International Budget Project
OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE

NEPAL

October 2005

International Budget Project
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street, NE
Suite 510
Washington, DC  20002
www.internationalbudget.org
This questionnaire was completed by:

Name: SATYENDRA TIMILSINA AND PRAMOD C. POUDEL
Organization: THE STRATEGIC GROUP P (LTD)
Address: Kopundol, Lalitpur
          Kathmandu
          Nepal
Telephone: (+977 1) 5537246
E-mail: strategic@wlink.com.np
Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents ................................................. 4
  Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire .......... 5
  Table 2. Internet Links for Key Budget Documents ............................................. 6
  Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal .... 7
  Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports ......................... 8

Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal ................................................... 9
  Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond ...................................................... 10
  Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year .................................................. 19
  Comprehensiveness ....................................................................................... 28
  The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring .......................................... 34
  Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring ....................... 42

Section Three: The Budget Process ................................................................. 48
  Executive’s Formulation of the Budget ........................................................... 49
  Legislative Approval of the Budget ............................................................... 53
  Executive’s Implementation of the Budget .................................................... 57
  Executive’s Year-End Report and the Supreme Audit Institution ...................... 66
Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

*Please indicate the budget year of the document used to complete the questionnaire. If the document is not available to the public, please state, “Not Available.”*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire</th>
<th>Budget Year Used</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Budget Statement</td>
<td>Not available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Summary</td>
<td>2005-06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
<td>2005-06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Budget Documents</td>
<td>2004-05 &amp; 2005-06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
<td>Not available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enacted Budget</td>
<td>2005-06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Year Reports</td>
<td>2004-05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Year Report</td>
<td>2004-05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year-End Report</td>
<td>2003-04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audit Report</td>
<td>2003-04</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

While, the Economic survey is one of the supporting budget documents and is published only for BY-1, the budgetary document such as RED BOOK contains details of the proposed expenditure and is published for the year 2005-06. This is the reason behind mentioning two different budget years.
### Table 2. Internet Links for Key Budget Documents

Please provide the Internet link for the document, or indicate one of these three answers: “Not Produced,” “Produced but Not Available to the Public,” “Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Document</th>
<th>Website</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Budget Statement</td>
<td>Produced, but not available for the public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Budget Documents</td>
<td><a href="http://www.mof.gov.np">www.mof.gov.np</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
<td>Not Produced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Year Reports</td>
<td>Publicly Available, but not on the Internet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year-End Report</td>
<td>Publicly Available, but not on the Internet</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* MTEF issued by NPC & Economic Report published by the central bank.
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For the following reports, place “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Executive’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Pre-budget</th>
<th>Main document</th>
<th>Budget summary*</th>
<th>Supporting Document 1</th>
<th>Additional Document 2</th>
<th>Citizens budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Not produced, even for internal purposes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?

For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pre-budget</th>
<th>Executive’s Budget</th>
<th>Citizens budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Executive's Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Pre-budget</th>
<th>Main document</th>
<th>Budget summary*</th>
<th>Supporting Document 1</th>
<th>Additional Document 2</th>
<th>Citizens budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The release date is known at least one month in advance</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Released to public same day as official release to media</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Available on the Internet free of charge</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Free print copies available, limited distribution</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Free print copies available, mass distribution</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities*</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Written in more than one language</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. News conference is held to discuss release</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

*Mark “Yes” if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Enacted budget</th>
<th>In-year reports</th>
<th>Mid-year review</th>
<th>Year-end report</th>
<th>Audit report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Not produced, even for internal purposes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Enacted budget</th>
<th>In-year reports</th>
<th>Mid-year review</th>
<th>Year-end report</th>
<th>Audit report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The release date is known at least one month in advance</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Released to public same day as official release to media</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Available on the Internet free of charge</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Free print copies available, limited distribution</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Free print copies available, mass distribution</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Readily available outside capital/big cities</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Written in more than one language</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. News conference is held to discuss release</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Mark “Yes” if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:
BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)
BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year
BY-1 = one year before the budget year
**The Executive’s Budget Proposal**

**Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond**

1. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?

   a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit.
   b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately.
   c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.
   d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** The information on classification of expenditures by administrative units can be found in Annex 4 of the “Budget Speech 2005-06.” This information is also available at [www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/pdf/annex_english.pdf](http://www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/pdf/annex_english.pdf).

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

2. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?

   a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
   b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
   c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function.
   d. No expenditures classified by function are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** The information on functional classification of expenditures can be found in Annex 8 of the “Budget Speech 2005-06.” This information is also available at [www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/pdf/annex_english.pdf](http://www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/pdf/annex_english.pdf).

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
3. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?

   a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
   b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
   c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification.
   d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The information on classification of expenditures by economic heads can be found in Annex 9 of the “Budget Speech 2005-06.” This information is also available at www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/pdf/annex_english.pdf.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:
   
   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

4. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?

   a. Program-level data are presented for all expenditures.
   b. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No program-level data are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The information on expenditures for individual programs can be found in the MOF publication entitled “Expenditure Details for 2005-06”. This information is also available at www.mof.gov.np/publication/red/2005/index.php.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:
   
   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
5. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.
   b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

The researcher’s response to this question was “b.” The Revised Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) for the current budget year was not made public.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: I am not sure that the fact that the MTEF was not ready at the time of the filling in of this questionnaire (as a result entirely of logistical reasons) should be taken as an indication of a lack of transparency on the part of the authorities or as a reason in and of itself to allot a “b” response. Not only has the report meanwhile been released and is available in English at the National Planning Commission’s website www.npc.gov.np dated July 2005, it is also apologetic in coming out late. To quote, “Since MTEF is a framework document for budget preparation, its process should be commenced in early November each year so that the MTEF document comes available well in time to serve as a basis for and guide to the preparation of the forthcoming budget.” Even if one were to decide that MTEF 4 is too late for the purposes of this questionnaire, then it is still my view that one would be better off basing the answer to this question on what is available in MTEF 3 (of course, also an imperfect document: not all expenditures are forecasted), rather than resting with the in-between response of “no report was available.”

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “a”. Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) is available for public access at http://www.npc.gov.np/prsp/mtef_prsp/index2.jsp and this information is present in that document. National Planning Commission officials claim that MTEF was made “within days” of releasing the budget.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “b” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the *Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire*. IBP is attempting to evaluate information when the budget is tabled. In Nepal the MTEF was unavailable when the executive’s budget proposal was released and therefore the analysis of the budget by civil society before it was adopted had to have excluded the MTEF and therefore this document is regarded as unavailable for the purposes of our survey even though it has been subsequently released.
6. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).
   b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.
   c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.
   d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   The researcher’s response to this question was “d.” The Revised Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) for the current budget year was not made public.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: As in Q.5, should one not take either MTEF 4 or MTEF 3 to answer this question?

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b”. Again, 4th MTEF is available at the NPC website and this information is present in the document, at least for all “central level” programs and sectoral allocations. This information was not available in the earlier MTEF (before the 4th).

   IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire. IBP is attempting to evaluate information when the budget is tabled. In Nepal the MTEF was unavailable when the executive’s budget proposal was released and therefore the analysis of the budget by civil society before it was adopted had to have excluded the MTEF and therefore this document is regarded as unavailable for the purposes of our survey even though it has been subsequently released.
7. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?

   a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually.
   b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually.
   c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually.
   d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The Information on different sources of tax revenue for the budget year is found in Annex 2 of “Budget Speech 2005-06.” This information is also available at www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/pdf/annex_english.pdf.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:  

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:  

8. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?

   a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually.
   b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually.
   c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually.
   d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The Information on different sources of non-tax revenue for the budget year is found in Annex 2 of “Budget Speech 2005-06.” This information is also available at www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/pdf/annex_english.pdf.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:  

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
9. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.
   b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

<p>| |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

10. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).
   b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: More detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period is not presented.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

<p>| |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

11. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?

   a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget).
   b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year.
   c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year.
   d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

<p>| |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

15
12. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

   a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented.
   b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The Information on interest payments on the debt for the budget year is found in Annex 9 of the “Budget Speech 2005-06.” This information is also available at: www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/pdf/BudgetSpeech_english.pdf.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

13. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?

   a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.
   b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The only information presented on debt is its classification as external or internal debt.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
14. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?

   a. Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly.
   b. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

The researcher’s response to this question was “d.” The “Budget Speech 2005-06” (refer point 252, page 33) contains some discussion on the macroeconomic forecast. The Budget projections, however, is not based on these forecasts. These figures, instead, are the budgetary targets that the government wants to achieve after the execution of budgeted programs.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “c”; between MTEF and “Annual Program for the Fiscal Year 2005/6”, both published by NPC and available to the public (although the latter is not on the website), all broad macroeconomic forecasts are available. The nature of “forecast” is such that, on most occasions, it differs from the actuals and, at times, ambitious finance ministers set targets that defy forecasts. The only public concern is that the government forecasts do not offer sufficient details for informed public contestations to be possible—thus the appropriate response, in my opinion, should be “c”.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire. IBP is attempting to evaluate information when the budget is tabled. In Nepal the MTEF was unavailable when the executive’s budget proposal was released and therefore the analysis of the budget by civil society before it was adopted had to have excluded the MTEF and therefore this document is regarded as unavailable for the purposes of our survey even though it has been subsequently released. IBP editors also held discussions with the researchers on the Annual Program for the Fiscal Year 2005-06 during which the researchers made it clear that this document is not available to the public.
15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?

- a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?

- a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: There is no information on impact of policy proposals on expenditures in the budget or supporting documents. The “Budget Speech,” however, provides information on new programs under various sector titles such as Employment promotion, Education and Human resource Development, Health and Drinking Water etc is provided (refer to pages 18-28) of the budget speech.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: While the budget speech provides information on the impact of administrative reforms on revenue mobilization, the information is insufficient.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year

18. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?

   a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1.
   b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately.
   c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.
   d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The Information on expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) can be found in Annex 6 of the Budget Speech 2005-06. This information is also available at www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/pdf/annex_english.pdf.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
19. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification?

   a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
   b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
   c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1.
   d. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

20. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?

   a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
   b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
   c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1.
   d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
21. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1.
   b. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1.
   c. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1.
   d. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** Program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1 in the Red Book, available at [www.mof.gov.np/publication/red/2005/index.php](http://www.mof.gov.np/publication/red/2005/index.php).

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>22. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure.</td>
<td>a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

   **Citation and/or comment:** All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect eight months of actual expenditure. Actual expenditure for the first eight months of fiscal year can be found in page 26 of the Economic Survey for FY 2004-05, available at: [www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/surveyeng.php](http://www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/surveyeng.php).

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
23. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: The Information on estimates of aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year is found in Table 2.4, 2.5 and 2.6 of the Economic Survey 2004-05. This information is also available at [www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/surveyeng.php](http://www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/surveyeng.php).

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

24. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs for BY-1 and BY-2 in the Red Book. The information is available at [http://www.mof.gov.np/publication/red/2005/index.php](http://www.mof.gov.np/publication/red/2005/index.php).

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
25. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** The Information on all expenditures that reflects actual outcomes for BY-2 and earlier can be found in Table 2.4, 2.5 and 2.6 of the Economic Survey 2004-05. Also available at [www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/surveyeng.php](http://www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/surveyeng.php).

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?

   a. Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data.
   b. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable.
   c. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist.
   d. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** The prior year expenditures are adjusted at least by administrative units, and are comparable to current year's expenditure proposals. The information on such expenditures is presented in Annex 6 of the Budget Speech 2005-06, available at: [www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/pdf/annex_english.pdf](http://www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/pdf/annex_english.pdf).

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
27. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: The information on different sources of tax revenue for BY-1 year is found in Annex 5 of the Budget Speech 2005-06. This information is also available at [www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/pdf/annex_english.pdf](http://www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/pdf/annex_english.pdf)

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: The information on different sources of non-tax revenue for BY-1 year is found in Annex 5 of the Budget Speech 2005-06. This information is also available at [www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/pdf/annex_english.pdf](http://www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/pdf/annex_english.pdf)

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections.
   b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections.
   c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections.
   d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect eight months of actual revenue collections. Actual revenue collection for the first eight months of fiscal year is presented in Table 2.2 and 2.3 of the Economic Survey, available at: www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/surveyeng.php.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.
   b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Prior year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented in Table 2.2 and 2.3 of the Economic Survey for FY 2004-05, available at: www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/surveyeng.php.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).
   b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Information on revenue estimates is presented in Table 2.2 and 2.3 of the Economic Survey for FY 2004-05. This information is also available at: [www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/surveyeng.php](http://www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/surveyeng.php).

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

32. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Information on all revenue that reflects actual outcomes is presented in Table 2.2 and 2.3 of the Economic Survey for FY 2004-05. This information is also available at: [www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/surveyeng.php](http://www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/surveyeng.php).

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
33. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?

   a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year.
   b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded.
   c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented.
   d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Information on the level of debt is presented in Table 2.11 & 2.12 of the Economic Survey for FY 2004-05. Debt information is classified as external and internal debt and information is also provided on the pattern of internal debt. This information is also available at: www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/surveyeng.php.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

34. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Information on debt for BY-2 and beyond can be found in Table 2.11 of the Economic Survey for FY 2004-05. This information is also available at: www.mof.gov.np/publication/speech/2005/surveyeng.php.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
### Comprehensiveness

35. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?

- **a.** Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- **b.** Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded.
- **c.** Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- **d.** No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:**

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

b

d

36. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?

- **a.** Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- **b.** Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded.
- **c.** Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- **d.** No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** Information highlighting key intergovernmental transfers – from the central government to local government – is presented in the Red Book. Table no. 6 in page 66 of the Red Book shows the transfers of the central budget to the districts in the form of grants. This information is available at: [www.mof.gov.np/publication/red/2005/index.php](http://www.mof.gov.np/publication/red/2005/index.php).

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
37. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?

a. Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.

b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded.

c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.

d. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Information highlighting key transfers to public corporations is presented in the Red Book (page 67-69, table 6). Information is available at: www.mof.gov.np/publication/red/2005/index.php.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

38. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?

a. Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates.

b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded.

c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.

d. No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
39. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?

   a. Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on financial assets is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**
   
   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?

   a. Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**
   
   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

41. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?

   a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**
   
   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>42.</th>
<th>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Citation and/or comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>43.</th>
<th>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Citation and/or comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?

   a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
   b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually.
   c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
   d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Information on sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind is presented in the White Book (White Book presents details of financial assistance committed by donor agencies), available at www.mof.gov.np/publication/sourcebook/2005/index.php.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

45. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?

   a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?

   a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually.
   b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually.
   c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually.
   d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?

   a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
   b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
   c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
   d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** The percentage is not available to the public.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring

48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

The researcher’s response to this question was “c.” The Red Book for BY 2005-6 breaks down all projected expenditures by the 4 “pillars” of the present PRSP which are: i) broad-based economic growth; ii) social development; iii) targeted programs for remote and marginalized communities; and iv) good governance. Thus a clear link is established between the budget and policy goals. Expenditures are also broken down by priority (highest, medium and lowest) and priorities are based on the PRSP. Therefore, though this is a weaker link, it is still a link between spending patterns and policy goals.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b”; MTEF provides both narrative and quantitative associations of the allocations to the policy goals by sector and the document is available at the NPC website. These linkages are not presented in the budget speech and, as far as I know, this is not unique to Nepal. On occasions, the budget document (outlay) oversteps the NPC guidelines and inserts programs that cannot be linked to stated policy goals. In other instances, the outlay breaches this norm by omission of details. Thus, the most appropriate answer is “b”.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “c” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire. IBP is attempting to evaluate information when the budget is tabled. In Nepal, the MTEF was unavailable when the executive’s budget proposal was released and therefore the analysis of the budget by civil society before it was adopted had to have excluded the MTEF and therefore this document is regarded as unavailable for the purposes of our survey even though it has been subsequently released.
49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   The researcher’s response to this question was “d.”

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment**: A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.”
   The latest MTEF (MTEF 4) makes forward projections for expenditures broken down by the 4 PRSP pillars so there is definitely a link here.

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment**: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b”; again, MTEF is the document that provides this information. The 4th MTEF, for instance, links the policy objectives of the Plan Document with expenditure allocations at the sectoral levels till 2007. Not all sub-sector information is available to the public, thus the answer “b”.

   **IBP Comment**: IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire. IBP is attempting to evaluate information when the budget is tabled. In Nepal the MTEF was unavailable when the executive’s budget proposal was released and therefore the analysis of the budget by civil society before it was adopted had to have excluded the MTEF and therefore this document is regarded as unavailable for the purposes of our survey even though it has been subsequently released.
50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Non-financial data are presented for all programs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No non-financial data are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:**

The researcher’s response to this question was “d.”

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c”; Annual Programs for FY 2005/6, published by NPC, provides this data on some of the programs.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire. IBP is attempting to evaluate information when the budget is tabled. In Nepal, the Annual Program for the Fiscal Year 2005-06 is not publicly available and therefore the analysis of the budget by civil society before it was adopted had to have excluded the Annual Program and therefore, this document is regarded as unavailable for the purposes of our survey.
51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?

   a. The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance.
   b. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance.
   c. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance.
   d. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

The researcher’s response to this question was “d.”

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “c”; non-financial data presented, for instance, in the “Annual Program for 2005/6”, gives some basis for performance assessment on a year to year basis. This information, however, is asymmetric across sectors; thus the answer should be “c” rather than “d”.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire. IBP is attempting to evaluate information when the budget is tabled. In Nepal the Annual Program for the Fiscal Year 2005-06 is not publicly available and therefore the analysis of the budget by civil society before it was adopted had to have excluded the Annual Program and therefore this document is regarded as unavailable for the purposes of our survey.
52. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?

   a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs.
   b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No performance indicators are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

The researcher’s response to this question was “d.”

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “c”; between 4th MTEF and the “Annual Programs for 2005/6” performance indicators (quantitative targets) can be acquired for many expenditure categories, but not all.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire. IBP is attempting to evaluate information when the budget is tabled. In Nepal the MTEF was unavailable when the executive’s budget proposal was released and therefore the analysis of the budget by civil society before it was adopted had to have excluded the MTEF and therefore this document is regarded as unavailable for the purposes of our survey even though it has been subsequently released. IBP editors also held discussions with the researchers on the Annual Program for the Fiscal Year 2005-06 during which the researchers made it clear that this document is not available to the public.
53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?

a. All performance indicators are well designed.

b. Most performance indicators are well designed.

c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not.

d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

**The researcher’s response to this question was “d.”**

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c”; designing “good” performance indicators is sometimes difficult even with the best of intentions. In Nepal’s case, Planning Divisions in the sectoral ministries have a severe capacity crunch for this kind of work and analysis. In other instances, not all programs yield to quantitative indicators. For instance, road building does and women’s empowerment does not. Given these caveats, the performance indicators used in the MTEF and Annual Programs should be considered agreeable, at least, on some instances. A “d” answer is not defensible because indicators are used, and some of them are fairly well designed.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire. IBP is attempting to evaluate information when the budget is tabled. In Nepal the MTEF was unavailable when the executive’s budget proposal was released and therefore the analysis of the budget by civil society before it was adopted had to have excluded the MTEF and therefore this document is regarded as unavailable for the purposes of our survey even though it has been subsequently released. IBP editors also held discussions with the researchers on the Annual Program for the Fiscal Year 2005-06 during which the researchers made it clear that this document is not available to the public.
54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation?

- a. All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
- b. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
- c. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not.
- d. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:**

*The researcher’s response to this question was “d.”* Performance indicators are not presented in the budget or any supporting budget documents

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c”; performance indicators, to the extent they are used, are used in conjunction with performance targets. An examination of the link between Plan Document (10th Plan) with MTEF and with Annual Program (and budget document) will sufficiently exhibit this trend at the sectoral level. However, the use of indicators itself is not symmetric across all programs and all sectors. The documents I have mentioned are all “supporting documents” to the budget and are publicly accessible.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the *Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire*. IBP is attempting to evaluate information when the budget is tabled. In Nepal the MTEF was unavailable when the executive’s budget proposal was released and therefore the analysis of the budget by civil society before it was adopted had to have excluded the MTEF and therefore this document is regarded as unavailable for the purposes of our survey even though it has been subsequently released. IBP editors also held discussions with the researchers on the Annual Program for the Fiscal Year 2005-06 during which the researchers made it clear that this document is not available to the public.
55. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?

a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Some information on such policies is presented, but it lacks important details. For example – Budget Speech 2005-06 (in pg number 11, point 62) states that: “Different skill oriented training programs will be conducted to create income generating opportunities for the freed Kamaiya’s families and concessional loan facilities will be provided through the groups to start income generating activities.” The budget speech, however, does not address how many families are targeted beneficiaries, the rate of interest for concessional loans provided to them, the criteria for identifying the beneficiaries and other important details.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: The Red Book 2005-6 for the first time breaks planned expenditure down by the 4 strategic “pillars” of the ongoing PRSP. The third of these pillars is “targeted programs for social inclusion” which is about marginalized communities in remote areas and is therefore entirely poverty focused. This is in my view another important way in which poverty links are indicated, one that seems to be worth mentioning.

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis &amp; Monitoring</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive's budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on tax rates and fee schedules is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: A description of the tax rate and fee schedule for all revenues can be found in the Finance Ordinance, which is made available by the Ministry of Finance at: [www.mof.gov.np/budget/policies/index.php](http://www.mof.gov.np/budget/policies/index.php).

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment:

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?

| a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. |
| b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded. |
| c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. |
| d. No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

Citation and/or comment: The Ministry of Finance provides some information on loan conditionality immediately after the signing of a loan agreement through press releases. For example, a MOF press release on August 31st, 2005 provided some information on the amount of grant assistance provided by International Development Association (IDA) of the World Bank. This press release provides information on grant amount, project area, funds to be allocated by the government and local bodies among others. It does not, however, provide information on interest rates, duration of loan repayment and other details, refer to http://www.mof.gov.np/publication/press/2005/aug0105.php.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?

| a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. |
| b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded. |
| c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. |
| d. No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

Citation and/or comment: The Ministry of Finance provides some information on conditionality immediately after the signing of a donor assistance program through press releases. For example, refer to a MOF press release, available at: http://www.mof.gov.np/publication/press/2005/mar0705.php. It provides information on the amount of grant assistance provided by the government of Japan and where the fund would be used. The release, however, does not mention the conditionality associated with the grant assistance program.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?

   a. Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative.
   b. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative.
   c. Yes, but the summary is not very informative.
   d. No, it does not provide a summary.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: In Nepal, the budget speech is also the budget summary.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

61. Does the executive publish a “citizens budget” or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?

   a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative.
   b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative.
   c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative.
   d. No, it does not publish a Citizens budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The executive does not publish a citizens budget.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?

   a. Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided.
   b. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, definitions are not provided.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
63. Does the executive make available to the public a summary of the budget process?

   a. Yes, it includes a summary of the budget process that is very informative.
   b. Yes, it includes a summary of the budget process that is somewhat informative.
   c. Yes, but the summary of the budget process is not very informative.
   d. No, it does not include a summary of the budget process.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

The researcher’s response to this question was “d.”

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b”; This information is available (and accessible to the public) on the Finance Ministry website in a document called “Budget Preparation Manual”, the manual lays out the process to be followed under normal circumstances (with the sitting parliament) as well as in situations when budget is to be brought through ordinance.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire. This question asks about the availability to the public of a description of the various stages of the budget process. It specifically refers to a description of the budget process from its formulation to its year-end report and auditing, and is distinct from Question 68, which asks about the availability to the public of the executive’s internal timetable for the formulation of the budget. The Budget preparation manual provides the executive’s internal timetable for the first stage of the budget process (the formulation of the budget), but not a description for all four stages of the budget process.
64. Do citizens have the right in law to access government information, including budget information?

   a. Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.

   b. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.

   c. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information.

   d. No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information.

   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Right to information is one of the fundamental rights guaranteed by the constitution of Nepal, but the right to access government information has not been codified into law to date.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?

   a. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.

   b. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.

   c. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.

   d. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available.

   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
66. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?

   a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.
   b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: The government does not prepare non-financial information for all expenditures and therefore, citizens cannot obtain any non-financial expenditure information.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
Section Three: The Budget Process
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Budget Process</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Formulation of the Budget</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The release date is set in permanent law.</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: The release date of the budget is not fixed in law. However, by convention the budget is released on the first day of the Nepali Fiscal Year, which begins on mid-July. With the suspension of the legislature, the budget is adopted through two biannual ordinances every year – according to the constitution of Nepal, an ordinance is valid only for six months. The executive does not make any advance announcement of the budget release dates but an assumption can be made that the budget would be adopted every six months.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:  

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:  

| 68. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for its budget preparation process? | d |
| a. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public. |  |
| b. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded. |  |
| c. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details. |  |
| d. No, a timetable is not issued to the public. |  |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |  |

Citation and/or comment:  

The researcher’s response to this question was “d.”

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:  

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b”. This information is available (and accessible to the public) on the Finance Ministry website in a document called “Budget Preparation Manual”, the manual lays out the process to be followed under normal circumstances (with sitting parliament) as well as in situations when budget is to be brought through ordinance.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire. The Budget preparation manual provides the executive’s internal timetable for the first stage of the budget process (the formulation of the budget), but is not specifically designed for the current budget year.
69. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?
   - a. The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable.
   - b. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable.
   - c. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable.
   - d. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable.
   - e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   **The researcher’s response to this question was “d.”**

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c”. The “Budget Preparation Manual” does provide a timetable for budget preparation but this timetable can be transgressed with impunity. Figuratively speaking, no one has lost one’s job at the ministry for not following the timetable. At the same time, I do not believe finance ministry ignores the timetable by design. To give them the benefit of the doubt, I would choose “c” over “d”.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the *Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire*.

70. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?
   - a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators.
   - b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded.
   - c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature.
   - d. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process.
   - e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: There is no parliament in the country and therefore no consultations are held with members of the legislature.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

**IBP Comment:** The editors would like to note that the Nepalese Parliament was dissolved by the Government of Nepal in 2002. It was not reinstated until May 2006.
71. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?

a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies.
b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded.
c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies.
d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Very limited consultations, in some major cities are carried out as a part of budgetary process.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

72. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?

a. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year.
b. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year.
c. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year.
d. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: 

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment:

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>74. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment:

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
### Legislative Approval of the Budget

#### 75. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?

- **a.** The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year.
- **b.** The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year.
- **c.** The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year.
- **d.** The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** Since there is no parliament, there are no members of legislature.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

**IBP Comment:** See IBP Comment for Question 70.

#### 76. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?

- **a.** Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies.
- **b.** Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies.
- **c.** Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard.
- **d.** No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** Since there is no parliament, legislative committees does not hold public hearings.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

**IBP Comment:** See IBP Comment for Question 70.
77. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?

   a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
   b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
   c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
   d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Since there is no parliament, legislative committees does not hold public hearings.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

IBP Comment: See IBP Comment for Question 70.

78. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?

   a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.
   b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard.
   c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard.
   d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Since there is no parliament, legislative committees does not hold public hearings.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

IBP Comment: See IBP Comment for Question 70.
### 79. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?

- a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings.
- b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative.
- d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** Since there is no parliament, legislative committees do not hold public hearings.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

**IBP Comment:** See IBP Comment for Question 70.

### 80. Does the executive present more details or provide a better explanation of any budget proposal, if members of the legislature (including from minority parties) request such information?

- a. The executive responds to such legislative requests, and it generally provides an appropriate and timely response.
- b. The executive responds to such legislative requests, but its responses are sometimes not appropriate or timely.
- c. The executive responds to such legislative requests, but its responses are typically not appropriate or timely.
- d. The executive responds selectively or ignores such legislative requests.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** Since there is no parliament, there are no members of legislature to request for better explanation of any budget proposal.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

**IBP Comment:** See IBP Comment for Question 70.
81. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee) given information for the budget year on the spending of secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?

   a. Yes, the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items.
   b. Yes, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, the legislature is provided some information on spending on secret items, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, the legislature is provided no information on secret items.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Since there is no parliament, there are no members of legislature to request such information.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

   **IBP Comment:** See IBP Comment for Question 70.

82. Does the legislature have authority to amend the budget presented by the executive?

   a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority to amend the budget.
   b. Yes, the legislature has authority to amend the budget, with some limitations.
   c. Yes, the legislature has authority to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited.
   d. No, the legislature does not have any authority to amend the budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: There is no parliament and thus no legislature.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

   **IBP Comment:** See IBP Comment for Question 70.
83. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?

   a. The approved budget includes program-level detail.
   b. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).
   c. The approved budget includes only departmental totals.
   d. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** There is no parliament and thus no legislature.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

**IBP Comment:** See IBP Comment for Question 70.

### Executive’s Implementation of the Budget

84. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?

   a. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month.
   b. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter.
   c. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually.
   d. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:**

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

85. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?

   a. Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures.
   b. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.
   c. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No in-year reports are released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:**

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
86. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

a. Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures.

b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.

c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures.

d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

87. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?

a. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month.

b. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter.

c. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually.

d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: In-year reports on actual revenue collection by source of revenue are released every month. The information is released by the Ministry of Finance through media releases, which are published in newspapers.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
### Question 88
What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?

- a. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue.
- b. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue.
- c. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources.
- d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** In-year reports on actual revenue collection cover all sources of revenue. The information is released by the Ministry of Finance through media releases.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

### Question 89
Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

- a. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources.
- b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources.
- c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources.
- d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** In-year reports compare actual revenue collection with the original estimates and with actual year-to-date revenue collection of the previous year. The information is released by the Ministry of Finance through media releases.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>90. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:**

*The researcher’s response to this question was “d.”* Actual borrowing comprises of external and internal borrowings. The in-year reports released by the Nepal Rastra Bank only provides information on external borrowings and does not provide information on loans taken for technical assistance.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” According to analysts and the Central Bank, in-year reports on borrowing are released monthly (figures presented with a two month lag), though further information is not presented hence 91 could remain as “d”. Or I would request an explanation for “d” under “comments” in this.

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer “a” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries. However, we acknowledge that the researchers make a valid point about the inadequacy of debt information in the in-year reports on debt.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>91. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:**

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
92. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?

   a. Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period.
   b. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period.
   c. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period.
   d. In-year reports are not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

---

93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?

   a. Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget.
   b. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details.
   c. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
94. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?

- a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.
- b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
- c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
- d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

95. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?

- a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures.
- b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).
- c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals).
- d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
96. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?

   a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.
   b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
   c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
   d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

97. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain level, as specified in law or regulation)?

   a. Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units.
   b. Yes, the executive advises the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment.
   c. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented.
   d. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: There is no parliament.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

   IBP Comment: See IBP Comment for Question 70.
98. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?

   a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year.
   b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities.
   c. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities.
   d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Although there are instances of breaches, the public procurement process in Nepal follows “Financial Rules and Regulations Act of 1997” and the regulation contains detailed procedures to make public procurements open and competitive. A “d” answer would be correct if there were no regulatory instruments and no punitive actions for breaches; both do not apply to Nepal in theory or practice.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

99. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?

   a. Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify).
   b. Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify).
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: There is no parliament and thus such budgets, if any, are promulgated through ordinance.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

   **IBP Comment:** See IBP Comment for Question 70.
100. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?

- a. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget.
- b. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget.
- c. Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget.
- d. Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

101. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?

- a. Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget.
- b. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year.
- c. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget.
- d. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: There is no parliament and thus such expenditures are not approved by the legislature.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

**IBP Comment:** See IBP Comment for Question 70.
### Executive’s Year-End Report and the Supreme Audit Institution

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>102. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report or another document that discusses the budget’s actual outcome for the year?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Reports are released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Reports are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Reports are released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The executive does not release a year-end report.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Citation and/or comment:</strong> The year-end reports are released within ten months after the end of the fiscal year by the Financial Comptroller General's Office. Reports can be obtained from the FCGO.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>103. In the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), have the data on the actual outcomes been audited?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Citation and/or comment:</strong> None of the data on actual outcomes are audited. FCGO carries out an internal audit, but the final audit is carried out by the Office of Auditor General.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
104. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?

- a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: An explanation is not presented.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

105. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below)?

- a. The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level.
- b. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases).
- c. The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals).
- d. No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: No explanation of the differences is provided.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
106. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: An explanation is not presented.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

107. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: An explanation is not presented

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
108. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: An explanation is not presented.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: 

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: 

109. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: An explanation is not presented.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: 

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: 
110. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** An explanation is not presented.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

111. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** An explanation is not presented.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
112. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: Final audited accounts are released within 12 months after the end of the fiscal year.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

113. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of expenditure has been audited and (except for secret programs) the reports released to the public?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures have been audited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Expenditures representing less than two-thirds of expenditures have been audited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No expenditures have been audited, or the reports have not been released to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment:

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
114. Do year-end audit reports of departmental expenditure that are released to the public include an executive summary?

a. All of these audit reports include an executive summary.
b. Most of these reports include an executive summary.
c. Some of these reports include an executive summary.
d. None of these audit reports include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: This information is presented in the annual report of the Office of Auditor General. The OAG also publishes the compilation of the summary report of several years for the reference of the general public and others, available at: [www.oag.gov.np](http://www.oag.gov.np).

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

115. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?

a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed.
b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: The head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature. However, at present there is no legislature and the king on the advice of the cabinet can remove the head of the SAI.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
116. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?

   a. Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds.
   b. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds.
   c. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds.
   d. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The SAI does not release to the public, audits of extra-budgetary funds.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

117. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have discretion in law to undertake those audits it may wish to?

   a. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
   b. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations.
   c. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations.
   d. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
118. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: During our discussions with high ranking SAI officials, we were informed that the SAI budget is determined by the budget division officials of the Ministry of Finance. Due to lack of funds, they were unable to carry out performance auditing in several instances.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>119. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, audit reports are not scrutinized.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: Currently, there is no legislative committee to view and scrutinize audit reports.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

**IBP Comment:** See IBP Comment for Question 70.
120. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?

a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.
b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings.
c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings.
d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

121. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?

a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations.
b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details.
d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify).
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: A report is not produced.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
122. Are audit reports related to national security and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?

a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to national security and other secret programs.
b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details.
d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify).
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Currently, there is no legislature.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: