenya researcher may include the link to its Public Finance Management Act, 2012 (<http://kenyalaw.org/8181/exist/kenyalex/actview.xql?actid=No.%2018%20of%202012>), and the Macedonian researcher may include a link to its State Audit Law (<https://finance.gov.mk/wp-content/uploads/2009/05/Audit-law.pdf>). Researchers should provide links to websites where such laws are published, if possible, or an electronic copy of the law itself. They should also indicate if and where (e.g. which article) these laws include specific provisions for budget transparency and citizen participation in budget processes.

Answer:

a. Yes

Source:

(a) Federal Constitution Part VII (Financial Provisions)

<http://www.agc.gov.my/agcportal/uploads/files/Publications/FC/FEDERAL%20CONSTITUTION%20ULANG%20CETAK%202016.pdf>

(b) Financial Procedure Act 1957
<http://www.agc.gov.my/agcportal/uploads/files/Publications/LOM/EN/Act%2061.pdf>

(c) Audit Act 1957
<http://www.agc.gov.my/agcportal/uploads/files/Act%2062.pdf>

(d) Debt management laws:
- Loan (Local) Act 1959
<http://www.agc.gov.my/agcportal/uploads/files/Publications/LOM/EN/Act%20637.pdf>
- Government Funding Act 1983
<https://www.bnm.gov.my/documents/20124/aa04a702-9257-b8e2-64af-84881e7a3aa0>
- External Loans Act 1963
<https://lom.agc.gov.my/ilims/upload/portal/akta/LOM/EN/Act%20403.pdf>

(The statute documents can be accessed by searching the name of the Act on <https://lom.agc.gov.my/>)

Comment:

The above cited laws guide public financial management and audit in Malaysia. They do not have specific provisions on budget transparency and citizen participation in budget processes, save for requirements in the Federal Constitution for the following to be laid before Parliament:

- (i) reports of the Auditor General (Article 107); and
- (ii) the estimate of receipts and revenues, to be presented before the start of the financial year (Article 99).

For debt management, there are several statutes governing federal government debt. The statutory debt limit is found under the Loan (Local) Act 1959 and the Government Funding Act 1983; while federal government offshore borrowings is governed under the External Loan Act 1963.

There are also circulars and Treasury instructions which regulate the management of public finances. These regulations are however not legally binding (<https://www.treasury.gov.my/index.php/en/business/company-registration-information/item/1089-laws-and-regulations>).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

GQ-3. Is there at least one additional law regulating: (1) access to information; (2) government transparency; or (3) citizens participation? If yes, please provide the necessary details and links in the comment/citation, and specify whether and where these laws contain specific provisions for budget transparency and/or participation.

The third and last question asks researchers to list any additional laws regulating access to information, transparency, or citizens' participation that are relevant for the promotion of budget transparency and citizen participation in budget processes. These might include legislation related to access to information, to planning processes, or to public administration more generally. India's Right to Information Act of 2005 (<https://www.ncess.gov.in/facilities/central-public-information-officer/rti-act-details.html>) is an example of this type of law. For more information on access to information legislation (constitutional provisions, laws, and regulations), including examples of model laws, see: <https://www.rti-rating.org/country-data/> and <https://www.constituteproject.org/>.

Answer:

b. No

Source:

a) Official Secrets Act 1972 (Act 88)
<https://lom.agc.gov.my/ilims/upload/portal/akta/LOM/EN/Act%2088.pdf>

b) Fiscal Responsibility Act
[https://www.bernama.com/en/business/news.php?id=2166801#:~:text=KUALA%20LUMPUR%2C%20Feb%2022%20\(Bernama,the%20federal%20government's%20annual%20budget](https://www.bernama.com/en/business/news.php?id=2166801#:~:text=KUALA%20LUMPUR%2C%20Feb%2022%20(Bernama,the%20federal%20government's%20annual%20budget)
<https://www.theedgemarkets.com/node/659049>

Comment:

Access to information in Malaysia is restricted by the Official Secret Act 1972 (Act 88). The Act gives discretion to public officials to classify documents, information, materials as secret. The Act also penalizes those who own, store and obtain secret information unlawfully. Laws that guide public finance management do not have provisions for budget transparency or citizens participation.

The Fiscal Responsibility Act was expected to be tabled in 2022 to institutionalize fiscal prudence, governance and transparency based on global best practices. Parliament was however dissolved in October 2022, with the new government promising to table it in 2023.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Malaysia lacks a federal law acknowledging and supporting citizen's access/right to information. Instead, Malaysia has retained the Official Secret Act 1972 (Act 88), which together with other laws, restricts the citizen's access to vital public information.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The government is targeting to table the Fiscal Responsibility Act in 2023 to institutionalize fiscal prudence, governance and transparency based on global best practices. The Public Finance and Fiscal Responsibility Bill 2023 was tabled to House of Representatives on 11 October 2023 and was passed by the House of Representatives. The bill will be tabled to House of Senate in November 2023. The Bill can be assessed by the public at parliament of Malaysia website: www.parlimen.gov.my

Researcher Response

No comment.

1. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?**GUIDELINES:**

Question 1 addresses the presentation of expenditure by administrative unit. This information indicates which government entity (ministry, department, or agency, or MDAs) will be responsible for spending the funds and, ultimately, held accountable for their use.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for all administrative units, accounting for all expenditures, in the budget year. To answer "b," the administrative units shown individually, in the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation, must account for at least two-thirds of all expenditures in the budget year. In other words, the sum of the expenditures assigned to the individual MDAs (education, health, infrastructure, interior, defense, etc.) must account for at least two-thirds of the total expenditure budgeted for that particular year. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents administrative units that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by administrative unit.

Answer:

a. Yes, administrative units accounting for all expenditures are presented.

Source:

Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p. 34 - 502
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

Comment:

Expenditure of the annual budget classified by administrative unit can be found in the Federal Government Expenditure Estimates publication.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

2. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year by functional classification?

GUIDELINES:

Question 2 addresses the presentation of expenditure by functional classification. This classification indicates the programmatic purpose, sector, or objective for which the funds will be used, such as health, education, or defense. Administrative units are not necessarily aligned with functional classifications. For instance, in one country all functions connected with water supply (which fall into the "Housing" function) may be undertaken by a single government agency, while in another country they may be distributed across the Ministries of Environment, Housing, and Industrial Development. In the latter case, three ministries have programs addressing water supply, so three ministries contribute to one function. Similarly, some administrative units may conduct activities that cut across more than one function. For instance, in the example above, some programs of the Ministry of Environment would also be classified in the "environmental protection" function.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for the budget year organized by functional classification.

Answer:

a. Yes, expenditures are presented by functional classification.

Source:

Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p.14 - 27

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

Comment:

The Federal Government Expenditure Estimates publication provides the functional classification for both operating and development expenditure which covers:

Operating expenditure:

- i) Economic
- ii) Social
- iii) Security
- iv) Administration
- v) Other sectors

Development expenditure:

- i) Economic
- ii) Social
- iii) Security
- iv) Administration
- v) Committed Guarantees and Liabilities

Sub-sector breakdowns are provided for both operating and development expenditure.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

3. If the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation presents expenditures for the budget year by functional classification, is the functional classification compatible with international standards?

GUIDELINES:

Question 3 asks whether a country's functional classification meets international standards. To answer "a," a country's functional classification must be aligned with the OECD and the UN's Classification of the Functions of Government (COFOG), or provide a cross-walk between the national functional

presentation and COFOG.

The OECD Best Practices for Budget Transparency can be viewed at <http://www.oecd.org/gov/budgeting/Best%20Practices%20Budget%20Transparency%20-%20complete%20with%20cover%20page.pdf>

COFOG can be viewed at https://unstats.un.org/unsd/publication/SeriesM/SeriesM_84E.pdf or at <http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/ch6ann.pdf>.

Answer:

a. Yes, the functional classification is compatible with international standards.

Source:

Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p.14 - 27
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

Comment:

The expenditures are classified into 5 sectors (functional):

- (a) General Administration (General Services, Foreign Services, refunds and reimbursements, Repairs and Renovation)
- (b) Economy (Transportation, Trade and Industry, Finance, Agriculture, Research and Development, Energy and Public Facilities, Environment, Communication, Development of Mineral Resources)
- (c) Social (Education and Training, Health and Population, Local Councils, and Welfare and Community Services, Community Welfare, National Unity and Indigenous People, Culture, Youth and Sports, Information and Broadcasting, Rural and Community Development, Housing)
- (d) Security (Defense and Domestic Security)
- (e) Other Sectors (e.g. Pensions and Bonuses, Loan Payments)

These sectors are not identical to COFOG, but the categories can be mapped to it.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

4. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year by economic classification?

GUIDELINES:

Question 4 asks whether the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents expenditures for the budget year organized by economic classification. Economic classification provides information on the nature of the expenditure, such as whether funds are being used to pay for wages and salaries, capital projects, or social assistance benefits. Please note that a presentation of expenditures by current and capital expenditures without additional disaggregation or detail will not qualify as an economic classification.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for the budget year organized by economic classification.

Answer:

a. Yes, expenditures are presented by economic classification.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p. 508 - 518
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

(b) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p.148
<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/section3.pdf>

Comment:

Only the operating expenditure was classified by economic components, such as emoluments, asset acquisitions, supplies and services and more. Developing expenditure was only classified according to sector.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: For Development Expenditure (DE), the economic classification by emoluments, supplies and services and assets are shown as a total DE of each ministry (summary of OE and DE in the Federal Expenditure Estimates for each ministry, before allocation by program and activities).

5. If the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation presents expenditures for the budget year by economic classification, is the economic classification compatible with international standards?

GUIDELINES:

Question 5 asks whether a country's economic classification meets international standards. To answer "a," a country's economic classification must be consistent with the International Monetary Fund's (IMF) 2001 Government Finance Statistics (GFS). The GFS economic classification is presented here: <http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/app4.pdf>. To learn more about Government Finance Statistics also refer to the entire IMF 2001 GFS manual (<http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/all.pdf>).

Answer:

b. No, the economic classification is not compatible with international standards, or expenditures are not presented by economic classification.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p. 508 - 518

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

(b) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p.148

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/section3.pdf> Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022

Comment:

The classification does not completely follow the IMF standard. However, there are several items that match the standard such as emoluments (compensation to employees) and subsidies.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, the economic classification is compatible with international standards.

Comments: The publication of the expenditure data is according to GFS 1986. For example, items that match the standard such as emoluments (compensation to employees) and supplies and services (use of goods and services). As for DE, the EBP present the data according to functional classification.

Researcher Response

The guideline to the question indicates that consistency with GFS 2001 is the standard for an "a" response.

6. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 6 asks whether expenditures are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term “program,” and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should treat the term “program” as meaning any level of detail below an administrative unit – that is, any programmatic grouping that is below the ministry, department, or agency level. For example, the Ministry of Health’s budget could be broken down into several subgroups, such as “primary health care,” “hospitals,” or “administration.” These subgroups should be considered programs even if they could be, but are not, broken down into smaller, more detailed units.

A note for francophone countries: “Program” level detail is sometimes referred to as *le plan comptable* or *le plan comptable detaillé*. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer “a,” the Executive’s Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures, in the budget year. To answer “b,” the programs shown individually in the Executive’s Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must account for at least two-thirds of all expenditures in the budget year. A “c” answer applies if the Executive’s Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents programs that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer “d” applies if expenditures are not presented by program.

Budget decisions for the upcoming year can also affect the parameters of future budgets. It is therefore useful to estimate revenues and expenditures for multi-year periods, understanding that these estimates might be revised as circumstances change. Sometimes referred to as a Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF), a three-year period – that is, the budget year plus two more years – is generally considered an appropriate horizon for budgeting and planning.

Answer:

a. Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p. 63 - 491

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

(b) Expenditure Estimate for Ministry of Agriculture and Food Industries 2022, p.195 - 208

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

Comment:

The operating expenditure of Ministries are broken down into various programmes which are then divided into multiple activities. For instance, the Ministry of Agriculture and Food Industries has 3 programmes - Management; National Food Security; and Agrofood Industry and Agropreneur. These programmes are then divided into various activities, for example the Agrofood Industry and Agropreneur program covers Federal Agriculture Marketing Activities, the Malaysian Pineapple Industry Board, and Farmers’ Skills Training.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

7. Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditure estimates for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 7 asks if multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by any one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications – which were addressed in Questions 1-5 above. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on.

To answer “a,” the Executive’s Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditure estimates by all three of the expenditure classifications for at least two years beyond the budget year. To answer “b,” multi-year expenditure estimates must be presented by two of these three classifications. A “c” answer applies if multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer “d” applies if multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented by any of the three classifications.

Answer:

d. No, multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented by any expenditure classification.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p.23 - 491

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

(b) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

EBP documents do not present expenditure for a multi-year period beyond the budget year 2022 but does compare with previous budget years of 2020 and 2021.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

7b. Based on the response to Question 7, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications have estimates for a multi-year period in the Executive's Budget Proposal?

Answer:

None of the above

Source:

(a) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p.23 - 491

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

(b) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

The EBP only presents the estimates of expenditures for the budget year (fiscal year 2022).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

8. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditure estimates for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year) by program?

GUIDELINES:

Question 8 asks if multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level

of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department. For example, the Ministry of Health's budget could be broken down into several subgroups, such as "primary health care," "hospitals," or "administration." These subgroups should be considered programs even if they could be, but are not, broken down into smaller, more detailed units.

A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as *le plan comptable* or *le plan comptable detaillé*. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures, for at least two years beyond the budget year. To answer "b," the programs shown individually in the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must account for at least two-thirds of all expenditures over the multi-year period. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents multi-year estimates for programs that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if multi-year estimates are not presented by program.

Revenues generally are separated into two major categories: "tax" and "non-tax" revenues. Taxes are compulsory transfers that result from government exercising its sovereign power. The largest sources of tax revenue in some countries are taxes on personal and business income and taxes on goods and services, such as sales or value-added taxes. The category of non-tax revenues is more diverse, ranging from grants from international institutions and foreign governments to funds raised through the sale of government-provided goods and services. Note that some forms of revenue, such as contributions to social security funds, can be considered either a tax or non-tax revenue depending on the nature of the approach to these contributions. Particularly because different revenues have different characteristics, including who bears the burden of paying the tax and how collections are affected by economic conditions, it is helpful when estimates for revenues are disaggregated and displayed based on their sources.

For more information, please refer to the 2001 GFS manual, in particular Appendix 4 (<http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/app4.pdf>).

Answer:

d. No, multi-year estimates for programs are not presented.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p.23 - 491

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

(b) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

The EBP only presents the estimates of expenditures for the budget year (fiscal year 2022).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

9. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present the individual sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 9 assesses the degree to which the individual sources of "tax" revenue are disaggregated in the budget. The largest sources of tax revenue in some countries are taxes on personal and business income and taxes on goods and services, such as sales or value-added taxes.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present all individual sources of tax revenue for the budget year, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all tax revenue. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present individual sources of tax revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all tax revenue, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents individual sources of tax revenue that account for less than two-thirds of tax revenues. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of tax revenue are not presented.

Answer:

b. Yes, individual sources of tax revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are presented.

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

(b) Treasury Memorandum on the Federal Government Revenue Estimates for 2022
<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/arkib/revenue/2022/memorandum.pdf>

Comment:

There are two sources of tax revenue:

i) Direct tax: Company income tax (CITA); individual income tax; petroleum income tax (PITA), and other direct tax collections (stamp duty, real property gain tax (RPGT), Labuan business activity tax, and others).

ii) Indirect tax (Export duty, import duty, excise duties, sales tax and service tax (SST), tourism tax, and others).

'Other' sources of revenue account for more than 3% of taxes.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

10. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present the individual sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of government-produced goods and services) for the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 10 assesses the degree to which the individual sources of "non-tax" revenue are disaggregated in the budget. The category of non-tax revenues is diverse, and can include revenue ranging from grants from international institutions and foreign governments to funds raised through the sale of government-provided goods and services.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present all individual sources of non-tax revenue for the budget year, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all non-tax revenue. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present individual sources of non-tax revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all non-tax revenue, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents individual sources of non-tax revenue that account for less than two-thirds of non-tax revenues. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of non-tax revenue are not presented.

Answer:

a. Yes, individual sources of non-tax revenue accounting for all non-tax revenue are presented.

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

(b) Treasury Memorandum on the Federal Government Revenue Estimates for 2022
<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/arkib/revenue/2022/memorandum.pdf>

Comment:

Non-tax revenue consist of licences and permits, service fees, rentals, interest and return on investments, fines and penalties, contributions and compensations, and oil and gas exploration income from Malaysia - Thailand Joint Authority (MTJA).

"Other" sources of non-tax revenue account for less than 3% of all non-tax revenues.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

11. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax) for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 11 evaluates whether revenue estimates are presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year) by "category," that is, whether tax and non-tax sources of revenue are shown separately.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present multi-year estimates of revenues classified by category for at least two years following the budget year in question.

Answer:

b. No, multi-year estimates of revenue are not presented by category.

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p. 26
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/hasil/tinjauan_fiskal_2022.pdf

(b) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p.14
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/hasil/tinjauan_fiskal_2022.pdf

(c) Details of Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p. 245-257
<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/hasil/perincian.pdf>

Comment:

EBP documents do not present revenue for a multi-year period beyond the budget year 2022 but do compare with previous budget years of 2020 and 2021.

The Medium Term Fiscal Framework provides a general macro-fiscal project for three years from FY 2022 to FY 2024 and serves as guidance for the Government's medium-term fiscal path.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

12. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates for individual sources of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 12 evaluates whether revenue estimates for individual sources of revenue are presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year). The question applies to both tax and non-tax revenue.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present multi-year estimates of all sources of revenue individually, accounting for all revenue, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all revenue. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present multi-year estimates of individual sources of revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all revenue, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents multi-year estimates of individual revenue sources that account for less than two-thirds of revenue. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of revenue are not presented for a multi-year period.

Answer:

d. No, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue are not presented.

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022 , p.26
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/hasil/tinjauan_fiskal_2022.pdf

(b) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p.14
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/hasil/tinjauan_fiskal_2022.pdf

(c) Details of Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p.245 - 257
<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/hasil/perincian.pdf>

Comment:

The EBP only presents the revenue estimates for the budget year (FY 2022) while the Medium-Term Fiscal Framework in the Fiscal Outlook presents the total revenue for the next three years (FY 2022 to FY 2024).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: While budget documents present the corresponding revenue amount for previous years, they do not include the estimates beyond the budget year.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

13. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 13 asks about three key estimates related to borrowing and debt that the budget should include:

- *the amount of net new borrowing required during the entire budget year;*
- *the central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year; and*
- *the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the entire budget year.*

Debt is the accumulated amount of money that the government borrows. The government can borrow from its citizens and banks and businesses within the country (domestic debt) or from creditors outside the country (external debt). External debt is typically owed to private commercial banks, other governments, or international financial institutions such as the World Bank and the IMF.

Net new borrowing is the additional amount of new borrowing that is required for the budget year to finance expenditures in the budget that exceed available revenues. Net new borrowing adds to the accumulated debt. It is distinct from gross borrowing, which also includes borrowing needed to repay existing debt that matured during the budget year; debt that is replaced (or rolled over) does not add to the total of accumulated debt. For the purposes of this question, the deficit may be accepted as a proxy for net new borrowing.

Interest payments on the debt (or debt service costs) are typically made at regular intervals, and these payments must be made on a timely basis in order to avoid defaulting on the debt obligation. Interest payments are separate from the repayment of principal, which occurs only when the loan has matured and must be paid back in full.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present all three estimates of borrowing and debt. For a "b" answer, the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present two of those three estimates. For a "c" answer, the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present one of the three estimates. Answer "d" applies if no information on borrowing and debt is presented for the entire budget year.

Answer:

b. Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

Source:

(a) Debt Service Charges: Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Expenditure 2022; Public Finance Statistics, p. 213
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/hasil/tinjauan_fiskal_2022.pdf

(b) New Borrowings: Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates; Debt Management 2022, p. 163-165 & p. 211
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

(c) Total Debt Burden at the end of BY: Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Expenditure 2022, p.172-174
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

Estimates of Debt Service Charges are provided on p. 213 of the Fiscal Outlook. Details on borrowing (pp. 163-165) only cover the year 2021 and prior. However, the deficit is shown on p. 211 as an "Overall balance" in absolute terms and as a percentage of GDP.

Total debt burden at the end of the budget year is only shown as of June 2021. The estimate of the total debt burden for 2022 is however not shown.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

Comments: The answer is a. The supporting documentation present all three estimates of borrowing and debt. Comments: The Government of Malaysia debt related Acts only allow the Government to borrow only to finance development expenditure and repayment of maturing debts. In this context, the estimates on the net new borrowing requirement equals to the deficit amount. The estimates of Federal Government's total debt as at end of budget year is presented as a percentage to GDP. The interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year is mentioned in Section 3: Federal Government Expenditure (Table 3.1, page 148), Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimate 2022. Other related info can also be referred in the FORE2022 Section 4 - Debt Management (page 163-185), & Public Finance Statistics Table 4.1 page 216.

Researcher Response

The missing estimate in question is the total debt burden at the end of the budget year. The Public Finance Statistics Table 4.1 stops at 2021, and data on debt levels is for the current fiscal year (2021).

13b. Based on the response to Question 13, check the box(es) below to identify which estimates of government borrowing and debt are presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal:

Answer:

The amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year

The interest payments on outstanding debt for the budget year

Source:

(a) Debt Service Charges: Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Expenditure 2022; Public Finance Statistics, p.213
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/hasil/tinjauan_fiskal_2022.pdf

(b) New Borrowings: Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Expenditure 2022; Debt Management, p. 163-165; p. 182-183 & p. 211
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

(c) Total Debt Burden at the end of BY: Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Expenditure 2022, p.172-174
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

No comments.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: The amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year The central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year The interest payments on outstanding debt for the budget year

Comments: The Government of Malaysia debt related Acts only allow the Government to borrow only to finance development expenditure and repayment of maturing debts. In this context, the estimates on the net new borrowing requirement equals to the deficit amount. The estimates of Federal Government's total debt as at end of budget year is presented as a percentage to GDP. The interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year is also mentioned in the supporting documents. All this info can be referred in the FORE2022 Section 4 - Debt Management (page 163-185), & Public Finance Statistics Table 4.1 page 216.

Researcher Response

As in Question 13a.

14. "Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year?"

(The core information must include interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)"

GUIDELINES:

Question 14 focuses on the composition of government debt at the end of the budget year, asking whether "core" information related to its composition is presented. These core components include:

- *interest rates on the debt;*
- *maturity profile of the debt; and*
- *whether the debt is domestic or external.*

The interest rates affect the amount of interest that must be paid to creditors. The maturity profile indicates the final payment date of the loan, at which point the principal (and all remaining interest) is due to be paid; government borrowing typically includes a mix of short-term and long-term debt. As discussed in Question 13, domestic debt is held by a country's citizens, banks, and businesses, while external debt is held by foreigners. These factors related to the composition of the debt give an indication of the potential vulnerability of the country's debt position, and ultimately whether the cost of servicing the accumulated debt is affordable.

Beyond these core elements, a government may also provide additional information related to the composition of its debt, including for instance: whether interest rates are fixed or variable; whether debt is callable; the currency of the debt; a profile of the creditors (bilateral institutions, multilateral institutions, commercial banks, Central Bank, etc.); an analysis of the risk associated with the debt; and where appropriate, what the debt is being used to finance.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to the composition of government debt at the end of the budget year as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to the composition of government debt is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on the composition of the debt outstanding at the end of the budget year.

Answer:

d. No, information related to composition of total debt outstanding is not presented.

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p.163-185 and p. 216
<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/section1.pdf>

Comment:

Information on the composition of total debt outstanding is not provided for FY 2022. The citations above only provide information until 2021.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

14b. Based on the response to Question 14, check the box(es) to identify which elements of the composition of the total debt outstanding are presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal:

Answer:
None of the above

Source:

Comment:
No comments.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

15. "Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?"

(The core information must include a discussion of the economic outlook with estimates of nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)"

GUIDELINES:

Question 15 focuses on the macroeconomic forecast that underlies the budget's revenue and expenditure estimates, asking whether "core" information related to the economic assumptions is presented. These core components include a discussion of the economic outlook as well as estimates of the following:

- *nominal GDP level;*
- *inflation rate;*
- *real GDP growth; and*
- *interest rates.*

While the core macroeconomic information should be a standard feature of the Executive's Budget Proposal, the importance of some types of macroeconomic assumptions may vary from country to country. For example, the budget estimates of some countries are particularly affected by changes in the price of oil and other commodities.

Beyond these core elements, some governments also provide additional information related to the economic outlook, including for instance: short and long-term interest rates; rate of employment and unemployment; GDP deflator; price of oil and other commodities; current account; exchange rate; and composition of GDP growth.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to the macroeconomic forecast as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to the macroeconomic forecast is presented, but some of the core pieces of

information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information on the macroeconomic forecast is presented.

Answer:

c. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

Source:

Economic Outlook 2022

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/economy/economy-2022.pdf>

Nominal GDP level (2018-2022): p.135

Inflation rates (2017-2021): p.153

Inflation rate (2022): p. 96

Real GDP growth (2018-2022): p.135

Interest rates (2017- Aug 2021): p. 160

Comment:

The Economic Outlook presents information on the estimates of nominal and real GDP growth rates for FY 2022. There is a brief mention of prices (inflation) for FY 2022 (p. 96). Information on interest rates is only provided up to FY 2021.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The Economic Outlook presents information on the estimates of nominal and real GDP growth rates for FY 2022. There is a brief mention of prices (inflation) for FY 2022 (p. 96). Information on interest rates is only provided up to FY 2021 (actual banking sector rates) .

15b. Based on the response to Question 15, check the box(es) to identify which elements of the macroeconomic forecast are included in the Executive's Budget Proposal:

Answer:

Nominal GDP level

Inflation rate

Real GDP growth

Source:

Economic Outlook 2022

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/economy/economy-2022.pdf>

Nominal GDP level (2018-2022): p.135

Inflation rates (2017-2021): p.153

Inflation rate (2022): p. 96

Real GDP growth (2018-2022): p.135

Interest rates (2017- Aug 2021): p. 160

Comment:

The Economic Outlook presents information on the estimates of nominal and real GDP growth rates for FY 2022. There is a brief mention of prices (inflation) for FY 2022 (p. 96). Information on interest rates is only provided up to FY 2021.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The Economic Outlook presents information on the estimates of nominal and real GDP growth rates for FY 2022. There is a brief mention of prices (inflation) for FY 2022 (p. 96). Information on interest rates is only provided up to FY 2021 (actual banking sector rates) .

16. "Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget?"

(The core information must include estimates of the impact on expenditures, revenue, and debt of different assumptions for the inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)"

GUIDELINES:

Question 16 focuses on the issue of whether the Executive's Budget Proposal shows how different macroeconomic assumptions affect the budget estimates (known as a "sensitivity analysis"). It asks whether "core" information related to a sensitivity analysis is presented, estimating the impact on expenditures, revenue, and debt of different assumptions for:

- *inflation rate;*
- *real GDP growth; and*
- *interest rates.*

A sensitivity analysis shows the effect on the budget of possible changes in some macroeconomic assumptions, and is important for understanding the impact of the economy on the budget; for instance, what would happen to revenue collections if GDP growth were slower than what is assumed in the budget proposal? Or what would happen to expenditure if inflation were higher than estimated? Or how will revenue be affected by a decrease in the price of oil?

As noted for Question 15, changes in certain macroeconomic assumptions, such as the price of oil and other commodities, can have a significant impact on the budget estimates. As a result, some sensitivity analyses may also examine the impact on the budget estimates of changes in assumptions such as the price of oil that are beyond the core elements of the inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.

For an example of how a sensitivity analysis may be presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal, see the following:

- *The United States in its 2021 Budget Analytical Perspectives includes a section titled Sensitivity of the Budget to Economic Assumptions along with a table that shows the impact of each economic scenario on revenues, spending, and the deficit. (see pages 16 – 17, <https://www.govinfo.gov/content/pkg/BUDGET-2021-PER/pdf/BUDGET-2021-PER.pdf>).*
- *The Philippines in its 2021 Budget of Expenditures and Sources of Financing (BESF) presents the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on expenditures, revenue, and debt (see page 131, Table A.6 titled "Budget Sensitivity to Macroeconomic Parameters, 2021," <https://www.dbm.gov.ph/wp-content/uploads/BESF/BESF2021/A6.pdf>); pages 12-13, Technical Notes on the 2021 Proposed National Budget <https://www.dbm.gov.ph/images/pdf/files/Technical-Notes-on-the-2021-Proposed-National-Budget.pdf>).*

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to a "sensitivity analysis" as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to a "sensitivity analysis" is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information on "sensitivity analysis" is presented.

Answer:

c. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

Source:

(a) Economic Outlook 2022, Chapter 2 Macroeconomic Outlook, p. 47-97
<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/economy/economy-2022.pdf>

(b) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, Medium Term Fiscal Framework, p.113-131
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

Chapter 2 of the Economic Outlook 2022 discusses the prospects of the domestic and global economy. It does, however, not discuss how changes in the outlook could influence the budget.

The Medium Term Fiscal Framework (MTFF) presents forecasts based on updated macroeconomic and fiscal assumptions providing information on revenue, operating and development expenditure, average real and nominal GDP, average crude oil prices, and average oil production. It does not, however, provide information on how changes in the MTFF could directly affect the budget.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

c. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

Comments: The Economic Outlook includes the present and the following years' downside risks to domestic economic growth. With regard to sensitivity analysis, the Economic Outlook does provide general qualitative assumptions on macroeconomic forecast (GDP and inflation). In the Fiscal Outlook document, it is stated that the Medium-Term Fiscal Framework 2022-2024 (MTFF) which is based on updated macroeconomic and fiscal assumptions is used to ensure appropriate resource allocation and forecast beyond the annual planning horizon over the 2022-2024 period. Therefore, there is information on how the MTFF has influenced the annual budget directly. The MTFF includes projection on revenue, expenditure, nominal and real GDP growth.

Researcher Response

Based on the government review, a second check was made on the documents. There is no sensitivity analysis in the Economic Outlook as such an analysis requires multiple projections based on scenarios. The qualitative information is too general. There is a comprehensive debt sensitivity analysis in the Fiscal Outlook document, p.66 - 72, but not for other categories of budget information. The response is revised to "c" from "d", but for a different reason from the reviewer's comment.

17. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how new policy proposals, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 17 and 18 ask about new policy proposals in the budget. In any given year, most of the expenditures and revenues in the budget reflect the continuation of existing policies. However, much of the attention during the budget debate is focused on new proposals – whether they call for eliminating an existing program, introducing a new one, or changing an existing program at the margins. Typically, these new proposals are accompanied by an increase, a decrease, or a shift in expenditures or revenues. Because these changes may have different impacts on people's lives, the budget proposal should present sufficient detail about new policies and their budgetary impact.

Question 17 asks about new expenditure policies, and Question 18 asks about new revenue policies. To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present both estimates of how all new policy proposals affect expenditures (for Question 17) or revenues (for Question 18) and a narrative discussion of the impact of these new policies. To answer "b" for either question, the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present estimates that show the impact of all new policy proposals, but no narrative discussion is included. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes only a narrative discussion of the impact of the new policies, or if it includes estimates that show the impact of only some, but not all, policy proposals (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on the impact of new policy proposals.

Answer:

c. Yes, information that shows how some but not all new policy proposals affect expenditure is presented.

Source:

(a) Budget Speech 2022
<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/bs22.pdf>

(b) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

Comment:

The Budget Speech typically announces major programs and the allocations to them, but does not necessarily provide the impact for all new policies that are announced.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

18. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how new policy proposals, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 17 and 18 ask about new policy proposals in the budget. In any given year, most of the expenditures and revenues in the budget reflect the continuation of existing policies. However, much of the attention during the budget debate is focused on new proposals – whether they call for eliminating an existing program, introducing a new one, or changing an existing program at the margins. Typically, these new proposals are accompanied by an increase, a decrease, or a shift in expenditures or revenues. Because these changes may have different impacts on people's lives, the budget proposal should present sufficient detail about new policies and their budgetary impact.

Question 17 asks about new expenditure policies, and Question 18 asks about new revenue policies. To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present both estimates of how all new policy proposals affect expenditures (for Question 17) or revenues (for Question 18) and a narrative discussion of the impact of these new policies. To answer "b" for either question, the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present estimates that show the impact of all new policy proposals, but no narrative discussion is included. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes only a narrative discussion of the impact of the new policies, or if it includes estimates that show the impact of only some, but not all, policy proposals (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on the impact of new policy proposals.

Prior-year information constitutes an important benchmark for assessing the proposals for the upcoming budget year. Estimates of prior years should be presented in the same formats (in terms of classification) as the budget year to ensure that year-to-year comparisons are meaningful. For example, if the budget proposes shifting responsibility for a particular program from one administrative unit to another – such as shifting responsibility for the training of nurses from the health department to the education department – the prior-year figures must be adjusted before year-to-year comparisons of administrative budgets can be made.

Typically, when the budget proposal is submitted, the year prior to the budget year (BY-1), also known as the current year, has not ended, so the executive will provide estimates of the anticipated outcome for BY-1. The soundness of these estimates is directly related to the degree to which they have been updated to reflect actual expenditures to date, legislative changes that have occurred, and anticipated changes in macroeconomic, caseload, and other relevant factors for the remainder of the year.

The first year that can reflect actual outcomes, therefore, is generally two years before the budget year (BY-2). Thus the OECD recommends that data covering at least two years before the budget year (along with two years of projections beyond the budget year) are provided in order to assess fully the trends in the budget.

Answer:

c. Yes, information that shows how some but not all new policy proposals affect revenues are presented.

Source:

(a) Budget Speech 2022

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/bs22.pdf>

(b) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

The Budget Speech typically announces how major new policy proposals affect revenues, but does not necessarily provide the impact for all new policy proposals that are announced.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

19. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 19 asks if expenditure estimates for the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) are presented by one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. (See Questions 1-5 above.)

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditure estimates for BY-1 by all three of the expenditure classifications. To answer "b," expenditure estimates for BY-1 must be presented by two of these three classifications. A "c" answer applies if expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if expenditure estimates for BY-1 are not presented by any of the three classifications.

Answer:

a. Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

Source:

(a) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

Administrative and Economic Classification of Operating Expenditure and Development Expenditure - p. 23 onwards

Functional Classification of Operating Expenditure - p. 9

Functional Classification of Development Expenditure - p. 16

(b) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p. 159

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Economic Classification of Operating Expenditure - p. 148

Functional Classification of Development Expenditure - p. 150

(See also p. 159)

Comment:

The Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022 provides the estimates of operating and development expenditure by administrative, economic, and functional classification covering FY 2022 and FY 2021.

The Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates also provides some of the information for FY 2022 and FY 2021 in summary format.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

20. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the

budget year (BY-1)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 20 asks if expenditure estimates for the year before the budget year (BY-1) are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department. For example, the Ministry of Health's budget could be broken down into several subgroups, such as "primary health care," "hospitals," or "administration." These subgroups should be considered programs even if they could be, but are not, broken down into smaller, more detailed units.

A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as *le plan comptable* or *le plan comptable detaillé*. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures, for BY-1. To answer "b," the programs shown individually in the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must account for at least two-thirds of all expenditures for BY-1. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents programs that account for only less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by program.

Answer:

a. Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented for BY-1.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p. 63-491
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

Comment:

The Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022 provides information for individual programs for FY 2022 and FY 2021.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

21. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, have expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditures?

GUIDELINES:

Question 21 asks whether the expenditure estimates for the year before the budget year (BY-1) have been updated from the original enacted levels. Updates can reflect actual experience to date; revised estimates due to shifting of funds by the executive, as permitted under the law; enactment of supplemental budgets; and revised assumptions regarding macroeconomic conditions, caseload, and other relevant factors for the remainder of the year.

Answer "a" applies if the estimates have been updated; answer "b" applies if the original estimates are still being used.

Answer:

a. Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 have been updated from the original enacted levels.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p. 4-495
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

Comment:

Updated expenditure estimates for 2021 (BY-1) are presented in Federal Government Expenditure Estimates document.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

22. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of expenditure for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 22 asks if expenditure estimates for more than one year prior to the budget year (BY-2 and prior years) are presented by any of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. (See Questions 1-5 above.)

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years by all three of the expenditure classifications. To answer "b," expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years must be presented by two of these three classifications. A "c" answer applies if expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are not presented by any of the three classifications

Answer:

a. Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

Source:

(a) Administrative: Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p.23-33
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

(b) Economic: Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p.148
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

(c) Functional: Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p.150
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

Expenditure estimates for BY-2 (2020-2021) are presented for all three expenditure classifications.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

22b. Based on the response to Question 22, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications have estimates for more than one year prior to the budget year in the Executive Budget Proposal:

Answer:

Administrative classification
Economic classification
Functional classification

Source:

(a) Administrative: Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p.23-33
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

(b) Economic: Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p.148
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

(c) Functional: Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p.150
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

Expenditure estimates for BY-2 (2020-2021) are presented for all three expenditure classifications.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

23. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for more than one year preceding the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 23 asks if expenditure estimates for more than one year before the budget year (BY-2 and prior years) are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department. For example, the Ministry of Health's budget could be broken down into several subgroups, such as "primary health care," "hospitals," or "administration." These subgroups should be considered programs even if they could be, but are not, broken down into smaller, more detailed units.

A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as *le plan comptable* or *le plan comptable detaillé*. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must present expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures, for BY-2 and prior years. To answer "b," the programs shown individually in the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation must account for at least two-thirds of all expenditures for BY-2 and prior years. A "c" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or its supporting documentation presents programs that account for only less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by program.

Answer:

d. No, expenditures are not presented by program for BY-2 and prior years.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p. 63-224
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

Comment:

The Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022 only provides information up to BY-2 for projects that are listed under Development Expenditure. Expenditures listed under Operating Expenditure are only provided up to BY-1.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

24. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?

GUIDELINES:

Question 24 asks for which year the actual outcomes for expenditures are shown. In most cases, the most recent year for which budget data on actual outcomes are available will be BY-2, as BY-1 is generally not yet finished when the budget proposal is drafted. So a government that has updated all its expenditure data for BY-2 to reflect what actually occurred, as opposed to estimating the outcome for that year, shows good public financial management practice.

For an "a" answer, a country must meet the good practice of having the figures for BY-2 reflect actual outcomes.

Answer:

a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).

Source:

(a) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, pg. 23-33

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

(b) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p.213-215

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

The Federal Government's Expenditure Estimates 2022 presents 2019 and 2020 actual expenditure by administrative classification.

The Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022 presents 2018 to 2020 actual expenditure by economic and functional classification.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

25. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue by category (such as tax and non-tax) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.

Answer:

a. Yes, revenue estimates for BY-1 are presented by category.

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p. 245-257

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

The Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022 presents tax and non-tax revenue for 2020 (actual) and 2021 (revised estimate).

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

26. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present individual sources of revenue for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.

Answer:

a. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented for BY-1.

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p.245-257
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

The Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022 presents individual sources of revenue up to BY-1. Individual sources of revenue are provided for 2020 (actual) and 2021 (revised estimate).

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

27. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, have the original estimates of revenue for the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) been updated to reflect actual revenue collections?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.

Answer:

a. Yes, revenue estimates for BY-1 have been updated from the original enacted levels.

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p. 245-257
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

The 2022 Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates presents information on BY-1 as "Revised Estimates" indicating that the estimates for BY-1 has been updated from the original enacted level. Revenue for BY-2 (2020) shows actual revenue collection.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

28. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax) for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.

Answer:

a. Yes, revenue estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by category.

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p. 245-257
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

The Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022 present tax and non-tax revenue from BY-2 (2020) onwards.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

29. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present individual sources of revenue for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.

Answer:

a. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented for BY-2 and prior years.

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p. 245-257
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

The Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022 presents individual sources of revenue from BY-2 (2020) onwards.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

30. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 25 through 30 cover the same topics about prior-year information as the previous six questions, only they ask about information provided for revenues rather than expenditures.

Answer:

a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p. 245-257
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

The Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022 presents actual revenue collections from 2020 (BY-2) onwards.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

31. "Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?"

(The core information must include the total debt outstanding at the end of BY-1; the amount of net new borrowing required during BY-1; interest payments on the debt; interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)"

GUIDELINES:

Question 31 focuses on prior-year debt information, rather than on prior-year expenditures or revenues, asking whether "core" information is provided on government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1).

The "core" information includes:

- total debt outstanding at the end of BY-1;
- amount of net new borrowing required during BY-1;
- interest payments on the debt;
- interest rates on the debt instruments;
- maturity profile of the debt; and
- whether it is domestic or external debt.

This core information for BY-1 is consistent with the budget year information for borrowing and debt, which is examined in Questions 13 and 14. Please note that for the purposes of this question, the deficit may be accepted as a proxy for net new borrowing.

In addition, some governments provide information beyond the core elements, such as gross new borrowing required during BY-1; currency of the debt; whether the debt carries a fixed or variable interest rate; whether it is callable; a profile of the creditors (bilateral institutions, multilateral institutions, commercial banks, Central Bank, etc.); where appropriate, what the debt is being used to finance.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for BY-1 as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to government borrowing and debt, including

its composition, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer “d” applies if no information is presented on government borrowing and debt for BY-1.

Answer:

c. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

Source:

(a) https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

- Total debt outstanding at the end of BY-1: p. 217-218
- Amount of net new borrowing required during BY-1: p. 163-185
- Interest payments on the debt: p. 213
- Interest rates on the debt instruments: p. 173
- Maturity profile of the debt: p. 185
- Domestic or external debt: p. 217-218

Comment:

Total debt outstanding at the end of BY-1, and domestic and external debt are provided in Table 4.2. The amount of net new borrowing required during BY-1 is provided in Section 4 (Debt Management). Section 4 also shows the Federal Government Financing for FY 2020 and FY 2021 in Table 4.1. Information on the maturity profile of the debt can be found in graphical format at the end of Section 4. Interest payments on the debt are referred to as debt service charges in Table 3.1. Regarding interest rates only an estimated weighted average interest rate for outstanding domestic debt is provided, as opposed to interest rates on the different debt instruments.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

32. In the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?

GUIDELINES:

Question 32 asks for which year the actual outcome for total debt outstanding is shown. In most cases, the most recent year for which budget data on actual outcomes are available will be BY-2, as BY-1 is generally not yet finished when the budget proposal is drafted. So a government that has updated its debt data for BY-2 to reflect what actually occurred, as opposed to estimating the outcome for that year, shows good public financial management practice.

For an “a” answer, a country must meet the good practice of having the figures for BY-2 reflect actual outcomes.

It is essential that all government activities that may have an impact on the budget – in the current budget year or in future budget years – be fully disclosed to the legislature and the public in budget documents. In some countries, for instance, entities outside central government (such as public corporations) undertake fiscal activities that could affect current and future budgets. Similarly, activities that can have a significant impact on the budget, such as payment arrears and contingent liabilities, sometimes are not properly captured by the regular presentations of expenditure, revenue, and debt.

Answer:

a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p.217-218
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

Table 4.2 presents the federal government debt by holder for the year 2021 (until end of June 2021), 2020, 2019, 2018, and 2017. Thus covering BY-2, BY-3, BY-4, and BY-5.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher Response

Based on the footnotes in the Fiscal Outlook, the consolidated public sector covers 86 statutory bodies (Footnote 1, p.197), and 31 NFPCs (Footnote 1, p.198). However, the Auditor General's Report 2020 p.177-180 provides a list of 135 statutory bodies whose financial statements are under its purview. The EBP is presented on a consolidated basis. The level of coverage may be taken into consideration.

33. "Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on extra-budgetary funds for at least the budget year?

(The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the extra-budgetary fund; and complete income, expenditure, and financing data on a gross basis.)"

GUIDELINES:

Question 33 focuses on extra-budgetary funds, asking whether "core" information related to these funds, which exist outside the budget, are presented. These core components include:

- *a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the extra-budgetary fund (i.e., why was a particular fund set up? what is it used for?); and*
- *estimates of its income, expenditure, and financing. (These estimates should be presented on a gross basis so that it is possible to tell how much money flows through each extra-budgetary fund.)*

In most countries, governments engage in certain budgetary activities that are not included in the central government's budget. Known as extra-budgetary funds, they can range in size and scope. For example, countries frequently set up pension and social security programs as extra-budgetary funds, where the revenues collected and the benefits paid are recorded in a separate fund outside the budget. Another example of an extra-budgetary fund can be found in countries dependent on hydrocarbon/mineral resources, where revenues from producing and selling those resources are channeled through systems outside the annual budget.

In some cases, the separation engendered by an extra-budgetary fund serves a legitimate political purpose, and the finances and activities of these funds are well documented. In other cases, however, this structure is used for obfuscation, and little or nothing is known about a fund's finances and activities.

The availability of information related to extra-budgetary funds is essential for a comprehensive understanding of the government's true fiscal position. In addition to the core information, other information about extra-budgetary funds is also desirable. Such information includes a discussion of the risks associated with the extra-budgetary fund; expenditures classified by economic, functional, or administrative unit; and the rules and procedures that govern the operations and management of the extra-budgetary fund.

For more information about extra-budgetary funds, see the Guide to Transparency in Public Finances: Looking Beyond the Core Budget (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/Looking-Beyond-the-Budget.pdf>) and Principle 2.1.1 of the IMF's Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to extra-budgetary funds as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. A "b" answer applies if the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation presents all of the core information. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to extra-budgetary funds is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on extra-budgetary funds.

Please provide in the comments a list of all known extra-budgetary funds.

Answer:

d. No, information related to extra-budgetary funds is not presented.

Source:

(a) 2022 Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p. 224-225
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

Tables 6.4 and 6.5 present information on the consolidated statutory bodies' and consolidated non-financial public corporations' financial position. Information is however only provided until 2021.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

34. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present central government finances (both budgetary and extra-budgetary) on a consolidated basis for at least the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 34 asks whether the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documents present the finances of the central government on a consolidated basis, showing both its budgetary and extra-budgetary activities. Virtually all of the questions in the OBS questionnaire focus on budgetary central government – the activities of the ministries, departments, or agencies of central government. In addition, Question 33 asks about extra-budgetary funds, such as social security funds that are not included in the budget.

Coverage is an important aspect of fiscal reporting. Budget documents should cover the full scope of government's financial activity. In many countries, extra-budgetary activities are substantial, and can represent a sizable share of the central government's activities. To get a full picture of the central government's finances, therefore, it is necessary to examine both activities that are included in the budget and those that are extra-budgetary. This question asks whether such a consolidated presentation of central government finances, including both revenues and expenditures, is provided.

The central government is only one component of the overall public sector. The public sector also includes other levels of government, such as state and local government, and public corporations. (See Box 2.1 under Principle 1.1.1 of the IMF's Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018): <https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>) For the purpose of answering this question, please consider only the central government level.

In order to answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present central government finances (both budgetary and extra-budgetary) on a consolidated basis for at least the budget year.

Answer:

b. No, central government finances are not presented on a consolidated basis.

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

(i) Section 6: Consolidated Public Sector, p.197-205

(ii) Public finance statistics tables, p. 221-225

Comment:

Information on central government finances is presented in Section 6 of the Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022 document.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

b. No, central government finances are not presented on a consolidated basis.

Comments: However, there is information on Consolidated Public Sector which includes other levels of government, such as state and local government, and public corporations.

IBP Comment

Thank-you to the Government Reviewer, the response is changed to a b, given that while information is presented for the consolidated public sector as a whole, it is not presented separately for central government.

35. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of intergovernmental transfers for at least the budget year?**GUIDELINES:**

Question 35 asks about intergovernmental transfers. In many cases, the central government supports the provision of a good or service by a lower level of government through an intergovernmental transfer of funds. This is necessary because, independent from the level of administrative decentralization that exists in a given country, the capacity for revenue collection of a local government is unlikely to be sufficient to pay for all its expenses. However, because the activity is not being undertaken by an administrative unit of the central government, it is unlikely to receive the same level of review in the budget. Thus it is important to include in the budget proposal a statement that explicitly indicates the amount and purposes of these transfers.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year both estimates covering all intergovernmental transfers and a narrative discussing these transfers. If a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all intergovernmental transfers are presented, then a "b" answer is appropriate. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, intergovernmental transfers (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no estimates of intergovernmental transfers are presented.

Answer:

c. Yes, estimates of some but not all intergovernmental transfers are presented.

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, Table 3.1, pg. 148
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

(b) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p. 509, Lampiran E
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

(c) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p. 52
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

Comment:

Link 1 presents information on the grants and transfers to state governments which is inclusive of constitutional grants and other grants/transfers. Link 2 presents the detailed information on the intergovernmental transfers, however the information is only available for FY 2020. Link 3 provides information at the aggregate level on the intergovernmental transfer for 2022.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

36. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present alternative displays of expenditures (such as by gender, by age, by income, or by region) to illustrate the financial impact of budget policies on different groups of citizens, for at least the budget year?**GUIDELINES:**

Question 36 asks about "alternative displays" of expenditures that highlight the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens. As discussed above, expenditures are typically presented by at least one of three classifications – administrative, functional, and economic classifications (see Questions 1-5) – and by individual program (Question 6). In addition, governments can provide alternative displays to emphasize different aspects of expenditure policies and to show who benefits from these expenditures.

For the purpose of answering this question, the alternative presentation must differ from the presentations (such as administrative, functional, or economic

classifications or presentation by program) used to answer other questions. The alternative display can cover all expenditures or only a portion of expenditures. For instance, it can show how all expenditures are distributed according to geographic region or it can show how selected expenditures (such as the health budget or the agriculture budget) are distributed to different regions. But such a geographic display must be something different than the presentation of intergovernmental transfers used to answer question 35. One exception is when a country includes a special presentation of all policies intended to benefit the most impoverished populations (and is used to answer Question 52) then that can be considered an alternative display for purposes of answering this question as well. Finally, brief fact sheets showing how proposals in the budget benefit particular groups would be insufficient; only more detailed presentations would be considered.

The IBP Budget Brief, "How Transparent are Governments When it Comes to Their Budget's Impact on Poverty and Inequality?" (<https://www.internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/government-transparency-of-budgets-impact-on-poverty-inequality-ibp-2019.pdf>) includes a discussion of the importance of alternative displays of budget information and provides a number of examples. For instance,

- Bangladesh in its 2017-18 Budget included a detailed supplementary Gender Budgeting Report, which presents the spending dedicated to advancing women across various departments. (<https://mof.portal.gov.bd/site/page/3bb14732-b5b1-44df-9921-efedf1496295>).
- The UK's 2017 budget included a supplementary analysis that provided a distributional analysis of the budget by households in different income groups (see https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/661465/distributional_analysis_autumn_budget_2017.pdf)
- South Africa's 2017 Budget Review goes beyond the standard presentation of intergovernmental transfers, discussing the redistribution that results from national revenue flowing to the provinces and municipalities and presenting the allocations on a per capita basis (see chapter 6, <http://www.treasury.gov.za/documents/national%20budget/2017/review/FullBR.pdf>).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must include at least three different presentations that illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens for at least the budget year. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must include at least two different alternative displays of expenditures. A "c" applies if only one type of alternative display of expenditure is presented. Answer "d" applies if no alternative display of expenditure is presented.

Answer:

d. No, alternative displays of expenditures are not presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022 https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

(b) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

Comment:

The cited documents only present expenditures by administrative, functional, and economic classification. Alternative displays of expenditure are not presented showing the impact of budget policies by income, gender, age, climate, or geographic region.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

36b. Based on the response to Question 36, select the box(es) below to identify which types of alternative displays are included in the Executive's Budget Proposal:

Answer:

None of the above

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022 https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

(b) 2022 Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

Comment:

The cited documents only present expenditures by administrative, functional, and economic classification. Alternative displays of expenditure are not presented showing the impact of budget policies by income, gender, age, climate, or geographic region.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

37. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of transfers to public corporations for at least the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 37 asks about transfers to public corporations. It is often the case that governments have a stake in enterprises that manage resources that are particularly relevant for the public good (such as electricity, water, and oil). While these public corporations can operate independently, in some cases the government will provide direct support by making transfers to these corporations, including to subsidize capital investment and operating expenses.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year both estimates covering all transfers to public corporations and a narrative discussing the purposes of these transfers. If a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all transfers to public corporations are presented, then a "b" answer is appropriate. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, transfers to public corporations (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "c" also applies if estimates of transfers to public corporations are presented as a single line item. Answer "d" applies if no estimates of transfers to public corporations are presented.

Please provide in the comments a list of all known public corporations.

Answer:

c. Yes, estimates of some but not all transfers to public corporations are presented.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p. 157-161
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

(b) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Expenditure 2022, p. 225
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

Information is presented on transfers to selected public corporations such as the Malaysia Airports Holdings Bhd (MAHB), and the Bank Pembangunan Malaysia Berhad (BPMB). There are however 26 major non-financial public corporations (NFPCs) according to the Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Expenditure 2022 publication.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

38. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on quasi-fiscal activities for at least the budget year?

(The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the quasi-fiscal activity and the intended beneficiaries.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 38 focuses on quasi-fiscal activities, asking whether "core" information related to such activities is presented. These core components include:

- A statement of purpose or policy rationale for the quasi-fiscal activity (i.e., what is the reason for engaging in this activity?);
- The identification of intended beneficiaries of the quasi-fiscal activity.

The term "quasi-fiscal activities" refers to a broad range of activities that are fiscal in character and could be carried out through the regular budget process but are not. For example, a quasi-fiscal activity could take place if, instead of providing a direct subsidy through the budget for a particular activity, a public financial institution provides an indirect subsidy by offering loans at below-market rates for that activity. Similarly, it is a quasi-fiscal activity when an enterprise provides goods or services at prices below commercial rates to certain individuals or groups to support the government's policy goals.

The above examples are policy choices that may be approved by the government and legislature. However, quasi-fiscal activities can also involve activities that violate or circumvent a country's budget process laws or are not subject to the regular legislative approval process for expenditures. For example, the executive may issue an informal order to a government entity, such as a public commercial enterprise, to provide the executive with goods and services that normally would have to be purchased with funding authorized by the legislature. All quasi-fiscal activities should be disclosed to the public and subject to public scrutiny.

Beyond the core information, some governments may also provide other information about quasi-fiscal activities, including for example: the anticipated duration of the quasi-fiscal activity; a quantification of the activity and the assumptions that support these estimates; and a discussion of the fiscal significance and potential risks associated with the activity, including the impact on the entity carrying out the activity. Principle 3.3.2 of the IMF's Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>) provides examples of quasi-fiscal activities that can be consulted as needed. And more details on quasi-fiscal activities can be found in the Guide to Transparency in Public Finances: Looking Beyond the Core Budget (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/Looking-Beyond-the-Budget.pdf>).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to all quasi-fiscal activities for at least the budget year as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to quasi-fiscal activities is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on quasi-fiscal activities.

If quasi-fiscal activities do not represent a significant problem in your country, please mark "e." However, please exercise caution in answering this question.

Answer:

c. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some quasi-fiscal activities.

Source:

(a) Budget Speech 2022, p. 18-72

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/bs22.pdf>

(b) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p. 497-508

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

(c) Budget Speech 2022 (microcredit schemes), p. 33 & 78

(d) Budget Speech 2022 (National Higher Education Fund Corporation), p. 13

Comment:

Not all of the quasi fiscal activities are presented. In the budget speech, there is a narrative discussion on quasi fiscal activities covering how the initiative will be conducted and the intended beneficiaries. However the details of these quasi fiscal activities are not presented in the detailed estimates of the budget, in the Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022 publication.

For example, TEKUN a microcredit scheme for microenterprises and the informal sector offers a zero percent loan of RM 10,000 with a 12 month moratorium. Other microcredit schemes provided by BSN and Agrobank offers 0% loan rate during the first 6 months and a 6 months moratorium.

Another example of quasi fiscal activities would be the discount given by the National Higher Education Fund Corporation (PTPTN), that provides education loans to further tertiary education. For budget 2022, PTPTN provides a discount of 15% on the outstanding amount for full settlement, a discount of 12% for repayment of at least 50% of the outstanding debt made in a single payment, and a discount of 10% for repayment through salary deductions or direct debit according to a repayment schedule.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: Researcher has sought to clarify the nature/type of quasi-fiscal activities by specific providing examples. This is much appreciated.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

39. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government for at least the budget year?

(The core information must include a listing of the assets, and an estimate of their value.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 39 focuses on financial assets held by the government, asking whether "core" information related to these assets is presented. These core components include:

- *A listing of the financial assets; and*
- *An estimate of their value.*

Governments own financial assets such as cash, bonds, or equities. Unlike private sector businesses, however, few governments maintain balance sheets that show the value of their assets and liabilities.

Beyond the core information, some governments may also provide other information about financial assets, including for example: a discussion of their purpose; historical information on defaults; differences between reported values and market values; and a summary of financial assets as part of the government's balance sheet.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year all of the core information related to all financial assets held by the government as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to financial assets is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on financial assets held by the government.

Answer:

d. No, information related to financial assets is not presented.

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Expenditure 2022, p. 212
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

Information is presented pertaining to non-tax returns on investments, however a listing of financial assets together with an estimate of their value is not provided.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

40. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on nonfinancial assets held by the government for at least the budget year?

(The core information must include a listing of the assets by category.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 40 focuses on nonfinancial assets held by the government, asking whether "core" information related to these assets is presented. The core information is a listing of nonfinancial assets, grouped by the type (or category) of asset.

Nonfinancial assets are things of value that the government owns or controls (excluding financial assets) such as land, buildings, and machinery. The valuation of public nonfinancial assets can be problematic, particularly in cases where the asset is not typically available on the open market (such as a government monument). In these cases, it is considered acceptable to provide summary information in budget documents from a country's register of assets. But, in some cases, governments are able to value their nonfinancial assets; some present a summary of nonfinancial assets as part of their balance sheets. For an example of how nonfinancial assets are presented in one of the many supporting documents to the New Zealand Executive's Budget Proposal, see the Forecast Financial Statement 2011, Notes to the Financial Statements (Continued), Note 14, accessible here: <https://treasury.govt.nz/sites/default/files/2011-05/befu11-pt6of8.pdf>.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year a listing by category of all nonfinancial assets held by the government as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to nonfinancial assets is presented, but some nonfinancial assets are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on nonfinancial assets held by the government.

Answer:

d. No, information related to nonfinancial assets is not presented.

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Expenditure 2022, p. 212
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

Information is presented pertaining to non-tax returns on investments, however a listing of non-financial assets is not provided.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

41. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of expenditure arrears for at least the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 41 asks about estimates of expenditure arrears, which arise when government has entered into a commitment to spend funds but has not made the payment when it is due. (For more information see sections 3.49-3.50 of the IMF's GFS Manual 2001, <http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/gfs/manual/pdf/all.pdf> (page 29)). Though equivalent to borrowing, this liability is often not recorded in the budget, making it difficult to assess fully a government's financial position. Moreover, the obligation to repay this debt affects the government's ability to pay for other activities.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year both estimates covering all expenditure arrears and a narrative discussing the arrears. If a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all expenditure arrears are presented, then a "b" answer is appropriate. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, expenditure arrears (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no estimates of expenditure arrears are presented. Answer "d" also applies if information is only available for the changes in arrears, and not the stock or balance of arrears.

If expenditure arrears do not represent a significant problem in your country, please mark "e." However, please exercise caution in answering this question. Public expenditure management laws and regulations often will allow for reasonable delays, perhaps 30 or 60 days, in the routine payment of invoices due. Expenditure arrears impacting a small percentage of expenditure that are due to contractual disputes should not be considered a significant problem for the purpose of answering this question.

Answer:

d. No, estimates of expenditure arrears are not presented.

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Expenditure 2022, p.155-158 & p. 194
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

The document does not provide estimates of expenditure arrears for the budget year. There is a mention of outstanding Public Private Partnership obligations by sector as at end June 2021 and it is stated that one new project was added to the list of projects, namely electronic land management system (e-Tanah) for Perak with a commitment of approximately RM249 million up to 2032.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

42. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities, such as government loan guarantees or insurance programs, for at least the budget year?

(The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each contingent liability; the new guarantees or insurance commitments proposed for the budget year; and the total amount of outstanding guarantees or insurance commitments (the gross exposure) at the end of the budget year.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 42 focuses on contingent liabilities, asking whether "core" information related to these liabilities is presented. These core components include:

- *a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each contingent liability;*
- *the new contingent liabilities for the budget year, such as new guarantees or insurance commitments proposed for the budget year; and*
- *the total amount of outstanding guarantees or insurance commitments at the end of the budget year. This reflects the gross exposure of the government in the case that all guarantees or commitments come due (even though that may be unlikely to occur).*

Contingent liabilities are recognized under a cash accounting method only when the contingent event occurs and the payment is made. An example of such liabilities is the case of loans guaranteed by the central government, which can include loans to state-owned banks and other state-owned commercial enterprises, subnational governments, or private enterprises. Under such guarantees, government will only make a payment if the borrower defaults. Thus a key issue for making quantitative estimates of these liabilities is assessing the likelihood of the contingency occurring.

In the budget, according to the OECD, "[w]here feasible, the total amount of contingent liabilities should be disclosed and classified by major category reflecting their nature; historical information on defaults for each category should be disclosed where available. In cases where contingent liabilities cannot be quantified, they should be listed and described."

Beyond the core information, some governments may also provide other information about contingent liabilities, including for example: historical default rates for each program, and likely default rates in the future; the maximum guarantee that is authorized by law; any special financing associated with the guarantee (e.g., whether fees are charged, whether a reserve fund exists for the purpose of paying off guarantees, etc.); the duration of each guarantee; and an estimate of the fiscal significance and potential risks associated with the guarantees.

For more details on contingent liabilities, see Guide to Transparency in Public Finances: Looking Beyond the Core Budget (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/Looking-Beyond-the-Budget.pdf>) and page 59 (Box 11) and Principle 3.2.3 of the IMF's Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year all of the core information related to contingent liabilities as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to contingent liabilities is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on contingent liabilities.

Answer:

c. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some contingent liabilities.

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Expenditure 2022, p.189-193
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

The Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022 provides some information on the government's financial risks and liabilities. Major contingent liabilities are highlighted along with their purpose and rationale. However the information is limited to data until 2021 and lacks estimates for the budget year, as can be seen in Tables 5.1, 5.2, and 5.3. Table 5.2 provides the major recipients of government loan guarantees; while Table 5.3 provides committed guarantees by entity. The narrative includes a discussion on selected companies such as the 1Malaysia Development Berhad on p. 192.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

43. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present projections that assess the government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term?

(The core information must cover a period of at least 10 years and include the macroeconomic and demographic assumptions used and a discussion of the fiscal implications and risks highlighted by the projections.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 43 focuses on government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer-term, asking whether "core" information related to these issues is presented. These core components must include:

- *Projections that cover a period of at least 10 years.*
- *The macroeconomic and demographic assumptions used in making the projections.*
- *A discussion of the fiscal implications and risks highlighted by the projections. Good public financial management calls for budgets to include fiscal sustainability analyses.*

The IMF's Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>) recommends that governments regularly publish the projected evolution of the public finances over the longer term (see Principle 3.1.3.). Future liabilities are a particularly important element when assessing the sustainability of public finances over the long term. Future liabilities are the result of government commitments that, unlike contingent liabilities, are virtually certain to occur at some future point and result in an expenditure. A typical example consists of government obligations to pay pension benefits or cover health care costs of future retirees. Under a cash accounting system, only current payments associated with such obligations are recognized in the budget. To capture the future impact on the budget of these liabilities, a separate statement is required.

Beyond the core information, some governments may also provide other information about the sustainability of their finances, including for example: projections that cover 20 or 30 years; multiple scenarios with different sets of assumptions; assumptions about other factors (such as the depletion of natural resources) that go beyond just the core macroeconomic and demographic data; and a detailed presentation of particular programs that have long time horizons, such as civil service pensions.

For more details on future liabilities, see Guide to Transparency in Public Finances: Looking Beyond the Core Budget (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/Looking-Beyond-the-Budget.pdf>).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core information related to future liabilities and the sustainability of government finances over the longer term as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to future liabilities is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on future liabilities and the sustainability of government's finances

Answer:

d. No, information related to future liabilities and the sustainability of finances over the longer term is not presented.

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022 https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

There is no presentation on the sustainability of finances using different macroeconomic or demographic assumptions.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

44. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind, for at least the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 44 asks about estimates of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind assistance. Such assistance is considered non-tax revenue, and the sources of this assistance should be explicitly identified. In terms of in-kind assistance, the concern is primarily with the provision of goods (particularly those for which there is a market that would allow goods received as in-kind aid to be sold, thereby converting them into cash) rather than with in-kind aid like advisors from a donor country providing technical assistance.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year both estimates covering all donor assistance and a narrative discussing the assistance. If a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all donor assistance are presented, then a "b" answer is appropriate. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, donor assistance (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "c" also applies if the sources of donor assistance are not presented, but the total amount of donor assistance is presented as a single line item. Answer "d" applies if no estimates of donor assistance are presented. Select answer "e" if your country does not receive donor assistance.

Answer:

c. Yes, estimates of some but not all sources of donor assistance are presented.

Source:

(a) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022, p. 254-255
https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

Data is provided on aggregate contributions and compensation from overseas and local contributions, however details are not provided including on the origin of these contributions.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

45. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on tax expenditures for at least the budget year?

(The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each tax expenditure, the intended beneficiaries, and an estimate of the

revenue foregone.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 45 focuses on tax expenditures, asking whether “core” information related to these tax preferences is presented. These core components must include for both new and existing tax expenditures:

- a statement of purpose or policy rationale;
- a listing of the intended beneficiaries; and
- an estimate of the revenue foregone.

Tax expenditures arise as a result of exceptions or other preferences in the tax code provided for specified entities, individuals, or activities. Tax expenditures often have the same impact on public policy and budgets as providing direct subsidies, benefits, or goods and services. For example, encouraging a company to engage in more research through a special tax break can have the same effect as subsidizing it directly through the expenditure side of the budget, as it still constitutes a cost in terms of foregone revenues. However, expenditure items that require annual authorization are likely to receive more scrutiny than tax breaks that are a permanent feature of the tax code.

Beyond the core information, some governments may also provide other information about tax expenditures, including for example: the intended beneficiaries by sector and income class (distributional impact); a statement of the estimating assumptions, including the definition of the benchmark against which the foregone revenue is measured; and a discussion of tax expenditures as part of a general discussion of expenditures for those program areas that receive both types of government support (in order to better inform policy choices). For more details on tax expenditures, see *Guide to Transparency in Public Finances: Looking Beyond the Core Budget* (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/Looking-Beyond-the-Budget.pdf>) and Principle 1.1.4 of the IMF’s *Fiscal Transparency Handbook* (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>).

To answer “a,” the Executive’s Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present, for at least the budget year, all of the core information related to tax expenditures as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer “b,” the Executive’s Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present all of the core components noted above. Answer “b” is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A “c” answer applies if some information related to tax expenditures is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer “d” applies if no information is presented on tax expenditures.

Answer:

c. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some tax expenditures.

Source:

(a) Budget Speech 2022 Appendices, p.103-154
<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/bs22.pdf>

Comment:

The appendices provide the tax measures for 2022, that include a statement of purpose or policy rationale and the listing of intended beneficiaries. However, an estimate of revenue forgone is not provided.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

46. Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of earmarked revenues for at least the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 46 asks about estimates of earmarked revenues, which are revenues that may only be used for a specific purpose (for example, revenues from a tax on fuel that can only be used for building roads). This information is important in determining which revenues are available to fund the government’s general expenses, and which revenues are reserved for particular purposes.

To answer “a,” the Executive’s Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present for at least the budget year both estimates covering all individual earmarked revenues and a narrative discussing the earmarks. If a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all individual earmarked revenues are presented, then a “b” answer is appropriate. A “c” response applies if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, earmarked revenues (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer “d” applies if no estimates of earmarked revenues are presented. An “e” response applies if revenue is not earmarked or the practice is disallowed by law or regulation.

Answer:

c. Yes, estimates of some but not all earmarked revenues are presented.

Source:

(a) Budget Speech 2022, p.26 & p.33

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/bs22.pdf>

Comment:

The Budget Speech refers briefly to some earmarked revenues, including:

(a) "To facilitate youths venturing into entrepreneurship, financing of RM150 million will be provided by Bank Simpanan Nasional and Agrobank." (p. 26)

(b) "Next year, microcredit financing worth about RM1.8 billion will be provided through various agencies such as TEKUN, Agrobank, BSN, Bank Rakyat and Bank Negara Malaysia." (p. 33)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

47. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on how the proposed budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to government's policy goals for the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 47 and 48 ask about information that shows how the budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to the government's policy goals. The budget is the executive's main policy document, the culmination of the executive's planning and budgeting processes. Therefore, it should include a clear description of the link between policy goals and the budget – that is, an explicit explanation of how the government's policy goals are reflected in its budget choices. For an example of a discussion of a government's policy goals in the budget, see pages 13-18 of New Zealand's 2011 Statement of Intent (<http://www.treasury.govt.nz/publications/abouttreasury/soi/2011-16>), one of the many documents supporting its budget.

In some countries the government prepares strategic/development plans. These plans include all the policies the government is planning to implement for the budget year and very often cover a multi-year perspective. In some cases, these plans do not match the budget documentation, and it is possible that they are completely disconnected from the Executive's Budget Proposal. So the question is examining whether government policy plans are "translated" into revenue and expenditure figures in the actual budget documents.

Question 47 asks about the information covering the budget year, and Question 48 asks about the period at least two years beyond the budget year. To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present both estimates of how the budget is linked to government's policy goals for the budget year (for Question 47) or for a multi-year period beyond the budget year (for Question 48) and a narrative discussion of how these policy goals are reflected in the budget. To answer "b" for either question, the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present estimates that show how the budget is linked to government's policy goals, but no narrative discussion is included. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes only a narrative discussion, or if it includes estimates that show how the budget is linked to some, but not all, of the government's policy goals (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on how the budget is linked to government's policy goals.

Answer:

a. Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for the budget year are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

Source:

(a) Budget Speech 2022

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/bs22.pdf>

(b) Budget 2022 Touchpoints

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/touchpoints-en.pdf>

Comment:

The Budget Speech and Touchpoints present the budget goals that focus on three main areas: the rakyat's (citizen's) wellbeing, resilient businesses, and a prosperous and sustainable economy. The documents also list expenditure programs and initiatives that fall under these three broad goals.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

48. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on how the proposed budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to government's policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 47 and 48 ask about information that shows how the budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to the government's policy goals. The budget is the executive's main policy document, the culmination of the executive's planning and budgeting processes. Therefore, it should include a clear description of the link between policy goals and the budget – that is, an explicit explanation of how the government's policy goals are reflected in its budget choices. For an example of a discussion of a government's policy goals in the budget, see pages 13-18 of New Zealand's 2011 Statement of Intent (<http://www.treasury.govt.nz/publications/abouttreasury/soi/2011-16>), one of the many documents supporting its budget.

In some countries the government prepares strategic/development plans. These plans include all the policies the government is planning to implement for the budget year and very often cover a multi-year perspective. In some cases, these plans do not match the budget documentation, and it is possible that they are completely disconnected from the Executive's Budget Proposal. So the question is examining whether government policy plans are "translated" into revenue and expenditure figures in the actual budget documents.

Question 47 asks about the information covering the budget year, and Question 48 asks about the period at least two years beyond the budget year. To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present both estimates of how the budget is linked to government's policy goals for the budget year (for Question 47) or for a multi-year period beyond the budget year (for Question 48) and a narrative discussion of how these policy goals are reflected in the budget. To answer "b" for either question, the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present estimates that show how the budget is linked to government's policy goals, but no narrative discussion is included. A "c" response applies if the presentation includes only a narrative discussion, or if it includes estimates that show how the budget is linked to some, but not all, of the government's policy goals (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" applies if no information is presented on how the budget is linked to government's policy goals.

Answer:

c. Yes, information that shows how the proposed budget is linked to some but not all of the government's policy goals for a multi-year period is presented.

Source:

(a) Budget Speech 2022
<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/bs22.pdf>

Comment:

Some of the initiatives mentioned can be linked to the 12th Malaysia Plan, a 5 year blueprint that focuses on economic empowerment, environmental sustainability, and social re-engineering. However, the budget as a whole does not link policy goals to a multi-year period, such that not all initiatives are linked.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

49. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired for at least the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 49 asks about the availability of nonfinancial data on inputs for the budget year. (Nonfinancial data on outputs and outcomes are addressed in Question 50.)

The budget should disclose not only the amount of money that is being allocated on a program but also any information needed to analyze that expenditure. Nonfinancial data and performance targets associated with budget proposals are used to assess the success of a given policy. For example, even when allocated funds are spent according to plan, there remains the question of whether the policy delivered the results that it aimed to achieve.

Nonfinancial data can include information on:

Inputs - These are the resources assigned to achieve results. For example, in regards to education, nonfinancial data on inputs could include the number of books to be provided to each school or the materials to be used to build or refurbish a school.

Outputs - These are products and services delivered as a result of inputs. For example, the number of pupils taught every year; the number of children that received vaccines; or the number of beneficiaries of a social security program.

Outcomes - These are the intended impact or policy goals achieved. For example, an increase in literacy rates among children under 10, or a reduction in rates of maternal mortality.

In addition, governments that set performance targets must use nonfinancial data for outputs and outcomes to determine if these targets have been met.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present, for at least the budget year, nonfinancial data on inputs for each individual program within all administrative units (ministries, departments, and agencies). It is also acceptable if nonfinancial data on inputs for each individual program is organized by functions. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present nonfinancial data on inputs for all administrative units or all functions, but not for each individual program (or even for any programs) within those administrative units or functions. A "c" response applies if nonfinancial data on inputs are presented only for some programs and/or some administrative units or some functions. Answer "d" applies if no nonfinancial data on inputs is presented.

Answer:

c. Yes, nonfinancial data on inputs are presented for some programs and/or some administrative units (or functions).

Source:

(a) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p. 63-468

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

Comment:

Nonfinancial data on inputs are not consistently provided, with scattered information provided across administrative units, such as on the number of personnel.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

50. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present nonfinancial data on results (in terms of outputs or outcomes) for at least the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 50 asks about the availability of nonfinancial data on results for the budget year. Nonfinancial data on results can include data on both outputs and outcomes, but not on inputs (which are addressed in Question 49).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present, for at least the budget year, nonfinancial data on results for each individual program within all administrative units (ministries, departments, and agencies). It is also acceptable if nonfinancial data on results for each individual program is organized by functional classification. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must present nonfinancial data on results for all administrative units or all functional classifications, but not for each individual program (or even for any programs) within those administrative units or functions. A "c" response applies if nonfinancial data on results are presented only for some programs and/or some administrative units or some functions. Answer "d" applies if no nonfinancial data on results is presented.

Answer:

a. Yes, nonfinancial data on results are provided for each program within all administrative units (or functions).

Source:

(a) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p. 63-468

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

Comment:

The Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022 provides nonfinancial information on each administrative unit. Outcomes and their respective indicators are provided for each program funded by the budget. For example, the Ministry of Works (p. 277) includes expected outcomes for its programs: Management; Development of road infrastructure and development of building industry; Building infrastructure; and Maintenance of tangible assets.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

51. Are performance targets assigned to nonfinancial data on results in the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation?**GUIDELINES:**

Question 51 asks about performance targets assigned to nonfinancial data on results for the budget year. The question applies to those nonfinancial results shown in the budget, and that were identified for purposes of Question 50.

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must assign performance targets to all nonfinancial data on results shown in the budget for at least the budget year. To answer "b," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must assign performance targets to a majority (but not all) of the nonfinancial data on results shown in the budget. A "c" response applies performance targets are assigned only to less than half of the nonfinancial data on results. Answer "d" applies if no performance targets are assigned to nonfinancial data on results shown in the budget, or the budget does not present nonfinancial results.

Answer:

a. Yes, performance targets are assigned to all nonfinancial data on results.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p. 63-468

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.pdf

Comment:

Outcomes and their respective indicators are provided for each program funded by the budget under each ministry. The targets are provided besides the indicators in tabular format.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

52. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of policies (both new proposals and existing policies) that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations in at least the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 52 asks whether the budget highlight policies, both new and existing, that benefit the poorest segments of society. This question is intended to assess only those programs that directly address the immediate needs of the poor, such as through cash assistance programs or the provision of housing, rather than indirectly, such as through a stronger national defense. This information is of particular interest to those seeking to bolster government's commitment to anti-poverty efforts. For purposes of answering this question, a departmental budget (such as for the Department of Social Welfare) would not be considered acceptable. In general, this question is asking whether the EBP includes a special presentation that pulls together estimates of all the relevant policies in one place. However, if the country uses "program budgeting," where programs are presented as expenditure categories with specific and identified objectives, and it identifies anti-poverty programs within each administrative unit, then that is also acceptable for this question.

The IBP Budget Brief, "How Transparent are Governments When it Comes to Their Budget's Impact on Poverty and Inequality?"

(<https://www.internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/government-transparency-of-budgets-impact-on-poverty-inequality-ibp-2019.pdf>) includes a discussion of countries that have provided information on how its policies affect the poor.

For instance, Pakistan provides a detailed breakdown of pro-poor expenditure as part of its 2017-18 budget proposal. In one document, the government sets out policy priorities, expected outputs, and estimates of past and future spending for several programs aimed at poverty alleviation. Another supporting document provides a comprehensive overview of ongoing policies, including a chapter on social safety nets, covering both financial and performance information of poverty alleviation schemes over a period of eight years. (http://www.finance.gov.pk/budget/mtbf_2018_21.pdf and http://www.finance.gov.pk/survey_1718.html).

To answer "a," the Executive's Budget Proposal or supporting documentation must for at least the budget year both present estimates covering all policies that are intended to benefit the most impoverished populations and include a narrative discussion that specifically addresses these policies. (For countries using program budgeting that breaks out individual anti-poverty programs, there should be a separate narrative associated with each such program.) Answer "b" if a narrative discussion is not included, but estimates for all policies that are intended to benefit the most impoverished populations are presented. Answer "c" if the presentation includes estimates covering only some, but not all, policies that are intended to benefit the most impoverished populations (regardless of whether it also includes a narrative discussion). Answer "d" if no estimates of policies that are intended to benefit the most impoverished populations are presented.

Answer:

a. Yes, estimates of all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

Source:

(a) Budget Speech 2022

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/bs22.pdf>

(b) Federal Government Expenditure Estimates 2022, p. 63 - 491; p. 17-18

https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/perbelanjaan/Anggaran_Perbelanjaan_Persekutuan_2022.

Comment:

Programs that benefit the country's impoverished populations are carried out by multiple line ministries. For example, programs related to poverty eradication are conducted by the Prime Minister's Department, Ministry of Rural Development, Ministry of Federal Territories, and Ministry of Housing and Local Government.

The estimates of policies can be seen in the EBP where it shows each ministry's program outcome performance from 2020 to 2022. The framework provides a performance indicator showing the target the ministry intends to achieve for 2021 and 2022, and the actual performance in 2020.

Additionally, program outcome performance information includes the activities that will be incorporated within the program together with its purpose. The framework thus shows the implementation impact of new or existing policies.

The Expenditure Estimates also report on the aggregate level budget allocation categorized according to the Sustainable Development Goals.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

53. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for

submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the Ministry of Finance or whatever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 53 asks about the budget timetable. An internal timetable is particularly important for the executive's management of the budget preparation process, in order to ensure that the executive accounts for the views of the different departments and agencies in the proposed budget. The timetable would, for instance, set deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the Ministry of Finance or whatever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation. So that civil society is aware of the various steps in the budget formulation process, and when opportunities may exist to engage the executive, it is essential that this timetable be made available to the public.

To answer "a," the executive must prepare a detailed budget timetable and release it to the public. A "b" answer applies if the timetable is made public, but some details are not included. A "c" response applies if the timetable is made public, but many important details are excluded, reducing its value for those outside government. Answer "d" applies if no timetable is made available to the public. As long as a timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal is released, answer "a," "b," or "c" may be selected, even if the Executive's Budget Proposal is not made publicly available.

Answer:

b. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded.

Source:

(a) PB 1.3 Penyediaan Belanjawan 2022 (Treasury Circular 1.3 - Budget 2022 Preparation), p. 17
<https://www.myresults.gov.my/portal/wp-content/uploads/2021/04/PB-1.3-Penyediaan-Belanjawan-2022-Final-PDF.pdf>

Comment:

A timetable for the preparation of budget proposals by government ministries and agencies is provided in the treasury circular. The circular focuses on providing internal instructions to line ministries, including the date of submission for budget requests from line ministries to the Ministry of Finance. As such, its usefulness to the public is limited as, for instance, it does not provide a timeline for the finalisation of the budget by the Cabinet or the expected date of its tabling to Parliament.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

d. No, a timetable is not issued to the public.

Comments: The circular is meant to provide instructions to line ministries, including the deadlines for submission for budget requests from line ministries to the Ministry of Finance. It is not intended to be used by the public. Therefore I would select D.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IBP Comment

As per the OBS methodology, as long as a timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal is released, answer "a," "b," or "c" may be selected.

54. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?

(The core information must include a discussion of the economic outlook with estimates of nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 54 focuses on the macroeconomic forecast that underlies the Pre-Budget Statement, asking whether "core" information related to the economic assumptions is presented. These core components include a discussion of the economic outlook as well as estimates of the following:

- nominal GDP level;
- inflation rate;
- real GDP growth; and
- interest rates.

Beyond these core elements, some governments also provide additional information related to the economic outlook, including for instance: short- and long-

term interest rates; the rate of employment and unemployment; GDP deflator; price of oil and other commodities; current account; exchange rate; and composition of GDP growth.

To answer "a," the Pre-Budget Statement must present all of the core information related to the macroeconomic forecast as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Pre-Budget Statement must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to the macroeconomic forecast is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information on the macroeconomic forecast is presented.

Answer:

c. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

Source:

(a) 2023 Pre-Budget Statement

<https://mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/siaran-media/Pre-Budget-Statement-2023.pdf>

Comment:

The macroeconomic outlook for the Budget 2023 (p. 18) includes the projected economic growth, inflation, private consumption as well as private investment growth rates.

Core elements not included: distinction between nominal and real GDP growth levels, and interest rates.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

55. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the government's expenditure policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?

(The core information must include a discussion of expenditure policies and priorities and an estimate of total expenditures.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 55 focuses on the government's expenditure policies and priorities in the Pre-Budget Statement, asking whether "core" information related to these policies is presented. These core components include:

- a discussion of expenditure policies and priorities; and
- an estimate of total expenditures.

Although a Pre-Budget Statement is unlikely to include detailed programmatic proposals (such detailed information is typically only presented in the budget itself), it should include a discussion of broad policy priorities and a projection of at least total expenditures associated with these policies for the budget year. The Pre-Budget Statement can include some detail, for instance, estimates provided by any of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications.

To answer "a," the Pre-Budget Statement must present for the upcoming budget year all of the core information related to the government's expenditure policies and priorities as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Pre-Budget Statement must present all of the core components noted above for the upcoming budget year. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to the government's expenditure policies and priorities is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information on the government's expenditure policies and priorities is presented.

Answer:

c. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

Source:

(a) 2023 Pre-Budget Statement
<https://mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/siaran-media/Pre-Budget-Statement-2023.pdf>

Comment:

There is a general discussion of expenditure policies and priorities, including that the Budget 2023 is to be formulated based on 3 priority areas (p. 20): a) economic recovery with focus on jobs and income, b) strengthening economic resilience, and c) implementing comprehensive reforms in socio-economic aspects.

However, an estimate of total expenditures is not provided.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

56. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the government's revenue policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?

(The core information must include a discussion of revenue policies and priorities and an estimate of total revenues.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 56 focuses on the government's revenue policies and priorities in the Pre-Budget Statement, asking whether "core" information related to these policies is presented. These core components include:

- *a discussion of revenue policies and priorities; and*
- *an estimate of total revenue.*

Although a Pre-Budget Statement is unlikely to include detailed revenue proposals, it should include a discussion of broad policy priorities and a projection of at least the total revenue associated with these policies for the budget year. The Pre-Budget Statement can also include more detail, for instance, with estimates provided by revenue category – tax and non-tax – or some of the major individual sources of revenue, such as the Value Added Tax or the income tax.

To answer "a," the Pre-Budget Statement must present for the upcoming budget year all of the core information related to the government's revenue policies and priorities as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Pre-Budget Statement must present all of the core components noted above for the upcoming budget year. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if some information related to the government's revenue policies and priorities is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if no information on the government's revenue policies and priorities is presented.

Answer:

d. No, information related to the government's revenue policies and priorities is not presented.

Source:

(a) 2023 Pre-Budget Statement
<https://mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/siaran-media/Pre-Budget-Statement-2023.pdf>

Comment:

While there is a discussion of tax revenue performance, it focuses on past performance and not the upcoming budget year. This includes that an estimate of total revenue is not provided.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

c. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

Comments: The info on tax strategies can be referred in the PBS document page 15. Link: 2023 Pre-Budget Statement <https://mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/siaran-media/Pre-Budget-Statement-2023.pdf>

Researcher Response

The Pre-Budget Statement on page 15 discusses measures such as undertaking a review of incentives, reliefs and deductions, and operational measures such as improving registration and introducing e-invoicing. Other than that, there is no indication of revenue policy that would guide detailed development of the budget.

57. Does Pre-Budget Statement present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 57 asks whether the Pre-Budget Statement includes three key estimates related to borrowing and debt:

- *the amount of net new borrowing needed in the upcoming budget year;*
- *the central government's total debt burden at the end of the upcoming budget year; and*
- *the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the upcoming budget year.*

Debt is the accumulated amount of money that the government borrows. The government can borrow from its citizens, banks, and businesses within the country (domestic debt) or from creditors outside the country (external debt). External debt is typically owed to private commercial banks, other governments, or international financial institutions such as the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund.

Net new borrowing is the additional amount of new borrowing that is required for the budget year to finance expenditures in the budget that exceed available revenues. Net new borrowing adds to the accumulated debt. It is distinct from gross borrowing, which also includes borrowing needed to repay existing debt that matured during the budget year; debt that is replaced (or rolled over) does not add to the total of accumulated debt. For the purposes of this question, the deficit may be accepted as a proxy for net new borrowing.

Interest payments on the debt (or debt service costs) are typically made at regular intervals, and these payments must be made on a timely basis in order to avoid defaulting on the debt obligation. Interest payments are separate from the repayment of principal, which occurs only when the loan has matured and must be paid back in full.

To answer "a," the Pre-Budget Statement must present all three estimates of borrowing and debt for at least the upcoming budget year. For a "b" answer, the Pre-Budget Statement must present two of those three estimates. For a "c" answer, the PBS must present one of the three estimates. Answer "d" applies if no information on borrowing and debt is presented in the PBS.

Answer:

d. No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.

Source:

(a) 2023 Pre-Budget Statement
<https://mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/siaran-media/Pre-Budget-Statement-2023.pdf>

Comment:

None of the three key estimates related to borrowing and debt are presented.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

58. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present estimates of total expenditures for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 58 asks about multi-year expenditure estimates in the Pre-Budget Statement.

To answer "a," expenditure estimates for at least two years beyond the upcoming budget year must be presented. The estimates must be for at least total expenditures, but could include more detail than just the aggregate total.

Answer:

b. No, multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented.

Source:

(a) 2023 Pre-Budget Statement

<https://mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/siaran-media/Pre-Budget-Statement-2023.pdf>

Comment:

Expenditure estimates are not presented for the multi-year period.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

59. Does the Enacted Budget present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 59 asks if expenditure estimates in the Enacted Budget are presented by any one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications – which were addressed in Questions 1-5 above. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. Unlike classification by administrative unit, which tends to be unique to each country, functional and economic classifications for government budgeting have been developed and standardized by international institutions. Cross-country comparisons are facilitated by adherence to these international classification standards.

To answer "a," the Enacted Budget must present expenditure estimates by all three of the expenditure classifications. To answer "b," expenditure estimates must be presented by two of the three classifications. A "c" answer applies if expenditure estimates are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if expenditure estimates are not presented by any of the three classifications.

Answer:

c. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by only one of the three expenditure classifications.

Source:

(a) Supply Act 2022

<https://lom.agc.gov.my/act-view.php?type=amendment&lang=BI&act=A1638>

Comment:

The Supply Act 2022 only presents authorised supply expenditures for each administrative function (by ministry).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

59b. Based on the response to Question 59, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications are included in the Enacted Budget:

Answer:

Administrative classification

Source:

(a) Supply Act 2022

<https://lom.agc.gov.my/act-view.php?type=amendment&lang=BI&act=A1638>

Comment:

The Supply Act 2022 only presents authorised supply expenditures for each administrative function (by ministry).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

60. Does the Enacted Budget present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

GUIDELINES:

Question 60 asks if expenditure estimates in the Enacted Budget are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department.

A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as *le plan comptable* or *le plan comptable detaillé*. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer "a," the Enacted Budget must present all programs, which account for all expenditures, in the budget year. To answer "b," the Enacted Budget must present expenditures for individual programs that when combined account for at least two-thirds of expenditures, but not all expenditures. A "c" answer applies if the Enacted Budget presents programs that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by program in the Enacted Budget.

Answer:

d. No, the Enacted Budget does not present expenditure estimates by program.

Source:

(a) Supply Act 2022

<https://lom.agc.gov.my/act-view.php?type=amendment&lang=BI&act=A1638>

Comment:

The Supply Act 2022 does not present program-level estimates. It only provides information about the amount allocated for each ministry for supply expenditures.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

61. Does the Enacted Budget present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 61 asks whether revenue estimates in the Enacted Budget are presented by "category"— that is, whether tax and non-tax sources of revenue are shown separately.

To answer "a," the Enacted Budget must present revenue estimates classified by category.

Answer:

b. No, the Enacted Budget does not present revenue estimates by category.

Source:

(a) Finance Act 2021

https://lom.agc.gov.my/ilims/upload/portal/akta/outputaktap/1719465_BI/ACT%20833.pdf

(b) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022 https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

The Finance Act 2021 does not present revenue estimates by category (Source a). It only presents amendments to tax-related policies such as the Income Tax Act 1967, the Real Property Gains Tax Act 1976, the Petroleum (Income Tax) Act 1967, the Labuan Business Activity Tax Act 1990, the Promotion of Investments Act 1986, the Finance Act 2012, and the Finance Act 2018.

Detailed estimates of the federal revenue by category (tax and non-tax, with further breakdowns) are presented in the Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022 (Source b). However, that is an EBP document.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Disagree
Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents revenue estimates by category.

Comments: "Detailed estimates of the federal revenue by category (tax and non-tax, with further breakdowns) are presented in the Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022. Under Federal Constitution Article 99, the Government is required to table revenue and expenditure estimates before the commencement of the year in the Parliament. The estimates are presented together in 2 separate documents which are expenditure estimates via supply bill and revenue estimates via Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates through Kertas Perintah (Order Paper). Meanwhile, the Government is also tabling all amendments related to tax policies such as Income Tax Act, Stamp Act and Customs Act. Therefore, the Revenue Estimates 2022 which is part of the Fiscal Outlook and Revenue Estimates 2022 should be regarded as Enacted Budget documents." Revenue: Tinjauan Fiskal dan Anggaran Hasil Kerajaan Persekutuan 2022 (Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022) which is a Parliament statutory document. Details of revenue estimates including for preceding year (BY-1) can be found on page 245-257 (Kertas Perintah CMD.35 Tahun 2021 (Order Paper CMD.35 2021))

Researcher Response

Agree that the revenue estimates are a constitutional requirement. If proposed revenue policies are passed without amendment, the estimates in the EBP would stand as the revenue estimates for the enacted budget. However, if amendments are proposed and accepted, it would not be known, as the EBP is published as presented. It is suggested that the EBP figures could be accepted as the EB only if there is evidence to make clear to the public that there were no amendments to the EBP. Note also the actual revenue policies are passed into law at a later date through Finance or Tax Bills or amendments to related Acts.

IBP Comment

Thank you to the reviewer for the comment. In OBS methodology, the proposed budget (even if approved without amendment) can only be considered

part of the approved budget if: 1) The document is republished as a version that clearly shows it is the approved version, or 2) The approval law explicitly references the proposed documents and notes that they approved without any changes in the allocations. Given that the Malaysian budget is approved without either of these confirmations that the proposed budget should then be considered the approved version, the researcher's original response is confirmed.

62. Does the Enacted Budget present individual sources of revenue?

GUIDELINES:

Question 62 asks whether revenue estimates for individual sources of revenue are presented in the Enacted Budget. The question applies to both tax and non-tax revenue.

To answer "a," the Enacted Budget must present all individual sources of revenue, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all revenue. To answer "b," the Enacted Budget must present individual sources of revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all revenue, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue that account for less than two-thirds of revenues. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of revenue are not presented.

Answer:

d. No, the Enacted Budget does not present individual sources of revenue.

Source:

(a) Finance Act 2021

https://lom.agc.gov.my/ilims/upload/portal/akta/outputaktap/1719465_BI/ACT%20833.pdf

(b) Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022 https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/revenue/fiscal_outlook_2022.pdf

Comment:

The Finance Act 2021 does not present revenue estimates by individual sources (Source a). It only presents amendments to tax-related policies such as the Income Tax Act 1967, the Real Property Gains Tax Act 1976, the Petroleum (Income Tax) Act 1967, the Labuan Business Activity Tax Act 1990, the Promotion of Investments Act 1986, the Finance Act 2012, and the Finance Act 2018.

Estimates for individual sources of federal revenue are presented in the Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022 (Source b). However, that is an EBP document.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.

Comments: "Detailed estimates of the federal revenue by category (tax and non-tax, with further breakdowns) are presented in the Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022. Under Federal Constitution Article 99, the Government is required to table revenue and expenditure estimates before the commencement of the year in the Parliament. The estimates are presented together in 2 separate documents which are expenditure estimates via supply bill and revenue estimates via Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates through Kertas Perintah (Order Paper). Meanwhile, the Government is also tabling all amendments related to tax policies such as Income Tax Act, Stamp Act and Customs Act. Therefore, the Revenue Estimates 2022 which is part of the Fiscal Outlook and Revenue Estimates 2022 should be regarded as Enacted Budget documents." Revenue: Tinjauan Fiskal dan Anggaran Hasil Kerajaan Persekutuan 2022 (Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimates 2022) which is a Parliament statutory document. Details of revenue estimates including for preceding year (BY-1) can be found on page 245-257 (Kertas Perintah CMD.35 Tahun 2021 (Order Paper CMD.35 2021))

Researcher Response

Agree that the revenue estimates are a constitutional requirement. If proposed revenue policies are passed without amendment, the estimates in the EBP would stand as the revenue estimates for the enacted budget. However, if amendments are proposed and accepted, it would not be known, as the EBP is published as presented. It is suggested that the EBP figures could be accepted as the EB only if there is evidence to make clear to the public that there were no amendments to the EBP. Note also the actual revenue policies are passed into law at a later date through Finance or Tax Bills or amendments to related Acts.

IBP Comment

Thank you to the reviewer for the comment. In OBS methodology, the proposed budget (even if approved without amendment) can only be considered part of the approved budget if: 1) The document is republished as a version that clearly shows it is the approved version, or 2) The approval law explicitly references the proposed documents and notes that they approved without any changes in the allocations. Given that the Malaysian budget is approved without either of these confirmations that the proposed budget should then be considered the approved version, the researcher's original response is confirmed.

63. Does the Enacted Budget present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 63 asks about three key estimates related to borrowing and debt:

- the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year;*
- the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year;*
- the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year.*

Debt is the accumulated amount of money that the government borrows. The government can borrow from its citizens, banks, and businesses within the country (domestic debt) or from creditors outside the country (external debt). External debt is typically owed to private commercial banks, other governments, or international financial institutions such as the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund.

Net new borrowing is the additional amount of new borrowing that is required for the budget year to finance expenditures in the budget that exceed available revenues. Net new borrowing adds to the accumulated debt. It is distinct from gross borrowing, which also includes borrowing needed to repay existing debt that matured during the budget year; debt that is replaced (or rolled over) does not add to the total of accumulated debt. For the purposes of this question, the deficit may be accepted as a proxy for net new borrowing.

Interest payments on the debt (or debt service costs) are typically made at regular intervals, and these payments must be made on a timely basis in order to avoid defaulting on the debt obligation. Interest payments are separate from the repayment of principal, which occurs only when the loan has matured and must be paid back in full.

To answer "a," the Enacted Budget must present all three estimates of borrowing and debt. For a "b" answer, the Enacted Budget must present two of those three estimates. For a "c" answer, the Enacted Budget must present one of the three estimates. Answer "d" applies if no information on borrowing and debt is presented in the Enacted Budget.

Answer:

d. No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.

Source:

(a) Supply Act 2022

<https://lom.agc.gov.my/act-view.php?type=amendment&lang=BI&act=A1638>

(b) Finance Act 2021

https://lom.agc.gov.my/ilims/upload/portal/akta/outputaktap/1719465_BI/ACT%20833.pdf

Comment:

The Supply Act 2022 and Finance Act 2021 do not present information or estimates on government borrowing and debt.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

64. What information is provided in the Citizens Budget?

(The core information must include expenditure and revenue totals, the main policy initiatives in the budget, the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget is based, and contact information for follow-up by citizens.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 64 focuses on the content of the Citizens Budget, asking whether "core" information is presented. These core components include:

- *expenditure and revenue totals;*
- *the main policy initiatives in the budget;*
- *the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget is based; and*
- *contact information for follow-up by citizens.*

To answer "a," the Citizens Budget or supporting documentation must present all of the above core information as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer "b," the Citizens Budget must present all of the core components noted above. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A "c" answer applies if the Citizens Budget includes some of the core components above, but other core pieces of information are not included. Answer "d" applies if a Citizens Budget is not published.

Answer:

c. The Citizens Budget provides information, but it excludes some core elements.

Source:

(a) Budget 2022 official website

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/en/2022/>

(b) Budget 2022 Touchpoints

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/touchpoints-en.pdf>

(c) Budget 2022 Infographics

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456462612669997066>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456468579826618368>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456465340548878342>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467218586234880>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464319638433794>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456465663883558918>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467870150389761>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464065618870278>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467550871515140>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464692394684416>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456468246341640197>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1468750504977043456>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1468749812677840900>

Comment:

The Budget 2022 Touchpoints and infographics provide information on the budget's main policy initiatives. The other core elements are not provided, including expenditure and revenue totals, and the macroeconomic forecasts upon which the budget is based.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

65. How is the Citizens Budget disseminated to the public?

GUIDELINES:

Question 65 asks how the Citizens Budget is disseminated to the public. Citizens Budgets should be made available to a variety of audiences. Therefore paper versions and an Internet posting of a document might not be sufficient.

To answer "a," the executive must use three or more different types of creative media tools to reach the largest possible share of the population, including those who otherwise would not normally have access to budget documents or information. Dissemination would also be pursued at the very local level, so that the coverage is targeted both by geographic area and population group (e.g., women, elderly, low income, urban, rural, etc.). Option "b" applies if significant dissemination efforts are made through a combination of two means of communications, for instance, both posting the Citizens Budget on the executive's official website and distributing printed copies of it. Option "c" applies if the Citizens Budget is disseminated through only posting on the executive's official website. Option "d" applies when the executive does not publish a Citizens Budget.

Answer:

b. A Citizens Budget is published by using at least two, but less than three, means of dissemination, but no other dissemination efforts are undertaken by the executive.

Source:

(a) Budget 2022 official website

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/en/2022/>

(b) Budget 2022 Touchpoints

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/touchpoints-en.pdf>

(c) Budget 2022 Infographics

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456462612669997066>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456468579826618368>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456465340548878342>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467218586234880>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464319638433794>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456465663883558918>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467870150389761>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464065618870278>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467550871515140>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464692394684416>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456468246341640197>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1468750504977043456>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1468749812677840900>

(d) Interview on Budget 2022 by Director of the National Budget Office, Ministry of Finance (1 November 2021)

<https://www.bfm.my/podcast/morning-run/the-breakfast-grille/a-budget-for-the-whole-family>

(e) Department of Information Budget 2022 Infographic

<https://www.penerangan.gov.my/japenv2/wp-content/uploads/2021/09/belanjawan2022.jpeg>

(f) Budget 2022 Website Infographic Flipbook

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/infografik/>

Comment:

The Ministry of Finance disseminates information through multiple streams. Budget 2022 Touchpoints and an infographic flipbook are available on the Budget 2022 official website, while the infographics are also disseminated on the official Twitter account of the Ministry of Finance. The Director of the National Budget Office gave a radio interview on the budget on 1 November 2021. Infographics on Budget 2022 are also disseminated in The Department of Information official website.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

66. Has the executive established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information prior to publishing the Citizens Budget?

GUIDELINES:

Question 66 asks whether the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information before publishing a Citizens Budget. What the public wants to know about the budget might differ from the information the executive includes in technical documents that comprise the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget; similarly, different perspectives might exist on how the budget should be presented, and this may vary depending on the context. For this reason the executive should consult with the public on the content and presentation of the Citizens Budget.

To answer "a," the executive must have established mechanisms to consult with the public, and these mechanisms for consultation are both accessible and widely used by the public. Such mechanisms can include focus groups, social networks, surveys, hotlines, and meetings/events in universities or other locations where people gather to discuss public issues. In countries where Citizens Budgets are consistently produced and released, it may be sufficient for the government to provide the public with contact information and feedback opportunities, and subsequently use the feedback to improve its management of public resources.

Option "b" applies if the executive has established mechanisms for consultation that are accessible to the public, but that the public nonetheless does not use frequently. That is, the public does not typically engage with the executive on the content of the Citizens Budget, even though the executive has created opportunities for such consultation. Option "c" applies if the executive has established mechanism for consultation with the public, but they are poorly designed and thus not accessible to the public. Option "d" applies if the executive has not created any mechanisms to seek feedback from the public on the content of the Citizens Budget.

Answer:

d. No, the executive has not established any mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget.

Source:

(a) Public Suggestion Survey for Budget 2022

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1435076816838922243>

(b) Interview with Mr Afizal bin Kasa, Head of Budget Section, the National Budget Office, Ministry of Finance.

Comment:

There was an opportunity for the public to provide suggestions about the Budget 2022 through <https://budget.mof.gov.my> for the period: 7 September 2021 to 15 September 2021 before the Budget 2022 was announced. The form for BY2022 is no longer accessible. However, based on a phone interview with a representative of the National Budget Office, the researcher determined that the form submission did not have any specific question on what information the public would like the government to publish. The form was to take in general suggestions and recommendations for the budget.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget, and these mechanisms are accessible and widely used by the public.

Comments: There was an opportunity for the public to provide suggestions about the Budget 2022 through <https://budget.mof.gov.my> for the period: 7 September 2021 to 15 September 2021 before the Budget 2022 was announced.

Researcher Response

Based on the differing comments, the researcher used the Wayback Machine to verify the issue. The specific budget feedback form discussed in the interview did not have this specific question. There was an open channel available at the bottom of the budget website's landing page that provides a phone number or direct email to the budget team. It is suggested that the open channel rather than the structured feedback form allows the public to make direct enquiries and give feedback on what budget information they would like to see. There is no specific query on what information the public would like to see, and no evidence of how widely used this mechanism is, although it is very accessible and open to any types of enquiries. The researcher suggests the response may be revised to b. Ref: <http://web.archive.org/web/20221007063900/https://budget.mof.gov.my/ms/>

IBP Comment

The original response is retained, in that while an open channel has been created for interaction with the public and for the provision of feedback on the budget itself, there is no indication that the public were asked to provide feedback on the contents of the Citizens Budget itself.

67. Are "citizens" versions of budget documents published throughout the budget process?

GUIDELINES:

Question 67 asks if "citizens" versions of budget documents are published throughout the budget process. While the Citizens Budget was initially conceived as a simplified version of the Executive's Budget Proposal or the Enacted Budget, good practice is now evolving and suggests that a "citizens" version of key budget documents should be produced during each of the four phases of the budget cycle. This would serve to inform citizens of the state of public financial management throughout the entire budget cycle.

To answer "a," a citizens version of at least one budget document is published for each of the four stages of the budget process (budget formulation, enactment, execution, and audit) – for a total of at least four citizens budget documents throughout the process. Option "b" applies if a citizens version of a budget document is published for at least two of the four stages of the budget process. Option "c" applies if a citizens version of a budget document is published for at least one of the four stages of the budget process. Select option "d" if no "citizens" version of budget documents is published.

Answer:

b. A citizens version of budget documents is published for at least two of the four stages of the budget process.

Source:

(a) Budget 2022 Touchpoints

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/2022/ucapan/touchpoints-en.pdf>

(b) Budget 2022 Infographics

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456462612669997066>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456468579826618368>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456465340548878342>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467218586234880>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464319638433794>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456465663883558918>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467870150389761>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464065618870278>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456467550871515140>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456464692394684416>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1456468246341640197>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1468750504977043456>

<https://twitter.com/MOFmalaysia/status/1468749812677840900>

(c) Audit Report Infographics

<https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1222>

Infographic and explanation section - <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1225>

Comment:

The Budget 2022 Touchpoints and infographics are published as the citizens' version of the EBP and incorporate visual elements for presenting key focus areas, strategies and initiatives to the public. There are also infographics providing critical information from the Audit Report.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

68. Do the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 68 asks if expenditure estimates in In-Year Reports are presented by any one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications – which were addressed in Questions 1-5 above.

Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. Unlike classification by administrative unit, which tends to be unique to each country, functional and economic classifications for government budgeting have been developed and standardized by international institutions. Cross-country comparisons are facilitated by adherence to these international classification standards.

To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present actual expenditures by all three of the expenditure classifications. To answer "b," actual expenditures must be presented by two of these three classifications. A "c" answer applies if actual expenditures are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if actual expenditures are not presented by any of the three classifications in In-Year Reports.

Answer:

d. No, the In-Year Reports do not present actual expenditures by any expenditure classification.

Source:

(a) Malaysian Economy Fourth Quarter 2022
<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202204/>

Comment:

The IYR provides some expenditure by economic classification. For example, the Malaysian Economy Fourth Quarter 2022 provides a brief overview of subsidies and social assistance, emoluments, supplies and services, and debt service charges (p. 9). However, the information is in narrative form and does not account for all expenditures. In addition, information is also not presented by the administrative or functional classifications.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

68b. Based on the response to Question 68, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications are included in the In-Year Reports:

Answer:

None of the above

Source:

Malaysian Economy Quarterly Reports 2022:

(a) Q1 FY2022 - <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202201/>

(b) Q2 FY2022 - <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202202/>

(c) Q3 FY2022 - <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202203/>

(d) Q4 FY2022 - <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202204/>

Comment:

The IYR provides some expenditure by economic classification. However, the information is in narrative form and does not account for all expenditures. In addition, information is also not presented by the administrative or functional classifications.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

69. Do the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for individual programs?

GUIDELINES:

Question 69 asks if expenditure estimates in In-Year Reports are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department.

A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as *le plan comptable* or *le plan comptable detaillé*. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present actual expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures. To answer "b," In-Year Reports must present actual expenditures for individual programs that when combined account for at least two-thirds of expenditures, but not all expenditures. A "c" answer applies if In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for programs that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if actual expenditures are not presented by program in In-Year Reports.

Answer:

d. No, the In-Year Reports do not present actual expenditures by program.

Source:

Malaysian Economy Quarterly Reports 2022:

(a) Q1 FY2022 - <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202201/>

(b) Q2 FY2022 - <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202202/>

(c) Q3 FY2022 - <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202203/>

(d) Q4 FY2022 - <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202204/>

Comment:

The IYRs do not present actual expenditures by program.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: a. Kertas Perintah CMD.35 Tahun 2021 (Order Paper CMD.35 2021).

70. Do the In-Year Reports compare actual year-to-date expenditures with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 70 asks whether In-Year Reports compare actual expenditures to-date with either the enacted levels or actual expenditures for the same period in the previous year.

The OECD recommends that the reports contain the total year-to-date expenditures in a format that allows for a comparison with the budget's forecast expenditures (based on enacted levels) for the same period.

To answer "a," comparisons must be made for expenditures presented in the In-Year Reports

Answer:

a. Yes, comparisons are made for expenditures presented in the In-Year Reports.

Source:

(a) Malaysian Economy Fourth Quarter 2022, p. 10
<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202204/>

Comment:

The IYR presents actual expenditures on a yearly and quarterly basis for FY2022 and FY2021 (p. 10).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

71. Do In-Year Reports present actual revenue by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

GUIDELINES:

Questions 71 asks whether In-Year Reports present actual revenues by "category"— that is, whether tax and non-tax sources of revenue are shown separately.

To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present revenue estimates classified by category.

Answer:

a. Yes, In-Year Reports present actual revenue by category.

Source:

Malaysian Economy Quarterly Reports 2022:

(a) Q1 FY2022 - <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202201/>

(b) Q2 FY2022 - <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202202/>

(c) Q3 FY2022 - <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202203/>

(d) Q4 FY2022 - <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202204/>

Comment:

The IYRs provide brief narrative discussions on actual revenue data for tax (direct and indirect) and non-tax revenue. For example, on p. 8 in the Malaysian Economy Fourth Quarter 2024, explanations are given in different paragraphs for tax revenue and non-tax revenue collections, respectively. The data is however not presented in detail.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

72. Do In-Year Reports present the individual sources of revenue for actual revenues collected?

GUIDELINES:

Question 72 asks whether In-Year Reports present actual collections of individual sources of revenue (such as income taxes, VAT, etc.). The question applies to both tax and non-tax revenue.

To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present actual collections for all individual sources of revenue, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all revenue. To answer "b," In-Year Reports must present actual collections for individual sources of revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all revenue collected, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue that account for less than two-thirds of all revenue collected. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of actual revenue are not presented.

Answer:

c. Yes, In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenue.

Source:

(a) Malaysian Economy Fourth Quarter 2022, p. 8
<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202204/>

Comment:

The latest IYR reports the actual revenue in two broad categories, i.e., non-tax revenue and tax revenue on p. 8. The latter is further broken down into direct tax and indirect tax. However, only the sales and service tax figure is reported as an individual source of the indirect tax. This figure accounts for less than two-thirds of all revenue.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

73. Do the In-Year Reports compare actual year-to-date revenues with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 73 asks whether In-Year Reports compare actual revenues to-date with either the enacted levels or actual revenues for the same period in the previous year.

The OECD recommends that the reports contain the total year-to-date revenues in a format that allows for a comparison with the budget's forecast revenues (based on enacted levels) for the same period.

To answer "a," comparisons must be made for revenues presented in the In-Year Reports.

Answer:

a. Yes, comparisons are made for revenues presented in the In-Year Reports.

Source:

(a) Malaysian Economy Fourth Quarter 2022, p.10
<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202204/>

Comment:

The IYR presents actual aggregate revenue on a yearly and quarterly basis for FY2022 and FY2021 (p. 10).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

74. Do In-Year Reports present three estimates related to actual government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing; the total debt outstanding; and interest payments?

GUIDELINES:

Question 74 asks about three key estimates related to borrowing and debt:

- the amount of net new borrowing so far during the year;
- the central government's total debt burden at that point in the year; and
- the interest payments to-date on the outstanding debt.

Debt is the accumulated amount of money that the government borrows. The government can borrow from its citizens and banks and businesses within the country (domestic debt) or from creditors outside the country (external debt). External debt is typically owed to private commercial banks, other governments, or international financial institutions such as the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund.

Net new borrowing is the additional amount of new borrowing that is required for the budget year to finance expenditures in the budget that exceed available revenues. Net new borrowing adds to the accumulated debt. It is distinct from gross borrowing, which also includes borrowing needed to repay existing debt that matured during the budget year; debt that is replaced (or rolled over) does not add to the total of accumulated debt. For the purposes of this question, the deficit may be accepted as a proxy for net new borrowing.

Interest payments on the debt (or debt service costs) are typically made at regular intervals, and these payments must be made on a timely basis in order to avoid defaulting on the debt obligation. Interest payments are separate from the repayment of principal, which occurs only when the loan has matured and must be paid back in full.

To answer "a," In-Year Reports must present all three estimates of borrowing and debt. For a "b" answer, In-Year Reports must present two of those three estimates. For a "c" answer, IYRs must present one of the three estimates. Answer "d" applies if no information on borrowing and debt is presented in In-Year Reports.

Answer:

b. Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

Source:

(a) Malaysian Economy Fourth Quarter 2022, p. 9-15
<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202204/>

Comment:

The IYR reports the total net borrowing so far during the year (p.15). It also presents the federal government deficit of RM99.5 billion, that can be used as a proxy for net new borrowing (p. 10). The federal government's total debt burden at that point in the year, with a break down of different sources of the debt is provided on p.10. The IYR, however, only reports interest payments (debt servicing charges) for the respective quarter (p. 9), not cumulatively.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

Comments: The Government of Malaysia debt related Acts only allow the Government to borrow only to finance development expenditure and repayment of maturing debts. In this context, the estimates on the net new borrowing requirement equals to the deficit amount. The estimates of Federal Government's total debt as at end of budget year is presented as a percentage to GDP. The interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year is mentioned in Section 3: Federal Government Expenditure (Table 3.1, page 148), Fiscal Outlook and Federal Government Revenue Estimate 2022.

Researcher Response

The question refers to in-year reports.

75. Do In-Year Reports present information related to the composition of the total actual debt outstanding?

(The core information must include interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)

GUIDELINES:

Question 75 focuses on the composition of government debt, asking whether “core” information related to its composition is presented. These core components include:

- interest rates on the debt;
- maturity profile of the debt; and
- whether the debt is domestic or external.

The interest rates affect the amount of interest that must be paid to creditors. The maturity profile indicates the final payment date of the loan, at which point the principal (and all remaining interest) is due to be paid; government borrowing typically includes a mix of short-term and long-term debt. As discussed in Question 74, domestic debt is held by a country’s citizens and banks and businesses, while external debt is held by foreigners. These factors related to the composition of the debt give an indication of the potential vulnerability of the country’s debt position, and ultimately whether the cost of servicing the accumulated debt is affordable.

Beyond these core elements, a government may also provide additional information related to the composition of its debt, including for instance: whether interest rates are fixed or variable; whether debt is callable; the currency of the debt; a profile of the creditors (bilateral institutions, multilateral institutions, commercial banks, Central Bank, etc.); an analysis of the risk associated with the debt; and where appropriate, what the debt is being used to finance.

To answer “a,” In-Year Reports must present all of the core information related to the composition of government debt to-date as well as some additional information beyond the core elements. To answer “b,” In-Year Reports must present all of the core components noted above. Answer “b” is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. A “c” answer applies if some information related to the composition of government debt is presented, but some of the core pieces of information are not included. Answer “d” applies if no information is presented on the composition of the debt outstanding in In-Year Reports.

Answer:

c. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

Source:

(a) Malaysian Economy Fourth Quarter 2022, p. 15
<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/ekonomi/suku-tahunan/202204/>

Comment:

The IYR only presents the core component of whether the debt is domestic or external (offshore borrowing) on p.15. Information is not provided on interest rates or the maturity profile of debt.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the composition of the total actual debt outstanding.

Comments: Reference should be made to the Section 4: Debt Management of the Fiscal Outlook and Revenue Estimates 2022. Information provided are as follows: (i) Debt by Instruments; (ii) Debt by currency; (iii) Debt holders; (iv) Average interest rates (v) Average time to maturity (vi) debt legislations; (vi) Usage of the borrowing proceeds (vii) Borrowing and debt management strategies

Researcher Response

The question refers to in-year reports.

76. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include an updated macroeconomic forecast for the budget year underway?

GUIDELINES:

Question 76 asks whether the Mid-Year Review includes an updated macroeconomic forecast for the budget year underway, and provides an explanation of the update.

Refer to Question 15 for the components of the macroeconomic forecast presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal.

To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must include an updated macroeconomic forecast and explain all of the differences between the initial forecast presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal and the updated forecast. The explanation must include at least estimates of all differences; a narrative discussion is desirable but not required if estimates of all the differences are provided. To answer "b," the macroeconomic forecast must be updated, but only some of the differences between the initial and updated forecasts are explained. The explanation would be more limited, such as only a narrative discussion of the differences or estimates covering only some of the differences. A "c" response applies if the Mid-Year Review includes an updated macroeconomic forecast, but does not provide an explanation for the revisions. A "d" response applies if the macroeconomic forecast has not been updated.

Answer:

d. No, the estimates for macroeconomic forecast have not been updated.

Source:

The Mid-Year Review is not publicly produced.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

77. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?

GUIDELINES:

Question 77 asks whether the Mid-Year Review includes updated estimates of expenditure for the budget year underway, and provides an explanation of the update. Please note that year-to-date expenditures as assessed in Question 70 do not qualify as updated estimates of expenditure for the purposes of this indicator.

To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must include updated expenditure estimates and explain all of the differences between the initial levels presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal (or the Enacted Budget) and the updated estimates. The explanation must include at least estimates of all differences; a narrative discussion is desirable but not required if estimates of all the differences are provided. The expenditure estimates must be updated, but only some of the differences between the initial and updated estimates are explained. The explanation would be more limited, such as only a narrative discussion of the differences or estimates covering only some of the differences. A "c" response applies if the Mid-Year Review includes updated expenditure estimates, but does not provide an explanation for the revisions. A "d" response applies if the expenditure estimates have not been updated.

Answer:

d. No, expenditure estimates have not been updated.

Source:

The Mid-Year Review is not publicly produced.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Comments: There is no evidence to show that the Mid-Year Review is undertaken & document produced

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IBP Comment

Based on OBS methodology, when a document is not available, all the questions related to the document's content should be scored as 0, in this case, answer D as per the original answer.

78. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 78 asks if expenditure estimates for the budget year underway in the Mid-Year Review are presented by any one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications – which were addressed in Questions 1-5 above. Please note that year-to-date expenditures as assessed in Question 70 do not qualify as updated estimates of expenditure for the purposes of this indicator.

Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. Unlike classification by administrative unit, which tends to be unique to each country, functional and economic classifications for government budgeting have been developed and standardized by international institutions. Cross-country comparisons are facilitated by adherence to these international classification standards.

To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must present expenditure estimates by all three of the expenditure classifications. To answer "b," expenditure estimates must be presented by two of these three classifications. A "c" answer applies if expenditure estimates are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" applies if expenditure estimates are not presented by any of the three classifications in the Mid-Year Review.

Answer:

d. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.

Source:

The Mid-Year Review is not publicly produced.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Comments: No MYR is produced

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IBP Comment

Based on OBS methodology, when a document is not available, all the questions related to the document's content should be scored as 0, in this case, answer D as per the original answer.

78b. Based on the response to Question 78, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications are included in the Mid-Year Review:

Answer:

None of the above

Source:

The Mid-Year Review is not publicly produced.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

79. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway for individual programs?

GUIDELINES:

Question 79 asks if expenditure estimates in the Mid-Year Review are presented by program for the budget year underway. Please note that year-to-date expenditures as assessed in Question 70 do not qualify as updated estimates of expenditure for the purposes of this indicator.

A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as le plan comptable or le plan comptable detaillé. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must present expenditures for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures. To answer "b," the Mid-Year Review must present expenditures for individual programs that when combined account for at least two-thirds of expenditures, but not all expenditures. A "c" answer applies if the Mid-Year Review presents programs that account for less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" applies if expenditures are not presented by program in the Mid-Year Review.

Answer:

d. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present expenditure estimates by program.

Source:

The Mid-Year Review is not publicly produced.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Comments: Given that no MYR is produced this is no applicable.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IBP Comment

Based on OBS methodology, when a document is not available, all the questions related to the document's content should be scored as 0, in this case, answer D as per the original answer.

80. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?

GUIDELINES:

Question 80 asks whether the Mid-Year Review includes updated estimates of revenue for the budget year underway, and provides an explanation of the update. Please note that year-to-date revenues as assessed in Question 73 do not qualify as updated estimates of revenue for the purposes of this indicator.

To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must include updated revenue estimates and explain all of the differences between the initial levels presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal (or the Enacted Budget) and the updated estimates. The explanation must include at least estimates of all differences; a narrative discussion is desirable but not required if estimates of all the differences are provided. To answer "b," the revenue estimates must be updated, but only some of the differences between the initial and updated estimates are explained. The explanation would be more limited, such as only a narrative discussion of the differences or estimates covering only some of the differences. A "c" response applies if the Mid-Year Review includes updated revenue estimates, but no explanation for the revisions is provided. A "d" response applies if the revenue estimates have not been updated.

Answer:

d. No, revenue estimates have not been updated.

Source:

The Mid-Year Review is not publicly produced.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Comments: As above

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IBP Comment

Based on OBS methodology, when a document is not available, all the questions related to the document's content should be scored as 0, in this case, answer D as per the original answer.

81. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 81 asks whether revenue estimates for the budget year underway in the Mid-Year Review are presented by "category"—that is, whether tax and non-tax sources of revenue are shown separately. Please note that year-to-date revenues as assessed in Question 73 do not qualify as updated estimates of revenue for the purposes of this indicator.

To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must present revenue estimates classified by category.

Answer:

b. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present revenue estimates by category.

Source:

The Mid-Year Review is not publicly produced.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

Comments: As above

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IBP Comment

Based on OBS methodology, when a document is not available, all the questions related to the document's content should be scored as 0, in this case, answer B as per the original answer.

82. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present updated individual sources of revenue for the budget year underway?

GUIDELINES:

Question 82 asks whether revenue estimates for individual sources of revenue for the budget year underway are presented in the Mid-Year Review. Please note that year-to-date revenues as assessed in Question 73 do not qualify as updated estimates of revenue for the purposes of this indicator.

To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must present all sources of revenue individually, accounting for all revenues, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all revenue. To answer "b," the Mid-Year Review must present individual sources of revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all revenue, but not all revenue. A "c" answer applies if the Mid-Year Review presents estimates of individual revenue sources that account for less than two-thirds of revenue. Answer "d" applies if individual sources of revenue are not presented in the Mid-Year Review.

Answer:

d. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present individual sources of revenue.

Source:

The Mid-Year Review is not publicly produced.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Comments: As above

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: MOF has published a Mid-Year Review documents in FY 2023 (only available in national language) as per link as follows: <https://budget.mof.gov.my/pdf/belanjawan2023/LAPORAN-PRESTASI-PERBELANJAAN-PERTENGAHAN-TAHUN-2023.pdf> A brief summary on the revenue collection performance for the budget year is reported in the documents.

IBP Comment

Based on OBS methodology, when a document is not available, all the questions related to the document's content should be scored as 0, in this case, answer D as per the original answer.

83. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the budget year underway?

GUIDELINES:

Question 83 asks whether the Mid-Year Review includes updated estimates of borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the budget year underway, and provides an explanation of the update.

Refer to Question 13 for details on estimates in the Executive's Budget Proposal of borrowing and debt. Key estimates related to borrowing and debt include:

- The amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year;
- The central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year; and
- The interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year.

Refer to Question 14 for details on estimates in the Executive's Budget Proposal related to the composition of the debt. Core information related to the composition of government debt include:

- interest rates on the debt;
- maturity profile of the debt; and
- whether the debt is domestic or external.

To answer "a," the Mid-Year Review must include an updated estimates of borrowing and debt, including its composition, and explain all of the differences between the initial estimates presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal (or Enacted Budget) and the updated estimates. The explanation must include at least estimates of all differences; a narrative discussion is desirable but not required if estimates of all the differences are provided. To answer "b," the estimates of borrowing and debt must be updated, but only some of the differences between the initial and updated estimates are explained. The explanation would be more limited, such as only a narrative discussion of the differences or estimates covering only some of the differences. A "c" response applies if the Mid-Year Review includes updated estimates, but no explanation for the revisions is provided. A "d" response applies if the estimates of borrowing and debt have not been updated.

Answer:

d. No, estimates of government borrowing and debt have not been updated.

Source:

The Mid-Year Review is not publicly produced.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer: e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Comments: As above

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IBP Comment

Based on OBS methodology, when a document is not available, all the questions related to the document's content should be scored as 0, in this case, answer D as per the original answer.

84. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?

GUIDELINES:

Question 84 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and actual expenditures for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all expenditures, along with a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if estimates of the differences for all expenditures are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences are presented for some, but not all expenditures, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. Answer "d" if no estimates of the differences are presented in the Year-End Report

Answer:

a. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all expenditures are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Financial Statements 2021

https://www.anm.gov.my/images/JANM/Webmaster/BPOPA/Penyata-Kewangan/PENYATA_KEWANGAN_KERAJAAN_PERSEKUTUAN_2021.pdf

Operating expenditure, p. 8-19 & p.79-187

Development expenditure, p. 35 & p.190-237

Comment:

The document presents the original and revised estimates, the actual expenditure, and the variance for 2021. This is accompanied by a narrative discussion on operating expenditure (p.18-19), and development expenditure (p. 35).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

85. Does the Year-End Report present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?**GUIDELINES:**

Question 85 asks if expenditure estimates in the Year-End Report are presented by any one of the three expenditure classifications – by administrative, economic, and functional classifications – which were addressed in Questions 1-5 above. Each of the classifications answers a different question: administrative unit indicates who spends the money; functional classification shows for what purpose is the money spent; and economic classification displays what the money is spent on. Unlike classification by administrative unit, which tends to be unique to each country, functional and economic classifications for government budgeting have been developed and standardized by international institutions. Cross-country comparisons are facilitated by adherence to these international classification standards.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present expenditure estimates by all three of the expenditure classifications. Answer "b" if expenditure estimates are presented by two of these three classifications. Answer "c" if expenditure estimates are presented by one of the three classifications. Answer "d" if expenditure estimates are not presented by any of the three classifications in the Year-End Report.

Answer:

a. Yes, the Year-End Report presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

Source:

(a) Federal Government Financial Statements 2021 (https://www.anm.gov.my/images/JANM/Webmaster/BPOPA/Penyata-Kewangan/PENYATA_KEWANGAN_KERAJAAN_PERSEKUTUAN_2021.pdf)

(i) Operating expenditure by administrative and economic classifications, p. 79-187

(ii) Operating expenditure by functional classification, p.19 (Schedule 8)

(iii) Development expenditure by administrative classification, p.190 - 237

(iv) Development expenditure by functional classification, p. 27 (Schedule 12)

Comment:

Operating and development expenditure were presented by administrative and functional classifications. Operating expenditure was also shown by economic classification.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

85b. Based on the response to Question 85, check the box(es) to identify which expenditure classifications are included in the Year-End Report:

Answer:

Administrative classification
Functional classification
Economic classification

Source:

(a) Federal Government Financial Statements 2021 (https://www.anm.gov.my/images/JANM/Webmaster/BPOPA/Penyata-Kewangan/PENYATA_KEWANGAN_KERAJAAN_PERSEKUTUAN_2021.pdf)

- (i) Operating expenditure by administrative and economic classifications, p. 79-187
- (ii) Operating expenditure by functional classification, p.19 (Schedule 8)
- (iii) Development expenditure by administrative classification, p.190 - 237
- (iv) Development expenditure by functional classification, p. 27 (Schedule 12)

Comment:

Operating and development expenditure were presented by administrative and functional classifications. Operating expenditure was also shown by economic classification.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

86. Does the Year-End Report present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

GUIDELINES:

Question 86 asks if expenditure estimates in the Year-End Report are presented by program. There is no standard definition for the term "program," and the meaning can vary from country to country. However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department.

A note for francophone countries: "Program" level detail is sometimes referred to as *le plan comptable* or *le plan comptable detaillé*. (These data are typically coded in the financial management database, following the chart of budgetary accounts, so that they can be organized by administrative and functional classification.)

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present expenditure estimates for all individual programs, accounting for all expenditures. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents expenditures for individual programs that when combined account for at least two-thirds of expenditures, but not all expenditures. Answer "c" if the Year-End Report presents programs that account for only less than two-thirds of expenditures. Answer "d" if expenditures are not presented by program in the Year-End Report.

Answer:

a. Yes, the Year-End Report presents estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures.

Source:

a) Federal Government Financial Statements 2021

https://www.anm.gov.my/images/JANM/Webmaster/BPOPA/Penyata-Kewangan/PENYATA_KEWANGAN_KERAJAAN_PERSEKUTUAN_2021.pdf

Operating expenditure, p. 79-187

Development expenditure, p.190-237

Comment:

Operating and development expenditure are presented by administrative classification (ministry), with a further breakdown on how the spending was divided within each ministry.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

87. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?

GUIDELINES:

Question 87 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and actual revenues for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all revenues, along with a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if estimates of the differences for all revenues are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences are presented for some, but not all revenues, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. Answer "d" if no estimates of the differences are presented in the Year-End Report.

Answer:

a. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all revenues are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Financial Statements 2021, p. 13-17 & p. 61-63

https://www.anm.gov.my/images/JANM/Webmaster/BPOPA/Penyata-Kewangan/PENYATA_KEWANGAN_KERAJAAN_PERSEKUTUAN_2021.pdf

Comment:

The document presents the original and revised estimates, the actual revenues, and the variance for 2021 (p. 61-63). This is accompanied by a narrative discussion (p.13-17).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

88. Does the Year-End Report present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 88 asks whether revenue estimates in the Year-End Report are presented by "category"— that is, whether tax and non-tax sources of revenue are shown separately.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present revenue estimates classified by category.

Answer:

a. Yes, the Year-End Report presents revenue estimates by category.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Financial Statements 2021, p. 61-63

https://www.anm.gov.my/images/JANM/Webmaster/BPOPA/Penyata-Kewangan/PENYATA_KEWANGAN_KERAJAAN_PERSEKUTUAN_2021.pdf

Comment:

The document presents revenue estimates for 2021 and 2020 by tax and non-tax categories (p. 61-63).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

89. Does the Year-End Report present individual sources of revenue?

GUIDELINES:

Question 89 asks whether revenue estimates for individual sources of revenue are presented in the Year-End Report. The question applies to both tax and non-tax revenue.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present all sources of revenue individually, accounting for all revenue, and "other" or "miscellaneous" revenue must account for three percent or less of all revenue. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue that when combined account for at least two-thirds of all revenue, but not all revenue. Answer "c" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of individual revenue sources that account for less than two-thirds of revenue. Answer "d" if individual sources of revenue are not presented in the Year-End Report.

Answer:

a. Yes, the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Financial Statements 2021, p.16 & p. 61-62

https://www.anm.gov.my/images/JANM/Webmaster/BPOPA/Penyata-Kewangan/PENYATA_KEWANGAN_KERAJAAN_PERSEKUTUAN_2021.pdf

Comment:

The document presents most individual sources of revenue, with details of items such as other taxes included within the narrative discussion section. For example, the notes to the financial statements do not provide detail of "other direct tax", but this information can be found within the narrative discussion section, p.16 (Schedule 4), where a breakdown is shown.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

90. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

GUIDELINES:

Question 90 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the original estimates and the actual outcome for the fiscal year for borrowing and debt, including its composition, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.

Refer to Question 13 for details on estimates in the Executive's Budget Proposal of borrowing and debt. Key estimates related to borrowing and debt include:

- the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year;
- the central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year; and
- the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year.

Refer to Question 14 for details on estimates in the Executive's Budget Proposal related to the composition of the debt. Core information related to the composition of government debt include:

- interest rates on the debt;
- maturity profile of the debt; and
- whether the debt is domestic or external.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must include estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented.

Answer:

c. Yes, estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Financial Statements 2021

https://www.anm.gov.my/images/JANM/Webmaster/BPOPA/Penyata-Kewangan/PENYATA_KEWANGAN_KERAJAAN_PERSEKUTUAN_2021.pdf

- net new borrowing required: p. 54
- central government total debt burden: p. 71
- interest rates on debt and maturity profile of debt: p. 252-255
- origin of debt: p. 71 & p. 252-255

Comment:

New borrowings are presented on p. 54, that shows the federal government's deficit and the amount of borrowings that will be incurred to finance that deficit. The federal government's total debt burden and its origin (domestic and external borrowings) are shown in the notes to financial statement No.10 (p. 71). The interest rates and the maturity profile of debt (shown as the date of redemption) for all of the federal government's liabilities' are also shown (p. 252-255).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

90b. Based on the response to Question 90, check the box(es) to identify which estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, have the differences between the original forecast and the actual outcome for the year presented in the Year-End Report:

Answer:

The amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year
The central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year
Interest rates on the debt
Maturity profile of the debt
Whether the debt is domestic or external

Source:

(a) Federal Government Financial Statements 2021

https://www.anm.gov.my/images/JANM/Webmaster/BPOPA/Penyata-Kewangan/PENYATA_KEWANGAN_KERAJAAN_PERSEKUTUAN_2021.pdf

- net new borrowing required: p. 54
- central government total debt burden: p. 71
- interest rates on debt and maturity profile of debt: p. 252-255
- origin of debt: p. 71 & p. 252-255

Comment:

New borrowings are presented on p. 54, that shows the federal government's deficit and the amount of borrowings that will be incurred to finance that deficit. The federal government's total debt burden and its origin (domestic and external borrowings) are shown in the notes to financial statement No.10 (p. 71). The interest rates and the maturity profile of debt (shown as the date of redemption) for all of the federal government's liabilities' are also shown (p. 252-255).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

91. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?**GUIDELINES:**

Question 91 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.

Refer to Question 15 for the components of the macroeconomic forecast in the Executive's Budget Proposal. Core components include estimates of the nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates, although the importance of other macroeconomic assumptions, such as the price of oil, can vary from country to country.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must include estimates of the differences between all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "b" is also accepted if one of the core elements is not presented but additional information beyond the core elements is presented. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented.

Answer:

d. No, estimates of the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year is not presented.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Financial Statements 2021

https://www.anm.gov.my/images/JANM/Webmaster/BPOPA/Penyata-Kewangan/PENYATA_KEWANGAN_KERAJAAN_PERSEKUTUAN_2021.pdf

Comment:

The YER does not provide the differences for the original macroeconomic forecast and the actual outcome for the year.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

91b. Based on the response to Question 91, check the box(es) to identify which elements of the macroeconomic forecast have the differences between the original forecast and the outcome for the year presented in the Year-End Report:

Answer:

None of the above

Source:

(a) Federal Government Financial Statements 2021

https://www.anm.gov.my/images/JANM/Webmaster/BPOPA/Penyata-Kewangan/PENYATA_KEWANGAN_KERAJAAN_PERSEKUTUAN_2021.pdf

Comment:

The YER does not provide the differences for the original macroeconomic forecast and the actual outcome for the year.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

92. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome?

GUIDELINES:

Question 92 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.

Refer to Question 49 for the nonfinancial data on inputs included in the Executive's Budget Proposal.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must include estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented.

Answer:

d. No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are not presented.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Financial Statements 2021

https://www.anm.gov.my/images/JANM/Webmaster/BPOPA/Penyata-Kewangan/PENYATA_KEWANGAN_KERAJAAN_PERSEKUTUAN_2021.pdf

Comment:

The YER does not provide estimates of original estimates of non-financial data on inputs and the actual outcome.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

93. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome?

GUIDELINES:

Question 93 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion. Nonfinancial data on results can include data on both outputs and outcomes, but not on inputs (which are addressed in Question 92).

Refer to Question 50 for the nonfinancial data on results included in the Executive's Budget Proposal.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must include estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented.

Answer:

d. No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are not presented.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Financial Statements 2021

https://www.anm.gov.my/images/JANM/Webmaster/BPOPA/Penyata-Kewangan/PENYATA_KEWANGAN_KERAJAAN_PERSEKUTUAN_2021.pdf

Comment:

The YER does not provide estimates of original estimates of non-financial data on results and the actual outcome.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

94. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted level of funds for policies (both new proposals and existing policies) that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?

GUIDELINES:

Question 94 asks whether the Year-End Report includes estimates of the differences between the enacted level of funds for policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.

Refer to Question 52 for assistance to the most impoverished populations in the Executive's Budget Proposal.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must present estimates of the differences between the enacted level for all policies that are intended to benefit the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between the enacted level for all policies that are intended to benefit the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between the enacted level for some but not all of the policies that are intended to benefit the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented.

Answer:

b. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Financial Statements 2021

https://www.anm.gov.my/images/JANM/Webmaster/BPOPA/Penyata-Kewangan/PENYATA_KEWANGAN_KERAJAAN_PERSEKUTUAN_2021.pdf

Comment:

The YER provides the differences between the enacted estimates, revised estimates and actual expenditure for each program under each administrative unit (ministry), including for those programs that are intended to directly benefit impoverished populations (such as the Covid-19). For example, p. 236 shows the differences in the amount enacted and the additional amount required to finance the BPN, a cash assistance program intended to reduce the burden of those affected by Covid-19. However, a consolidated section with a narrative, that shows all of the programs intended to benefit impoverished populations with the difference between the enacted budget and the actual expenditure is not provided in the document.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

95. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome?

GUIDELINES:

Question 95 asks whether the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome for the year, and whether these estimates are accompanied by a narrative discussion.

Refer to Question 33 for estimates of extra-budgetary funds in the Executive's Budget Proposal.

To answer "a," the Year-End Report must include estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome, including a narrative discussion. Answer "b" if the Year-End Report presents estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome, but does not include a narrative discussion. Answer "c" if estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome are presented, regardless of whether a narrative discussion is included. A "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented

Answer:

d. No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome is not presented.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Financial Statements 2021, p. 19 & p. 53

https://www.anm.gov.my/images/JANM/Webmaster/BPOPA/Penyata-Kewangan/PENYATA_KEWANGAN_KERAJAAN_PERSEKUTUAN_2021.pdf

Comment:

Extra-budgetary funds are not clearly presented in a detailed manner. Expenditure on federal statutory bodies and non-financial public corporations are aggregated as grants and fixed charges (p.19 & p. 53), without showing the amounts that specific bodies/corporations received from the federal government.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

96. Is a financial statement included as part of the Year-End Report or released as a separate report?

GUIDELINES:

Question 96 asks whether a financial statement is included as part of the Year-End Report, or whether it is released as a separate report. The financial statement can include some or all of the following elements: a cash flow statement, an operating statement, a balance sheet, and notes on accounting. For purposes of responding to this question, the financial statement in question does not need to be audited. For an example of a financial statement, see the document "Financial Statements of the Government of New Zealand 2013" (<https://treasury.govt.nz/sites/default/files/2013-10/fsgnz-year-jun13.pdf>)

To answer "a," a financial statement must either be included in the Year-End Report or must be released as a separate report. Answer "a" applies if a financial statement is released as a separate report, even if the Year-End Report is not publicly available. Answer "b" applies if no financial statement is released either as part of the Year-End Report or as a separate report.

Answer:

a. Yes, a financial statement is part of the Year-End Report or is released as a separate report.

Source:

(a) Federal Government Financial Statements 2021

https://www.anm.gov.my/images/JANM/Webmaster/BPOPA/Penyata-Kewangan/PENYATA_KEWANGAN_KERAJAAN_PERSEKUTUAN_2021.pdf

Comment:

The Federal Government's Financial Statements are published as the YER.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

97. What type of audits (compliance, financial, or performance) has the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) conducted and made available to the public?

GUIDELINES:

Question 97 asks about the types of audits conducted by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI). There are three basic types of audits:

- Financial audits are intended to determine if an entity's financial information is accurate (free from errors or fraud) and presented in accordance with the applicable financial reporting and regulatory framework. See ISSAI 200 (<https://www.issai.org/pronouncements/issai-100-fundamental-principles-of-public-sector-auditing/>) for more detail.
- Compliance audits look at the extent to which the relevant regulations and procedures have been followed. See ISSAI 400 (<https://www.issai.org/pronouncements/issai-400-compliance-audit-principles/>) for more details.
- Performance audits assess whether activities are adhering to the principles of economy, efficiency, and effectiveness. See ISSAI 300 (<https://www.issai.org/pronouncements/issai-300-performance-audit-principles/>) for more details.

Financial and compliance audits are more common than performance audits, which usually occur only once a performance framework has been agreed upon. In some countries, the SAI's mandate limits the type of audit it can conduct.

To answer "a," the SAI must have conducted all three types of audit – financial, compliance, and performance – and made all of them available to the public. A "b" response applies if the SAI has conducted two of the three audit types, and a "c" applies if it has conducted only one type of audit. Answers "b" and "c" may be selected even if the Audit Report is not publicly available, as long as the SAI has conducted compliance or performance audits and made them available to the public. A "d" response applies if the SAI has not conducted any of the three types of audits, or has not made them available to the public.

Answer:

a. The SAI has conducted all three types of audits (compliance, financial, or performance) and made them available to the public.

Source:

(a) Archive of available audit reports

<https://lkan.audit.gov.my/index.php>

(b) Financial Audit - Laporan Ketua Audit Negara Penyata Kewangan Kerajaan Persekutuan Tahun 2021
<https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1222>

(c) Compliance Audit - Laporan Ketua Audit Negara Pengauditan Pematuhan Kementerian dan Jabatan Persekutuan
<https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1427>

(d) Performance Audit for Federal government bodies - Laporan Ketua Audit Negara 2021 - Aktiviti Kementerian / Jabatan Kerajaan Persekutuan dan Badan-badan Berkanun Persekutuan

Series 1 (Siri 1) - <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1043>

Series 2 (Siri 2) - <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1474>

(e) Performance Audit for federal government corporations - Laporan Ketua Audit Negara 2021 - Pengurusan Syarikat Kerajaan Persekutuan

Series 1 (Siri 1) - <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1054>

Series 2 (Siri 2) - <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1426>

Comment:

The SAI performs all three types of audits, published in different reports. Performance audits are carried out on a selection of ministries, agencies, federal statutory bodies, and government corporations.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

98. What percentage of expenditures within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited?

GUIDELINES:

Question 98 focuses on the coverage of audits by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI), asking what percentage of expenditures within the SAI's mandate has been audited.

The SAI's mandate is typically defined in statute. Only expenditures related to budgetary central government (ministries, departments, and agencies) that are within the SAI's mandate should be considered for this question. (Question 99 addresses audits of extra-budgetary funds.) Further, the question does not apply to "secret programs" (for example, security-related expenditures that are confidential). Further, if the mandate gives the SAI the authority to outsource some audits, then those audits count for purposes of this question.

Only the Audit Report identified in Section 1 should be used to answer this question. Financial audits and compliance audits, or a hybrid of the two, can be taken into account to answer this question. Performance audits should not be considered for this question.

To answer "a," all expenditures within the SAI's mandate must be audited. A "b" response applies if at least two-thirds, but not all, expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited. A "c" response is appropriate when less than two-thirds of expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited. A "d" response applies when no expenditures have been audited.

Answer:

b. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited.

Source:

(a) Audit Act 1957

<https://lom.agc.gov.my/ilims/upload/portal/akta/LOM/EN/Act%2062%20-15.11.2016.pdf>

(b) Audit (Accounts of Companies) Order 2017

[https://lom.agc.gov.my/ilims/upload/portal/akta/outputp/pua_20170930_P.U.%20\(A\)%20294%202017.pdf](https://lom.agc.gov.my/ilims/upload/portal/akta/outputp/pua_20170930_P.U.%20(A)%20294%202017.pdf)

(c) Financial Audit - Laporan Ketua Audit Negara Penyata Kewangan Kerajaan Persekutuan Tahun 2021 / Auditor General's Report on Federal Financial Statement 2021

<https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1222>

Comment:

Section 5 of the Audit Act 1957 provides the power to the Auditor General to "examine, enquire into and audit:

- (a) the accounts of accounting officers of the Federation and of the States;
- (b) the accounts of any separate fund established in a State or the Federal Territory under Article 97(3) of the Federal Constitution notwithstanding any law to the contrary;
- (c) the accounts of any other public authority or body if it is so provided by law in any case; and, where it is not so provided, at the request of that authority or body and with the consent of the Minister of Finance to be notified in the Gazette;
- (d) the accounts of any other body, including a company registered under the Companies Act 1965 [Act 125], in receipt of a grant or loan from the Federation or a State, and including also a company where more than half its paid-up share capital is held by the Federation, a State or a public authority or is so held in the aggregate by two or more of them: Provided that the Yang di-Pertuan Agong so specifies by order under Article 106(2) of the Federal Constitution and notwithstanding any law relating to the audit of the accounts of any such body;
- (e) (Deleted by Act A558);
- (f) the accounts of any other public authority if the Minister of Finance is satisfied that the public interest requires that the accounts of the authority shall be examined, inquired into and audited by the Auditor General notwithstanding any law relating to the accounts and audit of any such authority: Provided that the Minister shall not cause the accounts of any such authority exercising powers vested in it by State law to be so examined, inquired into and audited unless he shall first have consulted the Menteri Besar or Chief Minister of that State."

The Auditor General Report 2021 presents audit reports of the following:

1. Financial Statement of Federal Government;
2. Financial Statement of Statutory Bodies, Trust Funds and Government Agencies;
3. Accounts of government companies.

The number of companies audited is small compared to the number of companies in the gazetted list. However, considering the substantial number of statutory bodies and trust funds audited, as well as the fact that these institutions represent at least four out of the five types of institutions that are mandated to be audited in the Audit Act, the researcher chose answer (b).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: The researcher's comments/notes, as above, capture Malaysia's current audit practice/process quite well.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

99. What percentage of extra-budgetary funds within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited?

GUIDELINES:

Question 99 focuses on audits of extra-budgetary funds, asking what percentage of extra-budgetary funds within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited. These funds, although technically outside the budget, are governmental in nature and thus should be subject to the same audit requirement as other government programs.

The SAI's mandate is typically defined in statute. Only expenditures related to extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate should be considered for this question. (Question 98 addresses audits of budgetary central government.) Further, if the mandate gives the SAI the authority to outsource some audits, then those audits count for purposes of this question.

To answer "a," all extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate must be audited. A "b" response applies if extra-budgetary funds accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited. A "c" response applies if extra-budgetary funds accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited. A "d" response applies if extra-budgetary funds have not been audited.

Answer:

c. Extra-budgetary funds accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited.

Source:

(a) Audit Act 1957 (Section 5)

<https://www.audit.gov.my/index.php/en/info-korporat/audit-act>

(b) Audit (Accounts of Other Bodies) Order 2022

<https://lom.agc.gov.my/act-detail.php?act=62&lang=BI>

(c) Laporan Ketua Audit Negara Mengenai Penyata Kewangan Kerajaan Persekutuan Tahun 2021 / Auditor's General Report on Federal Government Financial Statements 2021

<https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1222>

(d) Compliance Audit of Agencies

<https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1427>

Comment:

The following are EBFs which are also within the mandate of the Auditor General:

Trust funds besides the Development Fund and Contingency Fund (which are part of the Budget) established under Article 99 of the Federal Constitution

Statutory bodies and agencies

Public corporations listed in Audit (Accounts of Other Bodies) Order 2022

All trust funds are reported in the Federal Government Financial Statements and audited.

The list of statutory bodies with audited financial statements has not been made available, hence it is not possible to identify the number of statutory bodies that have had their financial statements audited in 2021. This is the main reason the researcher has selected the response 'c.'

The National Audit Department conducts a performance audit of a small number of public corporations each year, which would include an assessment of their financial position within a certain time period.

The government liabilities, transfers, and equity investments with respect to agencies and public corporations are part of the Federal Government Financial Statements and are audited (p. 88 - 92; 98-100 of the Auditor General's Report on the Federal Government Financial Statements 2021).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: In the current context, it is hard to be precise about the % of funds within the SAI's mandate that have been audited. But I believe option C is more realistic representation of the current practice.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

100. Does the annual Audit Report(s) prepared by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) include an executive summary?

GUIDELINES:

Question 100 asks whether the annual Audit Report includes an executive summary. Only the Audit Report identified in Section 1 should be used to answer this question. The Audit Report can be a fairly technical document, and an executive summary of the report's findings can help make it more accessible to the media and the public.

To answer "a," the Audit Report must include at least one executive summary summarizing the report's content. Answer "b" applies if the Audit Report does not include an executive summary, or the Audit Report is not made publicly available.

Answer:

a. Yes, the annual Audit Report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report's content.

Source:

(a) Financial Audit - Laporan Ketua Audit Negara Penyata Kewangan Kerajaan Persekutuan Tahun 2021

<https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1222>

Executive Summary: <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1226>

(b) Compliance Audit - Laporan Ketua Audit Negara Pengauditan Pematuhan Kementerian dan Jabatan Persekutuan

<https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1427>

Infographic Summary: <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1431>

Infographic Summary Explanation: <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1432>

(c) Performance Audit for Federal government bodies - Laporan Ketua Audit Negara 2021 - Aktiviti Kementerian / Jabatan Kerajaan Persekutuan dan Badan-badan Berkanun Persekutuan

Series 1 (Siri 1) - <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1043>

Series 2 (Siri 2) - <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1474>

(d) Performance Audit for federal government corporations - Laporan Ketua Audit Negara 2021 - Pengurusan Syarikat Kerajaan Persekutuan

Series 1 (Siri 1) - <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1054>

Series 2 (Siri 2) - <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1426>

Comment:

The audited financial statements includes an executive summary. The other reports have infographic summaries with explanations. The contents provide each report's key points and can be considered an executive summary.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

101. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?

GUIDELINES:

Question 101 asks whether the executive reports to the public on the steps it has taken to address audit recommendations made by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI). The ultimate purpose of audits is to verify that the budget was executed in a manner consistent with existing law, and to hold the government accountable for this execution and its future improvement. The extent to which audits achieve the latter depends on whether there is adequate and timely follow-up on the recommendations provided in the SAI's audit reports.

To answer "a," the executive must report publicly on the steps it has taken to address all audit findings. A "b" response applies if the executive reports publicly on the steps it has taken to address most, but not all, audit findings. A "c" response applies if the executive reports publicly on the steps it has taken to address only some audit findings. As long as the executive reports publicly on the steps it has taken to address audit finding, answer "a," "b," or "c" may be selected, even if the Audit Report is not made publicly available. A "d" response applies if the executive does not report at all on its steps to address audit findings.

Answer:

a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.

Source:

(a) Compliance Audit - Laporan Ketua Audit Negara Pengauditan Pematuhan Kementerian dan Jabatan Persekutuan

<https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1427>

(b) Performance Audit for Federal government bodies - Laporan Ketua Audit Negara 2021 - Aktiviti Kementerian / Jabatan Kerajaan Persekutuan dan Badan-badan Berkanun Persekutuan

Series 1 (Siri 1) - <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1043>

Series 2 (Siri 2) - <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1474>

(c) Performance Audit for federal government corporations - Laporan Ketua Audit Negara 2021 - Pengurusan Syarikat Kerajaan Persekutuan

Series 1 (Siri 1) - <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1054>

Series 2 (Siri 2) - <https://lkan.audit.gov.my/laporan/manage/1426>

Comment:

For compliance and performance audits, the Executives' responses to the audit evaluation including the steps it has taken to address audit recommendations made by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) are included in the Auditor General Reports.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

102. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) or legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?

GUIDELINES:

Question 102 asks whether the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) or the legislature track actions by the executive to address audit recommendations. After audit results and recommendations are discussed and validated by the legislature, the executive is normally asked to take certain actions to address the audit findings. For accountability purposes, the public needs to be informed about the status of those actions, and steps the executive has taken to address audit recommendations. In addition to the executive reporting on its actions (see Question 101), the SAI and legislature – as the key oversight institutions – have a responsibility to keep the public informed by tracking the executive's progress in addressing audit recommendations.

To answer "a," the SAI or legislature must report publicly on what steps the executive has taken to address all audit findings. A "b" response applies if the SAI or legislature reports publicly on what steps the executive has taken to address most, but not all, audit findings. A "c" response applies if the SAI or legislature reports publicly on what steps the executive has taken to address only some audit findings. As long as the SAI or legislature reports publicly on the steps the executive has taken, answer "a," "b," or "c" may be selected, even if the Audit Report is not made publicly available. A "d" response applies if neither the SAI nor the legislature reports on the executive's steps to address audit findings.

Answer:

a. Yes, the SAI or legislature reports publicly on what steps the executive has taken to address all audit recommendations.

Source:

(a) Auditor General's Dashboard Portal
<https://agdashboard.audit.gov.my/>

Comment:

The Auditor General's Dashboard Portal shows the progress of actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations. The Portal shows the number of cases that are being addressed (Dalam Tindakan), completely addressed (Selesai) and not addressed (Tiada Tindakan) and their details. The Portal also shows the aggregate number of unresolved cases by ministry.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

103. Is there an Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) that conducts budget analyses for the budget formulation and/or approval process?

GUIDELINES:

Question 103 examines whether an Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) exists that contributes budget analyses to the budget formulation and/or approval process. According to the Principles for Independent Fiscal Institutions, adopted by the OECD Council in 2014, "independent fiscal institutions are publicly funded, independent bodies under the statutory authority of the executive or the legislature which provide non-partisan oversight and analysis of, and in some cases advice on, fiscal policy and performance", and with "a forward-looking ex ante diagnostic task". In practice, they come in two main forms:

- Parliamentary budget offices (also known as PBOs) such as the Congressional Budget Office in the United States (<https://www.cbo.gov/>), the Parliamentary Budget Office in South Africa (<https://www.parliament.gov.za/parliamentary-budget-office>), and the Center for Public Finance Studies in Mexico (Centro de Estudios de las Finanzas Públicas, <http://www.cefp.gob.mx/>); or
- Fiscal councils such as the Office for Budget Responsibility in the United Kingdom (<https://obr.uk/>) and the High Council for Public Finances in France (Haut Conseil des finances publiques, <https://www.hcfp.fr/>).

For more information, see von Trapp et al. 'Principles for Independent Fiscal Institutions and Case Studies', *OECD Journal on Budgeting* 15:2 (special issue, 2016), <https://doi.org/10.1787/budget-15-5jm2795tv625>.

To answer "a," there must be an IFI, and its independence must be set in law. In addition, it must have sufficient staffing and resources, including funding, to carry out its tasks. Answer "b" applies if an IFI exists, but either its independence is not set in law or its staffing and resources are insufficient to carry out its tasks. Answer "c" applies if an IFI exists, but its independence is not set in law and it lacks sufficient staffing and resources. Answer "d" applies if no IFI exists.

If the answer is "a," "b," or "c," please specify in the comments the name and type of IFI that exists (e.g., parliamentary budget office or fiscal council). If the answer is "a" or "b," identify the law that guarantees its independence, and provide evidence in support of the assessment of the adequacy of its staffing and resources. This can include the IFI's total budget allocation over recent years, any press reports that discuss perceived funding shortfalls, assessments by international organizations, and/or information from interviews with staff of the IFI.

Answer:

d. No, there is no IFI.

Source:

Comment:

There is no separate agency with the functions of an IFI.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: It must be noted that the Public Accounts Committee (PAC) of the Parliament of Malaysia does play an important role in this regard. The PAC has the power to examine the accounts of the Malaysian government, the accounts of all public authorities, the reports of the auditor-general, and any other agencies administering public funds. However, analysis of the budget formulation and approval process is outside the scope of the PAC's mandates.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

104. Does the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) publish macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts?

GUIDELINES:

Question 104 assesses whether an Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) has a role in producing the macroeconomic forecast (e.g., GDP growth, inflation, interest rates, etc.) and/or the fiscal forecast (revenues, expenditure, deficits, and debt), and if so, what kind of role it has. Macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasting is a typical core function across IFIs, but their role in forecasting takes several forms (von Trapp et al. 2016, p. 17 and Table 2). Some IFIs produce just a macroeconomic forecast, while others produce a complete fiscal forecast (which also typically requires an underlying macroeconomic forecast). In some cases, the fiscal forecast reflects continuation of current budget policies; such forecasts can be used by the legislature, the media, or the public to assess the projections in the executive's budget reflecting the government's policy proposals.

Some IFIs produce the official macroeconomic and fiscal forecasts used in the executive's budget. In other cases, IFIs do not prepare their own independent forecasts, but rather produce an assessment of the official estimates, or provide an opinion on, or endorsement of, the government's forecasts. Some others have no role at all in forecasting.

To answer "a," there must be an IFI that publishes both its own macroeconomic AND fiscal forecasts. Answer "b" applies if an IFI publishes its own macroeconomic OR fiscal forecast (but not both). Answer "c" applies if the IFI does not publish a macroeconomic or fiscal forecast, but rather publishes an assessment of the official forecasts produced by the executive and used in the budget. Choose option "d" if there is no IFI; or if there is an IFI that neither publishes its own macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts, nor a commentary on the official forecasts for the budget.

Macroeconomic forecasts may include indicators relating to economic output and economic growth, inflation, and the labor market, amongst others. Fiscal forecasts may include estimates of revenues, expenditures, the budget balance, and debt. If the answer is "a" or "b," please specify which indicators and estimates are included in the forecasts and whether the forecast is used by government as the official forecast. If the answer is "c," please describe the nature and depth of the assessment (e.g., the length of the commentary, or whether it covers both economic and fiscal issues).

Answer:

d. No, there is no IFI; or the IFI neither publishes its own macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts, nor a commentary on the official forecasts produced by the executive.

Source:

Comment:

Malaysia does not have an IFI.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

105. Does the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) publish its own costings of new policy proposals, to assess their impact on the budget?

GUIDELINES:

Question 105 assesses whether an Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) has a costing function that involves assessing the budgetary implications of new policy proposals for both revenues and expenditures, and if so, what kind of role it has. Many IFIs have a costing role, but with substantial diversity in the nature and extent of this work (von Trapp et al 2016, pp. 17-18 and Table 2). Some assess virtually all new policy proposals, while others cost only a selection of new policy proposals. Others only publish opinions on, or scrutinize the costings of, budget measures produced by the executive.

To answer "a," the IFI must publish its own costings of all (or virtually all) new policy proposals. Answer "b" applies if the IFI publishes its own costings, but only for major new policy proposals – for instance, only those proposals that cost or save above a certain amount. Answer "c" applies if the IFI publishes its own costings, but only on a limited number of proposals. This could occur, for instance, if the IFI lacked the capacity to assess proposals dealing with certain sectors. Instead of producing a cost estimate, it can also publish an assessment of the estimates produced by the executive. Answer "d" applies if there is no IFI; or if the IFI does not publish its own costings of new policy proposals or provide an assessment of the official costings of new policy proposals.

Answer:

d. No, there is no IFI; or the IFI does not publish its own costings of new policy proposals.

Source:

Comment:

Malaysia does not have an IFI.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

106. In the past 12 months, how frequently did the head or a senior staff member of the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) take part and testify in hearings of a committee of the legislature?

GUIDELINES:

Question 106 concerns the interaction between two important oversight actors and assesses how frequently the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) made high-level inputs to the work of legislative committees. Almost all IFIs interact with the legislature in some form (von Trapp et al 2016, p. 18), but the intensity of the interaction varies. This question assesses this aspect by asking, with reference to the past 12 months, how frequently the head or a senior staff member of the IFI took part and testified in hearings of a committee of the legislature. The intent is to assess the extent to which the IFI staff member in question was not only present at a meeting of a legislative committee, but was an active participant (as opposed to a passive observer, serving only as a resource when called

upon). As evidence to support your answer, you can refer to official records of legislative committees, websites and annual reports of the IFI, press releases and media coverage, for example. Choose answer "a" if this occurred five times or more; "b" for three times or more, but less than five times; and "c" for once or twice. Answer "d" should be selected if the head or a senior staff member of the IFI never took part and testified in hearings of a committee of the legislature, or if there is no IFI.

Answer:

d. Never, or there is no IFI.

Source:

Comment:

Malaysia does not have an IFI.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

107. Does the full legislature and/or a legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal?

GUIDELINES:

Question 107 asks whether the legislature debated budget policies prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal for the most recent budget year before the research cut-off date. In general, prior to discussing the Executive's Budget Proposal for the coming year, the legislature should have an opportunity to review the government's broad budget priorities and fiscal parameters. Often times this information is laid out in a Pre-Budget Statement, which the executive presents to the legislature for debate. (See Questions 54-58.)

A number of countries conduct a pre-budget debate in the legislature around six months before the start of the budget year. In some cases, they adopt laws that guide the upcoming budget, for example the Budget Guidelines Law in Brazil and the Spring Fiscal Policy Bill in Sweden. A pre-budget debate can serve two main purposes: 1) to allow the executive to inform the legislature of its fiscal policy intentions by presenting updated reports on its annual and medium-term budget strategy and policy priorities; and 2) to establish "hard" multi-year fiscal targets or spending ceilings, which the government must adhere to when preparing its detailed spending estimates for the upcoming budget year.

To answer "a," the full legislature must debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal and approve recommendations for the upcoming budget.

Answer "b" applies if a legislative committee (but not the full legislature) debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal, and approves recommendations for the budget. Option "b" also applies if, in addition to the action by the committee, the full legislature also debates budget policy in advance of the budget, but does not approve recommendations.

Answer "c" applies if the full legislature and/or a legislative committee debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal, but does not approve recommendations for the budget. Answer "d" applies if neither the full legislature nor any legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal.

In your comment, please indicate the dates of the budget debate, and if both the full legislature and a legislative committee held a debate. Note that a debate does not need to be open to the public, but a public record of the meeting or a public notice that the meeting occurred is required. In addition, please indicate whether the budget debate was focused on a Pre-Budget Statement published by the Executive. If the Executive did not publish a Pre-Budget Statement, then please indicate what served as the focus of the legislature's debate (for instance, a report released by an IFI or some other institution).

Answer:

d. No, neither the full legislature nor any legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal.

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

108. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the Executive's Budget Proposal?

GUIDELINES:

Question 108 examines how far in advance of the start of the most recent budget year the legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal. International good practice recommends that the Executive's Budget Proposal should be submitted to the legislature far enough in advance to allow the legislature time to review it properly, or at least three months prior to the start of the fiscal year. (See, for instance, Principle 2.2.2 of the IMF's Fiscal Transparency Handbook (2018) (<https://www.elibrary.imf.org/view/IMF069/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859/24788-9781484331859.xml>)).

For the purposes of responding to this question, if – and only if – the most recent budget submission occurred later than usual as a result of a particular event, such as an election, please use a more normal year as the basis for the response. If, however, delays have been observed for more than one budget year, and the legislature has not received the Executive's Budget Proposal in a timely manner on more than one occasion in the last three years, then "d" will be the appropriate answer.

To answer "a," the legislature must receive the Executive's Budget Proposal at least three months in advance of the start of the budget year. Answer "b" applies if the legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal at least two months, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year. Answer "c" applies if the legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal at least one month, but less than two months, before the start of the budget year. Answer "d" applies if the legislature does not receive the Executive's Budget Proposal at least one month prior to the start of the budget year, or does not receive it at all.

Answer:

b. The legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal at least two months, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year.

Source:

(a) News

<https://www.malaymail.com/news/malaysia/2021/10/27/supply-bill-2022-to-be-tabled-for-first-reading-in-parliament-today/2016269>

(b) Hansard

<https://www.parlimen.gov.my/hansard-dewan-rakyat.html?uweb=dr&arkib=yes>

Comment:

The 2022 Supply Bill underwent its first reading on 27 October 2021, two days before its second reading (tabled in parliament).

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

109. When does the legislature approve the Executive's Budget Proposal?

GUIDELINES:

Question 109 examines when the legislature approves the Executive's Budget Proposal. International good practice recommends that the Executive's Budget

Proposal should be approved by the legislature before the start of the fiscal year the budget proposal refers to. This gives the executive time to implement the budget in its entirety, particularly new programs and policies.

In some countries, the expenditure and revenue estimates of the Executive's Budget Proposal are approved separately; for purposes of this question, at least the expenditure estimates must be approved. Further, approval of the budget implies approval of the full-year budget, not just a short-term continuation of spending and revenue authority.

To answer "a," the legislature must approve the Executive's Budget Proposal at least one month before the start of the budget year. Answer "b" applies if the legislature approves the Executive's Budget Proposal less than one month in advance of the start of the budget year, but at least by the start of the budget year. Answer "c" applies if the legislature approves the Executive's Budget Proposal less than one month after the start of the budget year. Answer "d" applies if the legislature approves the Executive's Budget Proposal more than one month after the start of the budget year, or does not approve the budget.

Answer:

b. The legislature approves the budget less than one month in advance of the start of the budget year, but at least by the start of the budget year.

Source:

(a) Parliament portal

<https://www.parlimen.gov.my/bills-dewan-rakyat.html?uweb=dr&arkib=yes>

(b) News

<https://www.malaymail.com/news/malaysia/2021/12/13/dewan-rakyat-passes-budget-2022/2028125>

(c) News

<https://ringgitplus.com/en/blog/budget-2022/budget-2022-unanimously-passed-by-dewan-negara.html>

(d) News

<https://www.bharian.com.my/berita/nasional/2021/12/902234/dewan-negara-lulus-bajet-2022>

Comment:

The Supply Bill was passed by the Dewan Rakyat on 13 December 2021 and by Dewan Negara on 22 December 2021.

The Finance Bill was passed on 15 December 2021.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

110. Does the legislature have the authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal?

GUIDELINES:

Question 110 examines the legislature's power to amend—as opposed to simply accept or reject—the budget proposal presented by the executive. This question is about legal authority rather than actions the legislature takes in practice. The legislature's powers to amend the budget can vary substantially across countries.

The "a" response is appropriate only if there are no restrictions on the right of the legislature to modify the Executive's Budget Proposal, including its right to change the size of the proposed deficit or surplus. The "b" response would be appropriate if, for instance, the legislature is restricted from changing the deficit or surplus, but it still has the power to increase or decrease funding and revenue levels. The more limited "c" response would apply if, for instance, the legislature can only re-allocate spending within the totals set in the Executive's Budget Proposal or can only decrease funding levels or increase revenues. Finally, response "d" would apply if the legislature may not make any changes (or only small technical changes), or if amendments must first be approved by the executive. In these cases, the legislature is essentially only able to approve or reject the budget as a whole. If the answer is "b" or "c", please indicate the nature of the amendment powers available to the Parliament and how they are limited.

Answer:

c. Yes, the legislature has authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal, but its authority is very limited.

Source:

(a) Standing Order of the Dewan Rakyat, Section 66 (9-17 & A)
https://www.parlimen.gov.my/images/webuser/peraturan_mesyuarat/PMDR-eng.pdf

Comment:

Based on the Standing Orders Section 66, an amendment can be proposed by a member of the legislature in the committee level debate. However, the amendment proposal is limited to reducing the sum allocated to the head of expenditures, and the member has to provide notice two days before the proposal is brought to the debate. Furthermore, re-allotment of expenditure can only be made through a motion by a Minister and not by any member of parliament as stated in S66A.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

111. During the most recent budget approval process, did the legislature use its authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal?**GUIDELINES:**

Question 111 assesses whether any formal authority of the legislature to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal is used in practice. The responses to this question should be determined based on action by the legislature related to the Enacted Budget used in the OBS. Choose answer "a" if the legislature used its authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal during the most recent budget approval process, and amendments were adopted (all, or at least some of them). Answer "a" also applies if the legislature used its authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal, but the amendments were rejected by executive veto. Answer "b" applies if the legislature used its authority in law to propose amendments to the Executive's Budget Proposal, but none of these amendments were adopted. Answer "c" applies if the legislature has the authority in law to amend the budget, but no amendments were proposed during its consideration. Answer "d" applies when the legislature does not have any authority to amend the budget (that is, Question 110 is answered "d").

If the answer is "a" or "b", please specify in the comments the number of amendments introduced by the legislature (and in the case of an "a" response, the number adopted, or if applicable, information about an executive veto) and describe their nature. For example, did the amendments result in an increase or decrease of the deficit? What were the most significant amendments to revenues and to expenditures in terms of the sums involved? How did amendments affect the composition of expenditures? If the answer is "a," please specify which amendments were adopted, and provide evidence for it.

Answer:

a. Yes, the legislature used its authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal, and (at least some of) its amendments were adopted.

Source:

(a) Supply Act 2022
<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/budget/supply-act-2022.pdf>

(b) Parliament portal
<https://www.parlimen.gov.my/bills-dewan-rakyat.html?uweb=dr&arkib=yes>

(c) Parliament Community Hall Official Statement, 23 November 2021
<https://parlimen.gov.my/files/hindex/pdf/DR-23112021.pdf#page=20&zoom=100&search=Akta%20Kerja>

(d) Parliament Community Hall Official Statement, 24 November 2021
<https://www.parlimen.gov.my/files/hindex/pdf/DR-24112021.pdf#page=18&zoom=100&search=22%20november%202021>

Comment:

Suggestions provided during the committee stage include, that to:

- Increase the RM 100 payment to RM 200 to allow students to enjoy kindergarten facilities (Committee stage for Ministry of National Unity); and
- Provide an additional allocation to the National Audit Department (Committee stage for Prime Minister's Department).

Based on the amendment to the Supply Act 2022, one ministry (Ministry of Housing and Local Government) had its budget reduced from RM 1,776,018,800 to RM 1,767,450,800 (a reduction of RM 8,568,000). This reduction resulted a reduced amount to the program for Local Community Mobilization (Penggerak Komuniti Tempatan).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

112. During the last budget approval process, did a specialized budget or finance committee in the legislature examine the Executive's Budget Proposal?

GUIDELINES:

Question 112 assesses the role of a specialized budget or finance committee during the budget approval stage. Effective committee involvement is an essential condition for legislative influence in the budget process. Specialized committees provide opportunities for individual legislators to gain relevant expertise, and to examine budgets and policy in depth. Yet, the involvement of committees differs across legislatures. Some legislatures have separate committees to examine spending and tax proposals, while others have a single finance committee. Not all legislatures have a specialized budget or finance committee to examine the budget. In addition, there can be differences in the time available for the committee's analysis of the budget.

A report with the committee's findings and recommendations is intended to inform the debate in the full legislature, therefore it must be published before the legislature has adopted the budget.

Response "a" requires that, in the last budget approval process, a specialized budget or finance committee had one month or more to examine the Executive's Budget Proposal, and it published a report with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted. Response "b" applies where such a committee examined the draft budget and published a report, but within a shorter timeframe of less than one month. Response "c" applies if a committee examined the budget (without regard to the time period), but did not publish a report prior to the adoption of the budget. Response "d" applies where a specialized budget or finance committee did not examine the Executive's Budget Proposal.

Please specify in your comment the name of the committee and the number of days it had available to examine the budget. For bicameral legislatures where one house or chamber has greater constitutional authority in budgetary matters, the question applies to the house or chamber (usually the upper or second one) that is decisive. For bicameral legislatures with co-equal houses or chambers, the question should be answered with reference to the one that achieves the higher score for this question. In the case of bicameral legislatures, please note the relevant arrangements in each house or chamber. If applicable, provide a copy of the report. Please note also if a report is published, but only after the budget has been adopted.

Answer:

d. No, a specialized budget or finance committee did not examine the Executive's Budget Proposal.

Source:

(a) Social media

https://twitter.com/reform_malaysia/status/1448603511088836612?lang=en

(b) News

<https://www.bharian.com.my/berita/nasional/2021/11/883956/keanggotaan-jawatankuasa-pilihan-khas-kini-9-ahli>

(c) Parliament archives

<https://web.archive.org/web/20230414145430/http://www.parlimen.gov.my/senarai-jkdr.html?view=2100&uweb=dr&>

(d) Parliament portal

<https://www.parlimen.gov.my/risalat.html?uweb=dr&arkib=yes>

Comment:

The Budget 2022 was presented during Ismail Sabri's Administration (Perikatan Nasional) that came into power on 21 August 2021. This resulted in a change to the composition of the existing parliamentary special select committee. It was restructured to include 5 chairmen to be elected from the government and 4 from the opposition.

The parliamentary special select committees are:

- (a) Special Select Committee on Human Rights and Constitutional Affairs;
- (b) Special Select Committee on Finance and Economy;
- (c) Special Select Committee for Agencies under the Prime Minister's Department;
- (d) Special Select Committee on Safety;
- (e) Special Select Committee on Agriculture and Domestic Trade;
- (f) Special Select Committee on Infrastructure Development;
- (g) Special Select Committee on Education;

- (h) Special Select Committee on Health, Science and Innovation; and
- (i) Special Select Committee on Women's and Children's Affairs and Social Development.

The parliamentary special select committee did not produce or publish a report on budget 2022 deliberations.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

113. During the last approval process, did legislative committees, responsible for particular sectors (e.g., health, education, defense, etc.), examine spending in the Executive's Budget Proposal related to the sector for which they are responsible?

GUIDELINES:

Question 113 assesses the role of committees of the legislature that are responsible for particular sectors (e.g., health, education, defense, etc.) during the budget approval stage. The role of sectoral committees differs across legislatures. Some legislatures do not involve them in the budget approval process, while others do. In addition, the time available for committee analysis differs.

A report with the committee's findings and recommendations is intended to inform the debate in the full legislature, so therefore must be published before the legislature has adopted the budget. Response "a" requires that sector committees had one month or more to examine the Executive's Budget Proposal, and published a report with findings and recommendations prior the budget being adopted. Response "b" applies where such committees examined the draft budget and published a report, but within a shorter timeframe of less than one month. Response "c" applies if sectoral committees examined the budget (without regard to the time period), but did not publish a report prior to the adoption of the budget. Response "d" applies where sectoral committees did not examine the Executive's Budget Proposal.

Please note that the examination of sectoral budgets by a specialized budget or finance committee is assessed in Question 112 and should not be considered for this question.

Please provide in the comments a brief overview of the committee structure and specify the number of days that sectoral committees had available to examine the budget and to publish their reports. For bicameral legislatures where one house or chamber has greater constitutional authority in budgetary matters, the question applies to the house or chamber (usually the upper or second one) that is decisive. For bicameral legislatures with co-equal houses or chambers, the question should be answered with reference to the one that achieves the higher score for this question. In the case of bicameral legislatures, please note the relevant arrangements in each house or chamber. If applicable, provide a sample copy of at least one of the reports. Please note if a report is published, but only after the budget has been adopted.

For purposes of responding to this question, use those sectoral committees that are best performing – that is, the ones that examine the budget the longest and that publish reports.

Answer:

d. No, sector committees did not examine the Executive's Budget Proposal.

Source:

(a) Social media

https://twitter.com/reform_malaysia/status/1448603511088836612?lang=en

(b) News

<https://www.bharian.com.my/berita/nasional/2021/11/883956/keanggotaan-jawatankuasa-pilihan-khas-kini-9-ahli>

(c) Parliament archives

<https://web.archive.org/web/20230414145430/http://www.parlimen.gov.my/senarai-jkdr.html?view=2100&uweb=dr&>

(d) Parliament portal

<https://www.parlimen.gov.my/risalat.html?uweb=dr&arkib=yes>

Comment:

The Budget 2022 was presented during Ismail Sabri's Administration (Perikatan Nasional) that came into power on 21 August 2021. This resulted in a change to the composition of the existing parliamentary special select committee. It

was restructured to include 5 chairmen to be elected from the government and 4 from the opposition.

The parliamentary special select committees are:

- (a) Special Select Committee on Human Rights and Constitutional Affairs;
- (b) Special Select Committee on Finance and Economy;
- (c) Special Select Committee for Agencies under the Prime Minister's Department;
- (d) Special Select Committee on Safety;
- (e) Special Select Committee on Agriculture and Domestic Trade;
- (f) Special Select Committee on Infrastructure Development;
- (g) Special Select Committee on Education;
- (h) Special Select Committee on Health, Science and Innovation; and
- (i) Special Select Committee on Women's and Children's Affairs and Social Development.

The parliamentary special select committee did not produce or publish a report on budget 2022 deliberations.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: I choose not to review this question

Comments: It is hard to know if the select committees of Malaysia's Parliament did examine the spending in the EBP in their respective fields, as very little information is available about their activities. This is particularly problematic for the period during and after the Pandemic when Malaysia has instability and frequent changes to government & leadership.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

114. In the past 12 months, did a committee of the legislature examine in-year implementation of the Enacted Budget during the relevant budget execution period?

GUIDELINES:

Question 114 is about legislative oversight of budget execution. It assesses whether and how often a committee examined the implementation of the budget during the budget execution period (i.e., financial year) for which it was approved, and whether this resulted in an official report with findings and recommendations. This question does not apply to the ex post review of implementation following the end of the budget year as part of the audit stage, which is assessed separately. Nor does it apply to the legislature's review of the budget that it may undertake as part of the process of considering a supplemental budget during the year. In-year monitoring by the legislature will be affected by the frequency that the executive publishes In-Year Reports.

To answer "a," a committee must have examined in-year implementation of the Enacted Budget at least three times during the course of the relevant budget year and published reports with findings and recommendations. Answer "b" applies where this occurred only once or twice during the year.

Exception: If a legislature is in session only twice during the year, and it examines the implementation of the budget during both sessions, then it would be eligible for an "a" response.

Choose "c" if a committee examined in-year implementation (without regard to frequency), but did not publish any report with findings and recommendations. Answer "d" applies where no committee examined in-year implementation.

If the answer is "a" or "b," please specify the name of the committee and when it reviewed budget implementation, and provide a copy of its report(s). If the answer is "c," please specify the name of the committee and when it reviewed budget implementation.

For purposes of responding to this question, if more than one committee holds in-year reviews of the budget, use the committee that is best performing – that is, the one that examines in-year implementation the most times and that publishes a report.

Answer:

d. No, a committee did not examine in-year implementation.

Source:

(a) Parliament portal
<https://www.parlimen.gov.my/risalat.html?uweb=dr&arkib=yes>

Comment:

The parliamentary archive lacks any report from the parliamentary special select committee showing an examination of the in-year implementation

of the enacted budget.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

115. Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units that receive explicit funding in the Enacted Budget, and is it legally required to do so?

GUIDELINES:

Question 115 examines whether the executive seeks approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, and whether it is legally required to do so.

In some countries, the executive has the power in law to adjust funding levels for specific appropriations during the execution of the budget. This question examines rules around shifting funds between administrative units (ministries, departments, or agencies) or whatever funding unit (or "vote") is specified in the Enacted Budget.

The conditions under which the executive may exercise its discretion to shift funds should be clearly defined in publicly available regulations or law. In addition, the amount of funds that the executive is allowed to transfer between administrative units should not be so excessive as to undermine the accountability of the executive to the legislature.

To answer "a," the executive is required by law or regulation to obtain prior legislative approval before shifting funds between administrative units, and it does so in practice. Answer "b" applies if the executive obtains legislative approval before shifting funds between administrative units, but is not legally required to do so. Answer "c" applies if the executive is legally required to receive legislative approval before shifting funds, but does not do so in practice. Answer "d" applies if legislative approval is not legally required for the executive to shift funds between administrative units and the executive does not obtain legislative approval in practice. Answer "d" also applies if the executive is authorized to shift an amount considered so excessive as to undermine accountability (roughly equal to 3 percent of total budgeted expenditures). A "d" response applies if the legislature only approves the shifting of funds after it has already occurred.

In the comments, please indicate any law or regulation that provides the executive with standing authority to shift funds between administrative units and, if so, describe that authority. Similarly, legislative approval for shifting funds between administrative units typically occurs with the adoption of legislation such as a supplemental budget. But if other formal procedures for gaining approval from the legislature exist, then please provide information about that approval process.

Answer:

a. The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, and it does so in practice.

Source:

(a) Financial Procedure Act, 1957 [https://lom.agc.gov.my/ilims/upload/portal/akta/LOM/EN/reprint%202006%20\(Act%2061\).pdf](https://lom.agc.gov.my/ilims/upload/portal/akta/LOM/EN/reprint%202006%20(Act%2061).pdf)

(b) Standing Orders of the House of Representatives

<https://www.parlimen.gov.my/peraturan-mesyuarat.html?uweb=dr&lang=en>

(c) News article

<https://www.thesundaily.my/local/reallocation-of-appropriated-expenditure-bill-2020-tabled-for-first-reading-IG2998578>

(d) Supply (Reallocation of Appropriated Expenditure) Bill, 2020 https://www.parlimen.gov.my/files/billindex/pdf/2020/DR/D.R%202_2020%20-%20eng.pdf

Comment:

Section 15(4) of the Financial Procedure Act 1957 provides power for the executive to shift surplus funds between subdivisions "of the same purpose", that is, only within the administrative unit and not between administrative units. Section 15(4) further restricts this power with a proviso that the shifting within subdivisions may not exceed the amount appropriated by the Supply Act for "any purpose of expenditure". Here "any purpose of expenditure" refers to the administrative division for which the supply is demanded. Paragraph 66A of the Standing Orders of the House of Representatives is related to this requirement. The rule states that "any reallocation of expenditure may be made through a motion by a Minister." The rule indicates that the executive is expected to abide by the allocations provided in the Supply Bill and needs a vote in Parliament for the reallocation of expenditure between administrative units. There is no evidence that the executive in practice shifts funds between administrative units prior to obtaining approval. The last known reallocation occurred in 2020 when a Supply (Reallocation of Appropriated Expenditure) Bill was tabled to obtain approval for reallocation that involved a restructuring of Ministries.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

b. The executive obtains approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, but is not required to do so by law or regulation.

Comments: Even though Parliamentary approval is usually sought and obtained before shifting funds between administrative units, it is not a legal/binding requirement. I am not aware of any new law or regulation that requires the Executive to do so. As such, I would choose b.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher Response

A close interpretation of the law that applies has been provided in the comment, with the Standing Order in Parliament that applies to it. Section 15(4) of the Financial Procedure Act 1957 reads as such: If the exigencies of the public service render it necessary to alter the proportions assigned to the subdivisions under a purpose of expenditure shown in the estimates referred to in subsection (1) or to create a new subdivision, the Treasury or the Menteri Besar or Chief Minister, as the case may be, may direct that there shall be applied in aid of any subdivision which may be deficient or any new subdivision a further sum out of any surplus arising on any other subdivision OF THE SAME PURPOSE provided that the amount appropriated under any PURPOSE OF EXPENDITURE by a Supply Act or Enactment is not thereby exceeded." (emphasis in capital letters added). The argument is that "provided that the amount appropriated under any purpose of expenditure by a Supply Act...is not thereby exceeded" restricts reallocation to different administrative units. This is because the Supply Act's Schedule lists the purposes of expenditure by administrative units. The wording of a Supply Bill/Act and the context of "purpose" as used there, may be referred to in any recent Supply Bill. Ref: <https://www.parlimen.gov.my/files/billindex/pdf/2023/DR/D.R%2023%20-%20BI.pdf>

116. Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenue (that is, amounts higher than originally anticipated) that may become available during the budget execution period, and is it legally required to do so?

GUIDELINES:

Question 116 examines whether the executive receives approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenue, and whether it is legally required to do so. Good practice requires the legislature to approve changes in revenue or expenditure relative to the Enacted Budget. For example, if additional revenue is collected unexpectedly during the year, which often happens in oil/mineral-dependent countries, and it was not accounted for in the Enacted Budget, there should be a procedure in place to ensure that the legislature approves any proposed use of these "new" funds. If such requirements are not in place, the executive might deliberately underestimate revenue in the budget proposal it submits to the legislature, in order to have additional resources to spend at the executive's discretion, with no legislative control.

To answer "a," the executive is required by law or regulation to obtain prior legislative approval before spending any funds resulting from higher-than-expected revenues, and it does so in practice. Answer "b" applies if the executive obtains legislative approval before spending excess revenue, but is not legally required to do so. Answer "c" applies if the executive is legally required to receive legislative approval before spending excess revenue, but does not do so in practice. Answer "d" applies if prior legislative approval is not legally required for the executive to spend excess revenue and the executive does not obtain legislative approval in practice. A "d" response applies if the legislature only approves the additional spending after it has already occurred.

Typically, legislative approval of additional spending beyond what was reflected in the Enacted Budget would occur with the adoption of a supplemental budget. But other formal procedures for getting approval from the legislature in advance of it adopting the supplemental budget may exist. If that is the case, then please provide information about that approval process.

Answer:

d. There is no law or regulation requiring the executive to obtain approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenues, and in practice the executive spends these funds before obtaining approval from the legislature.

Source:

(a) Parliament portal

<https://www.parlimen.gov.my/bills-dewan-rakyat.html?uweb=dr&#>

(b) Federal Constitution of Malaysia 1957, Article 101

https://www.constituteproject.org/constitution/Malaysia_2007.pdf?lang=en

Comment:

Article 101 of the Federal Constitution states "If in respect of any financial year it is found – that the amount appropriated by the Supply Act for any

purpose is insufficient, or that a need has arisen for expenditure for a purpose for which no amount has been appropriated by the Supply Act; or that any moneys have been expended for any purpose in excess of the amount (if any) appropriated for that purpose by the Supply Act, a supplementary estimate showing the sums required or spent shall be laid before the House of Representatives and the purposes of any such expenditure shall be included in a supply Bill."

In practice, excess amounts that were spent relative to the enacted budget require the tabling of a supplementary bill in parliament. For example, the government tabled for approval an additional allocation of RM 60 billion (RM 60,174,928,000). The bill was tabled for its first reading on 27 March 2023 and was approved on 30 March 2023. The bill underwent its first reading and was approved 3 months after FY 2022 ended.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

117. Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below the levels in the Enacted Budget in response to revenue shortfalls (that is, revenues lower than originally anticipated) or other reasons during the budget execution period, and is it legally required to do so?

GUIDELINES:

Question 117 examines whether the executive receives approval from the legislature prior to cutting spending below the levels in the Enacted Budget in response to revenue shortfalls or for any other reason, and whether it is legally required to do so. Good practice requires the legislature to approve changes in revenue or expenditure relative to the Enacted Budget. For example, if less revenue is collected unexpectedly during the year, the legislature should approve or reject any proposed reductions in expenditures that are implemented as a result. If such requirements are not in place, the executive might substantially change the composition of the budget at the executive's discretion, with no legislative control.

Typically, legislative approval of proposals to reduce spending below the levels reflected in the Enacted Budget would occur as part of the supplemental budget. But other formal procedures for getting approval from the legislature in advance of it adopting the supplemental budget may exist. If that is the case, then please provide information about that approval process.

To answer "a," the executive is required by law or regulation to obtain prior legislative approval before implementing spending cuts in response to revenue shortfalls or for other reasons, and it does so in practice. Answer "b" applies if the executive received legislative approval before implementing such cuts, but is not legally required to do so. Answer "c" applies if the executive is legally required to obtain legislative approval before implementing such cuts, but does not do so in practice. Answer "d" applies if legislative approval is not legally required for the executive to implement such cuts and the executive does not obtain such approval in practice. A "d" response applies if the legislature only approves the spending cuts after they have already occurred.

Answer:

d. There is no law or regulation requiring the executive to obtain approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below enacted levels, and in practice the executive implements these spending cuts before seeking prior approval from the legislature.

Source:

(a) Financial Procedures Act 1957

http://www.commonlii.org/my/legis/consol_act/fpa19571972252/

(b) Federal Constitution of Malaysia 1957

https://www.constituteproject.org/constitution/Malaysia_2007.pdf?lang=en

(c) Parliament portal

<https://www.parlimen.gov.my/bills-dewan-rakyat.html?uweb=dr&#>

Comment:

The Federal Constitution and the Financial Procedures Act do not have provisions related to spending below the level set out in the enacted budget. In addition, parliament's portal does show any bills for consideration or approved relating to spending below the level enacted for FY 2022.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

118. Did a committee of the legislature examine the Audit Report on the annual budget produced by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 118 is about ex post oversight following the implementation of the budget. It probes whether a committee examined the Audit Report on the annual budget produced by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI), and whether this resulted in an official report with findings and recommendations. A key issue is how soon after the SAI releases the report does it legislature review it. This question does not apply to the legislative scrutiny of in-year implementation of the Enacted Budget during the relevant budget execution period, which is assessed separately. Also, the question is asking specifically about the SAI's annual report on the execution of the budget, not about other audit reports that the SAI may produce. (This is the Audit Report used for responding to Question 98.)

To answer "a," a legislative committee must have examined the annual Audit Report within three months of it being released by the SAI, and then published a report (or reports) with findings and recommendations. (Note that the three-month period should only take into account time when the legislature is in session.)

Answer "b" applies when the committee examines it within six months of it being released (but more than three months), and then published a report with its findings and recommendations. Choose "c" if a committee examined the annual Audit Report more than six months after it became available or it did not publish any report with findings and recommendations. Answer "d" applies where no committee examined the annual Audit Report.

If the answer is "a" or "b," please specify the name of the committee and when it reviewed the Audit Report, and provide a copy of its report(s). If the answer is "c," please specify the name of the committee and when it reviewed budget implementation. Answers "a," "b," or "c" may be selected if the Audit Report is produced by the SAI but not made publicly available.

Answer:

c. Yes, a committee examined the Audit Report on the annual budget, but it did so after the report had been available for more than six months or it did not publish any report with findings and recommendations.

Source:

(a) Standing Orders of Dewan Rakyat, I.S.O 77(1)

https://www.parlimen.gov.my/images/webuser/peraturan_mesyuarat/PMDR-eng.pdf

(b) Published Reports by Public Accounts Committee

<https://www.parlimen.gov.my/pac/publication-details.html?id=66>

(c) Treasury Instructions, Amendment 2008, P 304 (a)-(b)

<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/pdf/arahan-perbendaharaan/ap2023/>

Comment:

The Public Accounts Committee (PAC) in Malaysia has the legal mandate to examine:

- (a) the accounts of the Federation and the appropriation of the sums granted by Parliament to meet the public expenditure;
- (b) such accounts of public authorities and other bodies administering public funds as may be laid before the House;
- (c) reports of the Auditor-General laid before the House in accordance with Article 107 of the Constitution; and
- (d) such other matters as the Committee may think fit, or which may be referred to the Committee by the House.

Under the Treasury Instructions, "When a report of the Auditor General is received, the Secretary General of Treasury or State Financial Officer shall send a copy of each paragraph of the report to the responsible Controlling Officer for his comments. From the information received, a memorandum shall be prepared for the use of the Secretary General of Treasury or State Financial Officer at the meeting held by the Public Accounts Committee for the consideration of the report. The Committee may also require a Controlling Officer to give evidence before it." "When the Public Accounts Committee has delivered its report to the Legislative Body, a copy for each paragraph of the report shall also be sent to the responsible Controlling Officer. If the report requires for an action to be taken, the Controlling Officer shall take the necessary steps to comply. The Controlling Officer shall then report to the Secretary General of Treasury or State Financial Officer the current position of each paragraph that is referred to him. The Secretary General of Treasury or State Financial Officer shall then send to the Public Accounts Committee a final memorandum on the matters referred in the report of the Committee."

The PAC does not publish a report on the examination of the report produced by the Auditor General. The reports published by the PAC were only on selected cases highlighted in the audit report.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

119. Was the process of appointing (or re-appointing) the current head of the SAI carried out in a way that ensures his or her independence?

GUIDELINES:

Question 119 concerns the appointment process of the current head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI). Appointment procedures vary greatly across countries, as well as across different types of SAIs. Moreover, conventions and informal practices can greatly affect the de facto independence of the head of the SAI. While these factors make it difficult to devise a single metric against which all SAIs can be assessed with regard to this particular aspect, this question focuses on whether the legislature or judiciary must appoint or approve the appointment of the head of the SAI as a way to ensure the SAI's independence from the executive. However, if the appointment is carried out in another way that nonetheless ensures the independence of the SAI head, then that approach could be also considered.

To answer "a," the legislature or judiciary must appoint (or re-appoint) the head of the SAI, or approve the recommendation of the executive, as a way that ensure his or her independence from the executive. (As noted above, alternative approaches may also be acceptable.) Choose "b" if the appointment process does not ensure the independence of the head of the SAI, e.g. the executive may appoint the head of the SAI without the final consent of the legislature or judiciary.

Irrespective of which answer you selected, provide a description of how the head of the SAI is appointed.

Answer:

b. No, the executive may appoint the head of the SAI without the final consent of the legislature or judiciary.

Source:

(a) Federal Constitution of Malaysia 1957, Article 105 (1) https://www.constituteproject.org/constitution/Malaysia_2007.pdf?lang=en

(b) News

<https://www.freemalaysiatoday.com/category/nation/2023/04/14/candidate-for-auditor-general-submitted-to-king/>

Comment:

As stated in Article 105 (1), "There shall be an Auditor General, who shall be appointed by the Yang di-Pertuan Agong on the advice of the Prime Minister and after consultation with the Conference of Rulers." The appointment process of the Auditor General starts with the Prime Minister proposing candidates for the position to the King and after consultation with the Conference of Rulers, the King appoints the candidate to the office.

The Agong has to act upon the advice of the prime minister. The Conference of Rulers' consultation is not to seek consent. Therefore, in a way, the prime minister's choice is final. However, the Yang Dipertuan Agong and the Conference of the Rulers' may provide a check and balance mechanism to the decisions made by the prime minister.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

120. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?

GUIDELINES:

Question 120 covers the manner in which the head or senior members of the SAI may be removed from office. This question draws on best practices identified in the Lima Declaration of Guidelines on Auditing Precepts (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/LimaDeclaration.pdf>), including measures

intended to guarantee the office's independence from the executive.

To answer "a," the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before the head of the SAI is removed. For example, the legislature or judiciary may give final consent following a certain external process, such as a criminal proceeding. So while the executive may initiate a criminal proceeding, the final consent of a member of the judiciary – or a judge – is necessary to render a verdict of wrongdoing that may lead to the removal from office of the head of the SAI. Answer "b" applies if the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.

Answer:

a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before he or she is removed.

Source:

(a) Federal Constitution of Malaysia 1957, Article 105 (3) & Article 125 https://www.constituteproject.org/constitution/Malaysia_2007.pdf?lang=en

(b) News

<https://www.thestar.com.my/news/nation/2019/03/09/nik-azman-named-new-auditorgeneral/>

Comment:

Constitution Article 105(3) states that "The Auditor General may at any time resign his office but shall not be removed from office except on the like grounds and in the like manner as a judge of the Federal Court".

Judges of the Federal Court can only be removed by the recommendation of the tribunal appointed by Yang Dipertuan Agong (YDPA). According to Article 125(4), the tribunal consists of "...not less than five persons who hold or have held office as judge of the Federal Court, the Court of Appeal or a High Court, or, if it appears to the Yang di-Pertuan Agong expedient to make such appointment, persons who hold or have held equivalent office in any other part of the Commonwealth...". Hence, the appointed judiciary persons by the YDPA have to give final consent before the head of the SAI can be removed.

Additionally, the appointment of the Auditor General lasts for 2 years (based on engagement session with the National Audit Department in July 2022) and the Auditor General is eligible for reappointment based on Article 105(2).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

121. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI)?

GUIDELINES:

Question 121 asks who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI). To ensure objective audits of government budgets, another important component of the SAI's independence from the executive is the extent to which the SAI's budget is determined by a body other than the executive, and whether the SAI has adequate resources to fulfill its mandate.

Answer "a" applies if the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate, AND either the SAI determines its own budget and then submits it to the executive (which accepts it with little or no change) or directly to the legislature, or the budget of the SAI is determined directly by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body). Answer "b" applies if the SAI's budget is determined by the executive (absent a recommendation from the SAI), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. Answer "c" applies if the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body) determines the SAI's budget, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. Answer "d" applies if the executive determines the SAI's budget, and the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. Please provide evidence in support of the assessment that the funding level is or is not broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.

Answer:

b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.

Source:

(a) Audit Act 1957

<https://www.audit.gov.my/index.php/en/info-korporat/audit-act>

(b) The 2021 Federal Government Financial Statements (YER), page 63

<https://www.anm.gov.my/arkib/terbitan/penyata-kewangan-kerajaan-persekutuan>

Comment:

The National Audit Department, like other government agencies and departments, is required to submit their budget proposal to the Ministry of Finance for it to then take the decision on the budget to be tabled in parliament. The Audit Act only regulates the remuneration of the Auditor General, not the allocation for the SAI.

The 2021 Federal Government Financial Statements (YER) showed that the SAI spent less than its allocation, indicating that their budget is broadly consistent with their needs. It spent RM142,060,485 out of its RM148,221,900 allocation (95.84% of the revised allocation).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

122. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have the discretion in law to undertake those audits it may wish to?**GUIDELINES:**

Question 122 explores the scope of the investigative powers of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) as prescribed in law.

Question 97 asks which of the three types of audits – financial, compliance, and performance – the SAI conducts. This question asks if the SAI is constrained by law (rather than by a lack of capacity or an inadequate budget) from undertaking any form of audit or investigating irregularities in any program or activity.

There are numerous examples of limitations. For instance, some SAIs are not permitted by their legal mandate to audit joint ventures or other public-private arrangements. Others are only allowed to undertake financial audits, precluded from conducting performance or value-for-money audits. The SAIs in some countries do not have the legal mandate to review arrangements involving oil or stabilization funds, or other types of special or extra-budgetary funds. The SAI may also not have the ability to audit commercial projects involving the public and private sector.

To answer “a,” the SAI must have full discretion in law to decide which audits to undertake. Answer “b” applies if some limitations exist, but the SAI enjoys significant discretion to undertake those audits it wishes to. Answer “c” applies if the SAI has some discretion, but significant legal limitations exist. Answer “d” applies if the SAI has no power at all to choose which audits to undertake

Consulting the Lima Declaration of Guidelines on Auditing Precepts (<http://internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/LimaDeclaration.pdf>) may be useful in answering this question as its provisions serve to define the appropriate scope of a SAI’s legal mandate and jurisdiction.

Answer:

b. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations.

Source:

(a) Audit Act 1957, Section 5

<https://www.audit.gov.my/index.php/en/info-korporat/audit-act>

Comment:

Under Section 5 of the Audit Act 1957, the duties of the Auditor General are as follows: to examine, enquire into and audit:

- (a) accounts of federal and state governments;
- (b) accounts of federal or state funds established under Article 97(3) of the Federal Constitution;
- (c) public authorities and bodies;
- (d) state-owned companies (established under Companies Act);
- (e) other public authorities.

These are limitations for categories (c), (d) and (e) where the Act only allows for the audit: "Provided that the Yang di-Pertuan Agong so specifies by

order under Article 106(2) of the Federal Constitution", or "with the consent of the Minister of Finance to be notified in the Gazette" or "if the Minister of Finance is satisfied that the public interest requires that", respectively.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

123. Are the audit processes of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) reviewed by an independent agency?

GUIDELINES:

Question 123 assesses whether and to what extent the audit processes of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) are subject to review by an independent agency. The latter could be a peer SAI, an international organization, an academic institution with relevant expertise, or an independent domestic agency with quality assurance functions in the area of financial reporting.

To answer "a," an independent agency must conduct and publish a review of the audit processes of the SAI on an annual basis. Answer "b" applies if a review was carried out within the past five years, and published, but it is not conducted annually, but. Choose answer "c" if the SAI has an internal unit that reviews the audit processes of the SAI on a regular basis, but an independent agency does not conduct such a review. Answer "d" applies if the audit processes of the SAI are reviewed neither by an independent agency nor by a unit within the SAI.

If the answer is either "a" or "b," please specify the name of the independent agency and when last it conducted such a review, and provide a copy of the published report. If the answer is "c," please specify the name of the unit within the SAI that is tasked with conducting such reviews.

Answer:

c. No, but a unit within the SAI conducts a review of the audit processes of the SAI on a regular basis.

Source:

(a) Organization Chart of the National Audit Department

https://www.audit.gov.my/images/cartaibupejabat/2022/ORGANISASI_PORTAL_JAN.jpg

(b) National Audit Department portal

<https://www.audit.gov.my/index.php/en/antarabangsa>

Comment:

The National Audit Department has a unit called the Bahagian Dasar and Hubungan Antarabangsa (Policy and International Relations Division) that conducts studies through quality assurance reviews and quality control inspections.

The National Audit Department is part of three international organizations: International Organization of Supreme Audit Institutions (INTOSAI), Asian Organization of Supreme Audit Institutions (ASOSAI), and ASEAN Supreme Audit Institutions (ASEANSAI). The purpose of these three organizations includes to establish cooperation, knowledge sharing, and capacity building among supreme audit institutions.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

124. In the past 12 months, how frequently did the head or a senior staff member of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) take part and testify in hearings of a committee of the legislature?

GUIDELINES:

Question 124 concerns the interaction between two important oversight actors and assesses how frequently the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) made high-level inputs to the work of legislative committees. Many SAIs interact with the legislature in some form, but the nature and intensity of the interaction varies. This question probes this aspect by asking, with reference to the past 12 months, how frequently the head or a senior staff member of the SAI took part and testified in hearings of a committee of the legislature. The intent is to assess the extent to which the SAI representative in question was not only present at a meeting of a legislative committee, but was an active participant (as opposed to a passive observer, serving only as a resource when called upon). You can refer to official records of legislative committees, websites and annual reports of the SAI, press releases and media coverage, for example. Choose answer "a" if this occurred five times or more; "b" for three times or more, but less than five times; "c" for once or twice, and "d" for never.

Answer:

a. Frequently (i.e., five times or more).

Source:

(a) Published Reports by Public Accounts Committee

<https://www.parlimen.gov.my/pac/publication-details.html?arkib=no&id=66>

(b) Hansard

<https://www.parlimen.gov.my/pac/hansardpac.html>

Comment:

The SAI took part in parliamentary activities at least 5 times in 2022 based on the hansards and reports of the Public Accounts Committee, including:

(i) DR.18/2022 - Pembangunan dan Perolehan Aplikasi MySejahtera

(ii) DR.13/2022 - Perolehan Kapal Peronda Generasi Kedua - Littoral Combatant Ship (LCS) bagi Tentera Laut Diraja Malaysia

(iii) DR.3/2022 - Perkhidmatan Rangkaian Telekomunikasi Bersepadu Kerajaan (MyGov*Net)

(iv) DR.2/2022 - Perbelanjaan Menggunakan Agihan Wang Zakat Majlis Agama Islam Wilayah Persekutuan (MAIWP)

(v) DR.5/2022 - Pengurusan Program Rumah Keduaku (MM2H)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

125. Does the executive use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during the formulation of the annual budget (prior to the budget being tabled in parliament)?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principles on "Inclusiveness" and "Timeliness" and assesses the extent to which the participation mechanism(s) used by the executive are truly interactive and involve a two-way conversation between citizens and the executive.

The drafting of this question and its answers are partially drawn from the IAP2 Spectrum of Public Participation, in particular with regards to the concepts of "involvement" (option "a" in the responses) and "consultation" (option "b"). See:

https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/foundations_course/IAP2_P2_Spectrum_FINAL.pdf.

Please consider only participation mechanisms that the Ministry of Finance, lead budget agency, or central coordinating agency designated by the government to implement participation mechanisms ("the executive") is currently using to allow the public to participate in the formulation of the annual budget, including annual pre-budget discussions. Participation mechanisms used only by line ministries should not be used to answer this question. If there is more than one mechanism used by the executive, please select the deepest or most interactive mechanism that reflects the government's efforts to incorporate citizens' input into the formulation of the annual budget. The participation mechanisms can involve a range of different issues, such as spending and tax policy, funding and revenue levels, and macro-fiscal planning.

To answer "a," the executive must use open participation mechanisms that involve the public in the formulation of the annual budget. This means that a public process is in place whereby CSOs and/or individual members of the public and government officials interact, and have the opportunity to express their opinions to each other in what can be considered a public dialogue between them (i.e., in-person and online discussion forums). Additionally, the mechanism should be open to any CSO and/or individual members of the public who wish to participate. By selecting this answer, the researcher must present evidence to support the presence of a public dialogue among citizens and government officials. Examples include public meetings and online deliberative exchanges.

Answer "b" applies if an open consultation mechanism is in place whereby members of the public (i.e., individuals and/or CSOs as well as academics, independent experts, policy think tanks, and business organizations) can provide their input in the formulation of the annual budget. This answer applies if the government is using a mechanism that is structured and well established, and not ad-hoc. The researcher must present evidence to support the presence of consultative processes through which the executive seeks out inputs from citizens. Examples include surveys, focus groups, report cards, published policy consultation exercises, and online platforms that government officials actively manage to solicit inputs.

Answer "c" applies if the executive has established a mechanism or mechanisms to allow citizens to participate in the budget formulation phase, but:

1) The mechanisms are not structured and happen only on ad-hoc basis, or not regularly.

and/or

2) The executive consults with and/or interacts with, citizens, but there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, and the executive determines fully or partially such selection process by inviting specific groups (for example by making an open call but just to experts from a particular sector, or naming specific organizations). While it is not possible for all citizens and/or CSOs to participate in this or other phases of the budget process, options "a" and "b" apply if the government does not exercise any discretion in determining who is allowed to participate. While there is likely going to be self-selection, it is important that the selection is not made by the executive.

In cases where there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, to select answer choice "c", there should be some sort of public record (held in public, minutes of meetings released to public) so that all CSOs and individual members of the public can have knowledge of the meeting, who participated, and what was discussed.

Examples of mechanisms that might qualify as a "c" response include hotlines, Facebook announcements, and one-off meetings with NGOs in which there is a public record.

The researcher must present evidence to support selection of a "c" response.

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget formulation stage.

Answer:

b. Yes, the executive uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public provide their inputs on the budget.

Source:

(a) Public consultation papers for Budget 2023

<https://budget.mof.gov.my/en/budget2023/public-consultation-paper/>

(b) Engagement and consultative sessions for Budget 2023

<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/en/news/press-citations/mof-invites-stakeholders-to-share-inputs-for-budget-2023>

(c) Budget 2023 memorandum submission portal

<https://budgetmemorandum.treasury.gov.my/>

(d) Bernama News, (September 28, 2022) "MOF Still Accepting Proposals For Budget 2023"

<https://www.bernama.com/en/business/news.php?id=2124384>

Comment:

Public consultation papers (PCPs):

- The Ministry of Finance (MOF) published four PCPs on 1 August 2022 to gather feedback from the public on: (i) Implementation of GloBE Rules in Malaysia; (ii) ESG; (iii) targeted subsidies; and (iv) green procurement. The public can provide their feedback via a Google form.
- The PCPs differ in format and structure. For example, the PCP on targeted subsidies consisted of 3 pages in total, while the PCP on GloBE rules consisted of 38 pages in total. Some PCPs provided in-depth explanations on the issue, while other did not. Nevertheless, the PCPs commonly included the ministry of finance's rationale for rolling out the initiatives.
- MOF has been publishing PCPs since 2021. However, the government has not published a consolidated feedback response before tabling and announcing the annual budget. It is not made apparent to what extent the government addressed the concerns and aspirations raised by the public.
- The publication of PCPs is also a rather new practice, instead of being required by law.

Engagement and consultative sessions:

- On 3 June 2022, the Ministry of Finance announced the commencement of its engagement and consultative sessions that were mentioned in the PBS.
- On 28 September 2022, the National Budget Office Director reported that about 190 engagement sessions were held.
- However, there weren't official reports on the output gathered from the engagement sessions.

Budget memorandum submission:

- On 3 June 2022, the Ministry of Finance opened an online portal for around 400 selected NGOs, CSOs and government agencies to submit their

memorandum for Budget 2023 (<https://budgetmemorandum.treasury.gov.my>). The portal was open for submission for 21 days until 24 June 2022.
- However, the portal is password-protected and not publicly accessible.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IBP Comment

As per OBS methodology, if there are multiple mechanisms to participate, researchers are to assess only one, the deepest and most meaningful mechanism. In Malaysia's case, answer choice B for this indicator is assessed based on Public Consultation Papers that were open to all citizens, with written submissions as the mechanism of participation.

126. With regard to the mechanism identified in question 125, does the executive take concrete steps to include vulnerable and under-represented parts of the population in the formulation of the annual budget?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principle of "Inclusiveness", and examines the executive's effort to actively reach out to citizens who are from socially vulnerable groups and/or underrepresented in national processes. The emphasis here is on the executive's efforts to seek out the views of members of the public from socially vulnerable groups and/or who are underrepresented in the process.

To answer "a," the executive must actively seek out individuals from at least one vulnerable and underrepresented community and/or civil society organization representing vulnerable and underrepresented individuals and communities. The researcher must provide evidence to show the government's efforts and actions. The researcher must speak with the relevant government official(s), and subsequently double check with an alternative source, such as representatives of vulnerable/underrepresented groups.

Answer "b" applies if the executive does not take concrete steps to incorporate vulnerable/underrepresented individuals, or organizations representing them, into participation mechanisms or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget formulation stage.

Answer:

a. Yes, the executive takes concrete steps to include individuals and/or CSOs representing vulnerable and underrepresented parts of the population in the formulation of the annual budget.

Source:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Comments: While the space for public participation is open and seen as a step in the right direction, there is nothing to show that the government is actively seeking inputs from vulnerable and under-represented groups. The mechanisms are open to the public as a whole, not specifically targeted to the inputs from vulnerable groups.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested Answer:

a. Yes, the executive takes concrete steps to include individuals and/or CSOs representing vulnerable and underrepresented parts of the population in the formulation of the annual budget.

Comments: Engagement and consultative sessions: - On 3 June 2022, the Ministry of Finance announced the commencement of its engagement and consultative sessions that were mentioned in the PBS. - On 28 September 2022, the National Budget Office Director reported that about 190 engagement sessions were held which including representatives of vulnerable/underrepresented groups Budget memorandum submission: - On 3 June 2022, the Ministry of Finance opened an online portal for around 400 selected NGOs, CSOs and government agencies including representatives of vulnerable/underrepresented groups to submit their memorandum for Budget 2023 (<https://budgetmemorandum.treasury.gov.my>). The portal was open for submission for 21 days until 24 June 2022.

Researcher Response

The researcher had sighted a list of focus group discussions previously available on the website in 2022. At the time of research, the list had been removed early due to a new administration entering after the general election in November 2022, preventing verification. A press statement kicking off the budget consultation process invites two specific CSOs for children to submit recommendations. The online portal for submissions mentioned in the statement was specifically for invited CSOs. Ref: <https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/en/news/press-citations/finance-ministry-to-start-budget-2023-engagement-process-welcomes-proposals-from-ngos> Based on the government reviewer's comment, the researcher finds that steps were made to invite vulnerable groups, although more evidence could be made available to identify the specific vulnerable groups invited. The response is revised to "a". Ref: (there is a link for "Libat Urus" which means stakeholder engagements, which previously had the list of focus group discussions) <http://web.archive.org/web/20230208010048/https://budget.mof.gov.my/ms/>

IBP Comment

Clarification: Score A is based on mechanism identified in 125 - the Public Consultation Papers. One of the topics open for consultation is 'targeted subsidies'. The Overview Paper shows that categories covered were related to cooking oil, petrol subsidy, diesel, cooking gas and electricity. Given that this relates to low income groups, participation is expected from CSO groups who work on issues of poverty.

127. During the budget formulation stage, which of the following key topics does the executive's engagement with citizens cover?

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:

1. Macroeconomic issues
2. Revenue forecasts, policies, and administration
3. Social spending policies
4. Deficit and debt levels
5. Public investment projects
6. Public services

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Timeliness". Please consider all of the mechanisms currently used by the executive to promote public participation during the formulation of the annual budget.

Please note that while the public engagement can/may cover other topics -- and for this reason the other questions assessing the executive's engagement with the public during budget formulation can be answered on the basis of engagement on topics other than the six listed above -- for the purpose of answering this question, "key topics" are considered to be only the ones listed above. If the executive's engagement with the public covers topics other than the six listed above, please specify these topics in the comments.

Note also that this question assesses only the coverage of public engagement (i.e., "what issues is the public invited to engage on?") and issues related to the depth of engagement or selectivity of engaged are not dealt with by this question.

If written materials about the public engagement, such as an invitation, do not specify the coverage of the public engagement, but the researcher has personally participated in the engagement, s/he may respond to this question based on firsthand experience of the coverage of the public engagement.

Answer "d" applies if requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget formulation stage.

Answer:

b. The executive's engagement with citizens covers at least three (but less than six) of the above-mentioned topics.

Source:

(a) Public consultation papers for Budget 2023
<https://budget.mof.gov.my/en/budget2023/public-consultation-paper/>

Comment:

The public consultation papers (PCPs) cover four different topics: (i) Implementation of GloBE rules in Malaysia; (ii) ESG; (iii) targeted subsidies; and (iv) green procurement. The public can provide feedback via a Google Form, that is publicly available and accessible during a certain time period.

Matching the PCPs with the key topics:

- (i) Implementation of GloBE rules in Malaysia -- 2. Revenue forecasts, policies, and administration
- (ii) ESG -- 2. Revenue forecasts, policies, and administration
- (iii) Targeted subsidies -- 3. Social spending policies
- (iv) Green procurement -- 6. Public investment projects

The PCPs covered three key topics, option b is thus chosen.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

128. Does the executive use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input in monitoring the implementation of the annual budget?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principles on "Inclusiveness" and "Timeliness" and assesses the extent to which the participation mechanism(s) used by the executive are truly interactive and involve a two-way conversation between citizens and the executive.

The drafting of this question and its answers are partially drawn from the IAP2 Spectrum of Public Participation, in particular with regards to the concepts of "involvement" (option "a" in the responses) and "consultation" (option "b"). See:

https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/foundations_course/IAP2_P2_Spectrum_FINAL.pdf

Please consider only participation mechanisms that the Ministry of Finance, lead budget agency, or central coordinating agency designated by the government to implement participation mechanisms ("the executive") is currently using to allow the public to participate in monitoring the implementation of the annual budget. If the executive has designated a central coordinating agency to implement participation mechanisms throughout the national budget process, researchers may consider these mechanisms. Participation mechanisms used only by line ministries should not be used to answer this question. If there is more than one mechanism used by the executive, please select the deepest or most interactive mechanism that reflects the government's efforts to incorporate citizens' input into the implementation of the annual budget. The participation mechanisms can involve a range of different issues, such as revenue administration, public service delivery, public investment project implementation, including procurement, and the administration of social transfer schemes.

To answer "a," the executive must use open participation mechanisms that involve the public in the implementation of the annual budget. This means that a public process is in place whereby CSOs and/or individual members of the public and government officials interact, and have the opportunity to express their opinions to each other in what can be considered a public dialogue between them (i.e., in-person and online discussion forums). Additionally, the mechanism should be open to any CSO and/or individual members of the public who wish to participate. By selecting this answer, the researcher must present evidence to support the presence of a public dialogue among citizens and government official. Examples include public meetings, online, deliberative exchanges, procurement complaint mechanisms, and social monitoring and dialogue.

Answer "b" applies if an open consultation mechanism is in place whereby members of the public (i.e., individuals and/or CSOs as well as academics, independent experts, policy think tanks, and business organizations) can provide their input on the implementation of the annual budget. This answer applies if the government is using a mechanism that is structured and well established, and not ad-hoc. The researcher must present evidence to support the presence of consultative processes through which the executive seeks out inputs from citizens. Examples include public hearings, surveys, focus groups, report cards, and online platforms that government officials actively manage to solicit inputs.

Answer "c" applies if the executive has established a mechanism or mechanisms to allow citizens to provide input on budget implementation, but:

1) The mechanisms are not structured, happen only on ad-hoc basis, or not regularly.

and/or

2) The executive consults with and/or interacts with, citizens, but there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, and the executive determines fully or partially such selection process by inviting specific groups (for example by making an open call but just to experts from a particular sector, or naming specific organizations). While it is not possible for all citizens and/or CSOs to participate in this or other phases of the budget process, options "a" and "b" apply if the government does not exercise any discretion in determining who is allowed to participate. While there is likely going to be self-selection, it is important that the selection is not made by the executive.

In cases where there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, to select answer choice "c", the researcher must have evidence that the government is holding participation mechanisms that have some sort of public record (held in public, minutes of meetings released to public) so that all CSOs and members of the public can have knowledge of the meeting, who participated, and what was discussed.

Examples include hotlines, Facebook announcements, one-off meetings with NGOs in which there is a public record.

The researcher must present evidence to support selection of a "c" response.

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget implementation stage.

Answer:

b. Yes, the executive uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public provide their inputs on budget implementation.

Source:

(a) Ministry of Finance: Voice Out Your Opinion
<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/en/contact/your-voice>

(b) Ministry of Finance: The Integrated Complaints Management System (SISPAA)
<https://treasury.spab.gov.my/eApps/sdmcasepool/SdmsCasePool/publicLogin.do>

(c) Public Complaints Bureau website
<https://www.pcb.gov.my/bm/>

Comment:

The Ministry of Finance's website hosts a dedicated form for public opinions and feedback towards improving the quality of services and delivery. While it is not specifically mentioned that the feedback should be related to the annual budget, budget implementation can be included under the "services and delivery" of the Ministry of Finance.

There is another dedicated website for Ministry of Finance-related complaints and inquiries, the Integrated Complaints Management System (SISPAA). Public users need to first create an account to login prior to submitting a complaint, an inquiry, or a compliment. The feedback should be related to services provided by the Ministry of Finance. This website is likely owned by the Public Complaints Bureau in accordance with the copyright remarks.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

129. With regard to the mechanism identified in question 128, does the executive take concrete steps to receive input from vulnerable and underrepresented parts of the population on the implementation of the annual budget?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principle of "Inclusiveness", and examines the executive's effort to actively reach out to citizens who are from socially vulnerable groups and/or underrepresented in national processes. The emphasis here is on national government's efforts to obtain input from members of the public who are from socially vulnerable groups and/or underrepresented in national processes during the implementation of the annual budget.

To answer "a," the executive must actively seek out individuals from at least one vulnerable and underrepresented community and/or civil society organization representing vulnerable and underrepresented individuals and communities. The researcher must provide evidence to show the government's efforts and actions. The researcher must speak with the relevant government official(s), and subsequently double check with an alternative source, such as representatives from vulnerable/underrepresented groups.

Answer "b" applies if the national executive does not take concrete steps to incorporate vulnerable/underrepresented individuals, or organizations representing them, into participation mechanisms or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget implementation stage.

Answer:

b. The requirements for an "a" response are not met.

Source:

(a) Ministry of Finance: Voice Out Your Opinion
<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/en/contact/your-voice>

(b) Ministry of Finance: The Integrated Complaints Management System (SISPAA)
<https://treasury.spab.gov.my/eApps/sdmcasepool/SdmsCasePool/publicLogin.do>

(c) Public Complaints Bureau website
<https://www.pcb.gov.my/bm/>

Comment:

The official Ministry of Finance and the Public Complaints Bureau portals for complaints and feedback are publicly accessible. These portals however don't specifically seek inputs from vulnerable and underrepresented individuals and communities.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

130. During the implementation of the annual budget, which of the following topics does the executive's engagement with citizens cover?

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:

1. Changes in macroeconomic circumstances
2. Delivery of public services
3. Collection of revenue
4. Implementation of social spending
5. Changes in deficit and debt levels
6. Implementation of public investment projects

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Timeliness". Please consider all of the mechanisms currently used by the executive to promote public participation during the implementation of the annual budget.

Please note that while the public engagement can/may cover other topics -- and for this reason the other questions assessing the executive's engagement with the public during budget implementation can be answered on the basis of engagement on topics other than the six listed above -- for the purpose of answering this question, "key topics" are considered to be ONLY the ones listed above. If the executive's engagement with the public covers topics other than the six listed above, please specify these topics in the comments.

Note also that this question assesses only the coverage of public engagement (i.e., "what issues is the public invited to engage on?") and issues related to the depth of engagement or selectivity of engaged are not dealt with by this question.

If written materials about the public engagement, such as an invitation, do not specify the coverage of the public engagement, but the researcher has personally participated in the engagement, s/he may respond to this question based on firsthand experience of the coverage of the public engagement.

Answer "d" applies if requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget implementation stage.

Answer:

c. The executive's engagement with citizens covers at least one (but less than three) of the above-mentioned topics.

Source:

(a) Ministry of Finance: Voice Out Your Opinion
<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/en/contact/your-voice>

(b) Ministry of Finance: The Integrated Complaints Management System (SISPAA)
<https://treasury.spab.gov.my/eApps/sdmscasepool/SdmsCasePool/publicLogin.do>

(c) Public Complaints Bureau website
<https://www.pcb.gov.my/bm/>

Comment:

The websites cited above offer opportunities for the public to provide feedback on the Ministry of Finance's "services and delivery", that cover policy

implementation and decision-making processes. Thus, it can be understood that these two key topics are covered: 2. Delivery of public services and 4. Implementation of social spending.

There are no other channels to seek public opinions and feedback on the other key topics.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

131. When the executive engages with the public, does it provide comprehensive prior information on the process of the engagement, so that the public can participate in an informed manner?

Comprehensive information must include at least three of the following elements:

- 1. Purpose**
- 2. Scope**
- 3. Constraints**
- 4. Intended outcomes**
- 5. Process and timeline**

GUIDELINES:

This question relates to the GIFT principle of "Openness," and addresses whether the executive provides relevant information on the process of the engagement before public participation takes place, in order to help citizens engage effectively. The question addresses whether the "rules of the public engagement" are clearly spelled out, in advance and in detail, so that those members of the public who want to engage know how to do so, in terms of when they can do so, what they are expected to provide input on, by when, to whom, etc. This question does not cover the substance of the engagement, which is covered by questions 127 and 130.

Non-comprehensive information means that the government provides information that includes at least one but less than three of the elements listed above.

Purpose refers to a brief explanation of why the public engagement is being undertaken, including the executive's objectives for its engagement with the public.

Scope refers to what is within the subject matter of the engagement as well as what is outside the subject matter of the engagement. For example, the scope may include how a current policy is administered but exclude the specifics of the policies themselves.

Constraints refers to whether there are there any explicit limitations on the engagement. An example of a constraint could be that any policy changes must not cost (or forgo revenue) more than a specific amount or have no net fiscal cost.

Intended outcomes refers to what the executive hopes to achieve as a result of the engagement. Examples of intended outcomes could be revising a policy to better reflect citizen or service-user views or to improve the way in which a particular program is administered.

Process refers to the methods by which the public engagement will take place and the discrete steps in the process. For example, the process may simply be a one-off Internet-based consultation, with a summary published of public inputs and the official response. The process may involve simultaneous or overlapping steps, and may be conducted in one round or in two or more rounds of engagement.

Timeline refers to the specific dates on which the discrete steps in the process will take place, or during which they will be completed, and clear start and end dates for the overall engagement.

Answer "d" applies if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget implementation or formulation stage.

Answer:

b. Comprehensive information is provided in a timely manner prior to citizens engagement only prior to one of the two phases (formulation OR implementation).

Source:

(a) Budget 2023 Public Consultation Papers
<https://budget.mof.gov.my/en/budget2023/public-consultation-paper/>

(b) Ministry of Finance: Voice Out Your Opinion
<https://www.mof.gov.my/portal/en/contact/your-voice>

Comment:

Formulation phase:

The Ministry of Finance published four PCPs on 1 August 2022 to gather feedback from the public on the: (i) Implementation of GloBE Rules in Malaysia; (ii) ESG; (iii) targeted subsidies; and (iv) green procurement. The public can provide feedback via a Google form.

The purpose, process, and timelines are made clear in the PCPs. Taking PCP (i) on GloBE rules for example, it begins with the rationale and purpose of the PCP in the Introduction chapter. This was followed by explanations on the content of GloBE rules, with feedback questions inserted accordingly. The links and submission deadline for the feedback form are also clear in the PCP.

However, the constraints and intended outcomes are not explicit in the PCPs. The PCPs focused on gathering general feedback and opinions rather than detailed analysis or consultation. They don't include the executive's plan to include feedback into final implementation, or any explicit limitations on the engagements.

Implementation phase:

There is not a designated website for citizen engagement in the budget implementation phase. The public can provide feedback on Ministry of Finance's "services and delivery" via the "Voice Out Your Opinion" portal. The portal is not targeted at budget implementation, but "services and delivery" that can be understood as including budget implementation.

However, the portal itself does not provide comprehensive information for citizens to provide feedback. The previous administration published the "Laporan Kewangan Rakyat" (People's Finance Report) roughly on a weekly basis; but, the last issue of the report was published on 22 September 2022. The reports provided general information and implementation progress on select budget initiatives (mostly related to social issues such as unemployment, upskilling and reskilling, initiatives for businesses etc.) without a standardized reporting format. The reports were also not designed to educate the public in order to collect public opinions. It is thus concluded that the executive does not provide comprehensive information on the budget implementation phase.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

132. With regard to the mechanism identified in question 125, does the executive provide the public with feedback on how citizens' inputs have been used in the formulation of the annual budget?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Sustainability", and examines the extent to which the executive provides information to citizens on which public inputs were received, which ones are used in the formulation of the annual budget, and how/why.

By "written record", we mean a document that is produced and released by the lead budget agency (Ministry of Finance, Treasury) that has set up and holds the participation activity.

Answer "a" applies when the executive provides a written document with:

- *The inputs (e.g., a written transcript) received from the public and*
- *A detailed report on how the inputs were used or not used (such report should include information on which inputs were used or not used, why, and how)*

Answer "b" applies when the executive provides a written document that includes:

- *The inputs (e.g., a written transcript) received from the public and*
- *A not-so-detailed report, such as a document with a few paragraphs, on how public inputs were used or not used. This document only gives a general idea on how those inputs were used or not used.*

Answer "c" applies when the executive provides a written document that includes:

- The inputs (e.g., a written transcript) received from the public or
- A report (being it detailed or not-so-detailed) on how public inputs have been used or not used.

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget formulation stage.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

Comment:

The Ministry of Finance used three mechanisms to collect citizens' inputs prior to budget formulation: public consultation papers (PCPs), engagement and consultative sessions, and a budget memorandum submission portal. Only PCPs were publicly accessible by citizens, whereas the others were conducted on a selective basis, for which there wasn't transparency regarding the selection mechanism utilized.

However, there is no formal report on the input gathered via the different mechanisms.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

133. With regard to the mechanism identified in question 128, does the executive provide the public with information on how citizens' inputs have been used to assist in monitoring the implementation of the annual budget?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Sustainability", and examines the extent to which the executive provides information to citizens on which public inputs were received during the implementation of the annual budget, which ones are taken into account to improve budget monitoring, and how/why.

By "written record", we mean a document that is produced and released by the lead budget agency (Ministry of Finance, Treasury) that has set up and holds the participation activity.

Answer "a" applies when the executive provides a written document with:

- The inputs (e.g., a written transcript) received from the public and
- A detailed report on how the inputs were used or not used (such report should include information on which inputs were used or not used, why, and how)

Answer "b" applies when the executive provides a written document that includes:

- The inputs received (e.g., a written transcript) from the public and
- A not-so-detailed report, such as a document with a few paragraphs, on how public inputs were used or not used. This document only gives a general idea on how those inputs were or were not taken into account by the executive during budget monitoring.

Answer "c" applies when the executive provides a written document that includes:

- The inputs (e.g., a written transcript) received from the public or
- A report (being it detailed or not-so-detailed) on how public inputs have been used or not used.

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget implementation stage.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

Public Complaints Bureau Annual Report 2021
https://www.pcb.gov.my/pdf/laporantahunan_2021.html

Comment:

There are two platforms for the public to give inputs on budget implementation: (i) the "Voice Out Your Opinion" portal and (ii) the Integrated Complaints Management System (SISPA). However, the Ministry of Finance does not publish reports on how the inputs were used to monitor the implementation of annual budgets.

The Public Complaints Bureau, however, does provide a summary on the complaints received through the annual report. For example, a breakdown is provided of the complaints received segregated based on the categories (e.g. late or no actions, failure in implementation, failure in complying by the procedures, etc.) on p. 31 in the Annual Report 2021.

However, this breakdown is based on all complaints received from the portals of different ministries and not those of the Ministry of Finance alone. The report also does not mention how the complaints were used to monitor annual budget implementation.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IBP Comment

For cross country consistency, IBP revised this indicator to C. The Public Complaint Bureau publishes annual reports in which they show the number of complaints, types, origins and to which ministry these complaints are directed to. See page 31 for types/category - https://www.pcb.gov.my/pdf/laporantahunan_2021.htm Additionally, registrants are able to see the status of their complaint.

134. Are participation mechanisms incorporated into the timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principles on "Sustainability," "Timeliness" and "Complementarity" and addresses whether the executive is able to link participation mechanisms to the administrative processes that are used to create the annual budget.

Please note that "timetable" refers to a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the Ministry of Finance or whatever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation. This document is sometimes referred to as the budget calendar and is the same document referenced in Question 53.

Answer "a" applies if the national executive establishes a clear set of guidelines that enable citizens and civil servants to understand when participation mechanisms should be used to enable citizen inputs to be incorporated into the annual budget. For answer choice "a", the timetable must be available to the public prior to the budget preparation process beginning.

Answer "b" applies if the executive does not establish a clear set of guidelines that enable citizens and civil servants to understand when participation mechanisms should be used to enable citizen inputs to be incorporated into the annual budget or if the executive does not use public participation mechanisms during the budget formulation or implementation stage.

Answer:

b. The requirements for an "a" response are not met.

Source:

(a) Treasury Circular: Preparation Guidelines for Suggestions on Federal Expenditures Estimates
<https://www.myresults.gov.my/portal/wp-content/uploads/2021/04/PB-1.3-Penyediaan-Belanjawan-2022-Final-PDF.pdf>

Comment:

The circular outlines deadlines for important milestones to be adhered to by ministries during the budget formulation process, but it doesn't incorporate a schedule for public participation.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

135. Do one or more line ministries use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during the formulation or implementation of the annual budget?

GUIDELINES

While questions 125 – 134 focus only on participation mechanisms that the Ministry of Finance, lead budget agency, or central coordinating agency currently use to allow the public to participate in the national budget process, this question asks about participation mechanisms used by line ministries to allow the public to participate in national budget processes. Thus, participation mechanisms used by the Ministry of Finance, lead budget agency, or central coordinating agency should not be used to answer this question. If there is more than one mechanism used by a line ministry or if multiple line ministries use participation mechanisms, please select the deepest or most interactive mechanism that reflects the government's efforts to incorporate citizens' input into the formulation and/or implementation of the annual budget.

This question reflects the GIFT principles on "Inclusiveness" and "Timeliness" and assesses the extent to which the participation mechanism(s) used by the executive are truly interactive and involve a two-way conversation between citizens and the executive.

The drafting of this question and its answers are partially drawn from the IAP2 Spectrum of Public Participation, in particular with regards to the concepts of "involvement" (option "a" in the responses) and "consultation" (option "b"). See:

https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/foundations_course/IAP2_P2_Spectrum_FINAL.pdf

To answer "a," a line ministry must use open participation mechanisms that involve the public in the formulation or implementation of the annual budget. This means that a public process is in place whereby CSOs and/or individual members of the public and government officials interact, and have the opportunity to express their opinions to each other in what can be considered a public dialogue between them (i.e., in-person and online discussion forums). Additionally, the mechanism should be open to any CSO and/or individual members of the public who wish to participate. By selecting this answer, the researcher must present evidence to support the presence of a public dialogue among citizens and government official. Examples include public meetings and online deliberative exchanges.

Answer "b" applies if an open consultation mechanism is in place whereby members of the public (i.e., individuals and/or CSOs as well as academics, independent experts, policy think tanks, and business organizations) can provide their input in the formulation or implementation of the annual budget. This answer applies if the government is using a mechanism that is structured and well established, and not ad-hoc. The researcher must present evidence to support the presence of consultative processes through which a line ministry seeks out inputs from citizens. Examples include surveys, focus groups, report cards, published policy consultation exercises, and online platforms that government officials actively manage to solicit inputs.

Answer "c" applies if a line ministry has established a mechanism or mechanisms to allow citizens to participate in the budget formulation phase, but:

1) The mechanisms are not structured and happen only on ad-hoc basis, or not regularly.

and/or

2) A line ministry consults with and/or interacts with, citizens, but there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, and the line ministry determines fully or partially such selection process by inviting specific groups (for example by making an open call but just to experts from a particular sector, or naming specific organizations). While it is not possible for all citizens and/or CSOs to participate in this or other phases of the budget process, options "a" and "b" apply if the government does not exercise any discretion in determining who is allowed to participate. While there is likely going to be self-selection, it is important that the selection is not made by the executive.

In cases where there is discretion in who is allowed to participate, to select answer choice "c", there should be some sort of public record (held in public, minutes of meetings released to public) so that all CSOs and individual members of the public can have knowledge of the meeting, who participated, and what was discussed.

The researcher must present evidence to support selection of a "c" response.

Examples of mechanisms that might qualify as a “c” response include hotlines, Facebook announcements, and one-off meetings with NGOs in which there is a public record.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a “c” response or above are not met.

Source:

Comment:

It is not apparent that any line ministries used participation mechanisms to collect inputs from the public during budget formulation or implementation.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

136. Does the legislature or the relevant legislative committee(s) hold public hearings and/or use other participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during its public deliberations on the formulation of the annual budget (pre-budget and/or approval stages)?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principle on “Sustainability,” “Transparency,” and “Complementarity” and assesses the extent to which the participation mechanism(s) used by the legislature are interactive and involve a two-way conversation between citizens and the legislature, rather than being limited to allowing the public to attend or hear public budget deliberations.

Please consider participation mechanisms that the legislature (both in its whole institution or its relevant budget/public accounts/finance committees) has put in place and is using to allow the public to participate in their deliberations on the annual budget. This includes deliberations during the pre-budget phase (i.e., when the executive is still in the process of formulating the draft budget) and the budget discussions after the budget has been tabled to parliament and before it is approved. In the comment box, please specify during which stage of the budget cycle the legislature has put in place a public participation mechanism.

Mechanisms through which members of the public reach out to individual Members of Parliament as opposed to the legislature (both in its whole institution or its relevant budget/public accounts/finance committees) or unofficial hearings organized by a subset of committee members should not be considered in answering this question.

If there is more than one mechanism, please select a mechanism that best shows/reflects the legislature’s efforts to incorporate citizens into the formulation of the annual budget. The participation mechanisms can involve a range of different issues, such as revenues, policy selection, and macro-fiscal planning (please note that the issue of coverage is covered in a subsequent question).

To answer “a,” the legislature must hold public hearings where citizens are allowed to testify. This answer applies only if the legislature does not exercise discretion in determining which citizens and/or CSOs can testify (for example, participation takes place on a first-come-first-served basis).

Answer “b” should be selected if the following applies:

- *The legislature holds public hearings on the budget;*
- *Testimony is not allowed from members of the public or CSOs; but*
- *There are other means used by the legislature to receive and collect views from citizens and CSOs on the budget, and the legislature does not exercise discretion in determining which citizens and/or CSOs can provide input. The researcher must provide evidence to support the presence of those alternative processes through which the legislature seeks inputs from citizens. For example, there should be a public record indicating that views from citizens and the public were sought.*

Answer “c” should be selected if the following applies:

- *The legislature holds public hearings on the budget;*
- *Testimony is not allowed from members of the public or CSOs;*
- *No other means are used by the legislature to receive and collect views/input from citizens and CSOs on the budget, but*
- *The legislature invites a few individuals/groups to provide input (through public hearings or elsewhere)*

- *The legislature has a provision (via standing orders or in law) through which the public can submit their inputs, and members of the public or CSOs actively use it to submit opinions on the budget.*

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the legislature does not use public participation mechanisms during its deliberations on the annual budget

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

(a) Announcement and Formation of Special Select Committee of Finance and Economy

- <https://themalaysianreserve.com/2020/11/12/dewan-rakyat-passes-motion-on-9-special-select-committees/>

- <https://www.malaymail.com/news/malaysia/2020/11/02/speaker-proposes-setting-up-of-nine-parliamentary-select-committees/1918600>

(b) Hansard for 11 November 2020, pg.14 -15

<https://www.parlimen.gov.my/files/hindex/pdf/DR-11112020.pdf>

Comment:

Special Select Committees with specific portfolios were introduced into the House of Representatives in 2018. On 11 November 2020, the Special Select Committee on Finance and the Economy (Jawatankuasa Pilihan Khas Kewangan dan Ekonomi) was among one of nine committees formed in the 3rd term of the 14th Parliament.

There is no record of public hearings and there is no indication that members of the public were called to provide inputs on the budget to the committee. The public can follow general parliamentary sessions on live television and by reading the Hansard, that is publicly available on Parliament's website, however they cannot attend select committee sessions.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

137. During the legislative deliberations on the annual budget (pre-budget or approval stages), which of the following key topics does the legislature's (or relevant legislative budget committee) engagement with citizens cover?

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:

1. Macroeconomic issues
2. Revenue forecasts, policies, and administration
3. Social spending policies
4. Deficit and debt levels
5. Public investment projects
6. Public services

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Timeliness". Please consider the range of mechanisms currently used by the legislature to promote public participation during legislative deliberations on the annual budget.

Please note that while the public engagement can/may cover other topics, for the purpose of answering this question, "key topics" are considered to be only the ones listed above. If the legislature's engagement with the public covers topics other than the six listed above, please specify these topics in the comments.

Note also that this question assesses only the coverage of public engagement (i.e., "what issues is the public invited to engage on?") and issues related to the depth of engagement or selectivity of engaged are not dealt with by this question.

If written materials about the public engagement, such as an invitation, do not specify the coverage of the public engagement, but the researcher has personally participated in the engagement, s/he may respond to this question based on firsthand experience of the coverage of the public engagement.

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the legislature does not use public participation mechanisms during its deliberations on the annual budget.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

(a) Parliamentary Business Of The 5th Session Of Fourteenth Parliament 2022 (3rd Meeting)

<https://web.archive.org/web/20220811194915/https://www.parlimen.gov.my/takwim-dewan-rakyat.html?uweb=dr&id=3&ssid=5&lang=en>

Comment:

The legislature does not seek inputs formally from the public during budget deliberations. The parliamentary schedule of the last parliamentary session for the initial Budget 2023 (which did not convene as the Parliament dissolved prior to the sitting) does not provide for public hearings.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

138. Does the legislature provide feedback to the public on how citizens' inputs have been used during legislative deliberations on the annual budget?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Sustainability", and examines the extent to which the legislature provides information to citizens on which public inputs were received and how inputs were used during legislative deliberations (please note that these deliberations can refer to the pre-budget and approval phases). By "written record" in this question, we mean a document that is produced and released by the legislature.

Answer "a" applies when the legislature provides a written document with:

- The inputs received from the public (e.g., a written transcript) and
- A detailed report on how the inputs were used or not used (such report should include information on which inputs were used or not used, why, and how).

Answer "b" applies when the legislature provides a written document that includes:

- The inputs received from the public (e.g., a written transcript) and
- A not-so-detailed report on how public inputs were used or not used. This document only gives a general idea on how those inputs were used or not used in legislative deliberations on the annual budget (please note that these deliberations refer to the pre-budget and approval phases).

Answer "c" applies when the legislature makes available a video recording of the relevant legislative session or provides a written document that includes:

- The inputs received from the public (e.g., a written transcript) or
- A report (being it detailed or not-so-detailed) on how public inputs have been used or not used.

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the legislature does not use public participation mechanisms during its deliberations on the annual budget.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

(a) Parliamentary Business Of The 5th Session Of Fourteenth Parliament 2022 (3rd Meeting)

<https://web.archive.org/web/20220811194915/https://www.parlimen.gov.my/takwim-dewan-rakyat.html?uweb=dr&id=3&ssid=5&lang=en>

Comment:

The legislature does not use public participation mechanisms when deliberating the annual budget. It does not provide feedback to the public on how public inputs have been used during legislative deliberations on the annual budget. There were mainly debates among parliamentarians during parliamentary sessions.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

139. Does the legislature hold public hearings and/or use other participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during its public deliberations on the Audit Report?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principle on "Sustainability," "Transparency," and "Complementarity" and assesses the extent to which the participation mechanism(s) used by the legislature are interactive and involve a two-way conversation between citizens and the legislature, rather than being limited to allowing the public to attend or hear public budget deliberations.

A key constitutional role of the legislature in almost all countries is to oversee the government's management of public resources. While the Supreme Audit Institution is responsible for checking the government's accounts and publishing the outcome of their audits, for accountability purposes it is essential that the legislature reviews and scrutinizes those reports, and checks on whether the executive is taking the appropriate corrective actions based on the Supreme Audit Institution's recommendations.

Holding public hearings to review audit findings allows the public to learn more about how the government has managed its resources for the budget years that have ended, and demand accountability in case of mismanagement and irregularities. Reviewing and discussing those reports in public is therefore a key responsibility of a legislature.

Please note that by "Audit Report" we refer to the same audit report assessed in the transparency section of this Survey, i.e., one of the eight key budget documents that all governments (in this case, the Supreme Audit Institution) must produce, according to best practice.

Please consider participation mechanisms that the legislature (both in its whole institution or its relevant budget/public accounts/finance committees) have put in place and using to allow the public to participate in their deliberations on the Audit Report.

Mechanisms through which members of the public reach out to individual members of parliament as opposed to the legislature (both in its whole institution or its relevant budget/public accounts/finance committees) or unofficial hearings organized by a subset of committee members should not be considered in answering this question.

To answer "a," the national legislature must hold public hearings where citizens are allowed to testify. This answer applies only if the legislature does not exercise discretion in determining which citizens and/or CSOs can testify (for example, participation takes place on a first-come-first-served basis).

Answer "b" should be selected if the following applies:

- *The legislature holds public hearings on the budget;*
- *No testimony is allowed from the public; BUT*
- *There are other means used by the legislature to receive and collect views from citizens and CSOs on the budget, and the legislature does not exercise discretion in determining which citizens and/or CSOs can provide input. The researcher must provide evidence to support the presence of those alternative processes through which the legislature seeks inputs from citizens. For example, there should be a public record indicating that views from citizens and the public were sought.*

Answer "c" should be selected if the following applies:

- *The legislature holds public hearings on the budget;*
- *No testimony is allowed from the public;*
- *No other means are used by the legislature to receive and collect views/input from citizens and CSOs on the budget, BUT*
- *The legislature invites a few individuals/groups to provide input (through public hearings or elsewhere)*

Answer "d" applies if the requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if the legislature does not use public participation mechanisms during its deliberations on the Audit Report.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a “c” response or above are not met.

Source:

(a) Efforts to amend Standing Order 85 by PAC chairperson
<https://www.malaysiakini.com/news/478236>

(b) The Standing Orders of the Dewan Rakyat (Section 85)
https://www.parlimen.gov.my/images/webuser/peraturan_mesyuarat/PMDR-eng.pdf

Comment:

The Public Accounts Committee is tasked with examining audit reports. The proceedings of the committee are not open to the public despite past efforts by the previous committee chairperson, Noraini Ahmad, to amend Standing Order 85 that stipulates that no documents and statements can be made public or released by the Committee before the official report is published and presented to Parliament.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

140. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can suggest issues/topics to include in the SAI's audit program (for example, by bringing ideas on agencies, programs, or projects that could be audited)?

GUIDELINES:

This question assesses whether the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has established mechanisms through which the public can provide suggestions on issues/topics to be included in its audit program. When deciding its audit agenda, the SAI may undertake audits for a sample of agencies, projects, and programs in the country; and such a selection could be based on complaints and suggestions made by members of the public. To receive such suggestions, the SAI may create formal mechanisms, like setting up a website, hotline, or office (or assigning staff to liaise with the public).

Please note that formal mechanisms that do not explicitly seek the public's input in the audit program (such as general comment submission boxes on the SAI's website) should not be considered for this question.

Answer:

a. Yes, the SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can suggest issues/topics to include in its audit program.

Source:

(a) Complaint and Feedback Form
<https://www.audit.gov.my/index.php/aduan-maklum-balas>

Comment:

The National Audit Department provides an online form for feedback and complaints. The preface to the form clearly states that the input would be used to inform the department's audit program.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

141. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) provide the public with feedback on how citizens' inputs have been used to determine its audit program?

GUIDELINES:

This question reflects the GIFT principles of "Transparency" and "Sustainability", and examines the extent to which the Supreme Audit Institution provides information to citizens on which public inputs were received, which ones are used to determine the Supreme Audit Institution's audit program. By "written record" in this question, we mean a document that is produced and released by the Supreme Audit Institution.

Answer "a" applies when the Supreme Audit Institution provides a written document with:

- *The inputs received from the public and*
- *A detailed report on how the inputs were used or not used (such report should include information on which inputs were used or not used, why, and how).*

Answer "b" applies when the SAI provides a written document that includes:

- *The inputs received from the public and*
- *A not-so-detailed report on how public inputs were used or not used. This document only gives a general idea on how those inputs were used or not used to determine the SAI's annual audit program.*

Answer "c" applies when the SAI provides a written document that includes:

- *The received from the public or*
- *A report (being it detailed or not-so-detailed) on how public inputs have been used or not used.*

Answer "d" applies if requirements for a "c" response or above are not met or if maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can suggests issues/topics to include in the SAI's audit program.

Answer:

d. The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

Source:

(a) Auditor-General's Reports portal
<https://lkan.audit.gov.my/senarai-laporan-kategori?filter=1>

(b) National Audit Department website
<https://www.audit.gov.my/index.php>

Comment:

The National Audit Department and the Auditor-General's Reports websites do not publish any reports recording inputs received from the public.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

142. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can contribute to audit investigations (as respondents, witnesses, etc.)?

GUIDELINES:

This question mirrors question 140, but instead of covering public assistance in formulating the SAI's audit program, it focuses on whether the Supreme Audit Institution has established mechanisms through which the public can participate in audit investigations. In addition to seeking public input to determine its audit agenda, the SAI may wish to provide formal opportunities for the public and civil society organizations to participate in the actual audit investigations, as witnesses or respondents.

Answer:

b. The requirements for an "a" response are not met.

Source:

(a) National Audit Department's Complaints and Feedback portal
<https://www.audit.gov.my/index.php/en/complaints-and-feedback>

Comment:

The National Audit Department website only provides a portal for the public to give general complaints and feedback. It states that:
"Note: The National Audit Department (NAD) is not an enforcement agency such as MACC and PDRM. NAD is only responsible to undergo auditing that involves public funds including programme performance / activities that are funded by the public funds, based on the annual plannings that have been prepared. The auditing outcome will be reported in the Auditor-General Report and will be tabled in the parliament. Therefore, any complaints will only be accepted by NAD as an input to the audit plan however NAD shall not be bound to make any further investigations related to it."

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree