This questionnaire was completed by:

Name: PAUL BARKER
Organization: INSTITUTE OF NATIONAL AFFAIRS
Address: P. O. Box 1530
Port Moresby, NCD
Papua New Guinea
Telephone: (+675) 321 1044/1045
E-mail: inapng@daltron.com.pg
Internet Website: www.inapng.com
International Budget Project
OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE
PAPUA NEW GUINEA

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents .................................................. 4
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire .............. 5
Table 2. Internet Links for Key Budget Documents .................................................... 6
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal ........ 7
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports .................................. 8

Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal ......................................................... 9
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond ................................................................. 10
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year ............................................................... 19
Comprehensiveness ..................................................................................................... 28
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring ...................................................... 35
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring ................................. 40

Section Three: The Budget Process ............................................................................ 45
Executive’s Formulation of the Budget ....................................................................... 46
Legislative Approval of the Budget ............................................................................. 50
Executive’s Implementation of the Budget ................................................................. 55
Executive’s Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution ............................... 64
Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

Please indicate the budget year of the document used to complete the questionnaire. If the document is not available to the public, please state, “Not Available.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire</th>
<th>Budget Year Used</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Budget Statement</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Summary</td>
<td>2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
<td>2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Budget Documents</td>
<td>2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enacted Budget</td>
<td>2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Year Reports</td>
<td>2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Year Report</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year-End Report</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audit Report</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Table 2. Internet Links for Key Budget Documents

*Please provide the Internet link for the document, or indicate one of these three answers: “Not Produced,” “Produced But Not Available to the Public,” “Publicly Available, But Not on the Internet.”*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Document</th>
<th>Website</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
<td>Not Produced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Year Reports</td>
<td><a href="www.treasury.gov.pg/html/publication">www.treasury.gov.pg/html/publication</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Year Review</td>
<td>Not Produced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year-End Report</td>
<td>Produced But Not Available to the Public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audit Report</td>
<td>Produced But Not Available to the Public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Documents</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevant Ministries &amp; Departments</td>
<td><a href="www.bankpng.gov.pg">www.bankpng.gov.pg</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal

**DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS**

*For the following reports, place “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pre-budget</th>
<th>Executive’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Citizens budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Main document</td>
<td>Budget summary*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Not produced, even for internal purposes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pre-budget</th>
<th>Executive’s Budget</th>
<th>Citizens budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Main document</td>
<td>Budget summary*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The release date is known at least one month in advance</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Released to public same day as official release to media</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Available on the Internet free of charge</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Free print copies available, limited distribution</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Free print copies available, mass distribution</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities+</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Written in more than one language</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. News conference is held to discuss release</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.*

*Mark “Yes” if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.*
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS</th>
<th>Enacted budget</th>
<th>In-year reports</th>
<th>Mid-year review</th>
<th>Year-end report</th>
<th>Audit report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For the following reports, place a “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Not produced, even for internal purposes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.</th>
<th>Enacted budget</th>
<th>In-year reports</th>
<th>Mid-year review</th>
<th>Year-end report</th>
<th>Audit report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The release date is known at least one month in advance</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Released to public same day as official release to media</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Available on the Internet free of charge</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Free print copies available, limited distribution</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Free print copies available, mass distribution</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Readily available outside capital/big cities</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Written in more than one language</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. News conference is held to discuss release</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Mark “Yes” if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:
BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)
BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year
BY-1 = one year before the budget year
Please mark your answer by placing the appropriate letter in the box to the right of the question. For all answers marked “not applicable/other,” please provide a brief explanation indicating either why the answer choices provided are not applicable or why another response would be more appropriate.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Executive’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit.</td>
<td>a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1, 2, and 3.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.</td>
<td>a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No expenditures classified by function are presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1, 2, and 3.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Question 3

Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?

- a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
- b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
- c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification.
- d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1, 2, and 3.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

### Question 4

Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?

- a. Program-level data are presented for all expenditures.
- b. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
- c. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- d. No program-level data are presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:**

*The researcher marked the answer “b.”* Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1, 2, and 3. Program-level data are presented for the development budget but not for recurrent expenditure.

**Researcher Response to Peer Reviewer:** I remain with “b” for reasons given by reviewer 2, i.e. the recurrent budget does not provide all program-level expenditures.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c,” because development expenditure for the 2006 Budget only represents about one third of total expenditure.

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” Program-level data are in fact presented in both the Development and Recurrent Budgets. The breakdown is as follows: department: program: activity: expenditure item. However, it is true that for a number of departments there is only one program in the Recurrent Budget.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer “b” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
5. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.
   b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Refer to: www.treasury.gov.pg/files/budget2005/volume1-2005.pdf

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: This response is correct; the reference is Table A3.9 at the back of Volume 1.

6. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).
   b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.
   c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.
   d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Refer to: www.treasury.gov.pg/files/budget2005/volume1-2005.pdf

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: Although no multi-year estimates are provided for any programs, they are at least split to a limited degree between national and provincial government, and by crude categories within the two, for example salaries, goods and services and so on. See Table A3.9 at the back of Volume 1.
7. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?

   a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually.
   b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually.
   c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually.
   d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program 2005 Volume 1, 2, and 3.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** This is correct. The reference is table A3.8 at the back of Volume 1.

<p>| |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

8. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?

   a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually.
   b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually.
   c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually.
   d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1, 2, and 3.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** This is correct. The reference is table A3.8 at the back of Volume 1.
9. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.
   b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).


   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment**: 
   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment**: Same reference as above.

10. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

    a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).
    b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.
    c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.
    d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.
    e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

    **Citation and/or comment**:

    **The researcher marked the answer “b.”** Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1. Table A3.8 at the back of Volume 1 provides estimates broken down by tax and non-tax, and by some additional detail within those two headings.

    **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment**: A more appropriate response to this question would be “c,” as shown on pages 106-7 of Volume 1 of the 2006 Budget. Some indications are given on trends in some revenue categories, beyond aggregate trends.

    **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment**:

    **IBP Comment**: IBP editors chose answer “b” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
11. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?

   a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget).
   b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year.
   c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year.
   d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

12. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

   a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented.
   b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volumes 1 and 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
13. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?

   a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.
   b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** Debt servicing costs are presented. Also refer to pages 81-85 and Table A3.10 (in Appendix 3) of Volume 1 of “Economic and Development Policies,” available at: http://www.treasury.gov.pg/files/budget2005/volume1_2005.pdf. Table A3.10 does not give any more than gross amounts; it does not give interest rates, maturity profile or currency denomination.


**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

14. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?

   a. Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly.
   b. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** This is correct. See Table A3.13 at the back of Volume 1.
15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   **Researcher Response to Peer Reviewer:** Information provided is very scant.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Chapter 7 of Volume 1 looks at the medium-term outlook and refers to some risks.

   **IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

**The researcher marked the answer “b.”** Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1, p. 54, Table 23.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” The table mentions only reports foreseen expenditure for key programs in the development budget, without any detail, and without any considerations of the impact of policy changes on recurrent expenditure.

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** The table referred to here includes a number of projects that are on-going. They are not all (in fact the majority are not) a result of the policies contained for the first time in the 2005 budget. In addition, the projects shown in this table are for the development budget only (they do not include estimates of recurrent expenditure). On the face of it however, “b” is probably still the most appropriate answer.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer “b” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1 states that there are no new tax measures, and non-tax revenue is predicted to increase by K17 million mostly due to property income (refer to p. 19, table 13).

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year

18. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?

   a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1.
   b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately.
   c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.
   d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1, 2, and 3.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: Note that for data at all levels (department, program, activity and expenditure item), the current year appropriation is shown alongside the previous year’s appropriation and the actual expenditure for BY-2.
19. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification?

a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1.
d. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1, 2, and 3.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** The level of detail suggests that “a” is the correct answer; however, data given for BY-1 are appropriations, not expenditures.

---

20. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?

a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1.
d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1, 2, and 3.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** Same comment as above.
21. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1.
   b. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1.
   c. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1.
   d. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1, 2, and 3.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: Same comment as above.

22. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure.
   b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure.
   c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure.
   d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The figures shown for BY-1 are the appropriations for that year; they are not the actuals. They have not been updated since they tally exactly with the appropriations given in the 2004 budget. However, the figures given for BY-2 are actuals which have been updated.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: 
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response Options</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>23. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</td>
<td>a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.</td>
<td>Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</td>
<td>a. Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).</td>
<td>Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
25. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1.

| Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: |
| Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: |

26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?

   a. Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data.
   b. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable.
   c. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist.
   d. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1, 2, and 3.

| Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: |
| Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: |
27. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   b. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.
   c. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.
   d. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1 (Table A3.8).

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   b. Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.
   c. Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.
   d. No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1 (Table A3.8).

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections.
   b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections.
   c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections.
   d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 2.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.
   b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1 (Table A3.8).

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).
   b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

32. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
33. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?

   a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year.
   b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded.
   c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented.
   d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:**

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

34. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1. Table A3.12 shows actual levels of public debt for BY-2.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
Comprehensiveness

35. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?

a. Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

The researcher’s response to this question was “b.”

Researcher Response to Peer Reviewer: There are some trust funds that are not reported on.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “c,” given the minimal level of detail provided in the budget documentation. The trust funds presented in the document are trust accounts mostly related to counterpart funds for donor-funded projects, earmarked revenues and other similar categories. They are extra-budgetary, as far as I understand.

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: Trust funds are extra-budgetary in so much as money put in them is not subject to the same appropriation and warrant limitations as it would be if it were appropriated in the budget in the normal way. As such, trust accounts are sometimes used as a means of circumventing the normal processes and avoiding putting revenues back in to the consolidated fund (see World Bank, 2003 Public Expenditure Rationalisation and Review: Overview of Papers).

In addition to the information provided on trust funds, there is also information on the expected amount of tax credits and project grants in Table A3.8. There is also some discussion on both of these extra-budgetary forms of funding in the body of Volume 1 (Chapter Two). Detail on project grants is provided in the development budget/PIP (Volume Two, Part Three and Volume Three of the Budget). “a” is therefore a more appropriate answer.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “c” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries. We reviewed the information on trust funds and think that it is not very useful and taken together with the researcher’s finding that some trust funds are not reported on, we feel that “c” is an appropriate answer for this question.
36. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?

   a. Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1, tables 2.4.1, 2.4.2, and Volume 2. Table A3.9 at the back of Volume 1 provides a breakdown of transfers to the provinces. These data are disaggregated to some degree, although not to the program-level. In addition, there is some discussion in Chapter Four of Volume 1 regarding transfers to provincial governments.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

37. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?

   a. Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1, Table 2.4.1, and Volume 2.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
### 38. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?

| a. Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates. |
| b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded. |
| c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. |
| d. No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

**Citation and/or comment:**

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

### 39. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?

| a. Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value. |
| b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. |
| c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. |
| d. No, information on financial assets is not presented. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

**Citation and/or comment:** According to Mr. S. Morling, Advisor at the Department of Treasury.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on non-financial assets is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:** According to Mr. S. Morling, Advisor at the Department of Treasury.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

---

41. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:** Refer to Economic and Development Policies, Volume 1, pp. 43-48, and budget speech pp.7, 12.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?

   a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: According to Mr. S. Morling, Advisor at the Department of Treasury.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?

   a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   Researcher Response to Peer Reviewer: Since information on pensions is not presented and pensions form a major part of future liabilities, I will stay with “c.”

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” Under the discussion of the medium-term outlook in Chapter Seven, the impact on recurrent expenditure of the future wage bill and likely increased payments for education subsidies given the increase in the population are considered (see page 80).

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “c” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
### 44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?

- **a.** All sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
- **b.** At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually.
- **c.** Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
- **d.** No sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

*Citation and/or comment:* Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1. See also Volume Two, Part Three and Volume Three

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

### 45. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?

- **a.** Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- **b.** Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded.
- **c.** Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- **d.** No, information on tax expenditures is not presented.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

*Citation and/or comment:* Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1, p. 32.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

### 46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?

- **a.** All earmarked revenues are identified individually.
- **b.** At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually.
- **c.** Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually.
- **d.** No earmarked revenues are identified individually.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

*Citation and/or comment:*

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?

   a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
   b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
   c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
   d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: According to Mr. S. Morling, Advisor at the Department of Treasury.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
## The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring

### 48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?

- a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** Refer to the Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

### 49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

- a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1, Appendix 3, Table 3.9, pp. 50 and 58; budget speech p. 9.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?

   a. Non-financial data are presented for all programs.
   b. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure.
   d. No non-financial data are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:**
   
   **The researcher marked this answer as “a.”** Non-financial data such as numbers of staff, labour and vehicles are provided for all departments (Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Programme, Volume 2) but the number of beneficiaries is not identified.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:** There is a question here about the kind of non-financial data provided. Input data are not useful for assessing performance for example by measuring the number of beneficiaries reached. There is a need to distinguish between the different kinds of non-financial data which count for scoring on this question.

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

   **IBP Comment:** IBP editors agree that the level of information on non-financial data is restricted to input data and information on output data (such as beneficiaries) is missing. However, this question is measuring whether or not, non-financial information is provided to programs, and does not measure the quality of this information.

51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?

   a. The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance.
   b. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance.
   c. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance.
   d. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** The only non-financial data provided are staffing and number of vehicles, as the researcher states in question 49. Since these are purely input data, they are not helpful for assessing performance in terms of output.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
52. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?
   a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs.
   b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No performance indicators are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

The researcher marked this answer as “a.” Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Programme Volume 2 present performance indicators but they are of a very general nature and would be almost impossible to measure.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: Again, as for question 50, what is the use of presenting performance indicators if no performance data are presented alongside?

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

IBP Comment: IBP editors agree that information on performance indicators is insufficient when it is not accompanied by any information on performance data. However, this question is measuring whether performance indicators are provided for programs or not, and does not measure the quality of this information.

53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?
   a. All performance indicators are well designed.
   b. Most performance indicators are well designed.
   c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not.
   d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: The Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 2 present performance indicators but they are of a very general nature and would be almost impossible to measure.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation?

   a. All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
   b. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
   c. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not.
   d. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: The Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 2 present performance indicators but they are of a very general nature and would be almost impossible to measure. Since performance targets are not discussed in the budget documents, beyond broad statements concerning public sector reform and the better use of public resources (found in Volume, 1 Chapter Four), this question is being marked “d.”

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?

a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

The researcher marked this answer as “c.” Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1 and 3.

Researcher Response to Peer Reviewer: Most of the statements are of the “motherhood” variety and do not give specific measurable targets.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” Within Volume 1, there is a chapter (Chapter Six) devoted to the discussion of sectoral policies and one devoted to the development strategy (Chapter Five). Chapter Five in particular concerns the ways that the government plans to improve the standard of living of ordinary Papua New Guineans, and so could be said to provide detail on policies intended to benefit Papua New Guinea’s (PNG) most impoverished citizens. The sectoral chapter gives more detail on this strategy.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “c” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
### Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring

*Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive’s budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on tax rates and fee schedules is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:** All taxation rates are prescribed by law.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:**

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>58.</th>
<th>Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment:

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:  

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>59.</th>
<th>Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment:

**Researcher Response to Peer Reviewer:** Information might be provided by the media but no information is provided by the government.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:  

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.”  

Whilst there is not a systematic process for reporting the conditions associated with donor country assistance, there is a lot of media scrutiny surrounding the Australian aid program in particular. This is fuelled by the government to some extent – for example the court case brought by Luther Wenge, a member of parliament, in 2005, claimed that the Australian Enhanced Cooperation Programme was unconstitutional because it required that Australian personnel accused of a crime whilst working in PNG would be prosecuted in Australia, rather than in PNG (see front page of the Post Courier, Monday, May 16th 2005).

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?
   a. Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative.
   b. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative.
   c. Yes, but the summary is not very informative.
   d. No, it does not provide a summary.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 1.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:** Volume 1 is hardly a summary, running at over 100 pages. The budget speech is probably a better summary.

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

61. Does the executive publish a “citizens budget” or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?
   a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative.
   b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative.
   c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative.
   d. No, it does not publish a citizens budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?
   a. Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided.
   b. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, definitions are not provided.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
63. Does the executive make available to the public a summary of the budget process?

- a. Yes, it includes a summary of the budget process that is very informative.
- b. Yes, it includes a summary of the budget process that is somewhat informative.
- c. Yes, but the summary of the budget process is not very informative.
- d. No, it does not include a summary of the budget process.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:**

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** It should be noted that in 2005, the Consultative Implementation and Monitoring Council (CIMC), a non-governmental body, provided a series of regional workshops on the budget process. This was carried out in close collaboration with the government, and government officials attended the workshop. In addition, a document was produced explaining the budget process. This is available on the website in two local languages as well as English. Since the workshops were carried out in 2005, the document refers to the 2006 Budget. As such, “d” is appropriate for the run-up to the 2005 budget.

64. Do citizens have the right in law to access government information, including budget information?

- a. Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
- b. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
- c. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information.
- d. No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:**

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?

   a. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.
   b. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.

   a. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available.
   b. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>66. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment:

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
Section Three: The Budget Process
### The Budget Process

#### Executive’s Formulation of the Budget

**67.** How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?

- a. The release date is set in permanent law.
- b. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance.
- c. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance.
- d. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

*Citation and/or comment:* The release date is almost always the second Tuesday in November, and this is known by those interested in the budget. However, if the budget is not ready in time, or indeed is ready early, the release date is subject to change with little advance warning.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

**68.** Does the executive release to the public its timetable for its budget preparation process?

- a. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public.
- b. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, a timetable is not issued to the public.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

*Citation and/or comment:* The Budget Circular is not released to the public but is made available to donors. According to Mr. S. Morling, Advisor at the Department of Treasury.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** Note that there is a budget timetable, but that it is for government use only and is not released to the public. However, it should be noted that as of 2006, the Budget Circular, which contains key dates for the budget preparation, is posted on the treasury’s website. However, as this survey concerns the 2005 budget this is not relevant here, and the correct answer is therefore indeed “d.”
69. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?
   
   a. The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable.
   b. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable.
   c. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable.
   d. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** The government adheres to its timetable but the timetable is not made public, according to Mr. S. Morling, Advisor at the Department of Treasury.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

   d

70. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?
   
   a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators.
   b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded.
   c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature.
   d. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

   d
71. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?

   a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies.
   b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded.
   c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies.
   d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

The researcher chose answer “c.” Advertisements were placed in newspapers requesting submissions and presentations to Regional and National Development Forums (NDF) for the first time in 2005.

Researcher Response to Peer Reviewer: I do not agree with the peer reviewers as the process of consultation is a two-way process. Treasury made a presentation to the public with some material which was out-of-date (regurgitation of budget assumptions rather than up-to-date macro indicators) and to my knowledge never even considered any changes as a result of what they heard at these consultations.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” My understanding was that through the CIMC and the NDFs the government was able to hold consultations with a range of constituencies, at least those that were partially organised.

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” As the researcher has noted, the regional and national development forums are held in the run-up to the budget process. Although these are not run by the government (they are run by an NGO, the CIMC, they are held in association with the government, which is represented at each event. A forum is held in each region of the country, a large number of invitations are sent out to members of different communities (businesses, NGOs, CBOs, religious-based organisations, education institutions and so on) and they are advertised in the press. In addition, for some individuals costs of travel are paid for. The forums result in a range of recommendations for inclusion in the budget which are then formally presented to the cabinet through the Minister for National Planning. This amounts to more than “very limited consultations” and so “b” is a more suitable answer.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “c” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
72. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>The executive does not release a pre-budget statement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: Regional and National Development Forums from March to September 2005, first presented at Southern Regional Development Forum, Port Moresby, 7-8 March 2005 (Consultative and Implementation Council, Port Moresby).

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** In addition to the development forums, the government also publishes a budget strategy paper on its website. This is typically produced and published in June/July – the budget year starts in January.

73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: Regional and National Development Forums April-September 2005.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
74. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?

a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.

b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded.

c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.

d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Regional and National Development Forums April-September 2005.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

Legislative Approval of the Budget

75. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?

a. The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year.

b. The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year.

c. The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year.

d. The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volumes 1, 2, and 3, November 2004 for FY 2005 (January 1st).

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: The legislature typically receives the budget in the second week of November, therefore the true answer lies between “b” and “c” – just about 6 weeks before the start of the budget year.
76. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?

   a. Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies.
   b. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies.
   c. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard.
   d. No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

77. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?

   a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
   b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
   c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
   d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
78. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?

   a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.
   b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard.
   c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard.
   d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

79. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?

   a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings.
   b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative.
   d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
80. Does the executive present more details or provide a better explanation of any budget proposal, if members of the legislature (including from minority parties) request such information?

   a. The executive responds to such legislative requests, and it generally provides an appropriate and timely response.
   b. The executive responds to such legislative requests, but its responses are sometimes not appropriate or timely.
   c. The executive responds to such legislative requests, but its responses are typically not appropriate or timely.
   d. The executive responds selectively or ignores such legislative requests.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Sometimes the executive directs the civil service to provide more detail on certain issues that are of interest to different members, although these requests are typically ad hoc in nature and may or may not be responded to, often depending on the relative political importance of the person making the request.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

81. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee) given information for the budget year on the spending of secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?

   a. Yes, the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items.
   b. Yes, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, the legislature is provided some information on spending on secret items, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, the legislature is provided no information on secret items.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volume 2.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
82. Does the legislature have authority to amend the budget presented by the executive?

   a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority to amend the budget.
   b. Yes, the legislature has authority to amend the budget, with some limitations.
   c. Yes, the legislature has authority to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited.
   d. No, the legislature does not have any authority to amend the budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Legislature can only alter the budget if the National Executive Council has approved the changes (s. 210) www.paclii.org

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

83. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?

   a. The approved budget includes program-level detail.
   b. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).
   c. The approved budget includes only departmental totals.
   d. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The Recurrent Budget Estimates of Recurrent Expenditure and Public Expenditure Program Volumes 2 and 3 and the development budget (Volume 3).

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
## Executive’s Implementation of the Budget

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Answer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>84. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</td>
<td>b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

However, it appears that these have ceased and the only regular reporting is the Quarterly Bulletin.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Answer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>85. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</td>
<td>b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No in-year reports are released to the public.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: Refer to Monthly Fiscal Report: Revenues, Expenditure and Financing as at 31 May 2005, Department of Treasury. Expenditures on donor projects are frequently omitted due to time delays in getting the relevant information from the donors (who provide project funding rather than budgetary support). In addition, although the reports technically cover all expenditure, they do so at a very high level – for example expenditure by national government departments is one item.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
86. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

- a. Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures.
- b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.
- c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: In both the QEBs and the (now suspended) in-year reports published by the Treasury, I found evidence of comparisons made for all revenue and expenditure aggregates (e.g. QEB December 2005, pp. 23-25, and Monthly Fiscal Report November 2005, pp. 6-9, Treasury Economic Monitor September 2005, pp. 17-19).

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

87. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?

- a. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month.
- b. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter.
- c. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually.
- d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Budget and Monthly Outturn Reports are available at www.treasury.gov.pg for April to September but not subsequent to September. However, the Bank of PNG releases quarterly reports consistently.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
88. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: Ex-budget revenues are not covered, for e.g., receipts by departments for services that are retained by the department. Again, the reports suffer from the fact that there is a time-lag on information pertaining to donor projects. To the extent that donor grants reflect revenue, this affects reporting on actual revenue collections.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

89. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: In both the QEBs and the (now suspended) in-year reports published by the Treasury, I found evidence of comparisons made for all revenue and expenditure aggregates (e.g. QEB December 2005, pp. 23-25, and Monthly Fiscal Report November 2005, pp. 6-9, Treasury Economic Monitor September 2005, pp. 17-19).

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
90. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?
   
a. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month.
   
b. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter.
   
c. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually.
   
d. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released.
   
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** Reports are not issued and monthly reports have been discontinued, according to S. Morling, Advisor at the Department of Treasury.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**
   
   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

91. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?
   
a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.
   
b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.
   
c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   
d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released.
   
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** Information on interest rates and other details on government borrowing are not published, according to S. Morling, Advisor at the Department of Treasury.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**
   
   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
92. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>In-year reports are not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:** Monthly reports are no longer published according to S. Morling, Advisor at the Department of Treasury. However, the Bank of PNG releases quarterly reports consistently.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:** According to S. Morling, Advisor at the Department of Treasury.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
94. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?

- a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.
- b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
- c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
- d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

*Citation and/or comment*: according to S. Morling, Advisor at the Department of Treasury.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

95. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?

- a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures.
- b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).
- c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals).
- d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

*Citation and/or comment*: According to S. Morling, Advisor at the Department of Treasury.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
96. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?

   a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.
   b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
   c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
   d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** According to S. Morling, Advisor at the Department of Treasury.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

97. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain level, as specified in law or regulation)?

   a. Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units.
   b. Yes, the executive advises the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment.
   c. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented.
   d. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** The executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking legislative approval as long as the shift in funds does not change the total approved budget amount. However, the executive seeks legislative approval if additional funds are required. Thus in 2005, the executive sought a supplementary appropriation for K400 million of expenditure that was above the budget limit to quarantine an unexpected budget surplus which may have otherwise been directed into low-priority “pet” projects, according to S. Morling, Advisor at the Department of Treasury.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
98. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?

- a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year.
- b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities.
- c. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities.
- d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Irregularities exist but these seldom if ever reach the press or financial watchdogs. According to S. Morling, Advisor at the Department of Treasury.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>99. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: The executive rarely proposes a supplementary budget unless there is a fiscal crisis. However, in 2005, the executive sought a supplementary appropriation for K400 million of expenditure that was above the budget limit to quarantine an unexpected budget surplus which may have otherwise been directed into low-priority “pet” projects.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** Although “a” is probably the most appropriate answer, it should be noted that supplementary budgets are used both as a tool to overcome fiscal crises and by governments that are coming into power (or are looking like they may lose power) halfway through the budget year. The last time that this happened was in August 2002.
100. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?

   a. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget.
   b. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget.
   c. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget.
   d. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Supplementary budgets are rarely used in PNG. In 2005, a supplementary appropriation for K400 million was requested out of a total budget of K4.7 billion.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

101. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?

   a. Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget.
   b. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year.
   c. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget.
   d. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: No unspecified contingency funds exist in the budget but provisions for natural disasters and other specific contingencies are made in the trust funds, see: www.treasury.gov.pg/files/budget2005/trustdoc_2005.pdf According to S. Morling, Advisor at the Department of Treasury.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
Executive’s Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution

102. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report or another document that discusses the budget’s actual outcome for the year?

- a. Reports are released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.
- b. Reports are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.
- c. Reports are released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year.
- d. The executive does not release a year-end report.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

The researcher marked this answer as “c.” Fiscal reports are released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year and often not produced for several years after the end of the financial year. Currently, the 2002 report has been produced but not tabled to Parliament or made public, according to S. Morling, Advisor at the Department of Treasury.

Researcher Response to Peer Reviewer: The question is not about public interest but whether government releases reports and it does eventually.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” Whilst the government might prepare year-end reports, these are so delayed, that by the time they are published they are unlikely to still be of interest to the public. The example given by the researcher here is a case in point: the year-end report for BY-3 still has not been tabled in Parliament or been made available to the public.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “c” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries. For the purposes of this questionnaire, we have asked researchers to use the latest available year-end report.
103. In the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), have the data on the actual outcomes been audited?

   a. Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited.
   b. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited.
   c. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited.
   d. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Since the 2002 year-end report has been produced but is not publicly available, we are marking this question as if the year-end report was not released.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

104. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Since the 2002 year-end report has been produced but is not publicly available, we are marking this question as if the year-end report was not released.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
105. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below)?

a. The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level.
b. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases).
c. The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals).
d. No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Since the 2002 year-end report has been produced but is not publicly available we are marking this question as if the year-end report was not released.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

106. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?

a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Since the 2002 year-end report has been produced but is not publicly available, we are marking this question as if the year-end report was not released.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
107. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Since the 2002 year-end report has been produced but is not publicly available, we are marking this question as if the year-end report was not released.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

108. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Since the 2002 year-end report has been produced but is not publicly available, we are marking this question as if the year-end report was not released.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
109. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** Since the 2002 year-end report has been produced but is not publicly available, we are marking this question as if the year-end report was not released.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

110. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** Since the 2002 year-end report has been produced but is not publicly available, we are marking this question as if the year-end report was not released.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
111. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:** Since the 2002 year-end report has been produced but is not publicly available, we are marking this question as if the year-end report was not released.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

112. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:** The 2003 Auditor General’s report has been finalised and presented to the Public Accounts Committee. However, the report has not been tabled in Parliament or published (as of August 2005). Further, the Auditor General’s Office hopes that the 2004 report will be finalised by November 2005, according to Mr. Craig Dean, Advisor in the Auditor General’s Office.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** “d” is an appropriate answer to all of the questions on the audit report since the 2003 report had not been tabled in Parliament as of August 2005. In fact, the lack of timely delivery of audit reports is an important issue in terms of budget transparency in PNG. Therefore highlighting this issue by marking the answer “d” is appropriate.
113. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of expenditure has been audited and (except for secret programs) the reports released to the public?

   a. All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public.
   b. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited.
   c. Expenditures representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited.
   d. No expenditures have been audited, or the reports have not been released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Since the 2003 audit report has been produced but is not publicly available, we are marking this question as if the audit report was not released.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>114. Do year-end audit reports of departmental expenditure that are released to the public include an executive summary?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. All of these audit reports include an executive summary.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Most of these reports include an executive summary.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Some of these reports include an executive summary.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. None of these audit reports include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

   Citation and/or comment: Since the 2003 audit report has been produced but is not publicly available, we are marking this question as if the audit report was not released.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
115. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?

   a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed.
   b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: According to Mr. Craig Dean, Advisor in the Auditor General’s Office

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

116. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?

   a. Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds.
   b. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds.
   c. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds.
   d. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Since the 2003 audit report has been produced but is not publicly available we are marking this question as if the audit report was not released. However, some information on extra-budgetary fund audits is presented in the audits of Statutory Institutions and State Owned Enterprises, according to Mr. Craig Dean, Advisor in the Auditor General’s Office.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: The appropriate answer “d” has been given to this question. However, statutory authorities are not strictly speaking extra-budgetary, since they receive appropriations in the budget (see for example, Volume Two, Part Two which covers recurrent appropriations to statutory authorities). It is true however, that at present such authorities are able to raise their own income, and do not remit it back to consolidated revenue.

As such, information provided in statutory authorities should not be used as evidence that audits of extra-budgetary funds are made available. Nonetheless, the answer remains the same, “d.”
117. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have discretion in law to undertake those audits it may wish to?

   a. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
   b. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations.
   c. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations.
   d. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** The Auditor General’s Office has an unlimited mandate but is constrained by lack of resources according to Mr. Craig Dean, Advisor in the Auditor General’s Office

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

118. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?

   a. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
   b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
   c. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
   d. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** The SAI budget is submitted to the executive through the Prime Minister’s Office and the cabinet as a one line item, which undergoes minimum scrutiny. The SAI’s office is currently supported by Australian aid personnel, which is helping the SAI’s office perform its duties and improve its outcomes according to Mr. Craig Dean, Advisor in the Auditor General’s Office.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
119. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?

- a. Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized.
- b. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized.
- c. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized.
- d. No, audit reports are not scrutinized.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

*Citation and/or comment:* It is scrutinized by the Public Accounts Committee which was revived after the 2002 elections, according to Mr. Craig Dean, Advisor in the Auditor General’s Office.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

120. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?

- a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.
- b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings.
- c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings.
- d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

*Citation and/or comment:* The executive does not report publicly but Section 9 of the Public Finance Management Act (PMFA) requires an audit committee to be chaired by the Secretary for Finance and this should ensure that the recommendations of the Auditor General are implemented. According to Mr. Craig Dean, Advisor in the Auditor General’s Office.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** The answer is the correct one. However, it should be noted that follow-up on recommendations is a real issue, and the fact that the PFMA requires an audit committee to do this does not necessarily mean that it is done.
121. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?

a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations.
b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details.
d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify).
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: The Auditor General may raise the success or failure of actions taken in previous years at his discretion. The fact that audit reports have a backlog of more than two years limits the value of this exercise. According to Mr. Craig Dean, Advisor in the Auditor General’s Office.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

122. Are audit reports related to national security and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?

a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to national security and other secret programs.
b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details.
d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify).
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: These are a very small part of the PNG budget and are therefore are a low priority and special reports are not presented to Parliament.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: I think the correct interpretation of the score is that secret programs are not audited. I am not aware of any audits having been carried out on sensitive parts of the budget.

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: The evidence available suggests that this is correct; audit reports on secret programs are not provided to the legislature.