Open Budget Survey 2015

Timor-Leste

Section 1. Public Availability of Budget Docs. “Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents” contains a series of four tables that allow the researcher to examine and map the public availability and dissemination of its country’s key budget documents (i.e., Pre-Budget Statement, Executive’s Budget Proposal (EBP) and Supporting EBP Documents, Citizens Budget, Enacted Budget, In-Year Reports, Mid-Year Review, Year-End Report, and Audit Report), as well as any national laws regulating budget processes and financial management. Once filled in, these tables will serve as a foundation for the completion of the rest of the questionnaire, as researchers will reference the specific documents cited in the tables to answer the questions contained in Sections 2-5 of the questionnaire.

Table 1. Key Budget Documents

Timor-Leste

BUDGET DOCUMENT	Full Title	Fiscal Year the Budget Document Refers to	Date of Publication
Pre-Budget Statement	Not Published	2014	Not available
Executive's Budget Proposal (EBP)	Proposta Orsamentu Geral Estadu 2014 (2014 State Budget proposal)	2014	October 25, 2013

Supporting EBP Document	Livro (book) 2. Plano de Acção Anual- Annual Action Plan	2014	October 25, 2013
Supporting EBP Document	Livro 3. Distritus-Appropriation for the districts	2014	October 25, 2013
Supporting EBP Document	Livro 4. Rubricas Orcamentais-Expenditure line, Livro 5 for Development Partner and Livro 6 for Special Fund	2014	October 25, 2013
Enacted Budget	Orsamentu Geral Estadu 2014/ 2014 State Budget	2014	March 14, 2014
Citizens Budget (for EBP or Enacted Budget)	Matadalan ba Orsamentu	2014	April 24, 2014
In-Year Report	Relatório de Execução Orçamental para o Terceiro Trimestre - Budget Execution Report for Third Quarter	2013	October 2013
Additional in-year report	Ano Financeiro de 2014 Relatório de Execução Orçamental para o Primeiro Trimestre	2014	June 4, 2014
Additional in-year report	-	-	-
Mid-Year Review	Not published	2013	Not Published
Year-End Report	produced, but published for internal purposes only	2013	not available
Audit Report	Relatório e Parecer Sobre a Conta Geral do Estado de 2012- Report and Opinion on General State Account for 2012	2012	January 31, 2014

Sources: Based on Article 30 of Law No. 13/2009 on Timor-Leste Budget and Financial Management Law " The Government shall present to the National Parliament by the 15 October the draft Budget Law for the following financial year", unfortunately, the 2014 State Budget Proposal was presented to Parliament after ten days of the time limits for presentation. Law No. 13/2009: http://www.jornal.gov.tl/?mod=artigo&id=2255. First revision of the law was in 2011 for establishment of High Administrative, Tax and Audit Court at http://www.jornal.gov.tl/?mod=artigo&id=3605. And, the second revision was in 2013 at http://www.jornal.gov.tl/?mod=artigo&id=4333 Please see the Q1 2014 In-Year Report at https://www.mof.gov.tl/budget-execution-report-2014-1st-quarter/?lang=en

Comments: All of State Budget Books (1-6) are not separated , all of these are a packet when it submitted to Parliament After the Timor-Leste's 2014 State Budget Proposal is published in Ministry of Finance website, at the end of February, the Ministry took it out from it's website. Now, this budget proposal only available in La'o Hamutuk website at http://laohamutuk.org/econ/OGE14/13OGE14.htm The Timor-Leste's 2014 State Budget proposal was discussed by Parliament at second week of January due to Prime Minister attendance in Nelson Mandela's funeral ceremony, promulgated by President of the Republic at February, 3, 2014 (Even though the Timor-Leste's fiscal calendar is start from 1st January till December) The Year-End and the Fourth Quarterly reports are not required by Law to published after two months of the end of the period of the report, as these reports will including in Audit Report by High Administrative, Tax and Audit Court as stated on Article 45 of Budget and Financial Management Law. However, the public can accessed to the whole year budget execution for 2013 by each ministry or any state entity on Timor-Leste Transparency Portal, at http://www.budgettransparency.gov.tl/publicTransparency/transparencyNavigation;jsessionid=5C096C264F68D92292DCD38A03A48DD5?fiscalYearId=83&isInflow=false In addition, at the end of March 2014, the Ministry of Finance published the Timor-Leste's Quarterly Fiscal Bulletin October-December 2013 Chart of Account and the Quarterly Fiscal Bulletin October – December 2013 GOVERNMENT FINANCE STATISTICS (GFS) link to https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/COA_fiscal_bulletin_Q4_Publication.pdf, and https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Quarterly_Fiscal_Report_Q4_GFS_Publication.pdf Even the Bulletins only shows general Government expenditure but its provide few tables on fiscal position and a narrative report on Government expenditure. The Ministry of Finance just published Timor-Leste's Citizens Budget at April, 24, 2014 at https://www.mof.gov.tl/mata-dalan-ba-orsamentu-geral-2014/?lang=en The Q1 2014 In-Year Report was published after we sent a letter to MoF for asking to release this report. However, it already passed 4 days as it should published as required by Timor-Leste PFA

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Chamber of Audit (Câmara de Contas) reports on the annual government financial statements (Conta Geral do Estado) are also available online at http://www.tribunais.tl/ Following the amendment Law 3/2013 to Law 13/2009 on Budget and Financial Management, the Government is required to submit annual financial statements to the Chamber of Auditors seven months after the end of the financial year (article 45(1). The Chamber of Auditors is then required to submit its report on the annual government financial statements to Parliament before the end of the subsequent financial year (Law 9/2011, Article 29(4)). This report is also required to be published in the Jornal da Republica (article 7(1) of Law 9/2011) which ensures availability of the report for free online (www.jornal.gov.tl) or as a low cost hard copy. Note that the Jornal da Republica website has been restructured so the links provided above are no longer current. Laws referred to above can be found by searching on www.jornal.gov.tl under the following references: - Law 13/2009 on Budget and Financial Management - Law 9/2011 on the Organic Structure of the Chamber of Auditors (Camara de Contas) of the High Administrative Tax and Audit Court - Law 3/2013 on the First Amendment to Law No. 9/2011 approving the Organic Structure of the Chamber of Auditors of the High Administrative Tax and Audit Court and the Second Amendment to Law No. 13/2009 on Budget and Financial Management

Table 2a. Details about Availability

Timor-Leste

	Budget Documents Tick box if answer to the questions is “yes”			
	Pre-Budget Statement	Executive’s Budget Proposal	Enacted Budget	Citizens Budget
Is it produced at all?	○ Yes ◉ No	◉ Yes ○ No	◉ Yes ○ No	◉ Yes ○ No
Is it produced for internal purposes only?	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No
Is it published too late compared to the accepted timeframe?	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No
Is it available to the public in hard copy, with charge?	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No
Is it available to the public in hard copy, NO charge?	○ Yes ◉ No	◉ Yes ○ No	◉ Yes ○ No	◉ Yes ○ No
Is it available to the public in soft copy, with charge?	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No
Is it available to the public in soft copy, NO charge?	○ Yes ◉ No	◉ Yes ○ No	◉ Yes ○ No	◉ Yes ○ No
Is it available to the public online?	○ Yes ◉ No	◉ Yes ○ No	◉ Yes ○ No	○ Yes ◉ No
If available online, provide internet/URL address	Not Available	https://www.mof.gov.tl/category/documents-and-forms/budget-documents/proposed-budget/?lang=en	https://www.mof.gov.tl/category/documents-and-forms/budget-documents/2014-state-budget/?lang=en	https://www.mof.gov.tl/mata-dalan-ba-orsamentu-geral-2014/?lang=en
Is it machine readable? [only for electronic copies]	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No
Is there a “citizens version” of the budget document?	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No	◉ Yes ○ No	N/A

Sources: Article 11 of the Budget and Financial Management Law stated "The Government shall assure the publication of all documents necessary to assure the disclosure and transparency of the state budget and its execution and shall use, when appropriate, the most advanced forms of communications available for this purpose"

Comments: The Ministry Finance was published 2014 State Budget proposal in their website before took it out at the end of February, but La'o Hamutuk still post it in our website http://laohamutuk.org/econ/OGE14/13OGE14.htm The Official Gazette of Timor-Leste "Jornal da Republica", also published the 2014 Budget Law on paper and online. In paper format, it cost $0.25 till $2, but the price is depend on printing pages of the publication. See the online site at http://www.jornal.gov.tl/?mod=artigo&id=4414 The Timor-Leste's Ministry of Finance just published it Citizens Budget at https://www.mof.gov.tl/mata-dalan-ba-orsamentu-geral-2014/?lang=en Even though that some budget documents and laws are published online, the Timor-Leste's public access on internet is very low compared to other countries in the region.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: While the budget law, 6 budget books and citizens guide to the budget are all available online, there is a variation in the languages available. The Constitution specifies Portuguese and Tetum (most commonly spoken indigenous language) as the official national languages, with English and Indonesian identified as working languages. The Budget Law (along with the majority of legislation on www.jornal.gov.tl) is available online only in Portuguese. Of the Budget books, Book 1 Budget Overview - available in Tetum, Portuguese, English Book 2 Annual Action Plans - available in Portuguese only Book 3 Districts - available in Tetum only Book 4a and 4b Budget Line Items - available in Portuguese and English Book 5 Development Partners - available in Portuguese and English Book 6 Special Funds - available in Portuguese and English While Book 4 contains Ministry and line item titles, and therefore limited text; there is significant information in Budget Book 2 (Annual Action Plans) and Budget Book 6) Special Funds (including the Infrastructure Fund, Human Capital Development Fund and loans for infrastructure) which would be more accessible to the majority of the population if it were available in Tetum.

Table 2b. Details about Availability

Timor-Leste

	Budget Documents Tick box if answer to the questions is “yes”			
	In-Year Report	Mid-Year Review	Year-End Report	Audit Report
Is it produced at all?	(●) Yes ( ) No	( ) Yes (●) No	(●) Yes ( ) No	(●) Yes ( ) No
Is it produced for internal purposes only?	( ) Yes (●) No	( ) Yes (●) No	(●) Yes ( ) No	( ) Yes (●) No
Is it published too late compared to the accepted timeframe?	( ) Yes (●) No	( ) Yes (●) No	( ) Yes (●) No	( ) Yes (●) No
Is it available to the public in hard copy, with charge?	( ) Yes (●) No	( ) Yes (●) No	( ) Yes (●) No	( ) Yes (●) No
Is it available to the public in hard copy, NO charge?	(●) Yes ( ) No	( ) Yes (●) No	(●) Yes ( ) No	(●) Yes ( ) No

Is it available to the public in soft copy, with charge?	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No
Is it available to the public in soft copy, NO charge?	◉ Yes ○ No	◉ Yes ○ No	○ Yes ◉ No	◉ Yes ○ No
Is it available to the public online?	◉ Yes ○ No	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No	◉ Yes ○ No
If available online, provide internet/URL address	https://www.mof.gov.tl/budget-spending/budget-execution/?lang=en	-	-	http://www.jornal.gov.tl/?mod=artigo&id=4385
Is it machine readable? [only for electronic copies]	◉ Yes ○ No	○ Yes ◉ No	◉ Yes ○ No	○ Yes ◉ No
Is there a “citizens version” of the budget document?	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No	○ Yes ◉ No

Sources: No legal obligation for the Government to publish its mid year report, but only allowed for rectifying budget or mid year budget adjustment "when the circumstances so justify it". Article 34.1 of the Budget and Financial Management Law stated : "The Government may present alterations to the approved State Budget when the circumstances so justify it".

Comments: As no obligation for the Government to publish it Q4 report and End Year report, but we can accessed to the whole Government's annual expenditure in 2013 at http://www.budgettransparency.gov.tl/publicTransparency/transparencyNavigation;jsessionid=5C096C264F68D92292DCD38A03A48DD5?fiscalYearId=83&isInflow=false. In addition, Government also published their Fiscal Bulletin Quarterly October-December 2013 Chart Account at https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/COA_fiscal_bulletin_Q4_Publication.pdf, and the Fiscal Bulletin Quarterly report October-December 2013 Government Finance Statistic at https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Quarterly_Fiscal_Report_Q4_GFS_Publication.pdf Even the Audit report for 2012 Budget Execution is produced for their internal use, but the Court publish its report and opinion on 2012 State Account "RELATÓRIO E PARECER SOBRE A CONTA GERAL DO ESTADO DE 2012" at http://www.jornal.gov.tl/?mod=artigo&id=4385

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

Table 3. When Are the Key Budget Documents Made Available to the Public?

Timor-Leste

Pre-Budget Statement: When is the Pre-Budget Statement made available to the public?

○ 100. At least four months in advance of the budget year, and at least one month before the executive’s budget proposal is

introduced in the legislature

○ 67. At least two months, but less than four months, in advance of the budget year, and at least one month before the executive's budget proposal is introduced in the legislature

○ 33. Less than two months in advance of the budget year, but at least one month before the executive's budget proposal is introduced in the legislature

◉ 0. Does not release to the public, or is released less than one month before the executive's budget proposal is introduced to the legislature

Executive Budget Proposal: When is the Executive Budget Proposal made available to the public?

○ 100. At least three months in advance of the budget year, and in advance of the budget being approved by the legislature

◉ 67. At least two months, but less than three months, in advance of the budget year, and in advance of the budget being approved by the legislature

○ 33. Less than two months in advance of the budget year, but at least in advance of the budget being approved by the legislature

○ 0. Does not release to the public, or is released after the budget has been approved by the legislature

Enacted Budget: When is the Enacted Budget made available to the public?

○ 100. Two weeks or less after the budget has been enacted

○ 67. Between two weeks and six weeks after the budget has been enacted

◉ 33. More than six weeks, but less than three months, after the budget has been enacted

○ 0. Does not release to the public, or is released more than three months after the budget has been enacted

In-Year Report: When are In-Year Reports made available to the public?

○ 100. At least every month, and within one month of the period covered

◉ 67. At least every quarter, and within three months of the period covered

○ 33. At least semi-annually, and within three months of the period covered

○ 0. Does not release to the public

Mid-Year Review: How long after the mid-point in the fiscal year
(i.e., six months into the fiscal year) is the Mid-Year Review made available to the public?

○ 100. Six weeks or less after the mid-point

○ 67. Nine weeks or less, but more than six weeks, after the mid-point

○ 33. More than nine weeks, but less than three months, after the mid-point

◉ 0. Does not release to the public, or is released more than three months after the mid-point

Year-End Report: How long after the end of the budget year is the Year-End Report made available to the public?

○ 100. Six months or less after the end of the budget year

○ 67. Nine months or less, but more than 6 months, after the end of the budget year

○ 33. More than nine months, but within 12 months, after the end of the budget year

◉ 0. Does not release to the public, or is released more than 12 months after the end of the budget year

Audit Report: How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual
expenditures of national departments audited and released (except for secret programs)?

- ○ 100. Six months or less after the end of the budget year
- ○ 67. 12 months or less, but more than 6 months, after the end of the budget year
- ◉ 33. More than 12 months, but within 18 months, after the end of the budget year
- ○ 0. Does not release to the public, or is released more than 18 months after the end of the budget year

Sources: Article 44.2 of Budget and Financial Management Law on Quarterly Reports on Budget Execution stated " The time limit for delivering the reports indicated in the previous paragraph is two months after the end of the period covered by the reports."

Comments: Year End Report document is not published, but we can accessed to the whole budget expenditure on http://www.budgettransparency.gov.tl/publicTransparency/transparencyNavigation;jsessionid=5C096C264F68D92292DCD38A03A48DD5?fiscalYearId=83&isInflow=false

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

Table 4. General Questions

Timor-Leste

	YES/NO	If yes, additional information; If no, please note N/A in the text box.
Is there a website or web portal for government fiscal information?	◉ Yes ○ No	www. transparency.gov.tl
Is there a law (or laws) guiding public financial management?	◉ Yes ○ No	Law No 13/2009 of 21 October 2009
Are there additional laws regulating: • Access to information? • Transparency? • Citizens participation?	◉ Yes ○ No	Constitution of RDTL article 40 guarantee people right for information, as well as Article 6, for estate to protect the citizen rights

Sources: Article 40 of Constitution of RDTL : (Liberdade de expressão e informação) 1. Todas as pessoas têm direito à liberdade de expressão e ao direito de informar e ser informados com isenção. 2. O exercício da liberdade de expressão e de informação não pode ser limitado por qualquer tipo de censura. 3. O exercício dos direitos e liberdades referidos neste artigo é regulado por lei com base nos imperativos do respeito da Constituição e da dignidade da pessoa humana.

Comments: in addition to No 13/2009 of 21 October 2009 on Budget and Financial Management Law, Timor-Leste has a law for Chamber of Auditors of the Administrative, Fiscal, Auditors High Court, a Decree Law for Infrastructure Fund (http://www.jornal.gov.tl/?mod=artigo&id=3251), a Decree Law for Human Development Capital Fund

(http://www.jornal.gov.tl/?mod=artigo&id=3289) and a Decree Law for implementation small infrastructure project in the districts (http://www.jornal.gov.tl/?mod=artigo&id=3913)

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

Section 2. Comprehensiveness of the Executive's Budget Proposal

001. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?

A. Yes, administrative units accounting for all expenditures are presented.

B. Yes, administrative units accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented.

C. Yes, administrative units accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented.

D. No, expenditures are not presented by administrative unit.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: https://www.mof.gov.tl/category/documents-and-forms/budget-documents/proposed-budget/?lang=en When the Government submits its annual budget proposal, the budget packet must include all of the Government expenditures during the year classified by administrative unit. See Book 3 for budget allocations to the districts, Book 4 (A and B) for each Ministry or State Agency's expenditure, and Book 6 for Special Funds. A summary of administrative expenditure is provided in Table 3.3 Annex II, Book 1 (pages 72-88) https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131024_Budget_Book_1_PT_16.10.pdf

Comments: Constitution of RDTL article 145.2 "The Budget law shall provide, based on efficiency and effectiveness, a breakdown of the revenues and expenditures of the State, as well as preclude the existence of secret appropriations and funds". Article 23.1 of Budget and Financial Management Law "The Budget law shall provide, based on efficiency and effectiveness, a breakdown of the revenues and expenditures of the State, as well as preclude the existence of secret appropriations and funds. (http://www.jornal.gov.tl/?mod=artigo&id=2255)

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

002. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year by functional classification?

A. Yes, expenditures are presented by functional classification.

B. No, expenditures are not presented by functional classification.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

B.

Score: 0

Sources: https://www.mof.gov.tl/category/documents-and-forms/budget-documents/proposed-budget/?lang=en

Comments: EBP documents do not include a presentation of expenditure by functional classification.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

003. If the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation presents expenditures for the budget year by functional classification, is the functional classification compatible with international standards?

A. Yes, the functional classification is compatible with international standards.

B. No, the functional classification is not compatible with international standards, or expenditures are not presented by functional classification.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

B.

Score: 0

Sources: https://www.mof.gov.tl/category/documents-and-forms/budget-documents/proposed-budget/?lang=en

Comments: The EBP documents do not present expenditure by functional classification.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Suggested Answer: b.

Comments: Suggested answer b) Timor Leste budget documents do not present expenditure by functional classification

004. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year by economic classification?

A. Yes, expenditures are presented by economic classification.

B. No, expenditures are not presented by economic classification.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See, Table 2.4.2.1 in Section 2.4.2 on Timor-Leste Consolidate Fund, page 37 and 38 in Book 1 of the 2014 State Budget.

Comments: More detailed economic classification for each Ministry or Agency on Book 4A and Book 4B of the State Budget

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Economic classification broken down by Ministry and Directorate is also presented in the EBP (Budget Book 1) as Attachment II to the 2014 State Budget Law (p83 - 99)

005. If the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation presents expenditures for the budget year by economic classification, is the economic classification compatible with international standards?

A. Yes, the economic classification is compatible with international standards.

B. No, the economic classification is not compatible with international standards, or expenditures are not presented by economic classification.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: The Timor-Leste Budget economic classification is complied with IMF 2001 GFS Standard. RDTL Constitution Article 145.2 required that "The Budget law shall provide, based on efficiency and effectiveness, a breakdown of the revenues and expenditures of the State, as well as preclude the existence of secret appropriations and funds.

Comments: A case in 2008, the Court of Appeal ruled that Economic Stabilization Fund in the 2008 State Budget was unconstitutional as it contained no indication by the Government of the purposes for which this Fund was established. This is not allowed by Law, which requires a breakdown of expenditures or an explanation for what purposes the budget is spent for.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

006. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?

A. Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented.

B. Yes, programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented.

C. Yes, programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented.

D. No, expenditures are not presented by program.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

C.

Score: 33

Sources: See Book 6 of the 2014 State Budget. https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Budget_Book_6_ENGL.pdf

Comments: Only Special Funds are present expenditure for individual programs. Article 145.2. of the RDTL Constitution stated "The Budget law shall provide, based on efficiency and effectiveness, a breakdown of the revenues and expenditures of the State, as well as preclude the existence of secret appropriations and funds".

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

007. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditure estimates for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

A. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

B. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by two of the three expenditure classifications.

C. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by only one of the three expenditure classifications.

D. No, multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented by any expenditure classification.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

B.

Score: 67

Sources: See https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131024_Budget_Book_1_EN_16.10.pdf Attachment II, pages 66-82 (administrative and economic classification)

Comments: Article 22.3 (a) of TL PFA stated: " The planned expenditure appropriations and revenue estimates for the financial year include: a) The total revenues foreseen by the Government, as well as the expenses and resulting balances for the next two years;" As required by TL PFA Law to present expenditure estimates for a multi-year period, but in Timor-Leste 2014 State Budget, there is no expenditure estimate for functional classification. In practical, even though the Government making forecasting for next two years expenditure as required by the Law, the Government never meet its budget expenditure forecasting when the new fiscal year is come in. Sometimes the Government only put the number of forecasting cost to the several projects in the Budget, but at the end, these number doesn't meaning anything. For example, however TL already spent several million to the "South Coast Project" but no one is know how much the total cost to this project.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Attachment 2 of Budget book 1 provides the current year appropriations by administrative and economic category. There are no forward estimates in this section (page reference in current version of Budget Book 1 online at https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Budget-Book-1-ENGL.pdf is Attachment II 2014 State Budget Appropriations p83-99). Forward estimates by economic classification only are provided in Budget Book 1 in: - table 2.4.2.1 Expenditure by appropriation category, p 36 - table 2.4.2.5.1 PDID and other capital and development expenditure, p44 - table 2.4.3.1 Infrastructure Fund Expenditure by program, p46 - table 2.4.4.1 Human Capital Development Fund Expenditure by program, p49 Forward estimates by Administrative and Economic category are provided in Budget Book 4a and 4b (693 pages). These books provide the current budget year and four year forward estimates by by Ministry and Directorate of each economic classification (with sub categories). https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Budget-Book-4A-PORT.pdf Budget book 6 also provides forward estimates by program for multi-year projects under the two special funds (large capital projects and the programs under the human capital development fund). https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-

content/uploads/2014/03/Budget_Book_6_ENGL.pdf

008. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditure estimates for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year) by program?

A. Yes, multi-year estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures are presented.

B. Yes, multi-year estimates for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented.

C. Yes, multi-year estimates for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented.

D. No, multi-year estimates for programs are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

C.

Score: 33

Sources: See https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131024_Budget_Book_1_EN_16.10.pdf Tables on pages 32, 34, 35

Comments: Article 22.3(a) of Budget and Financial Management Law " The planned expenditure appropriations and revenue estimates for the financial year include: a) The total revenues foreseen by the Government, as well as the expenses and resulting balances for the next two years." Despite the requirement by TL PFA for Government to provide estimate budget expenditure for next two years, only Special Funds Budget show estimate expenditure by program.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: In addition to Budget Book 1, this information also available in Budget Book 6, Special Funds: - Table 2. Summary of 2014 IF Budget By Category, page 10 - Table 5101 – Infrastructure Fund, page 15 to 46 - Table 31. Human Capital Development Fund Budget for 2014, page 59-68 https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Budget_Book_6_ENGL.pdf Budget Book 1 available at: https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131024_Budget_Book_1_EN_16.10.pdf

009. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present the individual sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?

A. Yes, individual sources of tax revenue accounting for all tax revenue are presented.

B. Yes, individual sources of tax revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are presented.

C. Yes, individual sources of tax revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are presented.

D. No, individual sources of tax revenue are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See section 2.5 on revenues on 2014 State Budget Book 1, page 50-67. Also see Article 22 of Budget and Financial Management Law on Content of the State Budget

Comments: The Budget annual must be presented by Government to the Parliament with information on taxes and other revenues that Government collected during previous years, including estimated the future state income tax collection. an Overview in Book 1, the Government explain disaggregated the revenue that collected by the state.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

010. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present the individual sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of government-produced goods and services) for the budget year?

A. Yes, individual sources of non-tax revenue accounting for all non-tax revenue are presented.

B. Yes, individual sources of non-tax revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are presented.

C. Yes, individual sources of non-tax revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues are presented.

D. No, individual sources of non-tax revenue are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: TImor-Leste's 2014 State Budget Book 1, Page 54 Table 2.5.2.3.1 : Fees and Charges Projection. Also see Page 55, Table 2.5.2.5.1: Autonomous Agencies' Revenues

Comments: Grants for development partner can be accessed on TL State Budget Book 5. There are two types of the grant implementation, one is administrated with the Government and the another one is administrated outside the Government. Administrated outside the government is the grants that allocated to NGOs or sometimes implemented by the donor itself.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

011. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax) for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

A. Yes, multi-year estimates of revenue are presented by category.

B. No, multi-year estimates of revenue are not presented by category.

C. Not applicable/other (please

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See Timor-Leste 2014 State Budget page 50-72, Section 2.5 on Revenues.

Comments: The TL Budget and Financial Management Law, Article 22.3 (a) stated that The planned expenditure appropriations and revenue estimates for the financial year include: The total revenues foreseen by the Government, as well as the expenses and resulting balances for the next two years;

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

012. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates for individual sources of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

A. Yes, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented.

B. Yes, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue are presented.

C. Yes, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of revenue are presented.

D. No, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See citation in previous question

Comments: See comment on previous question too.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

013. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

A. Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

B. Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

C. Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

D. No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

B.

Score: 67

Sources: See TL State Budget Book 1 https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131024_Budget_Book_1_EN_16.10.pdf page 55, Section 2.6.3 on Loans

Comments: At present, the government's debt is formed by only two loans from ADB and World Bank. There is explanation on the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year as stated in the Article 5 of 2014 Budget Law, and the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year as the debt is based on the debt contract that Timor-Leste has signed with the creditors. We know how much the each debt's interest rate as it appears in the debt contract, but there is no information on interest payments in the 2014 budget year, also because the 2014 year is a part of the "grace period" of the

debt interest rate payment period from the TL Government to the creditors. Article 23.2 of the TL Budget and Financial Management Law on Content of State Budget and Mandatory Expenses stated that "Should the purpose of a budget appropriation be to pay an autonomous fund, it should indicate the amount attributed for capitalization, loans and expenses with the acquisition of goods or services. Article 5 of 2014 Budget Law Maximum Threshold of Authorized Debt 1. In order to meet the funding needs related with the construction of strategic infrastructures for the development of the Country, the Government is authorized, under article 20 of Law no.13/2009, of 21 October, as changed by Law no. 9/2011, of 17 August, Law no. 3/2013, of 7 August, on Budget and Financial Management, and article 3 of Law no. 13/2011, of 28 September, on the Public Debt Regime, to make use of external concessional loans up to a maximum amount of $270 million, with a maximum time frame of 40 years. 2. Subject to the provisions in the previous paragraph, funding from loans in 2014 may not exceed $31.1.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: b.

Comments: Budget Book 1 provides information on the new debt undertaken in the budget year and also explains that there are currently no interest repayment as both of the two loans undertaken have a grace period. Information is provided on interest rates that will apply after the grace period. This is sufficient to meet the information requirements on current debt serving costs; therefore two of the three estimates relating to Government debt and borrowing are presented in Budget Book 1 as per: - Section 2.6.3 Loans, p70 - Attachment II Budget Appropriation, p83 showing new appropriation and carry-over appropriation for loans https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131024_Budget_Book_1_EN_16.10.pdf There is additional narrative information in Budget Book 6, p4. https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Budget_Book_6_ENGL.pdf

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

I changed the answer to "b" but need to clarified that even there is no amount of interest but there is number of percentage for each debt that help us to know how much money to repay each year.

014. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year? (The core information must include interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)

A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the composition of the total debt outstanding.

B. Yes, the core information is presented for the composition of the total debt outstanding.

C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

D. No, information related to composition of total debt outstanding is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See TL Budget Book 1 https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131024_Budget_Book_1_EN_16.10.pdf page 56, Table 2.6.3.1 on Information on Signed Loan Agreements, and Table 2.6.3.2 on Total Loan Disbursement, 2014-2018 and the 2014 Budget Law.

Comments: At present, the government's debt is formed by only two loans from ADB and World Bank. Article 23.2 of the TL Budget and Financial Management Law on Content of State Budget and Mandatory Expenses stated that "Should the purpose of a budget appropriation be to pay an autonomous fund, it should indicate the amount attributed for capitalization, loans and expenses with the acquisition of goods or services. Article 5 of 2014 Budget Law Maximum Threshold of Authorized Debt 1. In order to meet the funding needs related with the construction of strategic infrastructures for the development of the Country, the Government is authorized, under article 20 of Law no.13/2009, of 21 October, as changed by Law no. 9/2011, of 17 August, Law no. 3/2013, of 7 August, on Budget and Financial Management, and article 3 of Law no. 13/2011, of 28 September, on the Public Debt Regime, to make use of external concessional loans up to a maximum amount of $270 million, with a maximum time frame of 40 years. 2. Subject to the provisions in the previous paragraph, funding from loans in 2014 may not exceed $31.1.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

015. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based? (The core information must include a discussion of the economic outlook with estimates of nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)

A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.

B. Yes, the core information is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.

C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

D. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See Timor-Leste 2014 State Budget Book 1, Page 20-34, Section 2.3 on Economic Overview

Comments: There is extensive information provided on GDP, GDP growth, inflation, employment, petroleum and agricultural

prices, etc. Article 22.2 (a) of the Budget and Financial Management Law said "The general information on the budget shall include: An internal and external macroeconomic study;

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

016. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget? (The core information must include estimates of the impact on expenditures, revenue, and debt of different assumptions for the inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)

A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented to show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget.

B. Yes, the core information is presented to show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget.

C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

D. No, information related to different macroeconomic assumptions is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

C.

Score: 33

Sources: Book 1, page 48ff https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131024_Budget_Book_1_EN_16.10.pdf

Comments: The EBP contains a sensitivity analysis of the impact of oil price fluctuations on Estimated Sustainable Income, which determines petroleum revenues financing the budget.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

017. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how new policy proposals, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?

A. Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect expenditures are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect expenditures are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, information that shows how some but not all new policy proposals affect expenditure is presented.

D. No, information that shows how new policy proposals affect expenditure is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See TL Budget Book 1 Section 2.4 on Expenditures.

Comments: Key new policy measures are discussed, and their overall budget implications included. Since 2013, the Government and the Opposition Party have agreed to set up an ad hoc committee in Parliament to assess Government proposals before being discussed in Plenary. This ad hoc Committee is making several alteration to the budget proposal, increasing allocations to some budget items as well as cutting several others.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: c.

Comments: Budget Book 1 provides information on key budget measures by economic category (Section 2.4 Expenditure). This includes information on the amount of funding in the current budget for the most significant measures in each category, but does not explicitly distinguish the impact of policy changes / new measures and any ongoing impact. The total cost in the current budget year for the measure is shown, rather than the impact of any change to the program (e.g. the marginal increase in costs for any policy change). The list of policy measures includes any item that make up a significant proportion of each economic category, so includes ongoing activities such as the contingency fund and government legal services. https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131024_Budget_Book_1_EN_16.10.pdf

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

I think "a" is correct since it has all the details in the sections listed.

018. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how new policy proposals, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?

A. Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect revenues are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect revenues are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, information that shows how some but not all new policy proposals affect revenues are presented.

D. No, information that shows how new policy proposals affect revenues is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See Timor-Leste Budget Book 1, Section 2.5 on Revenues, and sub section 2.5.3.1 on inflows of Petroleum Revenues.

Comments: Nearly 95% of the 2014 State Budget is financed from oil revenues based on Estimated Sustainable Income (ESI) which depends on oil price and oil reserves. In the 2014 State Budget, the ESI is calculated lower than was calculated for 2013 State Budget due to ConnocoPhilips projections that the Bayu-Undan field reserve will run out in the next six years. Therefore, current and projection of ESI and oil revenues are changed too.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: c.

Comments: The majority of Timor Leste's revenue is derived from petroleum resources. Budget Book 1 provides significant information on different projections of petroleum based revenue and its potential impact on financial sustainability. This includes providing detailed information on the investment strategy and returns on investment for petroleum wealth held in the Petroleum Fund (from page 51). Other than the investment strategy for petroleum wealth, the budget papers contain little discussion on how new policies affect revenue (see Section 2.5 Revenue which provides a narrative description of revenue categories and trends). Few domestic programs affect the existing petroleum revenue, however, the budget papers do not provide information on the potential revenue impact of Infrastructure projects such as supply bases which are linked to future natural resource projects. While programs are likely to have a larger effect on domestic revenue, this is also not detailed. For example, programs with domestic revenue impact such as purchase and subsidized sale of rice and local agricultural products or the installation of electricity meters are mentioned as having a revenue impact in a descriptive narrative but without costing information. It should be noted that domestic revenue is a very small component of government financing and there may be limited budget impact from this level of policy change.

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

the PR is correct that Book 1 doesn't show the whole "result' of PF investment return but we or public can free to accessed the 2014 PF investment strategy on Central Bank Report that available at http://www.bancocentral.tl/Download/Publications/Quarterly-Report38_en.pdf or see the other years report at http://www.bancocentral.tl/pf/Reports.asp The PR also correct that there is no detailed information on the potential revenue impact on infrastructure project on Petroleum clusters (supply base) as well as other projects but generally the Government show its analysis on future return from these project at Book 6 on part V. (The Importance of Infrastructures Fund Programs) see http://www.laohamutuk.org/econ/OGE14/final/BB6en.pdf However, the question is asking within the fiscal envelope how does the government plan on raising revenue to achieve these new policies which they have. The answer remains A.

019. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

A. Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

B. Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by two of the three expenditure classifications.

C. Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by only one of the three expenditure classifications.

D. No, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are not presented by any expenditure classification.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

B.

Score: 67

Sources: Article 145.2 of RDTL Constitution stated "The Budget law shall provide, based on efficiency and effectiveness, a breakdown of the revenues and expenditures of the State, as well as preclude the existence of secret appropriations and funds".

Comments: The 2014 Budget doesn't show Functional classification on the Government expenditure for the year preceding the Budget Year

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Budget book 1 provides a summary of BY-1 by economic classification in Table 2.4.2.1, expenditure by appropriation category, page 36. Budget Book 4a and 4b provide BY-1 by administrative and economic category (Ministry and Directorate level)

020. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

A. Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented for BY-1.

B. Yes, programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented for BY-1.

C. Yes, programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented for BY-1.

D. No, expenditures are not presented by program for BY-1.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

C.

Score: 33

Sources: Budget Book 1 https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131024_Budget_Book_1_EN_16.10.pdf Tables on pages 32, 34, 35.

Comments: Only the Special Funds in TL 2014 State Budget present Government expenditure by individual program for the year preceding the Budget Year. Article 145.2. of the RDTL Constitution stated "The Budget law shall provide, based on efficiency and effectiveness, a breakdown of the revenues and expenditures of the State, as well as preclude the existence of secret appropriations and funds".

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: In addition to Budget Book 1, this information also available in Budget Book 6, Special Funds: - Table 2. Summary of 2014 IF Budget By Category, page 10 - Table 5101 – Infrastructure Fund, page 15 to 46 https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Budget_Book_6_ENGL.pdf Budget Book 1 available at: https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131024_Budget_Book_1_EN_16.10.pdf

021. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, have expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditures?

A. Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 have been updated from the original enacted levels.

B. No, expenditure estimates for BY-1 have not been updated from the original enacted levels.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

B.

Score: 0

Sources: See 2014 Budget Book 1 https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131024_Budget_Book_1_EN_16.10.pdf

Comments: In most tables in the budget proposal, 2013 figures appear as "Budget", meaning they reflect original enacted estimates.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Budget Book 6 Special Funds provides both the enacted budget and estimated update of expenditure at end of financial year on a program basis for capital projects within the Infrastructure Fund (table 2.4.6, page 10) and Human Capital Development Fund programs (page 52).

022. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of expenditure for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

A. Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

B. Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by two of the three expenditure classifications.

C. Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by only one of the three expenditure classifications.

D. No, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are not presented by any expenditure classification.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

B.

Score: 67

Sources: See Budget Book 1: https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131024_Budget_Book_1_EN_16.10.pdf Tables on pages 5 and 25, for example. Budget Book 2: https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131022_Livro_2_Planos_Anuais_2014_GPM_FINAL_141013_edit_daftar_isi_15-10-2013-DNO181013.pdf Details of budgeted expenditure by ministry

Comments: Budget books include BY-2 actual spending by economic and administrative classification. Only functional classification is not presented in the Budget documents. The Timor-Leste Budget and Public Financial Management Law Article Article 22 Content of the State General Budget 2 – The general information on the budget shall include: a) An internal and external macroeconomic study; b) Short and medium term fiscal strategies; c) Budget objectives and priorities, including revenue and expenditure estimates; d) Budget deficit or surplus concerning the previous financial year, transported into the financial year corresponding to the State Budget Law; e) Detailed information on the funding of the budget deficit; f) Other information considered necessary for the transparency and clarification of the State General Budget Law.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Agree, with one point regarding clarification of references. Details of budget expenditure by Ministry is located in Budget Book 4a and 4b. https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Budget-Book-4A-PORT.pdf This includes a BY-2,

BY-1, BY and 4 years of forward estimates for each Ministry and Directorate by economic classification (including sub item breakdown). The Ministry of Finance has updated their web references. Therefore the tables referred to in Budget Book 1 can be found as follows: - Table 2.1.1.2: Fiscal Table with Memorandum Items, p16 - table 2.4.2.1 Expenditure by Appropriation category, p 36

023. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for more than one year preceding the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

A. Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented for BY-2 and prior years.

B. Yes, programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented for BY-2 and prior years.

C. Yes, programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented for BY-2 and prior years.

D. No, expenditures are not presented by program for BY-2 and prior years.

E. Not applicable/other (please

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: See Book 1 https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131024_Budget_Book_1_EN_16.10.pdf Tables on pages 32, 34, 35

Comments: Information on Special Funds, the only ones for which program classification is used, does not include estimates for BY-2 and previous years.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

024. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?

A. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).

B. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).

C. Before BY-3.

D. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See Budget Book 1, page 16, Table 2.1.1.2: Fiscal Table with Memorandum Items

Comments: Only in Budget Book 1 estimates reflect actual expenditure from 2010 till 2012. In other Books, more detailed actual expenditure figures only show 2012 actual estimates.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

025. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue by category (such as tax and non-tax) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

A. Yes, revenue estimates for BY-1 are presented by category.

B. No, revenue estimates for BY-1 are not presented by category.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See 2014 Budget Book 1, page 50-56 on Section 2.5 on Revenues

Comments: The information on Revenues only in Budget Book 1.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

026. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present individual sources of revenue for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

A. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented for BY-1.

B. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue for BY-1 are presented.

C. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues for BY-1 are presented.

D. No, individual sources of revenue are not presented for BY-1.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See Section 2.5 on Revenues at 2014 Budget Book 1. Also see Section 2.6 on Financing, which showing how much money from Estimated Sustainable Income from Petroleum Fund, borrowing and Cash Balance have come into 2014 State Budget

Comments: Loans and Cash Balance (unspent money from previous years) are revenues for State Budget. Article 20.4 on Public Debt of TL Budget and Financial Management Law stated "All revenues obtained under the present article shall be transferred to the Consolidated Fund of Timor-Leste, being available to fund State expenses according to the State Budget Law" .

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

027. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, have the original estimates of revenue for the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) been updated to reflect actual revenue collections?

A. Yes, revenue estimates for BY-1 have been updated from the original enacted levels.

B. No, revenue estimates for BY-1 have not been updated from the original enacted levels.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

B.

Score: 0

Sources: See TL 2014 State Budget Book 1, Page 36-41, Section 2.5: Revenues https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131024_Budget_Book_1_EN_16.10.pdf

Comments: The 2013 estimates of revenues in the 2014 budget proposal are based on the original enacted budget. TL PFA Article 22.3 (l) "Estimated cost of previous uncollected revenues, tax or customs benefits expressly foreseen by law, attributed

to services without administrative and financial autonomy and to autonomous services and funds by expenditure programs related with the activity covered by the tax or customs benefits;"

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Updated page references as the Ministry of Finance have updated their budget document. TL 2014 State Budget Book 1, Section 2.5: Revenues. Pages 50 - 69 Table 2.5.2.1.1: Domestic Revenue 2012 – 2018, page 51 https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Budget-Book-1-ENGL.pdf

028. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax) for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

A. Yes, revenue estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by category.

B. No, revenue estimates for BY-2 and prior years are not presented by category.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See 2014 State Budget Book 1, Page 50-56, Section 2.5: Revenues

Comments: Same comment as provided for previous question

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Budget Book 1, Table 2.5.2.1.1: Domestic Revenue 2012 – 2018, page 51 https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Budget-Book-1-ENGL.pdf

029. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present individual sources of revenue for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

A. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented for BY-2 and prior years.

B. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue are presented for BY-2 and

prior years.

C. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues are presented for BY-2 and prior years.

D. No, individual sources of revenue are not presented for BY-2 and prior years.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See 2014 State Budget Book 1, Page 50-56, Section 2.5: Revenues

Comments: The 2014 State Budget provided information on individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue for 2012 (actual) and 2013 (Based on 2013 enacted budget year)

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

030. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?

A. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).

B. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).

C. Before BY-3.

D. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See 2014 State Budget Book 1, Page 50-56, Section 2.5: Revenues

Comments: The most recent year which presented the actual revenues is 2012, and for 2013 is based on 2013 enacted budget

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Budget Book 1, Table 2.5.2.1.1: Domestic Revenue 2012 – 2018, page 51 https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Budget-Book-1-ENGL.pdf

031. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the year proceeding the budget year (BY-1)? (The core information must include the total debt outstanding at the end of BY-1; the amount of net new borrowing required during BY-1; interest payments on the debt; interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)

A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for government debt.

B. Yes, the core information is presented for government debt.

C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

D. No, information related to government debt is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

E.

Score: 0

Sources: See 2013 State Budget Book 1: https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131024_Budget_Book_1_EN_16.10.pdf Table 2.6.3.1: Information on Signed Loan Agreements, page 51. Also see Table 2.6.3.2: Projected Total Loan Financing 2014-2018.

Comments: In 2013, the Govt of Timor-Leste did not have any debt. While Loan Agreements had been signed, no resources had been drawn and spent. Government debt operations only started in 2014. Article 22. 4 of TL PFA – The information on assets and liabilities for a financial year includes: a) The investment strategy of the Government; b) Borrowings by and loans to the Government; c) Changes made to borrowings and loans under article 12 in the previous financial year; d) Borrowings by or loans to the Government; e) Setting an overall limit on guarantees and borrowings by the Government; f) Estimated amount of Government contingency liabilities that may be transferred into actual liabilities; g) Other information considered relevant by the Government.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

032. In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?

A. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).

B. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).

C. Before BY-3.

D. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See 2014 State Budget Book 1, Page 16, Section 2.1: Executive Summary (Table 2.1.1.2 : Fiscal Table With Memorandum Items

Comments: 2012 was the first year for TL to take loans from outside, however, so far there are no expenditure from loans that already contracted by the Government (but will see in 2014 expenditure reports)

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

033. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on extra-budgetary funds for at least the budget year? (The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the extra-budgetary fund; and complete income, expenditure, and financing data on a gross basis.)

A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all extra-budgetary funds.

B. Yes, the core information is presented for all extra-budgetary funds.

C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some extra-budgetary funds.

D. No, information related to extra-budgetary funds is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

E.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: Article 4 of Budget and Financial Management Law states that "The State Budget is unitary and covers all revenues and expenses of the services and bodies of the State which do not have administrative and financial autonomy, as well as of autonomous services and funds. RDTL Constitution Article 145.2 "The Budget law shall provide, based on efficiency and effectiveness, a breakdown of the revenues and expenditures of the State, as well as preclude the existence of secret appropriations and funds. It would be unconstitutional in Timor-Leste if the Government has another funds apart from the State Budget. In 2008, The Court decided unconstitutional from the Government plan to established an Economic Stabilization Fund, a fund that Government think to anticipate for any unexpected economic instability situation caused by global financial crisis. The Court ruled this fund as a secret fund which violated the Article 145.2 of the Constitution. It is therefore unclear whether the Petroleum Fund is an extra-budgetary fund or not. The 2010 PEFA assessment says yes, but the law does not seem to allow it. In 2012, the OBS did recognize it as an EBF, but all indicates that it does not work as such - ie its only disbursements are to the Budget.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

034. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present central government finances (both budgetary and extra-budgetary) on a consolidated basis for at least the budget year?

A. Yes, central government finances are presented on a consolidated basis.

B. No, central government finances are not presented on a consolidated basis.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

C.

Score: 0

Sources: Same answer as provided for previous question

Comments: No extra budget is allowed by RDTL Constitution as described in Article 145.2 The Budget law shall provide, based on efficiency and effectiveness, a breakdown of the revenues and expenditures of the State, as well as preclude the existence of secret appropriations and funds.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

035. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of intergovernmental transfers for at least the budget year?

A. Yes, estimates of all intergovernmental transfers are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates of all intergovernmental transfers are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, estimates of some but not all intergovernmental transfers are presented.

D. No, estimates of intergovernmental transfers are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

E.

Score: 0

Sources: See Budget 4A-B on Budget for all ministry, Book 3 for District allocation and Book 6 for Special Fund

Comments: Currently, TL administration still centralized, so all of expenditures for district level depend on central government support. There is a budget allocation for districts for infrastructure in Book 3 with a narrative explanation as a summary for districts expenditure, summary for districts statistical, district budget and its profile and others.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: e.

Comments: As outlined above, Timor Leste currently only has one level of Government. Information is provided on expenditure and programs targeting, or implemented in rural areas (presented by District) in Budget Book 3. All such programs and activities are implemented under the management of the Central national government and should not be categories as intergovernmental transfers. The Government is currently working on a decentralisation policy which will create a municipal level government, with the first elections originally proposed for 2016 in the 2011-2030 Strategic Development Plan.

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

the Answer "a" was related to central Government policy to transfer money for each village "suco" for National Program for Suco Development (PNDS) as stated in the Book 3. But as the PR said, I move the answer to "e" as inter-governmental is not yet exist in Timor-Leste

036. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present alternative displays of expenditures (such as by gender, by age, by income, or by region) to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens, for at least the budget year?

A. Yes, at least three alternative displays of expenditures are presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.

B. Yes, two alternative displays of expenditures are presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.

C. Yes, one alternative display of expenditures is presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.

D. No, alternative displays of expenditures are not presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Only general overviews on Millennium Development Goals which related to gender, poverty and health issues, but no information is provided to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of Citizens.

Comments: Only 2010 State Budget had an attachment with Government Statement on Gender

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: c.

Comments: Budget Book 3 on District Expenditure shows how selected program expenditures are distributed across the 13 Districts. Information includes allocation of Government staff in rural areas (e.g. police, teachers, health practitioners), number of beneficiaries of the various government pensions and subsidies (e.g. old age, veterans pensions) and allocations provided under the Suco (Village) development program and District Development Program for small scale infrastructure. Budget Book 3 also identifies development partner programs by district. https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131022_2014_BB3-TT.pdf

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

The Book 3 only show how many the number of the public servant for each district and the amount money allocated to each district on Integrated Decentralized Development in District (PDID)and National Program for Suco Development (PNDS) which targeting to build small infrastructure project in district and suco level. No gender disaggregated data has provided in the Book 3, even in other budget documents. 2010 State Budget was the latest budget document has show gender statement. There is no special analysis in the 2014 budget proposal. The answer remains D.

037. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of transfers to public corporations for at least the budget year?

A. Yes, estimates of all transfers to public corporations are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates of all transfers to public corporations are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, estimates of some but not all transfers to public corporations are presented.

D. No, estimates of transfers to public corporations are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

C.

Score: 33

Sources: See 2014 Budget Book 4-B, page 318 (SAMES - Ministry of Health) See 2014 Budget Book 4-B page 582 (RTTL,EP) (National Radio and Television) See 2014 Budget Book 4-B page 507 (CIVIL AVIATION AUTHORITY OF TIMOR LESTE)/under Ministry og Public Works See 2014 Budget Book 4-B page 509 (PORT AUTHORITY OF TIMOR-LESTE (AUTONOMOUS FUND) See 2014 Budget Book 4-B page 566 (Public Transfer from Ministry Petroleum and Mineral Resources) See 2014 Budget Book 4-B page 488 (EDTL - Electricity)/under Ministry og Public Works See 2014 Budget Book 4-B page 489 (PUBLIC INSTITUTE OF EQUIPMENT MANAGEMENT)/under Ministry og Public Works

Comments: Book 4-B includes details of some transfers, but with no narrative discussion. Transfers to the National Oil Company, TimorGAP, EP, National Petroleum Authority and Institute for Petroleum and Geologist are allocated through the budget of the Ministry of Petroleum and Mineral Resources, under Public Transfer Category. The detailed expenditures of these agencies are not in the State Budget but are available in their annual reports.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

038. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on quasi-fiscal activities for at least the budget year? (The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the quasi-fiscal activity and the intended beneficiaries.)

A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all quasi-fiscal activities.

B. Yes, the core information is presented for all quasi-fiscal activities.

C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some quasi-fiscal activities.

D. No, information related to quasi-fiscal activities is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: It is not clear to what extent QFAs exist in TL, but there is no information in the budget proposal. Article 22.4 of PFA stated the contain of State Budget must include "The information on assets and liabilities for a financial year includes: a) The investment strategy of the Government; b) Borrowings by and loans to the Government; c) Changes made to borrowings and loans under article 12 in the previous financial year; d) Borrowings by or loans to the Government; e) Setting an overall limit on guarantees and borrowings by the Government; f) Estimated amount of Government contingency liabilities that may be transferred into actual liabilities; g) Other information considered relevant by the Government.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

039. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government? (The core information must include a listing of the assets, and an estimate of their value.)

A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all financial assets.

B. Yes, the core information is presented for all financial assets.

C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some financial assets.

D. No, information related to financial assets is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: Information on financial assets related to the TL Petroleum Fund asset can be found on the Central Bank website

(http://www.bancocentral.tl/pf/main.asp), where quarterly and annual PF reports can also be found. Information on financial assets however is not included in the EBP and supporting documents

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

040. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on nonfinancial assets held by the government? (The core information must include a listing of the assets by category.)

A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all nonfinancial assets.

B. Yes, the core information is presented for all nonfinancial assets.

C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some nonfinancial assets.

D. No, information related to nonfinancial assets is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Even the Government has an agency which controlled all state non financial assets (DIRECTORATE OF GOVERNMENT ASSETS under Ministry of Finance but, there is no information is provided on state non financial assets in the TL 2014 State Budget.

Comments: Article 12.2 (e) of Public and Financial Management Law stated "The following revenues are considered public monies: e) Revenues from the location of movable or immovable assets; Article 22.1 (c) of PFA " The State General Budget contains, in relation to the period it concerns: c) Information on assets and liabilities.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

041. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of expenditure arrears for at least the budget year?

A. Yes, estimates of all expenditure arrears are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates of all expenditure arrears are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, estimates of some but not all expenditure arrears are presented.

D. No, estimates of expenditure arrears are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: In principle, the law does not allow Government agencies to have arrears. The 2010 PEFA assessment confirms that arrears are low, but also that there is a lack of information on their real status. No information on arrears is included in the EBP and supporting documents.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Repeat PEFA Assessment 2013 – Timor-Leste confirms there is no definition of expenditure arrears and no process to record and monitor the stock of arrears, but the adoption of the IPSAS Cash Basis for the Government accounting, controlling commitments and authorizing purchase beyond the 15th of November prevents the building of expenditure arrears. Page 9 www.pefa.org/en/assessment/files/1473/rpt/10186

042. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities, such as government loan guarantees or insurance programs? (The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each contingent liability; the new guarantees or insurance commitments proposed for the budget year; and the total amount of outstanding guarantees or insurance commitments (the gross exposure) at the end of the budget year.)

A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all contingent liabilities.

B. Yes, the core information is presented for all contingent liabilities.

C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some contingent liabilities.

D. No, information related to contingent liabilities is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Even-though the PFA Article 22.1.(c) stated that Budget contains information on liabilities, but there is no information on that in 2014 Budget as The Minister of Finance is the only authority for lending or borrowing on behalf of the State, and: a) Represents the Government in all lending or borrowing agreements; b) Maintains the original documents and records regarding all lending or borrowing agreements, including guarantees and contingency obligations. (Article 20.3 of PFA)

Comments: Even no information related to liabilities on loans in State Budget document, but Article 20: Encumbrances on the Assets of the Petroleum Fund stated: 1. Any amount that is invested in accordance with Articles 14 and 15 is, independently of the form which is invested, the property of the State of Timor-Leste. 2. By contract or agreement it is possible to encumber the assets of the Petroleum Fund, up to 10% of the total value of the Petroleum Fund as of the date of the creation of the encumbrance or charge, provided that the principles in the general system of creation, issuance and management of public debt are respected.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: No information on contingent liabilities despite the existence of state owned enterprises such as Timor Gap, the national oil company.

043. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present projections that assess the government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term? (The core information must cover a period of at least 10 years and include the macroeconomic and demographic assumptions used and a discussion of the fiscal implications and risks highlighted by the projections.)

A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented to assess the government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term.

B. Yes, the core information is presented to assess the government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term.

C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

D. No, information related to future liabilities and the sustainability of finances over the longer term is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

C.

Score: 33

Sources: See Budget Book 1, page 59 Table 2.5.3.1.2 Sustainable income calculation and page 57 on oil production "The production forecast of liquids (condensate and LPG) for Bayu-Undan has been significantly revised down compared with the 2013 Budget. Total petroleum production from Bayu-Undan (also including LNG) is estimated to have peaked in 2011 at 59 million barrels of oil equivalents and is now set to decline before ceasing in 2020"

Comments: Although the information included in budget documents as such is not about liabilities per se, it is very important for fiscal sustainability, and covers some of the core elements, such 10+ year projections.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

044. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?

A. Yes, estimates of all sources of donor assistance are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates of all sources of donor assistance are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, estimates of some but not all sources of donor assistance are presented.

D. No, estimates of the sources of donor assistance are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See 2014 Budget Book 5 on Development Partners

Comments: Since 2008, all of Consolidate Funds of Timor-Leste (all of the State Budget) are financed by TL's own resources. Donor money is all categorized as a combined Fund, though projects can be administered by the Government or NGOs, or implemented by the donor itself.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

045. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on tax expenditures for at least the budget year? (The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each tax expenditure, the intended beneficiaries, and an estimate of the revenue foregone.)

A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all tax expenditures.

B. Yes, the core information is presented for all tax expenditures.

C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some tax expenditures.

D. No, information related to tax expenditures is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: No information on tax expenditures is available in the EBP and supporting documents.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

046. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of earmarked revenues?

A. Yes, estimates of all earmarked revenues are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates of all earmarked revenues are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, estimates of some but not all earmarked revenues are presented.

D. No, estimates of earmarked revenues are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

E.

Score: 0

Sources: As referred in Article 6 of the TL Budget Law, "The product of any head of revenue cannot be allocated for covering pre-identified expenses".

Comments: Only some National Petroleum Authority expenses are paid directly from the oil company's services fees which are not included in the State Budget.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

047. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on how the proposed budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to government's policy goals for the budget year?

A. Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for the budget year are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for the budget year are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, information that shows how the proposed budget is linked to some but not all of the government's policy goals for the budget year is presented.

D. No, information on the link between the budget and the government's stated policy goals for the budget year is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

C.

Score: 33

Sources: See 2014 Budget Book 1 part 2..1.3 on Expenditure "The Government considers these expenditures to be in accordance with the goals and policies stated in the Strategic Development Plan (SDP)". Also see Budget Book 2 on Government Annual Action Plan.

Comments: The budget proposal is prepared by each ministry which is responsible for its program. The SDP provides the basis and goals for them to achieve in next 20 years. For example, South Coast Project is part of SDP goal and others large projects such as electricity projects, roads and others, except ZEESM (Special Economic and Social Market Zone) which are not mentioned in the Government's SDP.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: There are some links between budget measures and the Strategic Development Plan. The information is limited to brief narrative statements identifying consistent programs. For example: Eg: Budget Book 1, p33: "Table 2.4.3.1 shows the distribution of Infrastructure Fund expenditure across different programs. The largest three programs (excluding loans) in terms of budgeted expenditure are Electricity, Roads and the Tasi Mane project which account for 15.3%, 13.5% and 12.6% of total expenditure respectively. This distribution of expenditure is in line with the Government's policies as stated in the SDP and program of Government which strongly emphasize the importance of these sectors to the development of Timor-Leste." Eg 2: Budget Book 1, page 55, section 2.6.3 regarding the projects funded by loans. "Two loans ... (details shown in Table 2.6.3.1) ... both feature in the Strategic Development Plan, which aims to rehabilitate all key arterial roads by 2017" https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131024_Budget_Book_1_EN_16.10.pdf Some links are made for infrastructure projects in Budget Book 6: Special Funds which contains some information on the major infrastructure projects/programs which are linked to the goals set out in the Government's Strategic Development Plan. Eg page 3; "These programmes are in line with the National Strategic Development Program and government priorities" https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Budget_Book_6_ENGL.pdf Budget Book 2: Annual Action Plans provides information on individual Ministry annual plans, with some Ministries providing clear information on how activities link to the Strategic Development Plan. Eg Ministry of Finance, page 167. (portuguese language only) https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/04/PORTUGUESE-Livro-2-Planos-Anuais-2013-Versão-FINAL-25.3.2013-LOS.pdf

048. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on how the proposed budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to government's policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

A. Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for a multi-year period are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for a multi-year period are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, information that shows how the proposed budget is linked to some but not all of the government's policy goals for a multi-year period is presented.

D. No, information on the link between the budget and the government's stated policy goals for a multi-year period is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

C.

Score: 33

Sources: See 2014 Budget Book 2 on Annual Action Plans of the Government

Comments: Government programs are divided into two types,: (a) yearly programs, mostly related to small infrastructure projects, and (b) multi-annual projects, related to large infrastructure projects. Information on Special Funds in Book 6 reflects

multi-year projects.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: There is limited information in the Budget Books on how individual programs link with the goals of the Strategic Development Plan. The information is limited to brief narrative statements identifying consistent programs. For example: Budget Book 6: Special Funds contains some information that links the major infrastructure projects/programs with the goals set out in the Government's Strategic Development Plan. Eg page 3; "These programmes are in line with the National Strategic Development Program and government priorities" https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Budget_Book_6_ENGL.pdf Budget Book 1 also provides some explanation of major infrastructure projects that are consistent with the Strategic Development Plan. Eg 1: Budget Book 1, p33: "Table 2.4.3.1 shows the distribution of Infrastructure Fund expenditure across different programs. The largest three programs (excluding loans) in terms of budgeted expenditure are Electricity, Roads and the Tasi Mane project which account for 15.3%, 13.5% and 12.6% of total expenditure respectively. This distribution of expenditure is in line with the Government's policies as stated in the SDP and program of Government which strongly emphasize the importance of these sectors to the development of Timor-Leste." Eg 2, Budget Book 1, page 55, section 2.6.3 regarding the projects funded by loans. "Two loans ... (details shown in Table 2.6.3.1) ... both feature in the Strategic Development Plan, which aims to rehabilitate all key arterial roads by 2017" https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131024_Budget_Book_1_EN_16.10.pdf Budget Book 2: Annual Action Plans only provides information on on annual plans (i.e. for the current budget year). It does not describe multi-year activities.

049. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired for at least the budget year?

A. Yes, nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired are provided for each program within all administrative units (or functions).

B. Yes, nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired are presented for all administrative units (or functions) but not for all (or any) programs.

C. Yes, nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired are presented for some programs and/or some administrative units (or functions).

D. No, nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

B.

Score: 67

Sources: See 2014 Budget Book 2 on Annual Action Plans and 3 on District Budget allocations (only available in Tetum)

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: d.

Comments: Budget Book 2 Annual Action Plans provides information on the objectives, activities and results sought by administrative unit. While the results section provides some information on outputs and outcomes, the document does not provide information on non financial inputs to be acquired. https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/04/PORTUGUESE-Livro-2-Planos-Anuais-2013-Versão-FINAL-25.3.2013-LOS.pdf Budget Book 3 of District Budget allocations provides information on some administrative unit resources at district level (such as teachers), but not inputs to be acquired. https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/04/TETUM-Book-3-FINAL-141212-Versaun-FINAL.pdf

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

I maintain my answer as "b" as PR comment, as well as of my new finding in Government Annual Plans in Book 2 that there is a summary explaining some non financial data on input to be acquired for long term (almost till 2017). For example, in education sector, in 2017 the Government aimed to build 250 new school for "kindergarten", established 5 new vocational school in district, 4 tertiary school and 65 community Center for learning in each sub district. But other sector as Security, doesn't presented. And, Foreign Affairs, including social inclusion, Social Communication sectors are so limited and not presented. see http://www.laohamutuk.org/econ/OGE14/fina

050. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present nonfinancial data on results (in terms of outputs or outcomes) for at least the budget year?

A. Yes, nonfinancial data on results are provided for each program within all administrative units (or functions).

B. Yes, nonfinancial data on results are presented for all administrative units (or functions) but not for all (or any) programs.

C. Yes, nonfinancial data on results are presented for some programs and/or some administrative units (or functions).

D. No, nonfinancial data on results are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

B.

Score: 67

Sources: See 2014 Budget Book 2 on Government's annual action plan.

Comments: Book 2 presents expected results by Ministry. Most of the Government expenditure results only are in the Government Portal which (government claimed) shows outcomes information for the most important Government targets, projects and programs. See http://www.governmentresults.gov.tl/publicResults/index?&lang=pt.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Budget Book 2 Annual Action Plans provides information on the objectives, activities and results sought by administrative unit. https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/04/PORTUGUESE-Livro-2-Planos-Anuais-2013-Versão-

FINAL-25.3.2013-LOS.pdf

051. Are performance targets assigned to nonfinancial data on results in the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation?

A. Yes, performance targets are assigned to all nonfinancial data on results.

B. Yes, performance targets are assigned to most nonfinancial data on results.

C. Yes, performance targets are assigned to some nonfinancial data on results.

D. No, performance targets are not assigned to nonfinancial data on results, or the budget does not present nonfinancial data on results.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

C.

Score: 33

Sources: See 2014 Budget Book 2 on Government's annual action plan

Comments: Some of the nonfinancial data on results have associated targets. Most of the Government expenditure results only are in the Government Portal which (government claimed) shows outcomes information for the most important Government targets, projects and programs. See http://www.governmentresults.gov.tl/publicResults/index?&lang=pt.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: For example, the Secretary of State for Training and Employment, page 108-119 https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/04/PORTUGUESE-Livro-2-Planos-Anuais-2013-Versão-FINAL-25.3.2013-LOS.pdf Available online in portuguese only.

052. Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of policies (both new proposals and existing policies) that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations in at least the budget year?

A. Yes, estimates of all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates of all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are

presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, estimates of some but not all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are presented.

D. No, estimates of policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

C.

Score: 33

Sources: Budget Book 1, Page 39, on Public Transfer "Policy Measures" : $136.8 million to the Ministry of Social Solidarity for payments to veterans, the elderly, the 'Bolsa de Mae' program for single mothers and for natural disasters. The Government believes it is important to reward those citizens who have served Timor-Leste in the past, and to provide support for those who may need it today.

Comments: Also, allocations in Book 3 show budgets to build infrastructure in rural areas. However, there are many allocations that are not intended to benefit impoverishment people, but only benefit few people.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

053. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the Ministry of Finance or whatever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?

A. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public.

B. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded.

C. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details.

D. No, a timetable is not issued to the public.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: No timetable is released by the Government. The process for budget formulation is available to Government officials only.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

Section 3. Comprehensiveness of Other Key Budget Documents

054. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based? (The core information must include a discussion of the economic outlook with estimates of nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)

A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.

B. Yes, the core information is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.

C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

D. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: The Government does not produce a Pre-Budget Statement.

Comments: There is a document called "Envelope Fiscal" which is approved by the Council of Ministers as a document setting annual budget ceilings. However, as the document is not published, we are not sure if this document can be considered as a Pre-Budget Statement.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

Suggested Answer: e.

055. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the government's expenditure policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget? (The core information must include a discussion of expenditure policies and priorities and an estimate of total expenditures.)

A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the government's expenditure policies and priorities.

B. Yes, the core information is presented for the government's expenditure policies and priorities.

C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

D. No, information related to the government's expenditure policies and priorities is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: The Government does not produce a Pre-Budget Statement.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

Suggested Answer: e.

056. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the government's revenue policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget? (The core information must include a discussion of revenue policies and priorities and an estimate of total revenues.)

A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the government's revenue policies and priorities.

B. Yes, the core information is presented for the government's revenue policies and priorities.

C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

D. No, information related to the government's revenue policies and priorities is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: The Government does not produce a Pre-Budget Statement.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

Suggested Answer: e.

057. Does Pre-Budget Statement present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

A. Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

B. Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

C. Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

D. No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: The Government does not produce a Pre-Budget Statement.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

058. Does the Pre-Budget Statement present estimates of total expenditures for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

A. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented.

B. No, multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

B.

Score: 0

Sources: The Government does not produce a Pre-Budget Statement.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

059. Does the Enacted Budget present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

A. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

B. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by two of the three expenditure classifications.

C. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by only one of the three expenditure classifications.

D. No, the Enacted Budget does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

B.

Score: 67

Sources: 2014 Budget Book 3, 4A-B and Book 6.

Comments: There is no expenditure estimate by functional classification. The Book 6 is showing expenditure estimate by program classification, the Book 4 is more on administrative unit classification

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Reference links: Budget book 1: https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Budget-Book-1-ENGL.pdf - Table 2.4.2.1 Expenditure by Appropriation Category, page 36 -Attachment 2 2014 Budget Appropriation, p89 Budget book 4a/4b: https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Budget-Book-4A-PORT.pdf https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Budget-Book-4B-PORT.pdf -entire document, information broken down by administrative unit (ministry/directorate) and economic classification (down to sub unit) Budget book 6: https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Budget_Book_6_ENGL.pdf - Table 2. Summary of 2014 IF Budget By Category, p10 - Table 3. Human

Capital Development Fund Transit and Allocation Budget for 2013, p52

060. Does the Enacted Budget present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

A. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures.

B. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents estimates for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.

C. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents estimates for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures.

D. No, the Enacted Budget does not present expenditure estimates by program.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

C.

Score: 33

Sources: See Book 6

Comments: Book 6 contains information on Special Funds for infrastructure and Human Capital Development. These represent less than half of total spending.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

061. Does the Enacted Budget present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

A. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents revenue estimates by category.

B. No, the Enacted Budget does not present revenue estimates by category.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: 2014 Budget Book 1, Section 2.5. Revenues, page 50-66

Comments: Tax or non-tax or other revenues are included in the State Budget as required by Timor-Leste PFA article 22 on Content of the State Budget

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Reference link: Budget book 1: https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Budget-Book-1-ENGL.pdf Section 2.5 Revenue, page 50 - 69

062. Does the Enacted Budget present individual sources of revenue?

A. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.

B. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue.

C. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues.

D. No, the Enacted Budget does not present individual sources of revenue.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: 2014 Budget Book 1 Section 2.5 Revenues, page 50-66

Comments: As required in TL PFA Article 22, the Budget includes all of the budget sources and its projections. In the 2014 State Budget there are three main revenue sources for the state budget: Domestic Revenues, composed by taxes, fees and charges, autonomous agencies' revenues, and other revenue streams. The other two sources are Oil Revenues and Unspent Budget from the previous year.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

063. Does the Enacted Budget present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

A. Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

B. Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

C. Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

D. No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: 2014 Budget Book 1, Sub Section 2.6.3 Loan, page 71-72

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Reference links: Budget book 1: https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Budget-Book-1-ENGL.pdf Sb section 2.6.3: Loans, page 71 Also: Budget book 6: https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Budget_Book_6_ENGL.pdf Page 4.

064. What information is provided in the Citizens Budget? (The core information must include expenditure and revenue totals, the main policy initiatives in the budget, the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget is based, and contact information for follow-up by citizens.)

A. The Citizens Budget provides information beyond the core elements.

B. The Citizens Budget provides the core information.

C. The Citizens Budget provides information, but it excludes some core elements.

D. The Citizens Budget is not published.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: 2014 Citizens Budget (Matadalan ba Orsamentu 2014) Information can be found on page 5 on how much the Government will spend during 2014, page 13-15 on new policies taken by the government in implementing the 2014 budget, page 16 on economic impact and page 7 on donor assistance.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

065. How is the Citizens Budget disseminated to the public?

A. A Citizens Budget is disseminated widely through a combination of at least three different appropriate tools and media (such as the Internet, billboards, radio programs, newspapers, etc.).

B. A Citizens Budget is published by using at least two, but less than three, means of dissemination, but no other dissemination efforts are undertaken by the executive.

C. A Citizens Budget is disseminated only by using one means of dissemination.

D. A Citizens Budget is not published.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

C.

Score: 33

Sources: The Citizens Budget is only available on the Ministry of Finance's website: https://www.mof.gov.tl/mata-dalan-ba-orsamentu-geral-2014/?lang=en

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Also available in English, Portuguese and Tetum. English document online at: https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2012/03/A_Citizens_Guide_to_the_Budget_2012_Final_21_march_2012_English-Signed.pdf

066. Has the executive established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information prior to publishing the Citizens Budget?

A. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget, and these mechanisms are accessible and widely used by the public.

B. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget; while these mechanisms are accessible they are not widely used by the public.

C. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget, but these mechanisms are not accessible.

D. No, the executive has not established any mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: There are no consultations held by the Government to consult the public on the Citizens Budget. Article 40.1 of RDTL Constitution states that every person has the right to freedom of speech and the right to inform and be informed impartially.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

067. Are “citizens” versions of budget documents published throughout the budget process?

A. A citizens version of budget documents is published for each of the four stages of the budget process (budget formulation, enactment, execution, and audit).

B. A citizens version of budget documents is published for at least two of the four stages of the budget process.

C. A citizens version of budget documents is published for at least one stage of the budget process.

D. No citizens version of budget documents is published.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

C.

Score: 33

Sources: https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/06/2PRINT_Matadalan_Orcamentu_2013_25_June_2013_Final.pdf Citizens Budget or "Orsamentu Sidadania"

Comments: The only Citizens Budget refers to the Enacted Budget.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Available in English, Portuguese and Tetum: English version at: https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2012/03/A_Citizens_Guide_to_the_Budget_2012_Final_21_march_2012_English-Signed.pdf

068. Do the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

A. Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

B. Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by two of the three expenditure classifications.

C. Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by only one of the three expenditure classifications.

D. No, the In-Year Reports do not present actual expenditures by any expenditure classification.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See the in Year Report Q1 for 2014 at https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/06/Relatorio_Primeiro_Trimestre%20_Q1_2014.pdf

Comments: Economic classification: Tabela 3 on page 6 Functional classification: Declaração 3 on page 16 Administrative classification: Declaração 4 on pages 17ff

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

069. Do the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for individual programs?

A. Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for programs accounting for all expenditures.

B. Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.

C. Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures.

D. No, the In-Year Reports do not present actual expenditures by program.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

C.

Score: 33

Sources: see the Q1-2014 report at https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/06/Relatorio_Primeiro_Trimestre%20_Q1_2014.pdf

Comments: Only expenditure for Special funds are presenting actual expenditure for individual program

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

070. Do the In-Year Reports compare actual year-to-date expenditures with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

A. Yes, comparisons are made for expenditures presented in the In-Year Reports.

B. No, comparisons are not made for expenditures presented in the In-Year Reports.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: see Q1-2014 Report page 17 on Declaracao 4 - Despesas por Ministerios (Ministries Expenditures)

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: A comparison with actual expenditures for the same period in the previous year is provided in Declaration 2 - Expenses per item, whole of Government, first trimester 2014 financial year on page 15. (Declaração 2 - Despesas por Itens - Todo o Governo 1 º Trimestre de Ano Fiscal de 2014) https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/06/Relatorio_Primeiro_Trimestre%20_Q1_2014.pdf Summary information is also provided on page 6 in the table on Budget Execution for the whole Govenrment (Execução Orçamental para todo o governo). Ministry level data from page 17 onwards does not provide this comparison.

071. Do In-Year Reports present actual revenue by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

A. Yes, In-Year Reports present actual revenue by category.

B. No, In-Year Reports do not present actual revenue by category.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See the Q1-2014 Report on page 6, figure 3 on composition of domestic revenue, see also table 2 which show all of revenue sources including from Petroleum Fund

Comments: This document is only printed in the Portuguese version

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

072. Do In-Year Reports present the individual sources of revenue for actual revenues collected?

A. Yes, In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue accounting for all revenue.

B. Yes, In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue.

C. Yes, In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenue.

D. No, In-Year Reports do not present individual sources of actual revenue.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See In Year Report for first Quarterly Report on 2014 Budget see at https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/06/Relatorio_Primeiro_Trimestre%20_Q1_2014.pdf

Comments: Article 44.3 of TL PFA Stated "3 The reports on the evolution of the budget shall include a report on revenues and expenses, containing the information described in article 4, along with information on assets and liabilities containing the information described in article 45.5.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Page 14: Declaration 1 - Summary of Revenue 1st Trimester 2014 Financial Year Declaração 1 - Resumo de Receitas 1 º Trimestre de Ano Fiscal de 2014 https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/06/Relatorio_Primeiro_Trimestre%20_Q1_2014.pdf

073. Do the In-Year Reports compare actual year-to-date revenues with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

A. Yes, comparisons are made for revenues presented in the In-Year Reports.

B. No, comparisons are not made for revenues presented in the In-Year Reports.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: see Q1-2014 Report, page 3 - table 3, and Declaração 1 - page 14

Comments: This is required by TL PFA Article 44.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

074. Do In-Year Reports present three estimates related to actual government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing; the total debt outstanding; and interest payments?

A. Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

B. Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

C. Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

D. No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

C.

Score: 33

Sources: See Q1-2014 on "Execução Orçamental" - Tabela 3, page 3

Comments: There is no information on interest rates and overall debt, just on how much has been borrowed through external loans.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

075. Do In-Year Reports present information related to the composition of the total actual debt outstanding? (The core information must include interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)

A. Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the composition of the total actual debt outstanding.

B. Yes, the core information is presented for the composition of the total actual debt outstanding.

C. Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

D. No, information related to composition of total actual debt outstanding is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

C.

Score: 33

Sources: See Q1-2014, table 3 page 3 and the section on expenditures for the Infrastructure Fund.

Comments: The only information provided is about the external nature of government debt to finance infrastructure. No additional information on debt composition.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

076. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include an updated macroeconomic forecast for the budget year underway?

A. Yes, the estimates for the macroeconomic forecast have been updated, and an explanation of all of the differences between the original and updated forecasts is presented.

B. Yes, the estimates for macroeconomic forecast have been updated, and an explanation of some of the differences between the original and updated forecasts is presented.

C. Yes, the estimates for macroeconomic forecast have been updated, but an explanation of the differences between the original and updated forecast is not presented.

D. No, the estimates for macroeconomic forecast have not been updated.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The government does not produce a Mid-Year Review. Sometimes there are budget adjustments through rectification or supplementary budgets, when the Government presents alterations to the approved State Budget to the Parliament - when the circumstances justify it, as stated in TL PFA article 34.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

077. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?

A. Yes, expenditure estimates have been updated, and an explanation of all of the differences between the original and updated expenditure estimates is presented.

B. Yes, expenditure estimates have been updated, and an explanation of some of the differences between the original and updated expenditure estimates is presented.

C. Yes, expenditure estimates have been updated, but an explanation of the differences between the original and updated expenditure estimates is not presented.

D. No, expenditure estimates have not been updated.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The government does not produce a Mid-Year Review.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

078. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

A. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

B. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents expenditure estimates by two of the three expenditure classifications.

C. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents expenditure estimates by only one of the three expenditure classifications.

D. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The government does not produce a Mid-Year Review.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

079. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

A. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures.

B. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents estimates for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.

C. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents estimates for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures.

D. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present expenditure estimates by program.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The government does not produce a Mid-Year Review.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

080. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?

A. Yes, revenue estimates have been updated, and an explanation of all of the differences between the original and updated revenue estimates is presented.

B. Yes, revenue estimates have been updated, and an explanation of some of the differences between the original and updated revenue estimates is presented.

C. Yes, revenue estimates have been updated, but an explanation of the differences between the original and updated revenue estimates is not presented.

D. No, revenue estimates have not been updated.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The government does not produce a Mid-Year Review.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

081. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

A. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents revenue estimates by category.

B. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present revenue estimates by category.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

B.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The government does not produce a Mid-Year Review.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

082. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present individual sources of revenue?

A. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.

B. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue.

C. Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues.

D. No, the Mid-Year Review does not present individual sources of revenue.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The government does not produce a Mid-Year Review.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

083. Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the budget year underway?

A. Yes, estimates of government borrowing and debt have been updated, and information on all of the differences between the original and updated estimates is presented.

B. Yes, estimates of government borrowing and debt have been updated, and information on some of the differences between the original and updated estimates is presented.

C. Yes, estimates of government borrowing and debt have been updated, but information on the differences between the original and updated estimates is not presented.

D. No, estimates of government borrowing and debt have not been updated.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The government does not produce a Mid-Year Review.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

084. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?

A. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all expenditures are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all expenditures are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for some but not all expenditures are presented.

D. No, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The Government does not publish a YER. The law (Article 45.1 of the TL PFA) actually requires an annual financial report to be submitted to Parliament and the Audit Court: "The Government shall submit to the National Parliament and to the Chamber of Auditors of the Administrative, Fiscal, Auditors High Court the Report on the General Accounts of the state, within seven months after the end of the financial year, a report containing the financial balance sheets complied by the Treasury, compatible with international accounting standards." The 2012 report was published too late according to OBS criteria, and the 2013 report has not been made public.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

085. Does the Year-End Report present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

A. Yes, the Year-End Report presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

B. Yes, the Year-End Report presents expenditure estimates by two of the three expenditure classifications.

C. Yes, the Year-End Report presents expenditure estimates by only one of the three expenditure classifications.

D. No, the Year-End Report does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The Government does not publish a YER.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

086. Does the Year-End Report present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

A. Yes, the Year-End Report presents estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures.

B. Yes, the Year-End Report presents estimates for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.

C. Yes, the Year-End Report presents estimates for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures.

D. No, the Year-End Report does not present expenditure estimates by program.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The Government does not publish a YER.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

087. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?

A. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all revenues are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all revenues are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for some but not all revenues are presented.

D. No, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for revenues are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The Government does not publish a YER.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

088. Does the Year-End Report present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

A. Yes, the Year-End Report presents revenue estimates by category.

B. No, the Year-End Report does not present revenue estimates by category.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

B.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The Government does not publish a YER.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

089. Does the Year-End Report present individual sources of revenue?

A. Yes, the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.

B. Yes, the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue.

C. Yes, the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues.

D. No, the Year-End Report does not present individual sources of revenue.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The Government does not publish a YER.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

090. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

A. Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates of the differences between all the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented.

D. No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The Government does not publish a YER.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

091. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

A. Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates of the differences between all the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented.

D. No, estimates of the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The Government does not publish a YER.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

092. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome?

A. Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, estimate of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are presented.

D. No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The Government does not publish a YER.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

093. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome?

A. Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, estimate of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are presented.

D. No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The Government does not publish a YER.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

094. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted level of funds for policies (both new proposals and existing policies) that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?

A. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for some but not all of the policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are presented.

D. No, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The Government does not publish a YER.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

095. Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome?

A. Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

B. Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

C. Yes, estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome are presented.

D. No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome is not presented.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The Government does not publish a YER.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

096. Is a financial statement included as part of the Year-End Report or released as a separate report?

A. Yes, a financial statement is part of the Year-End Report or is released as a separate report.

B. No, a financial statement is neither part of the Year-End Report nor released as a separate report.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

B.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The Government does not publish a YER. A financial statement is produced separately, but unfortunately it is not publicly accessible.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

097. What type of audits (compliance, financial, or performance) has the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) conducted and made available to the public?

A. The SAI has conducted all three types of audits (compliance, financial, or performance) and made them available to the public.

B. The SAI has conducted two of the three types of audits, and made them available to the public.

C. The SAI has conducted one of the three types of audits, and made them available to the public.

D. The SAI has not conducted any of the three types of audits, or has not made them available to the public.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

B.

Score: 67

Sources: Relatório e Parecer sobre a Conta Geral do Estado 2012

Comments: The 2012 Audit Report (Parecer sobre a CGE de 2012) includes elements of compliance and financial audit, but not performance audit.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Available at http://www.tribunais.tl/?q=node/54 or www.jornal.gov.tl

098. What percentage of expenditures within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited?

A. All expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited.

B. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited.

C. Expenditures representing less than two-thirds of expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited.

D. No expenditures have been audited.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See Court Report and Opinion on 2012 State Accounts http://www.jornal.gov.tl/?mod=artigo&id=4385

Comments: The relevant legislation states that all Government expenditures should be included in the audit.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

099. What percentage of extra-budgetary funds within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited?

A. All extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited.

B. Extra-budgetary funds accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited.

C. Extra-budgetary funds accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited.

D. No extra-budgetary funds have been audited.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

E.

Score: 0

Sources: No extra budgetary fund is allowed.

Comments: Based on TL PFA Article 4, the budget follows the principles of unity and universality.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

100. Does the annual Audit Report(s) prepared by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) include an executive summary?

A. Yes, the annual Audit Report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report's content.

B. No, the annual Audit Report(s) does not include an executive summary.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

B.

Score: 0

Sources: See Court Report and Opinion on 2012 State Account - RELATÓRIO E PARECER SOBRE A CONTA GERAL DO ESTADO DE 2012

Comments: Only the court report and opinion are available to the public. There is no other information available except the court opinion, and this report does not contain an executive summary.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: available at: http://www.tribunais.tl/?q=node/54 and www.jornal.gov.tl

101. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?

A. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.

B. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings.

C. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings.

D. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: The executive does not publish such a report.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Suggested Answer: c.

Comments: While the Executive does not produce a report on its response and action, this information is documented in the Chamber of Audits' report for the subsequent year's Financial Statements, which is published in the Jornal da Republica. For example, Table 27 - Implementation of Recommendations of the 2011 Report on the General Accounts of the State (Tabela 27 - Implementação das Recomendações do Relatório e Parecer da CGE de 2011) on page 44 sets out the clarifications provided by the Ministry of Finance against each recommendation from the 2011 as well as the conclusion if the recommendation has been completely or partially implemented as a result. http://www.tribunais.tl/files/camara_contas/PARECER_CGE_2012.pdf This report is public (published online on www.jornal.gov.tl and www.tribunais.tl) but is not necessarily timely. In 2014, this currently available audit report reflects the 2012 financial year, leading to the reporting on steps taken in response to the audit reflecting the 2011 financial year.

102. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) or legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?

A. Yes, the SAI or legislature reports publicly on what steps the executive has taken to address all audit recommendations.

B. Yes, the SAI or legislature reports publicly on most audit recommendations.

C. Yes, the SAI or legislature reports publicly on some audit recommendations.

D. No, neither the SAI nor legislature reports on steps the executive has taken to address audit recommendations.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See the Audit Report: RELATÓRIO E PARECER SOBRE A CONTA GERAL DO ESTADO DE 2012

Comments: Part 11 of the 2012 Audit Report tracks what has happened with all of the audit recommendations from 2011.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

Section 4. Strength of Oversight Institutions

103. Does the legislature have internal capacity to conduct budget analyses or use independent research capacity for such analyses?

A. Yes, there is a specialized budget research office/unit attached to the legislature, and it has sufficient staffing, resources, and analytical capacity to carry out its tasks.

B. Yes, there is a specialized budget research office, but its staffing and other resources, including adequate funding, are insufficient to carry out its tasks.

C. Yes, there are independent researchers outside the legislature that can perform budget analyses and the legislature takes advantage of this capacity, but there is no specialized office attached to the legislature.

D. No, the legislature has neither internal capacity nor access to independent research capacity for budget analyses.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: Centru Peskiza Parlamentar

Comments: The Parliament has its own Parliamentary Research Center with several divisions, the Budget Analysis Division is one of them. The Unit supports MPs with analyses or provision of information related to the Budget. Most of their work depends on MPs' request. In all Budget debates in Parliament, this Unit plays a major role in providing information requested by MPs and feeding into debates.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

104. Does the legislature debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal?

A. Yes, the legislature both debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal and approves recommendations for the budget, and the executive is obliged to reflect the legislature's recommendations in the budget.

B. Yes, the legislature both debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal and approves recommendations for the budget, but the executive is not obliged to reflect the legislature's recommendations in the budget.

C. Yes, the legislature debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal, but the legislature does not approve recommendations for the budget.

D. No, neither the full legislature nor any legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: RDTL Constitution Article 145 states that The State Budget shall be prepared by the Government and approved by the National Parliament.

Comments: Budget preparation is done by the executive. The Parliament only debates the budget after the Government has submitted it to Parliament based on Article 30 TL PFA. Previous steps during budget formulation, such as defining the Fiscal Envelope or Budget Ceilings are decided by the Council of Ministers.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

105. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?

A. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a wide range of legislators.

B. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded.

C. Yes, the executive holds consultations with only a limited number of legislators.

D. No, the executive does not consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

C.

Score: 33

Sources: Article 145 of RDTL Constitution

Comments: The Executive is responsible for budget preparation. Each Ministry decides its annual plan and its annual budget proposal based on the Fiscal Envelope and the budget circular, which are decided by the Council of Ministries with involvement of the Budget Review Committee, led by the Ministry of Finance. There is a workshop called “Yellow Road” where the Government - especially the Ministry of Finance - presents its view on the upcoming budget, where some Members of Parliament are invited to attend, but mostly the budget proposal does not depend on what is discussed at the workshop.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

106. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the Executive’s Budget Proposal?

A. The legislature receives the Executive’s Budget Proposal at least three months before the start of the budget year.

B. The legislature receives the Executive’s Budget Proposal at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year.

C. The legislature receives the Executive’s Budget Proposal less than six weeks before the start of the budget year.

D. The legislature does not receive the Executive’s Budget Proposal before the start of the budget year.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

B.

Score: 67

Sources: Article 30.1 of TL PFA "The Government shall present to the National Parliament by the 15 October the draft Budget Law for the following financial year".

Comments: While the law states that 15 October is the time limit for submitting the budget proposal to the legislature, the 2014 budget proposal was submitted on 22 October 2013.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

107. When does the legislature approve the Executive's Budget Proposal?

A. The legislature approves the budget at least one month in advance of the start of the budget year.

B. The legislature approves the budget less than one month in advance of the start of the budget year, but at least by the start of the budget year.

C. The legislature approves the budget less than one month after the start of the budget year.

D. The legislature approves the budget more than one month after the start of the budget year, or does not approve the budget.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: TL PFA Article 3.6 "The financial year coincides with the calendar year".

Comments: There is no legal obligation for the Parliament to approve the State Budget at a fixed time, but it is clearly defined that the financial year starts in January and ends in December (TL PFA 3.7). If the approval process happens after the beginning of the fiscal year, Article 31 of TL PFA will apply (Duo-decimal regime). The 2014 budget was only approved in January 2014.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: The 2014 Budget law was approved by Parliament on 24 January 2014, and promulgated on 3 of February of 2014 by the President. Reference to Law: http://www.jornal.gov.tl/?q=node/779 Article 13 of Law 13/2009 on Budget and Financial Management states that: Article 31 Duodecimal regime 1 – Should the Budget not enter into force at the start of the

financial year, the Government may resort to temporary budget appropriations to continue its activity, provided that: (a)Each budget appropriation covers an expense for a period not exceeding one month; (b)Each budget appropriation is done according to the present article and does not exceed one twelfth (1/12) of the budget appropriation for the same purpose foreseen in the Budget Law for the previous year. 2 – Budget appropriations done according to the present article expire when the new budget law enters into force, with all such expenses being integrated in the Budget for the ongoing financial year.

108. Does the legislature have the authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal?

A. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal.

B. Yes, the legislature has authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal, with some limitations.

C. Yes, the legislature has authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal, but its authority is very limited.

D. No, the legislature does not have any authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: Article 145 of RDTL Constitution, and Article 9 (d) of Petroleum Fund Law

Comments: The budget is prepared by the Government and approved by the Parliament. Members of Parliament have a right to propose amendments or suggest new budget items, to be voted in the Plenary.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

109. Does the executive seek input from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units that receive explicit funding in the Enacted Budget, and is it legally required to do so?

A. The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval or input from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, and it does so in practice.

B. The executive obtains approval or input from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, but is not required to do so by law or regulation.

C. The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval or input from the legislature prior to shifting funds

between administrative units, but in practice the executive shifts funds without seeking prior approval or input from the legislature.

D. The executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking prior approval or input from the legislature, and there is no law or regulation requiring it to obtain such prior approval or input from the legislature.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Article 38.1. of TL PFA "The Government is responsible for altering the budgets of services without administrative and financial autonomy under a Ministry or Secretariat of State, provided that the amount of the transfer does not exceed 20% of the budget appropriation from which the amount is transferred. Article 32.3 of TL PFA on Special Fund "The Minister of Finance is responsible for managing and controlling the funds set according to the present article.

Comments: Virements are allowed if the amount does not exceed 20% of the budget appropriation from which the amount is transferred without asking for Parliamentary approval. The Minister of Finance has more power to decide the implementation of the Infrastructure Fund without seeking Parliament's approval.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

Suggested Answer: a.

110. Does the executive seek input from the legislature prior to shifting funds within administrative units that receive explicit funding in the Enacted Budget, and is it legally required to do so?

A. The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval or input from the legislature prior to shifting funds within administrative units, and it does so in practice.

B. The executive obtains approval or input from the legislature prior to shifting funds within administrative units, but is not required to do so by law or regulation.

C. The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval or input from the legislature prior to shifting funds within administrative units, but in practice the executive shifts funds without seeking prior approval or input from the legislature.

D. The executive shifts funds within administrative units without seeking prior approval or input from the legislature, and there is no law or regulation requiring it to obtain such prior approval or input from the legislature.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Same as in previous question

Comments: if the amount is lower than 20% as article 32 of PFA stated, there is no obligation to seeking Parliament's approval, but if there is a major change, Article 34 of TL PFA will apply (budget rectification).

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: As per Law 13/2009, on Budget and Financial Management, article 38, virements up to 20 per cent of appropriated funds are allowed within administrative units.

111. Does the executive seek input from the legislature prior to spending excess revenue (that is, amounts higher than originally anticipated) that may become available during the budget execution period, and is it legally required to do so?

A. The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval or input from the legislature prior to spending excess revenues, and it does so in practice.

B. The executive obtains approval or input from the legislature prior to spending excess revenue, but is not required to do so by law or regulation.

C. The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval or input from the legislature prior to spending excess revenue, but in practice the executive spends these funds without seeking prior approval or input from the legislature.

D. The executive spends excess revenues without seeking prior approval or input from the legislature, and there is no law or regulation requiring it to obtain such prior approval or input from the legislature.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: Article 34 of TL PFA “The Government may present alterations to the approved State Budget when the circumstances so justify it."

Comments: Only budget adjustments with Parliamentary approval are allowed when excess revenues become available.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

112. When was the most recent supplemental budget approved?

A. The most recent supplemental budget was approved before the funds were expended.

B. The most recent supplemental budget was approved after the funds were expended, or the executive implemented the supplemental budget without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify).

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: A Rectification (supplemental) Budget was passed in 2012: https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/01/2012_Rec_Bud_16_Jan_2013_English.pdf. and it was approved before funds were spent.

Comments: The rectification budget will happen if there are some urgency from the Government plan. 2012 Rectification budget happen as the transition for the new Government to take office. In the 2014 Budget, Article 8.6 of 2014 Budget Law said " Should it be estimated during the third quarter that the budget execution rate until the end of the year will be below 80%, the Budget is to be rectified by reducing the respective total amount between the months of July and September.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

113. Does the executive seek input from the legislature prior to spending contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the Enacted Budget, and is it legally required to do so?

A. The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval or input from the legislature prior to spending contingency funds, and it does so in practice.

B. The executive obtains approval or input from the legislature prior to spending contingency funds, but is not required to do so by law or regulation.

C. The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval or input from the legislature prior to spending contingency funds, but in practice the executive spends these funds without seeking prior approval or input from the legislature.

D. The executive spends contingency funds without seeking prior approval or input from the legislature, and there is no law or regulation requiring it to obtain such prior approval or input from the legislature.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: TL PFA Article 37 Contingency Expenses " In the case of urgent and unforeseen expenses, the Minister of Finance may change part of a budget appropriation for contingency expenses by a Ministry or Secretariat of State."

Comments: The Government has full responsibility for any of the expenditures approved by the Parliament, and the Parliament only supervises it, as stated in Article 145 of the RDTL Constitution.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: The size and management of the contingency reserve is specified in the 13/2009 Law on Budget and Finance Management: Article 7 Specification 3 – The budget of the Ministry of Finance shall include a contingency appropriation meant to meet unforeseen and urgent expenses. Article 22 Content of the State General Budget 3 – The planned expenditure appropriations and revenue estimates for the financial year include: (i)Budget appropriation not exceeding 5% of the total spending with contingency expenses; The budget law also identifies the contingency reserve as an appropriation under Whole of Government Expenses under the management of the Ministry of Finance as follows: Article 9: Appropriations for Whole of Government According to the criteria set for public expenses, the Government shall inscribe the following appropriations in the Appropriations for the Whole of Government, to be managed by the Ministry of Finance c) contingency reserve See Budget Appropriation 2014; in P62 (reference) and pP72 (amount) of the Budget Book 1 https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/FINAL_20131024_Budget_Book_1_EN_16.10.pdf

114. Does a committee of the legislature hold public hearings to review and scrutinize Audit Reports?

A. Yes, a committee holds public hearings to review and scrutinize a wide range of Audit Reports.

B. Yes, a committee holds public hearings to review and scrutinize the main Audit Reports.

C. Yes, a committee holds public hearings to review and scrutinize a small number of Audit Reports.

D. No, a committee does not hold public hearings to review and scrutinize Audit Reports.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: N/A

Comments: There was only one public hearing in 2012 committee C of Parliament where some NGOs were invited, including La'o Hamutuk. See http://laohamutuk.org/econ/OGE11/CGA11/LHsubComCGSA2011Nov12.htm

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have the discretion in law to undertake those audits it may wish to?

A. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.

B. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations.

C. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations.

D. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See Law No. 9/2011 “Orgânica da Câmara de Contas do Tribunal Superior Administrativo, Fiscal e de Contas"

Comments: Article 145.3 of RDTL Constitution “The execution of the Budget shall be monitored by the High Administrative, Tax and Audit Court and by the National Parliament." Law 9/2011 clearly establishes the independent mandate of the Court.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

116. Has the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) established a monitoring system to provide on-going, independent evaluations of its audit processes (a quality assurance system)?

A. Yes, the SAI has established a quality assurance system, and both a sample of completed audits are reviewed annually and the findings of these reviews are made available to the public.

B. Yes, the SAI has established a quality assurance system, but either a sample of completed audits are not reviewed annually or the findings of these reviews are not made available to the public.

C. Yes, the SAI has established a quality assurance system, but neither a sample of completed audits are reviewed annually nor are the findings of these reviews made available to the public.

D. No, the SAI has not established a quality assurance system.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

C.

Score: 33

Sources: Article 39 of Timor-Leste Chambers of Accounts Law

Comments: This Chamber of Account is not yet fully established, most of its work is carried out by the Court of Appeals and by external auditors hired by the Government.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

117. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?

A. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before he or she is removed.

B. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: Article 95.3 (a) Parliament competence "To ratify the appointment of the President of the Supreme Court of Justice and of the High Administrative, Tax and Audit Court;

Comments: The President of the High Administrative, Tax and Audit Court is elected from among and by respective judges for a term of office of four years as stated in Article 129.2 of RDTL Constitution, and his/her mandate terms is renewed or terminated based on this provision. And only Parliament has the right to ratify the result of the election of the member of SAI.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

118. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI)?

A. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.

B. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.

C. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.

D. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: Article 60 of Law 9/2011

Comments: The Court's plenary decides on the Court's budget and annual plans (Art 60.c), which is then incorporated into the State Budget.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

Section 5. Public Engagement in the Budget Process

119. Does the executive make available to the public clear (accessible, nontechnical) definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?

A. Yes, clear definitions of all key budget terms are provided.

B. Yes, definitions are provided for all key budget terms, but they are not always clear.

C. Yes, definitions are provided for some but not all key budget terms.

D. No, definitions are not provided.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: All 2014 Budget documents.

Comments: No glossary is available in any of the budget documents, as well as in the languages that are used by the majority of people. The Government publishes English and Portuguese versions mostly, except Budget Book 3 and Citizens Budget and most of People can't read or speak in these languages.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Definition of key terms is included in the annual budget law such as expenditure categories. The definitions do not add substation information to the terms. Eg. 2014 Budget Appropriation Law, Article 1: Definitions. www.jornal.gov.tl

120. Is the executive formally required to engage with the public during the formulation and execution phases of the budget process?

A. A law, a regulation, or a formal procedural obligation requires the executive to engage with the public during both the formulation and execution phases of the budget process.

B. A law, a regulation, or a formal procedural obligation requires the executive to engage with the public during either the formulation or the execution phase of the budget process but not both.

C. There is no formal requirement for the executive to engage with the public during either the formulation or the execution phase of the budget process, but informal procedures exist to enable the public to engage with the executive during the formulation or execution phase of the budget process or during both phases.

D. There is no formal requirement and the executive does not engage with the public during the budget process.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: Article 40.1 of the RDTL Constitution "Every person has the right to freedom of speech and the right to inform and be informed impartially."

Comments: Despite the constitutional requirement, in practice citizens are not invited to engage in the budget formulation process. Only Government officers are involved in that process. Sometimes a few NGOs are invited to Parliamentary Committee hearings. There is no specific law regulating public engagement in the budget process.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: c.

Comments: There is no requirement to engage with the public during the formulation or execution of the budget process. There is currently a process to consult with the public prior to the launch of the budget process when priorities and fiscal envelopes are being established. The Ministry of Finance runs an annual workshop titled the Yellow Road workshop prior to launching the budget process which informs the fiscal envelopes and priorities. For the 2014 Budget, this workshop was expanded into a 2 part format, with two days for government and parliamentary officials followed by one day for civil society, private sector and development partners. The workshop (undertaken in May 2014) discussed issues ranging from high level strategy to practical implementation challenges such as economic indicators, the strategic development plan, key goals, budget execution challenges and how to ensure quality of execution. This was an expansion of the range of topics, and the level of participation sought compared to previous workshops/years. Workshop material was also put online on the Ministry of Finance website: https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/08/Yellow_Road_Workshop_2014.pdf

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

that is true that the Government held a "Yellow Road Workshop" during May, I was invited and participated discussed the Fiscal Envelope that at that time was $1.3 billion that eventually become $1.5. But the whole Budget process in executive phase wasn't include public engagement. No one in civil society group or any other group except the Government high officer was involved in designed the ministry plan or even allowed or invited to submitted a submission. I don't think any others answer are appropriate except "d." e day workshop for Civil Society doesn't mean the Government already engaged with the public. I insist to continue as "d"

121. When the executive engages with the public during the budget formulation process, does it articulate what it hopes to achieve from the engagement and provide other information far enough in advance so that the public can participate in an informed manner?

A. The executive provides sufficient information (including what it hopes to achieve from its engagement with the public) in advance of the engagement.

B. The executive provides information to the public, but it is either insufficient or is not provided in advance of the engagement.

C. The executive provides information to the public, but it is neither sufficient nor provided in advance of the engagement.

D. The executive does not provide information, or does not engage with the public during the budget process.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: NA

Comments: Same as in previous question

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

122. When the executive engages with the public during the budget execution process, does it articulate what it hopes to achieve from the engagement and provide other information far enough in advance so that the public can participate in an informed manner?

A. The executive provides sufficient information (including what it hopes to achieve from its engagement with the public) in advance of the engagement.

B. The executive provides information to the public, but it is either insufficient or is not provided in advance of the engagement.

C. The executive provides information to the public, but it is neither sufficient nor provided in advance of the engagement.

D. The executive does not provide information, or does not engage with the public during the budget process.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: NA

Comments: Same answer as in previous questions

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

123. Has the executive established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget priorities?

A. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget priorities, and these mechanisms are accessible and widely used by the public.

B. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget priorities; while these mechanisms are accessible they are not widely used by the public.

C. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget priorities, but these mechanisms are not accessible.

D. No, the executive has not established any mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget priorities.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: NA

Comments: There are no such mechanisms

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: No, I do not agree with the score.

Suggested Answer: c.

Comments: There is no requirement to engage with the public during the formulation or execution of the budget process. There is currently a process to consult with the public prior to the launch of the budget process when priorities and fiscal envelopes are being established. The Ministry of Finance runs an annual workshop titled the Yellow Road workshop prior to launching the budget process which informs the fiscal envelopes and priorities. For the 2014 Budget, this workshop was expanded into a 2 part format, with two days for government and parliamentary officials followed by one day for civil society, private sector and development partners. The workshop (undertaken in May 2014) discussed issues ranging from high level strategy to practical implementation challenges such as economic indicators, the strategic development plan, key goals, budget execution challenges and how to ensure quality of execution. This was an expansion of both the range of topics, and the level of participation sought compared to previous workshops/years. Workshop material was also put online on the Ministry of Finance website: https://www.mof.gov.tl/wp-content/uploads/2014/08/Yellow_Road_Workshop_2014.pdf This mechanism is not formal, is limited to community representatives located in the capital city and the goals of consultation, as well as any opportunities for influence are not always clearly stated. The process is an important step towards increased participation and inclusion for the public in the budget process.

RESEARCHER'S RESPONSE

The Yellow Road Workshop is not an annual planning, it was only publicly held in 2014, but not in previous or even for 2015. The Comment from the The Constitution allowed and guarantee the public right to involved or informed on every state activity related to public issues. Budget is public issue, and is not valid as PR said. Per I know, and what is the practice in Timor-Leste, no one was invited or allowed to submitted a proposal or submission related to the preparing the Budget in each Ministry or even in department. As in my previous answer, Yellow road workshop was only discussing the Government step on development regarding to SDP even its mentioned some issue related to public financial. See http://www.laohamutuk.org/econ/OGE14/YRW/Pres1-2RD2en.pdf and http://www.laohamutuk.org/econ/OGE14/YRW/Pres3RD9en.pdf also http://www.laohamutuk.org/econ/OGE14/YRW/ConceptRD1en.pdf. The fiscal envelope or Budget ceiling for 2014 was showing in the Yellow Road presentation, but not the whole budget. I am continue to defend "d"

124. Has the executive established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget execution?

A. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget execution, and these mechanisms are accessible and widely used by the public.

B. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget execution; while these mechanisms are accessible they are not widely used by the public.

C. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget execution, but these mechanisms are not accessible.

D. No, the executive has not established any mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget execution.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: NA

Comments: The Government does not have mechanisms to gather information from the public on budget execution. Some NGOs and others monitor the implementation of specific projects or programs, but independently of government.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

125. Does the executive provide formal, detailed feedback to the public on how its inputs have been used to develop budget plans and improve budget execution?

A. Yes, the executive issues reports on the inputs it received from the public and provides detailed feedback on how these inputs have been used.

B. Yes, the executive issues reports on the inputs it received from the public, but provides only limited feedback on how these inputs have been used.

C. Yes, the executive issues reports on the inputs it received from the public, but provides no feedback on how these inputs have been used.

D. No, the executive does not issue reports on the inputs it received from the public or provide feedback on how these inputs have been used.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: NA

Comments: No feedback provided

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

126. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?

A. Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies.

B. Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies.

C. Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard.

D. No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

B.

Score: 67

Sources: See La'o Hamutuk submission to the Committee C of Parliament in http://laohamutuk.org/econ/OGE13/LHSubCom18Jan2013en.pdf

Comments: Only few organizations are invited to present testimony, though any other group can write a submission to the Parliament. For the 2014 Budget, La'o Hamutuk was not invited by the Parliamentary committee to participate in their hearing, but we sent our analysis to them as in http://laohamutuk.org/econ/OGE14/LHKartaOGE14PN8Nov2013en.pdf

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

127. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (i.e., ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?

A. Yes, public hearings in which testimony from the executive branch is heard are held on the budgets of a wide range of administrative units.

B. Yes, public hearings in which testimony from the executive branch is heard are held on the budgets of the main administrative units.

C. Yes, public hearings in which testimony from the executive branch is heard are held on the budgets of a small number of administrative units.

D. No, public hearings in which testimony from the executive branch is heard are not held on the budgets of administrative units.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: See the schedule and events and debates in Parliament related to the 2014 Budget at http://laohamutuk.org/econ/OGE14/CalParlCommOGE14.pdf

Comments: While parliamentary committees invite relevant ministries, civil society organizations and other relevant groups to the hearings, these meetings are not open to the wider public and the media, and therefore cannot be considered as public.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

128. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (i.e., ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?

A. Yes, public hearings in which testimony from the public is heard are held on the budgets of a wide range of administrative units.

B. Yes, public hearings in which testimony from the public is heard are held on the budgets of some administrative units.

C. Yes, public hearings in which testimony from the public is heard are held on the budgets of a small number of administrative units.

D. No, public hearings in which testimony from the public is heard are not held on the budgets of administrative units.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: See the schedule and events and debates in Parliament at http://laohamutuk.org/econ/OGE14/CalParlCommOGE14.pdf

Comments: But, public hearings are limited, not all of the public is invited, and the process is not covered by the media.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

IBP COMMENT

After careful review of the situation in Timor-Leste, since the media can't attend and certainly not broadcast hearings IBP decided to change the answer to D. While some NGOs are invited, it's at the government's discretion who to invite which is contrary to what a public hearing is supposed to be. These do NOT constitute public hearings.

129. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings on the budget release reports to the public on these hearings?

A. Yes, the committees release reports, which include all written and spoken testimony presented at the hearings.

B. Yes, the committees release reports, which include most testimony presented at the hearings.

C. Yes, the committees release reports, but they include only some testimony presented at the hearings.

D. No, the committees do not release reports, or do not hold public hearings.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

A.

Score: 100

Sources: See Committee C report to the plenary at http://laohamutuk.org/econ/OGE14/CommCReport3Dec2013pt.pdf and its Annex of the recommendation at http://laohamutuk.org/econ/OGE14/AnexoRelComOGE2014pt.pdf

Comments: Lao Hamutuk has translated the Committee C conclusion to English at http://laohamutuk.org/econ/OGE14/ComCRecomOGE14LHEditen.pdf Normally, we come to Parliament based on the Parliament plenary schedule. For example, in 2014 and 2015 State Budget, the committee send us their schedule including the plenary. So we already know when the each Committee and plenary activity. Se then, we come to Parliament as the Parliament here is very open and every one can ask or accessed the documents discuses in Plenary. We got the document by asking the MPs or Parliamentarian staff.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score but wish to add a comment, clarification, or suggest another reference.

Comments: Reports are produced, but distribution is limited. Reports are presented in plenary, which is open to the public but not put on the Parliamentary website. Access to reports is usually through the NGO Lao Hamutuk who scan and translate Committee reports and make them available online, rather than through the Parliament.

130. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can assist in formulating its audit program (by identifying the agencies, programs, or projects that should be audited)?

A. Yes, the SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can assist in formulating its audit program, and these mechanisms are accessible and widely used by the public.

B. Yes, the SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can assist in formulating its audit program; while these mechanisms are accessible, they are not widely used by the public.

C. Yes, the SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can assist in formulating its audit program, but these mechanisms are not accessible.

D. No, the SAI does not have formal mechanisms through which the public can assist in formulating its audit program.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: NA

Comments: No such mechanisms exist

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

131. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can participate in audit investigations (as respondents, witnesses, etc.)?

A. Yes, the SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can participate in audit investigations, and these mechanisms are accessible and widely used by the public.

B. Yes, the SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can participate in audit investigations; while these mechanisms are accessible, they are not widely used by the public.

C. Yes, the SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can participate in audit investigations, but these mechanisms are not accessible.

D. No, the SAI does not have formal mechanisms through which the public can participate in audit investigations.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: NA

Comments: No such mechanism exists

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

132. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) maintain any communication with the public regarding its Audit Reports beyond simply making these reports publicly available?

A. Yes, in addition to publishing Audit Reports, the SAI maintains other mechanisms of communication to make the public aware of audit findings (such as maintaining an office that regularly conducts outreach activities to publicize previously released audit findings).

B. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public beyond publishing Audit Reports.

C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

B.

Score: 0

Sources: NA

Comments: No communication beyond the publication of the report.

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.

133. Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) provide formal, detailed feedback to the public on how their inputs have been used to determine its audit program or in Audit Reports?

A. Yes, the SAI issues reports on the inputs it received from the public and provides detailed feedback on how these inputs have been used.

B. Yes, the SAI issues reports on the inputs it received from the public but provides only limited feedback on how these inputs have been used.

C. Yes, the SAI issues reports on the inputs it received from the public but provides no feedback on how these inputs have been used.

D. No, the SAI does not issue reports on the inputs it received from the public through public consultations.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Timor-Leste

D.

Score: 0

Sources: NA

Comments: No feedback is provided

PEER REVIEWER

Opinion: Yes, I agree with the score and have no comments to add.