ANGOLA

September 28, 2007

International Budget Partnership
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street, NE
Suite 510
Washington, DC  20002
www.internationalbudget.org
www.openbudgetindex.org
This questionnaire was completed by:

Name: 
Organization: COMISSÃO EPISCOPAL DE JUSTIÇA E PAZ
Address: PO Box 2918, Luanda Angola
Telephone: 222263169
E-mail: analista.ie@gmail.com / ekambali@yahoo.com
        navyngolo@hotmail.com
        coordenador.sje@gamil.com
Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents

Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal

Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year
Comprehensiveness
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring

Section Three: The Budget Process

Executive’s Formulation of the Budget
Legislative Approval of the Budget
Executive’s Implementation of the Budget
Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution
Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

*Please indicate the budget year of the document used to complete the questionnaire. If the document is not available to the public, please state, “Not Available.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire</th>
<th>Budget Year Used</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Budget Statement</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Summary</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Budget Documents</td>
<td>2007 / 2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
<td>2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enacted Budget</td>
<td>2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Year Reports</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Year Report</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year-End Report</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audit Report</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links

Please provide the full title, date and Internet link for all documents to be cited in Sections 2 & 3.

If an Internet link is not available for the document, please indicate one of these three answers: “Not Produced,” “Produced but Not Available to the Public,” “Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Document</th>
<th>Full Title, Date, and Internet Link</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Budget Statement</td>
<td>Produced but not Available to the public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Summary</td>
<td>Produced but not Available to the public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
<td>Produced but not Available to the public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Document Three in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
<td>Not produced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
<td>Orçamento Geral do Estado 2007. Publicly available but not on the internet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enacted Budget</td>
<td>Diário da República, Lei do Orçamento Geral do Estado para 2007, 29th December 2006 / Lei nº 13/06 de 29 de Dezembro. <a href="http://www.minfin.gov.ao/docs/dspOrcaPass.htm">Link</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Year Reports</td>
<td>Produced but not available to the publicIn an interview with the Director of Information and Documentation, we were informed that every trimester and every semester reports are produced but are not available to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mid-Year Review</strong></td>
<td>Not produced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Audit Report</strong></td>
<td>Produced but not available to the public. The information provided to the researchers (from the reception of the Tribunal de Contras (nat’l audit body) is that this report exists but that these documents are all secret.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Other Documents</strong></td>
<td>1. Orçamento Geral do Estado para o Ano 2007 - Revisto 8 de Agosto 2007. publicly available but not on the internet. 2. Despesa Pública &amp; Gestores Orçamentais, Public available but not on the internet</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS</th>
<th>Pre-budget</th>
<th>Executive’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Citizens budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Main document</td>
<td>Budget summary*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Not produced, even for internal purposes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?

For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?</th>
<th>Pre-budget</th>
<th>Executive’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Citizens budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The release date is known at least one month in advance</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Released to public same day as official release to media</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Available on the Internet free of charge</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Free print copies available, limited distribution</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Free print copies available, mass distribution</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities*</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Written in more than one language</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. News conference is held to discuss release</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

*Mark “Yes” if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.
### Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

**DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS**

*For the following reports, place a “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Enacted budget</th>
<th>In-year reports</th>
<th>Mid-year review</th>
<th>Year-end report</th>
<th>Audit report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Not produced, even for</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>internal purposes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Produced for internal</td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>purposes, but not</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>available to the public</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Produced and available</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to the public, but</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>only on request</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?*

*For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Enacted budget</th>
<th>In-year reports</th>
<th>Mid-year review</th>
<th>Year-end report</th>
<th>Audit report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The release date is known at least one month in advance</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Released to public same day as official release to media</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Available on the Internet free of charge</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Free print copies available, limited distribution</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Free print copies available, mass distribution</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Readily available outside capital/big cities*</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Written in more than one language</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. News conference is held to discuss release</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Mark “Yes” if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:
BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)
BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year
BY-1 = one year before the budget year

Please mark your answer by placing the appropriate letter in the box to the right of the question. For all answers marked “not applicable/other,” please provide a brief explanation indicating either why the answer choices provided are not applicable or why another response would be more appropriate.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Executive’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. <strong>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

According to the Director of documentation and information of the Ministry of Finance, the executive budget proposal is considered as a public document when it is handed to the Nacional Assembly (Parliament). But, in practice, the copies of this document are just distributed among the MPs committees for their analysis and despite various attempts it was not possible for the researchers to obtain a copy. Then, after a period of time, less than two weeks, a public formal session is held to enact the budget. Civil society and public institutions are invited to the session, but they do not participate in any budget decision making. We have to mention that it has never happened that the parliament vote against the executive budget proposal, because the ruling party is the majority in the parliament. So, the enacted budget used to be the same document as the executive budget proposal.

The Government of Angola in 2008 for the first time made the Executive’s budget proposal available to the public in the website of the Ministry of Finance. However, this information was available after the cutoff date of this questionnaire, which was September 28, 2007: so it was not possible to include it in this report, but will be reflected in next year’s.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
2. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No expenditures classified by function are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation: 

Comment: 

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

|   | d |

3. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation: 

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

|   | d |
4. **Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?**

   a. Program-level data are presented for all expenditures.
   b. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No program-level data are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

5. **In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?**

   a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.
   b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
6. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).
   b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.
   c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.
   d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

7. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?

   a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually.
   b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually.
   c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually.
   d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
8. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?

   a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually.
   b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually.
   c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually.
   d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

9. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.
   b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
10. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).
   b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

11. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?

   a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget).
   b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year.
   c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year.
   d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
12. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

   a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented.
   b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>b</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

13. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?

   a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.
   b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation: 

Comment: 

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** 

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>17.</th>
<th>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation: 

Comment: 

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** 

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 19. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification? |
| a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. |
| b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. |
| c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1. |
| d. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |
| Citation: |
| Comment: |
| **Peer Reviewer One Comment:** |
| **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** |
20. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?

   a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
   b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
   c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1.
   d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**
   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

21. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1.
   b. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1.
   c. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1.
   d. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**
   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
22. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure.
   b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure.
   c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure.
   d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

23. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.
   b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
24. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

- **a.** Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).
- **b.** Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.
- **c.** Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.
- **d.** No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

25. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?

- **a.** Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
- **b.** Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
- **c.** Before BY-3.
- **d.** No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?

a. Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data.
b. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable.
c. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist.
d. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

27. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

a. All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
b. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.
c. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.
d. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:  
Comment:  

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**  

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:  
Comment:  

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**  

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.
   b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation: 

   Comment: 

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).
   b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation: 

   Comment: 

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
32. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

33. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?

   a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year.
   b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded.
   c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented.
   d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<p>| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>34.</strong> In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Before BY-3.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Citation:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<p>| <strong>Comprehensiveness</strong> |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |
|   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |
| <strong>35.</strong> Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds? |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |
| a. Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |
| b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded. |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |
| c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |
| d. No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented. |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |
| <strong>Citation:</strong> |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |
| <strong>Comment:</strong> |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |
| <strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong> |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |
| <strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong> |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>36.</th>
<th>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>37.</th>
<th>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>38.</th>
<th>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>39.</th>
<th>Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on financial assets is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Answer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Answer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>41. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?

   a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: 

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

|  | d |

43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?

   a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: 

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<p>|  | d |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>44.</th>
<th>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>45.</th>
<th>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?

- a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually.
- b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually.
- c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually.
- d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?

- a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
- b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
- c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
- d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>The Budget Narrative &amp; Performance Monitoring</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>48.</strong> Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

| **49.** Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)? |
| a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. |
| b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded. |
| c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. |
| d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?

   a. Non-financial data are presented for all programs.
   b. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure.
   d. No non-financial data are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: 

Comment: 

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?

   a. The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance.
   b. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance.
   c. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance.
   d. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: 

Comment: 

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
52. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?

   a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs.
   b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No performance indicators are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>d</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?

   a. All performance indicators are well designed.
   b. Most performance indicators are well designed.
   c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not.
   d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>d</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation?

- a. All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
- b. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
- c. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not.
- d. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

55. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?

- a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

---

**Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring**

*Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive’s budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.*
56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources, including commercial projects involving the private sector?

a. Yes, extensive information on tax rates, fees, royalties and other revenue sources is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, information is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
www.minfin.gov.ao/docs/dspPetrolDiamond.htm
www.minfin.gov.ao/fsys/sintese_Tributárias_Angolano.pdf

Comment:
The executive makes available to the public the total amount of the oil profit from exportation and the total amount from the production of each project. However, signing bonuses, fees and royalties from the commercial projects including private sector are not available to the public. Moreover, the framework law about oil industry does not allow commercial and private companies (including multinationals companies) to publish what they pay to the government and what they produce (Law Nº 10/04, article 77º and the Directive from the Ministry of oil Nº 385/06 of 16th August 2006)

Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” The information on the MinFin website on oil and diamond tax revenues is highly detailed and covers more than 80% of Angola’s fiscal revenues. Information is also available in the 2007 (and 2008) budget on significant revenues from bonus and concessions (Bonificações E Prémios Do Petroleo and Rendimentos Das Concessões De Petroleo, in RESUMO DA

Researcher Response: I choose to keep my answer “c” because while there is information regarding the tax rates and the fees, it is not clear in the budget how these revenues will be implemented.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.
57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?

   a. Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?

   a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macroeconomic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.
   b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Comment:

Researcher's Response to this Question was "d."

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment: Angola does not receive assistance from the IMF and only project assistance from the World Bank (i.e. no Country Assistance Strategy). A more appropriate response would therefore be “e.” The government did withhold an IMF sponsored ROSC but it is not related to assistance and priority actions are published in the Article IV staff report for 2007 p. 20.

Researcher Response: I choose to keep my answer “d” because the World Bank does indeed give project assistance which in our comprehension is still applicable as assistance, but the conditions of this assistance are not readily made available.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries, in accordance with the methodology of the Open Budget Initiative.
59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?

   a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.
   b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Relatório de fundamentação 2007, page 6, table 3 , 1.1.3 doações

Comment:
After the end of the armed conflict donor countries have generally reduced their donations to Angola as the assessment is that Angola has enough revenues to finance its development. Some donor countries still have small projects without structural conditionalties with different ministries but no detailed and coherent information is available to the public. The Budget Report 2007, for the the revised budget, page 6 shows the amount received in donations: 7.983.617.315,00 Kwanzas (Aprox. $100 millions).

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

---

60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?

   a. Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative.
   b. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative.
   c. Yes, but the summary is not very informative.
   d. No, it does not provide a summary.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
61. Does the executive publish a “citizens budget” or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?

   a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative.
   b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative.
   c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative.
   d. No, it does not publish a citizens budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Ministry of Finance, Director of documentation and imformation department, Interview, June 13th 2007

Comment:
The government publishes 9000 brochures with a simplified summary of the budget. These are distributed as a supplement in the national newspaper. However, this is a very limited amount as Angola has a population of more than twelve million. Moreover, it is not translated into any of the 7 most spoken national languages which excludes a large part of the population from information about the budget.

Researcher’s Response to this Question was "c."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “d” this brochure of almost 4 pages used to be a summary and published in the Jornal de Angola after the budget is approved by the parliament. As we know the Jornal de Angola is not affordable to everyone. Its price in the informal market is 2 $, the equivalent of the daily revenue of majority of Angolan. Yet its distribution to provinces is limited and delayed.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: The brochure is moreover very glossy and not very educational. Recent estimates of the Angolan population puts it above 16 million.

Researcher Response: I choose to keep my answer “c” because, according to the Ministry of Finance, this is indeed a ‘citizen’s budget,’ even if we do not find it particularly informative.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>62.</th>
<th>Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
|     | a. Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided.  
|     | b. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded.  
|     | c. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details.  
|     | d. No, definitions are not provided.  
|     | e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
63. Do citizens have the right in law to access government information, including budget information?

a. Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
b. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
c. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information.
d. No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: Articles 7th, 8th, 9th, and 10th, Decree n° 16-A/95 of 15 December, about Administrative Proceeding.

Comment: The Decree-Law above cited regulates the relationship between public administration and citizens. The document statements include the citizens' right to access government information in general. Being the executive budget document part of the public administration, the articles statements above written protect the citizens' right to access to budget information as well. Since the Angolan Constitution and the basic law on budget (Lei N° 9/97 of October 17) are not explicit in their statements about the public information as a citizen right, we have considered, this year, to choose b. as a suitable answer to the question.

Researcher's Response to this Question was "b."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” The frequency to get public information from a public service is less than the facility to get it. I refer particularly on the law and the decree banning and prohibiting oil companies to publish their data. Oil revenues is the biggest sources of revenue of the country.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: Researcher Response: I choose to keep my answer “b” because in our experience, it is only a few times in which the information is not available. We were able to receive information from the Ministry of Finance documentation center and from the National Assembly. However, we acknowledge that asking for information is not something that Angolans are used to do, and that governmental institutions are only beginning to be accustomed to respond to requests. Furthermore, the question does not specify how much information, or what information, to which the reviewer refers, just if the right exists in the law.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “c.”
64. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?

   a. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.
   b. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Programa Geral do Governo para o Biénio 2007-2008
The Programa de Investimento Publico

Comment:

Researchers Response to this Question was "d."

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: I am surprised that this should not be the case for the Programa Geral do Governo para o Biénio 2007-2008 which is quoted as a supporting budget document. I am unable to verify this, as not on the internet. The Programa de Investimento Publico which is part of the package of budget documents released contains this kind of information

Researcher Response: I suggest the answer should be changed to “c,” as it is true that these two documents mentioned by the reviewer present disaggregated information and the PIP is available on the internet and the Programa Geral do Governo para o Bieno 2007-08 is available upon request from the Ministry of Finance, and is also on the website of the Ministerio do Planeamento.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.
65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?

   a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.
   b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
Section Three: The Budget Process
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Budget Process</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Formulation of the Budget</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>66. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The release date is set in permanent law.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td>Lei Quadro do OGE, 9/97 de 17 de Outubro (October 17), Articles 19th and 20th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td>The Law Nº 9/97 of 17 October establishes deadlines: up to 30th of September the Ministry of Finance has to submit the budget proposal to the Council of Ministers and up to 31st October the budget proposal has to be submitted to the National Assembly and to be enacted up to 15th December. But these deadlines are sometimes overlooked and the executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
67. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for preparation of the executive’s budget proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the ministry of finance or what ever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget’s formulation)?

a. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public.
b. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details.
d. No, a timetable is not issued to the public.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Ministerio das Finanças, Manual de Elaboração da Proposta Orçamental, 2006
Lei no 9/97 de 17 de Outubro

Comment:
The Manual for the budget proposal elaboration presents a detailed timetable for the preparation and the release of the budget. This manual was available on the internet for the budget process of 2006, but the researchers did not locate one for 2007, and the 2006 Manual is no longer posted on the Internet. We have as yet been unable to verify if they used the 2006 Manual for 2007. The Legal framework, (Lei no 9/97 de 17 de Outubro) however, does present certain deadlines, but not detailed ones.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

c

68. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?

a. The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable.
b. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable.
c. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable.
d. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
For example, this year the budget proposal was submitted the Council of Ministers on 26th October. But the timetable shows that the budget proposal should be handed to Council until 30th September (Lei Quadro do OGE, 9/97 de 17 de Outubro, Articles 19th and 20th). According to the Ministry of Finance, Director of documentation and information department, Interview, June 13th 2007, the executive has difficulty to adhere to its timetable due to the macro-economic changes of our economy that most of the time it leads the government to revise the budget. Therefore, the budget revision may change the course of the government’s program.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
69. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?

   a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators.
   b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded.
   c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature.
   d. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Ministry of Finance, Director of documentation and information department, Interview, June 13th 2007.

   Comment:
   The priorities are determined by the government under its programme approved by the council of ministers. The National Assembly are allowed to change the budget proposal according to the government program, which was approved by the National Assembly. This has been confirmed at the interview with MP member, Mr. Moises Chingongo, 5th Commission of the National Assembly secretary, from the ruling party, on 24th January 2008.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

70. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?

   a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies.
   b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded.
   c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies.
   d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Citation:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
### 71. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>The executive does not release a pre-budget statement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

### 72. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?

a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

### Legislative Approval of the Budget

74. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?

a. The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year.
b. The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year.
c. The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year.
d. The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
The legislature received the 2007 budget two months before the start of the budget year. The information is no longer on the internet.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
75. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?

- Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies.
- Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies.
- Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard.
- No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard.
- Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**
Interview with MP member, Mr. Moises Chingongo, 5th Commission of the National Assembly secretary, from the ruling party, on 24th January 2008.

**Comment:**
According to the first interview, All government's institutions are heard and some civil society’s organizations are heard before the budget proposal is approved., but the second interview states the public or civil society are never invited to give testimony.

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "b."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” On one hand Mr. Moises Chingongo’s answer may have been made to defend its position as member of parliament and probably he belongs to the ruling party. On the other hand is that what we used to see I think is not what he said. I never heard and seen a legislative committee inviting the public (even journalists or civil society) to make testimony on the budget. But they used to invite government members (Ministers) to explain their budget proposals, beyond this like Members of states companies I never seen and heard. The answer d of 78 is a proof of that.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Only one source – from the ruling party – is not enough to conclude that this happens. If any civil society organizations are heard – which I strongly doubt – it would be only “selected” government friendly organizations like the old one-party mass organizations.

**Researcher Response:** I agree the answer should be changed to “c.” Our own experience validates that of the second interview as we know of no civil society organization that has been invited to give testimony.
76. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?

    a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
    b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
    c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
    d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
    e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
- Interview with MP member, Mr. Moises Chingongo, 5th Commission of the National Assembly secretary, from the ruling party, on 24th January 2008.

Comment:

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "b."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Idem

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** Lamentable that this is based on one source alone – if problems were experienced with getting interviews with opposition MP’s this should be documented.

**Researcher Response:** I agree the answer should be changed to “c”: IBID
77. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?

a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.
b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard.
c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard.
d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Ibid

Comment:
“We need people to be involved on the budget preparation end execution process.”
But, few individuals are used to” (the MP member’s comment)

Researcher's response was "b."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” Ibidem

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” The quote suggests that this does not happen (!?). Also to my knowledge this has never happened although there is a myth that it does – again if it does it is only with a few handpicked organizations and not representative for civil society in any way? Has the Comissão Episcopal de Justiça e Paz ever been invited to a public hearing?

Researcher Response: I agree the answer should be changed to “d”: IBID

d

78. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?

a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings.
b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative.
d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
- Interview with MP member, Mr. Moises Chingongo, 5th Commission of the National Assembly secretary, from the ruling party, on 24th January 2008.)

Comment:
The committees do not release reports, but they hold public hearings

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

d
79. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature) given full information for the budget year on the spending of all secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?

a. Yes, the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items, which includes detailed, line item descriptions of all expenditures.

b. No, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded, or some categories are presented in an aggregated manner, or the legislature is provided no information on secret items.

c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**
- Interview with MP member, Mr. Moises Chingongo, 5th Commission of the National Assembly secretary, from the ruling party, on 24th January 2008.)

**Comment:**
According to the first interview, extensive information is given to National Assembly members, but the second interviewee says that the National Assembly only orally hears a report on security and or secret issues and that this report is not very detailed.

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "a."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” Ibidem

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** The credibility of this response is strongly undermined being referenced only to a member of the ruling party... (See additional comments below).
It seems that only one MP has been interviewed for the survey which is highly unfortunate and undermines the credibility of the responses. Not least because it is a representative of the MPLA, the government party, which holds a majority in the Parliament and ensures that this body functions as really nothing but a rubberstamp for the executive in budget and other legislative matters. It seems unlikely that no opposition MPs should have been interested in making themselves available for the interviews and if that is the case it should definitely be documented.

**Researcher Response:** I agree to change my answer to “b” because the second interview and the peer reviewer comments provided sufficient information to change.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
<th>Citation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>80. Does the legislature have authority <em>in law</em> to amend the budget presented by the executive?</td>
<td>a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority <em>in law</em> to amend the budget.</td>
<td>Lei nº 9/97, de 17 de outubro, Art. 20 nº 3 and 21º nº 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Yes, the legislature has authority <em>in law</em> to amend the budget, with some limitations.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Yes, the legislature has authority <em>in law</em> to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No, the legislature does not have any authority <em>in law</em> to amend the budget.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
<td>The framework law provides absolute authority to Nacional Assembly to amend the budget. In practice, it seems unreal since the ruling party holds an absolute majority. Therefore, any opposition’s action to amend the budget is mostly voted against by the majority.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>81. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?</td>
<td>a. The approved budget includes program-level detail.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. The approved budget includes only departmental totals.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td></td>
<td>Lei do Orçamento Geral do Estado para 2007 /Lei nº 13/06 de 29 de Dezembro. <a href="http://www.minfin.gv.ao/exerc%C3%ADcio2007">www.minfin.gv.ao/exercício2007</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td>For capital expenditures the budget includes an amazing level of detail (project level) as a sign of the high level of centralization (see DEMONSTRATIVO DO P.I.P. POR FONTES DE FINANCIAMENTO).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Executive’s Implementation of the Budget

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>82. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**
Decreto 98/06, 29 de Dezembro, Chapter V, article 8° and the Lei nº 9/97 de 17 de Outubro, article 58° nº 1-7

**Comment:**
The legal framework presents the timetable for the reports submissions. But these reports are for internal purpose and not made available to the public.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>83. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No in-year reports are released to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**
Ibid

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
### 84. What is the most detail provided in the in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit?

- a. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain program-level detail.
- b. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).
- c. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain only departmental totals.
- d. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not released to the public, not produced, or contain less information than departmental totals.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**
Ibid

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

### 85. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

- a. Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures.
- b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.
- c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**
Ibid

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
86. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?

| a. | In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month. |
| b. | In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter. |
| c. | In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually. |
| d. | In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released. |
| e. | Not applicable/other (please comment). |

**Citation and/or comment:**
Ibid

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

87. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?

| a. | In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue. |
| b. | In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue. |
| c. | In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources. |
| d. | In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public. |
| e. | Not applicable/other (please comment). |

**Citation:**
Ibid

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
88. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

   a. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources.
   b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources.
   c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources.
   d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: 
Ibid

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

---

89. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?

   a. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month.
   b. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter.
   c. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually.
   d. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: 
Ibid

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

---
90. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?

   a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.
   b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Ibid

   Comment:
   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**
   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

   91. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?

   a. Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period.
   b. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period.
   c. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period.
   d. In-year reports are not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Ibid

   Comment:
   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**
   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
92. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?

   a. Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget.
   b. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details.
   c. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
The revised law is on the following website: 
http://www.minfin.gov.ao/docs/dspOrcaPass.htm
However, on the internet index the title is not listed as “Lei de Revisao” but merely “Lei do Orcamento Geral do Estado.” However, the link does open up the revised law. The “Relatorio de fundamentacao OGE Revisto,” which goes into more detail, is not on the website but can be found on a CD that is only available upon request.

Comment:
The government has been making annual revisions since 2002. These revisions are not the same as a mid-year review because they are based on macroeconomic indicator changes and the government does not make any detailed information on budget execution available to the public such as in year reports etc. The "Lei de Revisao do Orçamento Geral do Estado" is a kind of a new budget replacing the previous one.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation: Ibid

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

94. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation: Ibid

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
95. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?

   a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.
   b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
   c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
   d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: 
Ibid

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>96. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain minimal level specified in law or regulation)?</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, the executive gives prior notification to the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature, or the amount allowed under the law or by regulation is significantly large enough to undermine public scrutiny and accountability (please describe arrangements below).</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation: 
Diario da República nº 157, I Série, capito I Constituição do Orçamento, Lei nº 13/06 de 29 de Dezembro, Artigo 8º

Comment:
The initiative to make any change rests with the executive and shifting funds is done by the ministry of finance with the council of the ministers mandate.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
97. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?

a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year.
b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities.
c. The procurement of goods and services followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities.
d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
We do not have information about such instances (which is not to say that such instances do not occur) and in the current political climate it can be dangerous to raise this kind of questions…

Researcher's Response to this Question was "e."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” I refer on the recommendation from the guide.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Researcher Response: I choose to keep my answer “e” because we were unable to obtain any information regarding the procurement process. In 2006 we asked this question in the interview with the National Assembly member, but due to the current political climate, we abstained from posing this question in the interview with the National Assembly member. We did not find any written records of procurement processes, as this is not usually made public.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “d” based on Peer Reviewer One’s Comment.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>98. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**
See question 93

**Comment:**
As for 2005, we consider the revised budgets as supplementary budgets. The executive has continued systematically to present revised budgets around July - August which are submitted to and approved by the government majority in parliament.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
99. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?

   a. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget.
   b. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget.
   c. Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget.
   d. Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**
Lei nº 13/06 Lei do Orçamento Geral do Estado 2007 e o OGE Revisto 2007

**Comment:**
The original budget for 2007 holds the amount of KZ 2,503,887,060,119.00 and the revised has KZ 2,278,299,037,904.00. As such the total value of the revised budget was actually 9% less that the original budget for 2007.

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** Can it be considered a supplemental budget in this case? The whole discussion of the classification of the Angolan government’s revised budgets is complicated. Surely it is not a review as indicated above but it might also not be accurate to classify it as a supplemental budget. Please note that for 2008 the MinFin has changed its language and now call it a “budget adjustment”[http://www.minfin.gv.ao/oldnews/oldnews_133.htm](http://www.minfin.gv.ao/oldnews/oldnews_133.htm) which actually would mean an improved practice as it would mean that they are asking parliament to endorse shifting funds. Whether this is indeed the case would require an in-depth analysis and no information is available on the internet about the 2007 revision referred to in this survey.

**IBP Comment:** Editors chose answer “c” based on the intention of the question, which is intended as one indicator to capture the credibility of the government’s annual budget proposal. The dramatic under spending described above suggests that the annual budget proposal that is presented to parliament is not realistic.
100. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?

   a. Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget.
   b. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year.
   c. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget.
   d. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Lei nº 13/06 Lei do Orçamento Geral do Estado 2007 e o OGE Revisto 2007

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “e.” To my knowledge there are no contingency funds in the Angolan budget.

Researcher Response: We know that the government spends money for contingency purposes, such as natural disasters, but the budget does not made a provision for such funds.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Executive’s Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>101.</strong> How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report that discusses the budget’s actual outcome for the year?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The report is released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The report is released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The executive does not release a year-end report.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Citation:</strong> <a href="http://www.minfin.gv.ao/docs/dspRelExecOGE.htm">http://www.minfin.gv.ao/docs/dspRelExecOGE.htm</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **102.** In the year-end report have the data on the actual outcomes been audited? |
| a. Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited. |
| b. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. |
| c. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. |
| d. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |
| **Citation:** http://www.minfin.gv.ao/docs/dspRelExecOGE.htm |
| **Comment:** The year end report is released to the public but none of the data on actual outcomes has been audited. |
| **Peer Reviewer One Comment:** |
| **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** |
| d |
103. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?

a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
http://www.minfin.gv.ao/docs/dspRelExecOGE.htm

Comment:

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "a."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Most times the report has never been discussed in parliament. It used to be a unilateral and lack report posted by the finance ministry in the internet.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Whereas the year-end report is of a quite good quality overall, it omits one very significant issue: the institutionalized mid-year budget revision (see question 99), which is not referred to neither in a narrative way nor quantitatively. It is therefore implicitly assumed that the analysis of the differences is based on the revised budget figures.

**Researcher Response:** I think the answer should be changed to “b” because while there is a lack of analysis regarding the budget revision in the end-year report, and it is based on the budget revision rather than the original budget, this is not such a significant detail to omit, because the government has already release an analytical report regarding the budget revision, “Relatorio de Fundamentacao.”

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.
104. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report?

a. The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level.
b. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases).
c. The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals).
d. No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Ibid

Comment:

Researcher's Response to this Question was "a."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” Idem

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Researcher Response: I choose to keep my answer “a” because while it may be true that there is a lack of discussion regarding the report, we feel that the question refers to the level of detail offered in the report, not the kind of discussion it receives.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.
105. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?

a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Ibid

Comment:
The differences are presented for the revenues as well.

Researcher's Response to this Question was "b."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Ibidem.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” See comment to question 103.

Researcher Response: I choose to keep my answer “b”: see comment to question 103.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.
106. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

- a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**
Ibid

**Comment:**

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "b."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Ibidem.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” The year-end report presents the macroeconomic context but not an analysis of the difference between the original, revised and real macroeconomic context. This is a key issue as it is the macroeconomic context (mainly higher oil prices) that has led the government to ask the legislature to enact revised budgets over the past years.

**Researcher Response:** I choose to keep my answer “b” because while we acknowledge that the analysis of the macroeconomic context is weak, the report does mention the difference in the projections and the year-end actuals, such as for the oil price and inflation. So key differences are highlighted, but details are missing.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.
107. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Ibid

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>108. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:
Ibid

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
109. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Ibid

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

110. Does the year-end report present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Lei nº 9/97 de 17 de Outubro, Article 3º

Comment:
The Framework law does not allow extra-budgetary funds

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** There is some discussion on “extra-budgetary funds” on page 23 of the year-end report but seemingly this is not matched by figures in the appendixes which mean that the response should remain “d.”
111. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?

   a. Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.
   b. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.
   c. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year.
   d. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Ibid

   Comment:
   Audit reports are not available to the public. It has been confirmed by the World Bank, African Region 2005. Angola: Revisão da Gestão das despesas Públicas e Responsabilização Financeira, February 16, 2005 p. 55.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** The most recent IMF Article IV staff report moreover indicates that the year-end budget execution report has been submitted to the Court of Accounts (Tribunal de Contas) but classifies progress as “moderate.” IMF (2007): Angola Article IV Consultation—Staff Report; p. 21

112. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of annual expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the report(s) released to the public?

   a. All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public.
   b. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited.
   c. Expenditure representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited.
   d. No expenditures have been audited, the reports have not been released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Ibid

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
113. Does the annual audit report(s) that is released to the public include an executive summary?

a. The annual audit report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report’s content.
b. No, the audit report(s) does not include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Ibid

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:  

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:  

114. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?

a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed.
b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Lei nº 5/96, de 12 de Abril, article 20

Comment:
The head of the Supreme Audit Institution is nominated and appointed by the President of the Republic following proposals from the National Assembly. The law does not stipulate the terms for removal from office. In practice, the executive can remove the head of SAI without consent of the judiciary or legislature.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:  

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:  

b
115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?

| a. Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds. |
| b. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds. |
| c. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds. |
| d. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds, or such a report was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

**Citation:**
Ibid

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

116. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have the discretion in law to undertake those audits it may wish to?

| a. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. |
| b. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations. |
| c. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations. |
| d. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

**Citation:**
Lei nº 5/96, de 12 de Abril, article 2 nº 3

**Comment:**
In practice, the SAI does not play its main role because it never put into public any audit report since it was founded.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>117. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**
Lei nº 5/96, de 12 de Abril, article 33º

**Comment:**
From the framework law the SAI budget is determined by the executive.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>118. Does the Supreme Audit Institution employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector (military, police, intelligence services)?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. The SAI employs designated staff, and the staffing levels are broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels are a cause of some constraints to the SAI in fulfilling its mandate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels pose a significant constraint on the SAI in fulfilling its mandate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of the security sector, or does not undertake audits of the security sector.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
119. Does the Supreme Audit Institution maintain formal mechanisms of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program (that is, to identify the agencies, programs, or projects it will audit)?

   a. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received more than 100 communications from the public during the past year.
   b. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received less than 100 but more than ten communications from the public during the past year.
   c. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public but it receives very little (less than ten) or no information from the public on potential subjects for audit.
   d. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public.
   e. Not applicable.

   Citation:  
   Comment:  

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**  
   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

120. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?

   a. Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized.
   b. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized.
   c. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized.
   d. No, audit reports are not scrutinized.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:  
   Comment:  

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**  
   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

---

82
121. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?

- a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.
- b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings.
- c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings.
- d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
cf. question 111

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

| d |

122. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?

- a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations.
- b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify).
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
cf. 111

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

| d |
123. Are audit reports of the annual accounts of the security sector (military, police, intelligence services) and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?

   a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to the security sector and other secret programs.
   b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details.
   d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify).
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
cf. 111

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
Additional Comments:

Please use this section to add any additional comments.

Peer Reviewer One Additional Comments:
It is some recession in the opening budget comparatively in the last two years. In fact, while it was very easy to access the finance ministry web site and to get budget information, last year (2007) it was very difficult. Several times I tried personally to get information, while the title in the link was showing a budget item in practice (beyond) the link was inaccessible and with details like in 2006. This year only the summaries are posted in the internet, there are no details. My comments (concern) raised in 2006 remain unchangeable and seems to worsen, the UN development index state that almost only 11 Angolans have access to the internet on 1000 Angolans. 6 years ago, we have seen news of from the finance ministry web site, indicating that the budget law and process was under reform with time table, but now we don’t where about the process. We regret also that the majority of our parliamentarians like civil society don’t have a specific training on budget analysis. How can we trust 100 % on their decisions regarding the budget? (IDASA: Oil and governance report, a case study of Chad, Angola, Gabon and Sao Tome é Principe p.17-29) or [http://www.idasa.org.za/Output_Details.asp?RID=1401&oplang=en&OTID=2&PID=9](http://www.idasa.org.za/Output_Details.asp?RID=1401&oplang=en&OTID=2&PID=9);

Comment of 2006:
"Responding to your second preoccupation on budget availability to the population: the population of Angola is estimated at 15,000,000.00 peoples of them adult literacy rate is 66.8 % (% ages 15 and above). I mean that 33.2 % don’t speak Portuguese or don’t understand it properly. Official medias, used to broadcast with 10 national languages for about 2 hours/ a day: Kikongo, Fiote, Kimbundu, Umbundu, Ngangela, Tchokwe, Kwanhama, Cokwe, …it should be better for Government to Explain the Budget with these languages but why not also in Lingala (a language from Democratic Republic of Congo, used by lot of returnees/former refugees from Congos) Yet, nevertheless Official medias doesn’t reach 100 % of people in the Country (statistics aren’t available most of rural peoples don’t benefit), government didn’t yet authorize private radios to broadcast in the entire Country. Private televisions doesn’t exists (aren’t authorized yet).”