International Budget Partnership
OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE

CHAD

September 28, 2007

International Budget Partnership
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street, NE
Suite 510
Washington, DC  20002
www.internationalbudget.org
www.openbudgetindex.org
This questionnaire was completed by:

Name: DOUDJIDINGAO Antoine et MAOUNDONODJI Gilbert
Organization: GRAMP-TC
Address: BP:4021, N'Djaména (TCHAD)
Telephone: (+235)623-17-11/629-34-18/2-51-52-22/2-51-95-55
E-mail: doudjianoine@yahoo.fr/gramtc@intnet.td/gilmagil66@yahoo.ca
Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents

Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal

Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year
Comprehensiveness
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring

Section Three: The Budget Process

Executive’s Formulation of the Budget
Legislative Approval of the Budget
Executive’s Implementation of the Budget
Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution
Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

*Please indicate the budget year of the document used to complete the questionnaire. If the document is not available to the public, please state, “Not Available.”*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire</th>
<th>Budget Year Used</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Budget Statement</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Summary</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Budget Documents</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enacted Budget</td>
<td>2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Year Reports</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Year Report</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year-End Report</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audit Report</td>
<td>2007</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links

*Please provide the full title, date and Internet link for all documents to be cited in Sections 2 & 3.*

*If an Internet link is not available for the document, please indicate one of these three answers: “Not Produced,” “Produced but Not Available to the Public,” “Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet.”*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Document</th>
<th>Full Title, Date, and Internet Link</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Budget Statement</td>
<td>Produced but not available to public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Summary</td>
<td>Not produced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
<td>Produced but not available to public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Document One in Support of the Executive’s</td>
<td>Produced but not available to public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Proposal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Document Two in Support of the Executive’s</td>
<td>Produced but not available to public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Proposal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Document Three in Support of the Executive’s</td>
<td>Produced but not available to public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Proposal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
<td>Not produced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enacted Budget</td>
<td>Budget Générale de l'Etat Gestion 2007 (Recettes et dépenses rectifiées).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The link is: <a href="http://www.dgitchad.org/legislation">http://www.dgitchad.org/legislation</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Year Reports</td>
<td>Not produced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Year Review</td>
<td>Not produced</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
No Internet Link. |
|----------------|---------------------------------------------------------------|
| Audit Report   | Audit des marchés publics de l'année budgétaire 2005  
No internet link. |
| Other Documents| Compte Spéciaux des Revenus Pétroliers (Oil Incomes  
Special Accounts), see the following link:  
http://www.ccsrp.org  
| Relevant Ministries & Departments | Plan de passation des marchés publics (Public markets transfer plan),  
Available to the public by request 2007.  
No Internet link. |
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For the following reports, place “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Executive’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Pre-budget</th>
<th>Main document</th>
<th>Budget summary*</th>
<th>Supporting Document 1</th>
<th>Supporting Document 2</th>
<th>Citizens budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Not produced, even for internal purposes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Executive’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Pre-budget</th>
<th>Main document</th>
<th>Budget summary*</th>
<th>Supporting Document 1</th>
<th>Supporting Document 2</th>
<th>Citizens budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The release date is known at least one month in advance</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Released to public same day as official release to media</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Available on the Internet free of charge</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Free print copies available, limited distribution</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Free print copies available, mass distribution</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities*</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Written in more than one language</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. News conference is held to discuss release</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

*Mark “Yes” if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.
### Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

**DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS**

For the following reports, place a “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:

| A. Not produced, even for internal purposes | Enacted budget | In-year reports | Mid-year review | Year-end report | Audit report |
| B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public | | | | | |
| C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request | Yes | | Yes | Yes |
| D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.) | | | | |

For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.

| 1. The release date is known at least one month in advance | Enacted budget | In-year reports | Mid-year review | Year-end report | Audit report |
| 2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media | No | NA | NA | No | No |
| 3. Released to public same day as official release to media | Yes | NA | NA | No | Yes |
| 4. Available on the Internet free of charge | Yes | NA | NA | No | No |
| 5. Free print copies available, limited distribution | Yes | NA | NA | Yes | Yes |
| 6. Free print copies available, mass distribution | No | NA | NA | No | No |
| 7. Readily available outside capital/big cities* | No | NA | NA | No | No |
| 8. Written in more than one language | No | NA | NA | No | No |
| 9. News conference is held to discuss release | No | NA | NA | No | No |

*Mark “Yes” if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:
BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)
BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year
BY-1 = one year before the budget year

Please mark your answer by placing the appropriate letter in the box to the right of the question. For all answers marked “not applicable/other,” please provide a brief explanation indicating either why the answer choices provided are not applicable or why another response would be more appropriate.
# The Executive’s Budget Proposal

## Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond

1. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?

   a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit.
   b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately.
   c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.
   d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**
   No information is available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

2. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?

   a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
   b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
   c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function.
   d. No expenditures classified by function are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**
   No information is available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document. Even if the information is not available to the public, the expenses adopt a functional nomenclature.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
3. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?

   a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
   b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
   c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification.
   d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   No information is available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document. There is no economical classification of the expenses in Chad’s budget.

4. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?

   a. Program-level data are presented for all expenditures.
   b. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No program-level data are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   No information is available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document.

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
5. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.
   b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**
   No information is available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

6. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).
   b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.
   c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.
   d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**
   No information is available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
## 7. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?

- **a.** All sources of tax revenue are identified individually.
- **b.** Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually.
- **c.** Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually.
- **d.** No sources of tax revenue are identified individually.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
No information is available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document. Although the information is not available prior to the legislature’s approval, the State Budget Execution Report identifies the different tax sources as the oil tax system, the firm benefits tax, the income tax, the cattle tax, etc.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

## 8. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?

- **a.** All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually.
- **b.** Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually.
- **c.** Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually.
- **d.** No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
No information is available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document. Although the information is not available prior to the legislature’s approval, the State Budget Execution Report identifies the sources of non tax incomes as the oil resources.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
<th>Citation</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 9 | In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)? | a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.  
b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.  
c. Not applicable/other (please comment). |                               | No information is available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|   | **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**                                                                                                               |                                                                        |                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|   | **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**                                                                                                               |                                                                        |                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| 10| In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)? | a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).  
b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.  
c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.  
d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.  
e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
11. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?

   a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget).
   b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year.
   c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year.
   d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   No information is available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document. But the State Budget Execution Report identifies the domestic and external debt level of the country.

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

<p>| |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

12. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

   a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented.
   b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   No information is available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document. However, the State Budget Execution Report identifies the Chad’s debt level (domestic and external)

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

<p>| |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
13. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?
   a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.
   b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   No information is available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document. But the State Budget Execution Report identifies the domestic and external debt level of the country.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

14. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?
   a. Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly.
   b. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   No information is available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document. But the State Budget Execution Report identifies the budget year inflation rate, the GDB growing rate with and without oil, the tax pressure rate with and without oil.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   No information is available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document.
   But the State Budget Execution Report identifies the budget year inflation rate, the GDB growing rate with and without oil, the tax pressure rate with and without oil, etc.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

| 16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures? |
|---|---|
| a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. |
| b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded. |
| c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. |
| d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

   Citation:

   Comment:
   Information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented prior to the legislature’s approval of the document.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented prior to the legislature’s approval of the document.

The State Budget Execution Report indicates the budget year inflation rate, the GDB growing rate with and without oil, the tax pressure rate with and without oil, etc., which do have an impact on the annual incomes level.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No estimates are available to the public for years prior to the Budget year.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>19.</th>
<th>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td>No estimates are available to the public for years prior to the Budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>20.</th>
<th>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td>No estimates are available to the public for years prior to the Budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
21. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

a. Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1.
b. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1.
c. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1.
d. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: 
Comment: No estimates are available to the public for years prior to the Budget year.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**
**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

22. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?

a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure.
b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure.
c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure.
d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Comment: No estimates are available to the public for years prior to the Budget year.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**
**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
23. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.
   b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Comment: No estimates are available to the public for years prior to the Budget year.

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:
   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

24. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).
   b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.
   c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.
   d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Comment: No estimates are available to the public for years prior to the Budget year.

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:
   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Answer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Before BY-3.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: No estimates are available to the public for years prior to the Budget year.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Answer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: No estimates are available to the public for years prior to the Budget year.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
27. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   b. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.
   c. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.
   d. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   No estimates are available to the public for years prior to the Budget year.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   b. Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.
   c. Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.
   d. No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   No supporting budget documents on non-tax-revenue are known prior to the Parliament's approval of the budget document.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections.
   b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections.
   c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections.
   d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
This information is not available prior to the Parliament’s approval of the Budget.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>d</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.
   b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
This information is not available prior to the Parliament's approval of the Budget.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
<td>b</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).
   b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**
   This information is not available prior to the Parliament's approval of the Budget.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

32. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**
   This information is not available prior to the Parliament's approval of the Budget.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
33. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?

   a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year.
   b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded.
   c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented.
   d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: 

Comment: 
This information is not available prior to the Parliament's approval of the Budget.

Peer Reviewer One Comment: 

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: 

34. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: 

Comment: 
This information is not available prior to the Parliament's approval of the Budget.

Peer Reviewer One Comment: 

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: 
## Comprehensiveness

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Answer</th>
<th>Citation</th>
<th>Comment</th>
<th>Peer Reviewer One Comment</th>
<th>Peer Reviewer Two Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>35. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?</td>
<td>d</td>
<td></td>
<td>No details are available to the public because the executive budget proposal is not accessible to the public.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Answer</th>
<th>Citation</th>
<th>Comment</th>
<th>Peer Reviewer One Comment</th>
<th>Peer Reviewer Two Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>36. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?</td>
<td>d</td>
<td></td>
<td>Information on budget year intergovernmental transfers is not available prior to Parliament's approval of the executive budget.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. The executive’s budget proposal is not available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>38. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, the executive’s budget proposal is not available to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
39. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?

   a. Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on financial assets is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:  
Comment:  
No information on financial assets is presented or available to the public.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:  
Peer Reviewer Two Comment:  

40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?

   a. Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:  
Comment:  
This type of information is not available.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:  
Peer Reviewer Two Comment:  

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
41. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?

   a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
No, the executive’s budget proposal is not available to the public prior to the Parliament’s approval of the document.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?

   a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
No, the executive’s budget proposal is not available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?

a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
No, the executive’s budget proposal is not available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?

a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually.
c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
No, the executive’s budget proposal is not available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document. However, the State Budget Execution Report indicates the participation of the different donors such as the African Development Bank, the Monetary and Economic Commission of Central Africa (CEMAC), and the European Commission.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
45. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

No, the executive’s budget proposal is not available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document. The existing documents indicate very disorderly information.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

---

46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually.</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

No, the executive’s budget proposal is not available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

Although the information is not available to the public, the State Budget Execution Report indicates disorderly information.

**Researcher's Response:** I do not agree with this answer. It is about saying every earmarked revenues are identified by the budget documents, which is not the case in Chad.
47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?

a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
No, the executive’s budget proposal is not available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>d</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:  
No, the executive’s budget proposal is not available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document. The existing budget documents present non-exhaustive and disorderly information.  

Peer Reviewer One Comment:  
Peer Reviewer Two Comment:  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:  
No, the executive’s budget proposal is not available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document.  

Peer Reviewer One Comment:  
Peer Reviewer Two Comment:  

35
50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?
   
   a. Non-financial data are presented for all programs.
   b. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure.
   d. No non-financial data are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   No, the executive’s budget proposal is not available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?

   a. The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance.
   b. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance.
   c. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance.
   d. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   No, the executive’s budget proposal is not available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
52. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?

   a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs.
   b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No performance indicators are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:  
   Comment:  
   No, the executive’s budget proposal is not available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?

   a. All performance indicators are well designed.
   b. Most performance indicators are well designed.
   c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not.
   d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:  
   Comment:  
   No, the executive’s budget proposal is not available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation?

- a. All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
- b. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
- c. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not.
- d. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
No, the executive’s budget proposal is not available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document. But the budget execution reports presents disorderly information on a few performance indicators such as the budget deficit, the budget expenses execution rate, the debt recover rate, etc.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

55. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?

- a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
No, the executive’s budget proposal is not available to the public prior to the legislature’s approval of the document.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

---

**Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring**

*Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive’s budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.*
56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources, including commercial projects involving the private sector?

   a. Yes, extensive information on tax rates, fees, royalties and other revenues sources is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Par exemple, les informations sur les entreprises publiques ne sont pas présentées. Il en est de même pour les détails sur certains revenus des capitaux et de la propriété financière de l'Etat.
ENG: For example, the information on public enterprises is not presented. It is the same for details on certain capital revenues and financial proprieties of the State.

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” The Executive provides information through the joint department reports on the inland revenue report and the Treasury relating to the Business Tax Reform announced in the Budget 2007.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**Researcher Response:** I agree with Peer Reviewer One on answer “b.”

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, “b.”
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>a. Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</th>
<th>b. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded.</th>
<th>c. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details.</th>
<th>d. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented.</th>
<th>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</th>
<th>Citation</th>
<th>Comment: Nothing.</th>
<th>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</th>
<th>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?</td>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.</td>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td>d. No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented.</td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td>Comment: No explanation on financial assistance is available to the public. But budget supporting documents present few information on conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)</td>
<td>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</td>
<td>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?

   a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.
   b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
Such information is reported by the press and media but only partially: Only amounts and reimbursement period are known.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?

   a. Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative.
   b. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative.
   c. Yes, but the summary is not very informative.
   d. No, it does not provide a summary.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
There is no budget summary. However, the Executive transmits to the Legislature a short description of the budget, in order to facilitate the budget examination. It is not available to the public prior to the budget adoption.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
61. Does the executive publish a “citizens budget” or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?

   a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative.
   b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative.
   c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative.
   d. No, it does not publish a citizens budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   This document is not produced in Chad.

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?

   a. Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided.
   b. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, definitions are not provided.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   No glossary related to the budget documents.

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
63. Do citizens have the right *in law* to access government information, including budget information?

a. Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.

b. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.

c. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information.

d. No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
No law on access to information in Chad.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>64. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

Information on the priority areas programs which have received oil incomes: transfer plan of the priority areas markets, repartition of the schools and free clinics to build, the appointee firms, the market amounts, the goods and services acquired for the priority sectors, etc. All this information is reported by the control and oil incomes monitoring College (CCSRP) in the “Oil incomes special account.” But there are no details on the projects co-financed by the lenders in the priority sectors.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?

   a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.
   b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   Such information is not available to general public.

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
Section Three: The Budget Process
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Budget Process</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Formulation of the Budget</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>66. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The release date is set in permanent law.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Although the calendar is officially established, each year there in Chad are recurring delays in the budget process.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for preparation of the executive’s budget proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the ministry of finance or what ever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget’s formulation)?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, a timetable is not issued to the public.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is the case of the Framing Letter sent each year by the Prime Minister to the ministries to prepare their budgets. But it is not easy for the public to obtain a copy, even by request.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>68.</td>
<td>Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
The executive find it too difficult to respect its budget timetable.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>69.</th>
<th>Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
In the budget elaboration process, the legislature does not intervene.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>70. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</td>
<td>a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies.&lt;br&gt;b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded.&lt;br&gt;c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies.&lt;br&gt;d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process.&lt;br&gt;e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td><strong>d</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td>No, the Executive does not hold specific consultations during the phase of budget formulation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>71. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?</td>
<td>a. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year.&lt;br&gt;b. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year.&lt;br&gt;c. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year.&lt;br&gt;d. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement.&lt;br&gt;e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td><strong>d</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td>The pre-budget statement is not available to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
72. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   Such document is not available.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

| 73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget? |
|---|---|---|---|
|   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. |
|   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded. |
|   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. |
|   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. |
|   e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

   Citation:

   Comment:
   Such document is not available.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Legislative Approval of the Budget</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>74.</strong> How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Citation:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The legislature receives the budget less than three months before the beginning of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **75.** Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard? |
| a. Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies. |
| b. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies. |
| c. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard. |
| d. No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |
| **Citation:** |
| **Comment:** |
| During the public hearing, the public can witness but not participate. |
| **Peer Reviewer One Comment:** |
| **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** |
76. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?

   a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
   b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
   c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
   d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   Before the budget session, the legislature receives by turns the ministries to discuss about their budget project. But the public cannot witness these hearings.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

77. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?

   a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.
   b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard.
   c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard.
   d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   There are discussions behind closed doors in the Finance, Budget and Account National Commission but the public is not invited.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
78. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?

a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings.
b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative.
d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
The Finance, Budget and Account National Commission releases a report on the budget project submitted to an examination. And it is on this report that the plenary session of the legislature approves or not the Finance Law project. But details on the contents of the discussions are not considered

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

79. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature) given full information for the budget year on the spending of all secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?

a. Yes, the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items, which includes detailed, line item descriptions of all expenditures.
b. No, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded, or some categories are presented in an aggregated manner, or the legislature is provided no information on secret items.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
The secret funds of security and army are unknown by the public, even the legislature members. Despite the existence of the Chambers of Account and other institutions of public expenses monitoring, no amelioration has been shown on the expenses side.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
80. Does the legislature have authority *in law* to amend the budget presented by the executive?

a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority *in law* to amend the budget.
b. Yes, the legislature has authority *in law* to amend the budget, with some limitations.
c. Yes, the legislature has authority *in law* to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited.
d. No, the legislature does not have any authority *in law* to amend the budget.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
This authority is very limited by the article 51 of the constitution and the article 40 of the Finance Organic Law. The legislature proposals are not accepted when they entail either an increase in expense or a reduction of revenues.

Comment:
These articles really limit the legislature authority concerning the budget amending.

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.”
According to the Constitution, the legislature has the authority in-law to amend the budget. However, the authority is limited and has conditions. For example, any amendment leading to an increase of expenditure in the budget must be accompanied by a corresponding proposal for increasing revenue.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**Researcher Response:**
I agree with the comment and the suggestions of the first peer reviewer. This comment corresponds to the Chad legislature authority regarding the budget amending. In the new version of the Chad constitution, you cannot find the article 51 mentioned above anymore. Therefore, we can accept response “b.”

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, “b” based on the comment of the researcher.
81. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?

- a. The approved budget includes program-level detail.
- b. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).
- c. The approved budget includes only departmental totals.
- d. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Executive’s Implementation of the Budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>82. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

There is no in-year report on the budget in Chad.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**Researcher Response:**

I have chosen the “d” response because the quarterly reports are not detailed enough to be considered as “in-year reports” based on the OCDE Guide (PUMA/SBO(2000)6/FINAL).
83. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?

   a. Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures.
   b. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.
   c. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No in-year reports are released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:  
There is no in-year report on the budget in Chad.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: The quarterly reports indicate the evolution of all the State expenditures execution.

Researcher Response:  
I chose response “d” because the quarterly reports are not detailed enough to be considered as “in-year reports,” based on the OCDE Guide (PUMA/SBO(2000)6/FINAL).
84. What is the most detail provided in the in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by *administrative unit*?

   a. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain program-level detail.
   b. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).
   c. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain only departmental totals.
   d. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not released to the public, not produced, or contain less information than departmental totals.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**
   There is no in-year report on the budget in Chad.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** The quarterly reports indicate the evolution of all the State expenditures execution.

   **Researcher Response:**
   I chose response “d” because the quarterly reports are not detailed enough to be considered as “in-year reports” based on the OCDE guide (PUMA/SBO(2000)6/FINAL).

85. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

   a. Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures.
   b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.
   c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**
   There is no in-year report on the budget in Chad.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
86. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?

   a. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month.
   b. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter.
   c. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually.
   d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment: There is no in-year report on the budget in Chad.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

87. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?

   a. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue.
   b. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue.
   c. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources.
   d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   No report from the administrative units is released.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
88. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

   a. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources.
   b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources.
   c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources.
   d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation: 

   Comment: 
   No report from the administrative units is released.

   Peer Reviewer One Comment: 

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment: 

89. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?

   a. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month.
   b. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter.
   c. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually.
   d. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation: 

   Comment: 
   No report from the administrative units is released.

   Peer Reviewer One Comment: 

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Option</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>90. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released.</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No report from the administrative units is released.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 91. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)? | d            |
|   a. Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period. | d            |
|   b. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period. | d            |
|   c. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period. | d            |
|   d. In-year reports are not released.                                | d            |
|   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).                          | d            |
| Citation:                                                              |              |
| Comment:                                                               |              |
| There are no in-year reports.                                         |              |
| Peer Reviewer One Comment:                                            |              |
| Peer Reviewer Two Comment:                                            |              |
92. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?

a. Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget.
b. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details.
c. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details.
d. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Such document has things in common with the quarterly reports, which are generally available at the request of the interested person. This is the case of the second quarterly report 2007, which we had access to.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:
The quarterly report, which constitutes such a document, is released either before or after the supplemental budget (collectif budgétaire, also known as loi de finances rectificatives). Therefore, it does not often include the updated expenditures during the supplemental budget.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
94. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?

   a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures.
   b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).
   c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals).
   d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Comment:
   This report includes some details but it is not detailed enough.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

95. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?

   a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.
   b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
   c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
   d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
96. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain minimal level specified in law or regulation)?

a. Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units.
b. Yes, the executive gives prior notification to the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment.
c. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented.
d. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature, or the amount allowed under the law or by regulation is significantly large enough to undermine public scrutiny and accountability (please describe arrangements below).
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
This is the case of the decree 224 which shifted all investment and equipment funds of all the Ministries to the Infrastructure Ministry, without seeking legislative approval.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
97. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?

a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year.
b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities.
c. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities.
d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Comment: For example, we can note the case of the contracts granted to not very credible firms competing with other firms which competences are proven. It is the case of SATOM that won the construction bid of the road Moundou-Doba, against MOTA, a firm whose competences are proven.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

98. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?

a. Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify).
b. Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify).
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Comment: The government proposes regularly supplemental budget. But certain expenses are executed before the legislature approves them. However, the part of the expenses realized before the legislature approval is scarce.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
99. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?

   a. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget.
   b. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget.
   c. Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget.
   d. Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
The percentage varies every year. It can change from 5% to 15% or more.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

100. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?

   a. Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget.
   b. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year.
   c. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget.
   d. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
The chapter of the unexpected expenditure and of the common costs not allocated is planned according to Article 42 of the Finance Organic Law. These funds are adopted in the same time as the other expenses, as they are part of the year budget.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Executive’s Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>101. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report that discusses the budget’s actual outcome for the year?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The report is released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The report is released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The executive does not release a year-end report.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The State General Budget Execution Report – which serves as year-end report – is generally released in the two months following the end of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 102. In the year-end report have the data on the actual outcomes been audited? |
| a. Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited. |
| b. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. |
| c. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. |
| d. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |
| Citation: |
| Comment: |
| These data on the budget outcomes are not systemically audited. The most recently audited expenses are from 2004 and 2005. |
| Peer Reviewer One Comment: |
| Peer Reviewer Two Comment: |
103. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Some explanations are presented on key differences but no more details are given on their causes.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>104.</strong> What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:
Some details are focused on the differences between departmental totals, enacted expenditures and actual levels of expenditures by the Ministry.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

|   |   |
105. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
The budget execution report for the fourth quarter – which serves as a year-end report – offers some aggregated information on the year estimates and the actual expenditure.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

106. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
Same comment as in 105.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 107. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?

- a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
The non-financial data are not presented in the budget execution report.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

### 108. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?

- a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
Explanations on the outcome execution rate are presented but these are quite poor.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
109. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
These kinds of explanations are not well known by the general public.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

110. Does the year-end report present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
No information on the extra-budgetary funds is available to the public.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
111. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?

a. Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.
b. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.
c. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year.
d. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
The audit of the public expenditures is not common in Chad. It depends on the necessities, it is not systematic

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

112. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of annual expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the report(s) released to the public?

a. All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public.
b. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited.
c. Expenditure representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited.
d. No expenditures have been audited, the reports have not been released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
The audit of public expenditures is not common in Chad. It depends on the necessities, it is not systematic. Things are getting better with the creation of the Moralization and the State Monitoring Ministry.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
113. Does the annual audit report(s) that is released to the public include an executive summary?

a. The annual audit report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report’s content.
b. No, the audit report(s) does not include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

114. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?

a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed.
b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
According to the article 150 of the Constitution of the Chad Republic, “Members of the Supreme Court are irremovable. They remain in function until the retirement admission, except in case of conviction for offences and crimes, demission or definitive impeachment.”

Comment:
However, the President of the Chambers of Account of the Supreme Court is named par the Executive. It would not be surprising to see him relieved from his duties without the consent of the legislature, as it is commonly the case.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?

   a. Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds.
   b. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds.
   c. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds.
   d. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds, or such a report was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**
   The extra-budgetary funds are not audited.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

116. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have the discretion in law to undertake those audits it may wish to?

   a. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
   b. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations.
   c. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations.
   d. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**
   According to the articles 133 and 157 of the Republic Constitution, the Chambers of Account has the discretion in law to undertake the public accounts audit. But in the facts, it is limited by the human and material resources and has not a sufficient independency to undertake this task.

   **Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
117. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?

- a. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- c. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- d. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Even if it is independent in theory, the Supreme Court is tied to the Justice Ministry. That is why its budget is determined by this Ministry. But the allocated funds do not really match with the real necessities of the institution considering the importance of its role in the country.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

118. Does the Supreme Audit Institution employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector (military, police, intelligence services)?

- a. The SAI employs designated staff, and the staffing levels are broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- b. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels are a cause of some constraints to the SAI in fulfilling its mandate.
- c. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels pose a significant constraint on the SAI in fulfilling its mandate.
- d. The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of the security sector, or does not undertake audits of the security sector.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
The lack of human resources constitutes a constraint for all the institutions of the country, including the Supreme Court from which the Chambers of Account comes, auditor of the public accounts.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
119. Does the Supreme Audit Institution maintain formal mechanisms of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program (that is, to identify the agencies, programs, or projects it will audit)?

- a. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received more than 100 communications from the public during the past year.
- b. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received less than 100 but more than ten communications from the public during the past year.
- c. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public but it receives very little (less than ten) or no information from the public on potential subjects for audit.
- d. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public.
- e. Not applicable.

Citation:

Comment:
There is no formal procedure allowing the Chambers of Account to communicate to the public. It communicates only in case of necessity. It is the case for example of the press conferences it organizes to communicate to the media the results of the public accounts audits.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

d

120. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?

- a. Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized.
- b. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized.
- c. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized.
- d. No, audit reports are not scrutinized.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
The legislature is naturally part of the audit reports recipients.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

c
121. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?

a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.
b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings.
c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings.
d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
No action of this kind is adopted and communicated to the public.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

122. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?

a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations.
b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details.
d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify).
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
No action of this kind is adopted and communicated to the public.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
123. Are audit reports of the annual accounts of the security sector (military, police, intelligence services) and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?

   a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to the security sector and other secret programs.
   b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details.
   d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify).
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   Information on secret funds is not provided to the public.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
Additional Comments:
Please use this section to add any additional comments.

Peer Reviewer One Additional Comments:
It is worth mentioning that the program to fight against corruption and the establishment of audit institutions are recent. Therefore, the audit institutions are still limited in their work by the youth as much as by the lack/weakness of competency.
In addition, it is not easy to break away from habits. However, it is encouraging the fact that every audit institution in the country is opening more and more to the public, providing information on the public resources administration.